

To the Accreditation Council of the
Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and
Quality Assurance in Education and
Health Care
May 17, 2024

**REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE
EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME
«7R01145 - PATHOLOGICAL ANATOMY»
OF THE NJSC "MEDICAL UNIVERSITY OF KARAGANDA" FOR
COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS FOR ACCREDITATION OF
POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMMES (RESIDENCE
SPECIALTIES) OF MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS**

Period of external expert evaluation: May 15-17, 2024

Karaganda, 2024

CONTENT

	List of designations and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	4
2.	General part of the final report	5
2.1	Presentation of the educational programme in the specialty - "Pathological anatomy" of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"	5
2.2	Information on the previous accreditation	8
2.3	Brief characteristics of the results of the analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational programme "Pathological anatomy" of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" and conclusions on the completeness	8
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	8
4.	Analysis for compliance with standards for accreditation based on the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme "Pathological anatomy" of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"	10
5.	Recommendations for improving the educational programme "Pathological anatomy" of the NJSC "Medical University Karaganda"	34
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council for accreditation of the educational programme "Pathological anatomy" of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"	35
	Annex 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation and educational residency programmes in the specialty of the educational programme "Pathological anatomy" of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"	36
	Annex 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	37

LIST OF DESIGNATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
ECAQA	Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Health Care
WFME	World Federation for Medical Education
MSHE RK	Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan
AC	Academic Committee
AP	Academic Policy
CPS	Certification of Practical Skills
HEI	Higher Education Institution
SCES	State Compulsory Education Standard
DAA	Department of Academic Affairs
DET	Distance Educational Technologies
DI and ID	Department of Informatization and Infrastructure Development
DHRM	Department of Human Resources Management
UHEMS	Unified Higher Education Management System
FCC	Final Certification Commission
End-of-course assessment	End-of-course assessment
IEP	Individual educational plan
IWP	Individual Work Plan
CDD	Clinical Diagnostic Department
CDC	Clinical Diagnostic Center
IMIS	Integrated Medical Information System
CED	Catalog of Elective Disciplines
QACS	Quality Assurance Commission of the School of Residency and Professional Development
MSE	Municipal State-Owned Enterprise
MOH	Ministry of Health
LEA	Local executive authorities
NJSC MUK	Non-Commercial Joint-Stock Company "Medical University of Karaganda"
NCIE	National Center for Independent examinations
RW	Research work
STP	Scientific and technical project
RCCH	Regional Children's Clinical Hospital
RCH	Regional Clinical Hospital
EP	Educational programme
ICU	Intensive care unit
ARA	Admission Rating Assessment
EDI	Especially dangerous infections
MC	Major competencies
Academic staff	Academic staff
LO	Learning outcome
WC	Working curriculum
SSS	Student support service
IWR	Independent work of residents

IWRT	Independent work of residents with teachers
SRC	Student research club
Mass media	Mass media
CSET	Center for simulation and educational technologies
SR and PD	School of residency and professional development
CBL	Case-based learning
ECTS	European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System

ECAQA

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with the order of the ECAQA No. 15 dated 02.05.2024, the External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational programme of the residency in the specialty "Pathological anatomy" of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" in the period from May 15 to 17, 2024, in the following composition:

No.	Status in the EEC	Full name	Academic degree/title, position, place of work/place of study, year, specialty
1	Chairman	Zhanalina Bakhyt Sekerbekovna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Surgical and Paediatric Dentistry of the NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov"
2	International Expert	Nasyrov Ruslan Abdullaevich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Vice-Rector for Research, Head of the Department of Pathological Anatomy with a Course in Forensic Medicine of the St. Petersburg State Paediatric Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, Member of the New York Academy of Sciences
3	International Expert	Troinich Yana Nikolaevna	Vice-Rector for Social and Educational Work of the Armenian-Russian International University "Mkhitar Gosh", translator of medical literature - Logosfera Publishing House. Member of the Student Scientific Society at the Department of Histology of the Perm State Medical University. Head of the Student Scientific Society at the Department of Histology of the Perm State Medical University.
4	Academic Expert	Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Paediatric Diseases with a Course in Neonatology, NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov "
5	Academic Expert	Madyarov Valentin Manarbekovich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Surgery with a Course in Anaesthesiology and Resuscitation, NJSC "Kazakh-Russian Medical University"
6	Academic Expert	Nugmanova Aigul Maratovna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Paediatrics with a Course in CID, NJSC "Kazakh-Russian Medical University"
7	Academic Expert	Apbasova Saulesh Akhatovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Assistant of the Department of Pathological Anatomy and Forensic Medicine named after Professor Yu.V. Pruglo, NJSC "Semey Medical University"
8	Academic Expert	Yesetova Gulstan Utegenovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Pulmonology, NJSC "Kazakh

			National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov"
9	Academic Expert	Sadykova Ainur Maralovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Infectious and Tropical Diseases, NJSC "Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov". Member of the working groups for preparation and participation in the National Ranking of Educational Programmes of the National Chamber of Entrepreneurs "ATAMEKEN", for conducting institutional accreditation.
10	Academic Expert	Tuksanbaeva Gulfariza Usenbaevna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Acting Professor of the Department of Neurology, Psychiatry, Rehabilitation and Neurosurgery of the South Kazakhstan Medical Academy
11	Academic Expert	Iztleuov Yerbolat Maratovich	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Radiology, NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov ", member of the local ethics commission on research work, internal auditor of the quality management service
12	Academic Expert	Pak Laura Alekseevna	PhD, Director of the Department of Higher Education of NJSC "Semey Medical University", Chairman of the State Unitary Enterprise Committee for the specialty "Oncology"
13	Academic Expert	Kamhen Vitaly Bronislavovich	PhD, Associate Professor, Associate Professor of the Department of "Health Policy and Organization" of NJSC "Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi"
14	Employer Expert	Daniyarova Bayan Lashinovna	Head of the MSE "CDC Regional Clinical Hospital" of the Health Department of the Karaganda Region
15	Student Expert	Dyusembek Nazira Askerbekkyzy	Resident of the 2nd year of study in the specialty "Adult and Pediatric Neurology" of the NJSC "Astana Medical University"

The EEC report includes a description of the results and the conclusion of the external evaluation of the educational programme "Pathological anatomy" for compliance with the Standards for Accreditation for postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Standards for Accreditation), recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above-mentioned educational programme and recommendations for accreditation for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for Accreditation.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the educational residency programme in specialty "Pathological anatomy" of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"

Name of the organization, legal form	Non-profit	Joint-Stock	Company	"Karaganda Medical
--------------------------------------	------------	-------------	---------	--------------------

of ownership, BIN	University of Karaganda", BIN: 190140033600
Management body	Sole shareholder - Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Management body - Board of Directors, executive body - Management Board
Full name of the first director	Turmukhambetova Anar Akyzbekovna, Chairman of the Management Board - Rector
Date of establishment	The University was founded in 1950. RSE on the REM "Karaganda State Medical University" was reorganized into NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" on the basis of order No. 82 of the Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 01/25/2019
Location and contact details	Republic of Kazakhstan, Karaganda region, Karaganda, st. Gogolya, 40, 100008
State license for educational activities in residency (date, number)	License for educational activities No. KZ32LAA00016018 dated 06.05.2019
Year of commencement of the implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP)	Start year - 2023 Total number of graduates since the beginning of the residency programmes - 0
Duration of training	2 years
Number of residents in the current academic year	1st year - 1 residents 2nd year - 0 residents
Quality indicators in residency	Number of residents in the program "Pathological anatomy" expelled over a period of 5 years - 0 people, including for academic failure - 0 people. Employment rate, % in dynamics over 5 years: 2019 – 0% 2020 – 0% 2021 – 0% 2022 – 0% 2023 – 0%
Full-time teachers/part-time workers involved in the implementation of the EP, incl. % of Sedateness	Total number of teachers - 4, including full-time - 2, part-time - 2. Sedateness, % - 50% Categorization, % - 100%..
Name of the organization, legal form of ownership, BIN	Non-profit joint-stock company "Medical University of Karaganda"

Since 2019, the Non-Profit Joint Stock Company "Karaganda Medical University" (hereinafter referred to as "NJSC MUK") has been granted the status of a research university (Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 27.06.2019 No. 453). The quality of education and scientific research is ensured by a high level of infrastructure, which includes seven academic buildings with lecture halls equipped with interactive technology, a library and publishing center with reading rooms and an electronic library hall, a Clinical Skills and Simulation Center equipped with high-tech simulators and mannequins, a research center and a Shared Use Laboratory, a Scientific Research Sanitary and Hygiene Laboratory, six dormitories, 57 clinical bases of the university, nine clinical departments, the University Clinic of NJSC "MUK", the Occupational Health Clinic, a dental clinic, a Student Service Center, and student sports and wellness camps.

In the fields of medical education, science, and practice, the university's partners include medical universities and research centers in Kazakhstan, Russia, Belarus, Georgia, Tajikistan, Uzbekistan, Sweden, France, Italy, Japan, and other countries, such as St. George's, University of London (United Kingdom), Lund University (Sweden), the University of Milan (Italy), the University of Poitiers (France), Vilnius University (Lithuania), the Modern Institute of Hospital Management (India), the Medical University of Plovdiv (Bulgaria), Aristotle University of Thessaloniki (Greece), the Medical University of Lublin (Poland), Lahti University of Applied Sciences (Finland), the International Medical University (Malaysia), Jyväskylä University of Applied Sciences (Finland), the School of Medicine of the University of Zagreb (Croatia), Atatürk University (Turkey), Shimane University (Japan), the University of Porto (Portugal), the Center for Modern Medical Technologies "SoMeT" (Israel), Helios Clinic (Germany), and Frankfurt-Oder Clinic (Germany). The university actively participates in the implementation of international projects under the Erasmus+ program.

NJSC "MUK" is included in the Avicenna Directory of Medical Schools of the World Health Organization and the World Federation for Medical Education. NJSC "MUK" is a member of the Magna Charta Universitatum (MCU), the Association for Medical Education in Europe (AMEE), the Association for the Study of Medical Education (ASME), the Asian Medical Education Association (AMEA), the Organization for PhD Education in Biomedicine and Health Sciences in the European System (ORPHEUS), the University Mobility in Asia and the Pacific (UMAP), the International Association for the Development of Education (IADE), and the European University Association (EUA).

The NJSC "Karaganda Medical University" was the first medical university in Kazakhstan to successfully undergo quality management system certification in 2005 for compliance of its educational, scientific, and clinical activities with the requirements of the ISO 9001 series international standard by the certification bodies NQA – UK (United Kingdom) and NQA – Russia. In 2015, it was certified by SGS (Switzerland). In 2016, it received healthcare accreditation for compliance with the accreditation standards for medical organizations providing inpatient care, achieving the first category.

The educational program for the specialty "7R01145 – Pathological Anatomy" is implemented in accordance with the Code of Academic Integrity, which is part of the Academic Policy of the NJSC "Karaganda Medical University," approved by the Board on August 27, 2021 (Protocol No. 1), with amendments and additions made on July 14, 2022 (Protocol No. 9). Training in residency is conducted in clinical specialties approved by the Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 25, 2021, No. RK MOH – 43 "On Approval of the List of Medical Specialties for Residency Programs." In 2022, the educational program in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" was included in the registry of the Unified Higher Education Management System (hereinafter referred to as UHES) of the Republic of Kazakhstan (http://epvo.platonus.kz/#/register/education_program/application/45641) and is accessible to the public and all stakeholders in the healthcare sector.

Currently, the residency program has one trainee in pathological anatomy, Sabina Sabitovna Abieva, who is in her second year of study. The educational program is implemented at the Department of Morphology of the NJSC "Karaganda Medical University."

The head of the educational program "7R01145 – Pathological Anatomy" is the head of the Department of Morphology of the NJSC "Karaganda Medical University," PhD Leila Medeubaevna Stabaeva.

The educational program includes theoretical and practical components that enhance the resident's clinical training. As a result, the graduate—a physician specializing in pathological anatomy—becomes a competent specialist capable of conducting proper and appropriate clinical practice in pathological anatomical diagnostics, working at a high professional level both independently and in teams when necessary, and being ready for lifelong learning and participation in continuous medical education and professional development.

The residency training in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" is conducted by the following staff:

1. Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Morphology (Pathological Anatomy Block), and pathologist of the highest category, M.M. Tusupbekova.

2. Head of the Department of Morphology, pathologist of the first category, PhD Leila Medeubaevna Stabaeva.

3. Clinical mentor of the Department of Morphology, Head of the Pathological Anatomy Department at the Multidisciplinary Hospital named after Professor Kh. Zh. Makazhanov, and pathologist of the highest category, O.V. Edi.

All instructors are certified pathomorphologists and engage in clinical practice in major medical organizations in Karaganda. <https://cloud.mail.ru/public/13Zq/9CofmnCU3>

2.2 Information about previous accreditation

To date, the educational program 7R01145 – Pathological Anatomy has not been accredited.

2.3 Brief description of the results of the analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational programme of residency in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" and conclusions on the completeness

The report on the self-assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty «7R01145 – Pathological Anatomy» (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 102 pages of the main text, annexes on 13 pages, copies or electronic versions of 3 documents located at the link <https://drive.google.com/file/d/1PNe2zvUFZa9QntfY3DIBxcsgK73Vb1R/view?usp=sharing>.

The report is characterized by the completeness of the answers to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for conducting self-assessment of the educational program, provided to the educational organization by the accreditation centre - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the rector Turmukhambetova Anar Akyzbekovna, which confirms the reliability of the quantitative information and data included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 3 members of the internal self-assessment commission indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational program - Stabaeva Leila Medeubaevna, PhD, Head of the Department of Pathology, NJSC MUK

Self-assessment of the educational program "Pathological Anatomy" was carried out on the basis of the order of the rector of the university No. 396 dated October 17, 2023 "On the creation of a working group to conduct a specialized self-assessment and write a report"

All standards provide the actual practice of the University in training residents in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" taking into account the start of admission of students in 2023, substantiated data, examples of the implementation of the objectives of the educational program, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, training results, knowledge and skills assessment results, the university's material and technical base and clinical sites, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, development and improvement plans, etc. The report is submitted to the ECAQA in its final form, with data adjustments based on the above recommendations, written in competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, tables and figures (diagrams, photographs) contain references in the text and are numbered continuously.

3. Description of the external expert evaluation

The external expert review of the educational program 7R01145 "Pathological Anatomy" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for Conducting External Evaluation of Educational Organizations and Programs by ECA. The site visit to the organization was conducted on May 15–17, 2024. The sequence of the three-day visit is detailed in Appendix 3 of this report.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members utilized the following methods and obtained the corresponding results:

- Interviews with management and administrative staff – 33 people;
- Interviews with residents – 47 people;
- Examination of the website – <https://muk.qmu.kz/ru/ob-universitete/>;
- Interviews with faculty members – 35 teachers, employers – 17, and graduates – 24;
- Questionnaire surveys of faculty members, master's students, and residents – 53, 9, and 39 respondents, respectively;
 - Observation of resident training: attendance at one practical class ("Tumors of the Reproductive System," instructor – Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Tusupbekova M.M., with 1 resident in attendance, held at the clinical training base);
 - Review of resources in the context of meeting accreditation standards: visits to four practice/clinical training bases, including: The State Municipal Enterprise (SME) "Regional Clinical Hospital"; The Clinic of the Medical University of NJSC "MUK"; The SME "Regional Children's Clinical Hospital"; The SME on the Right of Economic Management "Multiprofile Hospital Named After Professor Kh.Zh. Makazhanov", where training for one educational program is conducted with the involvement of three full-time and adjunct faculty members.
 - study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 36 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents studied is in **Annex 2**).

The staff of the accredited organization ensured the presence of all persons specified in the visit program and in the lists of interview sites and interviews (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, and conversations with members of the EEC

№	Position	Quantity
1.	Members of the Board	3
2.	Heads of structural divisions	11
3.	School deans	2
4.	Heads of educational programmes	11
5.	Members of the Academic Committee of the Senate, the School Quality Assurance Commission for educational programmes (Master's programme, residency)	6
6.	Teachers	35
7.	Students	47
8.	Employers	17
9.	Graduates	24
	Total	156

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of the EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational program, examination of documents, results of interviews, conversations, and questionnaires was held. The EEC members began drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the external evaluation results were made. The experts individually filled out the "Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of the Educational Programme" Pathological Anatomy for Compliance with the ECAQA Standards for Accreditation." The EEC members made no comments. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed and the chairperson, B.S. Zhanalina, held a final open vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the University, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the members of the EEC.

While conducting a survey of residents, 88.89% rated the work of the External Expert Commission on Accreditation as positive, 11.11% as satisfactory. The majority of respondents (100%) believe that it is necessary to accredit an educational organization or educational programmes.

According to 78.57% of teachers, the survey conducted by the ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving key areas of activity of the accredited educational organization.

At the end of the visit, the Chairperson of the EEC announced recommendations for the management and staff of the educational organization based on the results of the external evaluation as part of the specialized accreditation.

4. Analysis of compliance with standards for accreditation based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" of the NJSC "Medical University Karaganda"

Standard 1: MISSION AND FINAL OUTCOMES

1.1 Mission statement

During the implementation of program activities, based on the results of an interview with the head of the organization, members of the advisory and consultative bodies (Academic Council, Supervisory Board, and Department of Academic Affairs), as well as interviews with residents and faculty members, compliance with the criteria of **Standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process are aware of the mission of the educational program and were involved in providing input for its formulation. The mission has been communicated to prospective residents through the website, social media, and informational letters to medical organizations.

The organization's strategic plan for 2024–2026 was reviewed, which includes educational, clinical, and research directions. This confirms compliance with accreditation standards and demonstrates the organization's goals, objectives, and prospects. From interviews with residents, it was noted that, prior to the start of classes, instructors inform them about the mission, the organization's operational plans, and where to access necessary information about the educational program, faculty, and training bases.

During the visit to NJSC MUK divisions, experts identified strengths related to the accredited educational program. NJSC MUK hosts divisions directly related to the educational program "Pathological Anatomy," which can be considered as best practices in education. These include the use of innovative teaching methods and the assessment of the educational process through electronic platforms at the Department of Morphology, as well as the presence of state-of-the-art clinical bases.

This conclusion is supported by the fact that experienced educators and pathologists, who hold advanced academic degrees and titles, work at the department and clinical bases. They have extensive experience in the pathology service, with 100% certification. Dr. Tusupbekova M.M., Doctor of Medical Sciences and Professor, is a leading pathologist in Kazakhstan, a scientific supervisor of candidate, doctoral, and PhD dissertations, and the author of methodological recommendations, books, and atlases on pathological anatomy. The department's close collaboration with the practical pathology service in Karaganda ensures high-quality training for residents.

The documentation review demonstrated that the mission of the organization aligns with the mission of the "Pathological Anatomy" educational program, and the educational process is structured in accordance with state compulsory educational standards and current regulatory and legal acts in postgraduate education and healthcare. During meetings with faculty, residents, and representatives of the practical pathology service, experts identified several issues, including the lack of funding for international clinical internships.

NJSC MUK trains residents in the following clinical bases and departments: the Regional Clinical Hospital, the University Clinic of NJSC MUK, the Regional Children's Clinical Hospital, and the Multidisciplinary Hospital named after Professor Kh. Zh. Makazhanov. NJSC MUK pays significant attention to patient safety and autonomy during pathological-anatomical studies of biopsy and surgical materials.

Experts found that residents are provided with appropriate working conditions to support their health. The educational institution and clinical bases offer facilities for residents to rest during free time, access hot meals, and work with literature. Residents adhere to sanitary-epidemiological protocols both at the university and at clinical bases. If necessary, residents can access the medical center located on the university campus. Recreational facilities are available in Topar and Karkaralinsk.

The core competencies of residents in the accredited specialty, including communication, regulatory knowledge, medical knowledge development, and specific competencies such as clinical skills, professionalism, teamwork, and personal and professional development, enable the educational institution to apply innovative teaching methods. Innovative teaching methods in the "Pathological Anatomy" specialty include interdisciplinary learning with clinical case discussions. This approach allows residents to perform roles as practicing physicians or specialists in their respective profiles, utilizing a multidisciplinary approach and enhancing teamwork skills. These practices help residents develop abilities such as autopsy, studying biopsy and surgical materials, and conducting microscopic examinations of postmortem material.

NJSC MUK encourages residents to participate in research in their chosen specialty by engaging them in scientific projects and ensuring their involvement in academic activities such as scientific conferences, symposiums, and forums.

Experts noted that the sole resident in the "Pathological Anatomy" specialty is already actively participating in scientific research at NJSC MUK, has attended conferences, and contributed to scientific publications. The resident physician, alongside their clinical mentor—the head of the Pathological Anatomy Department at the Multidisciplinary Hospital named after Professor Kh. Zh. Makazhanov—periodically participates in clinical case reviews (<https://cloud.mail.ru/public/CKvq/mgbF1Thnx>). Additionally, the resident has contributed to clinical case evaluations with Professor M.M. Tusupbekova (<https://cloud.mail.ru/public/nL2A/YHZjVpggm>).

1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

Experts determined that the development of professionalism includes the university's autonomy in formulating its mission. The mission of the educational program (EP) is posted on the university's website and has been discussed with both external and internal stakeholders. NJSC MUK promotes the professional autonomy of residents by providing opportunities for rotation across various clinical bases and departments, contributing to the formation of the elective catalog, and developing final outcomes.

The experts established that the educational organization fully exercises autonomy in selecting residents for the accredited specialty (as outlined in the Academic Policy of NJSC MUK, section "[Admission Rules](#)"), developing the educational program, and defining approaches to assessing residents (Regulations on Residency at NJSC MUK, approved by the Board's decision on August 23, 2022, Protocol No. 18). Responsible staff presented the experts with a document outlining the requirements for residency program faculty ([Regulations on Residency at NJSC MUK](#) <https://cloud.mail.ru/public/YSuu/5HAMGAQ7d>). The employment of residents is regulated by the [Academic Policy](#) with an employment rate of ___% (based on examples from other specialties).

To verify **Standard 1**, a meeting was held with the head of the organization, Rector A. A. Turmukhametova. During the conversation, the experts posed the following questions: Which stakeholders participate in discussing the mission of the EP?; How is residents' academic freedom manifested?; Is the university autonomous in formulating its mission?

In response, the rector confirmed that the university is autonomous in formulating its mission, and both internal and external stakeholders actively participate in discussions. Residents have significant opportunities and favorable conditions for conducting research.

According to the [Academic Policy of NJSC MUK](#) (approved by the Senate on August 31, 2023, Protocol No. 1), the university has autonomy. In accordance with its license to conduct educational activities within the framework of groups of educational programs as per the classifier of training areas, it develops EPs based on the current State Compulsory Educational Standards (SCES) and Model Curricula. The EPs are designed in alignment with the National Qualifications Framework, professional standards, Dublin Descriptors, and the European Qualifications Framework. They are developed using principles, methods, and procedures for modular learning, ensuring that learning outcomes are achieved through a comprehensive approach. Both the EPs and the curricula, as well as the academic disciplines, are structured on a modular basis.

Residents' academic freedom is demonstrated through participation in the university's collegial bodies, the free choice of research topics, elective disciplines, and opportunities to attend scientific conferences, among other activities. This freedom is ensured by the educational organization through mechanisms such as facilitating participation in conferences, membership in collegial bodies, involvement in developing clinical protocols, and more. These aspects are described in the [Regulations on Residency at NJSC MUK](#) (<https://cloud.mail.ru/public/YSuu/5HAMGAQ7d>). Pathomorphology residents have a real opportunity to participate in the organization of their specialty's educational program through direct discussions and approvals of the EP, including the development of Individual Work Plan (ILP) and elective disciplines during meetings of the SR and PD Council, the Academic Committee, the Senate, and the Coordination and Quality Assurance Committee of the School.

Residents are regularly invited to attend meetings of advisory bodies and actively participate in discussions related to their specialty. Suggestions and recommendations from students are always taken into account by members of these bodies and are considered when making final **decisions during the meetings. The decisive right in approving candidates from among residents** for the School Council and Senate is held by the employees of the SR and PD. The key criteria for selection include academic performance and the student's active engagement in university life.

First-year pathology resident S.S. Abieva, recognized for her positive personal qualities and excellent academic performance, has been appointed as a member of the SR and PD Council (<https://cloud.mail.ru/public/XZfZ/5uUxmFZp6>). Residents also express interest in participating in case reviews, including maternal mortality and fatal cases involving comorbid conditions. They choose scientific and practical events (such as conferences, congresses, forums, etc.) to present and publish the results of their practical and research activities in the form of oral and poster presentations (<https://cloud.mail.ru/public/xTGg/fM6aLicTU>). All these activities—case reviews, publication writing, and the creation of presentations and posters—are carried out under the guidance of the EP coordinator, PhD L.M. Stabaeva, and DMedSc, Professor M.M. Tusupbekova.

When conducting a survey of 39 residents (on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>), out of 22 questions, a number were devoted to the quality of the educational process and the educational program. It was found that 89.74% of residents would recommend studying in this educational organization to their acquaintances, friends, relatives. And 97.44% of respondents believe that the heads of the educational program and teachers are aware of the problems of students related to training. To the question "Do you think this NJSC MUK allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?", 97.44% of residents answered positively, 2.56% are not sure about this, 0% could not yet answer this question and 0% would like to believe it.

The 25 teachers surveyed (21 questions of the questionnaire) also answered that 80% are satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace in this educational organization, and 20% partially agree with this statement. The experts determined that the organization has a healthy microclimate, since the manager is quite accessible to both residents and employees, responds promptly to requests and resolves any issues. According to 88%, a teacher in an educational organization has the opportunity to realize himself as a professional in his specialty. For your

information, a total of 25 people responded, while teaching experience up to 10 years - 16%, over 10 years - 84%.

1.3 Final learning outcomes

The learning outcomes have been defined and are included in the document titled Educational Program for the Specialty "Pathological Anatomy". This program was developed in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard of Residency, approved by Order No. RK MOH-63 of the Minister of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 4, 2022, "On the Approval of State Compulsory Educational Standards for All Levels of Education". It was adopted at a departmental meeting and Academic Council session on September 1, 2023. Stakeholders are informed about the learning outcomes for residents specializing in "Pathological Anatomy" through oral discussions at extended departmental meetings, surveys of external stakeholders, and the publication of the educational program for the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" on the university's website. Experts have verified that professional behavior and communication skills of residents are developed through activities such as the autopsy of adults and children, microscopic examination of postmortem material, and the analysis of surgical and biopsy materials from various pathologies. These aspects are documented in the Educational Program for the Specialty "Pathological Anatomy".

Both instructors and residents are informed about the Code of Ethics, which can be reviewed in the following documents: The Code of Academic Integrity of NJSC "MUK" ([Academic Policy of NJSC "MUK"](#) approved by the Senate on August 31, 2023, Protocol No. 1); [The Code of Business Ethics of NJSC "MUK"](#) (approved by the Board of Directors on August 24, 2019, Protocol No. 4).

When determining the learning outcomes, the staff of the DAA considered the prior learning outcomes from the bachelor's and internship levels, as well as the goals and objectives of subsequent continuous professional development in the chosen specialty. The organization provides training in additional and informal education (continuous professional development), including programs related to the accredited specialty. For instance, programs have been developed and implemented on topics such as: "Current Issues in Pathological Anatomy"; "Pathological Diagnosis of Maternal Death"; "Iatrogenic Pathology" with durations ranging from 54 to 216 hours.

The surveyed teachers answered that 64% are fully satisfied with the level of previous training of residents, and 32% are partially satisfied.

The experts established a clear continuity between the final results of previous training of residents (prerequisites) and training in residency, and subsequent programs of continuous professional development. The organization has developed 33 programs of additional education, including for the specialty "Pathological Anatomy". Residents are informed about this.

99% of the respondent teachers believe that students of this educational organization have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training program, and 1% partially agree with this.

1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final outcomes

Internal and external stakeholders (residents, employers, administrative and managerial personnel, teaching staff) took part in developing the goals and objectives of the educational program "Pathological Anatomy". Representatives of resident pathologists and employers are members of the university's collegial advisory bodies - the Senate of the NJSC "MUK", the Council of the SR and PD, and are invited to department meetings), which is confirmed by the document in the "[Regulations on the Management of the Educational Program](#)", <https://drive.google.com/file/d/1KRKDBk1ILY5BTevEjzTdzxLLfrkbYfYv/view?usp=sharing>.

Proposals were made such as including electives on the most complex pathomorphological issues. When updated regulatory legal acts and orders are issued in education and healthcare, the developers of the educational program take these changes into account and make appropriate changes.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 14 standards (including 9 basic, 5 improvement standards): fully - 14, partially - 0, does not comply - 0.

Recommendations for improvement: none

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

2.1 Framework parameters of the postgraduate medical education programme

The model of the educational program for the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" is based on the learning outcomes of residents and therefore includes the following: a total workload of 4200 hours (140 credits). The list of compulsory component disciplines is determined by the Model curriculum and specifies the workload of each academic discipline in credits and academic hours, as well as each type of academic activity and examination. The working curricula are developed strictly in accordance with the 2022 State Compulsory Educational Standards of the Republic of Kazakhstan (SCES RK), the Model curriculum, and the educational program (EP), including both compulsory and elective components, designed considering modular learning technology. The list of elective component disciplines is determined independently by the university. The elective component accounts for 120 hours/4 credits (ECTS) out of the total volume of specialized disciplines, and the final assessment is 60 hours/2 credits (ECTS). The duration of training is 2 years. The educational program is presented on the website of the Unified Higher Education Platform (EPVO) of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The systematic and transparent nature of education is ensured by the evaluation procedure, which includes the placement of evaluation policies and criteria, as well as a list of control and measurement tools in the syllabi. To standardize the assessment approaches, the university developed standardized approaches using automated systems such as "Session" and "Platon", which define the criteria for assessing students' mastery of the required learning outcomes.

To implement the educational program for the specialty "Pathological Anatomy", the organization has developed Educational and Methodical Discipline Complex (EMCD), which defines the objectives and considers the integration of practical and theoretical components, as well as independent work. Compliance with SCES and standard requirements has been established, including those approved by Order No. RK MOH – 43 of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 25, 2021, "On the Approval of the List of Medical Residency Program Specialties".

During a visit to a practical session on the topic "Tumors of the Reproductive System" (2 hours, conducted by Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor M.M. Tusupbekova), the experts obtained convincing evidence that the training is conducted according to the plan. At the beginning of the session, the resident answers tests, receives feedback from the instructor, and has the opportunity to improve their skills in pathological diagnosis based on microscopic changes in tissues and organs in tumors. The organization ensures adherence to ethical aspects during the implementation of the educational program, as the experts reviewed the Code of Ethics (approved by the Board of Directors on August 24, 2019, Protocol No. 4), and during the interview, a resident confirmed being informed about the content of this document.

An analysis of educational activities revealed that the scientific foundation and all relevant achievements in the respective disciplines have been taken into account, with updates made to the bibliography of the EMCD and syllabi, which instructors apply during classes.

The mentoring system was evaluated and is described in the document [Regulations on Residency at NJSC "MUK"](#), approved by the decision of the Board of NJSC "MUK" on August 23, 2022, Protocol No. 18.

Currently, there is one mentor, as only one resident is enrolled in the program. A clinical mentor is appointed from among qualified healthcare professionals working at residency training bases, holding relevant certifications, and having at least five years of experience in the specialty (<https://cloud.mail.ru/public/PnN3/ZMYLvTypL>). The mentor chosen is O.V. Edi, Head of the Pathological Anatomy Department at the Municipal State Enterprise on the Right of Economic Management "Multidisciplinary Hospital No. 1 of Karaganda," a pathologist of the highest category.

The mentor's tasks include: Assisting students in planning their educational trajectory; Supporting decision-making when choosing disciplines and departments; Guiding and adapting residents to the educational process within the university; Shaping future professional orientation;

Creating conditions for the maximum individualization of training, aligned with the requirements of SCES and the educational program; Familiarizing residents with the requirements of the specialty, occupational safety regulations, and internal work rules; Ensuring high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. The clinical mentor periodically provides feedback to the instructor and the program manager on the resident's progress.

The procedure for informing residents about their rights and responsibilities is reflected in the [Academic Policy](#). NJSC "MUK" residents are introduced to the academic policy at the beginning of their residency program through the university's website. Additionally, academic and clinical mentors familiarize them with this document.

The qualification obtained upon completion of the educational program in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" corresponds to Level 8 of the National Qualifications Framework (**ESG 1.2**) and is coded as 7R01145.

Instructors employ various teaching methods for residents, including interdisciplinary learning, case analysis, pathological anatomy conferences, and microscopic examination of postmortem, surgical, and biopsy materials. The list of teaching methods is described in the educational program. Through these methods, residents can participate in providing pathological anatomical diagnostics for patients. Instructors ensure that residents review cases using histological studies of various thematic patients. For instance, upon completing the program, residents in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" can perform procedures such as autopsies, collecting material for histological examination, pathological diagnostics, and more.

Experts have established that the principles of academic honesty and anti-plagiarism are fully implemented in the educational organization. This is reflected in the document [Code of Academic Integrity of NJSC MUK \(Academic Policy of NJSC MUK\)](#), approved by the Senate on August 31, 2023, Protocol No. 1). Academic honesty is applicable at all stages of resident training. And anti-plagiarism is applicable when residents are engaged in scientific and clinical research.

Thus, by the end of 2 years of training, residents will acquire basic skills and abilities in the profession of "Pathological Anatomy", which will allow them to work in institutions such as pathological anatomical bureaus (ESG 1.2).

The experts did not find any violations regarding the principle of equality in postgraduate education and continuous professional development, since NJSC MUK complies with the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Law on the Languages of the Peoples of the Republic of Kazakhstan and other regulatory legal acts in the field of education and health care.

The educational organization has a mechanism for regular adaptation of teaching and learning methods to the requirements of modern science and education, as well as to the current needs of practical health care. This mechanism includes the use of innovative methods, the introduction of new technologies, the use of immunohistochemical studies, etc.

This indicates compliance with standard 2 in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents.

2.2 Scientific method

The educational program does not include scientific foundations and methodology of medical research. During the conversation with residents, the experts learned that they use scientific data in their training and know the basics of evidence-based medicine. The teachers said that they teach residents methods of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data, the application of scientific developments. Training in the basics of scientific work and methodology of medical research, including clinical research and clinical epidemiology, the formation of primary skills of critical evaluation of literature, writing scientific articles is carried out in the disciplines of basic higher medical education in the form of various forms of independent work, participation in SSS, in student scientific conferences. As part of the implementation of this area, a program for the development, support and promotion of university researchers is being developed and implemented through the involvement of students, interns, residents, young scientists under 35 years of age in the implementation of research programs and projects. The head of the EP, teacher, clinical mentor

determine the directions and topics of scientific projects, which are reflected in the individual work plan of the resident and approved at a meeting of the department, consistently implemented by residents in accordance with the design of the study. A resident studying in the EP "Pathological Anatomy" develops research on the topic "Clinical and diagnostic aspects of cervical ectopia associated with sexually transmitted infections in young nulliparous women". The result of the resident's research is the presentation of data on the research activities of the latter at scientific conferences of various levels and the publication of articles. The share of scientific work in the assessment sheet of the portfolio in residency is 20%, the results of personal achievements - 2%, which affects the final assessment of the resident and is a mechanism for activating students in this section of work

When surveying residents, it was found that the educational organization has access to the participation of students in research work, and 87.18% of people are fully satisfied with this, 5.13% are partially satisfied, and 0% are not satisfied. Residents should engage in research and in response to the questionnaire, 87.18% wrote that they are already engaged in research, 5.13% are planning to start.

2.3 Structure, content and duration of the residency programme

There are documents containing requirements for the structure and content of educational programs, including the State Compulsory Educational Standard of 2022. Model curriculum. The Work Curriculum, EP reflects the logical sequence of mastering modules/disciplines that ensure the formation of competencies. The head of the department is responsible for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process.

The content of the work programs and the catalog of elective disciplines reflect the needs of the healthcare system, including pathological diagnostics using modern methods, international recommendations and updating the standard for the provision of pathological diagnostics of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the map of the provision of the discipline with educational and methodological literature is updated, as well as the specifics of research and scientific achievements of teachers. For the successful implementation of the educational program in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy", the organization has resources for organizing the assessment of the practical skills of residents ("Assessment forms of independent work of a student in a medical university (scientific work), authors Dosmagambetova R.S., Laryushina E.M., Turgunova L.G. and others), including a resident (Assessment sheet "Maintenance of medical documentation / medical history" in PAO; Assessment sheet "Night / day duty" in a therapeutic hospital; [Assessment sheet "360° - assessment of a resident", conducting a clinical and written exam \(Assessment sheet of the clinical exam, Assessment sheet of the written exam\)](#)). Intellectual property has been declared and received for the assessment criteria checklist "Pathological anatomy assessment" (authors: L.M., Stabaeva, M.M., Tusupbekova, G.N. Imanbaeva, R.Zh. Nygyzbaeva. Certificate of amendments to the state register of rights to objects protected by copyright No. 32751 dated "16" February 2023) The experts found that the educational program takes into account the requirements of the legislation, including with regard to the ethics of conducting pathological studies

The theoretical component of the educational program is 20% of all work including all disciplines. The practical component of the educational program is 70%. Possible future roles of a residency graduate, namely, a medical expert, a manager are formed through all disciplines when conducting pathomorphological diagnostics and comparing clinical and pathoanatomical diagnoses. Legal aspects of a doctor's activities are discussed in classes on the discipline "Forensic Histology". The scientific component in resident training is formed through work with literary sources, when performing research.

NJSC MUK guarantees adjustment of the structure, content and duration of the educational program in the event of any changes in various sciences, demographic, as well as in response to the needs of the health care system. For this purpose, there is a mechanism for updating and amending the EP.

Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, in which 94.87% are completely satisfied, 5.13% are partially satisfied, 0% are not satisfied.

The organization has its own clinical base with 195 beds and corresponding outpatient visits. To the question of the questionnaire "Is there sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.)", 97.44% of residents answered with complete agreement, 2.56% partially agree. At the same time, 92.3% of residents claim that after the end of classes, the teacher provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini-questionnaire, and works on mistakes).

The organization has its own clinical base with a pathomorphological department, and has also concluded agreements with medical organizations that have pathomorphological departments. And to the question of the questionnaire "Is there enough time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.)", 97.44% of residents answered with full agreement, 2.56% partially agree. At the same time, 92.31% of residents claim that after the end of classes, the teacher provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini-questionnaire, works on mistakes).

At the same time, to the question "Do representatives of residents participate in the development of educational programs?", the experts received the following answer - residents take an active part, are members of collegial bodies. The resident in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" is a member of the Council of the SR and PD.

The surveyed residents are completely satisfied with the schedule of classes (89,74%).

2.4 Organization of training and the relationship between postgraduate medical education and the provision of medical care

The management of the educational process, reflected in the self-assessment report (**standard 2**) and general approaches to management were confirmed during a visit to clinical sites and the Department of Morphology of the NJSC MUK and a conversation with the head and staff.

The experts familiarized themselves with the work of the departments, including clinical sites, a total of 2 meetings were held and during a cross-interview it was established that a resident in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" has free access to pathological materials, has the opportunity to actively participate and conduct autopsies, pathological diagnostics of histological, biopsy and surgical materials.

Thus, responsibility for choosing the base of clinical training and practice of a resident in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" is assigned to the postgraduate department and the head of the Department of Morphology. The experts analyzed the information on the accreditation of clinical sites and concluded that they are licensed.

The training of residents in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" is aimed at meeting the needs of practical healthcare, since the analysis of the shortage of specialists for 2022 revealed an acute shortage of pathologists in all regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Clinical bases are specialized in the field of pathological anatomy, and provide a lot of opportunities and conditions for qualified training of specialists in the residency in "Pathological Anatomy". Thus, during a conversation with the management of the organization, experts received information that pathologist residents have free access to pathological objects, independently perform autopsies of children and adults, conduct microscopy of organs taken from corpses, as well as biopsy and surgical materials. Teachers confirmed that the training of residents is carried out directly in clinical bases - pathomorphological departments. Residents of this specialty have the opportunity to rotate to study various nosologies.

This is facilitated by mentoring, which is carried out at the NJSC MUK.

When visiting a practical lesson on the topic of "Tumors of the reproductive system", lasting 2 hours and talking with a resident, experts saw that the organization promotes the development of practical competencies of residents, including at various pathological facilities. At the same time, residents deepen their theoretical knowledge and develop communication skills.

Integration between training and the provision of pathological diagnostics (training on the job) is carried out through joint microscopic views, comparison of pathological and clinical diagnoses, etc.,

together with a clinical mentor and an academic mentor. Training is conducted in accordance with the data of modern pathological studies.

Of the 39 residents surveyed, 89.74% responded that teachers use active and interactive teaching methods in classes quite often, 7.69% believe that they rarely or sometimes.

The following employees took part in the planning, discussion, approval and review of the educational program in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" - teaching staff, employers, doctoral students, pathologists, students, members of collegial bodies and other interested internal and external stakeholders.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Of 22 standards that comply (including 19 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully - 21, partially - 1, does not comply - 0.

Recommendations for improvement:

1) Expand the catalogue of elective disciplines taking into account the need to ensure competencies in the scientific foundations and methodology of medical research, including clinical research and epidemiology (2.2.1).

Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF RESIDENTS

3.1 Assessment methods

A study of the assessment tools (2000 tests, 57 tasks, 83 cases on various topics, micropreparations, macropreparations, etc.) showed that the organization has implemented an appropriate assessment policy that allows for a comprehensive assessment of the academic achievements of residents. Assessment tools used to assess the academic achievements of residents <https://cloud.mail.ru/public/MNXA/YZ2X7YfNB>.

During the interview, the residents talked about the assessment forms, for example: the academic achievements (knowledge, skills, abilities and competencies) of students are assessed in points on a 100-point scale, corresponding to the letter system with a digital equivalent accepted in international practice (positive grades, in descending order, from "A" to "D", and "unsatisfactory" - "FX", "F") and grades according to the traditional system <https://cloud.mail.ru/public/2Mav/ARUYF18Yf> and that they are satisfied with everything. The final control and midterm certification of residents in NJSC "MUK" is carried out in accordance with the academic calendar, Working curriculum and syllabuses. The [Working curriculum](#) presents a list of disciplines and the form of final control during the academic period <https://cloud.mail.ru/public/DMUC/bCsUCopsY>. The final assessment is carried out upon completion of the discipline/module in the form of a comprehensive 2-stage exam - Stage 1 - clinical exam (attestation of practical skills) (50%), Stage 2 - written exam, in the final years - testing (50%). The clinical exam is carried out in the form of certification of practical skills "at the patient's bedside", according to the assessment sheet "Assessment sheet of the clinical exam". The written exam is held on the session.kgmu.kz platform with a check of the resident's written answer for originality in the Strikeplagiarism.com system (the Antiplagiat system of the Polish company Plagiat.pl), as well as with coding of the residents' works, ensuring the objectivity of the assessment. Computer testing is carried out using the Platon information system for residents of the final years. Grades for disciplines are posted in electronic statements in the Platon system. The student is admitted to the exam subject to the completion of the curriculum for the discipline, receiving an Admission Rating Assessment for the discipline of at least 50%.

The portfolio defense is carried out at the end of each academic year to assess the resident's mastery of the competencies provided for by the EP, according to the form of the assessment sheet established at the university ("[Portfolio Assessment Sheet](#)") by a commission consisting of the head of the EP, teachers of departments, clinical mentors, representatives of practical healthcare.

And also receive regular feedback from teachers. The system of appeal of the assessment results is reflected in the document "Residency Regulation" and during the period of work of NJSC MUK there were no precedents of appeal. The assessment covers not only knowledge and skills, but also professional behavior and communication skills, which is confirmed by the following: assessment sheets have been developed for monitoring various types of resident activities: extracurricular activities of the resident - "Maintenance of medical documentation / medical history" in the pathology

department), "360° - assessment of the resident", for conducting midterm certification - a checklist for assessing the written exam, "Portfolio assessment sheet", which determine the criteria for assessing the student for mastering the necessary learning outcomes.

The criteria for admission to the final certification are the indicators of completion of the educational process in accordance with the requirements of the working curriculum and working curricula, and having an admission rating of 50% or higher. If the admission rating is less than 50%, the entry "not admitted" is made in the examination report opposite the student's name. This is documented in the "Regulations on the rating system for assessing the academic performance of students at NJSC MUK".

Admission for independent examination of residents is an admission rating of 50% or higher. In the practice of NJSC MUK, residents (including those of other specialties) pass the independent examination positively in 100% of cases. Validation and assessment of the reliability of resident assessment methods (tests, tasks, cases) is ensured by compliance with the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 11, 2020 No. RK MOH-249/2020 "On approval of the rules for assessing the knowledge and skills of students, assessing the professional readiness of graduates of educational programs in the field of health care and specialists in the field of health care", as well as internal regulatory documents: "Regulations on the residency of NJSC MUK", "Rules for the rating system for assessing students' academic performance" of the Academic Policy of NJSC MUK.

NJSC MUK has a practice of involving external examiners in assessing residents, which is documented in the minutes of the departmental meeting. This ensures the independence and objectivity of the assessment results.

Thus, to verify the data of **standard 3**, the experts asked questions to the head of the department of morphology Stambaeva L.M. and checked the documents and methods for assessing residents.

In NJSC MUK, there are developed control and measuring tools for conducting current and final control, including extended clinical tasks for a written exam, test tasks based on a clinical situation, 2 and 3 levels of difficulty with Multiple Choice Question (MCQ), allowing to assess the knowledge, skills and abilities of residents, the level of clinical thinking. Methods of assessing residents are determined in accordance with the final learning outcomes and the teaching methods that were used to achieve them. Formative assessment is used by the faculty regularly to monitor current academic performance and is carried out in the form of oral/written feedback when assessing the completion of tasks, assessing the practical skills of residents at the "bedside/at the workplace", etc. to develop recommendations for improvement. Based on the results of the final control (summative assessment), including a 2-stage comprehensive exam and midterm certification (portfolio defense), a decision is made on the transfer of the resident to the next course of study or admission to the final certification.

Tests in the amount of 1000, which were compiled by the faculty of the Department of Morphology and approved at a meeting of the department (minutes No. 1 dated September 3, 2024). The control and measuring tools have been reviewed. The head of the department responded that additions and updates to the control and measuring tools are planned to be made annually.

The results of the assessment of residents are documented in the academic electronic database AIS "Platon", where each student has access with a personal login and password. This program allows the student to monitor their achievements.

There is a document on appealing the results of the assessment "Residency Regulation", which was approved on 23.08.2022, protocol No. 18. To date, there have been no appeals from residents.

During the visit to NJSC MUK and the interview with the professor of the Morphology Department, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor M.M. Tusupbekova, the commission was convinced that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and employees, and includes such documents as the work plan and annual reports, Individual work plan, department regulations, agreements with clinical sites, certificates of completion of work and educational and methodological documentation (educational program, working curricula, syllabuses, electronic journals), assessment tools (checklists, statements), certificates and credentials. A review of

the website showed that its pages contain the documents necessary for residents - Individual work plan, educational program, work curriculum, schedule and other information documents that are regularly updated.

During the visit to NJSC MUK, the management was asked the question: "Are external examiners involved in order to improve the fairness, quality and transparency of the assessment process?" And the answer was received that when accepting practical skills, external examiners from among experienced pathologists are necessarily involved.

3.2 Relationship between assessment and learning

When interviewing teachers of the Morphology Department regarding assessment methods, experts received convincing information that automated systems (Platonus, Session, and others) are successfully used. Residents also shared their opinions on the timeliness of providing tests, conducting consultations before exams, the clarity of the entire assessment procedure and its fairness. For example, residents said that all this is spelled out in the documents - the regulation on the residency of the NJSC MUK, the Academic Policy of the NJSC MUK, etc. The experts inspected the resources for organizing the assessment of knowledge and practical skills: computer classes, clinical bases, the presence of modern microscopes, dissection rooms, dissection kits for pathological anatomical dissection, a sufficient number of macro and micropreparations for the nosologies studied.

The experts determined that the selection of assessment methods for residents is based on the evaluation of practical skills, as the practical component is central to the training. For example, current assessment methods, such as completing pathological examination protocols, comparing diagnoses, and making conclusions on biopsy and surgical materials, promote interprofessional learning. Additionally, methods such as assessing the ability to make pathological diagnoses using glass slides during autopsies demonstrate the integration of training and a focus on clinical skills.

The established assessment methods ensure that residents have mastered all sections of the educational program and acquired the necessary practical skills.

Feedback from residents regarding their assessments is collected through online surveys and is published on the university's website and reported during meetings of collegial bodies. During interviews, residents confirmed that feedback is provided to them after completing their training.

Employers from the clinical base of the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" (7 respondents) also indicated that the training of graduates aligns with the current advancements in medical practice and science. They emphasized that the theoretical and practical components of the training fully comply with the SCES 2022 and the model curriculum (MC), as well as the requirements of the global pathological anatomy service. Employers noted that they themselves participate in the assessment of residents, as they are included as examiners.

At the same time, challenges exist in the development of assessment tools, including insufficient time for their preparation.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria correspond to 9 standards (including 6 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully - 9, partially - 0, does not correspond - 0.

Recommendations for improvement: none

Standard 4: RESIDENTS

4.1 Admission policy and selection

NJSC MUK has a policy for the admission of residents, which is called the Academic Policy of NJSC MUK, section "[Admission Rules, Student Progress, Certification](#)". Approaches to the admission of residents are based on the requirements of the country and internal regulations, namely, developed in accordance with the Model Rules for Training in Educational Organizations Implementing Higher and Postgraduate Education Programs (Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 600 dated October 31, 2018) and the Rules for Placing a State Order, Admission to Training and Training of Medical Personnel in Residency (Order of the Ministry of Health of the

Republic of Kazakhstan No. RK MOH-270/2020 dated December 15, 2020). <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V2000021802>

Transparency of the selection procedure and equal access to residency programs are achieved through the website of NJSC MUK. <https://www.qmu.edu.kz/ru/contents/list/1608>, and is confirmed on the basis of: Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600 "Standard rules for admission to study in educational organizations implementing educational programs of higher and postgraduate education". Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 27, 2018. 2007 No. 319-III "On Education", Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 04.07.2022 No. RK MOH-63 "On approval of state mandatory standards for levels of education in the field of health care", Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 15, 2020 No. RK MOH-270/2020 "On approval of the rules for placing a state order, admission to training and training of medical personnel in residency" - Academic Policy of NJSC "MUK".

The document reflects approaches to the admission of residents with disabilities, but for residency in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy", which requires certain physical and psychological stress - there is no opportunity to train people with disabilities.

The document takes into account the requirements for residency applicants in terms of their previous achievements in undergraduate and internship (e.g., what prerequisites have been mastered, what GPA scores), and also describes the safety requirements (e.g., health status, certificates from drug treatment and psychiatric centers, etc.).

The educational organization has created a barrier-free learning environment, including ramps, call buttons, elevators, toilets for the disabled.

Approaches to the admission and transfer of residents from other educational organizations in accordance with the Rules for the provision of public services in the field of technical and vocational, post-secondary education. A resident is transferred or reinstated provided that the first academic period of the mastered program is fully completed, according to the individual academic year, regardless of the timing of expulsion upon reinstatement. The transfer of residents studying on an educational grant to another university is carried out with the preservation of the educational grant. Transfer of resident doctors from other universities to a national university or another university is carried out subject to additional payment by students of the difference in the cost of the educational order.

The appeal procedure for the results of admission to residency is prescribed in the "[Policy for the admission of applicants to postgraduate educational programs](#)" of NJSC MUK. To date, there are no precedents for appeal.

Representatives of students, namely residents who are members of the Council of the SR and PD and the Senate of NJSC MUK, are included in the process of developing the policy for the admission and selection of residents. Feedback is provided to residents on this issue.

The admission and selection policy, the number of residents are revised annually, in accordance with the regulatory documents of the authorized body, internal decisions of NJSC MUK, taking into account social and professional data. Thus, in 2022, additional criteria were included in the rules for admission to residency: experience in the field of healthcare, research work in the profile of the EP (Program of the entrance exam for educational programs of residency, approved by the Chairman of the Board - Rector on 12.05.22). Comprehensive testing was introduced into the program of the entrance exam in 2023, including questions of biomedical and clinical sciences in the profile of the specialty.

Thus, the experts validated the data according to **standard 4**. In general, all criteria are met. The experts familiarized themselves with the documentation on the admission of residents, including the capabilities of the department and clinical sites. According to the capabilities, up to 10 residents can be trained. All documents are well drawn up.

4.2 Number of residents

During the period 2019-2023, 1,790 residents were accepted to all educational programs, including 1 to the program in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy". The total number of residents

graduating on the dates of the start of admission to residency in all specialties was 1,369 people, including none for the accredited educational program. NJSC MUK analyzed the need of practical healthcare for pathologists and determined that the annual admission to the educational program in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" will be 3-5 people. This figure corresponds to resource capabilities. The sources of information on the need for specialists in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" are applications from practical healthcare.

4.3 Support and consulting of residents

The practice of academic counseling, personal support of residents and development of not only professional skills were assessed by experts through interviews. During interviews with residents and graduates, the following information was obtained: for social and personal support of students, there is a youth department, a compliance officer, a student service center, which are structural units implementing state youth policy, civic-patriotic, legal, moral, professional, aesthetic, ethno- and multicultural education of residents. The compliance officer organizes work on the formation of an anti-corruption culture, on issues of compliance with integrity and ethics, on identifying and reducing corruption risks, implementing the main directions of the anti-corruption legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan. On the website of NJSC "MUK" on the main page there are tabs "Rector's Reception Online", "[Rector's Blog](#)". The School of Residency and Professional Development holds meetings and gatherings with residents, where various issues related to training, the work of the student support service, etc. are also discussed. The student support service (hereinafter referred to as SSS) provides psychological adaptation and information support to students (the university has full-time psychologists). The Student Republic "Samruk" is a student self-government body in the sphere of implementing the State Youth Policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The university also has a Council of Young Scientists and Students, which functions in accordance with the Regulation on the Scientific Society of Young Scientists and Students of the University.

Residents are included in advisory bodies such as the SR and PD. For instance, resident pathomorphologist Abiyeva S.S. is a member of the SR and PD Council.

To provide social support to residents, the university has established a Student Support Service. This service operates based on the Regulation on the Student Support Service of NJSC "MUK" (PP NJSC MUK 19-2, version 1 dated 08.07.2019, with amendments dated 23.10.2020, protocol No. 20). Financial support for residents is provided through scholarships amounting to 117,000 tenge, as well as additional financial assistance. Psychological support is ensured by the Student Support Service, which operates confidentially.

For career planning of residency graduates, the university, along with faculty members and clinical mentors, supports residents in career planning and employment matters. NJSC "MUK" facilitates the professional development of residents. Specifically, residents are encouraged to participate in internships, scientific conferences, professional webinars, forums, and projects. To enhance professional orientation and career planning, residents are allowed to conduct practical sessions on pathological anatomy with students as assistant interns.

The employment rate of graduates from all residency programs reached 100% in 2022.

4.4 Representation of residents

The educational organization operates the following advisory and consultative bodies: the SR and PD Council, and the Senate, in which residents participate. Residents have a genuine opportunity to contribute to the organization of the educational program for their specialty through direct discussions of the program, the development of individual study plans, and the selection of elective disciplines. Resident representatives are included as members of the SR and PD Council, and the Senate. The university encourages the initiative of resident learners in decision-making processes regarding the conditions and rules of education and training, based on an individualized approach to mastering the program, selecting clinical bases and elective disciplines, academic mobility, and participation in research projects and conferences. Resident pathomorphologist S.S. Abiyeva is a member of the SR and PD Council.

During a survey of residents, experts found that residents actively participate in making many decisions.

4.5 Working conditions

Residents receive a monthly stipend in accordance with the document - Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 799 dated October 10, 2022, "Rules for the Appointment, Payment, and Amount of State Scholarships," as well as the Regulation on the Procedure for Awarding Scholarships Established by the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Residents studying under an educational grant are provided with state scholarships in the manner established by the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan. https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/P080000116_/links

Residents are allowed to work during their extracurricular time, as reflected in the Regulation on Residency of NJSC MUK. Currently, 56% of residents take advantage of this opportunity. The specialty "Pathological Anatomy" has four clinical training bases, each hosting various activities involving residents. Typically, residents perform autopsies, dissect cadaveric, biopsy, or surgical materials, conduct microscopic examinations, and draft autopsy protocols, among other tasks. Residents also deliver thematic presentations, such as "Issues in Maternal Mortality" and "Iatrogenic Pathology".

Under special circumstances (e.g., residents experiencing illness lasting 6 to 12 months, based on the conclusion of the Central Medical Control Commission (CMCC) at a hospital or outpatient clinic, in accordance with Form No. 026/u approved by the Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan; conscription for military service based on a military service summons in accordance with the Rules for Military Registration of Reservists and Conscripts; or maternity leave and childcare up to the age of three years, based on a birth certificate), a resident may apply for academic leave.

To formalize academic leave, the resident must submit an application to the Digitalization Department addressed to the Chairperson of the Management Board-Rector, along with the original and a copy of the document serving as the basis for the academic leave (e.g., the CMCC conclusion, military service summons, or birth certificate).

Upon returning from academic leave, the resident resumes training in the same educational program and from the same year (and academic period) as at the time the leave was granted.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply with 20 standards (including 14 basic, 6 improvement standards): fully - 20, partially - 0, does not comply - 0.

Recommendations for improvement: no

Standard 5: TEACHERS

5.1 Recruitment and selection policy

There are 14 employees in total, including 13 full-time teachers and 1 part-time teacher. The requirements for residency program teachers take into account the Personnel Policy, 11.01.2021, the Regulation on the performance management system of employees of the NJSC MUK, 26.08.2019, the Regulation on the rating of departments and assessment of the activities of the teaching staff, 23.05.2019, the Internal Labor Regulations in the NJSC MUK, 11.03.2021.

The degree rate is 100%, 7 people have the highest category, 3 - the first, 4 - the second. The training of residents in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" is carried out by the following employees: prof. Tusupbekova M.M., head. Department of Stambaev L.M., on the basis of the department of the pathological anatomy department of the KGP on the REM multidisciplinary hospital named after Professor Kh. Zh. Makazhan

The experts familiarized themselves with the job descriptions of the head of the department, professor, associate professor, assistant, clinical mentors and the provisions of the university's [personnel policy](#), the rules for hiring employees upon employment, the [Rules for competitive replacement of vacant positions](#), and the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the

Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 13, 2009 No. 338 "[On approval of standard qualification characteristics of the positions of teaching staff and persons equivalent to them](#)"

The experts were familiarized with the personnel policy (university [personnel policy](#), 11.01.2021), the Regulation on mentors, on the Regulation on the performance management system of employees of the NJSC MUK, 08.26.2019. The ratio of teachers to residents is 1:3.

The motivation system for clinical mentor teachers includes the following: the staff of the Morphology Department of the Pathological Anatomy Block have awards, certificates and letters of thanks, no disciplinary sanctions. <https://cloud.mail.ru/public/16zr/hUX76GXdK>.

The principles of ethics and academic honesty of teachers are reflected in the document - the [Code of Business Ethics](#). During the conversation with the teachers, they confirmed their awareness of this issue.

In order to verify the data of standard 5, external experts received the opinion of teachers on the personnel policy, which reflects the procedure and rules for selecting potential employees in accordance with the requirements of the standard qualification characteristics of positions of medical education workers. The search and selection of highly qualified specialists is carried out on the basis of submitted resumes, interviews. The decision to hire employees is made collegially, by a commission for interviewing candidates for employment. The commission considers the candidate's compliance with the stated requirements, the decision of the commission is recorded in the protocol. The interview with the professor of the department, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Tusupbekova M.M. included such questions as: how many residents are planned to be recruited in 2024? Do residents have free access to pathological anatomical objects? Do residents have enough time to master theoretical and practical skills? and allowed the experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical bases for teaching (there are 1 such teachers in total), about the strategy and tactics of recruiting residents, and the information support of the educational program.

When surveying teachers, it was found that the majority (80%) are completely satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace in this educational organization, but 20% are partially satisfied. In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research - 84% completely agree, 16% partially. They are satisfied with the salary - 56% completely agree, 28% partially.

5.2 Commitments and development of teachers

In order to verify the data of standard 5, during a meeting with the head of the HR department and during interviews with teachers, experts received an opinion on approaches to developing the pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring, which includes the fact that NJSC MUK has highly qualified teaching staff and clinical mentors; clinical mentors are happy to work with residents; good provision by the university of all the necessary materials for the learning process; the opportunity to do an internship at the expense of the university; opportunities to engage in research work, as well as opportunities to travel to international congresses and conferences abroad.

The experts determined that teachers and residents have enough time for teaching, mentoring and training. The work schedule of teachers is established in accordance with the standards of the Labor Code, time standards for calculating the volume of academic work approved by the Senate decision (Senate Decision of 05.04.2023), the average teaching load of the teaching staff, instructions of the head of the department on the types and volume of academic workload and the implementation of other sections of the plan. Distribution of types of activities is carried out on the basis of job descriptions, in which 20% is for research work, 70% for educational work, and 10% for the social activities of the university. The share of types of educational work in residency is distributed as follows: classroom - 20%, work with a clinical mentor - 70, and independent work of the resident - 10%. The average teaching load of the teaching staff implementing the educational program in residency is reviewed annually, which amounted to 650 hours for the teaching staff for the 2023-2024 academic year, and 1,500 hours for clinical mentors. (Senate Resolution of 05.04.2023, Protocol No. 8). When considering the dynamics of the average annual teaching load of the teaching staff

conducting classes in residency over the past 5 years, the following was revealed: for teachers, the workload for the 2019-2020 academic year was 780 hours, in 2020-2021 - 700 hours, and from 2021 to the present - 650 hours. For clinical mentors, the workload has not changed from 2019 to the present and is 1,500 hours.

The experts received responses about the advanced training program for teachers. Information about the teachers involved in the implementation of the OP "Pathological Anatomy" who have undergone training in professional skills is presented in [Table 6, paragraph C](#). In 2018, the head of the Department of Morphology, L.M. Stabaeva, completed a clinical internship in Russia, St. Petersburg (2 weeks).

The salary fund of teachers consists of the state budget and extra-budgetary funds. There is also differentiated payment, based on the Regulation on the rating of the department and the assessment of the activities of the teaching staff. based on the Regulation on the department rating and assessment of the activities of the teaching staff According to the Regulation on remuneration of NJSC MUK (approved by the Chairman of the Board - Rector of NJSC MUK on 17.11.2023), additional payments are made to the authors' team for publishing an article with an impact factor of more than 1, in international peer-reviewed scientific journals (indexed in Web of Science, Scopus). If the indicators are successfully met, the teaching staff is stimulated annually in the form of a bonus. Additional payment for conducting classes in English to the teaching staff with an IELTS certificate (5.5 points and above) or TOEFL (525 points and above) in the amount of 100% of the Base salary (including external part-time workers (master's students, doctoral students).

Funding for mentors is carried out in accordance with the Regulation on remuneration of NJSC MUK (approved by the Chairman of the Board - Rector of NJSC MUK on 17.11.2023),

Experts have found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature, medical documentation, statistical processing, participation in scientific projects.

The educational organization has an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies - 84% of the surveyed teachers answered, and 16% partially agree with this. Studied in programs for improving professional qualifications - 84% less than 1 year ago, 16% during the current year, 0% more than 3 years ago, 0% more than 5 years ago and 0% answered "I do not remember when it was".

The organization implements social support programs for teachers - 64% answered that "yes, such programs exist", 4% "I have already used this", 0% of respondents answered that there are no such programs, and 28% of respondents do not know about it.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 8 standards (including 7 basic, 1 Standard of improvement): fully - 8, partially - 0, do not comply.

Recommendations for improvement: none.

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

6.1 Material and technical support and equipment

The training of residents is conducted at the Clinic of the Medical University NJSC "MUK," including residents of the accredited educational program in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy." Training is based at the following facilities: the Regional Clinical Hospital (RCH), the Clinic of the Medical University NJSC "MUK," the Regional Children's Clinical Hospital (RCCH), and the Multidisciplinary Hospital named after Professor K.Zh. Makazhanov. There are 5 lecture halls, 2 conference rooms for seminars and journal clubs, 5 laboratories (pathomorphological laboratories at clinical bases), a library with 443 seats, and a computer lab with 113 seats.

Experts visited the library, which provides residents and staff with internet access. The Wi-Fi network is available throughout the library. The electronic resources room is equipped with 2 scanners, and the interactive room is equipped with a short-throw projector. For students, the Researcher's Hall is available, equipped with 15 computers connected to the internet, allowing access to all university

information resources. Electronic hall services operate Monday through Friday from 9:00 AM to 8:00 PM and on Saturdays from 9:00 AM to 6:00 PM. The MUK library is equipped with two information kiosks that enable users to place electronic orders for required literature through the electronic catalog based on the “Web-IRBIS” module. As of November 1, 2022, the university library’s collection comprises 450,374 / 42,710 (copies/titles) and meets the requirements for literature provision.

To support the educational process in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy," the provision of core and supplementary literature is 100%. This includes a total of 41 textbooks, of which 21 are in Kazakh, 4 scientific publications, and 9 electronic editions. Currently, the following publications are being prepared for release:

1. Monograph: "Pathological Anatomy of the Perinatal Periods" by authors M.M. Tusupbekova and L.M. Stabaeva.

2. Educational and methodological manual: "MORPHOLOGY OF REGENERATION AND ADAPTATION PROCESSES" ("РЕГЕНЕРАЦІЯ ЖӘНЕ АДАПТАЦІЯ ҮРДІСІНІҢ МОРФОЛОГИЯСЫ") by L.M. Stabaeva, M.M. Tusupbekova, R.Zh. Nygyzbaeva, and G.N. Imanbaeva.

There is access to international databases, including Cochrane Library, EBSCO, BMJ Best Practice, BMJ Learning, and CBS eBooks. Residents are aware of this access.

At the start of each discipline within the educational program, residents receive a syllabus from the instructor and are informed about the skills they are expected to acquire and develop during the course.

During the experts’ visit to the Department of Morphology and clinical bases, they noted the excellent facilities and the availability of all necessary academic documentation. During a meeting with the department head, L.M. Stabaeva, an electronic platform for resident evaluation was demonstrated.

The updating of the material and technical base, including the library collection, occurs annually. Over the past five years, the following updates have been made: the university has subscribed to electronic libraries such as Consultant Student, Consultant Doctor, Lan’, Epigraph, Aknurpress, and RMEB, which collectively provide access to more than 10,000 electronic textbooks, teaching aids, and supplementary materials across various disciplines in Kazakh, Russian, and English.

6.2 Clinical bases

A review of the resources demonstrated that they align with the goals and objectives of the educational activities. The primary clinical bases for residents specializing in "Pathological Anatomy" are located at State Communal Enterprise (SCE) "Regional Clinical Hospital," the Clinic of the Medical University NJSC "MUK," SCE "Regional Children's Clinical Hospital," and SCE on the Right of Economic Management (REM) "Multidisciplinary Hospital Named After Professor Kh. Zh. Makazhanov."

Staff members of NJSC MUK maintain collegial and ethical relationships with the medical personnel and management of the clinical bases to achieve the desired outcomes for the residents. A sufficient number of thematic pathological and anatomical objects (cadavers, pathohistological specimens, surgical and biopsy materials), modern equipment, and unrestricted access for learners are ensured. Faculty members provide high-quality education while adhering to ethical standards and principles of deontology.

During visits to the clinical bases—SCE "Regional Clinical Hospital", the Clinic of the Medical University NJSC "MUK", SCE "Regional Children's Clinical Hospital", and SCE on REM "Multidisciplinary Hospital Named After Professor Kh. Zh. Makazhanov"—the experts conducted an assessment of the resources. This included evaluating their compliance with educational programs, accessibility for instructors and residents, and determining whether the equipment is modern and meets the needs of the learners and practical healthcare.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence of the quality of the programs, an interview was conducted with residents. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, sufficiency of time for pathological diagnostics, work with medical

documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and the qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents in need of it, participation in the "Journal Clubs", and the availability of resources for international databases of professional literature. Residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, since they believe that the educational organization has good resources, image, and international connections. Residents demonstrated their commitment to NJSC MUK, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgments on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in research, financing, and demonstrated proficiency in English when answering questions from a foreign expert, R.A. Nasyrov. Experts have studied the documents of residents (portfolio, results of resident assessment-checklists, results of resident questionnaires). All documents are prepared in accordance with the requirements.

6.3 Information technology

The experts assessed the access of residents and teachers to the necessary web resources, including the student portal, an additional information resource - the Platonus platform for obtaining information on the results of current and final academic performance. as well as access to electronic media (Cochrane Library, CBS, eBooks, EBSCO, BMJ BestPractice, BMJ Learning). Residents confirmed that they can also use the Electronic Library of the Medical University "Student Consultant", the Electronic Medical Library "Doctor's Consultant", the Electronic Library System "Lan", the Electronic Library "Epigraph", the Portal of Multimedia Textbooks "Epigraph", including in preparation for classes.

Information and communication technologies are represented by the following: CochraneLibrary, CBS, eBooks, EBSCO, BMJ BestPractice, BMJ Learning,

The educational program uses such technologies as the Electronic Library of the Medical University "Student Consultant", Electronic Medical Library "Doctor Consultant", Electronic Library System "Lan", Electronic Library "Epigraph", Portal of Multimedia Textbooks "Epigraph". During independent study, residents use CochraneLibrary, CBS, eBooks, EBSCO, BMJ BestPractice, BMJ Learning). Residents confirmed that they can also use the Electronic Library of the Medical University "Student Consultant", Electronic Medical Library "Doctor Consultant", Electronic Library System "Lan", Electronic Library "Epigraph", Portal of Multimedia Textbooks "Epigraph". Access to patient data and the health information system is carried out through KMIS.

6.4 Clinical teams

In order to develop the residents' experience of working in a team, NJSC MUK holds events such as interprofessional conferences, pathological conferences. Interprofessional interaction is also carried out through a journal club. Residents of the Pathological Anatomy EP take an active part in telemedicine with subsequent submission to KMIS of the results of the interdisciplinary consultation, in pathological conferences, and commissions for the study of fatal outcomes.

Residents can conduct health education events among patients and training events among interns. For example, during her clinical practice, resident S.S. Abieva of the Pathological Anatomy EP provides advisory and methodological assistance to 6th-year students majoring in Dentistry and 6th-year interns majoring in General Medicine when working with biopsy-autopsy material located in the pathological department.

In the questionnaire, residents noted that they have free access to patients at clinical sites and all the conditions for improving their practical skills - 100% of teachers completely agree with this.

6.5 Medical scientific research and achievements

The NJSC MUK carries out research work in the following areas: BR 11065386-OT-22 "COVID-19: Scientific and technological substantiation of the response system to the spread of new respiratory infections, including coronavirus infection." Scientific Director of the program - MD, Turmukhambetova A.A. (2021-2023)

National program for the implementation of personalized and preventive medicine in the Republic of Kazakhstan. Scientific Director - MD, Turmukhambetova A.A. (2021-2023) Head of the EP "Pathological Anatomy", Head of the Department L.M. Stabaeva is involved as a responsible

executor in the implementation of a scientific project on grant financing of the Ministry of Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Assessment of preimplantation use of a combination of vascular-stromal fraction of adipose tissue and platelet-rich plasma in improving the quality of lipofilling" (2024-2026). Over 5 years, success has been achieved in research work. Residents of all years of study are involved in the implementation of scientific work (or fragments). They perform such types of work as collecting material, literature review, statistical processing. All information about the scientific work is included in the resident's portfolio, the structure of which is based on the Regulation on the residency of the NJSC MUK.

The educational program does not include topics where residents study research methods in medicine. If residents carry out scientific and practical research, they are provided with access to instrumental and laboratory equipment. For example, in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy", it is planned to conduct research work on the topics of Pathological anatomy of diseases of perinatal age." This information was obtained through interviews with teachers.

Interviews with 35 teachers, including 3 full-time faculty members of the morphology department, showed that there are both successes and problems in education management, depending on the specific base (access for residents to equipment, sufficient number of subject patients, time for maintaining medical records, independent work).

6.6 Expertise in the field of education

Expertise in education includes the following areas: bachelor's degree, internship, residency, master's degree and doctoral studies, which are designed in the form of research, including residency in pathological anatomy.

Expertise of educational programs in NJSC "MUK" is carried out at the stages of development, approval and updating of the educational program. The policy and procedures for the examination of educational programs are regulated by the [Regulation on the management of the educational program](#) of NJSC "MUK". Educational programs in the areas of residency are developed by the head of the educational program in accordance with the National Qualifications Framework, professional standards, Dublin descriptors and the European Qualifications Framework. Expertise of the Concept of the educational program is carried out by the Academic Committee of the Senate of NJSC "MUK". Educational programs undergo internal examination in the Quality Assurance Commission under the SR and PD. The composition of the commission is approved at a meeting of the school and includes the faculty from the school, representatives of practical healthcare (employers) and residents. Educational programs of residency are approved by the Board. EPs are included in the Register of the Unified system of higher education management upon approval by external expert reviewers.

Sociological surveys, including issues of education quality, have become one of the mechanisms for education expertise in the NJSC MUK. The expertise is carried out in the form of an analysis of the need for specialists, an analysis of resident training methods, and the results allow us to draw conclusions about the quality of innovative changes in postgraduate education. For example, when talking with teachers, they noted that there is a shortage of pathologists in many regions of the country.

The mechanisms for motivating and developing the interest of employees and teachers in conducting research in the field of postgraduate education are incentive bonuses for publishing scientific papers in journals with an impact factor of more than 1, in international peer-reviewed scientific publications (indexed in Web of Science, Scopus).

Additional payment for psycho-emotional stress (for psycho-emotional and physical stress, employees of clinical departments of NJSC "MUK" are entitled to an additional payment, proportional to the position held, upon the provision of the chief physician of the clinic). Additional payment for conducting classes in English for the teaching staff with an IELTS certificate (5.5 points and above) or TOEFL (525 points and above) in the amount of 100% of the Basic official salary (including external part-time workers (master's students, doctoral students).

Resources for clinical training are updated annually.

6.7 Training in other institutions

The academic policy for training residents includes the possibility of training in alternative organizations if the existing clinical bases do not cover all the topics of the educational program. At the same time, training of residents in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" is carried out on the basis of the Regional Clinical Hospital of Karaganda, Multidisciplinary Hospital No. 1, Multidisciplinary Hospital named after prof. Makazhan, Multidisciplinary Hospital No. 3, as well as the Clinic of the NJSC MUK, where there are departments of pathomorphological research. The preparation of scientific publications is carried out under the supervision of a teacher and does not require additional bases for training. However, residents can participate in academic mobility within the country, for example, an agreement has been concluded with the NJSC SMU, NJSC MUA, etc. on the basis of the "[Regulations on the organization of academic mobility](#)" in the Academic Policy of the NJSC "MUK".

There is a document on the transfer and offset of learning outcomes between educational organizations: [Academic Policy](#).

The university has a coordinator of academic mobility programs. To ensure academic mobility of students and recognition of the EP, the academic disciplines mastered by students (with credits and grades) are compared and re-credited when changing the educational trajectory, educational institution and country of study using ECTS (European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System) credits. An academic credit within the ECTS measures the complexity of studying a discipline, both in the classroom and during independent work. In 2022-2024, academic mobility was not provided for in the EP "Pathological Anatomy" ([Table 11](#)).

The teachers of the educational organization actively participate in national and international events. Thus, 2 teachers took part in international conferences. Such participation allows applying the information received in the educational process.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply with 18 standards (including 11 basic, 7 improvement standards): fully - 18, partially - 0, do not comply - 0

Recommendations for improvement: none.

Standard 7: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME EVALUATION

7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

Monitoring of the educational program is a continuous multi-level process that covers the assessment of all areas affecting the quality of the educational program, which ensures transparency of the process and results. Annual analysis of the educational program will allow NJSC MUK to make adjustments and improve the content. The educational program in pathological anatomy was approved in September 2023 and has not yet undergone the adjustment process. scheduled for September 2024. The mechanism for monitoring the educational program includes several stages: planning, data collection, analysis/conclusions, necessary improvements with subsequent monitoring of changes. In accordance with the Academic Policy of NJSC MUK, all university structures involved in the implementation and quality management of the educational program participate in monitoring the educational program.

When evaluating the program, the goals and objectives of training, the final learning outcomes (through the assessment of residents, independent examination) are taken into account. The process of implementing the educational program is assessed through feedback from residents and teachers and the achievements of graduates. For example, a survey of 1-year residents in the specialty of pathological anatomy demonstrated the following: all the courses covered fully reflect the needs of the practical pathological anatomy service.

The assessment of approaches to the admission of residents is carried out through a comprehensive analysis.

The selection and compliance of teachers and teaching methods is also carried out through feedback from residents.

The assessment of methods for assessing the knowledge and skills of residents is carried out using electronic platforms and demonstrates transparency and objectivity.

The assessment of the sufficiency and quality of educational resources is carried out through a

survey of stakeholders, which is conducted by the strategic development department, the results of which are monitored by the SR and PD department and show that changes are being made in the educational program based on the survey.

7.2 Feedback from teachers and residents

Feedback from teachers, residents, and employers is regularly collected at NJSC MUK. Every year in September, questionnaires are sent to employers. The questionnaire contains 15 questions and they are devoted to the educational program, teaching methods, assessment, and so on. The results of the employer survey on pathological anatomy have not yet been conducted, since the EP was approved in 2023, a survey is planned for September 2024.

A questionnaire has been developed for the survey of teachers, including 30 questions, including on "pathological anatomy". The survey of residents is conducted by questionnaire after each completed discipline.

Due to the fact that the specialty "pathological anatomy" is accredited for the first time, there are no survey results for previous years.

7.3 Results of residents and graduates

The results of residents and graduates are indicators of the quality of educational programs. The final results of the assessment of residents in various specialties in 2022 show the following: a high level of practical skills and theoretical knowledge of graduates of the NJSC MUK is confirmed by the results of an independent examination of the NCIE.

Monitoring of graduates of the residency program is carried out through surveys of employers. The graduation of residents in "Pathological Anatomy" is planned for 2025.

Since the entire process of training and monitoring of residents is concentrated in the SR and PD, the results of the assessment of the clinical practice of residents and graduates are immediately sent to the responsible persons. The head of the department is responsible for the residency programs.

7.4 Involvement of stakeholders

The NJSC MUK has approaches to involving teachers and residents in the assessment of the educational program and monitoring its implementation. Thus, a resident in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" is included in the advisory body of the "SR and PD" and participates in the discussion of all issues of the educational process. The EP "Pathological Anatomy" was discussed at a meeting of the Department of Morphology, the reviewer is the head of the pathological anatomical block of the Clinic of the NJSC "Medical University Karaganda" E.K. Kamyshansky <https://cloud.mail.ru/public/QQHo/CfFDNWLS9>; at a meeting of the School of Residency and Professional Development (Minutes No. of September 8, 2022) <https://cloud.mail.ru/public/cKSd/QJMD6yigf>, approved by the Senate of the NJSC MUK (Minutes No. of June 14, 2022). The EP has been agreed upon with the supervising vice-rector and approved by the Chairman of the Board, the rector of NJSC MUK. The EP has undergone an external examination for inclusion in the Register of EPs of the EPVO.

Interviews with 17 employers were conducted offline and included questions such as: knowledge of the university mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in training residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, 100% employment of residency graduates, etc.

7.5 Procedure for approving educational programs

The educational organization has a system for documenting the educational process, including approval of the educational program, which includes the following: development in accordance with the license for the right to conduct educational activities within the framework of groups of educational programs according to the classifier of training areas, in accordance with the "[Regulations](#)

[on the management of the educational program](#)" and the Academic Policy of NJSC "MUK". All stakeholders, including students and employers, are involved in the process of developing educational programs and monitoring educational activities within the EP. The development of the EP is based on the principles of constructing educational programs: student-oriented approach; competence-based approach; result-oriented approach; modular structure of educational programs; scientifically oriented training. At the stage of developing the EP, an assessment of the EP is simultaneously carried out, since it is discussed at meetings of departments, the School of Medicine, undergoes an examination of the Quality Assurance Commission of the School of Residency and Professional Development and is approved at a meeting of the Board. The University has formed a pool of experts who conduct an examination of educational programs, including at the planning stage.

The educational program is approved by the Senate of the NJSC MUK based on such criteria as compliance with the 2022 State Compulsory Educational Standard and the Model curriculum. The interested parties involved in the approval of the educational program are the teaching staff, students, employers, pathologists, etc.

A system for monitoring the quality and compliance of clinical bases, material and technical equipment and educational resources has been developed and implemented, which includes the following: provision of classrooms, offices, availability of technical training tools and equipment. Residents are trained at the clinical bases of medical organizations on the basis of contracts (Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No. RK MOH-304/2020 "On approval of the provisions on the clinical base, clinic of an educational organization in the field of healthcare, university hospital, residency base, integrated academic medical center and the requirements imposed on them"). When preparing agreements between a clinical base and a MUK, the characteristics of the base, the profile of the departments, the availability of an accreditation certificate certifying the compliance of the clinical base's activities with the accreditation standards in the field of healthcare in the Republic of Kazakhstan are considered. According to the agreement, clinical bases bear joint responsibility for the quality of training of future specialists, providing departments with high-quality educational facilities, ensuring access to patients and modern diagnostic equipment. The head of the EP controls the updating of the above documents.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply with 10 standards (including 7 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully - 10, partially - 0, do not comply - 0

Standard 8: MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION

8.1 Management

Residency training is conducted in accordance with the requirements of such regulatory rules regarding the admission of residents as the "Model Rules for Admission to Education in Educational Organizations Implementing Educational Programs of Higher and Postgraduate Education", approved by the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600. Assessment of knowledge and skills is carried out on the basis of entrance examinations; examination committees for groups of educational programs are created by order of the Chairman of the Board-Rector. Admission of persons to residency is carried out on a competitive basis based on the results of entrance examinations. Persons entering residency pass an entrance exam in the profile of a group of educational programs.

To implement the educational program, the educational organization has an organizational structure in which the educational sector is represented by the SR and PD. A certificate of completion of residency is issued to residents by the Department of Academic Work in the form of assigning a specialist qualification in the relevant educational program and issuing a specialist certificate.

The NJSC MUK operates an internal quality assurance system in accordance with the requirements of the international standard ISO 9001:2015, Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG).

The training of a resident physician in the EP "Pathological Anatomy" is carried out in accordance with:

- SCES for levels of education in the field of healthcare Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 63 dated July 4, 2022
- Standard curriculum (hereinafter referred to as SCC) for medical and pharmaceutical specialties Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 4 dated January 9, 2023
- Model curriculum (hereinafter referred to as MC);
- Instructional letter No. 8 "On the development of educational and methodological documentation in educational organizations of the Republic of Kazakhstan implementing residency training" (2010);
- Model curriculum;
- Modular educational programs;
- Academic calendar;
- Individual work plans for a residency student.

8.2 Academic Leadership

The responsibilities and obligations of the management and employees for postgraduate medical education, which are assigned to the SR and PD and are fixed in the document "Regulations on the residency of the NJSC MUK", are defined. Transparency of management and decision-making in the educational process is ensured by means of questionnaires, audits, which is reflected in the document "In accordance with the requirements of the documented procedure DP NJSC "MUK" 9.3-08 "Analysis by the management".

NJSC MUK evaluates the management of the educational process and employees in relation to the achievement of the residency program mission, the expected final learning outcomes by conducting feedback with residents and teachers (see section 7.2 of the report), audits on educational process issues.

To the question of the questionnaire "Do the organization's managers listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, R&D, clinical work", 72% of teachers answered that they do so systematically, 24% answered "sometimes", 0% "quite rarely", 0% "never".

8.3 Budget for training and resource allocation

The department responsible for planning and distributing finances in the residency programs is the economic block of the NJSC MUK. The scope of duties, responsibilities and powers are reflected in the job descriptions of the economic block approved by the Senate of the NJSC MUK.

A financial plan is drawn up annually, including a target budget for training. The process of forming the university budget for the current year includes determining the income and expenditure base. The income part of the university budget is formed by financial receipts from the following items:

- main educational activities (educational grant and income from educational activities on a fee basis);
- other activities (implementation of research work, publishing and printing services, medical services, dormitory services, etc.).

The financial plan corresponds to the strategic plan for the period 2023-2025.

A financial report is submitted annually, which is approved by the Senate of the MUK and demonstrates, among other things, the distribution of educational resources in accordance with the needs and coverage of all types of expenses for the implementation and development of the residency program.

8.4 Administration and Management

To ensure effective management of the educational process, the staff of the DAA, SR and PD underwent professional development in 2023 on the following topics: "Curriculum Development", "Innovations in the Educational Process", and "The Application of Artificial Intelligence in Education".

The experts found that the quality management system (QMS) was introduced in 2005 and includes regular internal and external audits, including those that ensure the residency program of processes. The vice-rector for strategic development and international cooperation is responsible for the implementation and monitoring of the QMS. The teachers are aware of the QMS, which is confirmed during their interviews. The main documents of the QMS are the following: ISO guidelines, "Organization of preparation for institutional and specialized accreditation in NJSC MUK".

The assessment of the administration and management of the educational process as a whole and the educational program of the residency in the specialty "Pathological Anatomy" is carried out through questionnaires and audits, and the results demonstrate such achievements as the introduction of innovative teaching methods, methods of assessment and control of residents' knowledge.

8.5 Requirements and regulations

NJSC MUK complies with the recommendations of national authorized bodies, including the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Thus, in accordance with the classifier of residency specialties (On approval of the Classifier of areas of training personnel with higher and postgraduate education. Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 13, 2018 No. 569), the educational organization provides training in 33 specialties at the beginning of the 2023-2024 academic year. All educational programs are provided with relevant educational and methodological documents and teachers.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply with 11 standards (including 8 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully - 11, partially - 0, do not comply - 0

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

The procedure for updating the organizational structure is reflected in the Development Program of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" for 2024-2028, approved on December 11, 2023 by the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 1105 (<https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/P2300001105>), and in 2023, such changes were made as requirements for the design and content of educational programs with an annual update of the Regulation on residency, the Regulation on the rating system for assessing student performance, Process Maps, Instructions, Documented Procedures, Management Structures, then, in order to bring to the attention of university employees, updated regulatory documents are posted on the corporate website of the University, and also sent to the corporate mail of the OutlookWebApp divisions.

Updates to the educational program are based on prospective studies and analyses, taking into account the results of our own experience, studying literature on medical education and studying the needs of the labor market, and are accompanied by the development of changes to the EP and are presented in the [Regulation on the management of the educational program. https://cloud.mail.ru/public/xnK3/8E1rt5zoG](https://cloud.mail.ru/public/xnK3/8E1rt5zoG).

NJSC MUK annually allocates resources for continuous improvement. For targeted improvement of the educational process, sociological research is conducted, including an annual analysis of the strategic plan for the development of activities in accordance with the documented procedure for the implementation plan of the Operational Plan of NJSC MUK and monitoring its implementation, and literature on postgraduate medical education is studied ([Regulations on the management of the educational program, https://cloud.mail.ru/public/xnK3/8E1rt5zoG](https://cloud.mail.ru/public/xnK3/8E1rt5zoG)). In the process of such analysis, approaches to teaching in residency were revised, and such methods as revision of control forms, 30% update of test questions, written assignments taking into account new concepts of diagnostics and treatment were introduced. Thus, in the 2021-2022 academic year, interim certification of residents was introduced in the form of portfolio defense at the end of the academic year. The results of the analysis, recommendations of the certification committee determine the need to improve the EP.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply out of 2 standards (including 1 basic, 1 Standard of improvement): fully - 2, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.

CONCLUSION: during the external evaluation of the educational programme, it was found that out of 114 standards (including basic standards - 82 and improvement standards - 32), full compliance is demonstrated by 113 standards for accreditation, including 81 basic standards and 31 improvement standards. 1 basic standards are partially fulfilled. No non-compliance with standards was found.

5. Recommendations for improvement of the educational programme "Pathological anatomy" of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda":

1. Expand the catalogue of elective disciplines taking into account the need to ensure competencies in the scientific foundations and methodology of medical research, including clinical research and epidemiology (2.2.1).

6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC came to a unanimous opinion to recommend that the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit the educational programme **7R01145 "Pathological anatomy" of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"** for a period of 5 years.

	Full name	Signature
Chairman	Zhanalina Bakhyt Sekerbekovna	
International Expert	Nasyrov Ruslan Abdullaevich	
International Expert	Troinich Yana Nikolaevna	
Academic Expert	Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna	
Academic Expert	Madyarov Valentin Manarbekovich	
Academic Expert	Nugmanova Aigul Maratovna	
Academic Expert	Apbasova Saulesh Akhatovna	
Academic Expert	Yesetova Gulstan Utegenovna	
Academic Expert	Sadykova Ainur Maralovna	
Academic Expert	Tuksanbaeva Gulfariza Usenbaevna	
Academic Expert	Iztleuov Yerbolat Maratovich	
Academic Expert	Pak Laura Alekseevna	
Academic Expert	Kamhen Vitaly Bronislavovich	
Employer Expert	Daniyarova Bayan Lashinovna	
Student Expert	Dyusembek Nazira Askerbekkyzy	

Профиль качества и критерии внешней оценки образовательной программы (обобщение)

Standard	Критерии оценки	Количество стандартов	БС*/СУ	Оценка		
				Полностью соответствует	Частично соответствует	Не соответствует
1.	МИССИЯ И КОНЕЧНЫЕ РЕЗУЛЬТАТЫ	14	9/5	9/5		
2.	ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНАЯ ПРОГРАММА	22	19/3	18/3	1	
3.	ОЦЕНКА РЕЗИДЕНТОВ	9	6/3	6/3		
4.	РЕЗИДЕНТЫ	20	14/6	14/6		
5.	АКАДЕМИЧЕСКИЙ ШТАТ/ПРЕПОДАВАТЕЛИ	8	7/1	7/1		
6.	ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНЫЕ РЕСУРСЫ	18	11/7	11/7		
7.	ОЦЕНКА ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНОЙ ПРОГРАММЫ	10	7/3	7/3		
8.	УПРАВЛЕНИЕ И АДМИНИСТРИРОВАНИЕ	11	8/3	8/3		
9.	НЕПРЕРЫВНОЕ УЛУЧШЕНИЕ	2	1/1	1/1		
		114	82/32	114		

Список документов, изученных членами ВЭЖ в рамках проведения внешней оценки образовательной программы резидентуры

№	Наименования документов/дата утверждения	Количество
1.	Стратегическая программа развития НАО «МУК»	1
2.	Академическая политика НАО «МУК»	1
3.	Кадровая политика НАО «МУК»	1
4.	Нормы времени для расчета объема учебной работы на 2023-2024 учебный год	1
5.	Политика приема обучающихся в НАО «МУК»	1
6.	Правила приема сотрудников при трудоустройстве в НАО «МУК»	1
7.	Правила рейтинговой системы оценки успеваемости обучающихся	1
8.	Правила внутреннего распорядка для обучающихся	1
9.	Политика управления рисками НАО «МУК»	1
10.	Положение о Совете Школы	1
11.	Положение о Сенате НАО «МУК»	1
12.	Положение об оплате труда НАО «МУК»	1
13.	Положение об оценке деятельности подразделений НАО «МУК»	1
14.	Положение о резидентуре НАО «МУК»	1
15.	Положение о повышении квалификации сотрудников	1
16.	ОП «Инфекционные болезни взрослые, детские»	1
17.	Выписки из протокола заседания кафедры	5
18.	Выписки из протокола заседания ШР и ПР	6
19.	Штатное расписание ППС, график работы	1
20.	Список выпускников за 2021-2022, за 2022-2023 учебный год	2
21.	Оценочный лист резидентов	3
22.	Средняя педагогическая нагрузка ППС на 2023-2024 учебный год	1
23.	Силлабусы	12
24.	Список публикации штатных ППС по специальности «Инфекционные болезни взрослые детские»	1
25.	Повышение профессиональной и педагогической квалификации штатных преподавателей по специальности: инфекционные болезни взрослые, детские»	7
26.	Повышение педагогической квалификации клинических наставников по специальности «Инфекционные болезни взрослые, детские»	5
27.	Укомплектованность научной и учебной литературы НАО «МУК»	1
28.	Список опубликованных работ резидентами по специальности: «Инфекционные болезни взрослые, детские» за период 2020 по 2023 г.г.	1
29.	Трудоустройство резидентов по специальности «Инфекционные болезни взрослые, детские»	1
30.	Сведения о финансировании и основных расходах на обучение (к Стандарту 8 «Управление и администрирование», п.8.3)	1