

To the Accreditation Council of the  
Eurasian Center for Accreditation and  
Quality Assurance in Education and Health Care  
05/27/2024

**REPORT  
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF  
THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME IN  
SPECIALTY  
7R01115 "NEPHROLOGY FOR ADULTS, CHILDREN"  
OF THE NJSC "MEDICAL UNIVERSITY OF KARAGANDA " FOR  
COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS FOR ACCREDITATION OF  
POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMMES (RESIDENCE  
SPECIALTIES) OF MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS**

**Period of external expert evaluation: May 15-17, 2024**

**Almaty, 2024**

## CONTENT

	List of designations and abbreviations	
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	
2.	General part of the final report	
2.1	Presentation of the educational programme in the specialty - 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children" of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"	
2.2	Information on previous accreditation	
2.3	Conclusion on the results of the analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational programme in the specialty - 7R09115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children" of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" for compliance with the Standards for accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions	
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	
4.	Analysis of compliance with standards for accreditation based on the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme in the specialty - 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children" of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"	
5.	Recommendations for improving the educational programme in the specialty - 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children" of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"	
6.	Recommendations to the Accreditation Council	
	Annex 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty of the educational programme in the specialty - 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children" of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"	
	Annex 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	

## LIST OF DESIGNATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS

<b>Abbreviation</b>	<b>Explanation</b>
AC	Academic Committee
AP	Academic Policy
HEI	Higher Education Institution
SCES	State Compulsory Education Standard
DAA	Department of Academic Affairs
DET	Distance Educational Technologies
DI & ID	Department of Informatization and Infrastructure Development
DHRM	Department of Human Resources Management
UHEP	Unified Higher Education Platform
FCC	Final Certification Committee
End-of-course asses	End-of-course assessment
IEP	Individual educational plan
IWP	Individual Work Plan
EC	Elective Component
IMIS	Integrated Medical Information System
CED	Catalog of Elective Disciplines
QACS	Quality Assurance Committee of the School of Residency and Professional Development
MSE	Municipal State-Owned Enterprise
MOH	Ministry of Health
LEA	Local Executive Authorities
NJSC MUK	Non-Commercial Joint-Stock Company "Medical University of Karaganda"
NCIE	National Center for Independent Examination
SC	Scientific Center
RI	Research Institute
RW	Research Work
EP	Educational programme
CPS	Certification of Practical Skills
ICU	Intensive Care Unit
RAA	Rating Assessment admission
OSCE	Objective structured clinical examination
MD	Major disciplines
PC	Profile competencies
PHC	Primary health care
Academic staff	Academic staff
RK	Republic of Kazakhstan
LO	Learning outcome
WC	Working curriculum
SSS	Student support service
IWR	Independent work of residents
IWRT	Independent work of residents with teachers
PMS	Employee performance management system
SSh	Secondary school
TB	Terabyte
TVET	Technical and vocational education
LLP	Limited liability partnership
TC	Typical curriculum

EMC	Educational and methodological complex
PHD KO	Public Health Department of the Karaganda region
FAT	Faculty of advanced training
CSET	Center for simulation and educational technologies
CPS	Center for practical skills
CAT	Center for advanced training
SR & PD	School of residency and professional development
AMEE	An international association medical education
CBL	Cased – based learning
ECTS	European Credit Transfer System
GPA	Grade point average
PBL	Problem-based learning
RBL	Research-based learning
TBL	Team-based learning
LO	Learning outcome

### 1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with the order of the ECAQA No. 15 dated 02.05.2024, the External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty "7R01115 NEPHROLOGY FOR ADULTS, CHILDREN" in the period from May 15 to 17, 2024, consisting of the following members:

No.	Status in the EEC	Full name	Academic degree/title, position, place of work/place of study, year, specialty
1	Chairman	ZHANALINA BAKHYT SEKERBEKOVNA	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Surgical and Paediatric Dentistry of the West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov, Excellent Worker of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan
2	International Expert	NASYROV RUSLAN ABDULLAYEVICH	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Vice-Rector for Research, Head of the Department of Pathological Anatomy with a Course in Forensic Medicine of the St. Petersburg State Paediatric Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, Member of the New York Academy of Sciences
3	International Expert	TRAINICH YANA NIKOLAEVNA	Vice-Rector for Educational and Upbringing Affairs of the Armenian-Russian International University "Mkhitar Gosh", translator of medical literature - Logosfera Publishing House. Head of the Student Scientific Society at the Department of Histology, Perm State Medical University
4	Academic Expert	ZHUMALINA AKMARAL KANASHEVNA	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Paediatric Diseases with Neonatology, West Kazakhstan State Medical University named after Marat Ospanov
5	Academic Expert	MADIAROV VALENTIN MANARBEEKOVICH,	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Surgery with a Course in Anaesthesiology and Resuscitation, Kazakh-Russian Medical University
6	Academic Expert	APBASOVA SAULESH AKHATOVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Assistant of the Department of Pathological Anatomy and Forensic Medicine named after Professor Yu.V. Pruglo, Semey Medical University
7	Academic Expert	NUGMANOVA AIGUL MARATOVNA	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Paediatrics with a Course in Paediatric Infectious Diseases, Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University
8	Academic Expert	YESETOVA GULSTAN UTEGENOVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Pulmonology, Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov"
9	Academic Expert	SADIKOVA AINUR MARALOVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Infectious and Tropical Diseases of the National Joint-Stock Company "Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov", member of the

			working groups for the preparation and participation in the National Rating of Educational programmes of the National Chamber of Entrepreneurs "ATAMEKEN", for conducting institutional accreditation
10	Academic Expert	TUKSANBAEVA GULFARIZA USENBAEVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Acting professor of the Department of Neurology, Psychiatry, Rehabilitation and Neurosurgery of the South Kazakhstan Medical Academy
11	Academic Expert	IZTLEUOV YERBOLAT MARATOVYCH	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Radiology of the NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov", member of the Local Ethics Commission on Research Work, internal auditor of the quality management service
12	Academic Expert	PAK LAURA ALEKSEEVNA	MD, PhD, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Clinical Oncology and Nuclear Medicine of the NJSC "Semey Medical University"
13	Academic Expert	KAMKHEN VITALY BRONISLAVOVICH	PhD, Associate Professor, Associate Professor of the Department of "Health Policy and Organization" of the NJSC "Al-Farabi Kazakh National University"
14	Employer Expert	DANIAROVA BAYAN LASHINOVNA	Deputy Director for Strategic Development of the MSE "Regional Clinical Hospital" of the Health Department of the Karaganda Region
15	Student Expert	DYUSEMBEK NAZIRA ASKERBEKKYZY,	Second-year resident in the specialty "Nephrology for Adults, Children" of the NJSC "Astana Medical University"

The EEC report includes a description of the results and the conclusion of the external evaluation of the external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children" for compliance with the Standards for accreditation for Postgraduate Education Programmes (Residency Specialties) of Medical Education Organizations and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Standards for accreditation), recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above-mentioned educational programme and recommendations for accreditation for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for Accreditation.

## 2. General part of the final report

### 2.1 Presentation of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children" of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"

Name of the organization, legal form of ownership, BIN	Non-profit Joint-Stock Company "Karaganda Medical University of Karaganda", BIN: 190140033600
Management body	Sole shareholder - Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Management body - Board of Directors, executive body - Management Board
Full name of the first director	Turmukhambetova Anar Akyzbekovna, Chairman of the Management Board - Rector
Date of establishment	The University was founded in 1950. RSE on the REM "Karaganda State Medical University" was reorganized into NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" on the basis of order No. 82 of the Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 01/25/2019
Location and contact details	Republic of Kazakhstan, Karaganda region, Karaganda, st. Gogolya, 40, 100008
State license for educational activities in residency (date, number)	License for educational activities No. KZ32LAA00016018 dated 06.05.2019
Year of commencement of the implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP)	Start year - 2015 Total number of graduates since the beginning of the residency programs - 17 people.
Duration of training	2 years
Number of residents in the current academic year	1 course - 7 residents 2 course - 3 residents
Quality indicators in residency	Number of residents in the programme "Nephrology for Adults, Children" expelled over a period of 5 years - 2 people (at their own request), including for academic failure - 0 people. Employment rate, % in dynamics over 5 years: 2019 -100% 2020 -100% 2021 -100% 2022 – 100% 2023 - 100%
Full-time teachers/part-time workers involved in the implementation of the EP, incl. % of Sedateness	Total number of teachers – 10 people, including full-time – 6 people, part-time – 4 people.  Sedateness, % - 100% Categorization, % - 100%

The educational programme (EP) in the specialty "7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children" was first developed at NJSC "MUK" in 2015 in accordance with the National Qualifications Framework, professional standards approved in accordance with paragraph 2 of Article 117 of the Labour Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated November 23, 2015, and the State Compulsory Standard of Postgraduate Education.

Karaganda State Medical University, in accordance with license No. 14020603, issued on April 14, 2015 in the specialty "Nephrology, including paediatric", carried out the first recruitment of 3 residency students based on a state order. Since 2019, educational activities have been implemented in

accordance with the license in the direction of 7R091 Healthcare; KZ32LAA00016018 dated June 14, 2019. In the 2019-2020 academic year, there was a redistribution of educational process hours with a focus on the clinical training of the resident: 75% - independent work of the resident under the guidance of a clinical mentor, 15% - independent work of the resident, 10% - practical classes with a teacher.

In 2020, program 7R01115 - "Nephrology, including paediatric" was entered into the Register of educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education, updated in the Register in 2023 in accordance with the 2022 State Educational Standard No. 63. In 2022, there were changes in the volume of the academic workload: 80% of the hours for practical work under the guidance of a clinical mentor and independent work of the resident, 20% of the hours - for practical classes with a teacher. Residents have access to work in the Centre for Simulation and Educational Technologies to consolidate the acquired skills, actively participate in regularly held interdisciplinary competitions "Territory of Emergency Conditions". In connection with the recommendations for the entrance exam, the entrance exam program has been revised, which includes the result of comprehensive testing on the profile of the residency educational programme, independent examination and GPA in biomedical sciences for the entire period of study (bachelor's degree and internship), portfolio assessment (medical experience, scientific achievements corresponding to the profile of the educational programme).

In the implementation of the program, much attention is paid to the research work of residents, the development of academic mobility of residents between universities within the country, and visiting professors from near and far abroad.

Over the past 5 years, the contingent of residents was: in 2019-2020 - 4 (government order - 3, LEA - 1), in 2020-2021 - 3 (LEA - 1, business contract - 2), 2021-2022. – 5 (state order – 2, bus business contract – 2, local executive bodies – 1), in 2022-2023 – 4 (state order – 4, 1 resident resigned due to family circumstances), in 2023-2024 – 7 residents (state order – 4, business contract – 1, LEA – 1, grant from NJSC “MUK” – 1).

The graduation rate over the past 5 years was 16 residents, 100% of whom were employed in their specialty. There are 10 residents studying this year, including 7 in their first year of study and 3 in their second year of study.

The head of the program is an associate professor of the Department of Internal Medicine, Chairman of the State Unitary Enterprise of Therapeutic Specialties, Chairman of the Committee of Educational programmes in the Specialty "Nephrology" at the EMA RK in the direction of "Healthcare", developer of clinical protocols for diagnosis and treatment, professional standards, expert in the field of medical education PhD Bacheva I.V.

The program is implemented at the departments - internal medicine, paediatrics and neonatology, surgical diseases, pathology. The structure of the NJSC "MUK" is presented on the university website. Graduates of the residency program "Nephrology for Adults, Children" are in demand, the employment rate is 100%.

The mission of the University is to develop society, improve the health and quality of life of the population of Kazakhstan by achieving excellence in science, education and practice. The mission of the EP "7R01115 Nephrology for Adults, Children" is developed in accordance with the institutional (university-wide) Mission, and is aimed at training a highly qualified nephrologist who is able to meet the needs of society in providing medical care to patients, apply and develop advanced innovative technologies in medicine, science and practice throughout life, and improve the health of the population.

#### **STRENGTHS:**

1. The status of a research university allows for greater integration of education, science and practice in accordance with its mission.
2. Digitalization of the resident assessment process and commitment to the principles of academic integrity.
3. Availability of an information system for monitoring and evaluating the activities of the teaching staff



and connection with the motivation system.

4. Organization of simulation training based on the NCIE with international recognition (ASPIRE award from AMEE Association for Medical Education in Europe, entry into the international registers SESAM and SSH)

5. High quality of training, confirmed by the results of an independent assessment of the knowledge and skills of NCIE graduates.

6. Effective management of the university's activities due to organizational, financial, personnel and academic autonomy and developed corporate governance.

7. Regular participation of the university in major international projects, conferences on medical education and partnership with leading foreign universities ensures constant monitoring of current trends and adaptation of internal processes to modern standards, providing the university with a significant competitive advantage.

## **2.2 Information about previous accreditation**

In 2019, programme 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children" was accredited by the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (IAAR), registration number: AB No. 2591, accreditation period of the EP: 06/14/2019-06/13/2024.

## **2.3 Conclusion on the results of the analysis of the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children" of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions**

The report on the self-assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children" (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 133 pages of the main text, annexes on 13 pages, copies or electronic versions of 39 documents submitted in paper form.

The report is characterized by the completeness of answers to all 9 main standards for accreditation and criteria, structuring taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for conducting self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the educational organization by the accreditation centre - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the Chairman of the Board - Rector A.A. Turmukhambetova, which confirms the accuracy of the quantitative information and data included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of members of the internal commission for primary self-assessment indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting self-assessment of the educational programme for requesting and obtaining the necessary information - Madina Ainullaevna Yernazarova, Chief Specialist of the Strategic Development and Quality Management Department.

Self-assessment of the educational programme 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children" of NJSC "MUK" was carried out on the basis of a meeting of the commission for ensuring the quality of education in residency, protocol No. 3 dated 12/27/2023 "On approval of the composition of the working group for conducting self-assessment of educational programmes".

The report was reviewed by an accreditation expert, Professor A.M. Nugmanova and the reviews noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes, which were taken into account in the process of feedback with representatives of the university, and the corresponding changes and additions were made to the self-assessment report.

All standards provide the actual practice of NJSC "MUK" in training residents in the residency specialty 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children", substantiated data, examples of implementing the objectives of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of standards for accreditation. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated according to information on selection and admission, training results, knowledge and skills assessment results, material and technical base of NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" and existing clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, development and improvement

plans, etc. The report was submitted to the ECAQA in its final form, with adjustments to the data based on the expert's recommendations, written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, the tables contain references in the text and have continuous numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the primary accreditation procedure - external evaluation. The experts planned to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during a visit to the educational organization, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

### 3. Description of the external expert evaluation

The external expert work within the framework of the evaluation of the educational residency program 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programmes of the ECAQA. Dates of the visit to the organization: May 15-17, 2024. The sequence of the visit over 3 days is presented in detail in Annex 3 to this report.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- interviews with management and administrative staff – **33** people;
- interviews with residents - 47 people (studying in other specialties);
- study of the website <https://muk.qmu.kz/ru/ob-universitete>;
- interviews - 35 teachers, employers - 17, graduates - 24;
- questionnaires of teachers, graduate students and residents - 53, 9 and 39, respectively;
- review of resources in the context of fulfilling standards for accreditation: 3 practice/clinical training bases were visited, including (Multidisciplinary Regional Children's Hospital, Shakhterov Ave. 83, Multidisciplinary Regional Children's Hospital named after Professor Kh.Zh. Makazhanova, 5/3 Mukanov St., Regional Clinical Hospital, 41 Yerubaeva St.), where training is conducted in 3 educational programmes (7R01120 Paediatrics, 7R01145 Nephrology for Adults, Children, 7R01112 Neurology for Adults, Children);
- study of 39 educational and methodological documents both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents studied is in Annex 2).

The staff of the accredited organization ensured the presence of all persons specified in the visit program and in the lists of interview sites and conversations (Table 1).

**Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, and conversations with members of the EEC**

<b>№</b>	<b>Position</b>	<b>Quantity</b>
1	Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs - Toleubekov Kuatbek Kuanyshbekovich	1
2	Vice-Rector for Scientific and Clinical Affairs - Turgunov Yermek Meyramovich	1
3	Executive Director - Bekturganov Zakir Zakar'yanovich	1
4	Deans: - School of Residency and Professional Development - Tashkenbaeva Venera Bazarbekovna	1
	- School of Public Health - Dauletkalieva Zhaniya Abaevna	1
5	<b>Heads of the Residency and Master's Programs:</b>	1
	- 7R01114 "Neonatology" - Kizatova Saule Tanzilovna	
	- 7R01120 "Pediatrics" - Eremicheva Galina Georgievna	1
	- 7R01112 "Neurology (Adult, Children's)" - Grigolashvili Marina Archilovna	1
	- 7R01115 "Nephrology (Adult, Children's)" - Bacheva Irina Viktorovna	1
	- 7R01126 "Therapy" - Toyynbekova Rakhima Zhaksylykovna	1
	- 7R01116 "General Surgery" - Ruslan Maratovich Badyrov	1
- 7R01117 "Oncology (adult)" - Kabildina Nailya Amirbekovna	1	

	- 7R01107 “Infectious diseases for adults, children” - Alshynbekova Gulsharbat Kanagatovna	1
	- 7R01110 “Radiology” - Zholdybaeva Gulfairuz Ablavna	1
	- 7R01145 “Pathological anatomy” - Stabaeva Leila Medeubavna	1
	- 7M10119 Public health – Kulov Dyusentai Barkenovich	1
6	Meeting with members of the <b><u>Academic Committee of the Senate, the School Quality Assurance Commission by level of education</u></b> (master's degree, residency):	
	- Laryushina Yelena Mikhailovna, Head of the Department of Internal Medicine, Member of the Academic Committee of the Senate	1
	- Sarsenbaev Kasym Kuandykovich, Dean of the International Medical Faculty, Member of the Academic Committee of the Senate	1
	- Talieva Gulbanat Nurgaliyevna, Associate Professor, Chairman of the Commission for Quality Assurance of the School of Public Health	1
	- Kalishev Marat Guzairovich, Professor, Member of the Commission for Quality Assurance of the School of Public Health	1
	- Belyaev Ruslan Andreevich, Associate Professor of the Department of Neurology, Psychiatry and Rehabilitation, Chairman of the Commission for Quality Assurance of the School of Public Health and Rehabilitation	1
	- Ogizbaeva Alina Vitaliyevna, Associate Professor of the Department of Emergency Medical Care, Anesthesiology and Resuscitation, Secretary of the Commission for Quality Assurance of the School of Public Health and Rehabilitation	1
7	<b><u>Meeting with employees of structural divisions</u></b>	1
	- Director of the Department of Academic Affairs - Sharapieva Sulushash Beketovna	
	- Compliance Officer - Urmashov Alexander Nikolaevich	1
	- Director of the Library - Amirova Yana Olegovna	1
	- Director of the Department of Human Resources Management - Kravtsiv Yelena Aleksandrovna	1
	- Deputy Director of the Department of Economics and Finance - Mukhanova Madina Kakimovna	1
	- Head of the Department of Strategic Development and Quality Management - Bukeeva Aliya Satybaldiyevna	1
	- Head of the Center for Simulation and Educational Technologies - Kemelova Gulshat Seitmuratovna	1
	- Head of the Career Development Center - Tokzhumanova Gulzhanat Maratovna	1
	- Head of the Information Technology Department - Mukhametova Yelena Leonidovna	1
	- Head of the Youth Department - Ungarbaeva Aigul Amanzholovna	1
	- Specialist of the International Cooperation Department - Aman Rakhat Muratuly	1
8	Centre for Simulation and Educational Technologies - Head of the Centre - Kemelova Gulshat Seitmuratovna	1
9	<b><u>Interview with students of the EP</u></b> (General Surgery, Oncology (Adult), Radiology, Neonatology, Infectious diseases adults, children, Pediatrics, Pathological anatomy, Nephrology (adult, children’s), Neurology adult, children’s, Public health)	47
10	<b><u>Interview with the Academic staff of the EP</u></b> (General surgery, Oncology (adult), Radiology, Neonatology, Infectious diseases adults, children’s, Paediatrics, Pathological anatomy, Nephrology (adult, children’s), Neurology adult, children’s, Public health)	35

13	<b>Interview with graduates of the EP</b> (General surgery, Oncology (adult), Radiology, Neonatology, Infectious diseases for adults, children, Paediatrics, Pathological anatomy, Nephrology (adult, children's), Neurology for adults, children, Public health)	24
14	<p><b>Interview with employers of graduates of the residency and master's degree programs of the EP</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <b>General surgery</b> (Bobyrev Semyon Sergeevich, chief physician of the Clinic of the Medical University of Karaganda; Tshai Boris Valentinovich, head of the surgical center of the RCH DPH KO)</li> <li>- <b>Oncology (adult)</b> (Toksambaev Gamal Saylyauovich, director of MB No. 3; Omarova Orynkul Seitkazievna, deputy director for control and quality of patient services of MH No. 3)</li> <li>- <b>Radiology</b> (Kurmangaliev Yerkin-Daur Toleuovich, director of the MSE on the REM "Multidisciplinary hospital of prof. Kh.Zh. Makazhanova")</li> <li>- <b>Neonatology</b> (Nurkeeva Zharkyn Syzdykovna, director of the MSE "RCH" PC No. 2; Tusupbekov Serikbol Dzhakhanovich, director of the MPH of Balkhash)</li> <li>- <b>Infectious diseases of adults, children</b> (Nurlybaev Yerzhan Shakirovich, director of the MSE RCH; Kenzhibaev Samat Yengibayevich, director of the MSE at the REM "Multidisciplinary Hospital of Temirtau")</li> <li>- <b>Paediatrics</b> (Derkach Nina Grigoryevna, Deputy Director for Medical Work, Multidisciplinary Regional Children's Hospital of Karaganda; Akhmetova Gulnara Bitimovna, Deputy Director for Medical Work, Multidisciplinary Children's Hospital of Karaganda)</li> <li>- <b>Nephrology (adult, paediatric)</b> (Kapinos Yelena Viktorovna, head of the nephrology department of the MSE RCH; Kunz Yelena Aleksandrovna, head of the nephrology department of the Multidisciplinary Regional Children's Hospital)</li> <li>- <b>Neurology (adult, pediatric)</b> (Malik Gulnara Sovetovna, chief physician of LLP "Neurorehabilitation Centre "Luch"; Akimzhanova Neilya Nurlanovna, director of LLP "Laboratory for Diagnostics and Treatment "Epi-Lab")</li> <li>- <b>Public Health</b> (Sultanov Alshynbay Kamalovich, director, PhD, State Institution "Medical and Physical Culture Dispensary" of the Department of Physical Culture and Sports of the Karaganda Region"; Sergaliev Talgat Sovetovich, head of the public health service, PhD, doctor of the highest category of the KGP on the Right of Economic Management "Regional Mental Health Center")</li> </ul>	17

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of the EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of educational programmes, examination of documents, interview results, and questionnaires was held. The EEC members began to draft the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the external evaluation results were made. The experts individually filled out the "Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of Educational programmes of the ECAQA Standards for accreditation". The EEC members did not make any comments. Recommendations for improving educational programmes were discussed and the chairperson, B.S. Zhanalina, held a final open vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period of 5 years.

While conducting a survey of residents, the majority of respondents (79.49%) believe that it is necessary to accredit an educational organization or educational programmes.

*According to 64% of teachers, the survey conducted by the ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving the key areas of activity of the accredited educational organization.*

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC; access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of the University's corporate

culture, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the members of the EEC. The Commission highlights the high satisfaction of residents of various specialties in acquiring practical skills at NJSC "MUK" and the absence of worthy competitors in comparison with other medical organizations and research centres.

At the end of the visit, the Chairman of the EEC announced recommendations for the management and employees of the educational organization based on the results of the external evaluation as part of the specialized accreditation.

#### **4. Analysis of compliance with standards for accreditation based on the results of an external evaluation of the residency educational programme in the specialty 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children" of the State Joint-Stock Company "Medical University of Karaganda"**

##### **Standard 1: MISSION AND FINAL OUTCOMES**

###### **1.1 Mission statement**

The mission of the State Joint-Stock Company "Medical University of Karaganda" is to develop society, improve the health and quality of life of the population of Kazakhstan by achieving excellence in science, education and practice. The mission of the State Joint-Stock Company "MUK" was approved by the decision of the Senate of the University of the State Joint-Stock Company "MUK", protocol No. 1 dated October 22, 2019. According to the Quality Policy, the State Joint-Stock Company "MUK" undertakes to ensure a high level of training of specialists for the healthcare system of the Republic of Kazakhstan, including residents who meet the requirements and expectations of all stakeholders (<https://muk.qmu.kz/ru/ob-universitete/>).

Vision: a world-class research university serving the benefit of Kazakhstani society.

The mission of the EP in the specialty "7R01115 Nephrology for Adults, Children" was developed on the basis of the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 7, 2020 "On Public Health and the Healthcare System", and in accordance with the Mission of NJSC "MUK" is aimed at training highly qualified specialists who are able to meet the needs of society in providing medical care to patients with a nephrological profile, apply and develop advanced innovative technologies in medicine, science and practice, use the achievements of information and communication technologies, strengthen the health of the population, specialists must be ready to adapt to the changing conditions of the healthcare system at the level of the state and the world community, continue learning throughout their lives, contribute to the development of society.

- 06/07/2019, protocol No. 4, at a meeting of the department, the Academic Committee of the School of Medicine and Residency, the Mission of the residency program "Nephrology, including paediatric", was reviewed and discussed, approved by the Academic Council of the NJSC "MUK" (minutes No. 7 of June 18, 2019), and approved at a meeting of the Academic Council by the Chairman of the Board - Rector of the NJSC "MUK" (minutes No. 10 of June 27, 2019).

- In 2020, the EP in the specialty "Nephrology, including paediatric" was included in the register of the "Unified Platform of Higher Education" (UPHE) of the Ministry of Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan (registration date 06/09/2020).

- In 2021, the EP was renamed into "Nephrology for Adults, Children" (Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No RK MOH 43 dated 05/25/2021).

- In 2022, the EP "Nephrology for Adults, Children" was updated in connection with the approval of the State Compulsory Educational Standard (Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 4, 2022 No RK MOH-63). The mission of the EP was again discussed at a meeting of the Council of SR and PD with the participation of employers and students (minutes No. 11 dated July 7, 2022), subsequently approved at a meeting of the QACS SR and PD (minutes No. 3 dated July 5, 2022), and approved by the decision of the Board of NJSC "MUK" (minutes No. 16 dated July 13, 2022).

The EP in the specialty 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children" was updated in the EHEA on 11.04.23 and, based on the analysis of the needs of practical healthcare, was included in the register of the Unified State Educational Institution of Higher Education of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan (<http://esuvo.platonus.kz/#/>).

During the implementation of the program activities, namely, following the results of the conversation with the members of the Board of Directors of the NJSC "MUK", the heads of the EP, employees of the structural divisions, in interviews with residents and doctors of the department, compliance with the criteria of **Standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the educational programme, took part in the formation of proposals for formulating the mission, while the mission was communicated to potential residents through the website, social networks, information letters to medical organizations.

According to the Development Program for 2019-2023, the activities of the NJSC "MUK" were carried out in the status of a research university, which contributed to strengthening the potential of the university through the integration of scientific research, education and practical activities into an integral system. The Development Program for 2024-2028 has been updated, the purpose of which is to develop NJSC "MUK" as a world-class research university through the integration and development of its educational and research activities (high-quality medical education based on obtaining modern theoretical knowledge and real practical skills in clinical facilities; improving the quality of medical care based on access to advanced technologies and scientific developments; conducting scientific research with the transfer of their results to practical healthcare; increasing the financial sustainability and efficiency of systems based on the integration and sharing of resources).

During the visit to the divisions of NJSC "MUK", the experts noted the strengths of the educational organization in relation to the accredited educational programme, especially in the clinical training of residents, the acquisition and development of clinical skills. The clinical bases for residents of the EP "Nephrology for Adults, Children" are the MSE "Regional Clinical Hospital", the Clinic of the Medical University of the NJSC "MUK", the Clinic of Professional Health of the NJSC "MUK", MSE "Regional Children's Clinical Hospital", the Medical Firm "Diaverum", which include nephrology departments, adult/paediatric nephrologist's offices, a day hospital, clinical and biochemical, immunological, bacteriological laboratories, functional, ultrasound and radiation diagnostics rooms, an endoscopy department, equipped with appropriate modern equipment and the necessary conditions for training residents.

In 2020, new communication and information platforms for distance learning were mastered: Microsoft Teams, Webex Cisco, Zoom. On the Moodle platform, within the framework of the ERASMUS+ "BERNICA" project, the course "CLINICAL NUTRITION PRACTICE IN CHRONIC KIDNEY DISEASES (CNPKD)" was developed in English with subsequent adaptation into Russian and Kazakh (<https://e-learning.qmu.edu.kz/>)

Residents participate in clinical reviews, consultations, consultations, general rounds with the head of the department, perform night shifts, and work in ultrasound and endoscopic diagnostic rooms, where they are taught the skills of a professional attitude to work in a medical organization and inter-professional communication of specialists of various profiles and levels.

Under the guidance of scientific supervisors, residents of the EP "Nephrology for Adults, Children" also participate in scientific research; consolidate theoretical knowledge and research competencies through the study and analysis of scientific material (PubMed, Elsevier, Cochrane Library, and Clinical Trials). Residents participate in the implementation of fragments of scientific research (STP, GRANT) conducted at the university (in 2023-2024, 2nd year resident Borchashvili S. participates in the implementation of scientific grant research RN AR 19676870 "Pathogenetic significance of structural and functional imbalance of the vascular system in the pulmonary-cardio-renal continuum", 1st year residents Lopukha I.V., Sandybaeva A.K. were involved in the development and submission of an application for a scientific grant research for consideration of funding for 2024-2026 "Dysapoptotic effect of the apelinergic system and phenotypes of pulmonary-renal syndrome in interstitial lung diseases").

The head of the EP "Nephrology for Adults, Children", Associate Professor Bacheva I.V., involves residents in participating in interdisciplinary conferences, pathological conferences, active participation in health education work in the nephrology department, and annually, for World Kidney Day, various events are held at the level of primary health care, schools, and other social institutions. All educational and methodological documentation is presented by the head of the EP "Nephrology for Adults, Children", Associate Professor Bacheva I.V.

The results of the documentation study demonstrate that the mission of the organization and the mission of the educational programme of the residency in the specialty "Nephrology for Adults, Children", namely the educational process, are built in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard and current LSI in postgraduate education and health care.

### **1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy**

To verify **Standard 1** at a meeting with the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs - Toleubekov K.K., Vice-Rector for Scientific and Clinical Affairs - Turgunov Ye.M., Dean of the School of Residency and Professional Development - Tashkenbaeva V.B., heads of the EP, etc., the experts asked the following questions: - In which regions is there a need for nephrologists; - Do residents work at 0.5 rate in clinics; - What are the functional responsibilities of clinical mentors? During the answers, representatives of the university administration noted that they are constantly in touch with the regions where there is a shortage of specialized specialties. Based on the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No RK MOH-305 "On approval of the nomenclature of specialties and specializations in the field of health care, the nomenclature and qualification characteristics of positions of health workers" (<https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V2000021856>), residency students have the opportunity to work additionally as a resident physician under the supervision of a clinical mentor in the chosen field of medicine for 0.5 rates in medical organizations. The functional responsibilities of clinical mentors are spelled out in the Regulation on clinical mentors, with which all interested parties are familiar.

*While conducting a survey of 37 residents of the 1st and 2nd years of study, it was found that 89.74% of residents would recommend studying in this educational organization to their acquaintances, friends, relatives. And 97.44% of respondents believe that the heads of the educational programme and teachers are aware of the problems of students associated with training. To the question "Do you think this educational organization allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?", 97.44% of residents also answered positively, 2.56% are not sure about this.*

*80% of the 25 surveyed teachers answered that they are satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace in this educational organization, and 20% partially agree with this statement. Experts determined that the organization has a healthy microclimate.*

*According to 88%, in the educational organization, a teacher has the opportunity to realize himself as a professional in his specialty. For your information, a total of 25 people responded, with 16% having up to 10 years of teaching experience and 84% having over 10 years of experience.*

### **1.3 Final learning outcomes**

Experts have established a clear continuity between the final learning outcomes of residents' previous training (prerequisites) and residency training, and subsequent continuous professional development programs. The University has a practice of informing residents about the final learning outcomes. The final learning outcomes of residents are aimed at mastering the professional competencies of the resident, reflected in the competency/learning outcomes map of the EP "Nephrology for Adults, Children", and are defined on the basis of the Dublin descriptors.

Upon completion of the training program, in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No RK MOH-249/2020 "On approval of the rules for assessing the knowledge and skills of students, assessing the professional training of graduates of educational programmes in the field of health care and specialists in the field of health care", the Academic Policy of the NJSC "MUK" and the "Regulations on the residency of the NJSC "MUK", control over the quality of training of residency graduates is carried out in the form of end-of-course assessment, which is carried out by the NCIE with the participation of representatives of practical health care, in the form of a 2-stage exam: Stage 1 - comprehensive testing, Stage 2 - assessment of practical / clinical skills at the patient's bedside.

During a meeting with potential employers of residency graduates, they noted the high level of training of residents, emphasized the strong clinical training and acquired skills, as well as the readiness of residency graduates for independent work (according to those programs that are being implemented at the university at the time of the external evaluation). Employers emphasized that graduates apply not only the acquired skills in their practical activities, but also strive to constantly master and improve new clinical

practices in their individual professional activities. Also, graduates and residents of NJSC "MUK" noted that during their studies at the university, they mastered both theoretical and clinical skills. While talking with residency graduates, some of them noted the weakness of their skills when working with children and wished for future graduates to rotate across various clinical bases so that there were no gaps in their training.

The bulk of the special skills and knowledge corresponding to the various roles of a healthcare specialist is mastered by residents at clinical sites with which there is an agreement. Residents acquire new and practice previously acquired skills in collecting anamnesis, examining patients, clinical thinking, skills in interpreting laboratory and instrumental studies, drawing up a plan for treatment and diagnostic, preventive and anti-epidemic measures, performing medical manipulations, communication skills, skills in making diagnostic and therapeutic decisions, especially during duty. The final outcomes of residents are presented on the website of the University and in the syllabuses of disciplines.

*The surveyed teachers answered that 64% are fully satisfied with the level of previous training of residents, and 32% are partially satisfied.*

*The experts established a clear continuity between the final results of previous training of residents (prerequisites) and training in residency, and subsequent programs of continuous professional development. Residents are informed about this.*

#### **1.4 Participation in formulating the mission and final outcomes**

While forming the program, its goals and final results, the program was discussed, reviewed and approved sequentially according to the hierarchy: by the academic committee, the Quality Assurance Committee, the Council of the SR&PD, the Senate of the NJSC "MUK", the Chairman of the Board - the Rector of the NJSC "MUK", which is confirmed by the minutes of the meetings. All EPs of the NJSC "MUK" undergo internal and external examination in accordance with the established procedure and are included in the national Register of educational programmes. If it is necessary to make additions or changes to the EP, the "Sheet of Changes to the Educational programme" (F NJSC "MUK" 1.4 / 21-05 / 1) is filled out. In accordance with the developed EP, TC, the head of the EP, the Academic staff develops WC, syllabuses for a module / discipline, CED, the form, structure and procedure for the development of which are determined by the University independently. The mission and goals of the EP are focused on the professional orientation of the residency graduate as a highly professional specialist in demand in the healthcare system of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

During the conversation with residents and employers, experts received an answer to the question "Do you participate in formulating the mission and goals of the organization, educational programme?", "What is the personal contribution of residents to improving the educational programme?". Residents of EP 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children" answered these questions that they have a real opportunity to participate in organizing the curriculum of the specialty during the direct discussion and approval of the EP, at the level of developing the IEP and elective disciplines at meetings of the Council of the SR and PD, the Senate, and employers answered as follows that they are members of the collegial advisory bodies of the university - the Senate of the NJSC "MUK", the Council of the SR and PD, are invited to meetings of the departments to monitor and improve the EP. Also, one of the mechanisms for continuous monitoring and improvement of the EP is a systematic survey of teachers, students and employers.

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.*** Comply with 14 standards (including 9 basic, 5 improvement standards): fully -14.

### **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

#### **2.1 Framework parameters of the postgraduate medical education programme**

To implement the educational programme 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children", the organization's documents contain teaching and methodological complexes, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work. The



University positions that the model used to implement the program has a modular-competency approach. EP 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children" is practice-oriented, as evidenced by the distribution of classroom and independent work of residents, the total number of visits to clinical sites, the results of interviews with clinical mentors, teachers and the residents themselves. The reports show that the university maintains a balance between mastering practical skills under the guidance of qualified teachers and the use of innovative teaching technologies. Residents spend most of their academic work at the patient's bedside, supervising patients, performing night shifts and working in clinical settings and emergency training at the Centre for Simulation and Educational Technologies (CSET). On May 16, 2024, they attended a practical lesson at the Department of Internal Medicine, based in the MSE "Regional Clinical Hospital", groups: 8-001 Nef (polylanguage), discipline Dialysis Therapy, topic: Mineral and bone disorders in dialysis patients (3 hours of practical work); 9-001 Nef (polylanguage), discipline Kidney pathology in pregnant women, topic: Renal replacement therapy in pregnant women (3 hours of practical work). During the classes, the experts received convincing data that residents study clinical protocols for the diagnosis and treatment of RC, International consensus in the field of nephrology, clinical recommendations of leading international organizations for the purpose of implementing treatment and diagnostic measures based on evidence-based medicine, practical classes are conducted according to plan, before the start of the class, residents answer tests, receive feedback from the teacher, and have the opportunity to improve their practical skills. Residents who have completed their training and successfully passed the IA are awarded the qualification of Adult and Paediatric Nephrologist and are issued a certificate of completion of residency, a state-issued document approved by the order of the Minister *of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 28, 2015 No. 39 "On approval of types and forms of state-issued educational documents and the Rules for their issuance" (with additions and amendments dated May 4, 2020), which corresponds to level 7 of the National Qualifications Framework and the Framework for Qualifications in the European Higher Education Area. (ESG 1.2).*

Written work is checked in the Strikeplagiarism.com system (Antiplagiat system of the Polish company Plagiat.pl). The University has developed an internal document - the Code of Academic Integrity, and is drawn up in accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 18, 2011. № 407-IV "On Science" (with amendments and additions as of 10.04.2019), and the principles of academic integrity are reflected in the Academic Policy of the University.

The practical activities of residents in the clinic are carried out under the guidance of experienced clinical mentors; a corresponding regulation has been developed. Future nephrologists register their academic achievements, as well as the skills and abilities that can affect their personal development, in the Portfolio, which is an alternative criterion for assessing the achievement of the final learning outcomes. Feedback from residents and clinical mentors, as shown by interviews with both parties, is maintained daily, at the patient's bedside, or based on the results of medical documentation in IMIS, and regular surveys are also conducted.

The resident mentoring system is determined by the Regulation on Residency, approved by the Decision of the Board of the NJSC "MUK" dated August 23, 2022, Protocol No. 18. Residency training is carried out under the supervision of the Academic staff and a clinical mentor, whose activities are regulated by the "Job Descriptions of the Clinical Mentor". The clinical mentor is appointed from among qualified practical healthcare specialists working at the residency bases, who have a certificate and at least 5 years of experience in the relevant specialty. Clinical mentors in the specialty "Nephrology for Adults, Children" are doctors of the highest and first qualification category.

Admission to the residency program, its implementation, assessment methods and other aspects are carried out regardless of religious, national affiliation and gender differences.

## **2.2 Scientific method**

The educational programme includes the scientific foundations and methodology of medical research, including clinical research and clinical epidemiology. The introduction of scientific foundations and methodology of medical research in the EP is carried out on the basis of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Science", "Development Program of the Non-Commercial Joint-Stock Company "Medical University of Karaganda" for 2024 - 2028", one of the areas of which is Leadership in

Research. As part of the implementation of this area, a program for the development, support and promotion of university researchers is being developed and implemented through the involvement of students, interns, residents, young scientists under 35 years of age in the implementation of research programs and projects. During a conversation with residents, the experts learned that they use scientific data in training and know the basics of evidence-based medicine. The teachers said that they teach residents methods of critical evaluation of literature, scientific data, and the application of scientific developments. In the process of carrying out scientific work, residents study educational and scientific literature in the university library, use electronic resources, electronic scientometric databases (Scopus, PubMed, Elsevier, Cohhrane library).

The training forms are organized in the format of the "Journal Club" at the Department of Internal Medicine, participation of residents in scientific and practical conferences, seminars. to carry out fragments of scientific research (STP, GRANT) conducted at the university. Thus, in 2022-2024, 2nd year resident Borchashvili S. participates in the implementation of scientific grant research RN AR 19676870 "Pathogenetic significance of structural and functional imbalance of the vascular system in the pulmonary-cardio-renal continuum", 1st year residents Lopukha I.V., Sandybaeva A.K. were involved in the development and submission of an application for a scientific grant research for consideration of funding for 2024-2026 "Dysapoptotic effect of the apelinergic system and phenotypes of pulmonary-renal syndrome in interstitial lung diseases".

The University has its own journal "Medicine and Ecology", which is included in the List of publications recommended by the Committee for Quality Assurance in Science and Higher Education of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan for publishing the main results of scientific activity (order No. 368 dated March 19, 2024). Over the past year, 10 articles were published by employees of the Departments of Internal Medicine and Pediatrics and residents-nephrologists.

Head of EP 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children" Associate Professor Bacheva I.V., participates in the implementation of the scientific and technical program "COVID-19: Scientific and technological substantiation of the response system to the spread of new respiratory infections, including coronavirus infection", scientific grant research "IRN AR 19676870" Pathogenetic significance of the structural and functional imbalance of the vascular system in the pulmonary-cardio-renal continuum ", participant in the project" Building educational and research potential in the field of nutrition and dietetics in Central Asia, BERNICA "ERASMUS + (2023-2025).

*While surveying residents, it was found that the educational organization has access to the participation of students in research work. To the question: "Am I currently engaged in research work under the supervision of my teacher or mentor?", 87.18% (34) of respondents answered - yes, this is so, 5.13% (2) - yes, I have started planning the implementation of R&D, 5.13% (2) I have no desire to engage in R&D, 2.56% (1) are unsure about the answer.*

### **2.3 Structure, content and duration of the residency programme**

There are documents containing requirements for the structure and content of educational programmes, including current methodological documentation. The responsible teacher / curator of the residency specialty is responsible for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process.

The content of the work programs and the catalog of elective disciplines reflect the needs of the healthcare system, incl. elective components "Differential diagnosis in secondary glomerular diseases", "Hereditary syndromes with kidney pathology in children", "Neonatal nephrology", "Emergency conditions in nephrology", "Urological problems in nephrology", as well as the specifics of research and development and scientific achievements of teachers. For the successful implementation of the educational programme in the residency specialty 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children", the organization has resources for organizing the assessment of the practical skills of residents. Practical skills are consolidated during the performance of clinical work within the framework of the IWRT, IWR at the clinical sites of the department, which ensures the integration of the learned theoretical material of the program with the practical application of the knowledge gained.

Provision of nephrology residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes is 100%. The members of the EEC were provided with tickets for applicants to the

residency in the specialty "Nephrology for Adults, Children", syllabuses for all disciplines corresponding to the State Educational Standard credits, including elective disciplines; test assignments for each discipline, electronic textbooks, links to video lectures by leading nephrologists. NJSC "MUK" has 3 of its own clinics: University Clinic, Clinic of Professional Health, and Dental Clinic. The clinical bases that are used to implement the educational process of the residency specialty "Nephrology for Adults, Children" are medical institutions of city and regional significance: MSE "Regional Clinical Hospital" (since 01.02.23 renamed to "Regional Multidisciplinary Hospital"), Clinic of the Medical University of NJSC "MUK", Clinic of Professional Health of NJSC "MUK", MSE "Regional Children's Clinical Hospital", Medical Organization "Diaverum". The university's clinical sites have all the conditions for organizing the educational process. The number of classrooms provided at the clinical sites is 36; the usable area is 100%. And to the question in the questionnaire "Is there enough time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.)", 97.44% of residents answered with full agreement, 2.56% partially agree. At the same time, 92.31% of residents claim that after the end of classes, the teacher provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini-questionnaire, work on mistakes).

The clinical sites involved in the implementation of the EP "Nephrology for Adults, Children" include 24-hour multidisciplinary hospitals, including nephrology departments, day hospitals, clinical and biochemical, immunological, bacteriological laboratories, centres/offices of functional and ultrasound, radiation diagnostics, endoscopy, equipped with the appropriate modern equipment and the necessary conditions for training residents. Residents master the skills of providing specialized care at the outpatient level during outpatient appointments in the offices of an adult/paediatric nephrologist at the University Clinic, the Clinic of Professional Health, the outpatient clinic of the Regional Clinical Hospital, and the Regional Clinical Hospital.

The duration of the educational residency programme 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children" is 2 years.

As part of the academic mobility, 2 residents - Borchashvili Seda Abdul-Kadyrovna and Muslimov Nauryzbek Rakhately, were trained at the Department of Internal Medicine, Clinical Pharmacology and Nephrology of the Federal State-Funded Educational Institution "SWSMU named after I.I. Mechnikov" of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation from 13.09.23 to 12.10.23 in the cycle Transplantology and Immunology (Kidney Transplantation).

In NJSC "MUK", an academic mobility plan for students is formed annually in accordance with applications from the heads of the EPs and is implemented in organizations that have memorandums with NJSC "MUK". In addition, within the framework of the "Professor's Visit" program, from 11.12.23 to 25.12.23, classes were held in a hybrid format by Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Azizov Ilya Suleimanovich, Head of the Laboratory Complex of the Research Institute of Antimicrobial Chemotherapy, Smolensk. From 21.04.24 to 12.05.24 a visit was made by Professor. Dr. Ulrich Kunzendorf (Germany).

Based on the changing needs of the healthcare system and the provision of medical care, the content of the residency program in the specialty "Nephrology for Adults, Children" is also changing by changing the CED. Every year, the head of the program, together with clinical mentors and representatives of practical healthcare, discusses and draws up a list of elective disciplines for the formation of the CED. Syllabuses for disciplines are revised annually taking into account the introduction of new diagnostic and treatment methods, international recommendations and updating of diagnostic and treatment protocols for diseases of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and the map of the provision of discipline with educational and methodological literature is updated.

## **2.4 Organization of training and the relationship between postgraduate medical education and the provision of medical care**

The management of the educational process, reflected in the self-assessment report (**Standard 2**) and general approaches to management were confirmed during a conversation with the Dean of the SR&PD, V.B. Tashkenbaeva.

The resident mentoring system is determined by the Regulation on Residency, approved by the Decision of the Board of the NJSC "MUK" dated August 23, 2022, Protocol No. 18 and demonstrates the

importance of the role of a clinical mentor in the development of future paediatricians as practical clinicians.

A wide range of beds in the largest multidisciplinary medical institutions give residents the opportunity to carry out practical activities in close cooperation with doctors of related specialties of therapeutic and surgical profile, participate in multidisciplinary consultations, implement continuity in the management of patients at the hospital level (ICU - nephrology department - other departments of therapeutic and surgical profile), hospital - outpatient clinic, have well-equipped auxiliary departments (endoscopic, morphological, radiation, functional and laboratory diagnostics).

The experts got acquainted with the work of the departments, including the work of specialized departments and during the cross-interview it was established that there is a constant connection between the residents-graduates and their curators, the relationship between curators and clinical mentors with stakeholders is monitored. This is facilitated by the mentoring that is carried out in the organization. During the conversation with the residents, the experts saw that the organization promotes the development of practical competencies of the residents.

*Of the 39 residents surveyed, 89.74% responded that teachers use active and interactive teaching methods in classes quite often, 7.69% believe that they rarely or sometimes, 2.56 do not know what it is.*

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Compliance out of 22 standards (including 19 basic, 3 Standard improvement): fully - 19/2, partially - 0/1.

**Recommendations for improvement:**

1) To expand the catalogue of elective disciplines taking into account the need to ensure competence in the scientific foundations and methodology of medical research for the scientific activities of residents of the program 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children" is 2 years.

### **Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF RESIDENTS**

#### **3.1 Assessment methods**

The policy and procedures for assessing the academic achievements of residents in NJSC "MUK" are carried out in accordance with the set goals and learning outcomes for the implementation of the EP and the assigned qualifications within the framework of the current rating system and control of the educational process, in accordance with directive, regulatory and internal documents. The comprehensive assessment of the academic achievements of residents at the university is regulated by the "Rules of the rating system for assessing the academic performance of students" (section 5-7 of the Academic Policy of NJSC "MUK"), compliance with which is mandatory for all students and structural divisions of the university - participants in the educational process.

In order to determine the degree of achievement of the final learning outcomes and acquired competencies by residents of the EP "Nephrology for Adults, Children", ongoing monitoring of academic performance, midterm and final certification are carried out.

Formative assessment of the academic performance of students is carried out for each completed task, which includes all types of academic work and the acquisition of practical skills using simulation technologies, patient management, duty at clinical sites, etc.). During the current monitoring of academic performance, academic achievements are assessed on a 100-point scale by calculating the arithmetic mean of all grades received during the academic period.

The period for conducting midterm assessment is approved by the Chairman of the Board - Rector of NJSC "MUK", the schedule for conducting end-of-course assessment and midterm assessment - by the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs. The final assessment is carried out upon completion of the discipline/module, the midterm assessment in the form of portfolio defence - upon completion of the academic period ("Conducting midterm assessment" (section 5-8 of the Academic Policy of NJSC "MUK").

The end-of-course assessment is carried out upon completion of the discipline/module in the form of a comprehensive 2-stage exam - Stage 1 - clinical exam (assessment of practical skills) (50%), Stage 2 - written exam, in the final years - testing (50%). The clinical exam is carried out in the form of certification of practical skills "at the patient's bedside", according to the assessment sheet. The written

exam is conducted on the session.kgmu.kz platform with checking the resident's written response for originality in the Strikeplagiarism.com system (AntiPlagiat system of the Polish company Plagiat.pl), as well as with coding of the residents' work, ensuring the objectivity of the assessment.

The University uses additional assessment methods residents in the specialty 7R01115 - "Nephrology for Adults, Children" such as a portfolio, assessment of scientific activity. The portfolio is defended at the end of each academic year to assess the resident's mastery of the competencies provided for by the EP.

Control and measuring tools are compiled in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard, TC, EP, and syllabus.

According to the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No RK MOH-249/2020 "On approval of the rules for assessing the knowledge and skills of students, assessing the professional readiness of graduates of educational programmes in the field of health care and specialists in the field of health care", the Academic Policy of NJSC "MUK" and the "Regulations on the residency of NJSC "MUK", control over the quality of training of residency graduates is carried out in the form of final certification. To ensure objectivity and transparency of assessment, the university has developed checklists: "Maintaining medical records/medical history" in a therapeutic hospital, "Night/day duty" in a therapeutic hospital, "360°-resident assessment".

The adequacy of the teacher's assessment of academic achievements in NJSC "MUK" is carried out according to the distribution curve of the grades given by him in accordance with the normal distribution (Bell Curve) in accordance with the approved criteria for assessing learning outcomes based on the general principles of the League of Academic Integrity (<https://adaldyq.kz/documents>). In 2023, the average deviation in accordance with the assessment system for all levels of education in the Department of Internal Medicine according to the criteria of the League of Academic Integrity was - 19.2% -20.1%, which fits into the recommended range.

The reliability of assessing residents' knowledge in all forms of control over residency students is ensured by compliance with the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, internal regulatory documents: "Regulations on the residency of the NJSC "MUK", "Rules for the rating system for assessing students' academic performance" of the Academic Policy of the NJSC "MUK". Methods for assessing residents in the specialty "Nephrology for Adults, Children" are developed and discussed with external stakeholders. Examination materials are discussed at a meeting of the department and undergo expert assessment by external reviewers - representatives of practical healthcare - freelance nephrologists of the Karaganda region - Kapinos Ye.V., Kunts Ye.A. Control and measuring tools are updated annually by 30%.

In order to ensure transparency and objectivity of the end-of-course assessment, a pool of proctors is formed by the registrar's office from among the faculty who do not have a conflict of interest during the period of its implementation.

At the end of the training, the end-of-course assessment is conducted by the NCIE in the form of an independent examination; all years, residents in the specialty "Nephrology for Adults, Children" successfully passed the independent examination on the first try. The average score of the final certification of 13 graduates for 2019-2023 was 86.85%.

In order to ensure compliance with uniform requirements and resolve controversial issues when assessing examination papers for the period of the midterm assessment of students, an appeal commission is created by order of the dean of the SR&PD (Order No. 8a dated September 15, 2023). While passing the end-of-course assessment, a student who does not agree with the result of the comprehensive exam files an appeal during the 1st stage (comprehensive testing), and an appeal of the 2nd stage no later than the next working day after the announcement of its results. In 2020, a written exam was introduced on the session.kgmu.kz platform, and in the 2021-2022 academic year, a new form of portfolio assessment sheet was introduced during its defence.

### **3.2 Relationship between assessment and learning**

The methods used to assess students' competencies are spelled out in syllabuses. It should be noted that the report presents a table on the correspondence of assessment methods to teaching methods, which

contains methodological errors. Also, during the interview with teachers, it was clarified that there is no clear understanding between the learning domains and the assessment methods in them.

The university has developed standardized checklists, but upon closer examination by the EEC experts, their "template nature" was revealed, that is, the lack of a differentiated approach depending on the specifics of the educational programme.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Compliance with 9 standards (including 6 basic, 3 Standard improvement): fully – 6/2, partially – 0/1.

**Recommendations for improvement:**

1) To detail the criteria of assessment sheets for objective assessment of clinical skills in the specialty “Nephrology for Adults, Children”.

## **Standard 4: RESIDENTS**

### **4.1 Admissions Policy and Selection**

Admission to the residency in the specialty of residency "Nephrology for Adults, Children" will be carried out in accordance with the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600 "On approval of the Model rules for admission to training in educational organizations implementing educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education", with the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 15, 2020 No RK MOH -270/2020 "On approval of the rules for placing a state order, admission to training and training of medical personnel in residency", the State Compulsory Educational Standard and the Rules for admission to residency for the current academic year. The conditions for admission of residents are described in detail in the "Rules for Admission to Residency" for the relevant academic year, based on LSI.

Information about the residency program "Nephrology for Adults, Children" is available to all interested parties on the website of the USHEM and the University (<https://qmu.edu.kz/ru/contents/view/1239>).

The NJSC "MUK" developed the "Regulation on Inclusive Education in NJSC “MUK” in 2020 dated 09.12.2020. Protocol No. 26, in accordance with the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600, the Charter and internal regulatory documents of NJSC "MUK".

Admission of persons entering NJSC "MUK" to the EP "Nephrology for Adults, Children" was carried out upon their applications on a competitive basis based on the results of the entrance examination, which included stages assessed on a 100-point assessment scale.

The entrance exam score was formed from three components: GPA value (weighted average score of the level of academic achievements for the entire period of study (bachelor's degree and internship)); the result of the 1st stage of the independent examination or the result of the specialist certificate; the result of comprehensive testing in the therapeutic profile. In case of equal competitive scores, preferential right for admission to residency was given to persons with medical experience (at the time of submission of the applicant's documents), where 1 year of experience was equal to 1 point, with supporting documents. In addition, applicants who had publications and presentations of various levels, awards, participation in specialized Olympiads, start-ups, scholarship holders had preferences with corresponding points, which were additionally added to the results obtained.

Persons are admitted to residency based on the results of the entrance exam in the therapeutic profile and who scored at least 75 points out of a possible 100 points.

### **4.2 Number of residents**

The number of accepted residents is regulated by the state order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, orders of the LEA for the training of medical personnel and the possibilities of their clinical training, the maximum permissible workload for the Academic staff, clinical mentors, material and technical resources of the university and clinical sites.

Every year, the university sends a proposal to the authorized body to place a state educational order for the training of medical personnel in residency in the appropriate form. The number of accepted residents is constantly agreed upon with the relevant stakeholders, taking into account the need for medical

personnel in nephrology. The revision is carried out regularly, taking into account the needs of the industry and the situation on the labour market.

### **4.3 Support and consulting of residents**

The main tasks of the teachers of the NJSC “MUK” and mentors of the clinical site are to provide support for professional orientation and career planning of residents, increase mobility, competitiveness of graduates of the centre in the labour market, expand the framework of social partnership and improve the "resident-university-employer" system. Support and consultation on all issues of organizing the educational process, mastering compulsory and choosing elective disciplines are provided by the Academic staff, the head of the educational programme, the head of the department, the SR&PD. Information on residency training is also posted on the official website of the University (in the tab education → applicant → entrance exams for postgraduate education (master's degree, residency, doctoral programme) → residency, Student Portal of NJSC "MUK").

Currently, NJSC "MUK" has a student service centre that provides services to students on a "one-stop shop" basis. In order to ensure and maintain an active dialogue with students, meeting times have been set in the work schedule of managers at all levels. The official website of NJSC "MUK" has a virtual rector's reception room, which allows students to submit their proposals for optimizing management processes. The "Reception schedule for personal matters of the rector and vice-rectors" is posted in the "Structure" tab. The University provides support to residents focused on social, financial and personal needs, allocates appropriate resources for social and personal support.

Also, the University has a youth department, a compliance officer, a student service centre for social and personal support of students, which are structural divisions implementing the state youth policy, civic-patriotic, legal, moral, professional, and aesthetic, ethno- and multicultural education of residents.

For those wishing to study foreign languages and improve their language skills, the English Club and the Multilingual Club operate on the basis of NJSC MUK. Since October 1, 2019, students, master's students, doctoral students, residents and employees have been studying. Since 2013, the University has a sports club, which has 20 sections in various sports.

Regular work is carried out with residents to improve communicative competence, prevent conflicts in practical medical activities and prevent burnout syndrome. The student support service provides psychological adaptation and information support to students (the university has full-time psychologists). This service operates at the university on the basis of the Regulation on the student support service of NJSC "MUK" (PP NJSC “MUK” 19-2, version 1 dated July 08, 2019 with amendments dated October 23, 2020, protocol No. 20).

The Student Republic "Samruk" is a student self-government body in the field of implementing the State Youth Policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The university also has a Council of Young Scientists and Students, which functions in accordance with the Regulation on the scientific society of young scientists and students of the university.

### **4.4 Representation of residents**

Resident representatives are included in the Council of the SR and PD and the Senate. Resident doctors are regularly invited to meetings of advisory bodies and take part in the discussion of issues in the context of this specialty. Suggestions and recommendations of students are necessarily taken into account by members of the advisory bodies and are taken into account when forming the final decision of the meeting.

### **4.5 Working conditions**

According to the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 799 dated 10.10.2022 "Rules for the appointment, payment and amount of state scholarships" (<https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/P080000116>), the Regulations on the procedure for assigning scholarships established by the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan, residents studying on the basis of an educational grant are paid state scholarships.

Based on the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 21.12.2020 No RK

MOH-305 "On approval of the nomenclature of specialties and specializations in the field of health care, the nomenclature and qualification characteristics of positions of health workers" (<https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V2000021856>), residency students have the opportunity to work additionally as a resident physician under the guidance of a clinical mentor in the chosen field of medicine for 0.5 rates in medical organizations, or according to a specialist certificate received upon completion of the relevant internship. Resident physicians are granted vacations between academic periods. The duration of vacations during the academic year is at least seven weeks, with the exception of the final year, in accordance with the state mandatory standard of residency in medical specialties and the educational programme for residency specialties. A medical educational organization should apply an individual training program for residents under special circumstances, so in 2023-2024, resident Zhaksylyk M. A., who has the 1st disability group due to terminal CKD, was admitted to the 1st year. Given this fact, the resident was asked to undergo daytime shifts, the academic load, the end-of-course assessment schedule should be formed taking into account the haemodialysis schedule, general well-being.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Comply with 20 standards (including 14 basic, 6 improvement standards): fully – 20.

## **Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF**

### **Admission and selection policy**

NJSC "MUK" has developed and implemented a personnel policy and an employee performance management system (EPMS) to maintain the optimal level of the number and quality of employees, their professional and social development to ensure high quality of the educational process and training of competitive specialists in residency, taking into account the needs of the labour market. The policy of selection and admission of academic staff at the university is carried out in accordance with the Labour Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated November 23, 2015 No. 414-V, in the Rules for the admission of employees when employed at NJSC "MUK", the Rules for competitive replacement of vacant positions, based on the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 13, 2009 No. 338 "On approval of standard qualification characteristics of positions of Academic staff and persons equivalent to them" with additions and amendments as of March 31, 2022.

The implementation of the EP "Nephrology for Adults, Children" is carried out by the Academic staff of the departments of internal diseases, paediatrics and neonatology, morphology, surgical diseases. The head of the EP "Nephrology for Adults, Children" is an associate professor of the department of internal diseases, PhD, nephrologist of the highest category Bacheva I.V. The share of full-time teachers is 67% (1 teacher per 0.5 position), part-time workers - 33%. Part-time workers are represented by clinical mentors:

1. Kapinos Ye.V., chief nephrologist of the Karaganda region health care institution, head of the nephrology department of the MSE RCH, nephrologist of the highest category, 25 years of practical experience;

2. Zhumakaeva Zhanara Kairovna - deputy director for strategic planning of the MSE RCH, nephrologist of the highest category, 25 years of practical experience;

3. Kunts Ye.A., nephrologist of the highest category, chief paediatric nephrologist of the Karaganda region health care institution, 25 years of experience.

4. Galitsky Frans Iosifovich - vascular surgeon of the MSE RCH, doctor of the highest category, 30 years of practical experience.

The university ensures a balance between teaching, research and clinical activities, which is reflected in the IWPT. The distribution of activities is carried out on the basis of job descriptions, depending on the categories of faculty. The average teaching load of the faculty implementing the EP for residency is reviewed annually, which amounted to 650 hours for the 2023-2024 academic year (Senate Decision of 04/28/2022, Protocol No. 7).

Research work is an integral part of the activities of the university's faculty and a prerequisite for the training of residents. The results of the research work of the Academic staff over the past 5 years are presented in the form of publications in peer-reviewed journals, certificates of registration of intellectual



property rights, oral/poster presentations at scientific and practical conferences in the Republic of Kazakhstan (annual Central Asian Conference; 2018, 2019, 2020 - Man and Medicine of Kazakhstan Conference on COVID; 2021 - Congresses of Nephrologists of Kazakhstan).

Advanced clinical and pedagogical training of teaching staff and clinical mentors is conducted at least once every 5 years, respectively. Upon completion of advanced training, supporting documents are submitted to the department, the HR department, and also uploaded to the AIS "Platon".

The principles of business ethics and academic honesty in the University are implemented through the Internal Labour Regulations. Associate Professor Bacheva I.V. is a developer and reviewer of clinical protocols, professional standards. The Department of Internal Diseases has 4 full-time employees who have a certificate of a specialist nephrologist.

*While questioning teachers, it was found that the majority (80%) are completely satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace in this educational organization, but 20% are partially satisfied. In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of R&D - 84% completely agree, 16% partially. Are you satisfied with the salary - 56% completely agree, 12% of respondents did not answer, 28% answered more YES than NO, 4% answered more NO than YES.*

### **5.1 Obligations and development of teachers**

In NJSC "MUK" for the teaching staff of the residency program there are wide opportunities for professional and personal improvement: internships, seminars, an internal system of advanced training, courses in the state, English and German languages, cooperation with foreign universities and recognized experts from near and far abroad in the specialized specialty within the framework of academic mobility programs, information and communication technologies are highly developed. Thus, prof. Bacheva I.V. was trained in English at the expense of the international project ERASMUS +. There is a developed system of social support - sports infrastructure, preferential services in the Dental Clinic, an active trade union, catering. The department's staff, including clinical mentors, regularly undergoes advanced training in educational, clinical, and scientific areas of activity. To stimulate the scientific activity of the faculty, incentive bonuses are established for the publication of scientific papers in journals with an impact factor of more than 1, in international peer-reviewed scientific publications (indexed in the Web of Knowledge; Scopus). Additional payment is paid for teaching classes in English to the faculty with an IELTS certificate (5.5 points and above) or TOEFL (525 points and above) in the amount of 100% of the BOS (including external part-time workers (master's students, doctoral students).

Support is provided to young teachers under 30 years of age in the form of a monthly incentive payment. For achievements in professional activities, employees are awarded with certificates of honour, letters of gratitude, medals and awards. Information on the results of work assessment and recognition of achievements in all types of activities is presented at meetings of the Senate, on the university website and in the periodical journal "MEDIK".

The conducted personnel policy allows maintaining a balance in the ratio of academic and professional qualifications of teachers, ensuring the quality of the educational process. In the implementation of the EP "Nephrology for Adults, Children" for the training of 10 residents, 9 teachers and 4 clinical mentors are involved.

The educational organization has an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies - 84% of surveyed teachers fully agree, 16% partially agree with this. 84% of respondents studied in professional development programs during the current year, from 1 to 5 years - 16%. The organization implements social support programs for teachers - 64% answered that "yes, such programs exist", 28% of respondents do not know about this, 4% are unsure with the answer.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Comply with out of 8 standards (including 7 basic, 1 Standard of improvement): fully -8.

## **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

### **6.1 Material and technical support and equipment**

Medical University of Karaganda has a sufficient material and technical base, allowing creating all the conditions for the training of qualified specialists with the achievement of final results and competencies in the specialty "Nephrology for Adults, Children".

The total area of the main academic buildings of the university is 29160.6 sq.m, the area of the dormitories is 30162.9 sq.m., the area of the Clinic of the Medical University is 2122 sq.m. Lecture halls and auditoriums are equipped with multimedia support, with Internet access and modern computers. (Table 7). At the clinical base, residents undergo primary safety training with confirmation of this training in the Safety Journal of the specialized departments.

The library plays a leading role in providing residents with information resources, the total area of the library is 1526 sq. m., and the area of book storage is 941.6 sq. m. The number of seats in the reading rooms is 443. The library includes: the acquisition and bibliography department and the scientific and educational literature service department (consists of a scientific literature subscription, two educational literature subscriptions, a reading room and a periodicals room, an electronic resources room, an interactive room). The library's computer park consists of 113 computers, including 88 thin clients (TC), 21 personal computers (PC) are located in the library departments, 4 PCs and 63 TCs are in the electronic resources room and 25 TCs are in the interactive room, the entire fleet of computers is connected to the INTERNET. Wi-Fi zone is distributed throughout the library. For users, 2 scanners are installed in the electronic resources room. The interactive room is equipped with a short-focus projector. The Researcher's Room is open to students and is equipped with 15 computers connected to the Internet, which allows them to access all information resources of the university. The MUK library has 2 information kiosks, with the help of which users can make an electronic order for the necessary literature from the electronic catalogue based on the WEB-IRBIS module. The total fund of the university library as of 01.11.2022 is 450,374/42,710 (copies/titles) and meets the requirements for literature availability. For the implementation of the educational process in the specialty "Nephrology for Adults, Children", the availability of primary and additional literature is 100%. Of these, the total number of textbooks, including those in the Kazakh language, is 815 copies, scientific literature - 539 copies, periodicals - 10, electronic publications - 10.

Over the past 3 years, there has been a trend towards an increase in subscriptions to educational electronic resources. The volume of the electronic catalogue of the MUK is 83,740 records.

The University has the opportunity to widely use the CSET by residents. The centre can simulate various clinical situations close to the real working conditions of a doctor. It is equipped with simulation equipment and demonstration devices for mastering practical skills in the specialty, as well as providing emergency care in the practice of an internist: a virtual ultrasound simulator with a LiveScan SONOSIM sensor, mannequins for practicing rectal skills, installing a nasogastric tube, gastric lavage, a SimMan patient simulator with software for performing intensive care skills in various clinical situations, phantoms for practicing catheterization skills of peripheral and central (Nasco, LF01012U) veins in adults and children, oro- and nasotracheal intubation of the trachea in adults. Residents have access to the electronic patient database Damumed, which is provided by the clinical base. Individual logins and passwords for access to IMIS are issued to residents employed by resident doctors in medical and preventive institutions. Satisfaction of students and teachers with the material and technical support of the educational process is analysed annually based on the results of the questionnaire.

## **6.2 Clinical bases**

NJSC "MUK" has 3 of its own clinics (University Clinic, Professional Health Clinic, and Dental Clinic) and cooperates with 60 medical organizations in Karaganda, Karaganda region and Astana. Joint work of these medical institutions with the medical university is regulated by concluded agreements on joint activities, which are updated annually by the clinical work department. Agreements on activities with the university's clinical bases are drawn up taking into account the needs of educational programmes in the profile of patients, the level of medical care, the availability of conditions for organizing the educational process.

The clinical bases used to implement the educational process in the specialty "Nephrology for Adults, Children" are the medical institutions of city and regional significance: MSE "Regional Clinical Hospital" (since 01.02.23 renamed to "Regional Multidisciplinary Hospital"), Clinic of the Medical University of

the NJSC "MUK", Clinic of Professional Health of the NJSC "MUK", MSE "Regional Children's Clinical Hospital", Medical Organization "Diaverum". All conditions for organizing the educational process have been created at the clinical bases of the university (Annex). The number of provided classrooms at the clinical bases is 36, the usable area is 100%.

In general, residents are satisfied with the training, and purposefully entered this organization, as they believe that the educational organization has good resources, image and international connections.

4 residents nephrologists are employed as resident doctors in the Regional Clinical Hospital of Karaganda for 0.25 of the rate, 1 resident in the dialysis centre, 1 in the Medical Centre "Divera", 1 in the polyclinic "Miras" for 0.5 of the rate.

Residents demonstrated their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgments on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in research, Experts studied the documents of residents (portfolio).

### **6.3 Information technology**

The main information platform for obtaining the necessary information on the educational process for residents of all courses and specialties is the Student Portal, an additional information resource is the "Platon" platform for obtaining information on the results of current and final academic performance

Residents and teachers have access to educational electronic resources. Users are informed by sending emails to the corporate Outlook email address, as well as by posting information on the MUK website, the MUK Portal, the MUK Student Portal, the Instagram page, and the Telegram messenger. The MUK website has a "Library" section in Kazakh, English, and Russian. The library also provides feedback to readers on the Student Portal and the Telegram bot, where students can ask questions, view the calendar of events, documents, instructions, and videos on working with electronic resources, etc. Every year, the library monitors (surveys) all categories of readers on the quality of using the reference and search apparatus, as well as on issues of improving and expanding the MUK library information resource base.

### **6.4 Clinical Teams**

At NJSC "MUK", residents have the opportunity to learn teamwork skills with colleagues and other healthcare professionals while working in clinical and diagnostic units equipped with the necessary equipment in sufficient quantity to perform the required manipulations.

Residential students participate as listeners during consultations, carry out assignments of senior colleagues within their competence. Students have free access to patients at clinical sites and all the conditions for improving their practical skills.

In the questionnaire, residents noted that they have free access to patients at clinical sites and all the conditions for improving their practical skills - 96% of teachers completely agree with this, 4% partially agree.

### **6.5 Medical scientific research and achievements**

The research activities of the university are currently carried out in accordance with the Research University Development Program for 2019-2023. The target indicators of the Development Program of the Research University of the NJSC "MUK" were approved by the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 27, 2019 No. 453.

The priority areas of scientific research of the university are: preventive environment as the basis of public health, a personalized approach to the management of a number of significant diseases, comprehensive research aimed at the development and implementation of drugs based on domestic plant materials in pharmaceutical production, medical and social problems of the elderly and old age, research in the field of medical education.

Head of the EP Assoc. Prof. Bacheva I.V., participates in the implementation of the scientific and technical program "COVID-19: Scientific and technological substantiation of the response system to the spread of new respiratory infections, including coronavirus infection", scientific grant research "IRN AR 19676870" Pathogenetic significance of the structural and functional imbalance of the vascular system in the pulmonary-cardio-renal continuum ", a participant in the project " Building educational and research

potential in the field of nutrition and dietetics in Central Asia, BERNICA "ERASMUS + (2023-2025).

## **6.6 Expertise in the field of education**

The examination is carried out in the form of an analysis of the need for specialists, an analysis of training methods for residents, and the results allow us to draw conclusions about the quality of innovative changes in postgraduate education. For example, all residency graduates are 100% employed and have positive characteristics as specialists. Every year, leading specialists are awarded certificates, cash prizes, and various awards from the University, the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and the government based on the results of their clinical, scientific, and pedagogical work.

## **6.7 Training in other institutions**

One of the main processes of the Bologna Declaration and one of the important aspects of the integration of Kazakhstani universities and science into the international space is academic mobility. The university has developed and approved the "Regulations on the organization of academic mobility" ("Academic Policy" of NJSC "MUK", section 7-7). The development plan for the EP "Nephrology for Adults, Children" provides for incoming and outgoing academic mobility of residents to partner universities, visiting professors, which is implemented according to the academic mobility plan.

Thus, from September 13 to October 12, 2-year residents of the specialty "Nephrology for Adults, Children" of NJSC "MUK" Borchashvili S. and Muslimov N.R. underwent training at the "Mechnikov North-West State Medical University" (St. Petersburg, Russian Federation) within the framework of academic mobility. As part of the program, Professor Azizov I.S., Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Laboratory Complex of the Research Institute of Antimicrobial Chemotherapy, Smolensk, conducted combined training on antibiotic resistance.

The university has a coordinator of academic mobility programs.

NJSC "MUK" is included in the Directory of Medical Schools "Avicenna" of the World Health Organization and the World Federation for Medical Education. NJSC "MUK" is a member of the Association for Medical Education in Europe (AMEE), the Association for the Study of Medical Education (ASME), the Organization for the Protection of PhD in Biomedicine and Health in the European System (ORPHEUS), the European University Association (EUA), the Organization for University Mobility in Asia and the Pacific (UMAP), the International Association for the Development of Education (IADE), the Association of Higher Education Institutions of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Association of Medical Education in Asia (AMEA).

In 2016, a memorandum of cooperation was signed with Lund University, Sweden. Every year, more than 300 students take part in international scientific conferences and research. Thus, on the initiative of the university, the Central Asian International Conference on Medical Education has been held since 2012.

The university participates in the implementation of republican programs and projects of scientific research in the field of health care, international multicentre studies SMART, METALL, UTIAP.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Comply with 18 Standards (including 11 basic, 7 improvement standards): fully - 18.

## **Standard 7: ASSESSMENT OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

### **7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms**

Assessment and monitoring of the EP at the University is carried out in accordance with the regulation on the Academic Policy, approved by the Senate on August 27, 2021. Monitoring of the educational programme includes planning, data collection, analysis / conclusions, necessary improvements with subsequent monitoring of changes, which ensures transparency of the process and results. An annual analysis of the educational programme will allow the educational organization to make adjustments and improve the content.

Initially, in 2015, Karaganda State Medical University, in accordance with license No. 14020603 dated 04/14/2015, carried out the first recruitment of a residency student in the EP "**Nephrology, including**

**paediatric"**. Since 2019, educational activities have been carried out in accordance with the license in the direction of 7R091 Healthcare; KZ32LAA00016018 dated June 14, 2019. In 2020, EP 7R01115 - "Nephrology, including paediatric" was entered into the Register of educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education, updated in the Register in 2023 in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard of 2022 No. 63.

Subsequently (2021), the EP was renamed into **"Nephrology for Adults, Children"** (Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No RK MOH 43 dated 05.25.2021).

Regular evaluation of the quality of the educational programme is carried out by all university structures involved in the implementation and quality management of the EP, through systematic surveys of teachers, students and employers, the results are discussed at meetings of the department, Schools, meetings of the Academic Committee, and the University Senate.

When assessing the program, the goals and objectives of training, the final learning outcomes (through assessment of residents, independent examination) are taken into account. The process of implementing the educational programme is assessed through feedback from residents and teachers and the achievements of graduates. Thus, among the graduates of the residency in the specialty "Nephrology for Adults, Children", 100% are employed in their specialty, working as nephrologists at the outpatient and inpatient stages in the LO and MA. The results of the employer survey in 2023 (for the 2022-2023 academic year) showed 100% satisfaction with the quality of training of graduates of the residency "Nephrology for Adults, Children".

## **7.2 Feedback from teachers and residents**

Teachers and residents have the opportunity to participate in the evaluation and subsequent improvement of the educational programme on a regular basis through various feedback channels.

Feedback from consumers is maintained in each structural unit. In the University's advisory bodies (SR and PD, Quality Assurance Commission) there is due representation of stakeholders in the evaluation of the educational process and the final results of resident training programs, members of the SR and PD, the Commission participate in the discussion, review of the developed EP, monitor the EP in order to identify weaknesses for subsequent corrective measures and improvement of the EP.

For feedback from teachers and residents, the Chairman of the Board blog is used, where students and employees of the University receive answers to their questions about the terms of implementation of the educational programme.

## **7.3 Results of residents and graduates**

The percentage of graduates employed in the specialty "Nephrology for Adults, Children" was 100%. In a survey conducted in 2023, 226 employers (100% response rate), including 7 in the specialty "Nephrology for Adults, Children", noted that the level of achievement of the necessary competencies by graduates in the EP "Nephrology for Adults, Children" was 5 points; 100% of employers noted that graduates have a sufficient level of knowledge and skills to perform their duties efficiently and effectively; no employer rated the quality of training as low.

## **7.4 Stakeholder Involvement**

Stakeholders are involved in the monitoring process by receiving ongoing feedback in the form of questionnaires, participation in various events (young scientists' competitions, participation in conferences).

Additionally, boxes for complaints and suggestions are placed. The feedback results are analysed and discussed at meetings of the SR and PD, departments, and the Senate. The feedback results are taken into account when planning work to improve the EP.

Interviews with employers were conducted offline. The overall share of employer satisfaction is 92%. Based on the survey results, it can be concluded that respondents are satisfied with the training of NJSC "MUK" graduates; NJSC "MUK" graduates have sufficient knowledge, skills and competencies. Respondents gave Recommendations for improving the quality of training in terms of practical classes, increasing the number of hours in specialized disciplines and practical skills, especially the development of communication and manual skills. It was also recommended to expand the volume of training with

foreign organizations (master classes, trainings) and international cooperation with other universities.

### **7.5 Procedure for approving educational programmes**

NJSC “MUK” has developed mechanisms for approving educational programmes that provide for the evaluation of programs at the stages of planning, implementation, analysis of results and implementation of changes, which allows monitoring the process of implementing the educational programme and the progress of residents, and ensures the identification and timely resolution of emerging problems.

The policy and procedure for the examination of the EP are regulated by the Regulation on the management of the educational programme of NJSC “MUK”. The Concept of the EP is evaluated by the Academic Committee of the Senate of the NJSC "MUK", and the internal assessment of the EP is carried out by the Quality Assurance Commission at the School of Residency and Professional Development.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Comply with 10 standards (including 7 basic, 3 Standard improvements): fully – 10.

## **Standard 8: MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION**

### **8.1 Management**

In accordance with license No KZ32LAA00016018 dated 06.05.2019 in the direction 7R091 "Healthcare (medicine)", the implementation of educational residency programs is carried out.

The educational programme is managed in accordance with:

- the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan - "On Education" (Government Resolution of July 27, 2007 No. 319-III LRK),
- Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 595 - "On approval of the Model rules for the activities of educational organizations of the corresponding types",
- Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 600 - "On approval of the Model rules for admission to training in educational organizations implementing educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education",
- Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No RK MOH–249/2020 - "On approval of the rules for assessing the knowledge and skills of students, assessing the professional readiness of graduates of educational programmes in the field of health care and specialists in the field of health care",
- SCES;

Internal documents:

- Academic policy of NJSC "MUK",
- Regulation on the management of the educational programme,
- Regulation on residency.

The academic policy of NJSC “MUK” defines the internal selection criteria and their rules, according to the academic performance rating system; conducting midterm assessment; rules for final assessment; rules for granting students’ academic leave; rules for transfer, expulsion and reinstatement; organization of academic mobility; rules for issuing duplicate documents; rules for organizing the educational process using distance learning technologies; rules and procedure for checking works for originality; rules for recognizing the results of formal and non-formal training; rules for awarding scholarships and vacant educational grants, rules for assessing students' achievements. The procedure for admitting students is regulated by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 600, and the internal regulatory document - the Policy for Admitting Students to NJSC “MUK”, approved on 05/27/2022 at a meeting of the Board of Directors. The procedures for admission and selection of residents are described in detail in Standard 4.

The EP is managed on the basis of the Regulation on the management of the educational programme in NJSC “MUK” (09.09.2020, pr. 14 of the Board meeting). Control and monitoring of the implementation, execution of programs is carried out by the SR and PR under the supervision of the Vice-Rector for Scientific and Clinical Work (Organizational structure dated 03.10.2022, pr. 40 of the Board of Directors).

The assessment of residents and the achievement of the final learning outcomes is carried out on the basis

of an independent examination.

The completion of the training of a resident physician is documented by the Department of Academic Work in the form of assigning a specialist qualification in the relevant educational programme and issuing a specialist certificate.

In accordance with Article 39 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" No. 319-III dated July 27, 2007 ([https://online.zakon.kz/Document/?doc\\_id=30118747&pos=3;-106#pos=3;-106](https://online.zakon.kz/Document/?doc_id=30118747&pos=3;-106#pos=3;-106)) and the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 28, 2015 No. 39 "On approval of types of educational documents, forms of educational documents of the state sample and the rules for their registration and issuance, the main requirements for the content of educational documents of their own sample and the rules for their registration and issuance, as well as the form of a certificate issued to persons who have not completed education in educational organizations" upon completion of postgraduate training programs and receiving a positive assessment of the final certification, students under the program 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children" are issued a "Certificate of Completion of Residency" of the state sample with the award of the qualification of a doctor - adult and paediatric nephrologist.

Ensuring the quality of the educational process in residency is determined by the fulfilment of mandatory requirements for the level of training (State Compulsory Educational Standards, EP), the creation of a system for monitoring the effectiveness of the Academic staff and the implementation of the resident's individual educational programme. Monitoring the quality of the educational process is carried out by the School Quality Assurance Commission, heads of educational programmes, and the School.

## **8.2 Academic Leadership**

In NJSC "MUK", the governing body is the Board of Directors, the executive body is the Management Board: Chairman of the Management Board - Rector, Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs, Vice-Rector for Strategic Development and International Cooperation, Vice-Rector for Scientific and Clinical Work, Managing Director.

The Management Board is responsible for financial and economic activities, the safety of the university's property, for organizing the fight against corruption, and resolves issues related to the university's activities in accordance with its competence, determined by the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Charter of NJSC "MUK". The composition of the members of the Management Board is approved by the Board of Directors.

One of the collegial representative bodies is the School Council (Regulations on the School Council dated 26.08.2019, pr. 8 of the Management Board), which organizes its work under the leadership of the Dean of the School. The School Council includes: the dean, deputy deans, Academic staff - 60%, employers - 20% and students - 20%. The main functions of the School Council are: consideration and approval of strategic directions for the development of the school, including the opening of new educational programmes for the training of specialists, consideration and examination of the educational programme, working curricula, determination of forms of final control in agreement with departments / heads of educational programmes and other functions.

The School Council approves the School Quality Assurance Commission (QACS) and acts on the basis of the regulation on the management of the educational programme. QACS is an advisory body and is in direct interaction with the School Council. The purpose of the QACS activities is to examine the content and conditions of the EP implementation, assess compliance with the assessment policy, analyse student satisfaction with regard to the quality of the EP and/or disciplines/modules, and the presence of facts of violation of academic honesty.

The purpose of the University Senate: consideration, submission of proposals and approval of documents on issues of educational, research and clinical activities of the University; creation of necessary conditions for students and faculty of the University; definition of the concept of the development program for scientific, educational and clinical activities of the University.

The main educational, research and clinical units that train residents - departments, manage the educational process to ensure the quality of services provided based on a competence-oriented approach, as well as conduct training. Currently, 5 departments are involved in the implementation of 10 disciplines of the educational programme "Nephrology for Adults, Children".

To the question of the questionnaire "Do the organization's managers listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research and clinical work?", 72% of teachers answered that they do so systematically, 24% answered "sometimes", 4% - no answer.

### **8.3 Budget for training and resource allocation**

The budget of NJSC "MUK" is formed from several sources: the republican budget (state order for the training of personnel for higher and postgraduate education, advanced training of medical workers, development of scientific research, transfers); local budget; provision of paid educational and other services.

Financial issues in NJSC "MUK" are supervised by the Managing Director and structural divisions responsible for budget management: the Department of Economics and Finance, the Department of State Procurement. Financing of the EP depends on the formation of the annual state order. Every year, the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan approves the state educational order for the training of specialists with higher and postgraduate education, and in accordance with the Order of the Acting Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 19, 2021 No RK MOH-6 "On approval of the methodology for forming the cost of training for educational programmes in the field of health care", a financial and economic calculation of the cost of training students is carried out within the framework of the state educational order. The NJSC "MUK" develops a University Development Plan, which is reviewed by the Management Board and approved by the Board of Directors for 5 years, and the plan is adjusted annually depending on changes in the needs of the departments and the university.

The financial condition of the NJSC "MUK" is characterized as stably sustainable and sufficient for the implementation of educational activities, no arrears in wages to employees are allowed, the share of wages in the university's expenses is stably high, employees are paid remuneration, and a social package is provided: discounts on advanced training, retraining, training in a master's program and for children of employees, as well as discounts on medical care and recreation areas.

### **8.4 Administration and Management**

The NJSC "MUK" has the appropriate administrative and management staff (95) and Academic staff (987), the total number is 1082 employees, excluding auxiliary persons, of which 279 are men, 803 are women; part-time workers - 348. The management structure of the University assumes the effective implementation of the educational programme, effective management, and timely provision of the necessary educational resources.

Requirements for the faculty when elected to vacant positions are determined by job descriptions and the Charter of NJSC "MUK". The University has developed and approved regulations on structural divisions (school, department) and job descriptions of the university faculty.

The university staffing table is approved by the University Board of Directors, and the annual academic load of the university and departments is approved by the Senate upon the submission of the Department of Academic Affairs. The total number of faculty is formed based on the average ratio of students and teachers: master's degree - 1:6, doctoral degree - 1:4, residency - 1:6. The calculation of the teaching load of the faculty is carried out in accordance with the Model Rules for the Activities of Higher Education Organizations and the state educational standard, and in residency it is 650 hours per year.

The faculty of NJSC "MUK" in the specialty "Nephrology for Adults, Children" together with the Republican Centre for Disease Control of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan actively participates in the development and implementation of clinical protocols for the diagnosis and treatment of various diseases, professional standards in the specialty.

Internal assessment of the quality of education is implemented in the processes of internal audit (QMS), self-assessment (accreditation), fulfilment of key performance indicators (KPI), which leads to continuous improvement and self-improvement.

Representatives of practical healthcare are part of the advisory bodies (School Council, School Quality Assurance Commission, and Senate) for the development of residency programs, their improvement, and have the right to vote when making changes, suggestions and comments to the educational process, as well as when approving the EP for residency.

Cooperation with the healthcare sector is carried out on the basis of the General Agreement between the Health Department of the Karaganda Region and the NJSC "MUK", agreements concluded between the



NJSC “MUK” and chief physicians (directors) of healthcare organizations. Official status of cooperation with partners in the healthcare sector is given through the conclusion of perpetual memorandums and agreements with clinical bases for organizing training, as part of the implementation of the EP.

### **8.5 Requirements and regulations**

The medical organization follows the recommendations of national authorized bodies that establish the number and list of recognized residency specialties, for the preparation of which postgraduate education programmes are developed.

The mechanism of interaction of the NJSC “MUK”, as a medical higher education institution, with authorized bodies (the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Ministry of Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan) and the healthcare sector is regulated by the regulatory legal acts specified in paragraph 8.1.1 of this standard.

The interaction of NJSC "MUK" with the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Ministry of Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan on issues of organizing the educational process in residency is carried out through the implementation of:

- Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 4, 2022 No RK MOH-63 "On approval of state mandatory standards for levels of education in the field of health care"

- Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 7, 2020 "On public health and the health care system" (<https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/K2000000360#z3518>),

- Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 15, 2018 No. 636 "On approval of the National Development Plan of the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2025 and recognition of certain decrees of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan as invalid" (<https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/U1800000636>),

- Message of the President Republic of Kazakhstan - Leader of the Nation N.A. Nazarbayev to the people of Kazakhstan dated December 14, 2012 "Strategy "Kazakhstan-2050": a new political course of an established state" (<https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/K1200002050>),

- Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated November 24, 2022 No. 945 "On approval of the Concept of development of healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2026" (<https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/P2200000945>),

- Message of the Head of State Kassym-Jomart Tokayev to the people of Kazakhstan dated March 16, 2022 "New Kazakhstan: the path of renewal and modernization" ([https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/K22002022\\_1](https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/K22002022_1)),

- Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 12, 2021 № 726 "On approval of the national project" Quality education "Educated nation" (<https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/P2100000726>),

- Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 12, 2021 № 725 "On approval of the national project" Quality and affordable healthcare for every citizen "Healthy nation" (<https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/P2100000725>),

- Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 12, 2021 № 727 "On approval of the national project" Technological breakthrough through digitalization, science and innovation " (<https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/P2100000727>).

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Compliant with 11 standards (including 8 basic, 3 improvement Standards): fully - 11

### **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

NJSC “MUK” initiates procedures: - regular review and update of the organizational structure; - the process of training residents, structure, program content, learning outcomes / competencies, assessment of knowledge and skills, learning environment; - management improvement. The university corrects deficiencies, allocates resources for continuous improvement in order to adapt to changing circumstances and needs in postgraduate education, as well as taking into account the opinions and interests of various stakeholder groups, which are reflected in the Development Program of NJSC "Medical University

Karaganda" for 2024-2028, approved on December 11, 2023 by the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 1105 (<https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/P2300001105>).

In 2019, during the development of the EP 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children", the final outcomes and competencies of residents were revised and analysed taking into account modern trends in the development of diagnostics and treatment in nephrology. At the beginning of the academic year, syllabuses are revised and changes are made aimed at improving the EP, control forms are revised annually, test questions and written assignments are updated by 30% taking into account new concepts of diagnostics and treatment. Thus, in the 2021-2022 academic year, midterm certification of residents in the form of portfolio defence at the end of the academic year was introduced. Monitoring of current academic performance is carried out and discussed monthly at a meeting of the department, the Council of the SR and PD. The results of the midterm certification at the end of the academic year and the results of the independent examination of the NCIE are also discussed at meetings of the department, the Council of the SR and SR and the Senate. The results of the analysis, recommendations of the certification committee determine the need to improve the EP.

The library collection is constantly updated with basic and additional literature in three languages (Kazakh, Russian, and English).

The Academic staff actively participates in scientific projects, grant research, scientific and technical programs within the framework of the Grants of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as intra-university competitions for Grants. Continuous improvement of the educational process in residency in the specialty "Nephrology for Adults, Children" helps to modernize the EP and graduate well-trained specialists in demand in various regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Comply out of 2 standards (including 1 basic, 1 Standard of improvement): fully - 2.

#### **CONCLUSION:**

During the external evaluation of the educational programme, it was found that out of **114 standards** (including basic standards - 82 and improvement standards - 32), full compliance is demonstrated by 112 standards for accreditation, including 82 basic standards and 30 improvement standards. 2 (6.25%) Standard of improvement are partially fulfilled. No non-compliance with standards was found.

#### **5. Recommendations for improving the educational programme in the specialty - 7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children" of the NJSC "Karaganda Medical University"**

1) To expand the catalogue of elective disciplines, taking into account the need to ensure competence in the scientific foundations and methodology of medical research for the scientific activities of residents in the residency specialty "Nephrology for Adults, Children" (2.2.1).

2) To detail the criteria for assessment sheets for an objective assessment of clinical skills in the specialty "Nephrology for Adults, Children" (3.1.3).

## 6. Recommendation to the Accreditation Council of the ECAQA

The members of the EEC established the compliance of the educational programme of the residency in the specialty **7R01115 "Nephrology for Adults, Children"** of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" with the Standards for Accreditation and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend the Accreditation Council of the ECAQA to accredit this program for a period of 5 years.

	Full name	Signature
Chairman	Zhanalina Bakhyt Sekerbekovna	
International Expert	Nasyrov Ruslan Abdullaevich	
International Expert	Troinich Yana Nikolaevna	
Academic Expert	Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna	
Academic Expert	Madyarov Valentin Manarbekovich	
Academic Expert	Nugmanova Aigul Maratovna	
Academic Expert	Apbasova Saulesh Akhatovna	
Academic Expert	Yesetova Gulstan Utegenovna	
Academic Expert	Sadykova Ainur Maralovna	
Academic Expert	Tuksanbaeva Gulfariza Usenbaevna	
Academic Expert	Iztleuov Yerbolat Maratovich	
Academic Expert	Pak Laura Alekseevna	
Academic Expert	Kamhen Vitaly Bronislavovich	
Employer Expert	Daniyarova Bayan Lashinovna	
Student Expert	Dyusembek Nazira Askerbekkyzy	

**Профиль качества и критерии внешней оценки образовательной программы (обобщение)**

Стандарт	Критерии оценки	Количество стандартов	БС*/СУ	Оценка		
				Полностью соответствует	Частично соответствует	Не соответствует
1.	<b>МИССИЯ И КОНЕЧНЫЕ РЕЗУЛЬТАТЫ</b>	14	9/5	14		
2.	<b>ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНАЯ ПРОГРАММА</b>	22	19/3	21	1	
3.	<b>ОЦЕНКА РЕЗИДЕНТОВ</b>	9	6/3	8	1	
4.	<b>РЕЗИДЕНТЫ</b>	20	14/6	20		
5.	<b>АКАДЕМИЧЕСКИЙ ШТАТ/ПРЕПОДАВАТЕЛИ</b>	8	7/1	8		
6.	<b>ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНЫЕ РЕСУРСЫ</b>	18	11/7	18		
7.	<b>ОЦЕНКА ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНОЙ ПРОГРАММЫ</b>	10	7/3	10		
8.	<b>УПРАВЛЕНИЕ И АДМИНИСТРИРОВАНИЕ</b>	11	8/3	11		
9.	<b>НЕПРЕРЫВНОЕ УЛУЧШЕНИЕ</b>	2	1/1	2		
				112	2	
		114	82/32	114		

**Список документов, изученных членами ВЭЖ в рамках проведения внешней оценки образовательной программы резидентуры**

<b>№</b>	<b>Наименования документов</b>	<b>Количество</b>
1.	Отчет по самооценке образовательной программы НАО МУК на соответствие стандартам аккредитации образовательных программ по специальности резидентуры 7R01115 «Нефрология взрослая, детская»	1
2	Кодекс Академической честности	1
3	Лига Академической честности	1
4	Аккредитация клиник	2
5.	Анкетирование выпускников, обучающихся, ППС, работодателей	4
6.	Академический календарь резидентуры	1
7.	Кодекс чести слушателя резидентуры	1
8.	Сферы компетенции выпускника резидентуры	1
9.	Перечень документов для поступления в резидентуру	1
10.	Политика в области качества НАО МУК	1
11.	Положение о промежуточной аттестации	1
12.	Положение об итог. госуд. аттестации	1
13.	Портфолио резидентов	2
14.	Журналы посещаемости резидентов по дисциплинам	5
15.	Экзаменационные ведомости	5
16.	Сертификаты повышения педагогической квалификации	2
17.	Положение об организации учебного процесса	1
18.	Положение об отделе ПО	1