

To the Accreditation Council
of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and
Quality Assurance
in Higher Education and Healthcare

**REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION
ON THE RESULTS OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME EVALUATION
"NEUROLOGY, INCLUDING PEDIATRIC"
OF THE CORPORATE FOUNDATION "UNIVERSITY MEDICAL CENTER"
FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF
POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMMES (RESIDENCY
SPECIALTIES) OF MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS**

period of external expert evaluation: 7-10.12.2020

Nur-Sultan, 2020

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the EEC	3
2.	General part of the final report of the EEC	5
2.1	Presentation of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Center" (CF UMC) and residency educational programme in the specialty "Neurology, including pediatric"	5
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	
2.3	Analysis of the self-assessment report of the residency educational programme in the specialty "Neurology, including pediatric"	
3.	Description of the stages of external expert evaluation and conclusion	
4.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of external evaluation and residency educational programme in the specialty "Neurology, including pediatric" of the CF UMC and a review of strengths for each standard	
5.	Recommendations for improving the educational programme of residency in the specialty "Neurology, including pediatric" of CF UMC	
6.	Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council	
7.	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation and residency educational programme in the specialty "Neurology, including pediatric" of the CF UMC for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards	
8.	Attachment 2. List of documents requested by EEC members as part of specialized accreditation	

LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS:

- SCES – state compulsory educational standard
Department – Department of Science and Education of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Center"
DET – distance educational technologies
ECAQA - Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Healthcare
EA – end-of-course assessment
IC - individual curriculum
RW - research work
CF "UMC" - corporate foundation "University Medical Center"
CED – catalog of elective disciplines
MH RK – Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RK – Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
NSCMC – National Scientific Center for Motherhood and Childhood
NSCOT – National Scientific Center of Oncology and Transplantology
NCCR - National Center for Children's Rehabilitation
PGE – postgraduate education
AT – advanced training
RT – retraining
TS- teaching staff
EP – educational programmes
RDC – Republican Diagnostic Center
WC - working curriculum
NCIE - national center for independent examination
QMS – quality management system
IRWT - the work of a resident-trainee under the supervision of a clinical mentor during the period of clinical activity of the resident-trainee
IRW – independent work of a resident-trainee
EMC - educational and methodological council
TM – teaching materials
GPA – Grade Point Average - the arithmetic average of the grades received for all completed courses, taking into account the time spent on them
JCI – Joint Commission International

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order under No.21 dated November 16, 2020, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct accreditation of educational programmes for residency specialties of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Center" (CF UMC) during the period from December 7 to December 10, 2020 in the following composition:

Chairperson of the External Expert Commission

MORENKO MARINA ALEXEYEVNA,

Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of children diseases JSC "Astana Medical University", Chief freelance pediatric immunologist of the Public Healthcare Department of Nur-Sultan, the member of the European Academy of Allergists and Clinical Immunologists, the Member of the European Respiratory Society

Foreign expert

IVANA OBORNÁ

Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Assessor for the recognition of accreditation bodies of the World Federation of Medical Education (<https://wfme.org/about-wfme/people/ivana-oborna/>), expert of the National Bureau of Accreditation of Higher Education of the Czech Republic, Deputy Chairperson of the Fulbright Czech-American government organization, vice-rector for international relations at Palacký University, obstetrician-gynecologist at the Faculty Clinic of Olomouc

Foreign expert

ZINCHENKO RENA ABULFAZOVNA,

Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Deputy Director for Scientific and Clinical Work of the Federal State Budgetary Scientific Institution "Medical Genetic Research Center named after Academician N.P.Bochkov" (MGRC), head of the laboratory of genetic epidemiology, scientific secretary of the Dissertation Council D 001.016.01 for the defense of candidate and doctoral dissertations in the specialty "genetics" (medical and biological sciences) on the basis of the Federal State Budgetary Scientific Institution "MGRC".

National Academic Expert

KURMANOVA ALMAGUL MEDEUBAYEVNA,

Doctor of Medical Sciences, head of laboratories of JSC "Scientific Center for Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology", Almaty

National Academic Expert

YESSENKULOVA SAULE ASKEROVNA

Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of NJSC "Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D.Asfendiyarov"

The Member of the Association of Oncologists of the Republic of Kazakhstan

National Academic Expert

RAMAZANOVA SHOLPAN KHAMZAYEVNA,

Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of General Medical Practice No.2 of NJSC "Kazakh National Medical University" named after S.D.Asfendiyarov."

National Academic Expert

KALIYEVA SHOLPAN SABATAYEVNA,

Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Clinical Pharmacology and Evidence-Based Medicine of NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"

Member of the professional association of clinical pharmacologists and pharmacists of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Member of the international pharmacoeconomic society ISPOR
Deputy Chairperson of the Form commission of the Healthcare Administration of Karaganda region

National Academic Expert

SADIYEVA ZHANAR ZAMANKHANOVNA,
anesthesiologist-resuscitator, head of the department of postgraduate education
JSC "South Kazakhstan Medical Academy"

National Academic Expert

DZHAMANTAYEVA BOTAGOZ DAUKIMOVNA,
Candidate of Medical Sciences, acting Head of the Department of Neurosurgery and Neurology of
JSC "Scientific Center of Neurosurgery"

National Academic Expert

BEISEBAYEV ELDAR NURLANOVICH,
PhD, assistant at the Department of Oncology, Mammology and Radiation Diagnostics
Non-commercial Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"

ECAQA Observer

SARSENBAYEVA DARIYABANU BULATOVNA,
head of international department
NI "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Healthcare"
Tel.: +7777 1471726, e-mail: info@ecaqa.org

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC (Order of the ECAQA General Director under No.4 dated February 13, 2017). The EEC report contains an evaluation of the residency educational programme in the specialty "Neurology, including pediatric" of CF UMC for compliance with the Accreditation Standards for postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of ECAQA medical educational organizations and EEC recommendations for further improvement of the educational activities of CF UMC in the field of postgraduate education.

2. General part of the final report of the EEC

2.1 Presentation of JSC "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" and the residency educational programme in the specialty "Neurology, including pediatric"

The Corporate Foundation "University Medical Center" (hereinafter - CF "UMC") was created in accordance with the decision of the Board of Trustees of the Autonomous Educational Organization "Nazarbayev University" (hereinafter - Nazarbayev University) dated September 20, 2015 under No.20 on the basis of subsidiaries of the joint stock company "National medical holding".

The goal of the CF "UMC" is to provide safe, effective and high-quality medical care, development, implementation and dissemination of modern technologies in the field of medical science, education and practice.

Today, CF "UMC" unites four leading medical centers, including the National Scientific Center for Motherhood and Childhood (hereinafter - NSCMC), the National Center for Children's Rehabilitation (hereinafter - NCCR), the Republican Diagnostic Center (hereinafter - RDC) and a branch in Kyzylorda. Three centers of the CF "UMC" (NSCMC, RDC, NCCR) have passed the international accreditation of Joint Commission International, which is a guarantee of the safety of the services provided and confirmation of the provision of medical services in accordance with the level of the international standard. In 2019, by resolution of the Government of the Republic of

Kazakhstan, the National Center for Oncology and Transplantology was removed from the CF “UMC” and transferred to the jurisdiction of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Also, by the end of this year, the National Scientific Cardiac Surgery Center will be transferred to the structure of the CF “UMC”.

Activity as part of the integrated academic healthcare system of Nazarbayev University ensures the uniqueness of the educational services offered. As part of the integrated academic healthcare system, Nazarbayev University, CF "UMC" attracts foreign specialists "mentors" and organizes master classes with the participation of international experts at its centers to create a competitive generation of medical personnel, develop and adapt modern protocols for the diagnosis and treatment of diseases, as well as improving the quality of medical care.

CF "UMC" pays special attention to the issue of compliance with the requirements of international standards of quality and safety of medical care JCI, including through the use of methodologies for continuous quality improvement, advanced training of medical personnel in leading medical organizations in the world, the introduction of a patient-oriented system of medical care, including based on the recommendations of partner mentors from Switzerland in the field of hospital services.

In accordance with the Charter of the CF "UMC", approved by the decision of the Governing Council of Nazarbayev University dated October 16, 2015 under No.16.10.15 (with amendments and additions approved by the decision of the Governing Council of Nazarbayev University dated February 6, 2018 under No.06.02.18), one of the main types of activity of CF "UMC" is educational.

The organizational, functional and staffing structures of the organization are built taking into account the mission, goals, objectives and policies in the field of quality assurance.

The organizational structure of CF "UMC" was developed based on the strategic directions approved by the governing body of CF "UMC", the vertical subordination of the relevant structural divisions to the Deputy Chairman of the Board, Medical and Executive Directors in the areas supervised. The basis for constructing the organizational system of the centers of the CF "UMC" is the main process blocks: medical, strategic, nursing and service and economic.

The Department of Science and Education (hereinafter referred to as the Department) is a structural subdivision of the CF "UMC".

Residency training at CF “UMC” has been carried out since 2016. According to Article 8 of the Law “On the status of Nazarbayev University”, “Nazarbayev Intellectual Schools” and “Nazarbayev Foundation” Nazarbayev University, Intellectual Schools and their organizations carry out educational activities without a license, without state attestation.

Residency programmes are implemented in accordance with the Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF "UMC", approved by decision of the Board of the CF "UMC" dated February 15, 2018 under No.3.

Residency programmes are implemented on 11 clinical specialties:

- 7R111500 Neurology, incl. pediatric;
- 7R114400 Obstetrics and gynecology, incl. pediatric;
- 7R112600 Anesthesiology and resuscitation, incl. pediatric;
- 7R114300 Neonatology;
- 7R111900 Radiation diagnostics;
- 7R114200 Pediatrics;
- 7R113300 Pediatric surgery;
- 7R115000 – Oncology and hematology pediatric
- 7R114500– Medical genetics;
- 7R113600 Traumatology and orthopedics, incl. pediatric;
- 7R111000 Nephrology, incl. pediatric;

The total number of students in the residency programme of the CF “UMC” in 2019-2020 is 66 residents, including **6 people in the specialty “Neurology, including pediatric”**. In 2019 and 2020, 51 and 32 residents were graduated, respectively, in the specialty **“Neurology, including pediatric” - 4 and 2, respectively.**

The total number of teachers involved in the educational process of residency and additional professional training is 206 people, of which 27 are Doctor of Medical Sciences, Candidate of Medical Sciences – 60. The number of teaching staff in the residency programme “Neurology, including pediatric” – 8.

2.2 Information about previous accreditation

Accreditation of the residency educational programme in the specialty “Neurology, including pediatric” of CF UMC has not yet been carried out.

2.3 Analysis of the self-assessment report of the residency educational programme in the specialty “Neurology, including pediatric” of CF UMC

Preparation for specialized accreditation of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Center" was carried out based on the order No.18-Н/К dated July 20, 2020 “On approval of the composition of the working group for preparation for specialized accreditation of the corporate foundation "University Medical Center".

The self-assessment report of the educational programme is presented on 131 pages of main text, of which 22 pages are attachments and electronic versions of documents via a link in Google Drive are 31.

The report is characterized by completeness of answers to all 9 accreditation standards, structured taking into account the recommendations of the ECAQA self-assessment Guidelines, as well as internal unity of information. A covering letter signed by the acting medical director Khairullin B.Ye. is attached to the report, confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report contains information about the representative of the CF UMC, responsible for conducting self-assessment of educational programmes Syzdykova Alma Alibekovna, director of the Department of Science and Education.

A working group of 22 people headed by Chairman Taigulov Ye.A. on preparing the self-assessment report, made a certain work : the content of the accredited educational programme, the conditions for its implementation, staff, educational resources were analyzed; the necessary information was collected in accordance with the Accreditation Standards of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations (hereinafter referred to as the accreditation standards); a thorough analysis, updating and addition of methodological and educational materials was carried out, their content is reflected in the report. The content of the self-assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards and includes a description of strengths and areas for improvement for each of the 9 standards.

All standards contain the actual practice of the CF UMC in training residents in the specialty “Neurology, including pediatric”, taking into account the start of admission of students in 2018 and 2019, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the objectives of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated regarding the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, training outcomes, results of assessment of knowledge and skills, material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, database), financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc.

The conclusion for each of the 8 accreditation standards includes a description of the strengths and areas for improvement identified during self-analysis and prospects for development in this specialty. Compliance analysis is given only for 8 standards, since new residency educational programmes are submitted for examination and the process of continuous renewal (Standard 9) will be analyzed and assessed at the stage of post-accreditation monitoring when the accreditation council makes a decision on full accreditation of the educational programme.

Thus, the self-assessment report of the accredited CF UMC residency educational programme contains objective, detailed, structured information on all types of activities in accordance with ECAQA accreditation standards, and the university made appropriate corrections in the report at the review stage.

3. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work on the evaluation of the residency educational programme in the specialty “Neurology, including pediatric” was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programmes of the ECAQA (approved by order of the General Director of the NI “Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Healthcare” under No.5 dated February 17, 2017) and according to the programme and schedule approved on November 16, 2020 by the General Director of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the acting Medical Director of the CF "University Medical Center" Khairullin B.Ye.

To obtain objective information on the expert evaluation of the accredited educational programme, EEC members used the following methods: conversation with management and administrative employees, interviews with residents, observation, study of the website, interviewing with employees of various structural subdivisions, teachers, surveys of teachers and residents, review of resources in the context of meeting accreditation standards, studying regulatory and educational documents both before the visit to the university and during the visit.

The CF UMC team ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview sites (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, conversations with EEC members 07-10.12.2020

No.	Full name	Job title
1	Pya Yuriy Vladimirovich	Chairman of the Board
2	Khairullin Bekbay Yeslyamovich	Deputy Chairman of the Board
3	Khamzina Nurgul Kaliyevna	Deputy Chairperson of the Board
4	Syzdykova Alma Alibekovna	Director of the Department of Science and Education (DSE)
5	Abdrakhmanov Asan Boribekovich	Director of the Strategy Department
6	Yessetova Asel Adilbekovna	General manager of DSE
7	Agdarbekova Madina Ruslanovna	General manager of DSE
8	Abdirova Bagdat Umirkhanovna	General manager of DSE
9	Niyazbekova Bagdagul Mukhambetzhonovna	General manager of DSE
10	Abakassova Gulmira Zhanatovna	General manager of DSE
11	Kapassova Bayan Birzhankyzy	General manager of DSE
12	Akhmetova Assem Tolegenovna	Chief Manager of the Science and Education Sector of NSCMC
15	Bokebayev Zhanybek Tolepkaliyevich	Chief Manager of the Quality Management Department
16	Saydildina Lyazzat Laulekovna	Head of Obstetric Department No.2 with maternity unit (postpartum) NSCMC
17	Primbetov Berik Uzakpayevich	Head of the Department of Women's Diseases, NSCMC
18	Umirbekova Balzhan Bulatovna	Head of Oncology Department No. 1 NSCMC
19	Abilkhadirova Asel Bayakhmetovna	Head of the Department of Neurology of Early Ages, NSCMC
21	Tortayeva Gulnar Sagiyevena	Head of the Neonatology Department of the NSCMC

22	Bayanova Mirgul Faizullinovna (remotely)	Head of the Department of Clinical Genetic Diagnostics NSCMC
23	Tazhibayev Dulat Mazhitovich	Head of the Radiation Diagnostics Department of the RDC
24	Mustafinova Gulnara Toleukhanovna	Head of the Department of Anesthesia, Resuscitation and Intensive Care
25	Abentayeva Botakoz Abubakirovna	Head of the neonatal resuscitation and intensive care department
26	Abishev Bakhyt Khamitovich	Head of the Department of Radiation Diagnostics
27	Olkhovik Yuriy Mikhailovich	Senior resident in surgery, Department of Pediatric Surgery No. 1, NSCMC
28	Nigmatullina Nazym Bakytbekovna	Head of the Department of Nephrology, Dialysis and Transplantation, NSCMC
29	Abilkhadirova Assel Bayakhmetovna	Head of the Department of Early Childhood Neurology

The sequence of the visit during December 7-10, 2020 is presented in detail in the Visit Programme, which is located in the documentation of the accreditation center and in the attachment to this report.

Interviews were conducted with 22 teachers (in three groups), residents (43) and employers (representatives of practical healthcare). It is necessary to take into account the fact that there has not yet been a graduation from an accredited educational programme, so it was not possible to conduct a conversation with graduates, however, the experience and authority of the CF UMC in clinical and educational activities shows the demand for graduates and educational programmes by medical organizations in all regions of Kazakhstan.

Interviews with teachers, as providers of the residency programme, showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of the educational programme, since the main developer of programmes and educational documentation is the Department of Education and Science, and teachers are more involved in the preparation of test measuring tools. In order to verify the data of standard 5, external experts obtained an opinion on personnel policies and approaches to the development of teachers' pedagogical competence, motivation to work with residents, and supervision. Experts have found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence about the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with 44 residents on the zoom platform. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with training at CF UMC, sufficient time to manage patients, work in Damumed with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents in need, participation in "Journal Clubs", availability of international databases of professional literature. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, because they believe that CF UMC has good educational resources, image and international relations, at the same time, residents would like more independence in managing patients and conducting international events.

Residents showed their commitment to organizing education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgment in organizing training, assessing their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in research and development, financing, and demonstrated proficiency in English when answering questions from foreign expert Ivana Oborn. Experts examined residents' documents (portfolios, resident assessment results, checklists, residents' survey results).

Interviews with 12 employers on all residency educational programmes of the CF UMC applied for accreditation were conducted online and included questions such as: knowledge of the university

mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of the advisory bodies of the CF UMC, satisfaction with basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in training residents through mentoring, providing teachers and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, problems of interaction, employment of residency graduates, etc.

A review of resources showed that the clinical base of the “Center for Motherhood and Childhood”, available for review at the time of the external visit, corresponds to the goals and objectives of the relevant educational programmes in the specialties - pediatrics, neonatology, obstetrics and gynecology, anesthesiology and resuscitation, etc., since it has a sufficient number of thematic patients, modern equipment and demonstrates accessibility to students, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and curators (mentors) provide quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the corresponding discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he/she must acquire and develop during training.

Experts examined the documentation for the educational programme “Neurology, including pediatric” at the link <http://umc.org.kz/educational-methodical-documentation/> , which confirmed compliance with accreditation standards, including documentation about teachers http://umc.org.kz/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/PPS_list.pdf and resident curators http://umc.org.kz/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/about_curators.pdf and at the request of EEC members.

Next, a meeting of EEC members was held based on the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of the external evaluation, study of documents, results of conversations, interviews and questionnaires was held. The EEC members began drafting the final report of the EEC.

A meeting of EEC members took place. The EEC members made generalizations of the results of the external evaluation. The experts individually completed the “Quality Profile and criteria for external evaluation of the residency educational programme in the specialty “Neurology, including pediatric” for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.” No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the postgraduate education sector in general and the department implementing an accredited educational programme were discussed. A draft report with recommendations was prepared.

Morenko Marina Alexeyevna, the Chairperson of the EEC, held a final open vote on the recommendations for the CF UMC and a final vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council. Then, the chairperson of the EEC announced recommendations for the management and employees of the educational organization based on the results of the external evaluation as part of the accreditation of educational programmes of residency specialties.

Survey results.

An observer from ECAQA conducted an online survey of residents and teachers of the accredited educational programme of CF UMC on the resource <https://webanketa.com/> from December 7 to 10, 2020.

Conclusion based on the results of the external evaluation:

The EEC members carefully studied and assessed the main indicators of the accredited educational programme. The information received by external experts when studying the self-assessment report, preparing a written review with recommendations for improvement, and implementing the activities of the CF UMC visit programme from December 7 to 10, 2020 was analyzed. All information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, the information was validated for each standard criterion of accreditation and verification of indicators in the attachment to the self-assessment report, which made it possible to verify the reliability of the information provided by CF UMC and supporting documents for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

Despite the fact that in the self-assessment report of the educational programme, CF UMC described its actual educational practice in postgraduate education. Before visiting the organization by accessing Google Drive https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1FxOheU2F2_zbWaoYqbxjgmzvM3rT8Oe?usp=sharing_eil&invite=CPCAYgN&ts=5fcf09db, experts reviewed more than 30 documents, and also during an external expert evaluation the EEC members studied the main documents (mission, strategic plan until 2023, teaching materials of disciplines, syllabuses, control and measurement tools, checklists, portfolios of residents, individual plans of residents for the 2019-2020 academic year, publications of teachers, rules for admission to residency, personnel policy, internal quality assurance system programme, training resources were reviewed directly at the clinical bases of the departments (classrooms, office equipment available for residents to work with literature, patient documentation, educational and methodological literature), residency resources on the website <http://umc.org.kz/?residency=post>, which made it possible to identify the compliance of the activities of the educational organization with basic accreditation standards.

When conducting an external examination, the Rules for the training of medical personnel in residency were taken into account (Order of the Minister of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 18, 2018 under No. ҚР ДСМ-16), paragraph 13. It was established that the clinical bases of all residency programmes provide training at all levels of medical care (from primary medical specialized care to highly specialized). The volume of educational workload and treatment and preventive work in sections of specialties is determined by the individual work plan of the residency student (clause 14) for one year and is monitored by the resident's monthly reports in free form. Accounting for completed tasks is presented in the form of a portfolio in accordance with the recommendations in the syllabus.

In connection with the new edition of Order No. 647 On approval of state mandatory standards and standard professional training programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties dated July 31, 2015 (as amended by Order of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 21, 2020 under No. ҚР ДСМ-12/2020 Chapter 2. Requirements to the content of residency educational programmes with a focus on training outcomes), changes and additions have occurred in the educational programme regarding the development of research competence of residents who must participate in the work of the research team.

In this regard, experts assessed the involvement of residents in research work. There are no general regulations or requirements for the implementation of research work in the CF, at the same time, initiative research is carried out at the departments, in which residents participate through writing reviews, collecting patient data, analyzing literature and the results of patient examinations, preparing reports and speaking at conferences). Also, in accordance with Article 222 Residency, clause 4 of the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On the health of the people and the healthcare system dated July 7, 2020 under No.360-VI LRK, external experts studied the activities and conducted conversations with resident mentors and it was established that each resident is provided with a mentor.

The experts took into account the fact that the accredited educational programme according to the current State Compulsory Educational Standard is being implemented for 2 academic years, therefore, at this time there is no graduation of students, however, the entire educational, methodological, personnel and resource base has been assessed for compliance with accreditation standards. Through conversations with teachers and interviews with students, it was possible to determine their direct participation in the development and evaluation of educational programmes, decision-making on a number of key issues in the selection of clinical bases, elective topics, participation in appeal commissions for admission and evaluation of residents, development of the content of individual plans for residents and choosing mentors.

At the same time, this justified the need to include in post-accreditation monitoring, along with the implementation of the EEC recommendations, an analysis of the implementation of the criteria of standard 9 and an annual report on the student population.

Recommendations for improving activities in the implementation of the residency educational programme in the specialty “Neurology, including pediatric” for compliance with the Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of an expert evaluation, were presented at a meeting with management on December 10, 2020.

The programme of the 3-day visit (December 7-10, 2020) of the external expert evaluation of the EEC has been fully completed. The CF UMC team ensured the participation of all persons specified in the programme.

Thus, the external evaluation and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-assessment report of the residency programme in full in accordance with the Regulations on the External Expert Commission, the Guidelines for the external assessment of the ECAQA medical educational organization.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, and access to all necessary information and material resources of the accredited educational programme was organized. Experts note the high level of corporate culture and discipline of the CF UMC employees, the department, employees of clinical bases responsible for postgraduate education, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to EEC members.

4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the residency educational programme in the specialty “Neurology, including pediatric” and a review of strengths for each standard.

Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES

Strengths:

1. Construction of residency training taking into account the integration of education-clinic-science in the context of the introduction of modern principles of training specialists for healthcare;
2. Special status of educational organization and cooperation with leading medical schools of the world (University of Pittsburgh);
3. Demand for educational programmes of residency and additional education among potential students;
4. A stable reputation among medical organizations and development prospects taking into account modern requirements for healthcare professionals;

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria. Compliant with 17 standards: fully - 17, significantly - 0, partially - 0, not compliant - 0.

Standard 1: implemented

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES

Strengths:

1. A wide range of specialties of residency educational programmes and demand among potential students;
2. Implementation of educational programmes at relevant JCI-accredited clinical bases;
3. Developed clinical practice and bedside teaching of residents;
4. Use of a variety of teaching methods.

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria. Compliant with 31 standards: fully - 31, significantly - 0, partially -0, not compliant - 0.

Standard 2: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. To provide educational and methodological documentation on educational programmes in the state language in accordance with the provisions of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 11.07.97 under No.151-I On the languages of the Republic of Kazakhstan (as amended and supplemented as of 24.05.18).

2. To ensure the participation of all stakeholders in the development of the educational programme (residents, clinical mentors, employers, graduates, representatives of professional associations) (3.1.2, 3.1.3).

Standard 3: RESIDENT ASSESSMENT

Strengths:

1. Assessment of students' educational achievements is carried out using criteria, regulations and procedures developed in accordance with the goals and objectives set for the implementation of the educational programme;

2. Skills assessment is carried out using summative assessment forms.

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria compliant with 11 standards: fully -11, significantly -0, partially - 0, not compliant - 0.

Standard 3: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) To provide for regular analysis and assessment of the quality of the assessment methods and formats used for validity and reliability in relation to the established training outcomes and carry out documentation (3.1.4, 3.1.6);
- 2) To consider the possibility of optimizing the documentation of student knowledge assessment (introducing an electronic grade record book) and organizing training for teachers in maintaining this documentation.

Standard 4: RESIDENTS

Strengths:

1. Compliance with the standard rules for the admission of residents, taking into account the internal requirements for training at the CF UMC;

2. Involvement of students in the work of consultative and advisory bodies to participate in decision-making regarding the educational programme;

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria. Compliant with 30 standards: fully - 30, significantly - 0, partially - 0, not compliant - 0

Standard 4: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) To expand the possibilities of distance learning or other training formats to provide residents with additional training, including in certain difficult or unforeseen situations (2.4.4, 4.5.4).

Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF/TEACHERS

Strengths:

1. Highly qualified teaching staff from among clinical professionals;

2. Policy for selection and recruitment of teachers;

3. System of clinical mentoring of residents;

4. Programme for the development of pedagogical competencies and organizers of educational programmes.

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria. Compliant with 7 standards: fully - 7, significantly -0, partially - 0, not compliant - 0.

Standard 5: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) To expand training opportunities for employees (teachers and managers) involved in the educational process on methodology and active teaching methods (6.5.3, 6.6.2, 6.6.3).

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

Strengths:

1. Modern clinical base for training residents and international cooperation with a strategic partner - the medical school of the University of Pittsburgh;
2. Providing the educational process with appropriate medical equipment and access to clinical resources of practice bases;
3. Support of educational programmes with relevant IT technologies, library resources with access to international databases of professional literature;
4. Programme of international cooperation with foreign partners.

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria. Compliant with 21 standards: fully -21, significantly - 0, partially - 0, not compliant - 0

Standard 6: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) To improve the use of the digital technology system in the educational process (6.1.2).
- 2) To promote the further expansion of international cooperation within the framework of joint scientific research with the involvement of residents.

Standard 7: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME EVALUATION

Strengths:

1. A system for monitoring the quality of educational programmes through external review at the planning and approval stage, assessment by the educational and methodological council, feedback from participants in educational relations and indicators of demand for programme graduates;
2. Actively applied feedback from students and teachers;
3. 360⁰ type assessment.

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria. Compliant with 15 standards: fully - 15, significantly - 0, partially - 0, not compliant - 0

Standard 7: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) To improve the feedback system by regularly monitoring and analyzing the data received, including special questions in the 360⁰ survey, reflecting the specifics of specialties, and use the survey results to improve educational programmes.

Standard 8: MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION

Strengths:

5. Transparency in the management of the educational programme;
6. Awareness of participants in the educational process through posting information about the educational programme on the website of the CF “UMC”;
7. Financial and economic activities of CF “UMC” are aimed at ensuring financial stability;
8. Ensuring the efficient use of financial resources.

Conclusions of the EEC by the criteria. Compliant with 15 standards: fully -15, significantly - 0, partially - 0, not compliant - 0

Standard 8: implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) To develop a policy of academic integrity and ensure the use of an anti-plagiarism programme (8.3.3).
- 2) To improve the management and financing mechanisms of the center to increase the motivation of teachers implementing the educational process in residency specialties (8.3.30).

Thus, all 8 accreditation standards have been met; no inconsistencies in fulfilling the criteria of each of the basic accreditation standards were found in the process of analyzing the self-assessment report and conducting the examination as part of the tasks of the external expert evaluation programme. Standard 9 will be assessed during post-accreditation monitoring.

5. Recommendations for improving educational residency in the specialty “Neurology, including pediatric”:

1. Develop a mission for educational programmes that will harmonize with the mission of the educational organization;

2. Involve stakeholders more widely in the development and discussion of the mission and document this process;

3. Update internal regulatory documents regulating the educational process (work programmes, syllabuses) taking into account the requirements of the normative legal acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan;

4. Ensure the participation of all stakeholders in the development of the educational programme (residents, employers, graduates);

5. Ensure the participation of employer representatives in the work of advisory bodies where educational programmes are planned, discussed and approved;

6. Regulate the process of assessing students with a clear definition of methods, the number of current assessments, accompanied by documentation and organization of training for teachers in maintaining this documentation;

7. Develop and implement mechanisms for motivating teachers of the residency programme and document this process (regulations/programme);

8. Increase the level of pedagogical skills and competencies through training in relevant programmes;

9. Make wider use of digital technologies in the educational process (keeping an electronic grade record book, assessing knowledge, providing feedback);

10. Develop a policy of academic integrity and ensure the use of an anti-plagiarism programme;

6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The EEC members came to a unanimous opinion to recommend that the Accreditation Council accredit the educational programme 6R111500 “Neurology, including pediatric” of CF UMC for a period of 5 years.

Chairperson

MORENKO MARINA ALEXEYEVNA

/signed/



Foreign expert

IVANA OBORNA

/signed/



Foreign expert

ZINCHENKO RENA ABULFAZOVNA

/signed/



Academic expert

KURMANOVA ALMAGUL MEDEUBAYEVNA

/signed/



Academic expert

YESSENKULOVA SAULE ASKEROVNA

/signed/



Academic expert

RAMAZANOVA SHOLPAN KHAMZAYEVNA

/signed/



Academic expert

KALIYEVA SHOLPAN SABATAYEVNA

/signed/



Academic expert

SADIYEVA ZHANAR ZAMANKHANOVNA

/signed/



Academic expert

DZHAMANTAYEVA BOTAGOZ DAUKIMOVNA

/signed/



Academic expert

BEISEBAYEV YELDAR NURLANOVICH

/signed/



Observer from ECAQA

SARSENBAYEVA DARIYABANU BULATOVNA

/signed/



List of documents requested by EEC members as part of accreditation

No.	Title of the document	Quantity	Approval date
1.	Questionnaire forms "Assessment 360 ⁰ " by specialty	1	Protocol of SMC No.6 dated November 22, 2016
2.	Duty schedule	4	Monthly
3.	Job descriptions of the Foundation's medical workers	3	Different periods for each medical worker
4.	Resident job description	1	10.10.2016 SMC protocol No. 5
5.	Job descriptions of DSAE employees	1	03.03.2020
6.	Catalog of elective disciplines	1	protocol 10 dated 02.09.2020
7.	Mission of the Foundation and development strategy	1	2019
8.	Educational programmes for accredited EP	1	2016, 2018 and 2020
9.	Agreements and memorandums: agreements with clinical bases, agreements with residents, Memorandums of cooperation	3	From 2016 to 2020
10.	Research work of residents	1	30.05.2017 protocol No. 5
11.	Code of Conduct	1	30.12.2015 Minutes of the Board No. 3
12.	Evaluation Forms	1	2016-2017
13.	Regulations on clinical academic departments	1	19.06.2020, No.12
14.	Regulations on the Department of Science and Education	1	29.10.2018, No.26
15.	Regulations of other Departments	1	
16.	Portfolio of residents, personal file of residents	2	
17.	Rules for organizing the educational process of residency at CF "UMC"	1	15.02.2018
18.	Rules for search, selection, hiring and certification of employees in CF UMC	1	19.11.2015
19.	Rules for search, hiring, selection and certification of employees of the Foundation	1	19.11.2015 with changes from 2016, 2018
20.	Rules for admission to residency	1	2018, with changes from 2019
21.	Orders	7	From 2016-2020
22.	Work study programmes for an accredited EP	4	2016, 2017, 2018, 2020
23.	Working curriculum	4	From 2017-2020
24.	Schedule	4	2016-2020
25.	Syllabuses	3	2016-17, 2018, 2020
26.	Residents' lecture attendance journal	1	1.09-12.09.2020
27.	Resident duty schedule	2	09.2020, 12.2020
28.	Educational and methodological council		Protocols from 2016 to

			2020
29.	Materials of the educational and methodological council	2	For 2019, 2020
30.	Staffing table	3	NSCMC – 30.11.20, RDC – 30.11.20, AMP – December 2020
31.	Operational plan for strategy implementation	1	27.03.2020
32.	Regulations on teaching staff	1	Protocol 9 dated 28.08.2019
33.	Charter of the Foundation (as amended)	1	12.05.2020
34.	Instruction checklist for internal training	2	
35.	State Compulsory Educational Standards	1	2015 and 2020
36.	Mission of CF "UMC"	1	2019
37.	Documents of the Educational and Methodological Council	4	06.11.2020
38.	Regulations on the Journal Club	1	28.04.2018 No.2
39.	A guidebook for applicants and residency students	1	2020
40.	List of residents	3	
41.	Residency budget for 2020	1	2020
42.	Quality management programme of NSCMC and RDC	1	
43.	Employer questionnaire form	1	2020
44.	List of resident privileges Zhakupova A.B. specialty "O&G"	1	2020-2023
45.	Scientific works of residents	2	2019, 2020
46.	PC Certificates in teaching skills	3	2015, 2017, 2017
47.	Certificates for successful completion of the seminar course “Methodology for developing examination material” for assessing the key competencies of students”	2	24.11.2020 NCIE
48.	Certificates/Evidences PC “Methodology for developing result-oriented image programmes” 54 hours	2	18.11.2019 CF UMC
49.	Examination materials on an accredited EP	1	2017-2018
50.	Interim assessment results on an accredited EP	1	2017-2018
51.	Statements and tests for accredited educational programmes	3	2017-2018
52.	Journal Club Minutes (36) Anesthesiology and resuscitation – 2 reports	36	For 2016-2018
53.	Library attendance journal	1	2019-2020