

To the Accreditation Council
of the Eurasian Centre for
Accreditation and Quality Assurance
in Education and Health Care
June 21, 2024

REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF
THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM
7R01101 "PHTHYSIOLOGY FOR ADULTS, CHILDREN"
OF THE RSE ON THE REM
"NATIONAL SCIENTIFIC CENTER OF PHTHYSIOPULMONOLOGY
OF THE REPUBLIC OF KAZAKHSTAN" FOR COMPLIANCE WITH
THE STANDARDS FOR ACCREDITATION OF POSTGRADUATE
EDUCATION PROGRAMMES (RESIDENCY SPECIALTY) OF
MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS

Period of external expert evaluation: June 11 – June 13, 2024

Almaty, 2024

CONTENT

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1	Presentation of the educational program in the specialty - 7R01101 "Phthysiology for adults, children" of the National Scientific Centre of Phthysiopulmonology of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan	4
2.2	Information on previous accreditation	6
2.3	Brief description of the results of the analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational program in the specialty 7R01101 "Phthysiology for adults, children" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of Postgraduate Education Programs (Residency Specialty) of Medical Education Organizations and conclusions on completion	6
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	7
4.	Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of the external evaluation of the educational program in the specialty - 7R01101 "Phthysiology for adults, children" of the National Scientific Centre of Phthysiopulmonology of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan	8
5.	Recommendations for improvement of the educational program in the specialty - 7R01101 "Phthysiology for adults, children" of the National Scientific Centre of Phthysiopulmonology of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan	22
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	22
	Annex 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation and educational program of residency in the specialty of the educational program in the specialty - 7R01101 "Phthysiology for adults, children"	23
	Annex 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	24

LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
PBL	Problem-based learning
TBL	Team based learning
EEC	External expert commission
SAC	State attestation commission
SCES	State compulsory education standard
ECAQA	Eurasian centre for accreditation and quality assurance in education and health care
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
MOH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Emergencies	Emergencies
NSCP	National Scientific Centre of Phthisiopulmonology
RW	Research work
LSI	Laws and Statutory Instruments
EP	Educational program
OSCE	Objective structured clinical examination
PHC	Primary health care
Academic staff	Academic staff
WC	Working curriculum
Mass media	Mass media
IWS(R)	Independent work of a student (resident)
IWST	Independent work of a resident under the supervision of a teacher
EMCD	Educational and methodological complex of the discipline
AC	Academic Council
EC	Educational center

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with the ECAQA Order No. 22 dated May 30, 2024, the External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational program of the residency in the specialty "Phthysiology for Adults, Children" of the National Scientific Centre of Phthysiopulmonology of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan during the period from June 11 to 13, 2024, in the following composition:

№	Status as part of the EEC	Full name	Academic degree/title, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	Chairman	IMASHEVA BAGDAT SAKENOVNA	Doctor of Biological Sciences, Professor, Head of the Science and Education Department of the National Centre for Children's Rehabilitation of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
2	Foreign expert	RYZHKIN SERGEY ALEKSANDROVIC H	Corresponding Member of the Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Tatarstan, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Radiology, Radiotherapy, Radiation Hygiene and Radiation Safety named after Academicians A.S. Pavlov and F.G. Krotkov of the Russian Medical Academy of Continuous Professional Education (Moscow, Russian Federation)
3	National Academic expert	KURMANOVA ALMAGUL MEDEUBAYEVNA	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Professor of the Department of Clinical Disciplines of the Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi, Science Advisor of JSC "Scientific Centre of Obstetrics, Gynaecology and Perinatology"
4	National Academic expert	RAMAZANOVA SHOLPAN KHAMZAEVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Children's Diseases named after N.A. Barlybaeva of the NJSC "Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov"
5	National Academic expert	BUGAKOV ANATOLY ALEKSEEVICH	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Phthysiology of the NJSC "Astana Medical University"

6	National Academic expert	IZTLEUOV YERBOLAT MARATOVICH	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Radiology of the NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov", Member of the Local Ethics Commission on Research Work, Internal Auditor of the Quality Management Service
7	Expert-employer	UTESHEVA GULMIRA SAYYNBAEVNA	Head of the Department of Science and Professional Development of the RSE on the Right of Economic Management "National Centre for Public Health Development" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
8	Expert-listener	TERTYUBAEVA ZHAZIRA ORUMBEOVNA	Head of the Department of Strategic Development, Work with Personnel and Functional Support of the "International Institute of Postgraduate Education" LLC

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulation on the EEC.

The EEC report contains an evaluation of the educational program of residency in the specialty 7R01101 "Phthysiology for Adults, Children" of the National Scientific Centre for Phthysiopulmonology of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of postgraduate education programs (residency specialty) of medical educational organizations and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above-mentioned educational program and recommendations for the Accreditation Council of the ECAQA.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the educational program of residency in the specialty 7R01101 "Phthysiology for Adults, Children" of the National Scientific Centre for Phthysiopulmonology of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan

Name of the organization, legal form of ownership, BIN	National Scientific Centre of Phthysiopulmonology of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Republican State Enterprise on the Right of Economic Management, 020340004264
Governing body	Governing body - Supervisory Board; control body - Internal Audit Service.
Full name of the first director	Adenov Malik Moldabekovich
Date of establishment	1932
Location and contact details	050100, Almaty, st. Bekkhozina, 5 +7 (727) 339-16-30
State license for educational activities in residency (date, number)	License for educational activities KZ02LAA00009671, issued by the Committee for Control in the Sphere of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the

	Republic of Kazakhstan on July 4, 2017
Information on branches, subsidiaries (if any)	no
Year of commencement of the implementation of the accredited educational program (EP)	Planned from 2024
Duration of study	2
Total number of graduates since the beginning of the EP	-
Number of residents in the EP since the beginning of the current academic year	-
Full-time teachers/part-time workers involved in the implementation of the EP	Total number of teachers - 17, including full-time - 17, part-time - 0 Proportion of degrees, % - 76%
Website Instagram Facebook with active pages	https://www.nncf.kz https://www.instagram.com/nncf_mz_rk/ https://www.facebook.com/nncf.kz

The National Scientific Centre for Phthisiopulmonology of the Republic of Kazakhstan is a leading scientific centre with modern high-tech equipment, coordinating the phthisiopulmonology service of the Republic for 90 years. It was organized in 1932, transformed into the National Scientific Centre for Phthisiopulmonology of the Republic of Kazakhstan

The Republican State Enterprise on the right of economic management "National Scientific Centre for Phthisiopulmonology of the Republic of Kazakhstan" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan is a specialized centre with a capacity of 350 beds, providing highly qualified and specialized medical services in 8 areas, provides outpatient and consultative medical services, implements educational services for additional and non-formal education for medical workers and plans to launch a residency in the specialty " Phthsiology for adults, children". Today, the National Scientific Centre for Phthisiopulmonology of the Republic of Kazakhstan (hereinafter referred to as the NSCP) is the flagship of the phthsiology service in Kazakhstan, providing highly qualified, specialized (PHC), high-tech (HTHC), hospital-replacing (HRHC) and outpatient medical care (OMC) to patients with severe and difficult-to-diagnose diseases from all regions of the Republic.

To provide high-tech, specialized care, the Institute has a clinical base with 350 beds.

The goal of the medical organization is to strive for a high level of medical care for each patient through the synergy of scientific research, education and clinical practice. To implement the mission, it continues to improve clinical activities to provide high-tech care to the population of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The implementation of the main tasks contributes to the development of clinical practice in accordance with international standards of quality and patient safety, meeting the needs of the population. Within the framework of strategic partnership, the institute cooperates with international clinical centres and universities of the near and far abroad.

The centre of phthisiopulmonology plans to implement 3 educational residency programs. The total number of students in the 2024-2027 academic years is planned to be up to 30 residents.

Requirements for the level of training of residency graduates in the specialty 7R01101 "Phthsiology for adults, children" are formulated in the educational program in accordance with: State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan for residency in the specialty "Phthsiology for adults, children", approved by order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 4, 2022 No RK MOH-63; Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On approval of the Rules for training medical personnel in internship and the Rules for

training medical personnel in residency" dated September 18, 2018 No RK MOH-16.

Residency training in the specialty is planned to be carried out full-time, the training period will be 2 years. According to the State Compulsory Educational Standard, the educational program for training residents is designed for 140 credits - major disciplines: compulsory component - 132 credits, elective component - 4 credits, midterm certification - 2 credits, end-of-course assessment - 2 credits.

2.2 Information on previous accreditation

Until now, the educational program has not been accredited.

2.3 Brief description of the results of the analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational program of residency 7R01101 "Phthisiology for adults, children" of the National Scientific Centre of Phthisiopulmonology of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the specialty for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of postgraduate education programs (residency specialty) of medical educational organizations and conclusions on the completeness

The self-assessment report of the educational program of residency in the specialty (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 128 pages of the main text, appendices, copies or electronic versions of documents located at the link.

Residency training under the educational program is being introduced for the first time, there are no students. The head of the training centre of the NSCP RK is Kaidaulov Mukhtar Kenzhebekovich.

The report is characterized by responses to 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for conducting self-assessment of the educational program, provided to the educational organization by the accreditation centre - ECAQA. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the director M. Adenov, who confirms the reliability of the quantitative information and data included in the self-assessment report.

Standard 9 "Continuous renewal" will be included in the evaluation during post-accreditation monitoring in the event of a positive decision on accreditation of the educational program.

The report contains a list of 17 members of the internal self-assessment commission indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting self-assessment of the educational program - Ryskulov Galymzhan Pernebekovich, Acting Deputy Director.

Self-assessment of the educational program was conducted based on Order No. 90-o dated March 6, 2024 "On the establishment of a commission for institutional and specialized accreditation and approval of responsible persons".

The report was reviewed by accreditation expert Bugakov A.A., the review noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes, which were taken into account during the feedback process with the representative of the NSCP and the corresponding changes and additions were made to the self-assessment report.

All standards provide principles for training residents in the specialty, taking into account the planning of admission of students in 2024, examples of methodological support tools to ensure compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The self-assessment report provides data on the number of teachers, admission policy, assessment of knowledge and skills, data on the material and technical base of the NSCP, plans for development and improvement. The report was submitted to the ECAQA in its final form, with the adjustment of data according to the above recommendations, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and is described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, tables and figures contain links in the text and have continuous numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for the transition to the next stage of the accreditation procedure - external evaluation. The experts planned to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during a visit to the educational organization, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

3. Description of the external expert evaluation

The external expert work within the framework of the evaluation of the educational program was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programs of the ECAQA and according to the program approved on 13.05.2023 by the Director General of the ECAQA Sarsenbaeva S.S. and agreed with the Director of the NSCP RK M. Adenov. Dates of the visit to the organization: June 11-13, 2024.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the self-assessment report data and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit over 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Program (hereinafter referred to as the program), which is located in the documentation of the accreditation centre. The program is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of the external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- interviews with management and administrative staff - 4 people;
- interviews with students and graduates of advanced training programs - 3 people and graduates - 5;
- study of the website <https://www.nncf.kz>
- interviews with heads of structural divisions - 11, teachers / mentors - 31;
- questionnaires for teachers- 10;
- review of resources in the context of fulfilling accreditation standards: 1 practice / clinical engagement base was visited;
- study of 54 educational and methodological documents both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents studied is in Annex 2).

The staff of the accredited organization ensured the presence of persons specified in the visit program and in the lists of interview sites and conversations (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, and conversations with members of the EEC

№	Position	Quantity
1	NSCP Management – Director, Head of Clinical Activities, Chief Researcher, Acting Deputy Director for Economic Affairs, Deputy Chairman of the LEC	4
2	Head of the National Training Centre	1
3	Resident Teachers	31
4	Employees of Support Services - HR Department	2
5	Graduates	5
6	Students	16
7	Employers of Residency Graduates	19

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of the EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational program, examination of documents, interview results, and questionnaires was held. The EEC members began drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the external evaluation results were made. The experts individually filled out the "Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of the Educational Program for Compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards. Recommendations for improvement of the educational program were discussed and the chairperson Imasheva Bagdat Sakenovna held a final open vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period of 5 years.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC; access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the research institute, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the EEC members.

According to 50% of teachers, the survey conducted by the ECAQA is useful for developing
[ECAQA_ Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare](#) 7

recommendations for improving key areas of activity of the accredited educational organization.

At the end of the visit, the Chairman of the EEC announced recommendations for the management and staff of the educational organization based on the results of the external evaluation as part of the specialized accreditation.

4. Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational program of residency in the specialty 7R01101 " Phthisiology for adults, children"

Standard 1: MISSION AND FINAL OUTCOMES

1.1 Mission statement

During the implementation of the program activities, namely, following the results of an interview with the first head of the organization, members of the advisory body (Academic Council), in an interview with residents and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the educational program, took part in the formation of proposals for formulating the mission, while the mission was communicated to potential residents through the website, social networks, information letters to medical organizations. The organization's strategic plan for 2022-2026 was reviewed, including such areas as an *Integrated Academic Healthcare System with improved productivity and improved quality of research activities, as well as improved quality of educational services*, which confirms the fulfilment of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization. From interviews with residents, it was established that before the start of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, tell where to get the necessary information about the educational program, teachers, training bases.

During the visit to the departments of the educational organization, the experts noted the strengths of the educational organization in relation to the accredited educational program, including:

1. The research institute has procedures for the development and adoption of LSI and their management.
2. The medical organization contributes to the formation of professionalism in residents by creating conditions for mastering the necessary competencies.
3. The research institute has developed educational programs based on a competency-oriented model of a residency graduate, in accordance with the needs of society and the labour market.
4. High commitment and continuity of residency students to this research institute.
5. Demand for residency graduates of the research institute.
6. Highly qualified staff of teachers and mentors implementing residency programs.
7. The institute, especially in the near future, has a sufficient material and technical base and provides the opportunity to master the necessary clinical skills and competencies.
8. The NSC has a system of continuous improvement of the postgraduate educational process with a stable financial position.

The NSC of Phthisiopulmonology has departments that are directly related to the educational program, which can be noted as the best practice in education. The main areas of graduate competencies are represented by universal (basic, general, key, and supra-professional) and professional (subject-specialized). The residents develop their special skills due to the fact that NSC occupies an advantageous position in the market for the provision of services: specialized and highly specialized health care, including the provision of high-tech health care to patients with diagnostic, therapeutic and surgical profiles.

The results of the study of the documentation demonstrate that the mission of the organization and the mission of the educational program, and the educational process are built in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard and current Laws and Statutory Instruments (LSI) in postgraduate education and healthcare.

1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

Based on the needs, new educational programs are developed in priority areas of healthcare, master classes are held with the invitation of foreign specialists; NSC employees participate in conferences, undergo training abroad. Active work is underway to improve elective training disciplines that complement educational programs. The resident doctor has access to patients, they are involved in the treatment and diagnostic process on a daily basis, supervises patients in the hospital, manage patients, and carry out diagnostic and therapeutic manipulations.

To verify standard 1 a meeting was held with the head of the organization. It should be noted that the Director sets the task of training highly professional personnel, has a clear idea of strategic goals, evaluate the needs of healthcare, and works to motivate teachers and students.

The 10 surveyed teachers of residency programs responded that 90% are satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace in this educational organization, and 10% partially agree with this statement. The experts determined that the organization has a healthy microclimate, since the manager is quite accessible to residents and employees, responds promptly to requests. In the questionnaire, 80% of teachers are satisfied with the microclimate of the organization, and 20% are partially satisfied. According to 80%, in the educational organization, a teacher has the opportunity to realize himself as a professional in his specialty. Teaching experience of respondents: up to 5 years up to 20 years.

1.3 Final learning outcomes

NSC of Phthisiopulmonology informs the public about the established final learning outcomes, ensures continuity between the final learning outcomes of the basic medical education programs, internship and educational program 7R01101 "Adult and Pediatric Phthysiology". The learning outcomes of the educational program are presented in the passport of educational programs of NSC of Phthisiopulmonology and posted on the website. The list of final outcomes, practical skills, manipulations, procedures, is reflected in the educational program.

The Academic Policy also prescribes joint meetings with residents of all years of study in the relevant specialty on educational, disciplinary and other work issues. While undergoing training at the NSC of Phthisiopulmonology, a resident doctor, in addition to specialized competencies, is instilled with the concept of "professional ethics". Each student, entering the NSC, will sign an agreement, one of the points of which is the obligation to follow the disciplinary requirements of the "Code of Business Ethics" of the NSC of Phthisiopulmonology. The student at the NSC has rights and obligations, including compliance with the academic honesty of the student.

The NSC of Phthisiopulmonology also guarantees continuity between the final outcomes of residency training and subsequent programs of continuous professional development. To this end, the NSC applies a quality assurance system for training based on determining its innovative potential of the educational program and the real value of the knowledge contained at the moment. The latest scientific and practical achievements are reflected in the educational program by inviting experts from leading medical organizations to conduct various seminars and master classes.

The surveyed teachers answered that 60% are fully satisfied with the level of previous training of residents, and 40% are partially satisfied.

100% of the respondent teachers believe that this organization has sufficient equipment and resources to conduct training.

1.4 Participation in formulating the mission and final outcomes

The academic policy of the NSC of Phthisiopulmonology declares that the NSC formulates the mission and determines the final outcomes of the training program, taking into account proposals from other stakeholders.

The main stakeholders are students, employees, and graduates. The participation of the NSC administration in the formation and support of the quality policy of the residency educational program is determined by the function of monitoring the quality of training of students and the level of teaching academic disciplines; coordination of research activities of the NSC resident, support for participation in the implementation of national and international scientific projects; replenishment of the library fund, expansion of information resources. At the level of the Academic staff - the introduction of new approaches to patient management, various master classes and seminars into the educational process.

At the level of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan - the development of a regulatory framework in the field of educational services, criteria for assessing the achievements of the results of resident training (intermediate and end-of-course assessment). The Academic Policy of the NSC of Phthisiopulmonology provides for monitoring the external and internal environment, studying the best advanced experience (benchmarking) of similar institutes. Based on the analysis of external and internal environmental factors, an initial register of potential risks for the relevant processes is formed, and then the risk manager of the institute enters the risks into the general register of risks for the NSC. This analysis mainly includes the results of feedback from employers, graduates, analysis of the internal infrastructure and industry-specific requirements, reflected in the compilation of a catalogue of elective disciplines, principles for independent work of residents.

Based on the presented materials, the NSC of Phthisiopulmonology demonstrates its commitment to comply with state requirements in the field of medical education reform and international accreditation standards.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply with 14 standards (including 9 basic, 5 improvement standards): fully - 14.

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

2.1 Framework parameters of the postgraduate medical education program

The NSC of Phthisiopulmonology implements a credit-modular training technology, and a model of resident competencies has been developed. The final outcomes of resident training are the training of qualified, competitive personnel who meet modern requirements for the quality of medical specialists for independent work in a particular specialty.

To implement the educational program in the specialty 7R01101 "Phthiology for adults, children", the organization's documents contain educational and methodological kits, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work. Compliance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard and standard requirements has been established. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational program; future residents will be informed about the content of this document posted on the website.

Analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all scientific achievements in the relevant disciplines are taken into account, additions have been made to the bibliography of the EMCD and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom.

The procedure for informing residents about their rights and responsibilities is reflected in the Personnel Policy.

This indicates compliance with standard 2 in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents. *At the same time, along with the principles of quality and academic integrity, which are described in the document Regulation on the Centre for Postgraduate Professional and Additional Education, the organization does not have an anti-plagiarism system.*

NSCP RK has a State License for educational activities in the direction of "Residency" on July 4, 2017 (link: <https://www.nncf.kz/deyatelnost-nncf-mz-rk>). Also, in 2019, it received a certificate of institutional accreditation for compliance with the standards of additional education (link: <https://www.nncf.kz/informaciya-o-centre>).

In-depth study of disciplines by residents is achieved through the choice of elective disciplines, academic mobility in other universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan, participation in domestic and international conferences

2.2 Scientific method

Educational program 7R01101 " Phthiology for adults, children" provides training in research skills (preparation of messages, reports, conducting research, publishing scientific articles, poster reports, working in scientific circles, participating in scientific and practical conferences, etc.). The content of the educational program includes the elective "Modern Scientific Research".

The "Learning through Research" program, taking into account the real needs of modern medicine, is integrated into the educational process and includes training from the standpoint of

evidence-based medicine. Residents will use knowledge of evidence-based medicine, issues of monitoring and analysis of clinical studies in accordance with the disciplines studied in the EP. Residents' participation in scientific research with presentation of results at conferences, congresses, in medical publications is encouraged by additional points to the portfolio.

Teachers of the educational program 7R01101 "Phthysiology for adults, children" are developers of methodological recommendations for phthysiology and are members of the organizing committees of scientific and practical conferences.

The EP integrates scientific foundations and methodology of medical research, including clinical research and clinical epidemiology.

2.2.2. The condition of the scientific literature in the library suffers. It is located in an adapted room. In the future, in the opening of a new centre for phthysiopulmonology, a significant improvement in the library conditions and expansion of the library collection is planned.

The teachers said that they will teach residents methods of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data, the use of scientific developments.

2.3 Structure, content and duration of the residency program

The residency program will be implemented in accordance with the Academic Policy of the educational programs of the residency of JSC "National Scientific Centre of Phthysiopulmonology of the Republic of Kazakhstan" Rules for organizing the educational process in residency, approved by the Decision of the Academic Council dated September 2, 2022, Protocol No. 4. There are documents containing requirements for the structure and content of educational programs, including the Academic Policy, Regulations on the Centre for Postgraduate Professional and Additional Education, on the ongoing monitoring of academic performance, on the development and approval of the EP. The Centre for Postgraduate Professional and Additional Education is responsible for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process.

The content of the work programs and the catalogue of elective disciplines reflect the needs of the healthcare system, as well as the specifics of research and development and the scientific achievements of teachers. For the successful implementation of the educational program in the specialty, the organization has resources for organizing the evaluation of the practical skills of residents. The integration of education, science and practice, the involvement of resident doctors in the learning process through research is undoubtedly the strong point of the Institute.

Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, in which 100% are fully satisfied.

The organization has its own clinical base for 350 beds; contracts have been concluded with medical organizations, including foreign ones.

2.4 Organization of training and the relationship between postgraduate medical education and the provision of medical care

Management of the educational process, reflected in the self-assessment report (Standard 2) and general approaches to management were confirmed during a visit to the Department of Postgraduate and Additional Education and a conversation with the head and employees. The experts got acquainted with the work of the departments, including 2 therapeutic, consultative and diagnostic departments, and the Republican Allergology Centre.

Training of residents in the specialty 7R01101 "Phthysiology for adults, children" is aimed at meeting the needs of practical healthcare, since there is a shortage of pulmonologists. NSC is the National Coordinator of the Tuberculosis Control Program in the Republic of Kazakhstan, provides organizational and methodological support for the implementation of new methods, and quarterly monitoring of indicators using the Electronic Database of NSC Indicators. In this regard, opportunities are provided for training not only phthysiologists residents, but also pulmonologists residents and radiologists residents. Residents of the specialty 7R01101 "Phthysiology for adults, children" can supervise patients with various respiratory diseases, various forms of pulmonary and extra-pulmonary tuberculosis. While surveying the Academic staff during the training process, 100% of the assessments, 70% of the problem-based learning, and 90% of the situational tasks are used.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply with 22 standards (including 19 basic standards, 3 improvement standards): fully - 21, partially - 1, do not meet - 0.

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To provide for adequate representation of residents in advisory bodies (2.4.4).

Standard 3: RESIDENT ASSESSMENT

3.1 Assessment methods

The policy and procedure for assessing learning outcomes within the EP is carried out using criteria developed in accordance with the goals and objectives set for the implementation of the EP and the qualifications awarded within the framework of the current point-rating system for assessing knowledge and monitoring the educational process in accordance with directive, regulatory and internal documents. The policy and methods for assessing residents are reviewed and approved at a meeting of the Department of Postgraduate and Additional Education of the NSC Phthisiopulmonology.

A study of the control and measuring tools showed that the organization has implemented an appropriate assessment policy that allows for a comprehensive assessment of the academic achievements of residents. The results of the students' academic achievements are planned to be entered into the "Platonus" program or another (as acquired). The system for appealing the assessment results is reflected in the Order on the establishment of the appeal commission, the Academic Policy; there have been no precedents for appeal during the period of the organization's work.

The organization has a CIS. The head of the education department responded that additions and updates to the CIS are planned for the next academic year.

During the visit to the organization and interview with the head, the commission was convinced that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and staff, and includes such documents as annual operational plans, annual reports, department regulations, agreements with teachers and residents, and educational and methodological documentation (work program, working curricula, syllabuses, journals), assessment tools (checklists, statements), certificates and credentials. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the documents necessary for residents and contain information that is regularly updated. It is necessary to finalize 3.1.4 checklists for conducting current, midterm and end-of-course assessment in the discipline.

3.2 Relationship between assessment and learning

Monitoring of residents' academic performance will be carried out in the form of formative, summative assessment, as well as through regular feedback from clinical mentors and curators. Current monitoring of academic performance will be assessed on a 100-point scale, the end-of-course assessment - on a letter system for assessing the academic achievements of students.

During a visit to the organization, the management was asked the question: "Are external examiners involved in order to improve the fairness, quality and transparency of the assessment process?" And the answer was yes.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria correspond to 9 standards (including 6 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully - 8, partially - 1, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 3: fulfilled

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) It is necessary to refine the checklists for conducting current, midterm and end-of-course assessment in the disciplines of the program (3.1.4).
- 2) To develop and apply mechanisms for studying and documenting the reliability, validity and fairness of assessment methods (3.1.4).

Standard 4: RESIDENTS

4.1 Admission Policy and Selection

Admission to the residency of the NSC of Phthisiopulmonology will be carried out under the [ECAQA_ Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare](#) 12

state educational order, at the expense of local executive bodies and on a paid basis at the expense of citizens' own funds. Admission to the residency with an indication of the specialty is carried out in accordance with the Typical Rules for Admission to Study in Educational Organizations.

Admission to the residency with an indication of the specialty is announced through the media, by posting announcements on the centre's website.

Thus, the experts have validated the data according to **standard 4**. In general, all criteria are met, at the same time, some comments have been identified. It is necessary to provide for questions on biomedical sciences in the examination tests at the pre-graduate level, as well as the inclusion of residents in the process of developing a policy for the admission and selection of residents. 4.1.6. Will only be implemented after the recruitment of phthisiologist residents.

4.2 Number of residents.

The number of residents in the specialty 7R01101 "Phthisiology for adults, children" is regulated by the State Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, taking into account the material and technical resources of the NSC and clinical bases, the provision of educational, educational and methodological, scientific literature. Taking into account the needs for medical personnel, the NSC sends a request for the need for scientific and pedagogical personnel and clinical specialties of residency to the Department of Scientific and Human Resources of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In accordance with the request of the DSHR, a State order is allocated for the training of medical personnel in residency.

Employees take part in boards, conferences, meetings, sessions of specialized commissions of the Ministry of Health, the "Republican Centre for Health Development", and conference calls with regional Health Departments. All participate in the "Open Days" at clinical sites, provide medical and consultative, curatorial (for regions) and methodological assistance. An analysis of the health care needs for specialists in a specific area of medicine is carried out annually (demographic and medical statistics, reports of regional Health Departments of the Republic of Kazakhstan). All of the above activities are used as results in preparing requests for the formation of the number of residents in a specific specialty.

According to the residency regulations, the number of residents in each specialty per teacher is 3:1. The policy for admitting residents provides for the implementation of the rights of residents in accordance with gender, ethnic, religious and social characteristics (regulated by the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Laws of the Republic of Kazakhstan on education, on religious activity, on languages).

There were no residents in the specialty 7R01101 "Phthisiology for adults, children".

4.3 Resident Support and Consulting

A system of academic consulting for residents is in place. For this purpose, by order of the Chairman of the Board, a resident will be assigned a curator from among the Academic staff, who will participate in the formation and implementation of an individual curriculum, supervise the educational and scientific activities of the student, and assist in employment. In addition, a clinical mentor is assigned to the resident at the medical organization where the resident is undergoing training. His function is to guide the resident in mastering the practical skills and competencies necessary for the resident in the course of his training.

Academic consulting work consists of consulting residents during their training and before the examination session. Before the start of each examination session, a schedule of consultations on disciplines is developed and approved. Before the beginning of each semester, the group teacher informs their residents about their work schedule, the time when residents can seek consultations on a given discipline. Residents can be consulted both in person and remotely (on-line, in chats). Responsibility for ensuring the quality of the educational process rests with the leaders.

NSC will provide support to students in the event of a professional crisis and involve the Department of P&AE in resolving problematic situations, and also guarantees confidentiality regarding consulting and the support provided.

4.4 Representation of residents

According to the Academic Policy of the NSC of Phthisiopulmonology, residents, together with the faculty of the institute, will have the opportunity to participate in formulating the mission and final learning outcomes, during direct discussion and approval of work programs, at the level of developing an individual work curriculum and elective disciplines. For this purpose, the NSC has implemented surveys that include questions on the schedule, teaching and assessment methods, learning conditions in clinics, provision of methodological and information and communication materials, and relationships with teachers.

The NSC has mechanisms to encourage residents to participate in the social and scientific life of the NSC of Phthisiopulmonology or outside it; they are encouraged when reviewing portfolio materials in the form of awards, participation in national and international conferences, master classes and trainings, publication of joint scientific papers, and participation in scientific research conducted at the department.

4.5 Working conditions

Residents will be granted a vacation between academic years of at least 6 weeks, after the final state certification of at least 4 weeks with the retention of the scholarship. Combining studies with work (no more than 0.5 rates) in areas of activity close to his future specialty in his free time from studies with the consent of the curator, head of the department and the residency sector. In the presence of a specialist certificate, residents of the 2nd training are allowed to carry out independent medical activities in state and private medical institutions, outside of school hours.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Correspond to 20 standards: fully - 19, partially - 1, do not comply - 0

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To provide for the inclusion of residents in the process of developing the admission policy (4.1.6).
- 2) To ensure proper representation of residents in advisory bodies (4.4)

Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF

5.1 Admission and selection policy

Teachers are admitted in accordance with the requirements of the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 17.02.2012 No. 230 "On approval of the Rules for competitive replacement of positions of professorial and Academicstaff and research workers of higher educational institutions", the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 13, 2009 No. 338 "On approval of standard qualification characteristics of positions of Academic staff and persons equivalent to them". Based on the "Regulations on the Resident Supervisor", the supervisor must have a doctorate, candidate of medical sciences, PhD or the highest or first category qualification, actively engaged in scientific and practical activities.

The NSC of Phthisiopulmonology has developed mechanisms and criteria for systematically evaluating the effectiveness of teaching quality: these are intra-departmental control, open classes, mutual visits to classes, and resident surveys. The quality of classes and the teaching materials used, the timeliness of issuing assignments for independent work, and the organization of monitoring and assessment of students' academic performance are analysed.

The NSC provides for a survey of residents ("The Teacher through the Eyes of Residents", "Satisfaction of Residents with the Educational Process"). The purpose of the rating assessment of the activities of the Academic staff is to ensure an objective evaluation and self-assessment of the level of performance of professional duties of the Academic staff in order to determine ways to further improve the pedagogical skills and motivate creative activity of the Academic staff through moral and material incentives for work. Conditions have been created for systematic professional development of employees, improvement and standardization of the competitive selection procedure for personnel. Experts have been familiarized with the HR policy, the Regulation on mentors.

External experts received the opinion of teachers on the HR policy. The conversation with the

head included such questions as how residents will be provided with patients with other diagnoses, how employees of clinical sites will be attracted for teaching, about the strategy and tactics of recruiting residents, information support of the educational program.

While questioning teachers, it was found that the majority (90%) are completely satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace in this educational organization, but 10% are partially satisfied. In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to do scientific work and publish the results of R&D - 80% completely agree, 20% partially. Satisfied with the work of the HR service - 80% completely agree, 20% partially. Satisfied with the salary - 40% completely agree, 40% disagree, 20% - more yes than no.

5.2 Faculty Responsibilities and Development

The Human Resources Department ensures compliance with the HR policy requirements in the residency educational program by monitoring the ratio of the Academic staff profile, compliance with the range and balance of teachers of basic biomedical sciences, behavioural and social sciences and major (clinical) disciplines necessary for the implementation of the educational program.

The core department guarantees the ability of the teacher to implement all activities for training residents. The scope of work of the teaching staff and clinical mentors is regulated by an individual employment contract. The teaching load of the Academic staff is calculated in accordance with the Typical Rules for the Activities of Higher Education Organizations (Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 20.05.2013 No. 499) and the state standard for levels of education (Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 23.08.2012 No. 1080) and is annually approved by a decision of the Academic Council. The work of the residency Academic staff is carried out in accordance with the individual teacher plan (ITP).

In order to verify the data of standard 5, during a meeting with the head of the HR department and during interviews with teachers, experts obtained an opinion on approaches to developing the pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring. Thus, the NSC has a policy for the professional development of department employees. The experts found that teachers stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation. The NSC of Phthisiopulmonology provides for an employment contract, a system of moral motivation in accordance with the Labour Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan, payment of incentive bonuses, incentives for Academic staff for special personal merits and achievements, and additional types of incentives are also used: gratitude, valuable gifts, awarding a certificate of honour; nomination for titles, medals and badges of the Ministry of Health and the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. However, we believe that this provision needs to be revised.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 8 standards (including 7 basic, 1 Standard of improvement): fully - 7, partially - 1, do not comply - 0.

Recommendations for improvement:

1) To develop a program for the development of professional and pedagogical competencies of teachers and mentors (5.2.2).

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

6.1 Material and technical support and equipment

The educational program has a material and technical base for the educational process. The NSC includes 2 lecture halls, classrooms for seminars and practical classes, laboratories, 1 computer class, 2 scientific and methodological offices. To master practical skills, an educational and simulation centre should be created. In the new building, the equipment has been purchased.

6.2 Clinical bases

The clinical base for training residents in the specialty 7R01101 "Phthysiology for adults, children" is the National Scientific Centre of Phthysiopulmonology (350 beds). The structural divisions of the Centre include: inpatient departments, a diagnostic department (outpatient level), a day hospital (hospital-replacement care); the structure also includes a telemedicine centre, laboratories, a library, a morgue, etc. The ability to provide specialized and highly specialized medical care to the population by the Centre's employees gives resident doctors the opportunity to participate in clinical, consultative and methodological assistance to specialists in the regions, participate in interdisciplinary consultations and master classes.

A review of resources showed that they generally correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, and the employees of the educational organization ensure collegial and ethical relationships with medical personnel, the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of residents. During the visit to the clinic, the experts examined the resources, their compliance with the training programs, and accessibility for teachers and residents, how modern this equipment is and how it meets the needs of students and practical health care. The experts received evidence of compliance with standard 6, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report.

6.3 Information technology

The Institute has a computer room with 6 seats, an electronic library room with 4 seats, 2 lecture halls with a capacity of 100 seats, equipped with modern multimedia and sound amplification equipment, and a telemedicine centre operates at the Institute.

The corporate network of the Institute provides access to modern databases in the field of medicine: "EbscoHost - Medline", "Springerlink", "Scopus", "Web of Science", "Elsevier", "Thomson Reuters". The library and information service consists of a subscription and a computer room, the total area of the premises is 53.5 sq.m.

6.4 Clinical teams

During the training process, residents, as a result of daily clinical activities, have the opportunity for interdisciplinary interaction in the process of discussing clinical cases (daily rounds, consultations, telemedicine consultations).

Students have free access to patients at clinical sites and all the conditions for improving their practical skills - 100% of teachers fully agree with this.

6.5 Medical scientific research and achievements

Residents have the opportunity to improve their scientific thinking skills through training at seminars or master classes with the involvement of foreign specialists, as well as by participating in national and international conferences, symposia, etc. NSC residents are planned to be involved as medical researchers in the implementation of scientific and technical programs (STP) of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as grant research of phase's I-IV.

All research and scientific and technical programs conducted at the NSC of Phthysiopulmonology are aimed at studying, analysing, standardizing epidemiological indicators for tuberculosis, developing and implementing highly effective technologies for diagnosing, treating and monitoring these diseases, which is subsequently reflected in making management decisions and strategic planning of the healthcare system.

An interview with teachers showed that there are both successes and problems in education management, depending on a specific base (admission of residents to equipment, a sufficient number of subject patients, time for maintaining medical records, independent work).

6.6 Expertise in the field of education

In order to ensure the quality of the EP, the NSC of Phthisiopulmonology conducts systematic monitoring and evaluation of the effectiveness of the EP at all levels on a regular basis by: examining the content of the EP by members of working groups; annual revision of syllabuses taking into account new requirements.

The examination is carried out in the form of an analysis of the needs for specialists, an analysis of resident training methods, and the results allow us to draw conclusions about the quality of innovative changes in postgraduate education.

As a result of the work carried out on the examination in the field of education, the NSC of Phthisiopulmonology has introduced relevant innovations in the educational process, which allow developing broader and more specialized competencies (Assessment of mastery of practical procedures, Discussion of a clinical case, Patient examination, and Portfolio assessment).

6.7 Training in other institutions

The NSC cooperates within the framework of a strategic partnership with international clinical centres and universities in the near and far abroad.

The academic policy of the NSC of Phthisiopulmonology provides for the possibility of individual training outside the university using ECTS credits and transfer of disciplines.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 18 standards (including 11 basic, 7 improvement standards): fully - 16, partially - 2, do not comply - 0

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To provide residents with access to the latest literature, subscriptions to electronic resources, international sources and equipment for theoretical training and mastering practical skills. To provide a safe environment for self-education (6.1.1).
- 2) To implement the program 7R01101 "Phthisiology for adults, children", it is necessary to provide access to laboratory and instrumental diagnostics of patients, improve the material and technical base, include training using simulations as an integrated part of the educational program (6.2.2).
- 3) To create the necessary conditions for placing a scientific library; regularly replenish the library with modern educational and scientific literature on phthisiology based on an analysis of needs, feedback from teachers and residents (6.3).

Standard 7: EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

The residency educational program is monitored at the course level and at the NSC level.

At the course level - methodological support for the educational process and monitoring of the final outcomes of the student contingent is developed; methodological support (work program, syllabuses, test assignments upon mastering the discipline) is submitted for discussion and approval to the NSC, the Chairman of the Board, the Academic Council; then the schedule is formed; discussion and approval of the individual curriculum, clinical mentors of the residency student, methods of formative and summative assessment, the form of conducting final control; informing the postgraduate education department about the resident's academic performance and attendance; monitoring the mastery and implementation of the curriculum, filling out the portfolio by the resident.

At the NSC level - jointly with the quality management department, development of feedback forms for the student contingent and employers; coordination and approval of the clinical mentor of the student contingent; organization and implementation of annual and final state certification of residency students; control of compliance of the final results with the specialist's competencies.

The final outcomes of monitoring the implementation of the educational program of residency in specialty 7R01101 " Phthisiology for adults, children" will be: compliance of the educational program with the qualification characteristics of levels 7.1C-7.2 B with the industry qualification framework; employment, compliance of the material and technical base, content of educational and methodological

support with the achievement of the final outcomes.

7.2 Feedback from teachers and residents

Despite the fact that there are no feedback results for program 7R01101 " Phthiology for adults, children", the NSC has developed a policy for collecting feedback. Thus, it is envisaged to collect feedback on the quality of the educational program in the form of a daily formative assessment by the teacher of the discipline; periodically - by a curator, clinical mentor, upon completion of the discipline in the form of a 3600 grade. The results of the analysis of the feedback from residents are expected to be presented at a meeting of the Academic Council, where a decision is made on making adjustments to the residency educational program.

An evaluation of clinical sites and the sufficiency of resources (material and technical, human, educational and scientific literature, etc.) are provided in the format of the Annual Report of the Department, with a SWOT analysis and an indication of weaknesses.

While studying the documentation, the NSC provided information on the annual collection of opinions on the quality of the educational program from employers. *At the same time, there is no information on the results of feedback from teachers, residency graduates, since there are no students graduating. But survey forms have been created.*

7.3 Results of residents and graduates

In accordance with the Regulation on residency, the results of residents are evaluated in the form of a formative, summative assessment and feedback from clinical mentors, curators. Formative assessment of resident competencies is carried out by the supervisor during consultations, clinical rounds, rotation of residents in the clinic, in the form of an oral analysis of the results of a joint examination of patients with the supervisor, by providing oral feedback, as well as during portfolio assessment. The supervisor must verbally inform the resident of the dynamics of the mastered competencies (progress/regression); in addition, a checklist is used as a formative assessment.

It is planned to assess the results of residents by collecting feedback from all stakeholders (residents, graduates, employers) during questionnaires and in the form of reviews; holding focus groups with students to analyse the content of individual disciplines and the residency program - annually; monitoring academic performance and quality of knowledge, results based on the results of midterm (once a semester) and end-of-course assessment (annually); creating groups from the NSC and the medical university to examine the program; organizing an independent examination of the results with the participation of leading specialists in practical healthcare. Taking into account the mission of the program 7R01101 " Phthiology for adults, children", which is to train a qualified phthiologist with universal and professional competencies for independent work in modern healthcare conditions, residents must study basic disciplines such as phthiology, outpatient and polyclinic, inpatient phthiology for adults, children, laboratory and instrumental and functional diagnostics.

7.4 Involvement of stakeholders

In order to ensure transparency and objectivity in assessing the academic achievements of residents, leading representatives of practical healthcare are involved in working with residents as mentors, as well as in the midterm and final certification of graduates. Updates regularly made to the CED are the result of the analysis of feedback from stakeholders. The main external stakeholder is the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, which monitors the academic achievements of residents through the National Centre for Independent Examination - the process is carried out by external experts. External quality assurance is guaranteed by the accreditation procedure.

Participation of external stakeholders in the processes of monitoring and evaluating the educational program is achieved through their inclusion in the collegial bodies of the NSC.

Employers in almost all regions of Kazakhstan noted the importance of undergoing high-quality practice, increasing hours for practice, developing clinical thinking, and forming a sense of responsibility for people's lives. The interview with employers was conducted online and included questions such as: knowledge of the university mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in training residents through mentoring,

providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, employment of residency graduates, etc.

7.5 Procedure for approving educational programs

Educational program 7R01101 "Phthisiology for adults, children" of the National Scientific Centre of Phthisiopulmonology of the Republic of Kazakhstan was created by a working group, reviewed by the Committee of educational programs, approved by the Academic Council, submitted for inclusion in the register of educational programs. On the website of the National Scientific Centre of Phthisiopulmonology www.ncvb.kz in the Residency section, the Passport of educational programs and the Curriculum are posted. The Academic Policy provides for procedures for the annual updating of educational programs by updating through individual curricula of students, based on the choice of elective courses by residents, collecting feedback from residents to determine the level of satisfaction of residents with the content of the educational program, the organization of the educational process in the form of questionnaires, focus groups, monitoring of requests.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliance out of 10 standards (including 7 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully - 9, partially - 1, do not comply - 0

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To integrate training in the simulation centre into the educational program(7.5.1).

Standard 8: MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION

8.1 Management

The National Scientific Centre of Phthisiopulmonology of the Republic of Kazakhstan has developed and approved documents defining the scope of responsibilities and powers of the institute in relation to the residency program in accordance with the LSI of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as internal rules.

The National Scientific Centre is one of the administrative structural divisions of the clinic that organizes the training of residents and advanced training courses. The work plan of the Academic Council of the NSC of Phthisiopulmonology includes the issue "Annual report" of Kaidaulov Mukhtar Kenzhebekovich - head of the training centre of the NSCP RK".

Residency graduates who have successfully mastered the EP in accordance with the WC and passed the end-of-course assessment, by decision of the State Attestation Commission are issued a Certificate of Completion of Residency of the State standard, with an appendix reflecting the results of mastering all disciplines according to the WC, GPA, the number of academic hours and credits.

8.2 Academic Leadership

Transparency of management and decision-making on the educational program of residency 7R01101 " Phthisiology for adults, children" is ensured by the presence of the Academic Policy, the functioning of collegial management bodies, a quality management system, and a system for collecting feedback from stakeholders.

Information on educational programs for residency is presented in the Passport of educational programs, published on the website of the National Scientific Centre of Phthisiopulmonology of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Information on admission to residency is published in social networks. There is also a press service providing public relations, information materials, and analytical reports on thematic issues.

The system of training medical personnel uses a mechanism for forming an order for training personnel: conducting industry monitoring, i.e. tracking the current and future needs of employers for personnel of various qualifications; joint marketing research of the labour market and the educational services market; planning the opening of new specialties, areas of training and retraining of personnel; promoting the employment of graduates; development of educational programs for targeted training of personnel, training young specialists for specific jobs; monitoring the professional growth of graduates in the workplace; providing employers with recommendations on improving the training of graduates in each specialty.

8.3 Training budget and resource allocation

The responsibility and authority for managing the budgets of the residency program are assigned to the Deputy Chairman of the Board for financial and economic issues, the planning and economic analysis department, and the accounting and reporting department.

The allocation of resources for training residents is regulated by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Budget program 006). The calculation of training costs is regulated in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan

No. 474 "On approval of the standards for calculating the cost of training one resident, residency student, master's student, doctoral student (PhD) in educational and scientific organizations in the field of healthcare within the country under the state educational order (with amendments and additions in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 8.08.2011 No. 510 as of 08.08.2011), the Development Plan of the National Scientific Centre of Pharmacology of the Republic of Kazakhstan", the Public Procurement Plan of the National Scientific Centre of Pharmacology of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the current year.

8.4 Administration and management

To implement the EP, qualified faculty members are involved, who meet the requirements of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan On Education, the State Compulsory Standard of Education for residency programs, the Academic Policy of the National Scientific Centre of Phthisiopulmonology of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and the Regulation on clinical mentors of the National Scientific Centre of Phthisiopulmonology of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The structural unit responsible for the implementation and effectiveness of educational residency programs is the National Scientific Centre of Phthisiopulmonology of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The responsibility of the faculty members is regulated by job descriptions and individual development plans. Clinical mentors are appointed and assigned by order of the Chairman of the Board.

The main issues on the organization and implementation of residency programs are resolved at meetings of the committee of educational residency programs, which is a collegial body, which includes those responsible for residency specialties, as well as representatives of practical healthcare.

8.5 Requirements and regulations

The documents regulating the educational activities of the National Scientific Centre of Phthisiopulmonology of the Republic of Kazakhstan are the Regulation on the National Scientific Centre of Phthisiopulmonology, the regulation on the development and approval of the EP, the Regulation on the clinical mentor, on the current monitoring of the progress of midterm and final assessment of students and the corresponding standard operating procedures.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 11 standards: fully - 10, partially - 1, do not comply - 0

Recommendation for improvement:

- 1) To develop, approve and implement a quality management system, including regular internal and external reviews and audits (8.4.2)

CONCLUSION:

During the external evaluation of the educational program 7R01101 "Phthisiology for adults, children" of the National Scientific Centre for Phthisiopulmonology of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, it was found that out of 114 standards (including 82 basic standards and 32 improvement standards), 106 accreditation standards demonstrate full compliance, including 76 basic standards and 30 improvement standards. 8 improvement standards were partially fulfilled. No non-compliance with the standards was found.

Strengths:

1) The educational program of residency in the specialty 7R01101 "Phthisiology for adults, children" has a practical focus on the scale of the republic.

2) The mission and goal of the educational program are posted on social networks and are thus

communicated to all interested parties.

- 3) Openness of the process of development and approval of the educational program.
- 4) Highly professional staff in the specialty.
- 5) Opportunities for participation in international projects.

5. Recommendations for improving the educational program 7R01101 “Phthiology for adults, children”:

1. To provide for adequate representation of residents in advisory bodies (2.4.4).
2. It is necessary to finalize the checklists for conducting current, midterm and end-of-course assessment in the disciplines of the program (3.1.4).
3. To develop and apply mechanisms for studying and documenting the reliability, validity and fairness of assessment methods (3.1.4).
4. To provide for the inclusion of residents in the process of developing admission policies (4.1.6)
5. To ensure adequate representation of residents in advisory bodies (4.4)
6. To develop a program for the development of professional and pedagogical competencies of teachers and mentors (5.2.2).
7. To provide residents with access to the latest literature, subscriptions to electronic resources, international sources and equipment for theoretical training and acquisition of practical skills. To provide a safe environment for self-education (6.1.1).
8. To implement program 7R01101 "Phthiology for adults, children", it is necessary to provide access to laboratory and instrumental diagnostics of patients, improve the material and technical base, and include training using simulations as an integrated part of the educational program (6.2.2).
9. To create the necessary conditions for placing a scientific library, regularly replenish the library with modern educational and scientific literature on phthiology based on an analysis of needs, feedback from teachers and residents (6.3).
10. To integrate training in the simulation centre into the educational program (7.5.1).
11. To develop, approve and implement a quality management system, including regular internal and external reviews and audits (8.4.2)
12. To generate a Q-code for receiving assessments and services on the official website for ease of navigation, upgrade the website for visually impaired students (standard 9).

6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The EEC members established the compliance of the educational program of the residency in the specialty 7R01101 "Phthisiology for adults, children", RSE on REM "National Scientific Centre of Phthisiopulmonology of the Republic of Kazakhstan", with the accreditation standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend that the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this program for a period of 5 years.

Chairman of the EEC	IMASHEVA BAGDAT SAKENOVNA	
Foreign expert	RYZHKIN SERGEY ALEKSANDROVICH	
Academic expert	KURMANOVA ALMAGUL MEDEUBAYEVNA	
Academic expert	RAMAZANOVA SHOLPAN KHAMZAEVNA	
Academic expert	BUGAKOV ANATOLY ALEKSEEVICH	
Academic expert	IZTLEUOV YERBOLAT MARATOVICH	
Expert employer	UTESHEVA GULMIRA SAYYNBAEVNA	
Expert student	TERTYUBAEVA ZHAZIRA ORUMBEOVNA	

Профиль качества и критерии внешней оценки образовательной программы (обобщение)

Стандарт	Критерии оценки	Количество стандартов	БС*/СУ	Оценка		
				Полностью соответствует	Частично соответствует	Не соответствует
1.	МИССИЯ И КОНЕЧНЫЕ РЕЗУЛЬТАТЫ	14	9/5	14		
2.	ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНАЯ ПРОГРАММА	22	19/3	21	1	
3.	ОЦЕНКА РЕЗИДЕНТОВ	9	6/3	8	1	
4.	РЕЗИДЕНТЫ	20	14/6	18	2	
5.	АКАДЕМИЧЕСКИЙ ШТАТ/ПРЕПОДАВАТЕЛИ	8	7/1	7	1	
6.	ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНЫЕ РЕСУРСЫ	18	11/7	17	1	
7.	ОЦЕНКА ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНОЙ ПРОГРАММЫ	10	7/3	9	1	
8.	УПРАВЛЕНИЕ И АДМИНИСТРИРОВАНИЕ	11	8/3	11	0	
9.	НЕПРЕРЫВНОЕ УЛУЧШЕНИЕ	2	1/1	-	-	
		114	82/32	112		

Список документов, изученных членами ВЭК в рамках проведения внешней оценки образовательной программы резидентуры 7R01101 «Фтизиатрия взрослая, детская»

№	Наименования документов	Количество
1	Академическая политика	1
2	Вовлеченные в науку резиденты	1
3	Договор с РГП на ПХВ «Национальный центр фтизиопульмонологии РК»	1
4	Должностная инструкция врача резидента (каз, рус)	1
5	ИСМ компетентностная модель выпускника резидента	1
6	Кадровая политика	1
7	Карта процесса	1
8	Кодекс чести	1
9	Коечный фонд	1
10	План КОП	1
11	План ПК ППС на 2023-2024	1
12	Положение о клинических наставниках	1
13	Положение о проведении текущего контроля успеваемости промежуточной и итоговой аттестации обучающихся	1
14	Положение о разработке и утверждении ОП	1
15	ПРАВИЛА ПРИЕМА В РЕЗИДЕНТУРУ НА 2024 - 2027 УЧЕБНЫЙ ГОД	1
16	Протоколы УС Внутренние Нормативные Документы по образованию	1
17	Протокол УС Миссия	1
18	Протокол УС ОП	1
19	Рецензия на ОП «Фтизиатрия, взрослая, детская»	1
20	СОП о разработке и утверждение системы оценки учебных достижений	1
21	СОП Правила проведения текущего контроля успеваемости обучающегося	1
22	Стратегические показатели 2024-2027	1
23	УС протоколы	1
24	Договор Библиотека	1
25	Этический кодекс преподавателя	1