

To Accreditation Board
Of Eurasian Centre for
Accreditation and Quality Assurance
in Higher Education and Health care

REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EVALUATION COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF
THE ASSESSMENT OF THE BACHELOR'S EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM OF
SPECIALTY 5B130100 "GENERAL MEDICINE" OF ASFENDIYAROV
KAZNMU FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS OF
ACCREDITATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME OF THE
SPECIALTY "GENERAL MEDICINE" OF MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL
ORGANIZATIONS

period of external expert evaluation: 22.12. -24.12.2020 year

Almaty, 2020

CONTENT

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	EEC composition	3
2.	General part of the final report of the EEC	5
2.1	Presentation of Asfendiyarov KazNMU and educational programme of bachelor's degree in "General Medicine" and internships	5
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	7
2.3	Analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational programme of the bachelor's degree in the specialty "General Medicine" and internships	7
3.	Description of the stages of external expert evaluation and conclusion	9
4.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the bachelor's educational programme in the specialty "General Medicine" and the internship of Asfendiyarov KazNMU and an overview of strengths for each standard	17
5.	Recommendations for improving the educational programme of the bachelor's degree in the specialty "General Medicine" and internship Asfendiyarov KazNMU	32
6.	Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Board	32
7.	Appendix 1. Quality profile and criteria for external assessment of the bachelor's degree programme in General Medicine and internship for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards	34
8.	Appendix 2. List of documents requested by EEC members in the framework of specialized accreditation	35

LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS:

ECTS	European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System
PBL	Problem-based learning
TBL	Team-based learning
RBL	Research based learning
AIS	Automated information system
AC KazNMU	Academic Council of KazNMU
AMP	Administrative and management personnel
BD	Basic disciplines
HEIs	Higher educational institutions
SAC	State Attestation Commission
SCES	State compulsory education standard
DAW	Department of Academic Work
DSHR	Department of Science and Human Resources
DLT	Distance learning technologies
DEMw	Department of educational and methodical work
DOW	Department of Operational Works
DEF	Department of Economics and Finance
ECAQA	Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care
FSC	Final state certification
IPE	Institute of Postgraduate Education
IC	Individual curriculum
OC	Optional component
CEP	Committee of educational programmes
QED	Catalog of elective disciplines
CEL	Clinical and experimental laboratory
MoH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MEO	Medical education organization
MC	Methodical council
MJ RK	Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan
IAAR	Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating
NJSC "KazNMU"	Non-profit joint-stock company "Kazakh National Medical University named after S. D. Asfendiyarov"
RI	Research Institute
RI of FAM	Research Institute of fundamental and applied medicine named after B. Atchabarova
SRW	Student research work
IKAQAE	Independent Kazakh Agency for Quality Assurance in Education
SC	Scientific Centre
EP	Educational programme
DPCEP	Department of planning and control of the educational process
IC	Intermediate certification

MD	Major disciplines
PHC	Primary health care
TS	Teaching staff
RSE on REM	Republican state enterprise on the right of economic management
WC	Working curricula
QMS	Quality Management System
SOP	Standard operating procedures
AAAS	Academic achievement assessment system
SIW	Student's independent work
SIWT	Independent work of a student with a teacher
SC	Simulation centre
TC	Typical curricula
EMA	Educational and methodical association
YPD	Youth Policy Department
AC	Academic Council
CCU	Centre of collective usage
GCV	Graduate Career Centre
SPS	School of Pedagogical Skills

1. Composition of the External Evaluation Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 23 of December 7, 2020, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct accreditation of the bachelor's educational programme in the specialty "General Medicine" and the internship of Asfendiyarov KazNMU in the period from December 22-24, 2020 in the following composition:



Chairperson

KUZGIBEKOVA ALMA BOLATOVNA,

Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Children's Diseases

NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda",

Honorary Worker of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, winner of the medal V.G. Leibniz (2012), M. Pettenkofer (2014) European Scientific Society, Accredited independent expert on the assessment of the quality of medical services.



Foreign expert

OLEG MIKHAILOVICH URYASIEV,

Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Faculty Therapy with courses in endocrinology, general physiotherapy, clinical pharmacology, occupational diseases and military field therapy, Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs

FSBEI HE "Ryazan State Medical University named after academician I.P. Pavlov "of the Ministry of Health of Russia.



National Academic Expert

KAUYSHEVA ALMAGUL AMANGELDINOVNA,

Ph.D., Vice-rector for educational and scientific activities

Kazakhstan Medical University "KSPH"

Accredited independent expert in assessing the quality of medical services, Deputy Chairman of the Board of the Regional Public Organization "Kazakhstan Alliance of Medical Organizations".



National Academic Expert

ERMUKHANOVA LYUDMILA SERGEEVNA,
Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Public Health and Health Care, NJSC "West Kazakhstan Marat Ospanov Medical University", trainer for training compulsory health insurance of the Western region.



Expert - representative of undergraduates

KHUSAINOVA ZHANAR ZHANATBEKOVNA,
2-year master's student in the specialty "Medicine"
JSC "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education", doctor of ultrasound diagnostics



ECAQA Observer

UMAROVA MAKPAL ALDIBEKOVNA
Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department
NI " Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care "
tel .: +7 747 5609212,
e-mail: info@ecaqa.org

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC (Order of the ECAQA Director general No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme of the bachelor's degree in the specialty "General Medicine" and the internship of Asfendiyarov KazNMU for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of the educational programme in the specialty "General Medicine" of medical educational institutions of the ECAQA, recommendations of the EEC on further education.

2. General part of the final report of the EEC

2.1 Presentation of Asfendiyarov KazNMU and the educational programme of bachelor's degree in "General Medicine" and internships

In 2018, the University was reorganized into a non-profit joint stock company (NJSC) in accordance with the resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (dated April 5,

2018 No. 166) and received the status of a research university (resolution of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated November 12, 2018).

Educational activities in NJSC KazNMU are carried out in accordance with the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 27, 2007 No. 319 "On Education", "On Approval of the State Programme for the Development of Health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020 - 2025", "State Programme for the Development of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2011 - 2020" and "State programme for the development of health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Densaulyk" for 2016-2019", "On approval of the State Programme for the Development of Health Care of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020–2025", by-laws of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as in accordance with ISO 9001: 2015.

Since 2006, KazNMU has started training bachelors, since 2007 – masters and since 2009 - PhD doctoral students. Currently, in accordance with the state license No. KZ74LAA00017008 dated 19.09.2019. training is carried out in Kazakh, Russian and English languages at the undergraduate and postgraduate levels of education.

The university successfully implements dual education involving employers in the development and implementation of educational programmes and field training for interns and residents in the regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan, branches of KazNMU in Taldykorgan, Taraz and Kyzylorda and other regions of Kazakhstan.

In KazNMU from 2016 to 2020, 5422 people received postgraduate education, including 4356 interns, 322 undergraduates, 122 doctoral students, 719 residents.

The employment of graduates of the internship of KazNMU in the 2015-2016 academic year was 100%, in the 2016-2017 academic year - 100%, in the 2017-2018 academic year -100%, in the 2018-2019 academic year - 99.9%, in 2019 - 2020 academic year - 100%.

In accordance with the Strategy of NJSC Asfendiyarov KazNMU "for 2019 - 2023 the basis of KazNMU's activity is the trinity: the integration of academic, scientific and clinical activities, in order to provide high-quality and modern medical care to the population and training of professional personnel ([https://kaznmu.kz/rus/programma-razvitiya-NJSC-kaznmu/programma-razvitiya-NJSC-kaznmu /](https://kaznmu.kz/rus/programma-razvitiya-NJSC-kaznmu/programma-razvitiya-NJSC-kaznmu/)).

The University has 13 academic buildings with a total area of 64,601.2 square meters, a gym, 7 dormitories for 2860 places with a total area of 25,559.2 square meters (until 2018).

In 2018, at the expense of the university, a new dormitory for 512 places was opened. The structure of NJSC Asfendiyarov KazNMU included republican state enterprises: Scientific Centre for Obstetrics, Gynaecology and Perinatology; Scientific Centre for Pediatric and Pediatric Surgery; Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Medicine; Kazakh Scientific Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology and Scientific Centre for Surgery named after A.N. Syzganov.

KazNMU conducts training for students on the basis of 108 clinics, polyclinics, research institutes, scientific centres, including 6 affiliated with the university - 5 scientific research institutes and scientific centres (A.N. Syzganov NSCS, SCOGP, SCPPS, KSRICIM, KRIOR, as well as 1 UC) ... The structure of the united University clinic includes: clinic "Aksai", clinic of internal diseases of KazNMU, professorial clinic of KazNMU, dental clinic.

The staff of the University is 2993 people. Of these, the teaching staff - 1283, including academicians - 9, doctors of sciences - 151, candidates of sciences - 401, doctors PhD - 20. Holders of the grant of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan "The best teacher of the Republic of Kazakhstan" are 21 university teachers.

Since 2018, KazNMU has a certificate of institutional accreditation for 5 years. KazNMU is 1 of the founders of the Academic Demanding League, which aims to improve the quality of education by implementing and promoting the principles of academic integrity.

KazNMU is a member of the following international associations: The Association for Medical Education in Europe (AMEE); Association Siberian Open University; UNAI - United Nations Academic Impact Programme.

During the period of implementation of KazNMU, 140 agreements on cooperation with universities, medical and scientific organizations of 35 countries of near and far abroad have been concluded. Within the Erasmus + programme signed agreements with European universities - Finland, Lithuania, Spain, Estonia, Italy.

In 2012 KazNMU began to operate a Dissertation Council for conferring a PhD degree in the specialty "Public health", in subsequent years in the specialties "Medicine", "Technology of pharmaceutical production".

In 2016, within the framework of grant funding (MoH RK, MES RK), 7 research projects were carried out in the amount of 57090.0 million tenge. 43 projects financed by other sources (foreign, intra-university, domestic, as initiative ones) in the amount of 256372.6 million tenge. In 2017, there were 12 projects in total, of which - 1 within the framework of programme-targeted funding (MHSD RK, MES RK), 7 - within the framework of grant funding (MoH RK, MES RK), 4 - with other sources of funding for a total of 75 8804.2 million tenge. In 2018, there were also 11 projects, of which 1 within the framework of programme-targeted financing (MHSD RK, MES RK), 6 - within the framework of grant financing (MoH RK, MES RK), 4 - with other sources of funding for a total amount of 106,559 million. tenge. In 2019, 14 projects, including 1 within the framework of programme-targeted financing (MoH RK, MES RK), 5 - within the framework of grant financing (MoH RK, MES RK), 8 - with other sources of financing for a total amount of 65,923 million tenge

...

Operational and communicative competencies in the educational model of KazNMU are practiced in the Simulation Centre named after K. Kozhakanov, which was updated in 2020 through the acquisition of modern high-tech simulators and dummies.

Thus, KazNMU is an innovation-oriented and socially responsible university, a leader in Central Asia in the multi-level training of competitive Health care and pharmacy specialists through the implementation of a competence-based model of medical and pharmaceutical education with the wide involvement of domestic and foreign scientists and a constant increase in scientific potential.

At KazNMU, training at the bachelor's and internship levels in the specialty "General Medicine" is coordinated by the School of General Medicine-1, School of General Medicine-2, the International Faculty, the Faculty of Postgraduate Education.

2.2 Information on previous accreditation

Accreditation of the bachelor's educational programme in the specialty "General Medicine" and internships was carried out in 2015 by NI "IAAR".

2.3 Analysis of the report on self-assessment of the educational programme of the bachelor's degree in the specialty "General medicine" and internship.

Self-Assessment Report of Undergraduate + Internship Study Programme presented on 132 pages of the main text, 28 annexes in the form of copies or electronic versions of supporting documents on the organization of education.

The report is characterized by the completeness of answers to all 9 accreditation standards, structuredness, taking into account the recommendations of the ECAQA Self-Assessment Guidelines, as well as the internal unity of information provided by the accredited educational programme. The report is accompanied by an accompanying letter signed by the rector prof. T.S. Nurgozhin confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report contains information about the representative of KazNMU, responsible for the self-assessment of the educational programme of the bachelor's degree in the specialty "General Medicine" and internship, the dean of the School of General Medicine-1, MD. Associate Professor Shopaeva G.A.

Self-assessment of the educational programme of KazNMU carried out on the basis of order dated 04.08.2020 No. 337 "On approval of the composition of the working group for preparing for

accreditation educational programmes in the specialty "Medicine" (bachelor's, master's, doctoral PhD).

The working group on the preparation of the self-assessment report did the following work: the content of the accredited educational programme, the conditions for its implementation, the staff in dynamics for 5 years, educational resources and their updating were analysed, the necessary information was collected in accordance with ECAQA accreditation standards (hereinafter referred to as accreditation standards); a thorough analysis, updating and addition of methodological and educational materials was carried out, their content is reflected in the report. The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with accreditation standards and includes a description of the strengths, areas for improvement for each of the 9 standards.

In the process of reviewing the self-assessment report of A.B. Kuzgibekova, a number of proposals were made to correct and supplement the missing elements, clarify quantitative indicators and the need to strengthen certain criteria of accreditation standards with relevant information. After revising the specified recommendations, KazNMU provided complete information on the relevant accreditation standards.

3. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work on the assessment of the educational bachelor's degree in the specialty "General Medicine" and the internship of KazNMU was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external assessment of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by order of the Director General of NI " Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care " No. 5 of 17.02.2017) and according to the programme and schedule approved on 07.12.2020 by the Director general of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the rector T.S. Nurgozhin.

To obtain objective information on the expert assessment of the accredited educational programme, the members of the EEC used the following methods: interviews with management and administrative staff, interviews with students, observation, study of the website, interviewing employees of various structural units, teachers, questioning teachers and students, review of resources in the context of fulfilling accreditation standards, attending practical classes at clinical sites, studying educational and methodological documents both before a visit to the university and during a visit. Access to the bachelor's programme "General Medicine" and the internship was provided by the university via the link in the google drive https://drive.google.com/file/d/1espuv4m_RfQdGV33xqw94N0xkaQCGe65/view?ts=5fe2b480

The KazNMU staff ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview sites. The sequence of the visit within 3 days is detailed in the Visit Programme, which can be found in the ECAQA documentation and attached to this report.

The first day of the visit is 12/22/2020. An interview with the management - vice-rector Bayeldinova K. Zh. and key employees of KazNMU made it possible to determine the fulfilment of most of the criteria for accreditation standards 1,2,5,7,8,9, namely, to identify approaches to the development of the mission of the educational programme and its compliance with the strategic goals of the university until 2023, the role and place of higher and postgraduate clinical education in the university strategy (plan), mechanisms in determining the appropriate specialty "General medicine" clinical bases (more than 100) and qualified teachers, guarantees of the adequacy of educational resources through planning public procurement and the conclusion of agreements with country and international partners (108 contracts).

Conversation with the dean of General Medicine Shopaeva GA and the dean of foreign students Dzhardemalieva N.Zh. made it possible to clarify information about the dynamics of the student body, including foreign students; to find out approaches to the admission and selection of students, as well as the recruitment of foreign students (mainly from India, Jordan). This interview enabled the experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical bases for teaching students,

information security of the educational process, as well as identifying problems in the management and development of human resources.

Determined that management of the educational programme is carried out at a qualitative level, the dean is aware of all the problems and successes of students, maintains regular communication with them, especially in the context of distance learning during a pandemic.

The meetings with the heads of departments in accordance with the programme of the EEC visit contributed to the verification of the data of the self-assessment report of the educational programme, since the heads of the relevant departments gave specific and clear explanations to the experts' questions: the final learning outcomes are clearly defined and information about them is available through the Sirius portal; there is a feedback system with students and teachers, which ensures the improvement of various processes related to learning.

A survey of KazNMU resources - a visit to the library, the test centre and the registrar's office - was aimed at verifying the data of Standard 6 "Educational Resource" of the self-assessment report. The library has a large collection of literature in three languages, only 4 floors (the last 1 serves senior students and teachers). Students are provided with a sufficient amount of educational literature, there is access to 12 databases of professional and scientific literature, which was demonstrated to the experts by director N.A. Modov. Library employee G.A. Zhanbolatova monthly monitoring of the use of electronic resources and the capabilities of foreign databases is carried out. During the visit, the problems of the library were voiced - the need to update office equipment, the introduction of informatization in the process of submitting applications and issuing textbooks to students.

The test centre visited by EEC is located on the 2nd floor of building No. 2, where 192 computer places are located, there are 5 air conditioners, video surveillance, however, metrological expertise has never been carried out. In the period before the pandemic, the workload of the test centre was daily from 8.00 to 18.00, while the centre has 4 employees and teachers of departments are involved as observers of the testing process. Head of the test centre Shonbasova M.B. reported that with a simultaneous large number of students, there are inappropriate climatic conditions in the premises of the centre.

In the office of the registrar, experts reviewed the registration logs of examination sheets, held a conversation with the head of Nabieva G.S. It has been established that the duties of the office-registrar include accounting for the contingent, student progress, including internship, the formation of groups of students for elective disciplines, but the choice of electives is the responsibility of the deans.

An interview with 4 chairmen of the CEP included it allowed to obtain information about the mechanisms for reviewing and approving educational programmes (the first stage at the department level), approving teaching aids, about the responsibility of the CEP for the quality of programmes, monitoring the educational process (carried out in conjunction with working groups), a commission under the Academic Council was created, checklists for checking syllables, a checklist for assessing a teacher were introduced. Other issues of the EEC were related to the distribution of responsibilities among the members of the CEP. Within the CEP, there are 5 quality working groups (improvement and implementation of new educational programmes, development and examination of CIS, feedback form, monitoring of the educational process, monitoring of innovation and publishing).

During interviews with tutors of students, a low level of their activity was noted. When communicating with the curators, it was found that educational work in accordance with the Plan of educational work was more realized in the pre-"pandemic" period. Since the introduction of online training, educational work has not been a priority for the curators, which was also confirmed by the bachelor students during interviews. There was a low level of activity of advisers who could not explain the goals and objectives of their work with students. The insufficient awareness of students and teaching staff about the choice of an individual educational trajectory was determined. Basically, the function of an adviser is performed by the deputy dean for educational work.

The experts studied in detail the documentation, including the journals of progress and attendance (paper and AIS-KazNMU) working curricula, syllables, control and measuring instruments, exam sheets. The experts found that the university strictly adheres to the requirements of regulatory legal acts and SCSES in the implementation of educational programmes, and the management systematically monitors this process during internal audits (QMS, mutual control, control of the vice-rector for academic work, reporting, etc.).

The basis for effective management is the Quality Assurance Policy of KazNMU and the "Department Policies" developed at the departments of the university, as well as adherence to the Quality Guidelines when documenting the educational process (since 2012, the QMS has been constantly supported and certified).

The second day of the visit is 12/23/2020. An interview was held with the director of the simulation centre Tolkimbaeva N.A. and a tour of the centre was made. Full compliance with the accreditation standard was established in relation to the organization of simulation training (area 3.5 thousand square meters, the sufficiency of modern equipment, its availability to students, qualified trainers and teachers, the possibility of independent work). Visiting the City Heart Center, PSE on REM "Ambulance Service", Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology, Medical centre "ASMED-2", SPE on REM City Polyclinic No. 26, experts from the EEC assessed the adequacy of resources for clinical training and their compliance with the disciplines of the educational programme, analysed the availability of patients and equipment of clinics for teachers and students. So, the department of general medical practice No. 2 has 30 full-time employees and 10 positions are employed part-time (at more than 20 clinical bases). The department is adapted to the remote format of organizing training for the 5th year (teachers are trained in making videos, principles of distance learning, proctoring in July-November 2020) and apply these technologies in the educational process during a pandemic.

Other clinical sites - Medical centre "ASMED-2", SPE on REM City Polyclinic No. 26 comply with the standard rules for medical organizations of practical health care, provide medical services to the attached population at a high level, however, by the indicated medical organizations Clause 23 of Order No. 628 of 11.09 is not fully implemented. 2012 "Regulations on clinical bases of medical Health care organizations:" The contribution of the Clinic to joint activities is the full administrative, economic and material and technical support of all types of educational, medical and scientific activities." In this connection, the provision of the departments "Basis of Internal Medicine" and "GD" with educational departments for a high-quality educational process is partially limited.

The available material and technical equipment of clinical departments allows to ensure the quality of the educational process, including in terms of distance learning (full, partial). At the same time, it is necessary to equip the teachers' workplace with technical training aids (PCs, laptops). During the visit to the clinics and conducting interviews with teachers, experts found that it is necessary to improve the interaction of the clinical department of the university and the management of clinical bases for better access of students to the resources of clinical bases and patients, taking into account the clinical work of teachers and material remuneration for this work, the need to develop mechanisms for motivating teachers in terms of incentive payments, including for clinical work in the context of a pandemic.

On the same day, interviews with students took place (online), 32 people participated. Students answered questions about the individual learning path, the choice of electives, the work of curators, advisers, as well as participation in the work of advisory bodies (student council and committees that interact with all 6 schools of the university). For example, students participated in determining the forms and methods of assessing students' knowledge and skills, in the work of commissions for the distribution of grants. Students actively participate in the work of KAZMSA https://www.instagram.com/kazmsa_kazakhstan/.

The experts asked questions about satisfaction with studying at the university, sufficient time for practical training, research, patient supervision and work with medical records, as well as satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers. In general, students are satisfied

with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this university, since they believe that KazNMU has excellent clinical bases and 90 years of experience in teaching, at the same time, the teachers wanted to improve the conditions for learning (not all clinical departments have enough classrooms), their equipment, insufficient activity of tutors and advisers in the process of formation and development of the learning path.

Interview with 77 bachelor and internship faculty members (online) included the following issues: material and moral incentives, satisfaction with teaching methods, the knowledge assessment system, conditions for equipping classrooms, classrooms, conditions for rest and meals at the university, provision of the necessary scientific literature, textbooks, the level of clinical (practical) training, in including the ability to participate in clinical examinations, rounds, consultations, training at the patient's bedside, in laboratories, conditions for conducting scientific research, the quality of feedback from teachers. The experts received answers about the teacher training programme, the financing of this training, the availability of certification in teaching methods for teachers.

In an interview with 8 employers (online) experts asked the following questions: participation in the development of the mission of the educational programme, what proposals were made to improve educational programmes, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction basic knowledge and skills of students and graduates of KazNMU, participation in teaching through mentoring, on the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, employment of graduates, etc.

The third day of the visit is 12/24/2020. The experts examined the documentation on the accredited educational programme both in electronic form using the links provided, and at the request of experts during a visit to KazNMU, which confirmed the compliance with accreditation standards (nomenclature of the department's affairs, plan for 5 years, annual plan for the 2019-2020 academic year and report for 2019, progress journal, EMCD, Code of ethics, etc., control and measuring instruments), including documentation at the request of EEC members : “Strategic indicators of Asfendiyarov KazNMU for 2019-2023 ”, Plan and Report of the Department of Economics and Finance, Report on the work of Atchabarov Research Institute of Physics and Mathematics, Information on clinical bases for the period from 2018-2019, 2019-2020; University clinical work report for 2020; Personnel policy of KazNMU; Alumni Career Centre documentation; results of feedback (questionnaires) on the organization of the educational process at the university from students, teaching staff, AMP, etc.).

In order to detail and confirm the necessary information on accreditation standards, interviews with Dean of the School of Medicine-1, MD Shopaeva G.A .; the head of the Centre for the Career of Graduates S.S. Kulzhakhanova; the leader Department of Clinical Work Tulepbaeva G. S .; the head of the B.A. Atchabarova T. Saliev; B.S. Kalenova, Head of the Digitalization Department; the head of the Department of distance educational technologies Botabekov N.K., as well as online and interviews with 10 employers.

Then a meeting of the EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of external assessment, study of documents, results of interviews, interviews, questionnaires was held. The members of the EEC started to design the final report of the EEC.

A meeting of EEC members was held. EEC members made generalizations of the results of the external evaluation. The experts individually completed the “Quality profile and criteria for external assessment of the bachelor's degree programme in the specialty “General Medicine” for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards”. No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the accredited educational programme were discussed. A draft report with recommendations was prepared.

Chairman of the EEC prof. A. Kuzgibekova held a final open vote on recommendations for KazNMU and a final vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Board. Then the chairman of the EEC for the management and employees of the educational organization announced recommendations based on the results of an external assessment as part of the accreditation of an educational programme in the specialty "Medicine".

Results of the survey. An observer from ECAQA on 20-21.12.2020 conducted an online survey of students and teachers of KazNMU on the resource [https://webanketa.com/...](https://webanketa.com/)

In total, responses were received from 400 (10% of all students) bachelors. In addition, the results of an independent student analysis on 78 questions, which was organized by the university itself, were analysed. The questionnaires included 78 questions. 600 bachelors in the specialty "General Medicine" answered.

The results of the questionnaire are presented in the appendix and, in general, demonstrate satisfactory management of educational programmes, positive aspects of the organization of training, satisfaction with training (72%) in key areas related to educational programmes: organization of the educational process, schedule, assessment methods, fair assessment of students, equipment of classrooms, availability of resources of clinical bases, library fund, communication with teachers and university management.

According to the results of the survey, it was found that the majority (more than 80%) of undergraduate students are to 1 degree or another satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms, classrooms at departments that teach in 1-3 courses and they are satisfied with the equipment and equipment of classrooms at clinical departments. According to the survey, 33% of the respondents are engaged in research work at the department. More than 2/3 of the respondents note that the library contains the educational literature on the disciplines recommended by the teachers. More than 90% of the students noted that teachers and employees of the educational organization are respectful of students.

The survey results identified areas for improvement (programmes of material and social support, improving the conditions of training and equipment, improving the quality of teaching by improving the qualifications of the teaching staff, provision of literature, corporate culture, improving conditions for mastering clinical skills, involving more students in scientific work, etc.). It is important to note that the results of the student survey obtained during the accreditation are similar to the results of the internal survey and the results of the independent student survey conducted in the summer of 2020. However, according to the results of the internal survey, the university has not developed measures to increase student satisfaction at KazNMU.

An important mechanism for improving the quality of the educational process is the satisfaction of the teaching staff. However, the results of the questionnaire allow us to identify areas of improvement for the teaching staff in order to improve their professional skills, motivation, enthusiasm in terms of improving the level of education both in junior and senior bachelor's courses.

360 faculty members of KazNMU were involved in the survey process, of which teachers of the therapeutic profile were 44.8%, the surgical teacher - 18.9%, the pediatric 1 - 6%. 7.15% were obstetricians-gynaecologists, doctors of functional diagnostics - 1.56%, teachers of other specialties - 20.7%. According to the results of the survey, it was found that more than 90% of the interviewed teaching staff were fully and partially satisfied with the organization of the educational process. Based on the results of the questionnaire, attention should be paid to improving the conditions for organizing the educational process at clinical sites.

Conclusion from the external evaluation:

Members of the EEC have carefully studied and assessed the main indicators of the accredited educational programme. The information received by external experts during the study of the self-assessment report, preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, implementation of the activities of the visit programme of KazNMU was analysed. All the information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, which made it possible to ensure the reliability of the information provided to KazNMU and supporting documents for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

Despite the fact that in the self-assessment report of the educational programme, KazNMU described its best practice in observing accreditation standards, during the external expert evaluation

by EEC members, 43 documents were studied, which allowed to confirm the compliance of the educational organization with the basic accreditation standards.

The EEC recommendations to improve the implementation of the Bachelor's degree programme in General Medicine and internships were presented at a meeting with the leadership on 12.24.

The programme of the 3-day visit of the external expert evaluation of the EEC has been fully completed. On the part of the KazNMU team, the participation of all persons indicated in the programme is ensured.

The external assessment and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-assessment report of the educational programme in full in accordance with the Regulations on the External Evaluation Commission, Guidelines, on external assessment, of the medical organization ECAQA education.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all necessary information and material resources of the accredited educational programme was organized.

4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the educational programme of bachelor's degree "General Medicine" of KazNMU and an overview of the strengths for each standard.

Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES

KazNMU has defined its mission, which was first formulated in 2012, revised in 2017. The latest revision of the university's mission, in connection with obtaining the status of a research university and the Development Programme for 2019-2023 was updated and approved by the Decision of the Supervisory Board of KazNMU (Protocol No. 1 dated 20.03.2019). The mission and vision of the Kazakh National Medical University (KazNMU) correspond to the charter of the educational organization, determine the main directions of the organization's activities and are presented in the document "Strategic indicators of Asfendiyarov KazNMU for 2019-2023 ", agreed with the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The current mission of the university reflects the educational strategy in accordance with the State Programme for the Development of Health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020-2025, the Strategic Development Plan of Kazakhstan until 2025 within the framework of the strategy "Kazakhstan 2050".

Mission and vision of Asfendiyarov KazNMU reflect social responsibility, understanding of the purpose and significance of the university in training competent Health care professionals both for the city of Almaty, the Almaty region, and for the country as a whole, and are consistent with the main directions of programme documents in the field of education, science and Health care.

The end results of student learning are reflected in the qualification characteristics of the graduate and are presented in the SCES of the specialty. Educational programmes are designed taking into account the Dublin descriptors: knowledge and understanding, application of knowledge and understanding, formation of judgments, learning skills or learning ability, communication skills. The educational programme 5B130100 "General Medicine" is compiled taking into account the social expectations of society for the intellectual, personal behavioural qualities and skills of the graduate, which determine his readiness for an independent life, productive professional activity in modern market relations in society.

The training of specialists in the field of Health care and pharmacy at the University is carried out at all levels of higher education in bachelor's, internship, residency, master's, PhD-doctoral studies in 89 educational programmes. 23 of them appeared in 2019, new ones are regularly developed, thanks to the autonomy provided to the university.

In 2019-2020, 13 agreements on cooperation and a memorandum of understanding were concluded with foreign educational, scientific and clinical organizations.

From the 2019-2020 academic year, strategically important in the development of medical schools is the implementation of the policy of allocating funds to schools / faculties, which independently draw up a budget, plan financial income and expenses in accordance with the implementation and strategic directions of the school / faculty development.

At the university, considerable attention is paid to compliance with the standards of conduct and the Code of Academic Integrity of students

As part of the implementation of the KazNMU mission, a system for collecting and analysing feedback from various stakeholders through internal and external monitoring was introduced. Feedback results are taken into account when planning improvement work.

Expanding the circle of stakeholders makes it possible to more accurately assess the university's activities and improve the process of continuous improvement in the formulation of mission and goals. Cooperation with all stakeholder groups helps the university to achieve the goal of forming and implementing corporate ethics standards, creating a scientific, socio-cultural, healthy corporate environment, and trust in the Health care system.

Strengths:

1. More than 90 years of experience in teaching students and a solid reputation among Kazakhstani universities (rating, QS).
2. Updating the university's mission and educational programme in connection with obtaining the status of the National Research University.
3. Clearly defined learning outcomes, developed in accordance with the regulatory requirements and the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, ensuring the formation and development of relevant competencies in graduates, who are employed in 94%.
4. Strategic partnership with a European university and a wide geography of international cooperation, contributing to the high quality of the implementation of the accredited educational programme.
5. University governance system within the framework of academic freedom.
6. Joining the League of Academic Integrity.

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out 12 standards conform: completely - 8, significantly -1, partially -3, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 1: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Improve the conditions for organizing the educational process at clinical sites, providing teachers with a sufficient number of office equipment.

2) Regularly develop an action plan for improvement based on the results of feedback from stakeholders.

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

Undergraduate studies are characterized by integrity, continuity, consistent study of disciplines; the principle of prerequisites and post requisites is observed. Academic disciplines are distributed by cycles of general education, basic and major disciplines, and are also presented in the framework of training modules... The educational programme is designed in accordance with the principles of equality in relation to students regardless of gender, nationality, religion, socio-economic status and taking into account physical capabilities. There is no discrimination in the programme based on age, religion, gender, national origin, etc.

The structure of the educational programme implies a gradual deepening in the study from norm to pathology throughout the entire period of study. This is implemented on the basis of the principle of a modular approach to teaching, the integration of disciplines both horizontally and vertically.

Integrated education for 1-3 courses involves the sequential study of fundamental students (normal and pathological anatomy, normal and pathological physiology, histology, visual diagnostics, pharmacology) with knowledge and practical skills acquired in clinical disciplines, the first of which

is propaedeutics of internal diseases. This methodology of integrated modular training allows the formation of competencies in clinical disciplines based on basic biomedical competencies.

The educational programme is regularly updated with new data on modern advances in behavioural and social sciences, as well as medical ethics.

Integration with clinical disciplines is carried out by including clinical situations in the learning process (situational tasks), using test tasks with a clinical bias. Teaching methods and the proportion of passive and active methods are determined taking into account the level of education (bachelor's degree, internship).

Within the framework of clinical training, early contact of students with patients is ensured and their acquisition of sufficient clinical knowledge and skills in order to assume appropriate clinical responsibility after graduation in the study of clinical disciplines, educational and industrial practices.

At the same time, along with traditional methods, innovative teaching methods are actively used, which are practice-oriented and teaching using Web-technologies, training through research has also been introduced - 3 course "Research project on social determinants of health "(3 credits), "Science Project on Additional Skills" (3 credits). 5 course - "Observational clinical trials in therapy "(3 credits), "Observational clinical trials in pediatric "(3 credits)," Observational clinical trials in surgery "(3 credits)," Observational clinical trials in obstetrics and gynaecology "(3 credits), participation of students "Fairs of scientific student circles", UIRS, SRWS).

To improve the quality of practical training, there is a Simulation Centre equipped with modern equipment.

Individualization of training is realized through the formation of a student's educational trajectory (selection of electives from the catalogue of elective disciplines for various areas of training).

Students are members of various advisory bodies (the committee of educational programmes, the Academic Committee of the Senate (until the 2019-2020 academic year - the Academic Council), the Senate of KazNMU), where they actively participate in the discussion and development of the educational programme.

During their internship training, in order to acquire a broader clinical experience with patients of various profiles, interns in the areas of training go to large regional centres (Taldy-Korgan, Kyzyl-Orda, Taraz, Uralsk, Petropavlovsk, Ust-Kamengorsk), where they practice in regional clinical hospitals under the direction of the heads of clinical departments.

KazNMU regularly assesses the degree of employers' satisfaction with university graduates to identify the correspondence of the educational programme to the real requirements of the labour market, opportunities for its improvement.

Strengths:

1. The use of innovative effective learning technologies that contribute to the achievement of the final learning outcomes.
2. Application in the educational process of modular technology, integrated, interdisciplinary training; ensuring the continuity of all levels of education.
3. Inclusion in the educational programme of the bachelor's degree disciplines aimed at mastering and developing the skill of research work.
4. Student-centeredness and practical orientation and dynamism of the educational programme in accordance with the changing needs of the labour market, feedback received from all stakeholders.

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out of 25 standards conform: fully - 20, significantly - 5, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 2: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Increase the activity of advisers, improve the awareness of students and teachers about the choice of an individual educational path.

2) To intensify the work of the committees of educational programmes aimed at improving the organization of the educational process at the university.

Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS

The university adheres to the requirements of the state standard, which reflects the forms and methods of monitoring students' knowledge, including testing, oral questioning, interview, midterm control, laboratory work, passing practical skills, the number of exams. The University is independent in choosing the forms, order and frequency of current and final monitoring of students' progress, in accordance with Article 28, Clause 7 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education".

From the 2017-2018 academic year, the University switched to filling in electronic journals on the SIRIUS platform, where students' grades for all types of control are timely recorded (which contributes to transparency in scoring) and the admission rating and final exam score are automatically calculated.

Assessment of educational achievements of students is carried out on the basis of the final learning outcomes prescribed in the educational programme "General Medicine", the syllabus of each department / module, and is implemented in various forms: control questions, tasks in test form (MCQs, tasks with multiple correct answers) , situational tasks, clinical situations, oral survey, written exam, essay, portfolio, case management assessment, 360 ° assessment, mini-clinical / clinical exam, OSPE, OSCE. Together with traditional forms of control and assessment, standardized assessment methods, assessment sheets / checklists for assessment, containing clear and specific assessment criteria and aimed at motivating students to learn, have been introduced and are used. With the simulation centre of the university, where, along with the usual assessment methods, new assessment methods are being worked out when conducting interactive teaching methods - TBL, CbD, PBL, CBL, which significantly brings the development of skills closer to real conditions.

New assessment methods are being developed, involving the involvement of external examiners (employers, representatives of government organizations, medical associations, etc.), a procedure for documenting, studying assessment methods, analysis their reliability and validity.

Students can familiarize themselves with the instruction on the system for assessing educational achievements on the University website

Intermediate certification of students is carried out in accordance with the educational programme, working curricula, academic calendar. In connection with joining the League of Academic Integrity of the Republic of Kazakhstan, in order to minimize corruption risks in assessing students, the balance between written and oral exams has been revised towards an increase in written work (up to 65%). The programmes "Antiplagiat", "Turnitin" are actively used.

For the final certification of undergraduate and internship graduates, the OSCE exam format is used, including with standardized patients. The student, in case of disagreement with the result of the exam, has the right to submit an application for appeal. The rules for the appeal are defined in the "Academic policy of KazNMU".

The transfer of students from course to course is carried out by them achieving an average grade point (GPA) not lower than the established.

Students have the opportunity to express their opinion on the methods of assessment at the university at the level of departments, dean's offices, as well as by participating in a survey at the university level.

Strengths:

1. A system for evaluating educational programmes through the involvement of stakeholders, starting with departments, the committee of educational programmes, the Academic Council, external expert evaluation and the participation of employers' representatives on examination boards and audits.
2. Electronic system "Sirius", providing transparency and speed of recording the results of student assessment.

3. Application of the Turnitin programme.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria Out 4 standards conform: completely - 4, significantly -0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 3: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: not

Standard 4: STUDENTS

The student admission policy complies with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", "Model rules for admission to universities in Kazakhstan" developed by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan social obligations and needs in the field of public health protection.

The main method for selecting applicants for admission is the results of the competition for awarding State educational grants of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan has established admission quotas for orphans and children left without parental care, disabled people of I and II groups, persons equated in benefits and guarantees to war veterans and war invalids, invalids from childhood, disabled children, for persons of Kazakh nationality who are not citizens of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The right for foreigners to receive free higher education at a competitive basis in accordance with the state educational order is determined by international treaties of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

When revising the student admission policy, the opinion of all stakeholders is taken into account, for example, special grants from akims of the region, districts, and the health department. The practice of transferring students from other universities is regulated by the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 30.10.2018

At KazNMU, the student support programme includes: scholarships to holders of an educational grant, personal scholarships, social support for various categories of students, a personal growth programme, a student health programme funded from KazNMU funds.

Based on the results of examination sessions, students are awarded a scholarship in accordance with the Rules for the payment of state scholarships for certain categories of students in educational institutions (order No. 116 of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 07.02.2008).

For the socially unprotected category of students at the university, free meals are organized in the university canteens, material assistance is allocated, provision of disabled students, as well as students from among children - orphans, with rooms in a student hostel without competition. Student activists who study on a contractual basis are provided with tuition discounts.

Students are provided with hostels according to the established criteria of KazNMU.

Outpatient services for students of KazNMU and medical examination on the basis of the Centre for Primary Care and Diagnostics of KazNMU are carried out by the staff of clinical departments. Material assistance for students with tuberculosis in 2019-2020 academic year amounted to 17,961,650 tenge. In hostel No. 3, 6 rooms are allocated for tuberculosis patients: three for men and three for women.

The university has a sports complex of 1164.8 square meters, equipped according to modern standards, outdoor sports grounds of 1020 square meters, including a soccer field and a gym. University students participate in more than 15 sports sections and take part in sports competitions at various levels.

Students have free access to library funds, information resources and information technologies (simulation classes; interactive computer mannequins and simulators, etc.). Information support of students is carried out through the functioning of the university website www.kaznmu.kz, which includes 33 sub-sites.

AIS "Sirius" of KazNMU provides a Personal Account, which allows employees to automate their main tasks, students - to see the necessary information (grades, schedule, tasks etc.), conduct

internal correspondence and monitor the implementation of tasks; registration of students for elective disciplines, drawing up IEP, student's timetable, operational reporting. On the basis of Zoom, Microsoft Teams, Google Meet, Cisco Webex Meetings, classes, consultations of teachers and students are carried out in ONLINE modes.

Counselling and social support for students is coordinated by Youth Policy Department The organization of educational work is carried out in accordance with the Comprehensive Plan of Educational Work of the University

The university has 25 student organizations, creative teams and sports sections. The system of student self-government is developed (student government, student dean's offices, student trade union). The faculty uses all the main directions, forms and methods of organizing educational work, adopted in universities. The work plans of the dean's office and departments contain a section of educational work with students. Reports of educational work are considered once a year at meetings of the University Senate.

Strengths:

1. Creation of a favorable environment at the university for the development of creative, sports and other abilities;
2. Creation of conditions for the activity of the student community, including self-government committees with representation in all advisory bodies of the university.

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out of 14 standards conform: fully - 13, significantly - 1, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 4: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) To improve the monitoring of the employment of graduates in the specialty "General Medicine", to provide a qualitative analysis of feedback from graduates and employers on the quality of training in accordance with the Resolution No. 390 of 03/30/2012.
- 2) Strengthen the role of the KazNMU Alumni Association in strengthening the image of the university.

Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF / FACULTY

The "Personnel policy of KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov" is being implemented, which reflects the priorities for the formation of human resources and criteria for the selection of personnel, including the scientific, pedagogical and clinical merits of candidates. The personnel policy of schools / faculties of the specialty "General Medicine" is fully consistent with the personnel policy of the university. Developed by the "Qualification requirements for the positions of teachers of KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov" (order of the rector No. 281 of 15.06.2020).

In their work, teachers are guided by the Teacher's Code of Honor.

The selection of personnel for the vacant positions of teachers is carried out on a competitive basis in accordance with the Labour Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" and the Rules for the competitive replacement of positions of the teaching staff and scientific workers of KazNMU.

The calculation of the teaching load of the teaching staff is made in accordance with external regulations and orders of KazNMU. The therapeutic load of teachers is regulated by the "Regulations on the therapeutic load of teachers of the departments of clinical disciplines of the NJSC KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov", 2019.

Monitoring of the responsibilities of the faculty is provided by intra-department control, control by the committee of educational programmes.

The total number of teachers is formed on the basis of the average ratio: students and teachers - 6: 1; undergraduates and teachers 4: 1; doctoral students and teachers - 3: 1.

In accordance with the current legislation, teachers and other categories of workers are given additional payments to wages for a qualification category, for an academic degree, according to working conditions - for harmfulness.

As part of the employee motivation programme, the University has introduced a rating system for assessing the activities of teachers, including a cash bonus for publication in journals with a high impact factor in accordance with the Regulations on material incentives.

In order to provide social support for teachers and employees, the following are defined: benefits for medical care in the Professorial Clinic No. 3 of KazNMU and the Institute of Dentistry of KazNMU.

The University has a Regulation on nominating university employees for awards, and a commission for awards is functioning.

Professional development of teachers takes place both at the university and in other educational institutions. KazNMU teachers studying on a paid basis at the Institute of Additional and Professional Education of KazNMU were provided with a 50% discount of the total cost of training, according to the Decision of the Economic Council, protocol No. 17 of 05/30/2018.

Strengths:

1. The activities of teachers are based on the "Teacher's Code of Honour".
2. A significant proportion of teachers were trained in distance teaching methods to improve quality in a pandemic (March - August 2020).

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out of 5 standards conform: completely - 2, significantly -2, partially - 1, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 5: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Improve the mechanisms for motivating teachers, including the payment of incentive bonuses for clinical work.

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

For continuous improvement of the material and technical base, the necessary funds are allocated from the university budget, which are spent on: major and current repairs, technical equipment for educational, scientific and information activities, the purchase of furniture and educational equipment, maintenance of engineering communications and networks of buildings and structures, and registration of buildings and structures. At the same time, it is necessary to update the computer equipment at clinical departments to provide distance learning. In addition, there is an insufficient number of training rooms in clinical departments....

In order to improve the educational process, more than 50 replicas of VI-generation robotic mannequins of realism and other equipment were additionally purchased. In total, the Simulation Centre has more than 500 items of equipment, of which interactive and high-tech are (10%) including simulators, simulators, mannequins, dummies, materials for simulators.

At the expense of budgetary and non-budgetary funds, reconstruction and repair of about 90% of buildings and dormitories of the university, as well as 100% of the territory of the university, were carried out.

Every year the library subscribes over 300 titles of newspapers and magazines and receives over 60 thousand copies of periodicals. The operability of the electronic library system is constantly maintained. The electronic literature fund is 11 958 copies, of these: e-books - 9001 copies, video lectures - 22 copies, 7976 copies of CD. To increase the availability of the necessary literature in the context of distance learning, 138 textbooks and 231 educational and methodological complexes of disciplines were scanned.

The university provides access to leading databases (Cochrane Library; Web of Science; MEDLINE Complete; ClinicalKey (Elsevier), etc.).

The scientific library began work in the Sirius programme in the Library Module, which made it possible to serve readers through their personal account, without visiting the library.

The Testing Centre (area is 720 sq.m.) has 192 computers, video surveillance is organized. When the hall is fully loaded, students note an inappropriate sanitary and hygienic state in terms of temperature, humidity, ventilation, etc. In the period before the pandemic, the workload of the test centre was daily from 8.00 to 18.00, while the centre employs 4 employees and is involved as observers of the testing process teachers of departments.

In order to implement the state policy for the development of medical science, the Atchabarov Scientific Research Institute of Fundamental Medicine functions. The implementation of research works, scientific and technical programmes and various competitive projects at the university was carried out in 52 programmes, 42 of which have now been completed. The sources of research funding were the funds of the state budget of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, intra-university grants, funds of international organizations, as well as through the development of partnerships with the private sector (Kazekoproekt LLP).

The university includes leading research institutes and scientific centres in the main areas of medicine (Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology, Scientific Centre for Obstetrics, Gynaecology and Perinatology, Scientific Centre for Pediatric Surgery, Scientific Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Medicine, National Scientific Centre of Surgery named after A.N.Syzganov), which allows to strengthen the research activities of teachers and students.

KazNMU cooperates with 140 universities, research centres and organizations from near and far abroad countries, including TOP-500 universities, implementing joint scientific, research and educational projects. The following programmes are being actively implemented: "Academic mobility of students" and "Visiting professor of KazNMU".

Strengths:

1. Consolidation of KazNMU with large research centres, which contributes to improving the quality of clinical training, scientific research;
2. The simulation centre of the university has been almost completely updated and has no analogues in the Republic of Kazakhstan;
3. Availability of the information management system AIS Sirius, which makes it possible to effectively manage the administrative, organizational, accounting and analytical, methodological, educational process, including distance learning, access to library resources.

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out of 19 standards conform: fully - 8, significantly - 9, partially - 2, do not correspond - 0

Standard 6: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Improvement of material and technical equipment of clinical departments.
- 2) An increase in the number of classrooms at clinical departments.
- 3) Compliance with the requirements for providing a production environment in a testing centre.
- 4) Provide for the possibility of modernizing the library in accordance with modern requirements and an adequate sanitary and hygienic regime (lighting, humidity, temperature).

Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION

Evaluation of educational programmes is carried out in accordance with the Academic policy of the NJSC KazNMU (order of the rector No. 375 of 08/20/2020)., In the implementation of which departments, schools of medicine and other departments of the university are involved.

The monitoring and evaluation system of the educational programme covers all aspects of the organization, implementation and evaluation of the programme: development, approval of the programme, organization and conduct of the educational process, achievement of the final learning outcomes by students, analysis of the results of external and internal audit of educational programmes and the educational process at the university, analysis of feedback data connections from all participants in the educational process and stakeholders.

Monitoring of progress and attendance is carried out by the departments according to the schedule of classes, with the recording of data in the journal. Monitoring of the educational process includes monthly meetings of departments, where they discuss the implementation of the curriculum, the results of quality control of the educational process (discussion of practical classes, lectures, etc.). Intra-cathedral control by types of activity is carried out by the staff of the department in accordance with the Plan of the department, within the framework of mutual visits to training sessions.

Monitoring of the implementation of the programme is carried out by the responsible departments based on the results of midterm control, final certification, final state certification, analysis of the results of progressive testing, Independent examination of graduates, questionnaires with all interested parties, allowing to assess the achievement of the final learning outcomes. Monitoring of the implementation of the educational programme is also carried out within the framework of internal control and during the internal and external audit of the activities of teachers and students.

The Internal Audit Service was introduced. There is a project group “Assessment of the educational programme based on the final learning outcome”.

The analysis of the results of intermediate certification, the level of GPA of students, complex testing, OSCE is carried out an analysis of learning outcomes, the shortcomings and areas for improvement are identified. The process of improving the educational programme is also carried out on the basis of studying the results of feedback at the end of the study of theoretical, clinical disciplines in all courses of study. The report of the Chairman of the SAC / State Attestation Commission includes recommendations for improving the educational programme and its assessment. During the reporting period, there were no comments on the conduct of the SAC.

From the spring semester of 2019-2020 and the fall semester of the 2020-2021 academic years, in the context of a pandemic, training was carried out using distance learning technologies. The training sessions were conducted online in the format of video conferencing (ZOOM, Cisco Webex, Hangouts, etc. each department approves the protocol) and offline (communication between the teacher and the student was carried out asynchronously, through remote platforms dis.kaznmu.kz (Moodle) and / or Google Classroom, internal communication services, chats and forums. Consulting, seminars, oral control of students' knowledge, protection of reports are carried out online through a web conference on ZOOM platforms, Cisco Webex and other platforms. Distance learning was carried out in accordance with the approved in university with internal documents on distance education.

In the spring semester 2019-2020 years, all exams were held in a distance format and regulated by the relevant documents (SOP for oral examination in a DOT, SOP for DOT Written Exam). Also, for the quarantine period, a group was created for monitoring of the educational process using DOT (Order No. 31 of 03/20/2020, Appendix-1 to No. 31 of 03/20/2020).

Based on the results of an independent assessment of the knowledge and skills of interns, conducted by the National Centre for Independent Examination (NCEE) from 15 to 26 June 2020 graduates of the internship KazNMU (105 surgeons, 246 general practitioners, 129 paediatricians, 257 general practitioners and 41 obstetricians-gynaecologists) have successfully passed the final state certification... Employment rate of graduates in 2020 - 99.9%.

Strengths:

1. The presence of an academic policy and its annual updating, including mechanisms for evaluating the effectiveness, monitoring the educational programme with the involvement of a wide range of stakeholders.
2. Establishment of academic quality committees in schools / faculties.
3. High employment rate for graduates.

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out of 12 standards conform: fully - 10, significantly -0, partially - 2, do not correspond - 0

Standard 7: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) To intensify the work of the Committees of educational programmes in improving the organization of the educational process at the university.

Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

In connection with obtaining a new legal status in KazNMU, a new management structure of the university has been revised and developed.

KazNMU carries out its activities on the basis of constituent documents - a certificate of state registration, a statistical card, a certificate of registration with a tax authority, the Charter, a state license for educational activities, a state license for medical and medical activities.

Representatives of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, non-governmental organizations, business structures, medical organizations are included in the Supervisory Board (2016-2018), since 2019 - in the Board of Directors; representatives of practical health care and the public - to the Senate of KazNMU, the Council of the School of General Medicine, the Committee of educational programmes, the Final Attestation Commission.

The university constantly monitors and analyses the implementation of the Strategic Plan for 2019-2023 and the annual operational plan, the achievement of planned indicators of the university's activities for all types of activities.

Annually, the authorized body (MoH RK) approves a budget application for 3 years with the allocation of a state order. Based on the budget request, funds are allocated for the current year in terms of budget programmes. In addition to the state order, KazNMU provides paid services: educational - under contracts with individuals and legal entities, other types of licensed activities.

The distribution of financial resources, production and non-production assets required for the implementation of the educational programme "General Medicine" is carried out in accordance with the needs of structural units to ensure the effectiveness of the educational programme and the training of highly qualified specialists.

KazNMU effectively operates a system for monitoring the activities of the university, developed in accordance with the recommendations of international standards. All measurable indicators and characteristics of the quality of the university's work are divided into internal quality indicators used to manage processes, and indicators obtained after external examination (accreditation, licensing, audit, and other external procedures).

The regulatory framework that ensures the compliance of the quality management system with the requirements of international standards is the documents developed by the QMS department

Strengths:

1. University autonomy, allowing to create optimal conditions for the implementation of the educational programme;
2. The practice of self-distribution of funds by schools / faculties, the creation of prerequisites for their self-financing.

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out of 13 standards conform: fully - 6, significantly -5, partially - 2, do not correspond - 0

Standard 8: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: not

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

KazNMU regularly revises the organizational structure of management in accordance with the reform processes in the field of higher education and Health care in the Republic of Kazakhstan, changes in the practice of world educational management. Over the years, new structural divisions were created and added (Centres, Institutes, Schools, Scientific and Practical Control and Analytical Laboratories, etc.), the functional tasks of which were aimed at providing a system for monitoring the educational process. At present, in connection with the reorganization and creation of the NJSC "Asfendiyarov KazNMU", the organizational structure of the university has been revised.

The strategic development plan has also been updated several times since 2015. Currently, the Strategic Plan for 2019-2023 is being implemented, agreed and approved by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The University conducts monitoring and strategic analysis of the changing internal and external environment (expectations of consumers of educational services - students, employers; the needs of practical health care and society, in general; new challenges) and develops a corrective action plan for continuous improvement and improvement of KazNMU's work.

Under the control of the QMS department, the internal audit procedure of all departments of the university is regularly carried out

Changing the structure, revising functions in KazNMU is based on the mission, vision in a changing environment and the demands of consumers of educational services, practical health care, and other stakeholders. An important role in this aspect is played by the strategic partnership with the partner university LUHS (Lithuanian University of Health Sciences, Kaunas, Lithuania).

An indicator of the priority of further development of the infrastructure of the university, in order to improve the educational process and provide high-quality medical services to the population, is the decision to build a University clinic for 1400 beds.

The mechanism aimed at monitoring the implementation of the educational programme and the progress of students is constant feedback from students, teaching staff and employers. The questionnaire "Teacher through the eyes of a student", questionnaires that include questions about the expectations and actually acquired competencies of students, the environment for the implementation of the educational programme, the availability of information resources and conditions, the results of the analysis of the contents of the boxes of confidence reflect the mechanisms and degree of participation of participants in the educational process in monitoring the educational programme. However, the university does not analyse the data (there is only statistics) obtained during the survey, data on measures to improve the satisfaction of consumers (students, teaching staff, employers) in educational, scientific, clinical processes are not provided.

Strengths:

1. Financial independence of the School of General Medicine since 2019
2. The university designated 2021 as the year of quality in the educational process.

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out of 3 standards conform: completely - 2, significantly - 0, partially - 1, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 9: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Improve the feedback system from stakeholders with analysis of results and development of recommendations for improvement.

Thus, all 9 accreditation standards have been met, no inconsistencies in the fulfilment of the criteria of each of the basic accreditation standards in the process of analysing the self-assessment report and conducting the examination as part of the tasks of the external expert evaluation programme were found.

5. Recommendations for improving the educational programme of bachelor's degree in the specialty "General Medicine" KazNMU:

1. Improve the conditions for organizing the educational process at clinical sites, providing teachers with a sufficient number of office equipment.
2. Regularly develop an action plan for improvement based on the results of feedback from stakeholders.
3. Increase the activity of advisers, improve the awareness of students and teachers about the choice of an individual educational path.
4. Intensify the work of the committees of educational programmes aimed at improving the organization of the educational process at the university.
5. Improve the monitoring of the employment of graduates in the specialty "General Medicine", to provide a qualitative analysis of feedback from graduates and employers on the quality of training in accordance with the Resolution No. 390 of 03/30/2012.
6. Strengthen the role of the KazNMU Alumni Association in strengthening the image of the university.
7. Improve the mechanisms for motivating teachers, including the payment of incentive bonuses for clinical work.
8. Improvement of material and technical equipment of clinical departments.
9. An increase in the number of classrooms at clinical departments.
10. Compliance with the requirements for providing a production environment in a testing centre.
11. Provide for the possibility of modernizing the library in accordance with modern requirements and an adequate sanitary and hygienic regime (lighting, humidity, temperature).
12. Intensify the work of the Committees of educational programmes in improving the organization of the educational process at the university.
13. Improve the feedback system from stakeholders with analysis of results and development of recommendations for improvement.

6.Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Board

The members of the EEC came to a unanimous decision to recommend to the Accreditation Board to accredit the bachelor's degree programme in the specialty "General Medicine" for a period of 5 years

Chairman

Kuzgibekova Almagul Bolatovna



The foreign expert

Uryasev Oleg Mikhailovich



Academic expert

Chausheva Almagul G. A.



Academic expert

Ermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna



Representative of undergraduates

Khusainova Zhanar Janibekova



The observer of ECAQA

Umarova Makpal Aldibekova



Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the bachelor's educational programme in the specialty "General Medicine"

No. standard	Accreditation standards Number of evaluation criteria	BS / SU	Number of standards	Assessment			
				Totally corresponds	Significantly corresponds	Partially corresponds	Does not correspond
1.	MISSION AND END RESULTS	7/5	12	8	1	3	-
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	10/15	25	20	5		-
3.	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS	2/2	4	4			-
4.	STUDENTS	8/6	14	13	1		-
5.	ACADEMIC STAFF / FACULTY	2/3	5	2	2	1	-
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	9/10	19	8	9	2	-
7.	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	6/6	12	10		2	-
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	6/7	13	6	5	2	-
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	1/2	3	2		1	-
	Total	51/56	107	73	23	11	-

Appendix 2.

List of documents requested by EEC members within the framework of accreditation

#	Names of documents	amount	Date approved
1.	“Strategic indicators of Asfendiyarov KazNMU for 2019-2023. ”	1	
2.	Department of Economics and Finance plan	1	
3.	Department of Economics and Finance Report	1	
4.	Information on clinical bases for the period from 2018-2019, 2019-2020	1	
5.	University clinical work report for 2020;	1	
6.	Personnel policy of KazNMU;	1	
7.	Alumni Career Centre Documentation;	1	
8.	Roadmap for informatization 2021	1	02/07/2017
9.	Information on digitalization of the educational process	1	09/30/2020
10.	Assessment of the satisfaction of university employees for 2018, 2019	2	
11.	Questioning of students to determine the level of student satisfaction with the activities of the teaching staff of the departments for 2019	1	
12.	Report on the STRATEGIC PLAN of Asfendiyarov KazNMU for 2019.	1	
13.	Information on clinical bases for 2018-2019, 2019-2020, 2020-2021 academic years	1	
14.	EMCD on the discipline " General medical practice " on Google disk.	1	