To Accreditation Council of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care 07.06.2022

## REPORT

OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME 7R01112

"DERMATOVENEROLOGY (ADULT, CHILDREN'S)" OF THE NON-PROFIT JOINT-STOCK COMPANY "SEMEY MEDICAL UNIVERSITY" FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR POSTGRADUATE PROGRAMMES (SPECIALTY RESIDENCY) IN MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS

period of external expert evaluation: 23-25.05.2022

City of Semey, 2022

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	4
2.	General part of the final report	5
2.1.	Representation of the Non-Profit Joint Stock Company	5
	"Semey Medical University" and educational programme in the specialty -	
	7R01112 "dermatovenerology (adult, children's)"	
2.2.	Information on previous accreditation	7
2.3.	Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the self-assessment report of the	
	educational programme 7R01112 "dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" for	7
	compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education	
	programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and	
	conclusions	
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	8
3. 4.		8 14
	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion  Results of the survey of teachers and residents  Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an	_
4.	Results of the survey of teachers and residents	14
4.	Results of the survey of teachers and residents  Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an	14
4.	Results of the survey of teachers and residents  Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01112	14
4. 5.	Results of the survey of teachers and residents  Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01112  "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)"	14 15
4. 5.	Results of the survey of teachers and residents  Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)"  Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme 7R01112	14 15
4. 5. 6.	Results of the survey of teachers and residents  Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)"  Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)"	14 15 41
4. 5. 6.	Results of the survey of teachers and residents  Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)"  Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)"  Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	14 15 41 42
4. 5. 6.	Results of the survey of teachers and residents  Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)"  Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)"  Recommendation to the Accreditation Council  Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the	14 15 41 42
4. 5. 6.	Results of the survey of teachers and residents  Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)"  Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)"  Recommendation to the Accreditation Council  Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)"	14 15 41 42 43

## List of symbols and abbreviations

Abbreviation	Interpretation
AMP	administrative and managerial staff
BD	Basic disciplines
BHE	basic health education
PRS	point-rating system
Blueprint	lesson topic technical specification
EKR	East Kazakhstan region
University	Higher education institution
EEC	External expert commission
SAC	State Attestation Commission
CSVD	City skin and venereological dispensary
SCES	State Compulsory Educational Standard
JD	job description
DOPS	direct observ of procedural skills
ESUVO	unified system of accounting for higher education
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation
LIS	library information system
FSA	final state attestation
FSE	final state examination
IL	letter of Instruction
STIs	Sexually transmitted infections
Irbis	library information system
IMS	integrated management system
IEPI	Individual Educational Plan
CIS	Control and measuring system
CQAES	Committee for Quality Assurance in Education and Science
KMIS	Kazakhstan Medical Information System
CEP	Educational Programmes Committee
HCF	health care facility
LMS	learning management system KEYPS
MoH RoK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
LEB	Local Executive Bodies
MES RoK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MEP	Modular educational programme
MTE	material and technical equipment
mini-CEX	mini-Clinical Exam
MSF	360 Degree Rating
NJSC "SMU"	Non-profit joint-stock company "Semey Medical University"
RW	Research work
NLA	normative legal act
GED	General educational disciplines
RSVD	Regional skin and venereological dispensary
DQCME	Medical Education Quality Control Department
GM	"General Medicine"
EP	Educational programme
RO	registrar's Office
ATR	assessment of tolerance rating
OSPE	objective structured practical exam
	. · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·

OSCE	Objective Structured Clinical Exam
POT	project-oriented training
PD	Profiling Disciplines
TS	Teaching staff
POT	project-oriented training
PD	Profiling Disciplines
WC	Working Educational plan
REMC	Republican Educational and Methodological Section
CBL	Case-based- CBL learning
CbD	Case-based-discussion
CIPP model	c-content programme evaluation model; I - costs, investments; P - process
	and P – product
QMS	Quality Management System
SSS	Student Scientific Society
SU	Structural unit
SSG	student self-government
SP	standardized patients
SCORM-	international standard for e-learning courses
packages	
TEP	Typical educational plan
TBL	Team-based-learning
TUKMOS	Turkish National Standard of Medical Education
SC	Scientific Council
DHC	Health Care Department
SPE	School of Postgraduate Education

## 1. Composition of the external expert commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 17 dated 05.05.2022, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" of the Semey Medical University NJSC in the period from 23.05 to 25.05.2022, as follows:

order	Status as part	Full name	Regalia, position, place of work/place of			
№	of EEC		study, course, specialty			
1	chairperson	Zhanalina Bakhyt	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the			
		Sekerbekovna	Department of Surgical and Pediatric Dentistry			
			of NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University			
			named after Marat Ospanov"			
2	Foreign Expert	Ripp Evgeny	candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate			
		Germanovich	Professor, Head of the Accreditation			
			Simulation Center of the Institute of Medical			
			Education FSBI "National Medical Research			
			Center named after V.A. Almazov" of the			
			Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation,			
			Member of the Board of the Russian Society			
			for Simulation Education in Medicine			
			(RSSTM), Member of the Programme			
			Committee of RSSTM, Instructor of the			
			European Council on Resuscitation (ERC)			
3	Academic	Ulzhan	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor of			
	Expert	Tursunkulovna	the Department of Dermatovenerology of			
		Beisebaeva	NJSC "Asfendiyarov KazNMU "			
4	Expert –	Tuleutaeva Gulnara	Organizing physician - social hygienist of the			
	employer	Esenzhanovna	highest category, deputy chief physician of the			
	representative		PSE on the REM "Polyclinic No.1", Semey,			
			EKR HCD			
5	Resident	Amina Timurovna	Resident of the second year of study in the			
		Izmaeva	specialty "Ophthalmology" of NJSC "Medical			
			University of Astana"			

The observer for ECAQA is Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The work of the ECAQA was carried out in accordance with the Regulation of EEC (Order of the Director General of ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC on further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above–mentioned educational programme and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

## 2. General part of the final report

# 2.1 Introduction of NJSC "Semey Medical University" and the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)"

Organization name, legal form of ownership, BIN	Non-profit joint-stock company "Semey Medical University"
Management body	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Full name of the chief executive	Dyusupov Altai Akhmetkalievich
officer	
Created in	1953
Location and contact details	Region/region: East Kazakhstan region
	Postal code: 071400
	City: Semey
	Street: Abay Kunanbayev, 103
	Tel.: +7(7222)52-22-51
	Fax: +7(7222)56-97-55
	E-mail: smu@nao-SMU.kz
	University website: http: www.semeymedicaluniversity.kz
State license for educational	KZ50LAA00016373 dated June 20, 2019
activities in the residency (date,	
number)	
Information on branches,	- Regional Skin and Venereology Dispensary (Skin and
subsidiaries (if any)	Venereology Department of the City Multidisciplinary
	Hospital No.4), Ust-Kamenogorsk,
	- Regional skin and venereal medicine dispensary (skin and
	venereal medicine dispensary of the regional hospital named
	after G. Sultanov) Pavlodar.
Year of implementation of the	Year 2016
accredited educational programme	
(EP)	
Duration of training	2 years
Total number of graduates since the	11
beginning of EP implementation	
Number of residents on EP since the	4 residents
beginning of the current year	
Full-time trainers/	3

The implementation of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult , children's)" began at the Semey Medical University in September 2015, when the first enrollment of students was made. During the period of implementation of this educational programme, the total number of graduates was 11 residents. Thus, the contingent of students resident dermatovenerologists by years amounted to: 2015-2017-1 student, 2017-2019-1 student, 2018-2020-2 students, 2019-2021-7 students and in the 2021-2023 academic year 4 students were accepted.

The mission of NJSC Semey Medical University: "Training of outstanding doctors, scientists and leaders in the field of health care to provide high-quality medical care."

The mission of the educational programme in the specialty of the residency "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" is based on the Mission of NJSC "SMU": "Training of highly professional dermatovenereologists capable of meeting the needs of society in the provision of medical care, applying and developing advanced innovative technologies in medical practice, using the achievements of science, strengthening public health." Acquired knowledge, skills and abilities, based

on the principle of a patient-centered approach, will allow graduates of the residency to work professionally, both independently and as part of a multidisciplinary team in the context of PHC, an inpatient department of a skin and venereal medicine dispensary.

The programme of study in the specialty "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" includes the study of the main current problems of dermatovenereology, issues of differential diagnosis, diagnosis and modern methods of treatment according to clinical protocols. The educational programme also includes clinical training of the resident under the guidance of a clinical mentor (teacher) and independent work of the resident. Based on the principle of the trinity of education, science and clinics, dermatovenerologists will be able to plan, conduct scientific research with further publication of the results, and transfer their experience to the medical community. All residency teachers in "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" regularly improve their competencies by attending refresher (https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1DlsgkwTGdF9O\_UiCAgqlEcourses 1HL6YQThrM?usp=sharing). Responsibilities and duties of employees are reflected in job descriptions (https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/17XOGOdS7iNCDxtaOaW3xvUHLjZy\_vjUG?usp=sharing). The department employees have certificates and professional development certificates in such competencies as effective teaching at a medical university, communication (https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1qKvurkBdm6eFPZdOT8zetMTEZ0hqvKgU?usp=sharing). certified teachers All in the highest category in Dermatovenerology. are (https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1S4TCsfPmz2OiVcp13OV7\_M74HLOh1k-I?usp=sharing). To date, the degree of settling of the department is 50%.

Graduates who have completed training under this educational programme are 100% employed and successfully work in the medical and preventive organizations of East Kazakhstan region and other regions of the Republic. In addition, graduates of 2019 and 2020 Khalidulina Akzhan and Chelekenova Anar work as heads of stationary departments of the regional skin and venereal medicine dispensary of East Kazakhstan region. During the entire period of study, residents were actively involved in scientific work and scientific projects carried out at the Department of Dermatovenerology and Cosmetology. As a result of this activity, participation in scientific and practical conferences with oral, poster presentations, co-authorship in publications of theses and articles, including in journals recognized by the Committee for Quality Assurance of Education and Science (CQAES) of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In total, graduates of the specialty "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" published more than 10 theses and articles, took part in 4 scientific and practical conferences. All residents actively participated in social projects to conduct sanitary and educational work among the healthy population on the prevention of infectious diseases of the skin (scabies, mycosis) and infections transmitted mainly through sexual activity. They conducted medical examinations among children and adolescents.

## 2.2. Information on previous accreditation

The initial accreditation of the specialty "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" was carried out by the "Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating", a certificate of conformity was obtained for 5 years from June 19, 2016 to June 18, 2022 (No. AB1367).

# 2.3. Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the self-assessment report of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions

The self-assessment report on the educational programme in the specialty 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 93 pages of the main text, attachments on 15 pages, copies or electronic versions of 168 documents located at <a href="https://drive.google.com/drive/u/1/folders/1L9FwzBnUPRFSB-6z8qbvgyDwT2ZPfX5i">https://drive.google.com/drive/u/1/folders/1L9FwzBnUPRFSB-6z8qbvgyDwT2ZPfX5i</a>.

The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment

of the educational programme provided to the organization of education by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. Attached to the report is a cover letter signed by A.A. Dyusupov, Head, Chairperson of the Management Board, Rector, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, which confirms the reliability of quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 16 members of the internal self-assessment commission, indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme – A.B. Zhunusova, Director of the Department of Academic Work, Candidate of Medical Sciences.

The self-assessment of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" was carried out on the basis of the order of the head No. 41 dated February 9, 2022 "On approval of the composition of the Working Group for self-assessment and preparation for accreditation of educational programmes of the residency for compliance with the standards of specialized accreditation of educational programmes of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance of Education and Health Care (ECAQA)".

The report was reviewed by U.T. Beisebayeva, Accreditation Expert, and the reviews noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes. Thus, in the process of feedback from the representative of the educational organization, experts received answers to the questions that arose and the self-assessment report was amended accordingly and additions were made to the recommendations of the reviewers.

All standards include the real practice of NJSC "Semey Medical University" for the training of residents in the specialty 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)", taking into account the beginning of admission of students in 2015, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of knowledge and skills assessment, material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement.

The report is submitted to ECAQA in a completed form, with correction of the data on the above recommendations, written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criterion of standards, tables and contain references in the text and have end-to-end numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure, the external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during the visit to the educational institution, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

#### 3. External expert evaluation assessment

External expert work in the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the External Evaluation of Educational Organizations and Educational Programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care" No.5 dated February 17, 2017) and in accordance with the programme approved by order No. 17 dated May 5, 2022 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the Chairperson of the Board - Rector of NJSC "SMU" Dyusupov A.A. Dates of the visit to the organization: May 23-25, 2022.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the Programme), which is contained in the documentation of the accreditation center and in Attachment 3 to this report. The programme is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- interview with management and administrative staff 17 people in total;
- interviews with residents 19 students;
- study of the <u>website https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/obuchenie/obrazovatelnye-programmy/rezidentura/;</u>
- interviewing 20 employees, 18 teachers;
- questionnaires of teachers and residents 26 and 124, respectively;
- observation of residents' education: attending a practical lesson on the topic "Melanocytic neoplasms: congenital melanocytic nevus", Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department. Akhmetova Almira Kalikapasovna for 4 residents of dermatovenerologists in the cutaneous and venereological department of the city hospital No.2 of Semey, at the address: Bespaev str., 26, office 51, 2nd floor;
- review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards: visited the practice/clinical engagement database of the Skin and Venereal Medicine Department of the City Hospital No.2 of Semey, located at Bespaev str., 26, office 51, 2nd floor, where 4 residents are trained in the specialty 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" with the participation of 3 full-time teachers;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 165 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the units (the list of studied documents is in Attachment 2).

The staff of the accredited organization ensures the presence of all persons indicated in the visiting programme and according to the lists of interviews and interviews (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with EEC members

No	Full name	Job Title			
1	Altai Akhmetkalievich Dyusupov	Chairperson of the Management Board - Rector			
2	Tanatarova Gulnaz Nursoltanovna	Acting Deputy Chairperson of the Management Board for Academic and Educational Work			
3	Omarov Nazarbek Bakhytbekovich	Deputy Chairperson of the Board for Science and Strategic Development			
4	Turarova Elmira Merkhatovna	Head of Graduate and MF Employment (Residency)			
5	Manatova Almira Manatkyzy	Dean of the School of Postgraduate Education (residency)			
6	Kusainova Gulnara Zhomartovna	Head of Training Department			
7	Bekbolatova Mariya Adletkyzy	Deputy Dean of SPE			
8	Dzhobalayeva Bagym Sasanovna	residency methodologist			
9	Krykpayeva Saltanat Sayatovna	Head of Research Institute			
10	Dzhametdinova Ulzhan Slamovna	Head of the Department of Epidemiology and Biostatistics			
11	Baybusinova Assel Zhanartasovna	Head of the Department of Epidemiology and Biostatistics			
12	Yerkezhan Sayatovna Tursinkanbetova	Deputy Chairperson of the Management			

		Board for Organizational and Economic Work		
13	Kadirova Elmira Asylbekovna	Head of Human Resources Department		
14	Balashkevich Natalia Aleksandrovna	Acting Head of the Department of Medical		
1.7		Education		
15	Gulnara Tursyngazyevna Nurgaliyeva	Head of Clinic Department		
16	Malchenko Victoria Valerievna	Specialist of the Clinic Department		
17	Masabaeva Meruert Ravilievna	Chief Researcher, JESL		
1		Members		
1	Zhanaspaev M.A.	chairperson of the CEP residency		
2	A.K. Akhmetova	head of the Department of Dermatovenerology and Cosmetology		
3	Semenova Yu.M.	head of the Department of Neurology, Ophthalmology and Otorhinolaryngology		
4	G.A. Berekenova	head of the Department of Maxillofacial and Plastic Surgery		
5	F.F. Yagofarov	associate Professor of the Department of Infectious Diseases and Immunology of NJSC "SMU"		
6	Adilgozhina S.M.	assistant of the Department of Family Medicine		
7	Alibekova B.A.	assistant of the Department of Perinatology		
8	Kapakova M.A.	Assistant of the Department of Hospital Therapy		
9	Shakhanova A.T.	assistant of the Department of Faculty Therapy		
10	Toktarova Zh.Zh.	Assistant of the Department of Hospital Therapy		
11	Kazymov E.M.	assistant of the Department of Cardiovascula and Thoracic Surgery		
	Er	nployers		
1	Raushan Kusainovna Kikimbayeva	deputy Medical Director of the University Hospital (UH)		
2	Zhanara Degelenovna Zhunusova	Head of the Polyclinic of the Skin and Venereology Department of the City Hospital No.2 of Semey		
3	Kairat Salimbekovich Mausymbayev	doctor of the polyclinic of the skin and venereal medicine department of the city hospital No.2 in Semey (clinical mentor of residents)		
4	Sandybaeva Mensulu Yexanovna	director of the SEMEYOFTUM Ophthalmology Clinic		
5	Buleukhanova Roza Tusupzhanovna	candidate of Medical Sciences, Director of the Medical Center (MC) "Zhan-Er"		
6	Bekbayev Marat Kozhakhmetovich	chief Physician of the State Enterprise on the Right of Economic Management "Polyclinic No.4 of Semey" of the DHC of East Kazakhstan region		
7	Almenova Nailia Sapanovna	Chief physician of the polyclinic No. 3 in Semey		

F71 - F71 11 11 11	TT 1 CD 1 11 1 N 7 7 C			
Zhanat Tursyngaliyevna Moldagaliyeva	Head of Polyclinic No.7 in Semey			
Baltakaeva Almagul Kabiyevna	chief Doctor of the Central Hospital of the			
	Abai District, village of Guard			
Dyusekenova Gulzhazira Kinayatovna,	Head of the Neonatal Service of the Perinata			
	Center (PC) in Semey.			
Abeshova Asiya Mukhametkarimovna,	head of the Department of Neonatal			
	Pathology, Semey PC			
Galiya Aytchanovna Alibekova.	Deputy Director for Medical Work, EMH			
Popov Sergey Alexandrovich	Chief Physician, City Hospital No. 4, Ust-			
	Kamenogorsk			
Abdieva Zagripa Tokenovna	freelance chief pulmonologist of the			
	Department of Health care (DHC) of East			
	Kazakhstan region			
Azimbaeva Indira Muslimkhanovna	director of Hippocrates Medical Center,			
	Semey			
Duman Medeuov	Director of the Renal Center in Semey			
Nail Sergalievich Smailov	Head of the Neurosurgical Department of the			
	UH			
	Dyusekenova Gulzhazira Kinayatovna,  Abeshova Asiya Mukhametkarimovna,  Galiya Aytchanovna Alibekova.  Popov Sergey Alexandrovich  Abdieva Zagripa Tokenovna  Azimbaeva Indira Muslimkhanovna  Duman Medeuov			

Thus, when implementing the activities of the programme, namely, according to the results of the interview with the first head of the organization, the Chairperson of the Board, the Acting Deputy Chairperson of the Board for Academic and Educational Work, the Deputy Chairperson of the Board for Science and Strategic Development, the Deputy Chairperson of the Board for Organizational and Economic Work, the Head of the Department of Employment of Graduates and MF, the Dean of the School of Postgraduate Education, the Head of the Training Department, the Head of the Research Institute, the Head of the Department of Personnel Management, the employees of the units and the Head of the Department of Employment of Graduates and the Medical Foundation, the Head of the Department of the Clinic, the employees of the JESL, members of the advisory bodies: the CEP of the Residency, in interviews with residents and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **Standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the organization, took part in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, while the mission was brought to the attention of potential residents through the website, social networks, information letters to medical organizations. The Programme for the development of NJSC "SMU" for 2020-2024 was reviewed, which includes such areas as "Promotion of public health" and "Entry into the top-700 universities of the world according to the QS version", which confirms the implementation of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization. From interviews with residents, it was established that before the beginning of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the organization of education, tell where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, training bases. This indicates compliance with Standard 2 in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents.

The organization's documents contain work programmes, EMCD, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, independent work. Compliance with the SCES and standard requirements has been established. Attending a practical lesson on the topic "Melanocytic neoplasms: congenital melanocytic nevus" (1 academic hour) and a practical lesson at a polyclinic reception, experts received convincing data that the training is carried out according to the plan, before the beginning of the lesson, residents respond to tests, receive feedback from the teacher, have the opportunity to improve their skills in dermatovenerology. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, since the experts studied the code of ethics G 041.03/04.05.01-2019 dated 01.04.2019 and during the interview the residents replied that they were informed about the content of this document.

In an interview with residents, experts saw that the organization promotes the development of practical competencies of residents, including on simulation equipment. At the same time, residents deepen their theoretical knowledge, develop communication skills.

The analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in advisory disciplines are taken into account, additions are made to the bibliography of the EMCD and syllabuses, and teachers apply them in classes.

The study of control and measuring tools (600 tests of the database of test tasks, 100 KEYPS tests, 50 clinical tasks) showed that the organization has implemented a proper evaluation policy that allows a comprehensive assessment of the educational achievements of residents. During the interview, the residents spoke about the forms of assessment, for example, assessment sheets for solving situational problems, assessment sheets for performing practical skills and that they are satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from teachers. The system of appealing the results of the assessment is reflected in the "Regulation on the conduct of the appeal" G-041.03.23-2020 dated May 29, 2020, and during the period of work of the organization of education, there were no precedents for the appeal. Thus, compliance with standard 3 has been established.

During the visit to the organization and during the interview with an employee, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department A.K. Akhmetova, the commission made sure that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and employees, and includes such documents as annual operational plans, annual reports, regulations of divisions, contracts with teachers and residents, individual plans of teachers and educational and methodological documentation (work programme, work curricula, syllabuses, journals), evaluation tools (checklists, sheets), certificates, portfolio of residents. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the necessary documents for residents "Regulations on the portfolio", "Regulations on residency" of NJSC "Semey Medical University", "Policy of academic honesty", etc., and there is up-to-date information that is regularly updated.

The conversation with the teachers of the department included such issues as the content of the educational programme, the formation of a catalog of elective disciplines, methods for evaluating residents, the sufficiency of clinical bases and their material and technical equipment, the amount of hours for academic mentors, requirements for clinical mentors, scientific research and publication activity of resident dermatovenereologists, the implementation of academic mobility of teachers and residents, etc., and allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical bases for teaching (3 people in total), about the strategy and tactics of recruitment of residents, the information security of the educational programme, as well as to identify problems in the management and development of human resources, since most clinical mentors do not have sufficient knowledge of teaching and evaluation methods.

An interview with 3 teachers showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of education, depending on the specific base (admission of residents to equipment, a sufficient number of thematic patients, time to maintain medical records, independent work). Experts received answers about the programme of professional development of teachers, financing of this training, availability at teachers of certification on methods of teaching.

On the same day, experts studied materials on the admission of residents and the selection of teachers and established compliance with **standard 4.** 

In order to verify the data of **Standard 5**, external experts received an opinion on personnel policy and approaches to the development of pedagogical and professional competence of teachers, motivation to work with residents, so, at the end of the 2021-2022 academic year, Associate Professor A.K. Akhmetova was recognized as the "Best Mentor in Residence"; mentoring; academic mobility of teachers, mainly with Russia (Ryazan). Experts found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature, work with medical documents, the implementation of an individual plan, the implementation of sanitary and educational work among the population, academic mobility of residents.

During the visit to clinical bases, a survey of resources was carried out, their compliance with training programmes, accessibility for teachers and residents, as far as this equipment is modern and meets the needs of students and practical health care. Experts obtained evidence of compliance with Standard 6, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report.

In order to validate the implementation of the data of the self-assessment report and obtain evidence about the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with residents in the specialty Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)". Experts asked questions about satisfaction with training; availability of necessary literature and equipment; sufficient time for patient supervision and availability of patients with various dermatological pathologies, work in medical information systems (Damumed) with medical documentation; satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers; social and moral support for residents in need, participation in the "Journal Club", accessibility of international databases of professional specialized literature. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization for the accredited specialty, as they believe that the organization of education has good resources, image and international relations, at the same time, residents would like more independence in the management of patients, encouraging the achievements of residents through the mechanism of a flexible system of tuition fees.

Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering the questions of external experts, demonstrated their judgments on the organization of training, the formation of a catalog of elective disciplines, assessment of their skills, advisory support, the ability to participate in research, support for publications, financing participation in scientific and practical conferences. Members of the External Expert Commission (EEC) Experts studied the documents of residents (portfolio, results of assessment of residents - checklists, results of questionnaire of residents).

Interviews with 16 employers were conducted online and included such questions as: knowledge of the university's mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals to the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and formation clinical thinking, interaction with departments and the university as a whole, 100% employment of residency graduates, etc.

A review of resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, the clinical base of the skin and venereology department of the multidisciplinary city hospital No. 2 of Semey with a round-the-clock hospital for 15 beds and 30 day beds and a polyclinic for 250 visits were visited, and employees of the educational organization provide collegial and ethical relations with medical staff, the management of the clinical bases for achieving the final results of residents. A sufficient number of thematic patients, modern equipment and demonstrates accessibility to students are provided, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and mentors (mentors) provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during the training.

During the visit, the residents demonstrated the skills of taking an outpatient patient, using a scorecard, where they were able to demonstrate the skills of examining a dermatological patient with skin neoplasms and using modern equipment (Dermatoscope) for the early detection and diagnosis of melanocytic skin neoplasms. A mini-library of the Department of Dermatovenereology with rare editions in the specialty "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)", both in Kazakh, Russian and English languages, has been demonstrated. During the open class, residents demonstrated discussion skills, ability to make independent decisions, sufficiency of theoretical knowledge, actively discussed clinical cases. Teachers of the department demonstrated on the KEYPS platform test tasks, the formation of formative and summative assessment of residents.

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. The final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of the interview, questionnaires was held. EEC members started designing the final EEC report. The results of the external evaluation are summarized. Experts individually completed the "Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed and the Chairperson Zhanalina B.S. held a final open vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all the necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the NJSC "SMU", the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the members of the EEC.

At the end of the programme of the visit, the chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the organization of education announced recommendations on the results of an external assessment within the framework of specialized accreditation.

#### 4. Results of the survey.

An observer from the ECAQA conducted an online survey on the resource in the period 23-25.05.2022 https://webanketa.com/.

Results of the resident survey: total number of respondents –124.

Fully (75%) and partially (18.55%) satisfied with the conditions and equipment of the teaching rooms, classrooms of the university. This university will be recommended as an organization of education – 87.9% fully agree, partially -8.87%. 83.06% of respondents fully agree and 15.32% partially agree that programme managers and teaching staff are aware of their learning problems.

According to 83.6% (fully) and 12.1% (partially) of office equipment is available for use on the basis of practice. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes - fully agree 83,6%, partially – 14,52%. Various teaching methods are used in the education of students, but more often - analysis of situational problems (88.46%), work in small groups (61.54%), oral surveys and topic analysis (50%), also problem-oriented learning (34.62%), test solution (73.08%), case analysis (88.46%), less often - written completion of tasks (7.69%). Completely according to 73.08% that this questionnaire will be useful for the development of recommendations for improving the university and educational programmes of the residency, 19.23% partially agree with this.

Fully (86.29%) and partially (8.87%) satisfied with the library collection and resources. 91.94% of respondents have access to electronic educational resources and 6.45% believe that partially.

According to 81.45%, the organization of clinical training fully satisfies them, and 16.13% partially. The majority of respondents (96.15%) fully agree, and 3.85% partially agree that students have free access to patients at the clinical bases of the university and to the resources of the practice bases. Satisfied completely (88.71%) and partially (10.48%) with the methods of teaching. There is sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.) – 94.35% fully agree, 5.65% partially. Satisfied with the methods of assessing my knowledge and skills –92.74% completely agree, partially 7.26%. According to 88.71% of teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods regularly, and according to 0.81% - rarely.

According to 91.94% of respondents, teachers constantly provide feedback after completing classes, but according to 4.03% - sometimes and 1.61% - rarely. 91.13% are completely satisfied that they study at the university, 8.06% are partially satisfied, -0.81% of respondents are disappointed. The university allows you to improve or acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the chosen specialty, 94.35% are confident, 0.81% are not sure, 3.23% cannot give an answer, 0.81% would like to believe it, 0.81% began to doubt it. Fully (94.5%) and partially (93.55%) satisfied with the

organization of teaching at the NJSC "SMU".

In the organization there is an opportunity for career growth and development of competence of teachers - fully agree 88.46%, partially – 11.54%. In this educational institution, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research – fully agree 80.77%, partly 19.23%. 88,46% of respondents are completely satisfied with work of personnel service, partially –7,69%. Unfortunately, 7.69% did not answer the question of whether the university supports the teacher in participating in international and national events, and 30.77% did not address this to the management or the relevant administrative staff of the university.

26.92% do not know about the implementation of social programmes to support teachers and 3.85% of respondents doubt their availability. The management and administration systematically listen to the opinion of teachers -76.92%, sometimes -0% of the respondents.

According to 85.48% of respondents, accreditation is a necessary mechanism for improving educational programmes, but 8.06% believe that it is not necessary to carry out and 5.65% doubt the answer. The work of the EEC was assessed as positive -92.74%, satisfactory -4.84%.

Thus, the results of the survey showed a high percentage of respondents' satisfaction with the organization of the educational process at the university.

5. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)"

# **Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES Evidence of compliance:**

## 1.1 Mission statement and deliverables

The mission of the educational programme of the residency **7R01112** "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" is based on the mission of the Semey Medical University - "Training of outstanding doctors, scientists and leaders in the field of health care for the provision of high-quality medical care" (<a href="https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/o-nas/">https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/o-nas/</a>). The mission of the educational programme in the specialty of the residency "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" is based on the Mission of NJSC "SMU": "Training of highly professional dermatovenerologists capable of meeting the needs of society in the provision of medical care, applying and developing advanced innovative technologies in medical practice, using the achievements of science, strengthening public health care."

As a result of meetings and interviews with teachers, employers, residents and graduates of the educational programme, it was possible to establish that, based on the principle of the trinity of education, science and clinic, graduates of dermatovenerology, taking into account the patient-centered approach, will be able to work professionally both independently, in the polyclinic of the skin venereal medicine dispensary (SVD), and as part of a multidisciplinary team in the context of PMHC, as well as in the inpatient departments of SVD; plan, conduct a scientific study with the publication of results, transfer their experience to the medical community.

The educational programme for discussion with the heads of departments of skin and venereal medicine dispensaries in Semey and East Kazakhstan region is published on the website of the university\_(https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/obuchenie/obrazovatelnye-programmy/rezidentura/). The study of the documentation showed that the content of the mission of the educational programme

The study of the documentation showed that the content of the mission of the educational programme of the residence in the specialty "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" is based on the analysis of the needs of public health and the medical care system. Within the framework of the existing need for qualified specialists in the field of dermatovenerology both in the East Kazakhstan region and throughout the Republic of Kazakhstan, this Mission was formulated. The content of the mission and the educational programme in general were presented to external stakeholders, discussed at an enlarged meeting of the department (Minutes No.11a dated 14.07.2021) (https://drive.google.com/file/d/1UTB - roi 1sZ7yDiE UYEqYAgqc2djM/view?usp=sharing).

The educational programme of the residency 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" has in its structure the module "Research in medicine", which includes the disciplines "Management of scientific research" and "Biostatistics". Residents demonstrated the results of independent work prescribed in the EP: resident dermatovenerologist Wetstein V. made a report at the Republican scientific and practical conference with international participation "Modern problems of dermatology and autoimmune diseases. Pathogenesis. Clinical and diagnostic and therapeutic algorithms", included in the list of measures of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2019; resident Konzhanova A. made a report at the Republican Scientific and Practical Conference with international participation: "Depression and neuroses in acute and chronic diseases as a social problem of modern society in the work of a doctor of any profile" Kazakhstan, Semey (https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1eWMAewr2jVV9bD9bDrf5Gmrl3VK-OHdi?usp=sharing)

Every year, resident venereal dermatologists participate in events dedicated to World Melanoma Day (May 22), World Psoriasis Day (October 29). They participate in preventive examinations of schoolchildren and college students, and are actively engaged in health education and prevention of scabies, mycosis and sexually transmitted infections (STIs).

## 1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

Visiting the clinical base, attending an open class, meetings with teachers and residents allowed us to see that, following a patient-centered approach in the clinical process, while maintaining the need for assistance, each resident develops an individual level of such quality as professionalism.

Based on the Law on Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, where the autonomy of higher and postgraduate education organizations is enshrined, which gives the right, on the basis of standard rules, orders, etc. The university determines independently the development of the educational programme, assessment, selection and admission of residents, selection/selection of teachers, employment conditions and allocation of resources.

The Regulations on Residency reflect the rights of residents, the implementation of which is facilitated by the department. Freedom of expression of the resident's opinions on their education is usually ensured through anonymous questionnaires, which are carried out centrally, under the supervision of the DQCME. Analysis of feedback on training satisfaction is reported at the departmental meeting.

In the course of interviews with residents, it was established that the freedom of practical and research activities is realized through the work of residents, where under the guidance of a department employee, work is carried out in research work, subsequent analysis and interpretation of data, and then writing an article or thesis.

The Chairperson of the Board - the Rector of the NJSC SMU annually meets with residents, where in the process of interactive communication he learns about the problems of students, receives feedback on the learning process, answers questions. Also, the Chairperson of the Management Board - the Rector of the NJSC SMU or the Deputy Chairperson regularly visit the clinical base in order to exchange views with the staff of the department, residents, to get acquainted with the problems of residents.

On the website of the NJSC SMU there are blogs of the Chairperson of the Board – the rector and blogs of the vice-chairperson of the Board, where residents can address their problems, complaints, requests.

Feedback is systemic. Thus, in the lobby of the main building, an urn is installed to collect information (proposals, complaints, recommendations) from students addressed to the rector, the chairperson of the Anti-Corruption Committee (<a href="https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/o-nas/obshhestvennyj-sovet-po-protivodejstviyu-korrupczii-v-mediczinskom-universitete-semej/">https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/o-nas/obshhestvennyj-sovet-po-protivodejstviyu-korrupczii-v-mediczinskom-universitete-semej/</a>), the SSU. Each month, the contents of the urn are examined and analyzed by a commission. Based on the results of the commission's work, a plan of measures to eliminate complaints is being developed.

## 1.3 Learning outcomes

The final training results presented in the MEP in the specialty 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" are aimed at forming a qualified specialist in the field of dermatovenereology, able to work as a dermatovenereologist (adult, pediatric) and provide specialized assistance at the consultative-diagnostic, inpatient-replacement and inpatient levels.

The final results of training in the specialty of residency 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" were formed on the basis of the State Standard for Occupational Safety of 2020 and the provisions of Tucmos on competencies in the residency of the university partner of the University of Bashkent (Turkey). When formulating the final results of training, the Key Competencies of the SCES were taken as the basis (Appendix – 1.7 EP KC 1-6), Levels of knowledge of clinical competencies (PD, DT, E, P, etc.) and Levels of knowledge of practical skills, manipulations, procedures (1-4). Each of these items is prescribed and applied to nosologies (ICD-10) studied in the residency in priority training of a specialist.

For example, KC-1 - (DT - Able to diagnose and treat patients without the help of a team (team work), DTT - Able to diagnose and treat, working together with a team (team), E - Able to identify an emergency situation and provide emergency care, P - Able to apply preventive measures (primary, secondary, tertiary prevention).

The skills of professional behavior; proper behavior and attitude to patients and their relatives, resident colleagues, teachers, other health care workers (KC-2) are formed on an ongoing basis by conducting conversations, participating in trainings conducted by the staff of the department, a 360-degree questionnaire.

The Code of Ethics for Students, adopted by the NJSC SMU on 15.04.2019, prescribes the principles of the corporate behavior of students, the relationship of students with teachers and among themselves, the relationship of students with doctors, etc. (https://drive.google.com/file/d/17\_CHtm8nfJZOHu7nlPivOsU01qIqt3q/view?usp=sharing). Associate Professor A.K. Akhmetova, the employee responsible for compliance with ethical standards of behavior in the residency in the specialty "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)"

Informing the medical community about the established final results of training on the residency programme in the specialty "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" is carried out by discussing the educational programme at the department, providing the EP to the heads of healthcare organizations and receiving feedback, publishing the EP approved by the Academic Committee on the website of the NJSC SMU (https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/obuchenie/obrazovatelnye-programmy/)

Interviews with employers showed that the coordination of the elements of the EP, CED is carried out. Employers, members of professional associations are involved in the review of EP, participation in the discussion of the results at the meetings of the commission on quality assurance of EP

## 1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final results

All interested parties (university employees, graduates of the residency, health and education authorities, healthcare organizations, employers, professional medical associations, the public) participate in the formation of the mission and final results of training, taking into account their proposals.

The mission and final results of the training of EP 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" are formulated on the basis of the Standard for the organization of dermatovenereological care in the Republic of Kazakhstan. Representatives of the main stakeholders are involved in the formulation of the mission of the EP by discussing the draft mission of the EP at the level of: students, at an enlarged meeting of the Department of Faculty Therapy, the Academic Committee, which includes representatives of employers/representatives of practical health care, students and representatives of various clinical specialties.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 17 standards: full – 17. *Standard 1: Implemented* 

## Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

#### **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

## **Evidence of compliance:**

## 2.1 Postgraduate programme framework

The analysis of the documentation revealed that the Educational Programme in the specialty 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" was developed in accordance with the State Standard Educational Programme and the Model Curriculum in the specialty 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's). Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 21, 2020 No.647 KR DSM-12/2020.

The standard curriculum provides for 2-year training in the residency, with the total minimum amount of hours 4200 (140 credits) and obtaining a qualification - a dermatovenerologist, which also meets the requirements of the State Standard of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 647 dated 21.02.2020. Mandatory disciplines/modules reflected in the EP, as well as the university component are optionally included in the educational programme in the specialty in 4 modules.

Also, as a mandatory requirement, the programme includes 2 credits of the "Interim Certification" and 2 credits of the "Final Certification". In total, the educational programme in the specialty 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" consists of 144 credits.

The list of the most common diseases and conditions to be diagnosed and treated by a dermatovenereologist, given in the Standard Curriculum for the specialty "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" is fully covered by the list of nosologies and conditions to be mastered by the resident according to the programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)", developed on the basis of the study of the requirements of regulatory documents, the TUKMOS programme of the partner's university and the needs of practical health care. The peculiarity of this list is the level of mastery for each state/nosology (E, PD, D, DT, DTT, P), which is the result of strategic cooperation with Bashkent University.

Modular study of disciplines is provided in accordance with the logical sequence of study of disciplines (EP-https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/obuchenie/obrazovatelnye-programmy/rezidentura/) for the entire period of study based on the standard curricula of the specialty ( <a href="https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1HqA8L15uWSC5L7J3RWd0upnCoyhpRGI1?usp=sharing">https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1HqA8L15uWSC5L7J3RWd0upnCoyhpRGI1?usp=sharing</a>). The work plan contains a complete list of academic subjects grouped into modules with disciplines, indicating the complexity of each academic subject in credits and academic hours. The programme is

included in the register of ESUVO of the Ministry of Education and Science (MES RK).

Given the practical focus of resident training, the NJSC SMU implements clinical mentoring. Since 2018-2019, the School of Clinical Mentor has been operating in NJSC "SMU". Since 2020-2021, the training of mentors by practical health care at this school is mandatory. Only specialists with clinical experience who have the highest and qualification extensive first (https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/11jyjUXK5JN\_waSSIBUyaW5KLhqXq3ZWy?usp=sharing) are involved as mentors for resident venereal dermatologists, which allows you to transfer skills and experience in a certain field of dermatovenereology to residents. Thus, among the mentors of residents in different years were: the head of the polyclinic department of the State Commission on Internal Affairs of Semey Zhunusova ZH.D., doctors of the polyclinic of the State Commission on Internal Affairs of Dermatovenerologists of the highest category Zhumabekova B.B., Mausynbaev K.S., Urazova A.M., the head of the polyclinic department of the All-Russian Commission on Internal Affairs of Ust-Kamsenogork Okpebayeva Sh.A., the doctor of the highest category of the All-Russian Commission on Internal Affairs of Pavlodar Omarova Zh.K. The mentors are assigned to a certain resident during the rotation of the resident in this department of the clinical base, which allows to accompany the practical training of the resident.

The educational programme for residency 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" is composed in such a way that the entire list of mandatory disciplines is formed logically and in relation to the future specialty in the future. The 6 key competencies (KC-1 - Patient Care, KC-2 -

Communication and Collaboration, KC-3 - Safety and Quality, KC-4 - Public Health, KC-5 - Research, KC-6 - Training and Development) in general, reflect the current trends towards the trinity of medical professionals. With the successful completion of the training programme, the resident dermatovenerologist will be able to effectively provide qualified dermatological care to the adult and pediatric population, successfully interact with others, carrying out its activities in compliance with the principles of safety and quality.

## 2.2 Scientific method

Resident dermatovenerologists simultaneously with clinical work, under the guidance of a teacher, conduct active research activities. In the "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" programme, 8 credits have been allocated to strengthen the skills of medical research methodology, which finds practical application in the ability to develop a research protocol, perform it and document the results in the form of an article or protection of a scientific project. The disciplines "Management of scientific research" and "Biostatistics", combined in the module "Research in medicine", are only auxiliary, while the resident will use and improve the acquired skills throughout the residency programme, as well as in his further professional activities.

The results of research activities of residents are regularly published in the form of abstracts, articles, and reports at conferences. <a href="mailto:(https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/13Rrsg15OdFkzT23dHRIxQsS4flkpL9bK?usp=sharing">(https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/13Rrsg15OdFkzT23dHRIxQsS4flkpL9bK?usp=sharing)</a>.

Teaching the basics of working with scientific literature, the formation of primary skills of critical assessment of literature, writing scientific articles is carried out in the disciplines of basic higher medical education in the form of various forms of independent work, participation in the SSS, student scientific conferences. The disciplines "Management of scientific research", "Biostatistics" of the training programme impart to residents the principles of scientific approach and evidence-based medicine and form their ability to analytical and critical thinking.

In the course of training in specialized disciplines, resident dermatovenerologists develop the skills of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data within the framework of classes of the "Journal club" type.

Upon completion of the study of the disciplines of EP 7R01112 – "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)", the resident demonstrates knowledge of evidence-based medicine in relation to his/her specialty, masters the skills of conducting an expert assessment of a scientific article, medical history, standards of examination and treatment based on the principles of evidence-based medicine. The EP provides for training of residents in critical assessment of literature, articles and scientific data through the writing of abstracts, presentations in accordance with the thematic plan of the discipline, essays on current problems of diagnosis and treatment of the most common diseases.

## 2.3 Content of the residency programme

The core disciplines of the mandatory component of the "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" EP are aimed at theoretical and practical training of residents in the field of clinical sciences and preventive medicine, making clinical decisions, communication skills, patient safety issues.

The development of clinical skills and professional attitude to work is facilitated by the participation of residents in the real activities of the doctor: supervision of patients at the inpatient level, outpatient reception, medical conferences, registration of medical documentation, work in medical information systems (KMIS, AIS), work with regulations, duty, preparation of reports, presentations, formation of a portfolio that provides a visual example of a professional attitude to work in a medical organization and interprofessional communications of specialists of various profiles and levels.

The content of the training programme in the specialty of the residency "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" changes depending on the results of the evaluation of the programme, the requirements of the legislation, the needs of practical health care, the study of international experience, including the experience of the partner's university. In 2018, the NJSC SMU was actively working to revise approaches to the formation of final results in the residency, approaches to training and evaluation of residents. In this regard, the correction of the MEP "Dermatovenerology (adult,

children's)" was carried out. In 2019, the project of the SCES Residence was published, in 2020, it was approved by the SCES Residence, in connection with which the residency programme was revised. These changes in the legislation coincided with the study of experience at the University of Bashkent. As a result of these processes, the modular programme of the residency 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" in 2021 was developed.

The duration of the training remains 2 years, 6 core competencies (KC 1-6) remain unchanged. However, according to the new TEP, the composition and scope of disciplines have been changed. The concepts of "level of knowledge of clinical competencies (E, PD, D, DT, DTT, P) and "level of knowledge of practical skills, manipulations, procedures" (I, II, III, IV), "list of nosologies and conditions that must be mastered by the resident", "List of practical skills, manipulations, procedures that must be possessed by the resident" are introduced. The latter is the result of strategic cooperation with Bashkent University, Ankara, Turkey. The approach to training in the residency of the partner university is taken as the basis, however, the final results of training in the residency of NJSC "SMU" are based on the demands of practical health care and the requirements of regulatory documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In addition, changes to the EP are made taking into account the needs of employers and practical health care, respectively, employers can make changes that affect the introduction of additional disciplines of the component of choice.

## 2.4 Programme structure, content and duration

The educational programme consists of 144 credits. The programme structure includes 4 modules:

3 modules of the mandatory component:

Module 1 - Adult Dermatovenerology:

Inpatient Dermatovenerology;

Outpatient polyclinic dermatovenerology;

Dermatocosmetology.

Module 2 - Pediatric Dermatovenerology

Pediatric dermatovenerology in the hospital;

Pediatric Outpatient and Polyclinic Dermatovenerology

Module 3 - Adjacent Disciplines

Infectious Diseases

Gastroenterology

Clinical Laboratory Diagnostics in Dermatovenerology

Clinical Pharmacology in Dermatovenerology

Oncology

Module 4 of the Medical Research Option, consisting of the following disciplines:

Research Management

**Biostatistics** 

The principle of building a modular educational programme is based on the logic and consistency of studying disciplines. Prerequisites are strictly observed. The principle of rotation and separation of the main disciplines "Dermatovenereology in the hospital" and "Outpatient polyclinic dermatovenereology" allows to consistently deepen the level of mastery of the most important nosological units and medical manipulations.

The ratio of classroom classes and independent work under the guidance of a mentor and independent work of a resident is 10%-75%-15%.

The content of the academic disciplines of the mandatory component is strictly regulated by the State Committee on Standardization and Metrology of 21.02.2020, and the standard curriculum already defines a list of disciplines/modules included in the mandatory component. Specialty 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" allows residents to plan and implement an individual, directed learning path during the entire training, preparing for work in the chosen specialty. The number of study hours for two years of study is 4,200, which corresponds to 140 credits, 4 of which are in CC – elective disciplines. The division of disciplines by hours and semesters is carried out by the department

of academic work. All academic disciplines and disciplines of the specialty are closely interconnected. Interdisciplinary communication can be clearly seen in the syllabuses of academic disciplines, compiled taking into account the development of prerequisites and postrequisites, as well as taking into account the specifics of the specialty.

The list of disciplines of the component by choice is compiled in accordance with the CED, formed and approved annually at the university. In the specialty 7R01112 – "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)", in the CED, in addition to the disciplines "Management of scientific research" and "Biostatistics", the disciplines of CC are included - "Dermatological manifestations of diseases of internal organs", "Vascular pathology, atrophies and dyschromias of the skin", "Pathohistological diagnosis of skin diseases". At the same time, during the study of the provided documentation and interviews with focus groups, it was found that 100% of residents study the disciplines of the component of the choice "Research in Medicine".

## 2.5 Organization of training

NJSC SMU has adequate representation of staff, trainees and other stakeholders in the planning of the educational programme. For example, the Academic Committee with a subcommittee on residency includes heads of departments, professors, associate professors, teachers of departments that provide the educational process in the relevant specialty of the residency, leading specialists in practical health care, employers, and representatives of the student population. In the specialty "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" the Academic Committee includes Associate Professor A.K. Akhmetova.

Residents studying under the programme 7R01112 – "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" undergo training at clinical centers that provide training both inpatient and outpatient settings. In the presented clinical databases, planning and implementation of innovations in teaching methods and evaluation of students are provided.

Meetings with the university departments allowed us to conclude that the department headed by the head of the department determines the clinical bases, where the maximum resident will be able to access patients in their profile of the residency educational programme at all levels of medical care. Further, the clinical work department draws up a contract with the base. Clinical bases of the Department of Dermatovenerology, which provide training to residents in the specialty 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)", were in the recent past skin and venereal medicine dispensaries, and now skin and venereal medicine departments of multidisciplinary medical organizations providing primary, specialized, medical care at the outpatient and inpatient levels to patients with dermatovenerological pathology. Thus, the CSVD of the city of Semey was attached to the city multidisciplinary hospital No.2 of the city of Semey, CSVD of East Kazakhstan region to the city multidisciplinary hospital No.4 of Ust-Kamenogorsk, CSVD of Pavlodar region to the regional hospital.

Compliance of clinical bases with accreditation requirements is carried out by specialized accreditation agencies and reflected in the relevant documents.

## 2.6 Relationship between postgraduate medical education and health care

The NJSC SMU has adopted a "Regulation on the Resident Clinical Mentor" (https://drive.google.com/file/d/1CPS-n IzLM xdqcM2jfgEqBPoe2r8o6J/view?usp=sharing)

This provision defines the priority goals of the mentor's work as assistance in acquiring, improving the professional theoretical and practical competencies of residents, mastering the norms of medical ethics and deontology, and educating them to be demanding and interested in the results of work in the process of joint clinical activities. Up to 3 residents are assigned to each mentor, if possible, the presence of a resident of the first and second years of study is provided for the purpose of continuity and "mini-mentoring" of the senior over the junior. The principle of rotation is also observed, in which the resident's clinical mentor changes depending on the department or clinical base on which the resident is located. The objectives of mentoring are achieved by providing the resident with sufficient freedom to carry out practical activities on the one hand, demonstrating the role model, ensuring a relevant level of observation, providing appropriate assistance, providing constructive feedback on the other.

In addition to the mentor, in order to implement the training plan and the quality of the EP, residents are assigned a curator who participates in the preparation of the resident and is personally responsible for the implementation of the training plan, carries out measures for personal and psychological support of the resident during the stages of education. The curator is appointed from among the teaching staff of the course, who have the academic degree of doctor, candidate of medical sciences, as well as the highest qualification category. Curators and mentors in the course of daily work give specific recommendations for further improving professional skills, mastering the standards of medical ethics and deontology, improving the general education and cultural level.

The share of employees from practical health care as mentors was selected from among experienced specialists whose activities are related to the direction of the residency programme (having at least 5 years of experience in this professional field).

According to the developed modular educational programmes, practical skills training in medical care under the guidance of supervisors takes place on various clinical bases. The share of practical training in the educational programme provides for 90%, with the direct participation of a clinical mentor.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 30 standards: fully - 29, partially -1. Standard 2: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) To provide residents with an alternative choice of elective disciplines in the specialty of the educational programme (2.4.2).

## **Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS**

## **Evidence of compliance:**

#### 3.1 Methods of evaluation

When analyzing the documentation, the EEC experts established that the methods of evaluation of residents in the university for all specialties of the residency there is a unified policy of evaluation of residents, including in the specialty 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)", the evaluation policy is reflected in the Regulation on Residence, Academic Policy of the University, the educational programme and syllabuses of disciplines. Also, the resident assessment policy is presented in electronic format on the Platonus and Keyps platforms and on the official website of the university.

The university has introduced an integrated assessment system that takes into account both formative assessment (FA) and summary assessment (SA), covering the theoretical knowledge and practical skills necessary for the future profession. Final Discipline Score (FDS) - is calculated using the following formula: FDS = FA\*0.3+SA\*0.7

Current monitoring is performed by an academic or clinical mentor. Line supervision evaluates the results of training upon completion of disciplines.

EEC experts confirmed that the criteria for passing examinations or other types of assessment, including the procedure for retaking in the residency, are reflected in the "Regulations on residency", according to which if the discipline of the SA or FDS is not mastered by less than 50%, the resident reacquires the discipline in the summer semester on a paid basis.

There were no such cases during the training on this EP.

A student of the residency who has completed the training programme and completed the individual curriculum is allowed to the Final Assessment. The final assessment is carried out in accordance with the final results of training and includes two stages:

1) knowledge assessment (computer testing); 2) skills assessment.

If the results of the assessment of knowledge and skills under the programme are positive, the resident is issued with a residency certificate. Also, this data is the basis for issuing a specialist certificate. This provision is described in the educational programme in the specialty 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)".

According to the Regulation on the Independent Examination, teachers from other universities who have an academic degree, as well as employers – the most experienced specialists from among practitioners of health care who have the highest qualification category and who were not clinical mentors in the process of training residents, are attracted to the SA as members of the examination commission.

Appeal of the results of the assessment of residents is carried out in accordance with the Academic Policy and the Residence Regulations. If the resident disagrees with the assessment of the final assessment, the resident has the right to appeal the assessment, the rules of appeal are described in the Regulation on the conduct of the appeal.

According to the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)", there was no final certification yet, all 3 residents are studying in the 1st year.

To ensure the objectivity and transparency of the evaluation process, the Department of Dermatovenerology and Cosmetology has developed checklists for conducting current, milestone and final control in the discipline (Mini-CEX, OSCE). Also, the department carries out the formation of a portfolio by each resident individually, in which all the achievements of the resident during the period of study in the residency are recorded. The portfolio serves as a basis for forming the characteristics of a resident and obtaining recommendations for further employment. Portfolio evaluation is carried out according to checklists developed by the department employees.

The compliance of control and measuring instruments with teaching methods and the specifics of the curriculum is monitored by a committee of educational programmes (CEP), which includes experienced methodologists and expert testologists.

Also, the experts of the Higher Educational Institution confirmed that there is a permanent Student Assessment Committee at the university, the main tasks of which are the examination of the examination material of the FA and SA, the analysis and approval of tests uploaded to the KEYPS platform, as well as the analysis and approval of the format and number of stations during the practical skills examination.

Residents pass testing on the KEYPS electronic platform, while at the stage of formative testing at least 20 test questions of MCQ, MSQ format are issued, at the stage of summary testing at least 30 questions of MCQ, MSQ format are issued. All tests before the start of testing undergo a review procedure, after evaluating the test results in the keyps programme, the tests are tested for validity and reliability. The procedure of this inspection was demonstrated by the registrar's office during the visit of the ECC members to this subdivision.

The results of students' academic achievements are recorded in the electronic educational journal through the office-recorder system and the AIS Platonus programme, which automatically generates examination sheets, which is confirmed by experts when viewing 3 electronic journals.

## 3.2 Relationship between evaluation and training

During the visit to the university, the EEC members confirmed that the methods of assessing residents are comparable with the methods of teaching and learning and cover the assessment of all the competencies of students both during practical classes and during examinations.

Differentiated assessment methods are used to assess different learning outcomes, so theoretical knowledge is mainly assessed by testing, and practical skills are assessed using assessment sheets for each section of the practical work.

During the conversation with residents in the specialty 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" it was established that the achievement of the results of training stated in the EP is carried out due to a significant number of thematic patients and a large volume of surgical interventions on 3 specialized clinical bases, as well as constant advice from a clinical mentor or teacher. Residents are provided with the necessary access to both the management of patients and participation in operations, manipulations, all types of medical documentation, participation in consultations and clinical debriefings with colleagues of related specialties, work in a multidisciplinary team.

The conclusions of the EEC meet the criteria of 11 standards: 11 in full.

## Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

## **Standard 4: STUDENTS**

## **Evidence of compliance:**

## 4.1 Admission and Selection Policy

During the visit, EEC experts established that the mission of the educational programme in the specialty 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" corresponds to the Mission of the NJSC "SMU" and forms the final set of residents in the specialty 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)".

When visiting the university, the experts of the EEC confirmed thatthe admission of resident dermatovenerologists to the NJSC "SMU" is carried out in accordance with the "Standard Rules for Admission to Education in the Organization of Education Implementing Educational Programmes of Postgraduate Education", approved by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600 with additions and amendments made on May 24, 2021 (No. 241) and the Regulations on the Admission of Students to Higher and Postgraduate Education in the NJSC "SMU" dated September 16, 2021. The Regulations on the Admission of Students to Higher and Postgraduate Education in the NJSC "SMU" (version 06 dated September 15, 21) are posted on the website of the university and are available to all interested parties. Section 8 of the Regulation regulates the procedure for admission of students to postgraduate educational programmes.

Ensuring a balance between the available capacity and opportunities for training and recruitment of residents is achieved by monitoring the availability of EP resources in preparation for the new academic year at NJSC "SMU". Every year in March-April, on the basis of a request from the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, a request is formed for a certain number of places for each specialty of the residency in accordance with the applications of the state license, analysis of concluded contracts for clinical training, qualification of teaching staff, material and technical resources.

During the conversation of the experts of the EEC with the teachers, it was established that the "Open Days" are actually held in the NJSC "SMU" in different areas and levels of training. Thus, in February 2022, the Department of Employment held an Open Doors Day in therapeutic specialties. All information about the events is actively published on the Semey Medical University page in Instagram.

Since the beginning of February 2022, meetings with employers for graduates of residency have been organized in NJSC "SMU", which are held with the participation of representatives of city and district hospitals of East Kazakhstan and Pavlodar regions. During the meetings, the issues of personnel shortages, working conditions, measures of social support for young professionals, such as the payment of salaries in employment, are discussed.

The NJSC "SMU" has developed and implemented a standard operating procedure (SOP) "Algorithm for admission of applicants" (Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan 600 dated October 31, 2018) of all levels, which contains a procedure/methodology for the admission of students of all levels of training.

Also experts of EEC confirmed that reception of resident - dermatovenerologists is carried out on a paid basis on the results of entrance examinations by anonymous independent assessment on results of entrance examination. For admission to the residency, GPA in the internship and bachelor's degree, a summary assessment based on the results of two stages of the final state certification of the 7th year, as well as an entrance exam in a test format are taken into account.

The entrance examinations of resident venereal dermatologists are held in one stage. Examination questions for each specialty of the residency are posted on the website of NJSC "SMU". Tickets are designed in 3 variants. The ticket with the set of questions is distributed randomly (randomly). The attendants randomize the tickets. When evaluating the applicant's response, the examiner uses a checklist for 5 or 10 steps. Additional points are 20 points for work experience in rural areas for a year or more (the supporting document is a work book) and the resident's portfolio (the Portfolio

Regulation). Independent examiners are involved in the monitoring of examinations: a representative of the Anti-Corruption Agency of the Republic of Kazakhstan in Semey, the chairperson of the anti-corruption committee "SMU", representatives of the public.

The transparency of the procedure for the selection of resident dermatovenereologists, as well as equal conditions for all applicants, is guaranteed by strict compliance by examiners with the Regulations on the independent examination of NJSC "SMU" dated April 22, 2019.

In order to ensure the transparency of the examination procedure, an annual live broadcast is held on Facebook, with the possibility of viewing the video again.

During the conversation with resident dermatovenereologists, the EEC experts confirmed that the selection of potential residents for training in EP 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" is carried out from among graduates of internship who have a high level of understanding of biomedical sciences, achieved at the undergraduate level.

## 4.2 Number of residents

Experts of the EEC confirmed that the NJSC "SMU" complies with the established by the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 606. and paragraph 8 of Article 52 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 27, 2007 "On Education", the number of residents for each specialty per teacher is 1:3. The authorized body – the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan – makes adjustments to the figures of admission.

One of the mechanisms for reviewing the number of residents enrolled for training is the annual Employers' Congress held at NJSC "SMU", at which representatives of the university negotiate the placement of targeted grants for residency by organizations. In the specialty 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" there are no targeted grants. All enrolled residents were citizens of the Republic of Kazakhstan. There were no foreign nationals. In the 2021-2023 academic year, 4 students were accepted.

During the conversation of the experts of the EEC with the representatives of the AMP, it was confirmed that the data on the demand in the personnel of dermatovenerologists are provided to the university by the Department of Health of the region and the Department of Science and Human Resources of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, published on the website of the university. The dean's office together with the educational department responsible for the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" conducts an analysis of the availability of the educational programme with teaching staff, including curators and mentors, clinical bases. At the end of the collection of applications, the data are processed and presented at a meeting of the CEP and the Academic Committee, at which the admission policy for the current year is approved. Applicants can consult on available vacancies in EKR and the Republic from the employment specialist of the SPE: the applicant can take the contact details of the medical institution, which requires doctors in the chosen specialty of the residency.

On the SMU website there is a module "To Employers", which contains information on the expected release of residents of the current year.

Also, the experts confirmed that the university annually creates and works a commission on the distribution of graduates, which includes representatives of the Ministry of Health of Kazakhstan, the DHC of East Kazakhstan region, the Council of Employers, the university. The Dean's Office of the School of Postgraduate Education, departments analyze the employment of graduates and the need for medical personnel.

Starting from 2019, data on students on the basis of a state educational order for monitoring the employment of university graduates and mandatory 3-year training of young specialists are entered into the "SMU" programme "Accounting of Young Specialists" of JSC "Financial Center". The university also annually submits a report on the results of the distribution of young specialists with personalized lists (protocols) to the observatory (working body) for monitoring and analysis.

The policy of recruitment and admission of residents from small groups of peoples, from among practitioners (doctors) from rural areas and special groups of the population (for example, persons with disabilities) complies with the norms and requirements adopted in the Republic of

Kazakhstan.

## 4.3 Resident support and advice

In the course of the conversation of the EEC experts with resident dermatovenereologists, it was established that the "SMU" created and provided safe conditions for the training of residents. To protect the interests of residents, assist them in educational, scientific, and non-curricular activities, the SMU provides various services for the organization of counselling, psychological, social, and medical support for students. During the conversation with residents, it was revealed that the university provides financial support to residents in need of material assistance. Residents in the regions of Ust-Kamenogorsk, Pavlodar, if necessary, are provided with a hostel.

The system of academic counseling of residents in NJSC "SMU" is represented by the School of Postgraduate Education, resident curators, the head of legal and passport and visa work, a psychologist. Residents have the opportunity to receive legal advice from the head of the legal support department. The resident can get psychological support from a regular teacher-psychologist.

All necessary consultations at certain stages of training of residents of dermatovenereologists are organized by the teachers of the department, including those based on the results of monitoring the academic progress of residents, including unforeseen incidents. In this process, curators and mentors are especially actively involved.

The University finances the participation of students at all levels in scientific and practical conferences, congresses, symposia (confirmed from a conversation with the vice-rector for research, teachers, residents).

Students also have the opportunity to report problems or corruption anonymously by contacting the director of a medical school or vice-rectors' blog. On the website of the university there are blogs of the rector, vice-rectors.

To form the clinical thinking of residents, clinical reviews of patients are carried out. At the Department of Dermatovenerology and Cosmetology, clinical analysis of patients is carried out during practical classes of residents on the thematic plans of the disciplines of dermatology, venereology (adult, pediatric) and cosmetology. Since the last academic year, in order to improve the effectiveness of training, a clinical review of complex diagnostics and treatment of patients was carried out once a month and after school hours using the zoom platform.

In the NJSC "SMU", the teaching staff of the profile department use a variety of ways to disseminate information: the university's website, chat rooms on the WhatsApp network, participation in briefings held by management, open days, job fairs at the university, round tables with heads of medical institutions and organizations, exhibitions of achievements. All information received is brought to the attention of residents.

Residents of dermatovenereologists are involved in the work of student self-government, where emerging problems are also solved.

## 4.4 Representation of residents

EEC experts confirmed that residents participate in meetings of collegial bodies of SMU, where they are official members and express their opinions and suggestions for improvement (during the interview it was found out that the resident neonatologist of the second year of study is part of the CEP for higher postgraduate education). A feedback analysis is carried out in the form of a survey of graduates of the residency and employers, on the basis of which the process of policy development and selection of residents in the specialties of the residency is improved.

The participation of residency students in the development of the residency programme is also carried out through the choice of elective disciplines. Residents have the right to make a proposal, to include in the catalogue of new elective disciplines, in their opinion, necessary for study and contributing to the improvement of the educational programme as a whole. Proposals submitted orally or in writing from residents are necessarily taken into account and taken into account.

When visiting the experts of the Department, it was confirmed that the Department of Dermatovenereology collects feedback from residents at the stage of mastering the taught discipline (at

the end of studying the discipline), as well as on issues related to the conditions of study/work, problem situations.

EEC experts also confirmed that the participation of students at all levels in the quality of the educational process is regulated by the Academic Policy of the SMU dated August 31, 2021. The participation of residents in the discussion of key issues of the quality of the educational process is regulated by their inclusion in the Academic Council, the Academic Committee, the CEP in accordance with the provisions on all the mentioned collegial bodies. The composition of the Academic Committee of the SMU for 2021-2022 academic year, the composition of the CEP of Residency specialties for 2021-2022 academic year includes 3 residents in clinical specialties. The University encourages (welcomes) the participation of residents in the life of the university, in particular participation in the work of the academic committee, the CEP, which takes into account the views/proposals of residents to improve the educational process (clarified from a conversation with residents).

## 4.5 Working conditions

EEC experts confirmed that when combining work, residents of the 1st year of study at the department receive 15 thousand rubles at 0.25 rates. It was also confirmed that students of the residency have the opportunity to work in their free time for 0.25 (in the second year of study -0.5) of the rate as a doctor in healthcare organizations, laboratory assistant, trainee teacher of the department. Residents holding the appropriate specialist certificate have the opportunity to work additionally. Currently, 1 resident of the 1st year of study works in the polyclinic in Semey for 0.5 hours as a surgeon.

During the visit to the clinical base, the experts of the EEC established that resident dermatovenerologists have unlimited access to patients, both inpatient and outpatient, to all types of medical equipment. The department has an office for mastering theoretical knowledge by residents, there is a separate room for changing clothes, for eating, etc.

During the training of resident dermatovenerologists, the YouTube information platform is actively used, where there is a university channel where video lectures are posted for independent study by residents, including in case of forced breaks in training, in case of pregnancy (including pregnancy and childbirth/paternity leave), illness.

Experts of EEC made sure that an individual plan is drawn up for residents (according to the order) transferred from other Universities, reinstated, remaining for the second year of study, returned from academic leave, on the basis of the WEPl approved for the relevant academic year, taking into account the difference in the curriculum or academic debt.

In order to maintain the optimal balance of time spent by the resident on training and medical care, in the "SMU" in accordance with the SCES of the resident's residence, the training day is 9 hours, 3 hours of which are allocated for classroom classes, 3 hours for IWRT, 3 hours for IWR. In connection with the Regulations on Residency, it is regulated to plan the study load of the resident based on this time; night and day duty, as well as other types of work are included in the specified study load. The duty of residents on a clinical basis is one of the types of independent work and is aimed at mastering the tasks of training. Shift planning is reflected in the discipline syllabus.

EEC experts also confirmed that the residency provides a system for recounting academic hours in disciplines completed by students before enrolling in the residency. In addition, the resident is exempt from duty at the clinical base, provided that he/she has experience in departments of this type. In case of pregnancy, the resident is released from duty at the clinical base at night. Tuition on an individual schedule in the residency is allowed only if there are appropriate medical recommendations. Provided that the resident provides the relevant certificate by the decision of the SPE, he is provided with the opportunity to study according to an individual schedule.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 30 standards: full – 30. Standard 4: Implemented
Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none

## **Standard 5: FACULTY**

## **Evidence of compliance:**

## **5.1 Recruitment and Selection Policy**

EEC experts confirmed that the University approved the University Development Programme at the meeting of the Board of Directors (02.12.2020, Minutes No. 8). According to the university development programme, taking into account the goals and objectives of the university, the personnel policy of the university is implemented.

The Regulation on the University Personnel Policy was approved on 10.03.2018, additions and changes were made to the Regulation on 30.09.2019, in accordance with which the policies and procedures for the recruitment and admission of teachers, managers and clinical mentors were determined. Recruitment takes into account the required experience and qualifications of the specialist, criteria of scientific, educational, pedagogical and clinical achievements are established.

During the conversation of the experts of the EEC with the representatives of the management personnel, it was established that the university developed and approved the standards for the selection of teaching staff on a competitive basis "On approval of the Rules for competitive replacement of the positions of faculty and researchers of higher educational institutions", the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 23, 2015 No.230 and the order of the rector of the university No.394dated August 2, 2018.

According to the competitive substitution of positions of the faculty, the composition of the competitive commission for the substitution and re-election of vacant positions of the faculty has been approved. All information about the upcoming competition for vacancies is posted on the website of the university and in the city newspaper. The meeting of the competition commission is held annually at the beginning of the academic year and is broadcast online on the university's page. The university takes into account the balance between teaching, scientific research of clinical departments. The developed job descriptions and regulations establish the responsibilities and duties of teachers and clinical mentors. When forming the staff of departments, the ratio of teachers and residents is taken into account, which is sufficient for effective teaching and learning.

Much attention is paid to the availability of candidates with the appropriate education, clinical experience, qualification category in the relevant specialty and discipline profile.

The personnel of the Department of Dermatovenerology and Cosmetology includes 2 candidates of medical sciences, 1 teacher without an academic degree. The university guarantees that residency teachers are practicing specialists in dermatovenerology.

For the motivational purpose, a competition for the title of the best clinical mentor is held every year, participants are given letters of thanks. Thus, at the end of the 2021-2022 academic year, Associate Professor A.K. Akhmetova was recognized as the "Best Mentor in Residence".

## 5.2 Teachers' obligations and development

When visiting the department's experts and during the conversation with teachers, it was confirmed that the duties between the department's employees are reflected in the department's annual work plan. At the beginning of the academic year, the head of the department, at the first meeting of the department, distributes duties to the staff of the department. In the individual work plan (IWP), the teachers of the department plan their activities for the entire academic year. IWP is considered at the meeting of the department and approved by the Dean of the School of Postgraduate Education.

When compiling the workload and schedule of teachers, a uniform workload of teachers is ensured for all types of activities, the department strives to ensure a balance between teaching and other types of work to enable teachers and clinical mentors to effectively engage in research, teaching and educational work. The workload for all types of activities is evenly distributed among teachers, observing the principle of the trinity of education, science and practice. From 2020-2021 academic year, the volume of teaching load in the residency is 650 hours, for head teachers - 600 hours, for the head of the department – 500 hours.

EEC experts also confirmed that all employees of the university are actively involved in the implementation of new educational technologies of teaching and evaluation implemented at the university: Turkish catalog, Caselog, milestones, MCQ in accordance with the ACGME criteria. Teachers of the department contribute to the development and improvement of programmes, the definition of educational goals and results. The staff of the department developed the educational programme of the residency in the specialty 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" syllabuses in all disciplines of the educational programme, as well as control and measuring tools, including scorecards of the mini-clinical exam and practical skills.

Periodic assessment of teachers is carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the certification of university employees (May 27, 2019).

Evaluation and recognition of worthy academic activities of teachers, supervisors and mentors is carried out through awarding in accordance with the Regulations on awards adopted at the university, awarding employees (for holidays and anniversaries), KPIs and research work (R&D rating), participation in the contests "The best teacher", "The best curator". The University has developed and approved the "Regulations on holding the contest "Best Teacher" of the University dated 30.09.2019.

According to clause 3 – Criteria and form for selection of a mentor of the Regulation on a clinical mentor dated 14.10.2020, a mentor is appointed from among qualified practitioners of health care, with at least 5 years of experience in the relevant specialty. It is preferable to have a certificate confirming the completion of the cycle of the School of Clinical Mentors.

During the conversation with the clinical mentors of the experts of the EEC, it was confirmed that the mentors are trained at the school of the clinical mentor in accordance with the established procedure on the basis of an appeal from the head of the department and the applicant for mentors. The Mentoring School programme has topics on communication skills, but there are no hours on pedagogical competencies.

According to the developed Regulations on advanced training and retraining of medical and pharmaceutical personnel of the university dated 04.06.2019, faculty members of departments undergo advanced training 1 times every 5 years in order to update and deepen theoretical knowledge, improve practical skills in clinical specialties.

EEC experts confirmed that the motivational tool for teachers and employees is the annual rating of incentives and motivation of employees, which is revised taking into account new requirements and opportunities, is in constant dynamics. The presented KPI system assumes the possibility of receiving up to 800-900 thousand tenge or more per year by one employee.

In accordance with the strategic priorities of the university and state programmes, the KPIs of the employees of NJSC "SMU" are reviewed and updated annually. To improve language competencies there is an opportunity to learn English. Professional development is carried out through training at seminars or master classes with the involvement of foreign specialists, as well as with the participation in republican and international conferences, symposia, etc.

In order to constantly improve the new model of teaching specialized disciplines, teachers are constantly trained in pedagogical technologies used in the world educational environment. For example, teachers of the department together with residents underwent online training in the basics of statistics in 2021 (St. Petersburg, Institute of Biostatistics). Certificates are available.

To stimulate and support talented young specialists, a system has been developed for forming a talent pool of managerial staff - the "Hope" talent pool. The developed Regulation on the personnel reserve "Hope" dated May 24, 2021 contains the regulations for the selection of candidates, requirements for the development of competencies, the regulations for training the composition of the reserve.

Experts of EEC confirmed that teachers of the department together with residents take part in international peer-reviewed journals, participate in international conferences and publish the results of ongoing research.

In total, graduates of the specialty "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" published more than 10 theses and articles, took part in 4 scientific and practical conferences.

Calculation of the mentor's workload is 3.5 hours per resident per day. One mentor is relied on by 4 residents, which is stipulated in the "Regulation on the resident clinical mentor" dated May 19, 2022. Compliance with this parameter guarantees individual effective interaction of the mentor and the resident of the dermatovenereologist, as well as the possibility of high-quality monitoring of academic and professional achievements of residents.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Compliant with 7 standards: fully -6, partially -1, non-compliant -0

Standard 5: Implemented

## Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Include in the advanced training programmes of the "School of clinical mentor" the issues of methods of assessing knowledge, the basics of pedagogy.

## **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

## **Evidence of compliance:**

## **6.1** Logistics and equipment

The Department of Dermatovenerology and Cosmetology of NJSC "SMU" has a sufficient material and technical base for the professional training of residents in the specialty 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)", which is represented by:

1) the basic institution of the EP "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" is the SPE on the REM "Multidisciplinary City Hospital No.2 of Semey, a skin and venereal medicine department with a hospital for 20 24-hour beds, 10 day beds and an outpatient polyclinic department for 200 visits. On this basis, the Department of Dermatovenerology and Cosmetology has 5 classrooms with a total area of 72m2, one of which is intended for residents, where they can have time for rest and independent work, studying materials. All audiences of the department are provided with unlimited access to the Internet.

Residents are provided with conditions and opportunities for practical training, patient management at various levels of medical care: an outpatient unit, a day and 24-hour hospital, equipped with sufficient diagnostic and treatment equipment.

The library of the university with a total area of 1362m2 includes a service department (reading room, electronic room, subscription of educational, scientific literature), a department of completing and processing of literature, a department of reference and bibliographic and information work. In the library reading room there are 177 seats, 54 computers, a Wi-Fi zone, places to work on your laptop or tablet. For individual and group work, there are 6 separate rooms equipped with multimedia equipment (Regulation on the discussion rooms of NJSC "SMU").

The library's book fund is annually updated and as of 01.07.2021 it amounted to 23,511 literary sources relating to the accredited specialty "Ophthalmology (adult, children's)".

The library offers free access to the following databases: Cochrane.org, the database "Legendary Books" of the publishing house "Urait", Elsevier "ScienceDirect", "Scopus"; CyberLeninka, the Electronic Library of RGB dissertations, Research methods of the Alexandria Library, Web of Science, Scopus.

For residents studying in Pavlodar, there is a library of the Pavlodar branch of the University, with a total area of 70.4 square meters and 12 seats (Appendix to the self-report).

Purchase of necessary literature is carried out taking into account applications and within the framework of a centralized survey of both residents and teachers, doctoral students and master's students

### **6.2 Clinical Bases**

The University, depending on the number of residents and their distribution, chose and approved the bases for the preparation of residents: "Multidisciplinary City Hospital No.2of Semey, a skin and

venereal medicine department with an inpatient facility for 20 24-hour beds, 10 beds of day stay and an outpatient polyclinic department for 200 visits; "Multidisciplinary City Hospital No.4of Ust-Kamenogorsk, a skin and venereal medicine department with an inpatient facility for 60 24-hour beds and an outpatient polyclinic department for 200 visits; "Pavlodar regional hospital named after Sultanov, a skin and venereal medicine department with a 24-hour inpatient facility for 15 beds and 30 beds of day stay and a polyclinic for 250 visits" (cooperation agreement in Appendix 7 to the self-report). Residents have access to all diagnostic rooms and laboratories, with a sufficient number of patients of various severity categories, to provide qualified care and develop practical skills using the possibilities of outpatient, inpatient care and night duty.

Practical skills are mastered under the guidance of a clinical mentor, using checklists for their assessment

## 6.3 Information technology

The training of resident dermatovenerologists takes place in person, the elements of the distance learning method are used in webinars, some lectures and in participation in conferences.

Unlimited access to the Internet is provided on the territory of the university, its clinical bases and directly in the study rooms of the department, for free use of the necessary web resources and electronic media. Through the University Library, residents have permanent access to electronic databases (Cochrane.org, Elsevier, full-text Pubmed, Wiley Library, UpToDate) when searching for up-to-date data, especially when performing scientific work.

When training, working on clinical bases, residents have access to the information systems of medical organizations: KMIS, Medelement (through the password of the head of the department or the clinical mentor), filling in medical documentation, appointment sheets, etc., under the control of their clinical mentor.

Teachers of the department contact resident dermatovenerologists of all years of study through the created working chats in WhatsApp, to solve both working and personal (social) issues.

## **6.4 Clinical Teams**

Preparation of residents for teamwork skills and effective interaction with other health care specialists includes direct work of residents together with employees of various clinical units: work in outpatient and polyclinic and reception departments, supervision of patients at the level of a day hospital, a round-the-clock hospital, participation in advisory examinations of patients of other medical institutions (under the guidance of a clinical mentor), in workshops and scientific and practical conferences. Working in multidisciplinary teams provides residents with sufficient experience in the team, including with specialists from other healthcare areas.

Skills of coordinated work with colleagues develop during examination, treatment of patients with dermatovenerological pathology. The resident is present during the consultations, fulfills the orders of senior colleagues within his competence. The result of the resident's activity is controlled by the mentor and documented in the resident's portfolio (electronic portfolio at the implementation stage). The interaction of the resident dermatovenereologist with other team members is estimated to be "360 degrees".

Within the framework of academic mobility, training for residents of dermatovenerologists is expected by Professor E.E. Zhiltsova, Head of the Department of Dermatovenerology of the Ryazan State Medical University named after Academician I.P. Pavlov. Academic mobility of the resident of the 1st year of study N. Akhtanova is also planned for the cycle "Cosmetology" in "National Center for Postgraduate Medical Education "Aru Dariger" LLP (there is a preliminary agreement).

## **6.5 Medical Research and Advances**

As a result of the study of the submitted documentation, it was established that university residents necessarily study the disciplines "Management of scientific research" (4 credits) and "Biostatistics" (4 credits) in the 1st and 2nd years of residency, included in the Catalog of elective disciplines. The resident uses this time to search for scientific data and publications in information systems. According to the schedule, once a week from 16.00 to 18.00 hours in the disciplines "Management of scientific research" (1 year) and "Biostatistics" (2 year of study), residents analyze

their data using various methods under the guidance of a teacher. To complete training in these disciplines, the resident must publish an article or defend a scientific project. At the Department of Dermatovenerology and Cosmetology, research work is carried out within the framework of initiative projects. The study of clinical cases of patients, medical records, literature data, work in the library made it possible to draw up data in the form of abstracts and articles in republican and international sources. The main areas of scientific interest are pigmentary skin diseases, pressure sores, psoriasis, sexually transmitted infections.

In addition, some of the results of the scientific work of residents were reported at republican and international conferences. An example is the publication of resident Altaybayeva Ekaterina, co-authored with the clinical director in the Scientific and Practical Journal "Science and Healthcare" No.4 (22) "Epidemiology of pressure ulcers among the high-risk group of patients"

## **6.6 Education expertise**

The examination of the quality of the implemented educational programme on residency (https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/obuchenie/obrazovatelnye-programmy/rezidentura/) is systematic and carried out in stages. The educational programme of the residency in the specialty R701112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" was adopted on the basis of the State Committee for Education and Science of 2020 and TUKMOS (Turkey). The Residency Officer draws up the educational programme, which is discussed at the departmental meeting. Further, the educational programme is transferred to the Academic Committee for evaluation and examination. The expert assessment of the Educational Programme of the Residence "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" is carried out at a meeting of the Academic Committee (AC). Further, the programme is approved by the Deputy Chairperson of the Academic Management Board of the University. After the comments and corrections, the educational programme is approved at the meeting (AC) Minutes No.1 dated August 31, 2021. Further, the programme is entered into the Register of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, where after an independent external examination, the programme is approved for use in the educational process. The EP is available on the university 's website (https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/obuchenie/obrazovatelnye-programmy/). After agreement with the Deputy Chairperson of the Board of NJSC "SMU" for academic work, the programme is entered in the Register of EP of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, where after an independent external examination, the programme is applied in the educational process.

The University has developed and implemented a Strategy for ensuring the quality of the educational process (https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/obuchenie/politika-disciplin/), which defines an algorithm for monitoring the educational programme (EP): systematic discussion of the EP at meetings of collegial bodies (AC), updating the EP in connection with the needs of the labor market and taking into account the wishes of stakeholders, systematic receipt and analysis of feedback on the quality of the educational process from all stakeholders, planning of measures to improve.

Monitoring of the implementation of the EP of the residency programmes is carried out on the basis of the principle of collective solidarity of all interested parties: the specialized department, SPE, the Academic Committee, residents, representatives of practical health care, potential employers and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Feedback from residents is carried out through the SPE to determine the degree of satisfaction with the content of the educational programme and the organization of the educational process, which are carried out in the form of questionnaires, focus groups, constant monitoring of appeals to the blog of the dean's office, Deputy Chairperson of the Board for Academic Work, Deputy Chairperson of the Board for Scientific and Clinical Work, Chairperson of the Board. In addition, the school of postgraduate education collects feedback from graduates of residency and their employers.

The Academic Committee annually organizes events to improve the educational programmes of the residency: forms working groups, on expert evaluation, working curricula, methods of training and evaluation in the residency, development and monitoring of the resident portfolio, examination of the catalog of elective disciplines, planning of measures to improve the content and the process of implementing the educational programme. Profiling departments update the content of curricula in

accordance with the development of medical science and education.

## **6.7** Training in other institutions

The mechanism for the implementation of the academic mobility programme for teachers and residents was developed and approved in the "Regulations on academic mobility of students, teachers and employees" (March18, 2019) (https://drive.google.com/file/d/1Dx2VdOXpn6ys1Krn8baRjzapPcNn\_\_78/view?usp=sharing),

including the Regulation "On the organization of academic mobility within the framework of the Kazakhstan credit recount system", to facilitate the procedure for academic recognition of diplomas and qualifications, ensuring transparency of educational programmes and curricula.

The search for a university partner, the development of an academic mobility programme, organizational issues of training and accommodation is carried out by an academic mobility specialist together with the supervising department and the SPE\_(https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/onas/struktura/departament-po-strategicheskomu-razvitiyu/otdel-mezhdunarodnogo-sotrudnichestva/akademicheskaja-mobilnost/).

The coordinator for academic mobility organizes the work of the commission for conducting a competition among students and faculty. Department of Dermatovenerology and Cosmetology (represented by Associate Professor A.K. Akhmetova) within the framework of academic mobility conducted training for clinical residents of dermatovenerologists of the Ryazan State Medical University named after academician I.P. Pavlov.

Currently, the Department of Dermatovenerology and Cosmetology cooperates with the following foreign universities to promote the exchange of residents and mutual recognition of learning elements:

- 1. Baskent University
- 2. Ryazan State Medical University named after I.P.Pavlov
- 3. Latvian Society of Dermatologists against Skin Cancer
- 4. Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education "Novosibirsk State Medical University" of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation
- 5. Chernivtsi city, Ukraine, Bukovyna State Medical University

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 21 standards: fully -20, partially -1. Standard 6: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) To document the implementation of the used innovative teaching methods in the educational process.

## **Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION**

## **Evidence of compliance:**

## 7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

Having analyzed the educational programme in the discipline R701112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)", the experts of the EEC found that at the university, the monitoring and evaluation of the implementation of the educational programme of the residency is carried out on the basis of the collective solidarity of all stakeholders and employees of the university. At the stage of planning the educational process in the specialty of residency, the responsibility for checking the working curricula for compliance with the requirements of state educational standards, drawing up a schedule is assigned to the departments. Responsibility for the selection of the composition of teachers meeting the qualification requirements, the profile of the specialty is assigned to the Human Resources Management Department. Checking the quality of the EMCD and monitoring the educational and methodological documentation of the departments of residency is carried out by the CEP of the PGE. The training and clinical center is a structural unit responsible for the provision and maintenance of simulators necessary to develop the practical skills of residents and at the stage of final certification. Provision of the residency's educational programme with the necessary clinical bases is carried out by the research center, whose functions include monitoring and selection of clinics existing in the cities of

Semey, Ust-Kamenogorsk for subsequent conclusion of contracts. The Registrar's office registers and stores examination records, which are documentary evidence of the recognition of academic achievements of residents.

The peculiarity of the analysis of the formation of the competence of residents of NJSC "SMU" is a comprehensive assessment of the resident by the teacher through formal, summary control over the discipline, by the mentor - through portfolio management, control over the mastery of practical skills and research competencies, by the PGE school through the analysis of reports provided by residents, by practical health care (potential employer) through participation in an independent examination of residents. The competencies of residents of the programme R701112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" are evaluated by current, midterm, intermediate control; control over the mastery of practical skills and research competencies; through the analysis of reports, individual developmentplans of residents (Evaluation 3600). The 3600 Evaluation questionnaire reflects the professionalism, interpersonal and communication skills of the resident as a doctor.

The applied system of assessment of knowledge, skills, abilities and competencies in the specialty of residency R701112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" corresponds to the State Standard of the RoK.

#### 7.2 Feedback from teachers and residents

In order to ensure the transparency of the process and evaluation results for management and stakeholders, the process of collecting feedback from students is automated and carried out in keyps, in order to avoid correction or distortion of feedback data. In addition, the results of the feedback are published on the university's website in the "Feedback" section in order for all interested parties to have an opportunity to read it. The School of Postgraduate Education collects feedback from residents to determine the level of satisfaction of residents with the content of the educational programme, the organization of the educational process in the form of questionnaires, focus groups, monitoring of appeals to the school's blog. Schools have a feedback box where residents can incognito leave their suggestions, wishes and complaints. An important role in the evaluation of the educational programme is played by monitoring the achievement by residents of the final learning goals. Therefore, the school collects feedback from residency graduates and their employers.

The basic departments collect feedback from residents, representatives of practical health care, teachers of related disciplines on the assessment and optimization of the content of the educational programme in the form of reviews, focus groups, questionnaires, etc.

The results of the study of feedback from stakeholders are voiced at the meetings of the departments, the Academic Council and the Committee of Educational Programmes (CEP).

Feedback analysis is provided for discussion at meetings of departments, the Committee of educational programmes and the Academic Council, which include teachers, residents and members of the Employers' Council. During these meetings, plans are being developed to further improve the quality of graduate training. In 2020 and in 2021, feedback was received from employers on the educational programme R701112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)".

The university has identified and used feedback mechanisms, as well as tools for training a medical specialist through continuous communication with medical practice and the health care system. As such tools, feedback from employers on the level of training of graduates, carried out in the form of a questionnaire, is used. The developed questionnaire allows to determine the level of satisfaction of the employer with the competencies of the graduate, professional, special and extrafunctional (mobility, sociability, teamwork skills, leadership skills, analytical abilities, etc.), to identify areas for improvement in the training of specialists. In this case, the educational trajectory of the graduate is taken into account. So, if the resident works as a teacher at the department, the employer is sent a questionnaire with questions that allow to assess the competencies of the teacher and researcher. In the case of a resident's employment in practical health care, the assessment of the clinician's and manager's competencies becomes a priority.

#### 7.3 Results of Residents and Graduates

An important role in the evaluation of the educational programme is played by the results of the final certification of residents carried out at the testing stage by the National Center for Independent Examination, as well as the results of certification examinations conducted by the Committee for Control of Medical and Pharmaceutical Activities of the Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The final state certification of residents in the 2020-2021 academic year was carried out in accordance with the standard of the State Standard of the Residence and was carried out in the following stages: determination of the level of theoretical training in the disciplines in the form of testing; certification of practical skills with a standardized patient. The results of these examinations are discussed annually at the meeting of the Academic Council. The results of the

In the 2020-2021 academic year, 7 residents passed the final certification in the specialty R701112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)", the final assessment of residents was 100%.

## 7.4 Stakeholder Engagement

The following mechanisms for involving stakeholders in the monitoring and evaluation of the educational programme are provided for in the NJSC "SMU":

- 1) surveying residents for satisfaction with the results of training in the discipline;
- 2) questioning residents for satisfaction with the quality of the organization of the educational process;
- 3) questionnaire of independent experts to assess the training of residents, review of training programmes by representatives of practical health care;
- 4) surveying employers for satisfaction with the training of graduates of the residency of NJSC "SMU";
- 5) organization of focus groups with the participation of residents to optimize the process and content of training;
- 6) organization of focus groups with representatives of practical health care on the content of training and methods of assessment of residents;
- 7) discussion of the results of monitoring the performance of residents and feedback from stakeholders at meetings of the CEP, the Academic Council, the School of Postgraduate Education, the Academic and Methodological Council, the Academic Council of the University.

At NJSC SMU, due representation of stakeholders in the assessment of the processes and final results of resident training programmes is observed. For example, the CEP of postgraduate and additional education includes heads of department, professors, associate professors, teachers of departments that provide the educational process in the relevant specialty, leading specialists in practical health care, employers, and representatives of the student population. The composition of the educational and methodological council, the CEP is approved by the rector of the university.

Representatives of practical health care, employers are obligatory members of the examination commission of the state certification of graduates. Representatives of practical health care, who have extensive experience, are part-time employees in the departments, which also makes it possible for other stakeholders to participate in the implementation of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)". Stakeholders' access to the results of the evaluation of educational programmes is ensured by publishing relevant analytical references and feedback analysis on the website of NJSC "SMU". In addition, the discussion of the feedback results is carried out at the meetings of the Academic Council of the SPGE, the CEP of the PGE, which includes representatives of all interested parties, as well as at the meetings of the department.

## 7.5 Procedure for Approval of Educational Programmes

The educational programme in the specialty R701112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" was approved at a meeting of the chair and subcommittee of the residency of the academic committee (AC) through the voting procedure. After all the necessary conditions are met, it is entered in the register of educational programmes. The School of Postgraduate Education collects feedback from residents to determine the level of satisfaction of residents with the content of the educational programme, the organization of the educational process in the form of questionnaires, focus groups,

monitoring of appeals to the school's blog. Schools have a feedback box where residents can incognito leave their suggestions, wishes and complaints. An important role in the evaluation of the educational programme is played by monitoring the achievement by residents of the final learning goals.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 15 standards: fully – 15.

Standard 7: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

# **Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION Evidence of compliance:**

## 8.1 Management

The guarantee of the implementation of the "Therapy" educational programme 7R01112 Dermatovenerology (adult, children's) is its strict compliance with the requirements of regulatory rules regarding the admission of residents (selection criteria and number), the learning process, assessment of knowledge and skills, established learning outcomes, programme management, which are regulated in the Republic of Kazakhstan by regulatory legal acts of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Internal documents of the university are developed on the basis of republican normative acts.

Thus, the Regulation on the admission of students to higher and postgraduate education in the Non-Profit Joint Stock Company "Medical University Semey" dated September 16, 2021 was developed in accordance with the "Standard Rules for Admission to Education Organizations Implementing Educational Programmes of Higher Education", approved by Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 600 dated October 31, 2018.

The process of training, assessment of knowledge and skills is regulated by the Regulation on the SMU Residency dated 01.02.2021 (https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/postuplenie/rezidentura/), which was developed on the basis of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 27.07.2007 No. 319-III "On Education", Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 18.09. 2018 No. KR DSM-16 "On approval of the Rules for the training of medical personnel in internship and the Rules for the training of medical personnel in the Residence", the State Mandatory Standard for Medical Specialties, approved by the Order of the Acting Minister of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 31.07. 2015 No. 647 "On approval of state mandatory standards and Standard Professional Curricula for Medical and Pharmaceutical Specialties, Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No.600 "On Approval of Standard Rules for Admission to Education Organizations Implementing Educational Programmes of Higher and Postgraduate Education ", Appendix No.1 to the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 20, 2015. Rules for the Provision of State Services "Translation and Restoration of Students by Types of Education Organizations", Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 7, 2008 No. 116 "On Approval of Rules for the Appointment, Payment and Amount of State Scholarships to Students in Education Organizations, Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 30, 2018 No. 595 "On Approval Standard Rules for the Activities of Educational Organizations of Appropriate Types", as well as Standard Rules for Conducting Current Performance Monitoring, Interim and Final Certification of Students in Higher Educational Institutions".

## 8.2 Academic Leadership

As a result of meetings with university staff, teachers of the department, study of documentation, it was established that the Department of Academic Work (DAW), which works under the direct supervision of the Deputy Chairperson of the Academic Work Management Board, exercises control and monitoring of planning, organization of coordination, provision of the educational process, introduction of innovations in the REP educational and methodological activities of the departments in

the "SMU".

The work on the organization and monitoring of the postgraduate level of study at the university is carried out by the School of Postgraduate Education (SPE), which coordinates the organization of the educational process: the schedule, the appointment of a curator, the choice of a clinical base, the formation of an individual work curriculum, enrollment in elective disciplines, sending to a conference, participation in competitions, solving issues of academic mobility of employment.

A great deal of organizational and methodological work is carried out by the Committee of Educational Programmes of Postgraduate Education (PGE), where the compliance of teaching methods with control methods and final learning outcomes formed in Sillabuses is checked and approved. Methods of final control: OSCE and OSPE.

The regulatory role of the collegial bodies of NJSC "SMU" - the Academic Committee, the Academic Council is also important and relevant. Thus, the results of the final certification of graduates are regularly discussed at the Academic Council of NJSC "SMU". The chairpersons of the State Attestation Commissions conduct a report with an analysis of the average score, make recommendations for improving both the educational process as a whole and the final attestation procedure itself. The main educational, educational-methodical, scientific-clinical load on the undergraduate training of students – residents is implemented by specialized departments

## 8.3 Training budget and resource allocation

The main sources of formation of financial resources of the educational process in the SMU are:

- funds of the republican budget;
- funds under training contracts on a reimbursable basis;
- funds from the provision of educational and other paid services;
- other receipts.

The solution of key issues of the distribution of financial resources of the university (university budget) is carried out in three stages: at the first stage at the meeting of the Economic Council, at the second – the Scientific Council of the NJSC "SMU", at the third Board of Directors, which ensures the collegiality, involvement of all categories of employees of the NJSC "SMU", as well as the avoidance of conflict of interest.

Information on the results of financial and economic activities of NJSC "SMU" and the implementation of the cost estimates are heard annually on the Academic Council of the university, which is broadcast online on the page of NJSC "SMU" on Facebook.

The educational programme of the residency 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" is financed at the expense of students' own funds. In addition, there is an opportunity to study at the expense of targeted training from medical organizations, and grants from regional akims. Funds allocated for the training of residents are spent on the purchase of necessary equipment on a competitive basis, library resources, payment for information resources and other items of expenditure established by regulatory legal acts.

The University manages the budget of the educational programme of the residency 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" on the principles of transparency, accountability, objectivity and legality. The University fulfills all obligations to pay employees and scholarships of residents, to create the necessary conditions at the bases, to purchase the necessary equipment, consumables, and other resources. This supports the necessary assistance to practical health care from the academic community.

## **8.4 Administration and Management**

The academic leader of effective management and allocation of resources for the educational programmes implemented at the university is the Deputy Chairperson of the Board for Academic Work.

At the level of specialized and general education departments – heads of departments, the activities of which are regulated by the Job Descriptions.

The overall management of the university is carried out through collegiate bodies, which include representatives of the SSG, employers, and other stakeholders, which ensures their participation in all areas of the university's activities.

The collegial bodies are:

- Academic Council of NJSC "SMU"; educational and methodological council
- Dissertation council;
- Clinical Council;
- Economic Council;
- Committees of educational programmes;
- Academic councils of faculties;
- Public Council on Anti-Corruption in Medical NJSC "SMU" Semey;
- Trade union committee of faculty, employees and students;
- student self-government

The powers, responsibilities and relationships between these bodies of the university, administration, teachers and employees are described and defined by the relevant regulations.

The University has developed and successfully implemented, and repeatedly certified the quality management system by the authorized certification bodies of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Currently, the quality management system is certified according to ST RK ISO 9001-2016. A strategic planning and quality management system department has been established. The Quality Manual, documented procedures, internal instructions, regulations, SOPs have been developed. The Academic Council annually approves the University Quality Policy and the University Quality Objectives developed with the participation of stakeholders, on the basis of which each department sets its annual goals. The Quality Policy and Objectives are available for review on the website of the university in the section "Quality Management System".

## 8.5 Requirements and regulations

Management activities are based on strict compliance with the requirements established by the regulatory documents of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan in terms of the educational process.

The University, represented by SPE, complies with the recommendations of the national authorized bodies to determine the number and types of recognized medical specialties of the residency, for which approved educational programmes are developed.

The university's governance system involves all stakeholders, including the health sector, and reflects the responsibility of academic leadership. Representatives of practical health care, employers are obligatory members of the examination commission of the state certification of graduates. Doctors with extensive work experience are part-time employees in the departments of senior courses, which also makes it possible for other stakeholders to participate in the implementation of the university curriculum. Chief physicians of clinical bases are officially included in the composition of the SC, AC, CEP.

For the development of residency programmes, their improvement, representatives of practical healthcare are involved. In order to effectively plan, develop and implement residency programmes, the advisory bodies (CEP, AC) include representatives of practical health care, residents and teachers of departments involved in the implementation of residency programmes. Each of these representatives has the right to vote when making changes, proposals and comments in the educational process of the residency. As well as the right to vote in the approval of educational programmes for residency.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant* with 15 standards: fully – 15.

Standard 8: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

#### Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

## **Evidence of compliance:**

Taking into account the tendency of "trinity" regarding medical specialists, NJSC "SMU" made a collegial decision to include a university component in the EP by the choice of "Research in Medicine", the mandatory requirement for mastering the programme is the resident's own research with the subsequent registration of the research result in the form of an article and/or a report at the conference. Pedagogical competencies are developed by actively involving residents in the process of formal and non-formal education of undergraduate, internship and junior year students.

Responsibility for the quality of medical education rests with the relevant department, DQCME, the department of the clinic, the School of Postgraduate Education (SPE), the Deputy Chairperson of the Board for the AW and the SCR, the Chairperson of the Board – the Rector.

The SMU Quality Strategy for Education dated 23.11.2020 offers the following characteristics of the educational quality assessment and monitoring system for education and core activities: <a href="https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1Eak90Aq8">https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1Eak90Aq8</a> PpBPtiraHZNKI5H7bkwb-oX

- Objective procedure for assessing the knowledge, skills and competencies of graduates (independent examination at the National Center for Independent Examination);
- Systematic monitoring of the quality of the organization and provision of the educational process;
- Systematic monitoring of the professional competence of teaching staff and creation of conditions for professional and personal growth;
- Orientation of the final results to the requirements of the labor market and their systematic updating;
  - Involvement of stakeholders in the improvement of educational programmes;
  - Creation of conditions for a combination of training, clinical and research work;
- Monitoring compliance with the responsibilities of structural units in terms of ensuring the quality of the educational process.

To regulate the mechanisms for assessing and monitoring the educational process, internal regulatory documents are in operation <a href="https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/prepodavatelyam/vnutrennie-normativno-pravovye-akty/">https://semeymedicaluniversity.kz/prepodavatelyam/vnutrennie-normativno-pravovye-akty/</a>):

- Academic policy/ strategy for quality assurance of the educational process
- Regulations on the Academic Committee
- Job descriptions of teaching staff
- Regulations on residency

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 4 standards: fully - 4.

Standard 9: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 6. Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)"
  - 1) To provide residents with an alternative choice of elective disciplines in the specialty of the educational programme (2.4.2).
  - 2) The advanced training programme of the "School of clinical mentor" includes questions about the methods of knowledge assessment, on the basics of pedagogy (5.2.2);
  - 3) To document the implementation of the used innovative teaching methods in the educational process.

## 7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit the educational programme "7R01112 - Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)" of the Non-profit Joint Stock Company "Semey Medical University", which meets the Standards of accreditation of educational programmes of the residency of medical educational organizations for a period of 5 years

Chairperson of the External Expert Commission Zhanalina Bakhyt Sekerbekovna Foreign expert (online) Ripp Evgeny Germanovich National Academic Expert Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna National Academic Expert Turgunov Ermek Meiramovich National Academic Expert Dzhandaev Serik Zhakenovich National Academic Expert Urazova Saltanat Nurgozhayevna National Academic Expert Ligai Zoya Nikolaevna National Academic Expert Chingaeva Gulnar Nurtasovna National Academic Expert Bozhbanbayeva Nishangul Seitbekovna National Academic Expert Beisebayeva Ulzhan Tursunkulovna National Academic Expert Doshakanova Asel Baidauletovna Expert - representative of employers Tuleutaeva Gulnara Yesenzhanovna Resident representative Expert (online)

Izmayeva Amina Timurovna

Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01112 "Dermatovenerology (adult, children's)"

			Est	ı	
Standard	Evaluation Criteria	Number of standards	Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant
1	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	17	17		
2	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	30	29	1	
3	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS	11	11		
4	STUDENTS	30	30		
5	FACULTY	7	6	1	
6	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	20	1	
7	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	15	15		
8	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	15	15		
9	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4	4		
	Subtotal:	150	147	3	
				150	

Attachment 1.