To Accreditation Council of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care 10.04.2022

## **REPORT**

OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME IN THE SPECIALTY 7R01114 "RADIOLOGY"

FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS OF ACCREDITATION PROGRAMMES OF POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION (SPECIALTY OF RESIDENCY) IN MEDICAL ORGANIZATIONS OF EDUCATION

period of external expert evaluation: 29.03.2022 - 31.03.2022

Nur-Sultan, 2022

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	5 5
2.1.	Presentation of the accredited organization "National Scientific Oncology	5
	Center" LLP in Nur-Sultan and the educational programme in the specialty	
	7R01114 "Radiation Diagnostics"	
2.2.	Information on previous accreditation	9
2.3.	Conclusion on the results of the review of the report on the self-assessment	
	of the educational programme in the specialty 7R01114 "Radiation	9
	Diagnostics" of "National Scientific Oncology Center" LLP in Nur-Sultan	
	for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate	
	programmes (specialty of residency) of medical organizations of education	
	and conclusions	
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	12
4.	Results of the survey of teachers and residents	16
5.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the	18
	results of an external evaluation of the educational programme in the	
	specialty 7R01114 "Radiation Diagnostics" of LLP "National	
	Scientific Oncology Center" Nur-Sultan	
6.	Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme in	25
	the specialty 7R01114 "Radiation Diagnostics" of "National Scientific	
	Oncology Center" LLP, Nur-Sultan	
7.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	26
	Attachment 1. Quality Profile and Criteria of External Evaluation and	27
	Educational Programme of the Residency in the Specialty 7R01114	
	"Radiation Diagnostics" of "National Scientific Oncology Center" LLP,	
	Nur-Sultan	
	Attachment 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert	28
	evaluation	
	Attachment 3. Organization Visit programme	29

## List of symbols and abbreviations

Abbreviation	Designation
SCES	State compulsory standard of education
DLT	DLT – distance learning technologies
FA	final attestation
IEP1	Individual Educational Plan
NSOC	National Scientific Oncology Center
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
MoH RoK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
NSOTC	National Scientific Oncology and Transplantology Center
RSCEMC	Republican Scientific Center of Emergency Medical Care
PGE postgraduate education	
AT	AT – Advanced Training
RT	retraining
TS	Teaching staff
EP	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES
WEPl	Working Educational plan
NCIE	national Independent Examination Centre
QMS	QMS – Quality Management System
IWRT	work of a resident doctor under the supervision of a clinical mentor
	during the period of clinical activity of a resident doctor
IWR	independent work of a resident doctor
EMC	educational and methodological council
GPA	Grade Point Average - the arithmetic mean of the grades obtained for
	all the courses, taking into account the time spent on them
JCI	Joint Commission International

## 1. Composition of the external expert commission

In accordance with the ECAQA Order No. 09 dated March 11, 2022, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct during the period of March 29-31, 2022, the accreditation of the educational programme: in the specialty 7R01114 "RADIATION DIAGNOSTICS" of the National Scientific Oncology Center LLP of Nur-Sultan, as follows:

order №	Status as part of EEC	Full name	Regalia, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	chairperson	Madyarov Valentin Manarbekovich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Surgery with the course of anesthesiology and resuscitation of the NEI "Kazakhstan - Russian Medical University"
2	Foreign Expert	SERGEY ALEXANDROVICH RYZHKIN	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Radiotherapy and Radiology named after Academician A.S. Pavlov, Head of the Department of Additional Professional Education of the Russian Academy of Continuing Professional Development (Moscow), Scientific Secretary of the Department of Medical and Biological Sciences of the Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Tatarstan, accredited expert of the Federal Service for Supervision of Education and Science (Rosobrnadzor).
3	National Academic Expert	MUSTAFIN ALIBEK HAMZENOVICH,	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Anesthesiology and Resuscitation of Internship, NJSC "Medical University of Astana"
4	National Academic Expert	UALIKHAN KOSHKARALIEVICH ZhUMASHEV	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Oncology, NJSC "Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University"
5	National Academic Expert	ESENKULOVA SAULE ASKEROVNA	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of NJSC "Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University" Member of

			the Association of Oncologists of the Republic of Kazakhstan
6	National Academic Expert	TRYNKIN ALEXEY VIKTOROVICH	Candidate of Medical Sciences, senior lecturer of the Department of Surgical Diseases with the course of anesthesiology and resuscitation of the NEI "Kazakhstan - Russian Medical University"
7	National Academic Expert	SLAVKO ELENA ALEKSEEVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Infectious Diseases of the NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University", Chairperson of the NEI "Scientific and Practical Society of Gastroenterologists of Almaty"
8	National Academic Expert	BAZARBAEVA AIGUL ABAEVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, doctor of the highest qualification category in pediatrics, head of science and education of JSC "Scientific Center of Pediatrics and Pediatric Surgery", Excellence in Health care
9	National Academic Expert	Ulanbek ZHANBYRBEK KABLY,	M.D., Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Urology and Andrology, Medical University of Astana JSC
10	Expert – employer representative	MADINA ERALYEVNA OSPANOVA	Head of the Department of Cryobiology of the RSE on REM "Scientific and Production Center of Transfusiology" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
11	Expert – resident representative	BAIMUKHANOV DAUREN SAMARKHANOVICH	Resident of the 4th year of training in the specialty "Neurosurgery, including pediatric" of JSC "National Center for Neurosurgery"
12	Observer for ECAQA	UMAROVA MAKPAL ALDIBEKOVNA,	head of the Department of Accreditation and Monitoring of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care".

The work of the ECAQA was carried out in accordance with the Regulation of EEC (Order of the Director General of ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme 7R7R01114 "Radiation diagnostics" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate programmes (specialty residency) of medical organizations of education and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC on further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above educational programme and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

#### General part of the final report

## 2.1 Presentation of the National Scientific Oncology Center LLP.

form of ownership, bin  Management body  Munagement Board  Full name of the chief Kulkaeva Gulnara Utepergenovna	
Full name of the chief Kulkaeva Gulnara Utepergenovna	
1 0	
executive officer Chairperson of the Management Board	
CMS – Candidate of Medical Sciences	
Tel.: +7 (7172) 70-29-10	
Mobile:+7 701 525 07 56	
E-mail: nrocastana@gmail.com, gulnara1412@mail.ru	
Created in By the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kaza	khstan
dated July 31, 2006 No.719 "On approval of the Plan for the c	reation
of a cluster of medical services in Astana on the basis of	of new
centers", as well as by the Order of the Ministry of Health	of the
Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 31, 2008 No.433 "G	
establishment of the joint-stock company" Republican Sc	
Center of Emergency Medical Care" (hereinafter – RSCEMC)	a new
medical center was created.	
On July 4, 2014, the National Scientific Oncology	and
Transplantology Center (hereinafter referred to as the NSCOT	
renamed	ŕ
Location and contact Republic of Kazakhstan, 010000	
details "Esil district", Nur-Sultan	
str. Kerey, Zhanibek Khandar, 3	
Tel.: +7 (7172) 70 29 59	
E-mail: kense.777@mail.ru	
Official website: http://cancercenter.kz	
State license for Training in the residency has been carried out since 2010. Ir	2010,
educational activities in the RSCEMC issued a license for postgraduate education	n No.
the residency (date, 0137410 series AB dated 02.06.2010. The RSCEMC	was a
number) subsidiary organization of Nazarbayev University and could ca	rry out
educational activities without a license, in accordance with A	rticle 8
of the Law "On the Status of Nazarbayev University, Naza	rbayev
Intellectual Schools and Nazarbayev Foundation". The licen	ise for
educational activities was re-issued from the RSCEMC	to the
NSOTC, No. KZ81LAA00007958 dated December 13, 2016.	
Information on branches, From October 1, 2017 to April 30, 2019, the NSOTC carried	out its
subsidiaries (if any) activities as part of the Corporate Fund "University Medical C	
being one of the branches of subsidiaries within the struc	ture of
Nazarbayev University JSC.	

	In accordance with the Decree of the Government of the Republic of
Year of implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP)	Kazakhstan dated May 11, 2018 No.255, the National Scientific Cancer Center LLP (hereinafter referred to as the NSC) was established with 100% participation of the state, which is a subordinate organization of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan (hereinafter referred to as the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan).  Training in the residency has been carried out since 2010 in the structure of JSC "RSCEMC". In 2010, the RSCEMC issued a license for postgraduate education No. 0137410 series AB dated 02.06.2010. The license for educational activities was re-issued from the RSCEMC to the NSOTC, No. KZ81LAA00007958 dated December 13, 2016.  In 2019, NSOC LLP underwent institutional accreditation of postgraduate and additional education organizations (continuing professional development), certificate No. IA00021 dated 04.10.2019.  The residency programme in the specialty 7R01114 "Radiation Diagnostics" is based on the requirements of the state mandatory standard of residency in medical specialties and a standard professional training programme in medical specialties of the residency, approved by executive orders. Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 31, 2015 No.647, https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V1500012007 and the Rules for the Organization of the Educational Process in the Residence of the Company, approved by the decision of the Management Board of the Company dated July 14, 2020 No.19.
Duration of training	2 years
Total number of graduates since the beginning of the implementation of EP Number of residents at	The total number of resident doctors in the 2021-2022 academic year amounted to 70 resident doctors, including 2 resident doctors (1 year of training), 4 resident doctors (2 years of training) according to "Radiation diagnostics".  Recruitment to the residency in this specialty
EP since the beginning of	in 2019 – 8 resident doctors,
the current year	in 2020 – 6 resident doctors,
	in 2021 – 2 resident doctors.
	Transfer from another organization in 2019 – 2 resident doctors.
	Release in 2020 of -2 resident doctors,
	in 2021 – 8 resident doctors,
Full-time trainers/ Combiners involved in the implementation of EP, incl. % of degree	7 faculty (2 professors) are involved in work with residents, 2 have the highest, 3 have the first qualification category in specialties,

The educational programme of the NSOC specialty "Radiation Diagnostics" is developed on the basis of the standard programme of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as taking into account the principles and approaches of the best international practice in the training of health professionals.

The NSOC implements a competency-based model of medical education focused on the final learning outcome. Thus, based on international approaches, in 2016, working curricula in the context of

disciplines in 10 specialties of the residency were revised and approved, including the following final learning outcomes:

- A. Knowledge and understanding.
- B. General and special skills.
- C. Professionalism.
- D. Communication abilities.
- E. Ability to study.

In addition, this year, as part of the further improvement of the educational programmes of the residence of the NSOC, the syllabuses in terms of specialties and courses of study were revised, also providing for the final results of training. Thus, in the specialty "Radiation diagnostics" the final results of training are:

- 1. General and special skills.
- 2. Medical knowledge.
- 3. Ability to learn and develop.
- 4. Communication skills.
- 5. Professionalism.
- 6. Research.
- 7. System-substantiated practice

Thus, one of the 7 key competencies of graduates of the NSOC residency is professionalism: the ability of the resident to demonstrate high standards of ethical behavior, to demonstrate compassion, responsiveness to the needs of patients, exceeding personal interest, decency and respect for others, acceptance of personal mistakes and recognition of them.

Elements of institutional autonomy have been introduced in the Centre. Academic freedom implies the independence of the development and implementation of the EP, within the framework of the standard curricula, of the SCES (21.02.20). Freedom in drawing up the EP is achieved when describing the syllabuses, CED, IEP, WEPL, the form, structure and procedure for the development of which is determined by the organization independently. The EP was approved at the meeting of the EMC NSOC on 14.07.2020.

Assessment of educational achievements of residents is carried out by various forms of control, which are determined by the "Rules for the organization of the educational process in the residence of the NSOC", approved by order of the Chairperson of the Board of the NSOC dated July 5, 2019 No.106-OD.

Admission of persons to the residency is carried out on a competitive basis on the basis of the results of the entrance examination. The admission commission is organized from the teaching staff of the NSOC with the participation of the administration. Persons who have scored at least 75 out of 100 on the examination are enrolled in the residency. Persons who scored the highest points on the exam (Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 15, 2020 No. KR DSM-270/2020. Registered in the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan on December 15, 2020 No. 21802 "On approval of the rules for placing a state order, admission to education and training of medical personnel in the residency").

The NSOC has an EP that meets the requirements of the SCES (21.02.2020), is staffed with employees with clinical experience and scientific titles, training is carried out on the basis of the Scientific Center, where there are sufficient resources for training resident oncologists. Persons who have completed training in the educational programme of the residency and successfully passed the final certification are awarded the qualification "doctor" in the relevant specialty of the residency and a certificate of completion of residency is issued.

The EP of the residence meets the international requirements and the 8th level of the national framework of qualifications in medical education and the Structure of qualifications in the European Higher Education Area.

Training of residents in the specialty of "Radiation Diagnostics" is carried out in the NSOC with personal participation in the therapeutic and diagnostic process, both in class time and during independent work.

Conditions and means have been created for the personal participation of residents in the provision of medical care at the level of PHC and hospital. Practical training is carried out through the daily personal participation of a young specialist in medical activities using methods of diagnosis and treatment based on evidence-based medicine, the acquisition of practical skills provided for in the curriculum, and work to promote a healthy lifestyle.

Methods of training residents include: seminars, webinars, conferences, case-studies, training, team-oriented training (TBL); training based on simulation technologies, role-playing games, brainstorming method, group discussion method, portfolio, combined survey, small group training method, simulation technologies, presentations.

The material and technical equipment of the NSOC makes it possible to effectively implement active methods of training (analysis of clinical cases, maintenance of medical records, examination of the quality of medical care, management of patients, training in a clinic with the participation of a real patient, training in primary health care, attendance at medical conferences, consultations, teaching using web-technologies); training through research (participation in the NSC).

Analysis of teaching methods, examination of the quality of educational programmes is carried out regularly by the education department of the NSOC, by mutual attendance of classes, the participation of teaching staff in scientific and methodological seminars, conferences.

#### 2.2. Information on previous accreditation

In 2019, NSOC LLP underwent institutional accreditation of postgraduate and additional education organizations (continuing professional development), certificate No. IA00021 dated 04.10.2019.

The self-assessment of the educational programme of NSOC LLP was carried out on the basis of Order No. 324-OD dated 09.12.2021 "On approval of the composition of the working group for training in specialized accreditation of the "National Scientific Oncology Center LLP".

2.3 Conclusion on the results of the review of the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme "Radiation Diagnostics" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate programmes (specialty of residency) of medical organizations of education and conclusions

The report on the self-assessment of the educational programme in the specialty 7R01114 "RADIATION DIAGNOSTICS" of the National Scientific Oncology Center LLP in Nur-Sultan is presented on 119 pages and contains \_0\_annexes according to the relevant standards. The report on the institutional self-assessment is accompanied by a list of members of the working group on self-assessment and preparation for accreditation - the Educational Programme of the NSOC Residency in the specialty 7R01114 "Radiation Diagnostics" with an indication of the responsibility of each member of the internal commission; information on the person responsible for conducting the self-assessment for compliance with the ECAQA Educational Programme Accreditation Standards.

The self-assessment of the educational programme in the specialty "Radiation Diagnostics" was carried out on the basis of Order No. 324-OD of 09.12.2021 "On approval of the composition of the working group for self-assessment and preparation for accreditation of the educational programme of the residence of the NSOC in the specialty "Radiation Diagnostics".

The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the organization of education by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the head of the chairperson of the board, Candidate of Medical Sciences, G.U. Kulkaeva, which confirms the reliability of quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 15 members of the internal self-assessment commission with an indication of the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme –

Shalekenov S.B., Candidate of Medical Sciences, Deputy Chairperson of the Management Board for Scientific and Educational Activities.

The self-assessment of the educational programme of NSOC LLP was carried out on the basis of Order No. 324-OD dated 09.12.2021 "On approval of the composition of the working group for training in specialized accreditation of the "National Scientific Oncology Center LLP".

The report was reviewed by accreditation experts: Zhumashev U.K. and Ryzhkin S.A. and the reviews noted strengths and areas for improvement.

Thus, in the process of feedback from the representative of the educational organization, experts received answers to the questions that arose and the self-assessment report was amended accordingly and additions were made to the recommendations of the reviewers.

In all standards, the real practice of "National Scientific Oncology Center" LLP for the training of residents in the specialty 7R01114 "Radiation Diagnostics" is given, taking into account the beginning of admission of students in 2021, reasoned data, examples of implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of knowledge and skills assessment, material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement.

The report is submitted to ECAQA in a completed form, with correction of the data on the above recommendations, written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criterion of standards, tables and contain references in the text and have end-to-end numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure, the external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during the visit to the educational institution, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

#### 3. external expert evaluation

External expert work within the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme of the National Scientific Oncology Center LLP for the training of residents in the specialty 7R01114 "Radiation Diagnostics" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care" No.5 dated February 17, 2017) and in accordance with the programme approved on March 11, 2022 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the Chairperson of the Board of the National Scientific Oncology Center LLP G.U. Kulkaeva. Dates of the visit to the organization: 29 – 31.03.2022.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 2 days is presented in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the Programme), which is contained in the documentation of the accreditation center and in Attachment 3 to this report. The programme is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- interview with management and administrative staff -5 people in total;
- interviews with residents 6 residents on radiation diagnostics (58 in total).
- study of the website https://ncu.kz/;
- interviewing 23 employees (mentors and teachers);
- questionnaires of teachers and residents 9 and 58, respectively;

- observation of the training of residents: attendance at 1 practical lesson (Subject: Mammography, teacher Ilyasova Assel Adilovna, head of the department of radiological diagnostics of the Multifunctional Medical Center (Onco. Dispensary of Nur-Sultan), student population: 6 residents, venue: department of radiological diagnostics, classroom class).
- review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards: 6 departments of the practice/clinical training bases of the National Scientific Oncology Center LLP were visited, where training is carried out on 1 educational programme with the participation of 6 full-time teachers/ part-time employees;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 10 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the units (the list of studied documents is in Attachment 2).

The staff of the accredited organization ensures the presence of all persons indicated in the visiting programme and according to the lists of interviews and interviews (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with EEC members

_	T		
orde	Full name	academic	Job Title
r №		degree/academ	
		ic title	
1	Zhukubayeva Almira	master's	Head of Education Department, Deputy
	Assetkyzy	Degree	Chairperson of the Working Group
2	Mukazhanov Adilbek	Candidate of	Deputy Chairperson of the Management
	Kairbekovich	Medical	Board for Medical Activities
		Sciences	
3	Sagandykov Irina	Candidate of	Head of the Center for Vascular Surgery
	Nigmetzhanovich	Medical	
		Sciences	
4	Azat Myrzabekovich Chinaliev	master's	Senior Resident, Center for Expert
		Degree	Endoscopy and Interventional Radiology
5	Umbetzhanov Erlan		Head of the Center for Anesthesiology,
	Urumbayevich		Resuscitation and Intensive Care
6	Alpysbaev Arman		anesthesiologist of the Anesthesiology,
	Makhsatovich		Resuscitation and Intensive Care Center
7	Kaliaskarova Kulpash	Doctor of	Consultant doctor in oncohepatology and
	Sagandykovna	Medical	gastroenterology of the center for
		Sciences	hepatopancreatobiliary surgery,
			oncohepatology and organ transplantation
8	Zhanasbayeva Marzhan		Senior Resident of the Sector of
	Siyazbekovna		Oncohepatology and Gastroenterology of
			the Center for Hepatopancreatobiliary
			Surgery, Oncohepatology and Organ
			Transplantation
9	Kemaykin Vadim Matveevich	Candidate of	Head of the Center for Oncohematology
	•	Medical	and BMT with Oncohematological
		Sciences	Resuscitation
10	Aynabay Ayagul Maratkyzy	Candidate of	Hematologist of the center of
		Medical	oncohematology and BMT with
		Sciences	oncohematological resuscitation
11	Dzhakipov Murat	First category	Head of the Radiology Center
	Abdrakhmanovich		
		I	1

12	Imangeldina Makpal Sabitovna		Radiologist at the Radiology Center
13	Uskenbayev Talgat Aitbayevich	Candidate of Medical Sciences	Head of the Center for Multidisciplinary Surgery
14	Zhanat Spataev	master's Degree	Head of the Center for Hepatopancreatobiliary Surgery, Oncohepatology and Organ Transplantation
15	Adylkhanov Tasbolat Alpysbayevich	Doctor of Medical Sciences	Senior lecturer of the sector of teaching staff of the Department of Education
16	Ilyasova Assel Adilovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences	Multidisciplinary medical center (oncology center). Head of the Department of Radiation Diagnostics
17	Imangeldina Makpal Sabitovna	First category	Radiologist at the Radiology Center
18	Erlibaeva M.B.	First category	NSOC resident
19	Umbetov Sh.A.	Highest category	National Research Centre for Motherhood and Childhood
20	Beissenova Nursaule Dmitrievna		Chief specialist of the sector of organization of postgraduate and additional education of the department of education
21	Zhusupbekov Darkhan Dyusembayevich		Chief specialist of the sector of organization of postgraduate and additional education of the department of education
22	Tazhmakina Kulshat Temirbekovna		Chief Specialist of the Library of the Department of Education
23	Zhannat Elemesovna Tashenova		Chief specialist of the sector of organization of postgraduate and additional education of the department of education

List of residents of NSOC in the specialty "Radiation diagnostics"

№	Year	Full name of the resident doctor	<b>LEB</b> (at the expense of local executive bodies)
	of		
	admiss		
	ion		
1	2019.	Ernar Omirov Serikuly	State Institution "Department of Health of
			Pavlodar region"
2	2019.	Yerzhanov Zhalgaas Bolatuly	PSE on the REM "Kyzylorda Regional
			Oncology Center" of the DHC of Kyzylorda
			region
3	2020.	Asyl Erbolbek Zhumabekuly	"National Scientific Oncology Center" LLP
4	2020.	Bolatov Dauren Akdauletovich	"National Scientific Oncology Center" LLP
5	2020.	Karimov Aslan Azatovich	"National Scientific Oncology Center" LLP
6	2020.	Kochiev Bayram Alimogly	"National Scientific Oncology Center" LLP

Thus, when implementing the activities of the programme, namely, based on the results of the interview with the first head of the organization, members of the advisory body – the SC, in interviews with residents and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **Standard 1was** established. All

participants in the educational process know the mission of the NSOC, took part in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, while the mission was brought to the attention of potential residents through the website, social networks, information letters to medical organizations. The strategic plan of the organization for the period of 5 years (2020-2024) was reviewed, including such areas as the development of human resources and research activities, the redistribution of the source of income for the economic development of the NSOC, the allocation of monetary assets to academic potential, information support and digitalization of processes, increasing the satisfaction of employees with their work, employers, students - the conditions and process of training, which confirms the fulfillment of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization. From interviews with residents, it was established that before the beginning of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the organization of education, tell where to get the necessary information about the educational programme, teachers, training bases. This indicates compliance with **Standard 2** in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents.

The organization's documents contain work programmes, EMCD, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, independent work. Compliance with the SCES and standard requirements has been established. Attending a practical lesson in the discipline "Palliative Oncology" and according to the calendar and thematic plan of the lesson topic: "Verbal skills. Non-verbal communication. Active listening. Spikes – a 6-step protocol for reporting bad news" experts received convincing data that the training is carried out according to the plan, before the beginning of the lesson, residents determine the initial level of knowledge, apply interactive methods (a"role-play"was demonstrated) of training, receive feedback from the teacher, have the opportunity to improve the skills of communicative competence. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational programme, since the experts studied the code of business ethics (by the decision of the Supervisory Board of the NSOC dated October 31, 2019) and during the interview, the residents replied that they were informed about the content of this document.

The analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in advisory disciplines are taken into account, additions are made to the bibliography of the EMCD and syllabuses, and teachers apply them in classes.

A review of the monitoring and measurement tools (tests, situational tasks, written examinations) showed that the organization has implemented an appropriate evaluation policy that allows for a multifaceted assessment of the learning achievements of residents. During the interview, the residents told about the forms of assessment (testing, written exam) and feedback from the teacher, mentor.

The system of appealing the results of the assessment is reflected in the document (according to the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600. Registered with the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan on October 31, 2018 No. 17650 "On approval of the Standard Rules for admission to training in educational organizations that implement educational programmes of higher and postgraduate education", the Rules for admission to the residency for 2020-2021 academic year, approved by the Board, Protocol No. 6 dated January 15, 2020.) and during the work of the organization of education there were no precedents of appeal. Thus, compliance with standard 3 has been established.

During the visit to the organization and during the interview with the Head of the Education Department A.A. Zhukubayeva, the commission made sure that there is a system and documentation that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and employees, and includes such documents as annual operating plans, annual reports, regulations of departments, contracts with teachers and residents and educational and methodological documentation (work programme, work curricula, syllabuses, journal, evaluation tools (checklists, sheets), certificates and certificates. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the necessary calendar and thematic lesson plans for residents, schedules of the semi-annual assessment, rotation schedules of residents by office, approval of supervisors, and Rupa, which is regularly updated. This information was obtained during interviews with residents, teachers and employees of the Education Department.

The conversation with the head of the department of science Saparbay D.Zh., the head of the department of education Zhukubayeva A.A. and the senior lecturer of the sector of teaching staff of the department of education Adylkhanov T.A. included such questions as "What number of clinical mentors are involved in the implementation of the educational programme "Radiation diagnostics"? "How is admission to the residency carried out?" "Are scientific achievements or results of other student activity taken into account in the selection of applicants for admission to the residency?" allowed experts to learn about the strategy and tactics of recruiting residents, the information security of the educational programme, as well as to identify problems in the management and development of human resources, about approaches to attracting employees of clinical bases for teaching (a total of 7 mentors: 1 doctor of medical sciences, 2 candidate of medical sciences, 2 doctor of the first qualification category. All teachers are active specialists in the field, carry out clinical work in basic institutions (supervise or consult patients, carry out instrumental research, expert assessment of medical histories, carry out scientific work, have scientific publications) and have certificates in pedagogy for up to 5 years.

Interviews with 4 teachers of NSOC, including 3 full-time teachers, showed that there are both successes and problems in educational management, depending on the specific base (admission of residents to the equipment, sufficient number of thematic patients, time for maintaining medical records, independent work). Experts received answers about the programme of professional development of teachers, financing of this training, availability at teachers of certification on methods of teaching.

On the same day, experts studied materials on the admission of residents and the selection of teachers and established compliance with standard 4.

In order to verify the data of Standard 5, external experts received an opinion on personnel policy and approaches to the development of teachers' pedagogical competence, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring. Experts found that there is a sufficient number of teachers to implement the educational programme, a total of 7 teaching staff. The faculty is formed on the basis of the requirements for the effective implementation of educational programmes, as well as on the basis of the total amount of study load. The number of teachers who implement EP and have an academic degree or/and academic title is 57% (only -3 have an academic degree, and the remaining 4 full-time faculty are young, promising, having the first medical qualification categories, having 10 years of practical work on radiation diagnostics). In recent years, the Department of Education has organized training for teaching staff on the topic: "School of clinical mentor. Topical issues of postgraduate education".

Teachers have enough time for teaching, mentoring, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature.

During the visit to clinical bases, a survey of resources was carried out, their compliance with training programmes, accessibility for teachers and residents, as far as this equipment is modern and meets the needs of students and practical health care. Experts obtained evidence of compliance with Standard 6, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report and to obtain evidence on the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with residents in the specialty. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with the training, enough time for patient supervision, work with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents in need, participation in "Morning medical conferences with reports", the availability of resources of international databases of professional literature. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, since they believe that the organization of education has good resources, image and international relations, at the same time, residents have a fairly high level of independence in the management of patients. Residents are interested in more active participation in academic mobility programmes abroad, and participation in international conferences and symposia.

Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering the questions of external experts, demonstrated their judgment in the organization of training,

assessment of their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in R&D. Members of the External Expert Commission (EEC) Experts studied the documents of residents (portfolio, results of assessment of residents - checklists, results of questionnaire of residents).

Interviews with 3 employers were conducted online and included such issues as: knowledge of the mission of the NSOC, participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring. Providing NSOC and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, on the problems of interaction with the teaching staff of NSOC. The percentage of employment of graduates of the educational programme implemented in the NSOC was 100%. In general, during the interview with employers, positive feedback was received about the quality of specialist training and their competence as oncologists.

The review of resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, the clinical units of the NSOC with a total bed capacity of 242 were visited, and the employees of the organization of education provide a collegial and ethical relationship with medical personnel, the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of residents. A sufficient number of thematic patients, modern equipment and demonstrates accessibility to students are provided, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and mentors (mentors) provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during the training.

The educational programme ensures the compliance of the content of the residency programme with the requirements of the State Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and the training of residents is carried out in accordance with the principles reflected in the State Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Teaching and learning methods correspond to the ultimate learning objectives. Residents actively participate in the provision of medical care, applying the acquired theoretical knowledge and thereby developing the ability to assume responsibility in various clinical situations. The implementation of the educational programme is carried out using the principles of quality, academic honesty, and the "Antiplagiarism" programme is also introduced and applied. The organization provides a student-centered approach, and this is confirmed in the report. The principle of mentoring of residents is implemented in the NSOC, and this activity is regulated in the Regulation on mentoring developed and approved by the Academic Council. In addition to obtaining academic knowledge, residents acquire other useful skills through the implementation of socially important activities (sanitary education, work in general education institutions, etc.). The introduction of a competency-based approach to the educational process ensures the development of knowledge, skills and professional attitude corresponding to different roles of the doctor. The educational programme can be adjusted in accordance with the expectations and requests of employers and the wishes of residents, as demonstrated in the report (feedback study). The self-assessment report describes in detail the structure, composition and duration of the educational programme, clearly defining the mandatory component and the component of choice. Training of oncologists is carried out on the basis of an analysis of the needs of the regional health system. The programme takes into account the final results of training, clearly describes the minimum number of procedures and surgical interventions that a resident doctor must perform in each year of his training. However, when planning the educational programme, equal representation was not ensured and it was not confirmed that all stakeholders (employers, mentors) were involved.

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. The final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of the interview, questionnaires was held. EEC members started designing the final EEC report. The results of the external evaluation are summarized. The experts individually completed the "Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of the Educational Programme: Oncology (Adult) for Compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for

improving the educational programme were discussed, and the chairperson of Turgunov E.M. held a final open vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council on the accreditation period – 5 years.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all the necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the NSOC, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to the members of the EEC.

At the end of the programme of the visit, the chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the organization of education announced recommendations on the results of an external assessment within the framework of specialized accreditation.

#### 4. Results of the survey

The ECAQA observer conducted an online questionnaire on 29-31.03.2022 at https://webanketa.com/.

#### The resident survey includes 24 questions.

In total 58 people (in total 70 residents for the current year) answered.

Residents of the 2nd year of study -55.2%, 1 year -24%, 4 years of study -12.2% and 1 year -8.6% predominated out of the total number of respondents.

This university will be recommended as an educational organization – about 78% fully agree, 17% partially. Fully agree 93% of those surveyed and 7% partially agree that programme managers and faculty are aware of their learning challenges. Fully (79%) and partially (10%) satisfied with the conditions and equipment of the teaching rooms, classrooms of the university. According to 85% (fully) and 5% (partially) office equipment is available for residents on the basis of practice. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes - fully agree 83%, partially – 14%. Fully (57 per cent) and partially (16 per cent) satisfied with the library collection and resources. 52% of the respondents are engaged in scientific work under the guidance of their teacher or mentor and 21% believe that they are partially engaged. According to 88%, the organization of clinical training for residents fully satisfies them, and 9% partially. Satisfied completely (94%) and partially (3%) with the schedule and sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.). Satisfied with the methods of assessing my knowledge and skills – more than 90% fully agree, partly 9%. According to 84% of teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods regularly, and according to 2% - rarely.

According to 97% of respondents, teachers constantly provide feedback after completing classes and only "sometimes" and "rarely" by 2%. 48% of residents say that seminars are held once a week, and 31% 2-3 times a week and 10% daily. Completely satisfied that 98% study at a higher education institution, can not answer – 2%. Fully (78%) rated the organization of clinical training as "excellent" and "good" (22%). 97% of residents are proud of their clinical mentors.

According to 88% of respondents, accreditation is a necessary mechanism for improving educational programmes, but 5% believe that it is not necessary to conduct and 7% doubt the answer. The most important tool of external expert assessment, which allows to draw conclusions about the quality of educational programmes, 57% of residents consider interviews with residents, 45% attendance at practical classes and seminars, 57% interviews with mentors.

The survey of teachers included 23 questions of the questionnaire. In total 9 people answered, thus pedagogical experience till 5 years – at 22%, till 10-and years - 44%, more than 10 years - 33%.

77.78% are completely satisfied with the organization of the educational process, and 11% are partially satisfied. The university observes ethics and subordination completely agree 88%, partially – 11%. Fully satisfied with the organization of work and workplace 88% of respondents, partially 11%. In the organization there is an opportunity for career growth and competence development to teachers - 77% completely agree, partially – 22%.

In this educational institution, teachers have the opportunity to do scientific work and publish the results of research – 88% completely agree, partially disagree - 11%.

44% of respondents are completely satisfied with a salary, partially -33%, not satisfied – 11%. The majority of those surveyed in the last 5 years have undergone advanced training, so 66% have completed training in the last year. The majority of 88% fully agree that can be realized as professionals, and 11% - partially. When asked whether the university supports the teacher in participation in international and republican events, 77% answered positively, and 11% did not address this to the management or relevant administrative employees of the university. The majority of respondents (77%) fully agree, and 22% partially agree that residents have free access to patients and clinic resources. At the practical lesson, teachers provide residents primarily with syllabuses (100%), control and measuring tools (77%), cases (88%). The level of prior training of residents upon admission to training programmes is fully satisfactory to 33% of respondents, and partially – to 33%. About implementation of social programmes of support of teachers 33% don't know and doubt about their existence 22% of respondents. The management and administration systematically listen to the opinion of teachers -88%, there is no answer -11% of respondents. Various training methods are used in the training of residents, but more often oral surveys and analysis of the topic (77% respectively), analysis of situational problems (77%), work in small groups (44%), practical classes in clinical skills at the training and clinical center – 55%, also problem-oriented training (44%), test solution (55%), less often perform projects (22%). Completely according to 77% that this questionnaire will be useful for the development of recommendations for improving the university and educational programmes of the residency, 22% partially agree with this.

The results of the survey in general demonstrate satisfaction with the educational process, the resources of the clinical base, the competencies of teachers, and also indicate the existence of centralized management of educational programmes.

## 5. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the National Scientific Oncology Center LLP

## Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES Evidence of compliance:

## 1.1 Mission statement and deliverables

The mission of the educational programme and the final results are defined, the public and the health sector are widely informed about the mission of the educational programme and the final results through the website of the NSOC (http://cancercenter.kz – Home – About us). The mission takes into account the needs of practical health care, and the recruitment and training of specialists is carried out on the basis of monitoring the needs of specialists in health care organizations in the Republic of Kazakhstan.

#### 1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

The self-report fully reflects the autonomy of the medical organization in the formation of the educational programme, assessment and admission to the residency, selection of personnel for the educational process. Academic freedom of students is reflected in the Rules on the Organization of the Educational Process and the Control of Success. The self-assessment report details the final results of training in the residency, details all the skills, abilities and competencies that a graduate of the residency in the Oncology (Adult) educational programme must possess.

#### 1.3 Learning outcomes

The EP pays great attention to the formation of practical skills, the solution of diagnostic and clinical situations in patients with concomitant pathology. The main result of the training is the formation of an independent highly qualified doctor, with the need for continuous improvement of his qualifications and professional skills.

#### 1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final results

No full confirmation was found during the interview with all stakeholders.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 17 standards: fully -16, partially -1, non-compliant -0

**Standard 1:** Implemented

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) When forming the Mission and the final results of the EP, actively involve stakeholders (residents, teachers, clinical mentors, employers, graduates).

#### **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### 2.1 Postgraduate programme framework

The report on the self-assessment of the educational programme Oncology (Adult) of the NSOC defines a model of the educational programme on the basis of the established final learning outcomes of residents and their qualifications, which ensures systematic and transparent learning. The report provides convincing evidence with references to regulatory documents.

#### 2.2 Scientific method

In the process of training, residents master the basics of evidence-based medicine and use scientific data in their practice.

### 2.3 Content of the residency programme

The organization provides a student-centered approach, and this is confirmed in the report. The principle of mentoring of residents is implemented in the NSOC, and this activity is regulated in the Regulation on mentoring developed and approved by the Academic Council.

#### 2.4 Programme structure, content and duration

The division of disciplines by hours and semesters is carried out by the Department of Education. All academic disciplines and disciplines of the specialty are closely interconnected. The formation of the content of disciplines is structured into logically completed methodological blocks. The self-assessment report describes in detail the structure, composition and duration of the educational programme, clearly defining the mandatory component and the component of choice. Training of oncologists is carried out on the basis of an analysis of the needs of the regional health system. The programme takes into account the final results of training, clearly describes the minimum number of procedures and surgical interventions that a resident doctor must perform in each year of his training. When planning the educational programme, the needs of all stakeholders are taken into account.

#### 2.5 Organization of training

The main clinical base is the NSOC with 242 beds, of which 217 beds are round-the-clock hospital and 25 beds are day hospital, providing specialized and highly specialized care in the field of oncology, hepatopancreatobiliary surgery, transplantology, oncogynecology, angiosurgery, coloproctology, hematology and oncohematology, coloproctology, orthopedics and osteooncology. For training in the profiling and elective disciplines, residents are rotated to the multidisciplinary hospitals of "Medical University of Astana" NJSC, the State Enterprise "Multidisciplinary Medical Center" of the Governor's Office of Nur-Sultan, the National Scientific Center for Motherhood and Childhood of "UMC". NSOC LLP has all the accreditation requirements, in which medical care is provided within the guaranteed volume of free medical care.

## 2.6 Relationship between postgraduate medical education and health care

On clinical bases, residents are distributed to their mentors – doctors from practical health care, with at least 5 years of experience, who have the highest qualification category. Under the guidance of a mentor, residents acquire practical skills in diagnosis and treatment from performing the simplest manipulations to assisting and performing the operation independently. Feedback is regularly exchanged between the mentor and the resident, since daily interaction in the clinic implies an analysis of clinical thinking, an assessment of the resident's communication skills.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant with 31 standards: fully -30, partially -1, non-compliant - 0.

Standard 2: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) When developing and discussing EP, conduct a systematic analysis of feedback from clinical mentors, employers, graduates, including foreign partners, followed by corrective measures:
  - 2) Involve external examiners in the interim and final certification of residents.
  - 3) Improve the degree of settling of the teaching staff.

#### **Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS**

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### 3.1 Methods of evaluation

Assessment of knowledge of residents is carried out through current, milestone and final control. The NSOC uses software (easyQuizzy) for testing students with graphical support (diagrams, graphs, diagrams, drawings, etc.).

The assessment is based on an oral survey of topics, testing, a written examination and demonstration of practical skills. In order to objectify the evaluation process, independent experts are involved. When conducting the final state certification to assess the educational achievements of residents, the commission includes practitioners of health care, external examiners are involved. The results of students' academic achievements are recorded in the electronic and paper educational journal and form examination sheets. Training logs are filled in accordance with the calendar and thematic plan, in accordance with the schedule and the dates of the current, milestone and final control reflected in the syllabus.

#### 3.2 Relationship between evaluation and training

The methods used to assess the competencies of students in the NSOC are defined in the syllabuses for the disciplines that are discussed and approved at the NSOC EMS. The evaluation criteria are announced in the first lesson for each discipline, and are also presented in the syllabus on the NSOC website. Confirmation of the effectiveness of the education received is based on the results of feedback from the resident – an anonymous questionnaire, very acceptable to the resident, fair, adequate to the skills and corresponds to their future specialty. Evaluation of reports according to the rotation schedule allows to assess the development of the resident's competencies: personal interest, professional competence, communicative, personal qualities, scientific interest.

The conclusions of the EEC meet the criteria of 11 standards: fully - 10, partially -0. Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Develop a document regulating the unified evaluation policy, forms and methods of current, milestone and final control for each discipline using evaluation sheets;
- 2) Provide for an assessment of the resident's work in the clinic, on duty, during independent work using unified validated questionnaires and/or checklists.

## Standard 4: STUDENTS Evidence of compliance:

## 4.1 Admission and Selection Policy

Those wishing to enter the residency can submit documents according to the approved schedule. All the necessary information regarding admission to the residency is presented on the website and the media: astana.nroc- instagram; www.cancercenter.kz-site; astana.nroc-facebook. Applicants for admission to the residency can get advice from the education department. Also, during the examination, it was established that the procedure for conducting examinations was worked out, during which an examination commission is formed, which includes the most experienced, qualified teachers of the NSOC who have an academic degree. There is a list of questions for the entrance exam. Also, when admitting to the residency, in addition to assessing the level of knowledge, the personal achievements of the applicant, the results of previously performed research work are also taken into account. The transparency of the selection of applicants for the residency is ensured by the video recording of the examination.

#### 4.2 Number of residents

The number of residents is carried out within the framework of an order from local executive bodies, based on the emerging need of specialists. There is also a limited recruitment of residents for training on a fee basis based on the needs of the center. The organization monitors the needs of specialists in the regions, collects feedback from LEB and the number of selected residents varies from year to year depending on the needs of practical health care.

#### 4.3 Resident support and advice

Each resident has a clinical mentor with whom they have a close business relationship. By joining the team, residents become part of the clinical base. In case of difficulties or any difficulties in the educational process or work, the information from the resident comes first to the clinical mentor, who can solve the issues at his level or, if necessary, inform and involve the rest of the faculty members and the center management in solving the problem.

Residents have support from NSOC in the form of employment assistance. The Education Department monitors the career development of graduates and maintains links with them.

#### 4.4 Representation of residents

Residents take part in the formation of the educational process and evaluation methods. The NSOC LLP has introduced surveys, questionnaires, including questions on the schedule, methods of training and assessment, conditions of training in clinics, the availability of methodological and information and communication materials, relations with teachers. Based on the results of the survey of residents, plans for corrective and preventive measures were developed, there are no proposals for EP.

#### 4.5 Working conditions

The center has all the conditions for comfortable work of residents (there is a wardrobe, a place for eating, residents are provided with personal protective equipment, there is protection against X-rays during X-ray control operations).

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 30 standards: fully - 29, partially -1, do not match - 0

Standard 4: Implemented

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Include residents, clinical mentors, employers, representatives of professional associations in the composition of collegial bodies during the development and discussion of the EP, the programme of admission to the residency.

## Standard 5: FACULTY Evidence of compliance:

## 5.1 Recruitment and Selection Policy

Systematic work on the training and retraining of scientific and pedagogical personnel is carried out in the NSOC. The personnel policy of the center is carried out by concluding employment contracts, as well as competitive filling of vacant positions in accordance with the rules of the current legislation. Effective and open criteria for recruitment and appointment of teachers are applied by the management, which guarantees equal employment opportunities. The teaching staff is provided with all the necessary means and resources for the effective implementation of the educational programme. There is free access to computers and the Internet.

#### 5.2 Teachers' obligations and development

The scope of activities of the teaching staff and the criteria for training and evaluation are adjusted in accordance with the latest achievements of medical science, correlate with changes in the Mission of the educational programme for residency.

Pas is provided with equal opportunities for continuous professional training, which are consistent and contribute to the achievement of the mission and final results of the training.

The activities of the teaching staff are planned in accordance with an individual plan, includes educational and methodological, clinical, research work. In accordance with this, appropriate refresher

training cycles are organized for teaching staff, confirming certificates of advanced training of teaching staff are filed in the personal files of employees.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 7 standards: fully -6, partially -1, non-compliant -0

Standard 5: Implemented

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Continuously monitor the activities of clinical mentors;
- 2) Expand opportunities for internal and external academic mobility of faculty and residents (between medical universities of near and far abroad).

#### **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

#### **6.1 Logistics and equipment**

NSOC LLP has a fairly extensive material and technical support, during the expert assessment a sufficient number of lecture halls, study rooms, a simulation classroom, a library was demonstrated. The existing material and technical base makes it possible to effectively implement the educational programme. A study of the operating unit was also conducted, where practical skills are directly acquired by residents. The operating unit is equipped with modern medical equipment that allows to provide planned and highly specialized medical care.

#### **6.2 Clinical Bases**

The NSOC LLP has a sufficient bed capacity (242 beds), there are highly specialized centers (departments) in which residents acquire practical skills in the diagnosis and treatment of cancer. Training in the discipline "Radiation Therapy" of the Residency in the specialty "Oncology (Adult)" is carried out on the basis of the State Enterprise on the PHC "Multidisciplinary Medical Center" of the Akimat of Nur-Sultan in the Center for High-Tech Radiation Oncology. The center has 45 inpatient beds and 5 inpatient day beds. The discipline "Medical Genetics in Oncology" is held on the basis of the National Scientific Center of Motherhood and Childhood of CF "UMC" in the Department of Clinical Genetic Laboratory.

Residents attend a simulation class to practice their skills.

#### **6.3 Information technology**

A unified information space has been built in NSOC LLP, the therapeutic process is carried out using an electronic system. Modern information and telecommunication technologies have been introduced, and thanks to this, the teaching staff has access to relevant electronic educational resources.

#### **6.4 Clinical Teams**

Residents from the first days join the teams of NSOC, where they acquire skills to work in a team and learn to effectively interact with other health care professionals. Also, in addition to medical work, residents together with the staff of clinical departments participate in scientific and practical conferences, and work in multidisciplinary teams. Working in multidisciplinary teams when choosing the tactics of managing the most complex patients increases the responsibility of residents when they see that performance depends on the correct organization of teamwork. In such situations, the resident performs all work within his competence.

#### 6.5 Medical Research and Advances

Residents carry out research work within the framework of independent work of residents under the guidance of a mentor-teacher, and this helps to consolidate the acquired theoretical knowledge, practical skills and use them in their daily routine practice. During the expert assessment, members of the commission were shown publications of employees in collaboration with residents, speeches at conferences.

## 6.6 Education expertise

The Department of Education of NSOC LLP demonstrated that continuous work is carried out to assess the quality of the educational programme being implemented in the residency (planning,

development, evaluation, implementation and monitoring of EP), teaching staff, employers and students by residents, the Quality Management System Department.

#### **6.7** Training in other institutions

NSOC LLP has all the necessary documentation to ensure the academic mobility of residents and their training in other organizations of Kazakhstan and countries near and far abroad. In addition, the NSOC provides support in obtaining foreign educational/research grants to resident doctors based on their interests. Thus, in 2021, Kochiev Bayram, a resident of 2 years of study, was sent to an internship on 09.06.2021 to 29.06.2021 in Korea. The National Cancer Center in Koyan together with the specialists of the NSOC, the subject of the internship: "Nuclear Medicine".

Currently, a resident of 2 years of study Kaskenova A.A. from the Medical University Semey NJSC is studying under the academic mobility programme.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 21 standards: fully -20, partially -1. Standard 6: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Expand the number of level 1-2 clinical facilities (PHC).

## **Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION**

### **Evidence of compliance:**

## 7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

During the expert assessment, the management of NSOC LLP demonstrated the measures and supporting documents of these measures aimed at continuous monitoring of the educational programme. Evaluation tools and results of evaluation during interim and final certification are provided. The document "Rules for the organization of the educational process in the residency, approved by order No.106-OD of July 5, 2019" is presented.

#### 7.2 Feedback from teachers and residents

Opportunities have been created for teachers and residents to participate in the evaluation and subsequent improvement of the educational programme on a regular basis. Thus, the methodology "Questionnaire 360 degrees" is used in the NSOC.

Also, on a systematic basis, feedback from consumers of medical services provided at the NSOC, where resident doctors are participants and executors of the treatment process, is assessed and the questionnaire of patients clearly demonstrates the competence of residents and the development of their communication skills.

To assess the feedback from teachers and residents, the blog of the Chairperson of the Board is also used, where it is possible to directly receive answers from the first head of the NSOC.

In general, the use of feedback contributes to a better understanding of the current needs of students and teachers and is systematic when making changes to the educational programme.

## 7.3 Results of Residents and Graduates

The last issue in 2020 is -2 resident doctors, and in 2021 - 8 resident doctors.

In the process of external expert evaluation of the activities of the NSOC, it was established that 100% of residents received a specialist certificate and were employed in medical institutions of the Republic of Kazakhstan in a specialty. Also, during the conversation with employers, positive feedback was received about graduates of the Radiation Diagnostics in the walls of the National Research Center.

#### 7.4 Stakeholder Engagement

During the evaluation of the implementation of the EP in the NSOC, the education department demonstrated evidence of the involvement of all stakeholders in improving the educational programme. However, during the interview, convincing confirmation was not received from both students and from employers, mentors and graduates.

#### 7.5 Procedure for Approval of Educational Programmes

The procedure for approval of the educational programme is structured as follows. The supervising department of education carries out an assessment for compliance with the SCES. Further, the catalog of elective disciplines is approved on the basis of the needs of residents, employers'

requests, and according to the trajectories of specialist training, taking into account pre- and post-requisites. A competent representative of practical health care is also involved in the assessment.

Reviewers of the implemented EP in the specialty "Radiation diagnostics" were:

Dzhakipov Murat Abdrakhmanovich – Head of the Center for Radiation Diagnostics of the National Research and Development Center; Ilyasova Assel Adilovna – Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Radiation Diagnostics of the Multidisciplinary Medical (Oncology) Center.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Compliant from 15 standards: fully -14, partially -1, non-compliant - 0

Standard 7: Implemented

## Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Involve employers, representatives of professional associations, as well as foreign partners in monitoring and evaluating the educational programmes being implemented.

## Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

**Evidence of compliance:** 

8.1 Control

#### 8.2 Academic Leadership

The following documents were provided during the expert review of the EEC:

- 1. Order of the Chairperson of the Board of the NSOC "On approval of the Rules for the organization of educational activities (postgraduate and additional education)" No. 106-OD of 05.07.2019.
- 2. Concepts for the development of NSOC, approved by Order No.420 of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated August 1, 2019.
- 4. SOP "The procedure for organizing training in the residency and the procedure for interaction: curator and resident, clinical mentor and resident, medical personnel and resident, and resident" No. 262-OD dated December 30, 2019.
- 5 The results of the assessment of residents and the achievements of the final results of training under the residency programme.
- 6 Annual orders of the chairperson of the board on the conduct of the IPA and the composition of the attestation commission.

The implementation of EP by residency is carried out in accordance with the regulations approved by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as the internal rules for the organization of the educational process in the residency.

## 8.3 Training budget and resource allocation

The management of the NSOC clearly demonstrates the distribution of funds allocated to support the educational process. From the self-assessment report and the documentation provided, it was noted that the center did not finance academic mobility for the period from 2019 to 2022 in connection with the CVI pandemic.

#### 8.4 Administration and Management

During the meeting and interview with the heads and employees of the auxiliary units, it was established that the definition of the financial and economic policy and the management structure of the NSOC is the responsibility of the first head – Chairperson of the Management Board, Candidate of Medical Sciences Gulnara Utepergenovna Kulkayeva. The financial issues in the NSOC are handled by the financial and economic department under the leadership of the First Deputy Chairperson of the Management Board. The First Deputy Chairperson of the Management Board supervises the structures responsible for budget management, including educational programmes of postgraduate and additional education: the Department of Economics and Finance, the Department of Accounting.

#### 8.5 Requirements and regulations

The NSOC LLP follows the definition of the national authorized bodies of the number and recognized medical specialties and other functions of medical experts, for the training of which postgraduate training programmes are developed.

The NSOC implements the educational programme of the residency in the specialty "Oncology (Adult)", developed in accordance with the State Standard of Education for the Year 2015 and agreed with the priority areas of legislative and programme documents: the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" dated June 27, 2007 No. 319-III; the State Programme for the Development of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2011-2020. Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 7, 2010 No. 1118; State programme for the development of health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Densaulyk" for 2016-2019, approved by Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 15, 2016 No. 176.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant from** 15 standards: fully -14, partially -1, non-compliant - 0

Standard 8: Implemented

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Provide funding for the production of educational and methodological literature.

#### **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

#### **Evidence of compliance:**

The developed personnel policy of the NSOC, which reflects the priorities for the formation of human resources and criteria for the selection of personnel, including scientific, pedagogical and clinical merits of candidates.

Cycles of advanced training of teaching staff not only in the specialty, but also in the acquisition and possession of pedagogical competencies.

Plans for further training of teaching staff in accordance with the changing needs for postgraduate medical education.

Work is currently under way on the construction of new buildings of the National Scientific Cancer Center (commissioning is scheduled for Q4.2022). It is planned to introduce radionuclide therapy, laser therapy, robotic surgery, etc.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Compliant with 7 standards: fully -6, partially -1, non-compliant -0

Standard 9: Implemented

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Train clinical mentors in pedagogical skills and ensure their participation at all stages of assessing the achievements of residents.

## 6. Recommendations for improving the educational programme of the residency in the specialty "Radiation diagnostics":

Standard	C. Recommendations			
1	When forming the Mission and the final results of the EP, actively involve			
	stakeholders (residents, teachers, clinical mentors, employers, graduates).			
2	When developing and discussing EP, conduct a systematic analysis of feedback from			
	clinical mentors, employers, graduates, including foreign partners, followed by			
	corrective measures;			
	Involve external examiners in the interim and final certification of residents.			
3	Develop a document regulating the unified evaluation policy, forms and methods of			
	current, milestone and final control for each discipline using evaluation sheets;			
	Provide for an assessment of the resident's work in the clinic, on duty, during			
	independent work using unified validated questionnaires and/or checklists.			
4	Include residents, clinical mentors, employers, representatives of professional			
	associations in the composition of collegial bodies during the development and			

	discussion of the EP, the programme of admission to the residency.
5	Continuously monitor the activities of clinical mentors; Expand opportunities for internal and external academic mobility of faculty and residents (between medical universities of near and far abroad).
6	Expand the number of level 1-2 clinical facilities (PHC).
7	Involve employers, representatives of professional associations, as well as foreign partners in monitoring and evaluating the educational programmes being implemented.
8	Improve the degree of settling of the teaching staff.
9	Train clinical mentors in pedagogical skills and ensure their participation at all stages of assessing the achievements of residents.



#### 7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit the educational programme 7R01114 - "Radiation Diagnostics" of the National Scientific Oncological Center LLP, which meets the Standards of accreditation of educational programs of the residency of medical educational organizations for a period of 3 years.

**Chairperson of the External Expert Commission** Magyarov Valentin Manarbekovich Foreign Expert Ryzhkin Sergey Alexandrovich Lumming **National Academic Expert** Mustafin Alibek Khamzenovich **National Academic Expert** Zhumashev Ualikhan Koshkaralievich **National Academic Expert** Yesenkulova Saule Askerovna **National Academic Expert** Trynkin Alexey Viktorovich **National Academic Expert** Slavko Elena Alekseevna **National Academic Expert** Bazarbayeva Aigul Abayevna **National Academic Expert** Ulanbek Zhanbyrbekuly **Expert - Representative Of Employers** Ospanovamadinaeralyevna **Expert - Resident Representative** Baymukhanov Dauren Samarkhanovich

Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme (generalization)

		<b>50</b>		Evalua	ation	
Standard	Evaluation Criteria	Number of standards	*BS - fully compliant.	*BS = Partially compliant.	*IS- fully compliant	*IS - Partially compliant
1	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	17	10	-	7	-
2	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	31	19	3	9	-
3	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS	11	5	2	4	-
4	STUDENTS	30	16	2	10	2
5	FACULTY	7	5	-	1	1
6	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	10	-	11	-
7	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	15	10	-	5	-
8	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	15	8	-	7	-
9	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4	1	-	3	-
	Total:	151	84	7	57	3
	*BS – Basic Standard *IS- standard of improvement			15	1	

## Attachment 2.

# List of documents studied by the members of the EEC within the framework of accreditation of educational programme: Radiation diagnostics.

No	Names of documents	Quantity	Date of approval
1.	State license of the Committee for Control	1	date of initial registration - July
	in the Sphere of Education and Science of		08, 2010.
	the Republic of Kazakhstan dated		
	December 13, 2016		
	No.KZ81LAA00007958		
2.	Certificate of Accreditation	1	No.005912 dated 18.10.2019
			Nur-Sultan)
3.	"Rules for the organization of the	1	July 5, 2019 No.106-OD.
	educational process in the residence of the		
	NSOC", approved by the order of the		
	Chairperson of the Board of the NSOC		
4.	Educational (working) programme,	1	14.07.2020
	approved by EMC NSOC.		
5.	Concepts for the development of NSOC	1	August 1, 2019 No.420.
6.	Provisions on "Temporary scientific	1	No.197 dated 30.09.2019
	collectives"		
7.	Regulations on the Academic Council	1	No.129 dated 29.07.2019
8.	Regulation on the Local Ethics	1	No.129 dated 29.07.2019
	Commission		
9.	CED for 2021-2022	1	
10.	IEPI. WEPI		

#### THE PROGRAMME

## of visits to the External Expert Commission (EEC)

"Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care" (ECAQA) of LLP "National Scientific Oncology Center" (NSOC) within the framework of specialized (residency programme) accreditation

external evaluation dates: 29 March-31 March 2022

Time (s)	ACTIVITY	<b>REMARK:</b>			
29.03.22	Arrival of EEC members				
Day 1 – 29.03.2022 (Tuesday)					
8:45 AM	Gathering of EEC members at the NSOC (Nur-Sultan, Kerey, Zhanibek Khandar, 3 Venue -1 floor, small conference room	Transport, meeting and escort			
9:00-9:20 (20 <sup>'</sup> )	<b>Meeting of the EEC members:</b> discussion of the goals, objectives of the external examination, the programme and schedule of the visit to the NSOC. Distribution of responsibilities among the members of the EEC.	Venue: 4th floor			
9:20-9:45 (25 <sup>/</sup> )	Meeting of the Chairperson and members of the EEC with the leadership of the NSOC.  Chairperson of the Board of NSOC Kulkaeva G.U.  Content of the meeting: introduction of EEC members, familiarization with the objectives of the visit, interview with the management on the strategy for the development of postgraduate education (residency) https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5mMzU5T2hzbTJhUT09	Standards 1,8,9 5th floor			
9:50-10:20 (30 <sup>'</sup> )	Organization of training of residents.  Department of Education. <i>Zhukubaeva A.A. Beissenova n.d.</i> Meeting content: Functions of the department (position), planning (plan and report), monitoring of implementation (indicators). Number of cases. Formation of a state order by specialty, reception of residents (presentation for 5 minutes). Resident Assessment Policy (Academic Policy). Resource endowment. Competencies of residents, assessment of residents, employment of graduates.	Standards 2,4,7,8 4th floor			
10:20- 10:50 (30 <sup>/</sup> )	Scientific work of NSOC and integration of research in residency programmes.  Responsible person: Head of the Department of Science Saparbay D.Zh.  The content of the meeting: scientific directions, the system of				
10:50- 11:05 (15 <sup>/</sup> )	EEC meeting: discussion of evaluation results, exchange of views  Organization of training of residents. Video broadcast from the	Venue: 4th floor Standards			
11:05- 11:50 (45)	<b>operating unit.</b> Practical skills training and assessment of residents in the simulation room in the specialties of educational programmes.	2,3,6 5th floor			

	Responsible persons: <i>Mukazhanov A.K., Ibraev B.E., Sagandykov I.N., Uskenbaev T.A., Kurmanov T.A., Zhusupbekov D.</i> <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m</a> <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m</a>					
11:50- 12:40 (50 <sup>/</sup> )	Attendance at a seminar in the specialties: Hematology (adult), Oncology (adult). Responsible persons: <i>Kemaykin V.M.</i> , <i>Adylkhanov T.A</i> . <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m/MzU5T2hzbTJhUT09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m/MzU5T2hzbTJhUT09</a>	Standards 2,3,6,7 1st Floor, 5th Floor				
12:40- 13:00 (20 <sup>/</sup> )	Interview with Resident Trainers/Mentors  The content of the meeting: the mission and values of the organization, the contribution of teachers and mentors, the provision of resources for clinical practice and the work of residents, mentoring in the residency (Regulations, lists), the representation of residents in advisory bodies.  Responsible persons: Zhukubaeva A.A., Beissenova n.d.	Standard 1,5,7 4th floor				
13:00- 14:00	Lunch break					
14:00- 14:40 (40 <sup>/</sup> )	Interviews with residents. Venue: 5th floor, conference hall. Responsible persons: <i>Beissenova n.d.</i>	Standards 1,3,4,7 5th floor				
14:40- 15:00 (20 <sup>/</sup> )	Interview with residency graduates (online). Responsible persons: Beissenova n.d., Bakenova T. https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m MzU5T2hzbTJhUT09	Standards 1,7				
15:00- 15:25 (25 <sup>/</sup> )	Availability of teachers and mentors  The content of the meeting: personnel policy regarding the recruitment of teachers for residency programmes, the programme of motivation and development of teachers, training of mentors, evaluation of teachers.  Responsible persons: Adylkhanov T.A., Zhukubaeva A.A., Beissenova N.D.	Standard 5.9 4th floor				
15:25- 16:35 (70)	Visit to the training base of residents of the programmes Angiosurgery (20 min.), General Surgery (20 min.), Urology (20). Responsible persons: Sagandykov I.N., Uskenbaev T.A., Kurmanov T.A. Visit to the library (10 min)- Tazhmakina K.T. https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m MzU5T2hzbTJhUT09	STANDARD 6. 4th floor, 2nd floor				
16:35- 16:50 (15 <sup>/</sup> )	EEC <b>meeting:</b> discussion of evaluation results, exchange of views	4th floor				
16:50- 17:10 (20)	Study of documentation on the residency programme: EP, syllabuses, individual plans of residents, resident portfolios, examination materials, results of resident assessment (protocols, statements, etc.)	Standards 1-3 4th floor				
17:10- 17:30 (20)	Discussion. EEC shutdown. Summing up the first day of the visit.	4th floor				
Day 2 – 30.03.2022 (Wednesday)						
8.45	Gathering of EEC members at the NSOC (Nur-Sultan, Kerey, Zhanibek Khandar, 3					
9:00-9:15 (15 <sup>/</sup> )	Meeting of EEC members. Discussion of the 2nd day of the visit.	4th floor				
9:15-10:00	Scientific work of doctors-residents of NSOC	Standards				

$(45^{\prime})$	Responsible person: Head of the Department of Science Saparbay	2,4,6
	D.Zh.	1st Floor Standards
10:00-		
10:30 (30)	Responsible persons: Sagandykov I.N., Uskenbaev T.A., Kurmanov	2,3,6,7
	<i>T.A.</i>	1st Floor
	https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m	4th floor, 2nd
	MzU5T2hzbTJhUT09	floor
10:30-	Attendance at a seminar on specialties: Radiation diagnostics.	Standards
11:00 (30 <sup>/</sup> )	Anesthesiology and resuscitation, adult.	2,3,6,7
	Responsible persons: <i>Dzhakipov M.A., Umbetzhanov E.U.</i>	1st Floor
11.00		4th floor
11:00- 11:20 (20 <sup>/</sup> )	EEC meeting: discussion of evaluation results, exchange of views	4th floor
11.00	Interviews with employers of residency graduates	STANDARD 7.
11:20-	(online).Responsible persons: Beissenova n.d., Bakenova T.	
12:00 (40/)	https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m	
	MzU5T2hzbTJhUT09	C4 1 1 6 0
	Meeting with heads and employees of auxiliary (supporting) units The content of the meeting: funding of residency programmes,	Standards 6.8 4th floor
12:00-	provision of programmes with appropriate resources (equipment,	4th 1100f
$12:30 (30^{\circ})$	textbooks), grants for mentors, motivation to perform research, etc.	
	Responsible persons: <i>Mukazhanov A.K.</i> , <i>Shalekenov S.B</i> .	
12:30-	EEC <b>meeting:</b> discussion of evaluation results, exchange of views	4th floor
13:00 (30 <sup>/</sup> )	ELEC Meeting. discussion of evaluation results, exchange of views	111111001
13:00-	Lunch break	
14:00		
	Visit to the training base of residents of the programmes	
	Visit to the training base of residents of the programmes Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20).	
	Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20). Anesthesiology and Resuscitation (20 min), Gastroenterology (20	STANDARD 6
14:00-	Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20). Anesthesiology and Resuscitation (20 min), Gastroenterology (20 min)-	STANDARD 6.
	Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20). Anesthesiology and Resuscitation (20 min), Gastroenterology (20 min)- Responsible persons: <i>Kemaykin V.M.</i> , <i>Dzhakipov M.A.</i> , <i>Adylkhanov</i>	of the
14:00-	Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20). Anesthesiology and Resuscitation (20 min), Gastroenterology (20 min)- Responsible persons: Kemaykin V.M., Dzhakipov M.A., Adylkhanov T.A., Umbetzhanov E.U., Kaliaskarova K.S.	
14:00-	Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20). Anesthesiology and Resuscitation (20 min), Gastroenterology (20 min)- Responsible persons: <i>Kemaykin V.M., Dzhakipov M.A., Adylkhanov T.A., Umbetzhanov E.U., Kaliaskarova K.S.</i> <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m</a>	of the
14:00- 15:00 (60)	Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20). Anesthesiology and Resuscitation (20 min), Gastroenterology (20 min)- Responsible persons: <i>Kemaykin V.M., Dzhakipov M.A., Adylkhanov T.A., Umbetzhanov E.U., Kaliaskarova K.S.</i> <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m</a> <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m</a> <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m</a>	of the
14:00- 15:00 (60) 15.00-	Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20). Anesthesiology and Resuscitation (20 min), Gastroenterology (20 min)- Responsible persons: <i>Kemaykin V.M., Dzhakipov M.A., Adylkhanov T.A., Umbetzhanov E.U., Kaliaskarova K.S.</i> <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5mMzU5T2hzbTJhUT09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5mMzU5T2hzbTJhUT09</a> Visit to the oncology center under construction. Satybaev K.S.,	of the
14:00- 15:00 (60) 15.00- 15.40 (40)	Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20). Anesthesiology and Resuscitation (20 min), Gastroenterology (20 min)- Responsible persons: <i>Kemaykin V.M.</i> , <i>Dzhakipov M.A.</i> , <i>Adylkhanov T.A.</i> , <i>Umbetzhanov E.U.</i> , <i>Kaliaskarova K.S.</i> <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5mMzU5T2hzbTJhUT09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5mMzU5T2hzbTJhUT09</a> Visit to the oncology center under construction. Satybaev K.S., Shalekenov S.B., Raisov S.D.	of the department  New housing
14:00- 15:00 (60) 15.00- 15.40 (40) 15:40-	Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20). Anesthesiology and Resuscitation (20 min), Gastroenterology (20 min)- Responsible persons: Kemaykin V.M., Dzhakipov M.A., Adylkhanov T.A., Umbetzhanov E.U., Kaliaskarova K.S. <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5mMzU5T2hzbTJhUT09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5mMzU5T2hzbTJhUT09</a> Visit to the oncology center under construction. Satybaev K.S., Shalekenov S.B., Raisov S.D.  Questionnaires of residents and teachers.	of the department  New housing  Standards
14:00- 15:00 (60) 15.00- 15.40 (40)	Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20). Anesthesiology and Resuscitation (20 min), Gastroenterology (20 min)- Responsible persons: <i>Kemaykin V.M.</i> , <i>Dzhakipov M.A.</i> , <i>Adylkhanov T.A.</i> , <i>Umbetzhanov E.U.</i> , <i>Kaliaskarova K.S.</i> <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5mMzU5T2hzbTJhUT09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5mMzU5T2hzbTJhUT09</a> Visit to the oncology center under construction. Satybaev K.S., Shalekenov S.B., Raisov S.D.	of the department  New housing
14:00- 15:00 (60) 15.00- 15.40 (40) 15:40- 16:00 (20')	Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20). Anesthesiology and Resuscitation (20 min), Gastroenterology (20 min)- Responsible persons: Kemaykin V.M., Dzhakipov M.A., Adylkhanov T.A., Umbetzhanov E.U., Kaliaskarova K.S. <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5mMzU5T2hzbTJhUT09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5mMzU5T2hzbTJhUT09</a> Visit to the oncology center under construction. Satybaev K.S., Shalekenov S.B., Raisov S.D.  Questionnaires of residents and teachers.	of the department  New housing  Standards 3,4,5,7
14:00- 15:00 (60) 15.00- 15.40 (40) 15:40- 16:00 (20')	Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20). Anesthesiology and Resuscitation (20 min), Gastroenterology (20 min)- Responsible persons: Kemaykin V.M., Dzhakipov M.A., Adylkhanov T.A., Umbetzhanov E.U., Kaliaskarova K.S. https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m MzU5T2hzbTJhUT09  Visit to the oncology center under construction. Satybaev K.S., Shalekenov S.B., Raisov S.D. Questionnaires of residents and teachers. Responsible persons: Beissenova N.D., Bakenova T.	of the department  New housing  Standards 3,4,5,7 5th floor
14:00- 15:00 (60) 15.00- 15.40 (40) 15:40- 16:00 (20')	Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20). Anesthesiology and Resuscitation (20 min), Gastroenterology (20 min)- Responsible persons: Kemaykin V.M., Dzhakipov M.A., Adylkhanov T.A., Umbetzhanov E.U., Kaliaskarova K.S. https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m MzU5T2hzbTJhUT09  Visit to the oncology center under construction. Satybaev K.S., Shalekenov S.B., Raisov S.D.  Questionnaires of residents and teachers. Responsible persons: Beissenova N.D., Bakenova T.  Study of the residency programme documentation. Examination of	of the department  New housing  Standards 3,4,5,7 5th floor  Standards 4-
14:00- 15:00 (60) 15:00- 15:40 (40) 15:40- 16:00 (20') 16:00- 16:20 (20')	Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20). Anesthesiology and Resuscitation (20 min), Gastroenterology (20 min)- Responsible persons: Kemaykin V.M., Dzhakipov M.A., Adylkhanov T.A., Umbetzhanov E.U., Kaliaskarova K.S. https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m MzU5T2hzbTJhUT09  Visit to the oncology center under construction. Satybaev K.S., Shalekenov S.B., Raisov S.D. Questionnaires of residents and teachers. Responsible persons: Beissenova N.D., Bakenova T.  Study of the residency programme documentation. Examination of documentation at the request of the members of the EEC.	of the department  New housing  Standards 3,4,5,7 5th floor  Standards 4- 5.7
14:00- 15:00 (60) 15:00- 15:40 (40) 15:40- 16:00 (20') 16:20 (20')	Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20). Anesthesiology and Resuscitation (20 min), Gastroenterology (20 min)- Responsible persons: Kemaykin V.M., Dzhakipov M.A., Adylkhanov T.A., Umbetzhanov E.U., Kaliaskarova K.S. https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m MzU5T2hzbTJhUT09  Visit to the oncology center under construction. Satybaev K.S., Shalekenov S.B., Raisov S.D. Questionnaires of residents and teachers. Responsible persons: Beissenova N.D., Bakenova T.  Study of the residency programme documentation. Examination of documentation at the request of the members of the EEC. Responsible: Zhukubaeva A.A., Beisenova N.D., Bakenova T.	of the department  New housing  Standards 3,4,5,7 5th floor  Standards 4- 5.7 4th floor
14:00- 15:00 (60) 15:00- 15:40 (40) 15:40- 16:00 (20') 16:00- 16:20 (20')	Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20). Anesthesiology and Resuscitation (20 min), Gastroenterology (20 min)- Responsible persons: Kemaykin V.M., Dzhakipov M.A., Adylkhanov T.A., Umbetzhanov E.U., Kaliaskarova K.S. https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5mMzU5T2hzbTJhUT09  Visit to the oncology center under construction. Satybaev K.S., Shalekenov S.B., Raisov S.D. Questionnaires of residents and teachers. Responsible persons: Beissenova N.D., Bakenova T.  Study of the residency programme documentation. Examination of documentation at the request of the members of the EEC. Responsible: Zhukubaeva A.A., Beisenova N.D., Bakenova T.  Additional interviews of EEC members with representatives of NSOC on compliance with accreditation standards. Responsible persons: Shalekenov S.B., Zhukubaeva A.A.	of the department  New housing  Standards 3,4,5,7 5th floor  Standards 4- 5.7 4th floor 4th floor
14:00- 15:00 (60) 15.00- 15.40 (40) 15:40- 16:00 (20') 16:20 (20') 16:20- 16:30 (10')	Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20). Anesthesiology and Resuscitation (20 min), Gastroenterology (20 min)- Responsible persons: Kemaykin V.M., Dzhakipov M.A., Adylkhanov T.A., Umbetzhanov E.U., Kaliaskarova K.S. https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m MzU5T2hzbTJhUT09  Visit to the oncology center under construction. Satybaev K.S., Shalekenov S.B., Raisov S.D.  Questionnaires of residents and teachers. Responsible persons: Beissenova N.D., Bakenova T.  Study of the residency programme documentation. Examination of documentation at the request of the members of the EEC. Responsible: Zhukubaeva A.A., Beisenova N.D., Bakenova T.  Additional interviews of EEC members with representatives of NSOC on compliance with accreditation standards. Responsible persons: Shalekenov S.B., Zhukubaeva A.A. Overview of educational and practical resources for residency	of the department  New housing  Standards 3,4,5,7 5th floor  Standards 4- 5.7 4th floor
14:00- 15:00 (60) 15:00 (60) 15:40- 16:00 (20') 16:00- 16:20 (20') 16:20- 16:30 (10')	Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20). Anesthesiology and Resuscitation (20 min), Gastroenterology (20 min)- Responsible persons: Kemaykin V.M., Dzhakipov M.A., Adylkhanov T.A., Umbetzhanov E.U., Kaliaskarova K.S. https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5mMzU5T2hzbTJhUT09  Visit to the oncology center under construction. Satybaev K.S., Shalekenov S.B., Raisov S.D.  Questionnaires of residents and teachers. Responsible persons: Beissenova N.D., Bakenova T.  Study of the residency programme documentation. Examination of documentation at the request of the members of the EEC. Responsible: Zhukubaeva A.A., Beisenova N.D., Bakenova T.  Additional interviews of EEC members with representatives of NSOC on compliance with accreditation standards. Responsible persons: Shalekenov S.B., Zhukubaeva A.A.  Overview of educational and practical resources for residency programmes (Oncology, Radiology, Anesthesiology and	of the department  New housing  Standards 3,4,5,7 5th floor  Standards 4- 5.7 4th floor 4th floor
14:00- 15:00 (60) 15.00- 15.40 (40) 15:40- 16:00 (20') 16:20 (20') 16:20- 16:30 (10')	Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20). Anesthesiology and Resuscitation (20 min), Gastroenterology (20 min)- Responsible persons: Kemaykin V.M., Dzhakipov M.A., Adylkhanov T.A., Umbetzhanov E.U., Kaliaskarova K.S. https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m MzU5T2hzbTJhUT09  Visit to the oncology center under construction. Satybaev K.S., Shalekenov S.B., Raisov S.D. Questionnaires of residents and teachers. Responsible persons: Beissenova N.D., Bakenova T.  Study of the residency programme documentation. Examination of documentation at the request of the members of the EEC. Responsible: Zhukubaeva A.A., Beisenova N.D., Bakenova T.  Additional interviews of EEC members with representatives of NSOC on compliance with accreditation standards. Responsible persons: Shalekenov S.B., Zhukubaeva A.A. Overview of educational and practical resources for residency programmes (Oncology, Radiology, Anesthesiology and Resuscitation, Adult). Responsible persons: Zhukubaeva A.A.,	of the department  New housing  Standards 3,4,5,7 5th floor  Standards 4- 5.7 4th floor 4th floor
14:00- 15:00 (60) 15:00 (60) 15:40- 16:00 (20') 16:20 (20') 16:20- 16:30 (10') 16:30- 16:50 (20')	Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20). Anesthesiology and Resuscitation (20 min), Gastroenterology (20 min)- Responsible persons: Kemaykin V.M., Dzhakipov M.A., Adylkhanov T.A., Umbetzhanov E.U., Kaliaskarova K.S. https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m MzU5T2hzbTJhUT09  Visit to the oncology center under construction. Satybaev K.S., Shalekenov S.B., Raisov S.D. Questionnaires of residents and teachers. Responsible persons: Beissenova N.D., Bakenova T.  Study of the residency programme documentation. Examination of documentation at the request of the members of the EEC. Responsible: Zhukubaeva A.A., Beisenova N.D., Bakenova T.  Additional interviews of EEC members with representatives of NSOC on compliance with accreditation standards. Responsible persons: Shalekenov S.B., Zhukubaeva A.A. Overview of educational and practical resources for residency programmes (Oncology, Radiology, Anesthesiology and Resuscitation, Adult). Responsible persons: Zhukubaeva A.A., Beissenova N.D.	of the department  New housing  Standards 3,4,5,7 5th floor  Standards 4- 5.7 4th floor 4th floor  4th floor
14:00- 15:00 (60) 15.00- 15.40 (40) 15:40- 16:00 (20') 16:20 (20') 16:30- 16:30 (10') 16:50 (20')	Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20). Anesthesiology and Resuscitation (20 min), Gastroenterology (20 min)- Responsible persons: Kemaykin V.M., Dzhakipov M.A., Adylkhanov T.A., Umbetzhanov E.U., Kaliaskarova K.S. https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m MzU5T2hzbTJhUT09  Visit to the oncology center under construction. Satybaev K.S., Shalekenov S.B., Raisov S.D. Questionnaires of residents and teachers. Responsible persons: Beissenova N.D., Bakenova T.  Study of the residency programme documentation. Examination of documentation at the request of the members of the EEC. Responsible: Zhukubaeva A.A., Beisenova N.D., Bakenova T.  Additional interviews of EEC members with representatives of NSOC on compliance with accreditation standards. Responsible persons: Shalekenov S.B., Zhukubaeva A.A. Overview of educational and practical resources for residency programmes (Oncology, Radiology, Anesthesiology and Resuscitation, Adult). Responsible persons: Zhukubaeva A.A.,	of the department  New housing  Standards 3,4,5,7 5th floor  Standards 4- 5.7 4th floor 4th floor
14:00- 15:00 (60) 15:00 (60) 15:40- 16:00 (20') 16:20 (20') 16:20- 16:30 (10') 16:30- 16:50 (20')	Hematology (20 min.), Radiology(20 min.), Oncology (20). Anesthesiology and Resuscitation (20 min), Gastroenterology (20 min)- Responsible persons: Kemaykin V.M., Dzhakipov M.A., Adylkhanov T.A., Umbetzhanov E.U., Kaliaskarova K.S. https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9469145873?pwd=SFlvUlcxUW4xZW5m MzU5T2hzbTJhUT09  Visit to the oncology center under construction. Satybaev K.S., Shalekenov S.B., Raisov S.D. Questionnaires of residents and teachers. Responsible persons: Beissenova N.D., Bakenova T.  Study of the residency programme documentation. Examination of documentation at the request of the members of the EEC. Responsible: Zhukubaeva A.A., Beisenova N.D., Bakenova T.  Additional interviews of EEC members with representatives of NSOC on compliance with accreditation standards. Responsible persons: Shalekenov S.B., Zhukubaeva A.A. Overview of educational and practical resources for residency programmes (Oncology, Radiology, Anesthesiology and Resuscitation, Adult). Responsible persons: Zhukubaeva A.A., Beissenova N.D.	of the department  New housing  Standards 3,4,5,7 5th floor  Standards 4- 5.7 4th floor 4th floor  4th floor

8.45	Gathering of EEC members at the NSOC (Nur-Sultan, Kerey, Zhanibek Khandar, 3	
9:00-10:30 (90 <sup>/</sup> )	Design of EEC reports, development of recommendations for improving the implementation of residency programmes.	4th floor
10:30- 12:00 (90 <sup>/</sup> )	Final discussion of the results of the external specialized assessment of educational programmes of the NSOC residence for compliance with accreditation standards.  Completion of the Quality Profile and assessment criteria for compliance with the ECAQA accreditation standards by each member individually.  Discussion of recommendations for improvement and final vote on recommendations for NSOC  Final vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.	ECAQA observer zoom link 4th floor
12:00- 12:30	Familiarization of the management of the NSOC with the results of the work of the EEC, recommendations for improving the educational programmes of the residence	Venue 5th floor meeting room
12:30- 13:00	Completion of the work of the external expert commission of ECAQA. Signing of documents.	
13:00	Departure of EEC members	