

To the Accreditation Council  
of the Eurasian Centre for  
Accreditation and Quality Assurance  
in Education and Healthcare  
30.01. 2024

**REPORT  
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE  
RESULTS OF THE INSTITUTIONAL ASSESSMENT  
EI "HIGHER MEDICAL COLLEGE "DANALYK" NAMED AFTER  
Z.G.MURZAGULOVA" FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS OF  
INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION OF MEDICAL COLLEGES**

**external expert evaluation period: December 26-28, 2023**

**Astana, 2023**

## CONTENT

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1	Presentation from the educational institution "Higher Medical College "DANALYK" named after Zoya Galymovna Murzagulova"	4
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	6
2.3	Brief description of the report on institutional self-assessment of the educational institution "Higher Medical College "DANALYK" named after Z.G. Murzagulova"	6
3.	Description of external expert evaluation	7
4.	Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the Educational Institution "Higher Medical College "DANALYK" named after Z.G.Murzagulova"	9
5.	Recommendations for institutional improvement of the educational institution "Higher Medical College "DANALYK" named after Z.G. Murzagulova"	40
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	40
	Annex 1. Institutional quality profile and external evaluation criteria of the educational institution "Higher Medical College "DANALYK" named after Z.G. Murzagulova"	41
	Annex 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	42

## LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
<b>JSC</b>	Joint-Stock Company
<b>AMP</b>	Administrative and management personnel
<b>AC</b>	Appeal Commission
<b>OSH</b>	Occupational safety and health
<b>VEC</b>	External Expert Commission
<b>SBPEI</b>	State Budget Professional Educational Institution
<b>MSE on the REM</b>	Municipal state enterprise on the right of economic management
<b>SCES</b>	State Compulsory Educational Standard
<b>SCC</b>	State Certification Commission
<b>JD</b>	Job Descriptions
<b>ECAQA</b>	Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare
<b>healthy lifestyle</b>	Healthy lifestyle
<b>End-of-course assessment</b>	end-of-course assessment
<b>ICT</b>	Information and communication technologies
<b>ICE</b>	Institute for Continuing Education
<b>YAC</b>	Youth Affairs Committee
<b>MO</b>	Medical organizations
<b>MTB</b>	Material and technical base
<b>MC</b>	Methodological council
<b>MPI</b>	Medical preventive institution
<b>MOH RK</b>	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
<b>MES RK</b>	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
<b>RW</b>	Research work
<b>NCCE</b>	National Centre for Continuing Education
<b>IKAQAE</b>	Independent Kazakh Agency for Quality Assurance in Education
<b>SEW</b>	Scientific and educational work
<b>SPC</b>	Scientific and practical conference
<b>PO</b>	Public organization
<b>GED</b>	General education disciplines
<b>EP</b>	Educational program
<b>RC</b>	Regulations for certification
<b>PC</b>	Pedagogical Council
<b>WC</b>	Working curriculum
<b>mass media</b>	Mass media
<b>IWS</b>	Independent work of students
<b>SCL</b>	Student-centered learning
<b>LLP</b>	Limited Liability Partnership
<b>TC</b>	Typical curriculum
<b>TVPSE</b>	Technical and vocational, post-secondary education
<b>DIA</b>	Department of Internal Affairs
<b>EW</b>	Educational work
<b>EPW</b>	Educational practical work

<b>EMC</b>	Educational and methodology complex
<b>CMC</b>	Cyclic methodological commission

### 1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 31 dated December 19, 2023, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation during the period December 26–28, 2023 within the framework of institutional accreditation of the Higher Medical College “DANALYK” named after Z.G. Murzagulova" in the following composition:

<b>№</b>	<b>Status as part of the EEC</b>	<b>Full name</b>	<b>Position</b>
1	Chairman	NURGALIEVA GULMIRA TURSUNGALIEVNA	Deputy Director for Academic Affairs of the MSE on the REM “State Higher Medical College named after D. Kalmataeva" healthcare facility of the Abay region
2	Foreign expert	SALIKHOJAEVA RIKHSI KAMILOVNA	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of “Nurses with Higher Education” of the Centre for the Development of Professional Qualifications of Medical Workers, Chief Nursing Specialist of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Uzbekistan
3	Academic expert	SIROTINA ASMIK YURIKOVNA	Deputy Director for educational and methodological affairs of the Medical Centre "Emily"
4	Expert - employer	NARIKBAEVA NURBAKHYT TURSymbekovna	Obstetrician of the maternity ward of the MSE on the REM "City Multidisciplinary Hospital 2" of the Akimat of Astana city, WHO expert, national trainer on safe motherhood of the Republic of Kazakhstan
5	Expert - student	MURATOV SHALKAR SERIKKALIEVICH	4th year student of the specialty “General Medicine” of the College "Republican Medical Academy" Astana

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC. The EEC report contains the results of an external evaluation of the educational institution "Higher Medical College "DANALYK" named after Z.G. Murzagulova" for compliance with the Standards of Institutional Accreditation of Medical Colleges (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards) and conclusions, recommendations of the EEC for improving the main activities and recommendations for accreditation of the college for ECAQA Accreditation Council.

## 2. General part of the final report

### 2.1 Presentation from the educational institution “Higher Medical College “Danalyk” named after Z.G. Murzagulova.”

Name of the organization date of creation	EI "Higher Medical College "DANALYK" named after Z.G. Murzagulova"
Legal form of ownership, BIN	Private non-profit educational institution, BIN 980440003477
Location and contact details	Republic of Kazakhstan, 010006, Astana, Saryarka district, Koktal residential area, st. Ardagerler, 27 Phone: 8(7172) 30-09-05
Total area	4283 sq. m, including educational - 3126.3 sq.m.
Availability of a supervisory board/board of trustees	No
Management Body	Private non-profit educational institution
Full name of the first manager	Sarymsakov Zharkynbai Baymuratovich
State license for educational activities (date, number)	No. KZ11LAA00032110 dated 13.10.2021  In 2022, state certification was passed by the Committee for Control of Medical and Pharmaceutical Activities of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, order No. 46 dated January 20, 2023.
Information about branches, subsidiaries (if any)	Not available
Total number of <b>educational programs</b> for the last five years (the current year is taken into account)	<b>Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) programs -</b> 1. 09130100 “Nursing”, qualification 3W09130101 “Junior nurse care” 4S09130103 “General practice nurse”; 2. 09120100 “General Medicine”, qualification 4S09120101 “Paramedic”; 3. 09160100 “Pharmacy”, qualification 4S09160101 “Pharmacist”. <b>Postsecondary Education Programs (PSE) -</b> 1. 09130100 “Nursing”, qualification 2. 5AB09130101 “Applied Bachelor of Nursing.” <b>26 EP on additional and non-formal education of healthcare specialists.</b>
Total number of <b>educational programs</b> in the current year	<b>09130100 “Nursing”</b> qualification: 4S09130103 “General practice nurse” - 2 years 10 months and 3 years 10 months; <b>09120100 “General Medicine”</b> , qualification 4S09120101 “Paramedic” - 2 years 10 months and 3 years 10 months; <b>09160100 “Pharmacy”</b> , qualification 4S09160101 “Pharmacist” - 2 years 10 months. Post-secondary education programs duration of study: <b>09130100 “Nursing”</b> qualification:

	5AB09130101 “Applied Bachelor of Nursing” - 1 year 6 months and 3 years 6 months.
Total <b>number of graduates</b> since the beginning of educational activities	TVET students – 5025 people. PSE students – 81 people.
<b>Student population</b> in the current academic year	TVET students -1611 Students of PSE -375
Quality indicators in TVET	The number of expulsions over a period of 5 years is 677, including 173 people for poor academic performance. Employment rate, % over 5 years: 2019 - 78% 2020 - 74% 2021 - 80% 2022 - 82% 2023 - 81%
Qualitative indicators in PSE	The number of expulsions over a period of 5 years is 32, including 9 people for poor academic performance. Employment rate, % over 5 years: 2019 - no 2020 - no 2021 - no 2022 - no 2023 - 98%
Year of commencement of the implementation of additional and <b>non-formal education</b> programs, total number of programs and number of students trained	Start year: 2010 The total number of additional education programs (advanced training) is 25 with a total of 120 hours, 1 with a total of 60 hours, a certification course - 1 with a total of 450 hours. The total number of non-formal education programs is 2 with 8 hours, 1 with 16 hours.
Indicators of student training	The total number of students trained over 5 years is 516, including 128 this year.
Availability of a <b>simulation</b> room/department/centre	Name – Simulation room, Simulation room of nursing technologies with preclinical practice, Simulation room of childhood diseases with preclinical practice, Simulation room of internal medicine with preclinical practice, Simulation room of obstetrics and gynecology with preclinical practice, Area is 354 sq.m. Number of phantoms/mannequins is 547 pcs.
Availability of an office/ <b>testing</b> centre	Title – 3 Area - 156 sq.m. Number of seats – 60 Number of computers – 60 Availability of a proctoring system - yes
Full-time teachers/Part-time workers, incl. % sedate	The total number of teachers is 65, including full-time teachers - 46, part-time teachers - 19. Sedateness, 23% Categorization (medical), 39% Categorization (pedagogical), 62%

Number of scientific projects over 5 years	In just 5 years - 421 This year - 172
Number of republican/international agreements on joint activities for 5 years	Republican treaties - 2 International treaties - 4
Number of clinical and industrial bases for training and practice of students	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Clinical bases, total - 38, including clinics - 22, clinics - 10, private medical centres - 6</li> <li>➤ Bases for dental practice - no</li> <li>➤ Bases for pharmaceutical practice, total - 15, including factories - none, pharmacies - 11</li> </ul>
Website Instagram Facebook with active pages	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ <a href="http://www.cdanalyk.kz">www.cdanalyk.kz</a>;</li> <li>➤ Instagram (<a href="https://www.instagram.com/cdanalyk/">https://www.instagram.com/cdanalyk/</a>);</li> <li>➤ Facebook (<a href="http://www.facebook.com/danalykcollege">www.facebook.com/ danalykcollege</a>);</li> <li>➤ Youtube (<a href="https://youtu.be/53xdc77achA">https://youtu.be/53xdc77achA</a>).</li> </ul>

## 2.2 Information about previous accreditation

In December 2018, the college underwent the procedure of institutional and specialized accreditation for all specialties at the Independent Kazakhstan Agency for Quality Assurance in Education) <http://iqaa.kz>.

## 2.3 Brief description of the report on institutional self-assessment of the educational institution "Higher Medical College "DANALYK" named after Z.G. Murzagulova"

The institutional self-assessment report (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 98 pages of main text, 63 pages of annexes, copies or electronic versions of documents located at <https://drive.google.com/drive/search> (login: [danalyk.akkred@gmail.com](mailto:danalyk.akkred@gmail.com) password Astana2023)

The report is characterized by completeness of answers to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for conducting institutional self-assessment of a medical educational organization, which were provided to the college by the accreditation centre - ECAQA, as well as internal unity of information. Attached to the report is a covering letter signed by the director of the college, Sarymsakov Zharkynbay Baimuratovich, which confirms the accuracy of the quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 18 members of the internal self-assessment commission indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the institutional self-assessment of the college - Shabdanova M.A., deputy director for Scientific, Educational and Methodological Work (SEMW).

Self-assessment of the educational activities of the college, including additional and non-formal education, was carried out on the basis of the head's order No. 70 of September 20, 2023 (On the creation of a working group).

All standards contain the actual practice of organizing education for preparing students in 3 specialties and students in 26 programs of additional and non-formal education. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated in terms of the number of students, listeners, teachers, administration, information about selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of assessment of knowledge and skills. Included is information about **its own** material and technical base with a total area of two buildings of the educational institution of 1915.2 m<sup>2</sup>, of which 1731.6 m<sup>2</sup> is useful, the college rents an area of 2368 m<sup>2</sup> from third parties, clinical bases in total 37, contractual

obligations with partners (universities, associations, databases), financial information, plans for development and improvement.

The report contains reasoned data, examples of the implementation of educational programs, national and international events, educational and methodological support, and resource base, confirming compliance with the requirements of institutional accreditation standards.

The main indicators of the institutional quality of a college are the following:

1. International certificate “Industry Leader”;
2. National certificate “Industry Leader”;
3. First degree diploma, Editorial Board of the international encyclopedia “Best in Education”;
4. “Gratitude Address” from the Republican Association of Private Educational Organizations;
5. Letter of gratitude from the Centre for the Formation of a Healthy Lifestyle in Astana;
6. “Uzdik seriktes”, Department of Education of Astana;
7. “Altyn zhurek”, Department of Education of Astana;
8. Diploma “Zharkyn bolashak”, Department of Education of Nur-Sultan;
9. “Best Primary Organization”, metropolitan branch of the Youth Wing “Jas Otan”

The report is presented to ECAQA in a complete form, written in literate language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, tables and figures (diagrams, photographs) contain references in the text and are continuously numbered.

### 3. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work as part of the institutional evaluation of the college was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for Conducting External Evaluation of Educational Institutions and Educational Programs of the ECAQA. Dates of visit to the organization: December 26-28, 2023.

External evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit over 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Program (hereinafter referred to as the program), which is located in the documentation of the accreditation centre and in **Annex 3** to this report.

To obtain objective information, members of the EEC used the following methods and their results:

- interviews with management and administrative employees – 19 people in total;
- interviews with students – 46 people;
- meeting with listeners – 10 people;
- studying the website [www.cdanalyk.kz](http://www.cdanalyk.kz) ;
- interviewing 5 employees, 33 teachers;
- survey of teachers and students - 57 and 736, respectively;
- observation of student learning: attending **5 practical classes** (1. “Anatomy, physiology” - topic “An understanding of the internal environment”, group 2-GM-GK, teacher Kalybekova A.A.; 2. “Basics of medical biology and medical genetics” - topic “Medical protozoology and helminthology”, group 2-N-BK, teacher Rakhmetova A.Sh.; 3. “Microbiology” - topic “Very dangerous zoonotic infections ”, group 2 GM-BK, teacher Mantugelova A.K.; 4.“Organic chemistry” - topic “Elements of group VIII”, “Natural fats. Wax”, group 1-FM-V-11, teacher Sarsenova B.S.; 5. Topic “IVA top elements”, group 1-FM -AK-11 teacher Baygalieva M.B.) and **5 classroom lessons** (1. “History of Kazakhstan” - topic “Alash Movement and political views of Kazakh national democrats”, group 1-N-V, teacher Kasymov M.M.; 2. «"Kazakh language" - theme "What belongs to nature. Living nature and dead nature. Proverbs about nature", group 1-N-AK, teacher Nesipbekova A.S.; 3. “History of Kazakhstan” - theme “The historical basis of the



universal idea of "Eternal country", group 1-GM-BK, teacher Zhaksylykova G.E.; 4. "Mathematics" - topic "Cone note. Lateral and total surface area", group 1-GM-AK, teacher Karkimbaeva K.B.; 5. "Professional foreign language" - topic "Diet1", group 1-N-AK-11 teacher Suksulaeva T.P.)

- review of resources in the context of implementation of accreditation standards: 8 practice/clinical engagement bases were visited, including the MSE on the REM "City Clinic No. 5" of the Akimat of Astana, the MSE on the REM "City Hospital No. 2" of the Akimat of Astana, the MSE on the REM "City Emergency Medical Care Station" of the Akimat of Astana, MSE on the REM "Oncology Centre" of the Akimat of Astana, LLP "Pharm Health", LLP MPC "Hippocrates" LLP "Afiyat", MSE on the REM "City Hospital No. 1" of the Akimat of Astana, where training is provided in 3 educational programs with the participation of 8 full-time teachers and part-time teachers.
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 88 units, both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the units (the list of studied documents is in **Annex 2**).

The team of the accredited college ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the visit program and according to the lists of interview sites (Table 1).

**Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, talks with members of the EEC**

<b>№</b>	<b>Full name</b>	<b>Job title</b>
1.	Sarymsakov J.B.	Director
2.	Kustovskaya S.A.	Deputy director of EPW
3.	Shabdanova M.A.	Deputy director of SEMW
4.	Temirbaeva A.M.	Deputy director of EW
5.	Syzdykov K.K.	Deputy director of housekeeping department
6.	Kurmanova D.M.	chief accountant
7.	Suleymenova A.Z.	HR manager
8.	Yeleuova R.T.	Curator of applied bachelor's degree
9.	Bekbergenova D.S.	Head of the department of medical affairs
10.	Nurgalieva T.U.	Head of the department of first courses
11.	Zhagiparova A.K.	Head of the pharmacy department
12.	Orazaeva P.B.	Head of the nursing department
13.	Akhanova L.M.	Head of Department of Additional Education
14.	Mantugelova A.K.	Chairman of the CMC of General and Natural Sciences
15.	Seitakhmetova A.S.	teacher-psychologist
16.	Karpikbaeva Z.A.	Chairman of the Clinical Disciplinary Department of the CMC
17.	Nurgozhinoy A.T.	Secretary of the Admissions Committee
18.	Matbaeva N.M.	Head of the library
19.	Toleuova N.B.	the chairman of the trade union committee
20.	Teachers	33
21.	Listeners are representatives of practical healthcare	10
22.	Student	28
23.	Graduates	16

24.	Employers	8
25.	Student asset	18

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held based on the results of the external evaluation. Members of the EEC began drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the results of the external evaluation are made. The experts individually completed the “Institutional quality profile and external evaluation criteria of the educational institution “Higher Medical College “DANALYK” named after Z.G. Murzagulova” for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards." There were no comments made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improvement for the organization of education were discussed and the chairman G.T. Nurgalieva held a final open vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, and access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the team and the prompt provision of information to members of the EEC. Organization of transfers to all practice bases stated in the external visit program.

*When conducting a survey of students, 58.15% rated the work of the External Expert Commission on Accreditation as positive, 28.67% as satisfactory. The majority of respondents (70.52%) believe that it is necessary to accredit educational organizations or educational programs.*

*According to 91.23% of teachers, the survey conducted by ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving key areas of activity of an accredited educational organization.*

At the end of the visit, the chairman of the EEC announced recommendations based on the results of the external assessment as part of institutional accreditation to the management and employees of the educational organization.

#### **4. Analysis of compliance with institutional accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the Educational Institution “Higher Medical College “DANALYK” named after Z.G. Murzagulova.**

### **Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES**

#### **1.1 Mission definition**

The mission has been formulated and the final results of training in TVET and PSE programs, as well as additional education, have been determined, taking into account the proposals of stakeholders such as teachers, the student community, and employers. Additional and non-formal education programs are compiled on the basis of applications and proposals from medical organizations, and since November 2022, the college has been implementing programs developed and approved by the Educational Institution of Continuing Professional Development.

The organization's strategic plan for 2021-2025 has been reviewed, including such areas as: Ensuring accessibility of education and quality of personnel training; Updating the content of college education taking into account the needs of the labour market; Improving management and monitoring of college development; Socio-economic integration of youth through the creation of conditions for obtaining a college education; Strengthening the spiritual and moral values of the national patriotic idea “Mangilik El” and the culture of a healthy lifestyle, which confirms the fulfilment of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization. From interviews with students, it was established that before the start of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, and tell where to get the necessary information about the educational program, teachers, and training bases.

At the same time, when talking with students, listeners and employers, experts, a clear answer was not received to the question “Do you participate in formulating the mission and goals of the

organization, educational program?”, “What is the personal contribution, for example, of students to improving the educational program?” To these questions, students answered that the formulation of the college’s Mission was updated in 2021, in connection with the assignment of the college to the status of Higher and in connection with the change of name, and employers responded as follows: “The mission is relevant and does not require additions.”

To verify **standard 1**, a meeting was held with the head of the organization, Zh.B. Sarymsakov. During the conversation, the experts asked the following questions: What are the college’s plans for the near future? How does the college plan to strengthen its faculty in response to increased enrolment? Does the stated Mission of the college correspond to reality? Are college graduates employed in their specialty, are they in demand? During the answers, the director of the organization confirmed that the college follows the main directions of the Strategic Plan for 2021-2025. A building was purchased on street 12-31, building 41, on the territory of which it is planned to build a sports hall and an assembly hall. The director of the college noted that over 25 years in the educational services market, the college has trained more than 4.5 thousand specialists. All college graduates find work in their specialty, with an average employment rate of 81%.

During the implementation of program activities, namely, based on the results of an interview with the director, members of the consultative and advisory body - the administrative council, in interviews with students and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the college, took part in the formation of proposals for the formulation mission, while the mission is brought to the attention of potential students through the website, social networks, and information letters to medical organizations and stands in three college buildings.

*When conducting a survey of 736 students (on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>), out of 22 questions, a number were devoted to the quality of the educational process and educational program. It was found that 71.2% of students would recommend studying at this educational organization to their acquaintances, friends, and relatives. And 71.6% of respondents believe that educational program leaders and teachers are aware of students’ problems related to learning. To the question “Do you think this educational organization allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?”, 81.7% of students answered positively, 4.2% were not sure about this, 10.7% could not yet answer this question and 1.9% would like to believe it.*

## **1.2 Final learning outcomes**

While working with the college’s documentation, members of the EEC were convinced that the college was achieving good results in terms of students mastering educational programs. The end-of-course assessment protocols provided to the NCIE college show good results in passing an independent evaluation of knowledge and skills (average score 88.8%), which indicates the high-quality preparation of students of this educational institution.

Interviews with college administration revealed that the employment rate averaged 81%, not including self-employed students. When attending classes, it was also possible to make sure that students possess professional and basic competencies that are provided for by professional standards and are also reflected in the SCES. Interviews with employers showed that graduates, after completing their studies, are ready to immediately begin working in medical organizations.

The external visit of experts made it possible to verify that the college has developed and documented provisions for organizing the educational process. To flexibly respond to the needs of the labour market, taking into account new advances in science and educational practice, the college annually updates work programs in disciplines. When updating programs, employers take part, and the recommendations of the chairmen of the SCC are taken into account.

In the educational organization there are departments that are directly related to the educational process, which can be noted as the best practice in education, namely, the Pharmacy department, and the department of additional and non-formal education. This conclusion was made because the EEC

demonstrated the well-established work of these departments. The heads of Zhagiparova A.K. and Akhanova L.M., during the 3 days of the EEC's presence in the college, were able to fully show all the work that is being carried out in the departments, including the practical activities of students at bases in medical organizations of the city. Student of the "Pharmacy" department Korogez R. took 1st place in the Republican professional competition "Best Pharmacist-2023" in Turkestan. Test tasks at the department of additional and non-formal education were prepared in the MyTest program, Google Forms and in the Quizizz, Kahoot mobile application.

The results of studying the documentation demonstrate that the mission of the organization is periodically reviewed and updated, and the educational process is built in accordance with the State Educational Standard and Laws and Statutory Instruments (LSI) in the field of education and healthcare. With regard to additional and non-formal education, it is determined that the work is carried out in accordance with the current legislation, on the basis of the developed programs of the ALE "Union of Medical Colleges of Kazakhstan".

*The surveyed teachers responded that 68.42% were completely satisfied with the level of previous (school) training of students; 24.56% were partially satisfied.*

*Experts have established a clear continuity between the end results of students' prior learning and college education, and subsequent continuing professional development programs. The organization has developed 26 continuing education programs, including for the specialty "Nursing", "General Medicine", "Pharmacy". Students and listeners are informed about this.*

*91.23% of teacher respondents believe that students of this educational organization have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training program, and 5.26% partially agree with this.*

At the same time, during meetings with college students and graduates, experts identified a number of problems, including the lack of their own dormitory. This problem was solved by the college through the rental of rooms in the dormitory of the Industrial Engineering and Economic College LLP; however, non-resident minor students who participated in the interviews indicated the need for their own dormitory. Also an important factor in achieving the main goals, students noted the lack of a canteen for organizing hot meals for students, as well as a gym (in the educational buildings there are buffets for 25-30 people).

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.*** Complies with 8 basic standards: fully – 8.

***Recommendations for improvement:*** No.

## **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

### **2.1 Model of educational programs**

The college provides training in 3 specialties and 3 qualifications at the technical and vocational level of education and in 1 specialty and 1 qualification at the post-secondary level of education.

Educational programs implemented at the college are developed on the basis of state mandatory standards for levels of education in the field of healthcare and in accordance with the mission, goals, expected learning outcomes and consumer demands. The college has EP at all levels. The mission and goals of the educational programs implemented at the college are reflected in the working curriculum (WC) in the form of academic disciplines, different types of practices, forms of control, in the distribution of credits among blocks of disciplines, and indications of the proportion of classes conducted in interactive forms. WCs were developed on the basis of standard curricula for medical and pharmaceutical specialties with the active participation of the relevant structures of the college (CMC, teachers, students) and employers from clinical sites, reviewed by the pedagogical council (there are protocols) and approved by the director of the college. WCs for specialties are available from the deputy director for EPW, heads of departments, and chairmen of the CMC. All procedures for

approving EP documents were carried out in accordance with the regulatory documents of the Ministry of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The educational programs implemented at the college reflect all components of educational activities that contribute to the achievement of final results and the required basic and professional competencies, and the development of lifelong learning abilities. The college uses various forms and methods of teaching in a combination of traditional and modern educational technologies. In its work, the college provides all students with equal opportunities to receive a high-quality and affordable education (confirmed during interviews with graduates and students).

The components of the educational program, industrial (clinical) and professional/pre-diploma internships contribute to the achievement of final results and the required basic and professional competencies, as evidenced by the dynamics of the quality indicator of industrial and pre-diploma internships.

To develop practical skills, the college has a simulation room and simulation rooms (Simulation room, Simulation room of nursing technologies with preclinical practice, Simulation room of childhood diseases with preclinical practice, Simulation room of internal medicine with preclinical practice, Simulation room of obstetrics and gynecology with preclinical practice) equipped with modern medical dummies, mannequins, phantoms, simulators (547 pieces), and medicines. A medicinal garden has been established on the territory of the college, a botanical corner of medicinal plants has been organized in the building, and a visual pharmacy has been opened. The development of practical skills and competencies of students in special disciplines is carried out using the objective structured clinical examination (OSCE) method, using the “Standardized Patient” training system, according to the EP “Nursing” in the format of a demo exam according to World Skills standards.

*In the process of visiting the clinical practice bases, an external expert commission noticed that the college did not fully adhere to the goals, objectives and content of the internship programs. For example, group 4GM-ZhK underwent a cycle of practice “Palliative care” at the Ambulance Station, groups 4GM-E and 4GM-AK. The practice “Providing psychoneurological care” took place on the basis of City Hospital No. 1 in the intensive care unit.*

For the implementation of educational programs in specialties 09130100 “Nursing” qualification 4S09130103 “General practice nurse” - 2 years 10 months and 3 years 10 months; 09120100 “General Medicine”, qualification 4S09120101 “Paramedic” - 2 years 10 months and 3 years 10 months; 09160100 “Pharmacy”, qualification 4S09160101 “Pharmacist” - 2 years 10 months the organization’s documents contain an EMCD, consisting of a working curriculum for the discipline and a lesson plan, where the goal is defined and the integration of practical and theoretical components is taken into account. Compliance with state standards and standard requirements has been established. Attending practical classes on anatomy in group 2GM-BK on the topic “Anatomy of the respiratory organs”, volume is 4 hours, in group 1-FM-V-11 “VII A group (halogens)” volume 4 hours, in group 1-SDV – V on the topic “The Alash Movement and the Political Views of Kazakh Revolutionaries”, volume is 2 hours, experts received convincing data that training is carried out according to the schedule, according to the Lesson Plan, before the start of the lesson the teacher monitors the initial level of knowledge in the form of testing and frontal survey, students receive feedback from the teacher, have the opportunity to improve their skills in homework presentations, conducting chemical reactions, and determining the topography of the respiratory system. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational program, since experts studied the code of ethics approved on August 31, 2021, and during the interview, students responded that they were informed about the contents of this document.

Since 2010, the implementation of additional and non-formal education programs has begun. There is a Regulation on Additional Education approved on August 29, 2023. The total number of additional education programs (advanced training) is 25 with a total of 120 hours, 1 with a total of 60 hours, a certification course - 1 with a total of 450 hours.

The total number of non-formal education programs is 2 with 8 hours, 1 with 16 hours.

The analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in the advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the bibliography of EMCD and syllabuses, to the working curricula and lesson plans, and teachers use them in the classroom.

The mentoring system was assessed, which is described in the documents dated August 29, 2023, "Regulations on Social Partnership" and "On the Organization and Conduct of Professional Practice and the Rules for Determining Organizations as Bases of Internship." A total of 7 mentors (Abenova K.T., chief/nurse of the MSE on the REM "City Clinic No. 5", Malinovskaya L.N. - chief paramedic of the MSE on the REM "Emergency Medical Station", Mukhamedgalieva A.A. - head of the management department and development of nursing LLP "National Scientific Oncology Centre", Kairlova S.S. - chief nurse of the MSE on the REM "City Clinic No. 9", Kasenova B.G. - Chief/nurse of the MSE on the REM "City Clinic No. 4", Musulkanova Zh. .T. - chief nurse of the MSE on the REM "Oncology Centre" of the Akimat, Nurbekova Sh.A. - head/nurse of the MSE on the REM "City Clinic No. 6", Anarbaeva A.T. - senior nurse of the surgical department of the MSE on the REM "City Clinic No. 5"), the objectives of which are practical training for students in real workplaces when organizing industrial training and professional practice, participation in assessing the content, organization and quality of the educational process.

*When surveying students, it was found that in the organization of education, 78.53% of people were completely satisfied with the activities of mentors, curators, tutors, 13.32% were partially satisfied, 4.21% were not fully and partially satisfied.*

Independent learning of students is carried out in class and out-of-class time and is presented in the form of work with textbooks, reference notes, teaching aids, solving situational problems, exercises, completing abstracts or search and research tasks throughout the year (IWS materials are available). Additional education students perform independent work in the form of creating presentations, compiling crossword puzzles, writing abstracts on current topics: Evidence-based medicine in nursing, Features of measles in adults and vaccinated people, Prevention of whooping cough, etc.

*When surveying students, it was found that the educational organization has established a system of independent learning for students/pupils and 69.57% of people completely agree with this, 15.49% agree partially, 6.25% disagree completely or partially.*

The training of students is carried out in accordance with the current policies of professional organizations, as it is focused on the needs of practical healthcare. Students can interact with each other and teachers through available information networks: WhatsApp, email, teleconference, ZOOM webinars, test tasks for all disciplines are prepared in the MyTest program, Google Forms, have access to electronic information resources, which can be accessed from a personal computer or from a mobile application to the library of the medical information base "Electronic library system "Student Consultant", the International centre of ISDS-Kazakhstan reference system "ACTUALIS: MEDICINE", access to the library of the NJSC "Republican Scientific and Technical Library" and the NJSC "Astana Medical University" and through digital educational content COLLEGE SmartNation ([www.college.snation.kz](http://www.college.snation.kz)).

The procedure for informing students and listeners about their rights and responsibilities is reflected in such internal regulations as "Rules of internal educational regulations", "Guide for students", "Regulations on ongoing monitoring of progress and intermediate, end-of-course assessment of students", "Code of ethics/conduct of students" ", "Social support program for students." This indicates compliance with standard 2 in terms of adapting training to the needs of students and trainees.

The qualification obtained as a result of mastering the TVET educational program corresponds to the 4th level and the applied bachelor's program corresponds to the 5th level of the national

qualification framework in medical education and, therefore, the Qualifications Framework in the European Higher Education Area. **(ESG 1.2)**

The organization of education adapts training to the needs and wishes of individual students. For example, there are 15 students with disabilities in a college. They are provided with separate classrooms and assistants who are not subject teachers.

*When surveying students, it was found that educational organizations have and implement social programs to support students, and 71.74% of people completely agree with this, 2.45% disagree, and 17.39% have not heard of such programs.*

In order to improve quality and maintain academic integrity, there is an anti-plagiarism system that is reflected in the College's Academic Policy. When preparing materials for teachers and students for publication in the media, participating in conferences at various levels, and writing coursework for students in the specialty "Nursing" with the qualification "Applied Bachelor of Nursing," the work is checked for anti-plagiarism. The document dated August 28, 2023, "Regulations on Coursework," regulates the principles of quality and academic integrity, and clause 2.4 states moral and legal responsibility for the information presented in the coursework

## **2.2 Structure, content and duration of educational programs.**

In the educational programs of each specialty implemented at the college, the content, volume and sequence of courses and components of educational programs are determined, thereby ensuring correspondence between various disciplines. The principles of prerequisites and post requisites are taken into account, a balance is determined between the compulsory and elective parts of educational programs, including a combination of special disciplines of the compulsory component and disciplines of the elective component.

*When surveying students, does the content of the educational program (list of disciplines) in the chosen specialty meet my expectations?*

*yes, 76.36% of people answered completely, 17.8% partially, 2.17% no, 3.67% doubt the answer,*

The educational programs implemented at the college reflect all components of educational activities that contribute to the achievement of final results and the required basic and professional competencies, and the development of lifelong learning abilities. The college uses various forms and methods of teaching in a combination of traditional and modern educational technologies (confirmed when the commission visited classes). The college provides all students with equal opportunities to receive a high-quality and affordable education (confirmed through interviews with graduates and students).

The structure and content of the EP for specialties implemented by the college and for additional education are developed in accordance with regulations in the field of medical education. The content, volume and sequence of courses and components of educational programs have been determined, horizontal and vertical integration of disciplines has been ensured, a choice component has been included, a balance between the compulsory and elective parts of educational programs has been determined, and the deadlines for mastering the EP have been met. The content of the training is focused on competency-based learning outcomes. To effectively and optimally organize the educational process, the college uses the corporate information system GoogleClassroom.

The college has created conditions for high-quality industrial training and professional practice. The college has a wide range of social partners, which contributes to the achievement of in-depth mastery of knowledge, abilities and skills and the practice-oriented nature of the learning process and its compliance with modern educational requirements. There are 51 Agreements with practice bases by specialty. The timing and content of industrial training and professional practice are reflected in the working curricula and practical training programs. The organization and conduct of internships at the college is carried out in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No MOH RK-304/2020, the order of the Ministry of Education

and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 29, 2016 No. 107 and the internal regulatory document “Regulations on the organization and conduct of industrial training and professional internship.” Employers' satisfaction with the quality of graduates' training is 81%.

*When surveying students to evaluate the organization of training at practice bases, it was found that 69.7% of people gave an excellent rating, 15.63% gave a good rating, 4.21% could not rate it, 3.26% were satisfactory, 7.2% were unsatisfactory.*

*When surveying the question about whether there is sufficient time for practical training (managing and caring for patients, nursing rounds, working in laboratories, etc.), students answered: 74.73% of people completely agree, 12.77% partially agree, 12.77% disagree completely or partially 5.57%, I doubt the answer is 6.93%.*

Educational work is carried out within the framework of the “Unified Educational Program” for the development of national values, patriotism and citizenship, comprehensive interests and abilities of students, and the formation of a healthy lifestyle. The college runs social projects: “Ashyk Zhurek”, “Leader”, “Your health is under your protection” – MSE “Centre for Social Services “Sharapat”” of Astana, “Ak Zhol” - MSE “Centre for Adaptation of Minors”, “From Good Hands with love!” - Council of Veterans of the Saryarka District of Astana, volunteers at the NGO “Atamnyn Amanaty” (supporting materials provided).

The terms of work of the external expert commission coincided with the academic period of practical training in continuing courses of TVET specialties and professional practice in the final year of applied bachelor's degree. In this regard, the commission mostly visited practices at clinical sites. We visited City Clinic No. 5, City Clinic No. 2, City ambulance station, Oncology Centre, City Clinic No. 1, Pharm Health LLP, MPC “Hippocrates” LLP, Afiyat LLP, where students completed internships in general surgery, anaesthesiology and resuscitation, and nursing in therapy and neurology, in propaedeutic of internal diseases, in the provision of palliative and psycho-neurological care, in nursing care in the field of primary health care, in the technology of dosage forms, in the organization of pharmacy. Based on what they saw, and on the basis of the results of conversations with students and with the general heads of the practice bases, the experts noted that both the organization of education and the practice bases help students form and deepen their theoretical knowledge, develop communication skills, and contribute to the development of practical competencies of college graduates, including on simulation equipment. At the Training and Simulation Centre of the MSE on the REM “City ambulance station”, students are additionally provided with courses on BLS and ACLS standards by highly qualified instructors accredited by the AHA.

At the same time, along with many positive aspects of organizing and conducting practical training (for example, the City Ambulance Station already organizes thematic preclinical training in the context of each medical practical training, and then field trips as part of teams), *the college does not fully adhere to goals, objectives and content of practical training programs, namely, some bases do not correspond to the content of practical training. For example, group 4GM-ZhK cycle of practice “Palliative care” took place at the emergency station, groups 4GM-E and 4GM-AK. The practice “Providing psychoneurological care” took place on the basis of City Clinic No. 1 in the intensive care unit*

The analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in the advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the bibliography of EMCD and syllabuses, to the working curricula and lesson plans, and teachers use them in the classroom.

*When surveying whether you are satisfied with the schedule of classes in the disciplines of the educational program, 74.46% of people answered yes completely, 15.08% were partially satisfied, and 2.99% were dissatisfied.*

### **2.3 Scientific method**



The Regulations “On educational-methodological and scientific-methodological work”, “On the organization of research activities of students and teachers”, “On club activity”, “On course work”, approved on August 29, 2023, regulate, among other things, the fundamentals of scientific methodology that require for teachers there are appropriate requirements for their competence and for their reflection in educational programs in order to involve students in participation in small research projects. The fundamentals of scientific methodology are reflected in the working curricula of the disciplines, in the EMCD in the form of requirements for the formation of research competence of students.

The abstracts, scientific reports, publications, and coursework provided to the expert commission also reflect the scientific approach to the work.

Scientific activity in college is presented at the EP of applied bachelor's degree in the form of completing and defending coursework, at the EP of TVET in the form of research work in thematic clubs with the publication of articles, presentations at scientific and practical conferences at various levels, subject competitions, etc. (materials presented, confirmed in interviews with teachers, students, graduates).

The college has 20 subject clubs: Baby, Bobek, Ayaulы alakan, Embryo, Injection, Pulse, Scalpel, Virtuoso of surgery, Zhurek, The most useful indoor plants, Chronopharmacology, Water, mineral waters, and health, The use of ether in medicine, Miras, Digital , Medlife, In the world of arts, Atameken, Cultural heritage (work plans for circles, minutes of meetings, output materials provided).

Student participation in research work is presented in the diagram below:



The Applied Bachelor of Nursing qualification program contains disciplines that include the scientific foundations and methodology of medical research, including clinical research and biostatistics. (“Principles of planning and conducting research in nursing”, “Biostatistics and reporting of research results”, “Evidence-based nursing practice”).

When talking with students, the expert commission learned that they are familiar with scientific methodologies, use scientific data in teaching and know the basics of evidence-based medicine. During a conversation with teachers, the expert commission confirmed that the college trains students, especially applied bachelor’s students, in methods of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data, the application of scientific developments, and analytical processing of the information received. This form of training is organized in the form of intermediate discussions of coursework and club work, which are held once a month (protocols were provided).

For teachers, students and students of continuous professional development programs at the college, access to updated scientific and clinical data is provided through: the information and medical database “Electronic library system “Student Consultant”, the International centre of ISDS - Kazakhstan reference system “ACTUALIS: MEDICINE”, NJSC “Republican Scientific -technical library” and NJSC “Astana Medical University”, Electronic textbooks <https://okulyk.kz/>.

*When surveying students, it was found that the educational organization has access to student participation in research work and 69.02% of people were completely satisfied with this, 17.26% were partially satisfied, and 4.21% were dissatisfied.*

*When questioning students whether they were currently involved in a scientific circle or participating in a scientific project, the commission received the following answers: yes, I am - 40.1%, no, I am not - 33.8%, I doubt the answer - 9.65%, and 11.96% of respondents are looking for a research topic, I don't want to do research - 3.8%*

#### **2.4 Management of educational programs**

The academic leadership is responsible for the organization and implementation of the educational process in the college (confirmed through an interview). There is an approved Organizational Management Structure and Job Responsibilities for each participant in the educational process (materials provided).

The college has collegial governing bodies: the Pedagogical Council, the Methodological Council, the Council of Pedagogical Ethics, 3 Cyclic Methodological Commissions, and the Council for Crime Prevention, the Council of Leaders, and the Committee on Youth Affairs. All divisions of the college have regulations approved by the director, reflecting the content and directions of their activities. Management of educational programs is carried out on the basis of approved plans of the above councils, confirmed by minutes and annual reports. The assessment of the activities of all structural divisions is carried out in accordance with the intra-college control plan (materials provided).

The development of educational programs in the college was carried out taking into account the approved SCES for levels of education in the field of health care and standard curricula for medical and pharmaceutical specialties. The administrative management of the college, teachers, representatives from employers and students took part in the development of the EP. Each stage of the process of discussing the development of the EP was recorded at the relevant meetings (the minutes are presented).

Based on the recommendations of employers, elective components were included in the work curriculum: in the specialty "Nursing" the electives "Social Work" and "Family Care", in the specialty "General Medicine" the elective "Basic Life Support", from the current academic year to the working curriculum for the discipline "Emergency Care in Surgery" included the topic "ACLS (Advanced Cardiac Life Support)". In this regard, the teachers and staff of the college underwent a training seminar on BLS (Basic Life Support) and ACLS (Advanced Cardiac Life Support) at the RSE on the REM "National Coordination Centre for Emergency Medicine" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan at the expense of the college. The working curriculum of the disciplines "Nursing in Pediatrics" included the topic "Universal progressive model of patronage of women and young children at the primary health care level."

In the specialty "Pharmacy", the study of LSI of Pharmaceutical activities in the territory of the Republic of Kazakhstan was included in the working curriculum of the discipline "Organization and Economics of Pharmacy with the Fundamentals of Management and Marketing": Order of the Acting Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated June 15, 2020 No MOH RK - 65/2020. "Rules for the provision of the public service "Issue of a license for pharmaceutical activities", Order of the acting Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 4, 2021 No MOH RK-15 "On approval of good pharmaceutical practices". This order approves: (GLP;) (GCP ); (GMP); (GDP); (GPP). Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 2, 2020 No MOH RK-112/2020 "On approval of the Rules for writing, recording and storing prescriptions."

All educational programs, including training at clinical sites, are developed using modular-credit technology in accordance with the SCES of the Republic of Kazakhstan for specialties, taking into

account theoretical and practice-oriented requirements for basic and professional competencies and approved by the director of the college and agreed with social partners.

There are documents containing requirements for the structure and content of educational programs, including state compulsory standards for preschool education and training, primary, basic secondary and general secondary, technical and vocational, post-secondary education by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 348, state compulsory standards for levels of education in the field of healthcare, order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. MOH RK-63, Typical curriculum for medical and pharmaceutical specialties, order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 4, “Regulations on the working curriculum of the discipline” dated 08/29/2023.

At the college, responsibility for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process lies with the teachers themselves; this process is coordinated by the deputy director for scientific, educational and methodological work. Achieving the final learning outcomes in special disciplines is carried out through the use of traditional and innovative methods. The programs MyTest, Google Forms, Quizizz, Kahoot are widely used.

The content of work programs and the catalogue of elective disciplines reflect the needs of the healthcare system, including knowledge of regulatory legal acts, patient management tactics in the context of the powers of mid-level specialists, and each work program of the discipline provides for the formation of research competence of students. For the successful implementation of educational programs of the 4th and 5th level, the organization has resources for organizing the assessment of practical skills of students (there are 19 clinical sites, a simulation room, 4 modern thematic simulation rooms for preclinical practice, a medicinal garden, a botanical corner of medicinal plants, a visual pharmacy, training system “Standardized patient”). The college does not experience any difficulties when planning, developing and approving educational programs.

Teachers provide students with methodological and didactic materials in paper and electronic form, additional literature for preparing for classes through: the information and medical database “Electronic library system “Student Consultant”, the reference system of International centre of ISDS - Kazakhstan “ACTUALIS: MEDICINE”, NJSC “Republican Scientific- technical library” and NJSC “Astana Medical University”, Electronic textbooks <https://okulyk.kz/>

*When surveying students, it was found that in the organization of education, teachers provide students with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature, and 80.03% of people are completely satisfied with this, 14.67% are partially satisfied, 2.99% are not, 2.31% have doubts with the answer*

Students of advanced training programs are also provided with the necessary educational and methodological literature in paper and electronic form, additional literature for preparing for classes through: information and medical database “Electronic library system “Student Consultant”, reference system ISDS -Kazakhstan “ACTUALIS: MEDICINE”, NJSC “Republican Scientific and Technical Library” and NJSC “Astana Medical University”, Electronic textbooks at the link <https://okulyk.kz/>

The college does not have its own clinical base, but has 38 contracts, including clinics - 22, polyclinics - 10, private medical centres – 6, Bases for pharmaceutical practice, a total of 15, including pharmacies - 11. And to the question of the questionnaire “Is there enough time for practical training (supervision of patients, etc.)?” 74.73% of students responded with complete agreement, 12.77% partially agreed, 5.57% disagreed. Moreover, during the interview, all students noted that after completing classes, the teacher provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini-questionnaire, sorts out unclear questions).

The college provides clinical training in third-party multidisciplinary clinics and pharmacies; their employees are involved as teachers and coordinators of training based on

these clinics, which contributes to more adequate training in various aspects of the chosen field of health care. For example, chief nurses of City Clinic No. 2, City Clinic No. 4, City Clinic No. 9, NSOC, chief paramedic of the City ambulance station, etc.

During the interview, to the question "Do student representatives participate in the development of educational programs?", students answered affirmatively and positively.

The surveyed students are fully satisfied with the schedule of classes (74.46%).

## **2.5 Relationship to practice and health system**

At the college, the operational connection between educational programs and subsequent stages of professional training is ensured through cooperation with representatives of practical healthcare, college graduates and university teachers.

Management of the educational process, reflected in the self-assessment report, and general approaches to management were confirmed when visiting the EEC of nine practice bases and in conversations with the head, employees and graduates of the college. During conversations with employers, graduates, and young college teachers, we noted the existence of continuity between the college's educational programs and the subsequent stages of graduates' professional training. For example, the working curricula of the disciplines are divided into preclinical and clinical parts, where clinical classes are conducted at the bases of the MO by experienced medical personnel of the highest and first qualification categories, a college graduate Sagdieva L., who subsequently continued her studies at the faculty of medical and preventive care, a college graduate Urazbaeva L. studies at Nazarbayev University with a degree in "Academic Bachelor's Degree in Nursing", many college graduates study in an applied bachelor's degree on the job, mid-level specialists of the MO improve their qualifications through the college's continuing education programs.

The experts got acquainted with the work of such departments as departments of educational programs, including additional education, methodological service, library, cyclic methodological commissions, IT departments, psychological service, medical centre, youth affairs committee, and personnel service. A total of 13 meetings were held, and during cross-sectional interviews it was established that all participants in the educational process are in close relationship on the development and implementation of educational programs, achievement of final learning outcomes, determination of the future role of graduates in the health sector, requirements and readiness for the next level of education and training, lifelong learning, health system needs and other aspects of social responsibility.

The training of students in TVET and applied bachelor's programs is aimed at meeting the needs of practical healthcare. The interview with 14 employers was conducted offline and included questions such as: participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, participation in the development of educational programs, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of graduates, participation in student training through mentoring, providing students with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, problems of interaction with departments of educational programs, employment of graduates upon completion of college, etc.

In interviews with employers, experts received information that the college is a specialized organization in Astana, provides great opportunities and conditions for qualified training of specialists, and that college graduates are in great demand among medical organizations in the city. This is facilitated by mentoring, which is carried out in seven medical organizations in the city. The employment rate of graduates is 85%.

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.*** Compliant out of 14 basic standards: fully -13, partially -1, do not comply - 0.

### ***Recommendations for improvement:***

1) Industrial internships must be organized at clinical sites and departments that correspond to the goals, objectives and content of the internship programs (2.2.3)

## **Standard 3: ASSESSMENT**

### **3.1 Assessment methods**

The college has determined, approved and published the principles and criteria for assessing students and listeners (reflected in the Regulations: On conducting ongoing monitoring of academic performance, intermediate and end-of-course assessment of students, On organizing basic, current, final control of students, On the objective structured clinical examination (OSCE), About course work, About additional education). The list of disciplines of the modules and the form for conducting intermediate certification of students is established by the college in accordance with the WC (there is an approved schedule of the educational process, a schedule of exams, the work programs of the disciplines contain forms for evaluating learning outcomes).

The policy of transparency and fairness in grading students, appealing assessment results, and during intermediate and end-of-course assessment by the college is observed (external examiners are involved).

Examination material for the disciplines was developed by teachers, reviewed at meetings of the CMC and approved by the deputy director for EPW (CMC protocols and examination material are presented).

The college has criteria for evaluating the educational achievements of students developed in accordance with the goals and objectives for the implementation of the EP and assigned qualifications within the framework of the current point-rating letter system. The student evaluation scale and evaluation criteria, forms of all types of control are available to participants in the educational process through the student's guide and working curricula, educational and methodological complexes.

End-of-course assessment is carried out on the basis of Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No MOH RK-249/2020. The composition of the State Certification Commission was approved by order of the director (the ratio was maintained at 60% from representatives of employers and 40% from representatives of the college). Protocols of the results of knowledge evaluation based on the results of end-of-course assessment are available. The Report of the Chairman of the Commission reflects the level of training of students in the EP, the characteristics of the students' knowledge identified in the exam, shortcomings in training on certain issues of the disciplines, recommendations for further improvement of the training of qualified personnel in the EP (reflected in the minutes of the pedagogical council).

At the College, students who have not passed the intermediate certification due to illness or other valid reasons are given individual deadlines for passing them (approved by order of the director). In matters of retaking the exam, if a grade of "unsatisfactory" is received, the requirements of the LSIs are met.

The study of control and measurement tools (CIS) (examination cards, test tasks of various levels of complexity, situational and clinical tasks, standards for manipulative techniques, checklists, etc.) showed that the college has implemented an appropriate evaluation policy that allows for a comprehensive evaluation educational achievements of students. CIS are available for all disciplines of educational programs; reviewed at meetings of the CMC and approved by the methodological council of the college, reviewed annually (minutes of the meetings are presented). Test tasks for all disciplines were prepared in the MyTest program, Google Forms and in the mobile application Quizizz, Kahoot (demonstrated to the commission). During the interviews, students spoke about such forms of knowledge assessment as an individual survey, a frontal survey, electronic testing, presentation, group assessment, simulations, essays, midterm control, an exam, including an objective-structured clinical exam, and a test. Students expressed satisfaction with the forms and methods of evaluating their knowledge.

Feedback in the teacher-student relationship in college is provided by the teacher commenting on each grade given, conducting a survey of students to monitor the effectiveness of educational

services, student satisfaction with support provided to them and learning outcomes (confirmed during interviews with students).

The system for appealing evaluation results is reflected in the “Regulations on ongoing monitoring of academic performance and intermediate, end-of-course assessment of students”, the composition of the certification commission (CC) was approved by order of the director. During the period of operation of the educational organization, there were no precedents for appeal and, accordingly, this norm was not applied.

Thus, to verify the data of **standard 3**, the experts asked the deputy directors for EPW and SEMW, the heads of departments, the head of the department of additional education, the chairmen of the CMC, the system administrator, teachers and students questions regarding the principles, methods and practices used to evaluate students of all educational programs, maintaining a balance between written and oral examinations, definitions criterion for establishing passing scores, grades and the number of permitted retakes. The commission checked documents and methods for assessing students and trainees (regulations, work curricula, journals of theoretical training and practical training, student record books, examination sheets, summary statements of academic performance by groups, FCC protocols, results of control sections of knowledge in special disciplines, protocols collegial bodies for monitoring the assessment of the effectiveness of mastering the required level of competencies, achieving the final learning outcomes, teaching methods and evaluation).

Thus, the commission was convinced that the college has a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and staff, and includes documents such as annual plans, annual reports, regulations of departments, regulations on councils and collegial bodies, job descriptions, contracts with teachers and students, and educational and methodological documentation (working syllabuses of EP, working syllabuses of disciplines, lesson plans, educational journals), evaluation tools (checklists, statements, NCIE protocols), evidence, certificates and verifications. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the documents necessary for students and trainees (external and internal regulatory documents, educational process schedule, class schedule, industrial training schedule, internal regulations, student guide, code of ethics of conduct, practical training bases, information and business projects on lifelong learning, etc.) and some of the information is updated at certain intervals. This information was also obtained during an interview with the system administrator.

### **3.2 Relationship between assessment and learning**

The college ensures the relationship between assessment and learning through communication with the student in the form of comments by the teacher on each grade given, discussion of the results of intermediate and final exams in academic departments and at meetings of collegial bodies, bringing information to the attention of the entire teaching staff and college management for making management decisions and implementing corrective actions (confirmed through interviews with students, teachers and heads of departments, PC and MC protocols are available).

The criteria for evaluating the educational achievements of students are developed in accordance with the set goals and objectives for the implementation of the EP and assigned qualifications (confirmed by information in the student guide and in WC, as well as in interviews with students, teachers and heads of departments).

Through the survey “Satisfaction of college students with support provided to them”, “Student satisfaction with learning outcomes”, the college evaluates the effectiveness of the provision of educational services, identifies shortcomings, adjusts approaches to organizing training, introduces new teaching methods, and improves educational resources.

*According to the survey results, 87.0% of students are satisfied with the educational services provided, and 71.6% of students confirm that program directors and teachers are fully aware of students' problems related to studying in college.*

The results of student evaluation are documented in theoretical/practical training journals,

industrial training journals, examination sheets, and NCIE end-of-course assessment protocols. The organization evaluates the reliability and validity of evaluation methods by attracting external examiners and conducting end-of-course assessment of graduates through an independent assessment of knowledge at the NCIE.

When conducting interviews with 33 teachers regarding methods for evaluating students' knowledge and skills, experts received convincing information that an individual rational approach to the selection of assessment methods (oral, written, two-stage, demonstration) are applied to each discipline. During the interview, 28 students also shared their opinions about the timeliness of providing tests, counselling before exams, the clarity of the entire evaluation procedure and its fairness. For example, students said that when assessing knowledge, teachers adhere to academic honesty, give the student the opportunity to reveal themselves fully, inform them about the system for appealing student assessment results, and together with them conduct a qualitative analysis of the assessment results. Listeners (13 people) also expressed their opinion regarding assessment methods; they confirmed their complete satisfaction with such forms and methods for assessing their knowledge, such as test tasks prepared in the MyTest program, Google Forms and in the Quizizz, Kahoot mobile application, a structured practical exam.

During the visit to the organization, management was asked the question: “Are external examiners involved in order to improve the fairness, quality and transparency of the evaluation process?” And the answer was “yes” (confirmed during interviews with employers).

The experts examined the resources for organizing the assessment of knowledge and practical skills, namely, the testing room/centre, subject rooms of general professional disciplines and pharmaceutical disciplines, a simulation room and simulation rooms, clinical practice bases, and pharmacies.

Interviewed 8 representatives of employers also indicated that the training of graduates corresponds to the modern development of medical practice and science, since the college is in close cooperation with practical healthcare and pharmaceutical services in the development of educational programs in terms of the choice component, taking into account theoretical and practice-oriented requirements for basic and professional competencies, in the development of work curricula taking into account the needs of the healthcare system, including the final learning outcomes. Employers said that they themselves participate in the assessment of students, since they are included in the examination commissions, and also participate in the acceptance of reports on industrial and professional practices. But the educational organization did not provide systematic feedback to them. Employers believe that the college graduates with sufficiently prepared students for practical work.

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria*** comply with 7 basic standards: completely – 7.

***Recommendations for improvement:*** no.

## **Standard 4: STUDENTS**

### **4.1 Admission and selection policy**

At the time of the external visit, 1,986 students were studying at the college on a commercial basis in three educational programs; there were no students studying on a budget at the college.

During the external visit, the college provided the Rules for admission to the educational institution “Higher Medical College “DANALYK” named after Z.G. Murzagulova” for the 2023-2024 academic year. Analysis of the materials confirmed that the work on admission to the college is carried out in accordance with the Model Rules. Information about the rules of admission to the college is available to all interested parties on the college website [cdanalyk.kz](http://cdanalyk.kz).

There is a reference book for adaptation of freshmen to college. From interviews with students, it was found that the college is carrying out systematic career guidance work. Open days are held, where visual video materials are shown, an overview of the educational resources of the college, simulation

centre, and information booklets and printed materials about the college are distributed. Career guidance work is carried out through social networks Instagram, WhatsApp, TikTok. These social networks are led and supervised by the executive secretary of the admissions committee, A.T. Nurgozhina.

Information boards in the college reflect regulatory documents on admission, transfer and reinstatement of students.

Materials on student admission and teacher selection were studied and compliance with **standard 4** was established.

The organization has a policy for the admission of students, which is called the Rules for Admission to the Educational Institution "Higher Medical College "DANALYK" named after Z.G. Murzagulova." The secretary of the admissions committee, Nurgozhina A.T., spoke about the student admission policy. Approaches to student admission are based on the requirements of the country and internal regulations, namely, Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 18, 2018 No. 578 "On approval of the Standard Rules for admission to training in organizations implementing professional educational programs of technical and vocational education " From the documentation provided by the EEC, it was established that among the students admitted to the college there are various categories. From 2019 to 2023, 49 students from large families are studying at the college, 20 of them are studying with a 10% discount from the founders, 37 are orphans, 15 students without parental care, and one of them has a disability. 7 students study free of charge, 7 with a 50% discount from the founders, 4 with a 25% discount from the founders, 13 students receive TSA (targeted social assistance).

In total, from 2019 to 2023, student enrollment doubled: 2019-2020 - 413, 2020-2021 - 508, 2021-2022 - 793, 2022-2023 - 842 students.

Listeners are accepted in accordance with the applications of medical organizations. The interview showed that every year, in order to determine the plan for admitting students, the college requests information from medical organizations in Astana and the Akmola region about the need for mid-level medical specialists. In addition, round tables and conferences are held with the mandatory participation of employers. In accordance with the material, technical, educational and methodological capabilities, and the availability of human resources, the college determines the number of students accepted.

A balance is ensured between the existing potential of the educational organization and the opportunities for training and recruitment of students and listeners, since the organization has its own educational buildings, simulation rooms with a total area of 354 sq.m., which are equipped with 547 phantoms and mannequins.

Secretary of the admissions committee Nurgozhina A.T. said that for persons with technical and vocational education applying for the qualification "Applied Bachelor of Nursing", corresponding to the specialty profile, a special exam is established in the form of writing an essay, including with the use of information and communication technologies. The topic of the essay, the requirements for writing it and the assessment criteria are determined by the college examination committee.

Psychometric testing is carried out in accordance with the recommendations of the educational and methodological association in the "Healthcare" profile. Thus, experts validated the data according to **standard 4**.

The experts reviewed the student admission documentation, including personal files, certificates, and written works (essays). Many of the papers are well written, but there are criticisms regarding the essay topics. It is recommended to diversify and update essay topics.

Regarding the practice of academic advising, personal support for students and the development of not only professional skills, experts surveyed students, graduates, and trainees. Academic counselling at the college is provided throughout the entire period of study. During interviews, teachers said that they provide individual assistance to students on issues of the educational process.



Schedules of consultations and individual lessons for teachers are posted on information stands and in offices. During the period of preparation for the intermediate certification, consultations are carried out at the expense of the allotted time budget.

Students are included in such advisory bodies as the Pedagogical Council, which includes Nazgul Mirzabekova, a student of group 2-GM-VK, she is a member of the college student activists.

#### **4.2 Recruitment of students.**

The interview showed that the formation of the college student population is carried out on the basis of applications from healthcare organizations and contracts with legal entities and individuals. Enrolment and expulsion of students is carried out by order of the director. Persons who have completed Competence Development Programme, as well as those who have completed the certification cycle, are issued a certificate of the established form based on a positive result of the final control. Those who have completed non-formal education are issued a certificate/attestation. Thus, the formation of a group of students for basic advanced training programs is carried out on the basis of the submitted application of the students and in the presence of appropriate medical education.

The motivation system for students to enrol in Competence Development Programme and non-formal education programs is:

- College accreditation;
- Certificate of completion of training in the established form;
- Discounts for graduates of the college of the educational institution “Higher Medical College “DANALYK” named after Z.G. Murzagulova”;
- Drawing up a schedule and a detailed training schedule so that students can plan their time;
- Links to paid resources: information and medical database “Electronic library system “Student Consultant”, International centre of ISDS -Kazakhstan reference system “ACTUALIS: MEDICINE”, NJSC “Republican Scientific and Technical Library” and NJSC “Astana Medical University”.

While entering college on an individual basis, the decision of the founders provides benefits. Over the past three years, there has been a steady increase in the college's enrolment rate from 413 students in 2019 to 842 students in 2022. Recruitment of applicants is carried out taking into account the design capacity of the college. The enrolment of students in the college corresponds to the human, material and technical resources and educational potential of the college.

#### **4.3 Consulting and support for students.**

The college carries out systematic career guidance work using various forms. Open Days are organized, excursions around the college are held, information posters and booklets are provided, presentations and promotional videos are shown. College accounts on social networks are actively used for career guidance purposes.

As part of the student support and counselling program, the college operates a psychological service that provides counselling assistance to students. Consultations are carried out at the request of curators, college administration, parents, at the request of students, and based on the results of the diagnostic work carried out. All consultations are recorded in the individual consultation log. When visiting the psychological service office of the college, psychologist A.S. Seitakhmetova showed the magazines. The EEC was able to verify that the work was being carried out in accordance with the requirements. If necessary, the psychologist schedules a series of follow-up meetings, conducts individual correctional classes, and invites you to group consultations.

Students who miss classes are given the opportunity to get advice during additional classes organized by the subject teacher. The schedule of additional classes, after agreement with teachers and heads of departments, is approved by the deputy director for EPW and placed in the office of the subject teachers.

The college has implemented a system of social protection for students. Deputy Director for EW Temirbayeva Alma Meirbekovna said that the founders give discounts on payment to orphans, children without parental care, disabled people, low-income people and large families. The founders of the

college also provide targeted charitable assistance: New Year's gifts, tuition discounts, and financial assistance.

To provide primary (pre-hospital) health care at the college, there are first aid stations in two buildings. At the same time, both medical centres have one nurse, which is very difficult with a student population of 2,000. The director of the college explained that in the absence of a nurse, doctor Mukataeva G.K. from Family Health Centre No. 5, to which the students are assigned, is working in the building on Zheltoksan Street. At the time of the EEC's work, when familiarizing themselves with the material and technical base of the college, doctor G.K. Mukataeva conducted an examination and consultation of the student online, via a WhatsApp video link. The EEC recommended that the college find the opportunity to hire one more nurse, according to the contingent.

For organized meals for students and staff at the college, there is a buffet in all educational buildings that complies with sanitary rules and regulations. The conclusions of the SES were provided to the EEC. However, during the interview, students made a proposal to organize hot meals through the opening of a canteen in the college.

#### **4.4. Student representation**

The interview showed that the college creates conditions, provides assistance and support for the representation of students in advisory bodies for their participation in determining the Mission of the college, developing, managing and evaluating educational programs, and resolving other issues affecting the interests of students. Students also noted that the college creates conditions for the development of student self-government, including through the organization of student associations and clubs. Student self-government contributes to the formation of a conscious, responsible attitude of students towards the possibilities and prospects of their professional, cultural and moral self-organization. The structure and functions of student self-government are regulated by the Regulations approved on August 28, 2023. A student of group 2-GM-VK Mirzabekova Nazgul is a member of the Pedagogical Council. The minutes of the teachers' councils were provided to the EEC.

*To the survey question about the involvement of students in the work of deliberative bodies, 58.83% of the students surveyed gave a positive answer, 10.73% negative, 17.93% know nothing about it, and 5.43% have doubts about the answer.* The results of the survey indicate that the college needs to more involve students in participating in various advisory bodies, as well as inform them about this opportunity.

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.*** Comply with 14 standards (including 10 basic, 4 improvement standards): fully – 14.

***Recommendations for improvement:*** no

### **Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF/FACULTY**

#### **5.1 Selection and recruitment policy**

The College has implemented a system of selection and admission of employees, developed taking into account regulatory documents on personnel management procedures and based on the principles of compliance of basic education with the taught discipline, taking into account pedagogical and professional criteria, ensuring a balance of academic staff/faculty, including the proper ratio between teachers working for full-time and part-time, qualified specialists from practical healthcare. Registration of hiring, dismissal, determination of teaching load, determination of remuneration is carried out in accordance with the labour legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and internal standards (there is a Regulation on personnel policy, orders and personal files of employees are provided, confirmed at an interview).

The College has created and ensured the effective activities of the teaching corps through the application of high-quality policies for hiring, training and motivating workers and improving their professional level, as well as ensuring the best possible working conditions (there are Regulations on

the organization and conduct of advanced training courses for teachers, on the study and generalization of advanced pedagogical experience, on the procedure for attending and mutually attending training classes, on educational-methodological and scientific-methodological work, on additional education, on the school of a young teacher, on the organization of research activities of students and teachers, Long-term plan for advanced training and internship of teachers, Rules for assignment (confirmation ) qualification categories for teachers).

The total number of teachers is 65, including 46 full-time and 19 part-time teachers. In addition, under the civil legal nature of agreement, 14 practical healthcare employees provide teaching services - a total of 79 teachers. The share of full-time teachers from the total number (taking into account under the civil legal nature of agreement) is 58.0%. Sophistication is 23.0%, pedagogical categorization is 62.0%. In the EP of additional education, 20 teachers with higher medical education are involved, the quality of the composition is -68%. (orders and personal files of employees are provided).

At the same time, the college does not provide the 6:1 teacher-student ratio required for medical educational organizations. In college, this figure is 25:1, which can negatively affect the organization of quality education.

The college sets an annual teaching load of 720 hours. 18.5% of teachers have an annual teaching load of up to 0.5 rates, 10.8% - up to 0.75 rates, 15.4% - up to 1.0 rate, 50.8% - up to 1.5 rates, 4. 5% - over 1.5 rates (Order No. 63 of September 1, 2023 “On the teaching load of teachers”)

Remuneration for Academic staff is carried out in accordance with the assigned category and tariff rates. The college applies motivational mechanisms to Academic staff in the form of additional payments and salary supplements for leading groups, managing offices, as well as an annual increase in the base salary rate (confirmed during interviews with teachers and heads of structural divisions). *During the survey, 87.7% confirmed that the college implements social support programs for teachers*

The dynamics of teachers' salaries over 5 years are presented in the table below

Indicators	2019-2020	2020-2021	2021-2022	2022-2023	2023-2024
Teachers' salaries	198 456	210 597	269 477	309 654	359 393

In order to verify the data of standard 5, external experts received an opinion on personnel policy and approaches to the development of teaching competence of teachers, motivation to work with students, implementation of a mentoring system (7 mentors in total), tutoring (1 tutor in total), supervision (27 supervisors in total) - data was obtained during interviews and confirmed through questionnaires.

Experts have found that teachers initiate research topics for students within 20 scientific student circles. The effectiveness and efficiency of the management of scientific work of teachers and students is expressed in the defence of research works, participation in conferences at the intra-college, city, republican and international level, participation in subject Olympiads, publication of scientific publications (materials of circle work, certificates and diplomas of prize places provided), stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature (reading room forms provided).

There are 79 employees in total, of which 46 are full-time teachers, 19 part-time teachers, 14 under a civil legal nature of agreement. The experts are familiar with the personnel policy (Regulation on Personnel Policy dated 08/29/2023).

The conversation with Suleimenova A.G., HR manager, included questions such as “what are the principles for selecting and hiring teachers, including from clinical sites”, “how is staffing and categorization of personnel ensured”, “how is the need for staffing positions for Academic staff”, “what percentage of teachers are teachers with higher nursing education”, “for what reason is the

required teacher-student ratio not maintained”, etc., and allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting staff from clinical sites for teaching (total there are 14 such teachers), about the availability of full-time teaching staff (58.0%), pedagogical categories (62.0%), staffing of Academic staff with specialists with higher nursing education (25.0%), information availability about vacant rates (posted on the website college), as well as identify problems in the management and development of human resources (insufficient staffing of teachers).

*When surveying teachers, it was found that the vast majority (91.2%) were completely satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace in this educational organization, and 8.8% were partially satisfied. In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish research results - 89.5% completely agree, 8.8% partially agree. Satisfied with the work of the HR (personnel) service - 93.0% completely agree, 7.0% partially agree. Satisfied with the salary - 91.0% completely agree, 7% partially agree. During the survey, 86.0% of teachers were completely satisfied with their salaries, 87.7% confirmed that the college implements social support programs for teachers*

## **5.2 Staff and Faculty Development Policy**

The policy for the development and promotion of employees in the college is carried out through a system of continuing professional development and professional development of Faculty (there is a Perspective Plan for continuing professional development and internships for teachers, Rules for assigning (confirming) qualification categories to teachers, Regulations on the organization and conduct of continuing professional development courses for teachers, Regulations on the study and generalization of advanced pedagogical experience, Regulations on the procedure for attending and mutually attending educational classes, Regulations on educational, methodological and scientific-methodological work, Regulations on the school of a young teacher, Regulations on the organization of research activities of students and teachers).

Organized and conducted open classes, seminars, round tables, professional competitions and extracurricular events at various levels, pedagogical workshops, study and implementation of best practices, participation in pedagogical readings, scientific-theoretical and scientific-practical conferences of the college and the city, as well as mutual visits and control visits . There has been an increase in the participation of teachers in international, republican and city Olympiads, competitions and scientific and practical conferences.

At the College, a personnel reserve is formed from among promising employees to fill leadership positions, including the positions of director, deputy director, and head of department, head of a structural unit (confirmed during an interview with the director, deputy directors and heads of departments). Satisfaction of the college's teaching staff with working conditions and employee development and promotion policies is 98.4%.

The college has developed, documented and uses monitoring of teachers' activities, based on the results of which the best teachers are awarded annually (the commission was provided with materials from the competitions “Best Teacher of the Year”, “Best Young Teacher”).

The college has a primary trade union organization and a system of material and non-material incentives for teachers (confirmed during interviews with teachers and the HR manager). The college has established a system for improving the professional and pedagogical qualifications of teachers at the expense of the college (teachers and staff of the college completed a training seminar on BLS and ACLS at the RSE on the REM “National Coordination Centre for Emergency Medicine” of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan)

In order to verify the data of standard 5, during a meeting with the head of the personnel department and during interviews with teachers and experts, an opinion was obtained on approaches to developing the pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with students and trainees, and mentoring, which includes: the presence of a promotion system in the college qualifications and professional development of Academic staff (there are teachers who are master's students, doctoral

students, there are certificates of completion of advanced training courses in the centres: Kazakhstan Medical University "Graduate School of Public Health", NJSC "Talap", JSC National Centre for Continuing Education "Orleu", JSC "Nazarbayev Intellectual Schools", etc. d.), exchange of work experience between teachers, introduction of innovative forms and methods of teaching, mutual visits to classes, study and implementation of best practices, participation in pedagogical readings, scientific-theoretical and scientific-practical conferences of the college and the city, etc. (materials of open lessons are provided, minutes of meetings of the methodological council, pedagogical council, Cycle methodological commissions and other supporting documents), involving teachers of special disciplines as experts in international and national accreditation of medical colleges of the Republic of Kazakhstan (5 people), in the development and examination of test items at the National Centre for Independent Examination" (4 people).

The experts received answers about the teacher training program, which is conducted annually, and 48 teachers involved in the implementation of the educational program were trained for the 2022-2023 academic year. Some of these activities are funded by the college. The expert verified teacher certificates on topics such as "Basic Life Support" and "Advanced Cardiac Life Support".

*There is an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies in the organization - 84.2% of surveyed teachers responded, and 15.8% partially agreed with this. Studied in professional development programs - 47.4% less than 1 year ago, 17.5% within a given year, 28.1% more than 3 years ago, 0% more than 5 years ago and 3.5% responded "I don't remember when it was."*

*The organization implements social support programs for teachers - 87.2% responded that "yes, such programs exist", 3.51% - "I have already taken advantage of this", and 5.3% of respondents do not know about it.*

The conversation with Kustovskaya S.A., Deputy Director for EPW, included questions such as "are practical healthcare specialists involved in teaching activities and their level of education", "how is the quality of education controlled and what academic support is provided at the college, including on the part of teachers", "how teachers are involved in the development of educational programs", "by what criteria is the rating evaluation of the professional activities of teachers", "does the college have a council or other body for mentoring and what work is being done to adapt young teachers", etc. and allowed experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical sites for teaching (there are 14 such teachers in total), about the strategy and tactics of recruiting students for this specialty, the information security of educational programs, and also to identify problems in the management and development of human resources.

*The expert commission notes that the college is insufficiently staffed with teachers (79 people in total, including teachers under the civil legal nature of agreement) and the unacceptable teacher-student ratio (25:1)*

An interview with 33 teachers, including 26 full-time teachers, showed that there are both successes (all students have free access to patients at clinical sites and all conditions for improving their practical skills) and problems in the management of education, depending on the specific site (It is not always possible to organize practical training on bases that correspond to the content of a particular internship). The experts received answers about the teacher training program, funding for this training, and whether teachers are certified in teaching methods.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Complies with 4 standards (including 3 basic, 1 Standard improvement): fully - 3, partially - 1 (basic standard).

**Recommendations for improvement:**

1) To replenish the Academic staff with full-time teachers, taking into account the total annual load and bring the "teacher-student" ratio to meet the established requirements. (5.2.2)

## **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

### **6.1 Material and technical base**

The college has 2 of its own educational buildings on Ardagerler Street 27 and Building 41 on 12-13 Street, as well as rented premises on Zheltoksan Street 45/1. The EEC was able to verify that video surveillance was being conducted in all three educational buildings. The useful training area complies with current sanitary standards and fire safety requirements. Total area is 4283 m<sup>2</sup>. During the familiarization with the MTB of the college, the EEC was able to make sure that the founders had created all the conditions for organizing the educational work of students and teachers.

The college has 65 classrooms, of which 47 are educational classrooms, 7 are preclinical simulation classrooms, 4 are laboratories, and 5 are computer classrooms.

Medical organizations in Astana have an additional 2 educational and practical rooms, which are located in the MSE on the REM "City Polyclinic No. 5" and the MSE on the REM "City Multidisciplinary Hospital No. 2" (lease agreements provided). However, for the existing contingent (1986 people), two offices at practice bases are not enough, and therefore the commission recommended increasing the number of offices at bases in medical organizations.

When working with the college's documentation, the EEC familiarized itself with a certificate of registered rights to real estate (F2) for two of its own buildings, as well as lease agreements for offices in two medical organizations in the city of Astana. The college also provided a rental agreement for rooms in the dormitory of the Industrial Engineering and Economic College LLP and a rental agreement for the gym at the "Zhastar" Palace LLP. The college does not have its own dormitory and gym.

The college has entered into an agreement with Family Health Centre No. 5 LLP, which provides full medical care: examination, treatment, medical examination and preventive vaccinations for students.

For organized meals for students and staff at the college, there is a buffet in all educational buildings that complies with sanitary rules and regulations. The EEC was familiarized with the Sanitary and Epidemiological Conclusion No. Z.03.X.KZ52VWF00066443 for the cafeteria at the college, located at Astana, Saryarka district, st. Ardagerler, 27 and Sanitary and Epidemiological Conclusion No. Z.03.X.KZ25V WF00066444 dated 05.24.2022 for the cafeteria at the college, located at Astana, Saryarka district, st. 12-31 building 41.

By order of the General Director, responsibilities for safety precautions and fire-technical minimums were assigned to Deputy Director for Administrative and Economic Affairs Kamaliy Karimovich Syzdykov.

Instructions on safety precautions and fire-technical minimum are carried out annually with all employees, teachers, and also thematic lectures and training sessions on evacuating people due to a simulated fire are held for college students with the invitation of lecturers from relevant departments in online and offline formats. There is a log of briefings on safety precautions and fire-technical minimum. At the same time, the college's AMP did not undergo training in occupational safety and health, according to Order No. 1019 dated December 25, 2015 (as amended on April 26, 2022)

In order to convey to employees the basic requirements of fire safety, fire protection equipment, as well as their actions in the event of a fire, on March 31, 2022, college employees were trained to test knowledge of fire safety in the scope of the fire-technical minimum at CenterExpert LLP with the issuance of a protocol meetings of the qualification commission and certificates. The Commission observed that Safety Instructions are available in all classrooms, laboratories and other teaching areas. However, they have the same type and general rules and character. They do not contain safety regulations regarding the specific activities of a particular laboratory or classroom. The main emphasis is on fire safety; in this regard, the commission recommended that all safety instructions be brought into compliance.

*When surveying students, 63.86% of students surveyed responded positively to the question*

*of satisfaction with the conditions and equipment of college classrooms and classrooms, and 21.88% responded that they were partially satisfied. To the question of the questionnaire about whether conditions have been created for rest and nutrition for students (rest rooms, benches/gazebos on the college grounds), 72% answered positively, 11.55% disagreed with this statement.*

## **6.2 Resources for hands-on learning**

During a visit to the college's practical bases, experts obtained evidence of the implementation of standard 6, as well as validation of the self-assessment report information. Experts conducted a survey of resources, their compliance with training programs, and accessibility for teachers and students, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical healthcare.

A review of resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, the EEC visited the clinical bases of the MSE on the REM "City Clinic No. 5" of the Akimat of Astana, the MSE on the REM "City Clinic No. 2" of the Akimat of Astana, the MSE on the REM "City ambulance station" of the Akimat of Astana, MSE on the REM "Oncology Centre" of the Akimat of Astana, "Pharm Health" LLP, MPC "Hippocrates" LLP, "Afiyat" LLP, MSE on the REM "City Hospital No. 1" » Akimat of Astana, where training is provided in 3 educational programs with the participation of 8 full-time teachers and part-time teachers. Employees of the educational organization ensure collegial and ethical relationships with medical staff and management of clinical sites to achieve final results for students. A sufficient number of thematic patients, modern equipment have been provided, and accessibility to students has been demonstrated. Employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and curators (mentors) provide quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational program, the student receives a practice program from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during his studies.

At the same time, when visiting the EEC of the MSE on the REM "City Hospital No. 1", where 5 students of groups 4GM-E, 4GM-AK had an internship, the students and the mentor did not have an internship program. The EEC also noted that the practice in this institution is not on the subject, since according to the TC, 4th year students of the specialty "General Medicine" during this period must undergo the practice "Providing psycho-neurological assistance", in fact, students provide assistance to medical staff in the department outside programs.

Students receive from the lecturer all the completed lecture material in paper and electronic versions, presentations of classes, a collection of standards of operating procedures (SOP) on the topic, situational tasks, tasks for performing manipulations on mannequins and simulators, tests for self-control, instruction cards, links to a library of information -medical base "Electronic library system "Student Consultant", reference system of ISDS -Kazakhstan "ACTUALIS: MEDICINE".

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence about the quality of the programs, interviews were conducted with students in the specialty. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for students in need, and the availability of professional literature database resources. In general, students are satisfied with the training, assessment methods and purposefully entered this organization, as they believe that the educational organization has good resources, image and international connections. At the same time, students would like to have their own dormitory, since there are minor students entering college on the basis of 9th grade, as well as a gym. These wishes of the students are familiar to the founders and director of the college, and they planned the construction of sports and assembly halls on the territory of the recently acquired building on 12-31 street, building 41.

Students showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgment on the organization of training, evaluating their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in research work, financing, demonstrated their knowledge when answering questions from foreign expert R.K. Salikhojaeva.

Experts examined student documents, including grade books, syllabuses, coursework and diploma papers, and materials from club work.

### **6.3 Information technology and library resources**

During the external visit, the commission visited 3 college buildings, each of which houses libraries occupying a total area of 174.9 m<sup>2</sup>. The libraries include a subscription service, 3 reading rooms with 95 seats and a book depository. The reading rooms have computer areas equipped with 40 computers with Internet access, where students additionally study and take practice tests using the MyTest, Google Forms program.

The book fund numbers are 24,634 copies, 750 on electronic media, of which 259 are in the state language. The head of the library, Matbaeva Nazeken Maratkyzy, noted in an interview that the college library annually subscribes to 6 titles of newspapers and magazines. Also in the college library there is an information and medical database “Electronic library system “Student Consultant”. Students have access to this program, which gives them the opportunity to work independently at home. The college is subscribed to the International centre of ISDS -Kazakhstan reference system “ACTUALIS: MEDICINE”. In interviews, students noted that they work with electronic textbooks posted at the link <https://okulyk.kz/> . The college actively cooperates with the National Scientific and Technical Library and the Astana Medical University.

*To the survey questions regarding satisfaction with the library collection/resources, 69.7% of the students surveyed answered that they were completely satisfied, and 15.63% were partially satisfied. 75.27% of students are completely satisfied with access to electronic educational resources; 15.35% are partially satisfied.*

In general, the acquisition of the college’s library collection is carried out in accordance with the requirements of the State Educational Standards of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

### **6.4 Health research and scientific advances**

One of the forms of research work in college is course work for students in the specialty “Applied Bachelor of Nursing.” Since 2021, 257 coursework has been completed under the guidance of academic advisors. Students present the results of their research work at conferences at various levels. The experts were familiarized with a number of course works, among them such as “Care features of premature children”, “The role of the caregiver in the prevention of scoliosis”. The experts also familiarized themselves with the list of coursework topics approved by the director for the 2023-2024 academic years. It contains 60 topics in the state language and 120 topics in Russian. The supervisors for the implementation of coursework for the 2023-2024 academic year on the basis of the director’s order No. 52 dated 09/01/23 are: Akhanova L.M., Gabdusheva A.A., Akhmetova Zh.S., Beisenova S.S., Kasenova B. G., Bekenova S.D., Beiseitova D.A., Kamalbekova G.M., Karpikbaeva Zh.A., Alim A.Zh., Bekbergenova D.S., Beisenov A.S., Meermanova Z.K. , Abenova K.T., Kazelova A.Yu., Musulkanova Zh.T. Experts noted that for one supervisor there are 9-13 students with different topics of coursework, which complicates the work of the supervisor, it was recommended to increase the number of supervisors.

The effectiveness and efficiency of the management of scientific work of teachers and students is expressed in the defence of research works, participation in conferences at the intra-college, city, republican and international levels.

Deputy Director for SEMW Shabdanova M.A. noted during the interview that the result of the work of the clubs is participation in student scientific and practical conferences, quizzes, Olympiads, concerts, exhibitions, and extracurricular events in academic disciplines.

Interviews with 33 full-time teachers showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of education, depending on the specific base (student access to equipment, a sufficient number of thematic patients, independent work). The college rents only 2 offices in medical organizations in Astana, which is very little for such a contingent (1986 students at the time of the external visit), especially since, in addition to “Danalak” College, there are about 8 medical colleges in



the capital that train in the same specialties and undergo practical training in the same municipalities of Astana. Therefore, difficulties arise when organizing thematic practices in medical organizations of the city.

*Students evaluate the organization of training at practice bases as follows: excellent 69.7%, good 15.53%. To the question of the questionnaire whether there is access to students' participation in research work, 69.02% of students answered positively, 17.26% partially agreed.*

*The student survey also showed that 40.08% of students are currently engaged in a scientific club or participating in a scientific project.*

### **6.5 Educational exchange**

As part of the external visit, the experts were provided with cooperation agreements by the State Budget Professional Educational Institution (SBPEI) "Kurgan Basic Medical College" (Kurgan, Russian Federation), the State Educational Institution "Belarusian Medical Academy of Postgraduate Education" (Minsk, Republic of Belarus), Educational Institution "Minsk State Medical College" (Minsk, Republic of Belarus), State Educational Institution "Bishkek Medical College" (Bishkek, Kyrgyz Republic), NJSC "Astana Medical University", MSE on the REM "Talgar Higher Medical College", State Institution "Health Department of Almaty Region."

The Deputy Director for SEMW said that teachers and students actively participate in professional skills competitions at the city, republican and international levels organized by medical colleges of the Republic of Kazakhstan and take prizes. From an interview with EEC students, we learned that the team of the College "Nefron" in the Republican professional competition "Best in Anatomy and Physiology-2023" in the specialty "Nursing" in Taraz received the nomination "Best Creative Team", in the Republican professional competition "Best pharmacist-2023" in Turkestan Korogez R. and took 1st place.

The college actively cooperates with the NJSC "Astana Medical University" in using the library, participating in round tables, seminars, conferences, attracting teachers to conduct classes, and reviewing coursework.

*To the question of the ECAQA questionnaire about whether students have free access to patients at clinical sites and whether all conditions are created to improve their practical skills, 91.23% of teachers answered positively, 5.26% partially agreed, 2% found it difficult to answer.*

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Compliant out of 13 standards (including 9 basic, 4 improvement standards): fully - 11, partially - 2, do not comply - 0

#### **Recommendations for improvement:**

1) To bring the safety instructions in line with the specifics of one or another laboratory or classroom, as well as responsible persons to undergo training on safety and labor protection issues. (6.1.2)

2) To increase the number of offices at practice bases in medical organizations, speed up the construction of a gym. (6.1.3)

## **Standard 7: PRORAMME EVALUATION**

### **7.1 Program monitoring and evaluation mechanisms**

The main task of management activities in the college is control by the administration over the fulfilment of the requirements of the SCES. Control begins with planning the work of the college. Intra-college control is built in accordance with the mission, goals and objectives of the college. The basis for improving the educational process is the analysis of the teacher's activities. The work of experts with the minutes of advisory bodies showed that the results of intra-college control are discussed at meetings with the director, methodological councils, teachers' councils, and SMP. The monitoring provided provides the administration with the necessary objective information, allows them to correlate the results with the assigned tasks and adjust management activities. Taking into account

the comments and recommendations based on the assessment results, measures are being taken to improve and revise the EP. During interviews with teachers and employers, experts found that, on the recommendations of employers, such elective components as: “Social work” and “Family care”, “Basic Life Support” were included in the work curriculum, from the current academic year to the discipline “Emergency Care in Surgery” included the topic “ACLS (Advanced Cardiac Life Support)”. In connection with this, the teachers and staff of the college underwent a training seminar on BLS (Basic Life Support) and ACLS (Advanced Cardiac Life Support) at the RSE on the REM “National Coordination Centre for Emergency Medicine” of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan at the expense of the college.

From interviews with the administration, it was established that in order to monitor the state of teaching academic disciplines, the college administration attends classes. All lessons attended are analysed and appropriate recommendations are given to teachers.

The experts were provided with Order No. 46 dated January 20, 2023, by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, stating that the college had passed state certification by the Committee for Control of Medical and Pharmaceutical Activities of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. There is a certificate of completion of the institutional and specialized accreditation procedure for all specialties by the Independent Kazakhstan Agency for Quality Assurance in Education (IQAEA) <http://iqaa.kz>.

According to the results of an independent assessment of the knowledge and skills of graduates, the college ranks 5th among colleges in the Republic of Kazakhstan with high performance (average score 88.8) and was included in the number of promising colleges (according to the rating of the Local Education Authority "NCIE").

## **7.2 Feedback between teacher and student**

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence about the quality of the programs, interviews were conducted with students in the specialty “General Medicine”, “Nursing”, “Pharmacy”. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, sufficient time to work with patients, work with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for students in need, participation in scientific work, and the availability of international databases of professional literature. Based on the interview results, we can conclude that students are satisfied with the educational services provided, the quality of the organization and professional practice, as well as the conditions created for their personal development.

The students showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgment on the organization of training, assessing their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in research work, and financing, demonstrated proficiency in English when answering questions from a foreign expert R.K. Salikhojaeva. Experts examined student documents (portfolios, student assessment results, survey results).

## **7.3 Academic achievements of students and graduates**

According to the results of the analysis, college students actively participate in competitions at various levels, competitions, project and research activities.

The college familiarized the experts with the reports of the chairmen of the SCC, which provided feedback on the quality of training of college graduates. In the specialty “Pharmacy”, it was noted that students know modern medicines, identify pharmacological groups, master the technique of preparing dosage forms, correctly use weighing equipment, measuring utensils, have the skills of maintaining accounting and reporting documentation, are familiar with the Resolutions and Orders of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of circulation medicines and medical products. The chairmen of the SCC in the specialties “General Medicine” and “Nursing” noted the defect-free knowledge of medical manipulations, emergency procedures, confident use of instruments,

and algorithms for proper patient care. Academic performance in college over the last three years is 99%, quality of knowledge is 95.3%. The IGA indicators of students indicate that students are well prepared.

S.A. Kustovskaya spoke about the students' achievements during the interview. – Deputy Director for EPW: In the International Competition of Professional Excellence “Breathing is Living!” in Kurgan, Russian Federation, Kolesnikova A. took 3rd place (2022), Sagadiev D. – 2nd place (2023), the team of the college “Nefron” in the Republican professional competition “Best in Anatomy and Physiology - 2023” in Taraz received a nomination “Best creative team”, in the Republican professional competition “Best Pharmacist-2023” in Turkestan Korogez R. took 1st place, in the city intellectual competition “Best Anatomist - 2022” in the specialty “Nursing” Egimbayev Dias took 1st place, in the city professional and intellectual competition “Best Ambulance Team - 2023” took 2nd place, in the city competition “Best Nurse” D. Sagadiev took an honorable 1st place.

Analysis of students' educational achievements is used by the college for subsequent planning of the educational process. Students' achievements are highlighted on social networks and the college website.

#### **7.4 Stakeholder engagement**

The external visit showed that the college involves employers in the evaluation of educational programs, involves them in the development of educational programs, participation in meetings of collegial councils, job fairs, reviewing educational and methodological material, as independent experts during the end-of-course assessment, mentors during clinical practice.

The interview with employers was conducted offline and included questions such as: knowledge of the college's mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of students, participation in the training of applied undergraduate students through mentoring, providing students with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with the college as a whole, about the employment of graduates of educational programs.

So in 2023, the average employment rate of graduates of TVET programs is 81%, and of applied bachelor's programs 99%.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Complies with 7 standards (including 2 basic, 2 improvement standards): fully – 7.*

*Recommendations for improvement: no.*

## **Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION**

### **8.1 Management**

The college has a defined management system that contributes to the achievement of its mission, goals and objectives. The organization of college management is carried out according to established requirements. The organizational structure of the college is posted on the website <https://cdanalyk.kz/>. Own regulatory and organizational and administrative documentation complies with the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the College Charter. The college is a private non-profit educational institution.

During a visit to the organization and during an interview with college employees S.A. Kustovskaya - Deputy Director for EPW, Shabdanova M.A. - Deputy Director for SEMW, Temirbaeva A.M. - Deputy Director for EW, the commission was convinced that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and staff, and includes documents such as annual operating plans, annual reports, department regulations, contracts with teachers and students and educational documentation (work program, work curricula, syllabuses, journals), assessment tools (checklists, statements), evidence, certificates and certificates. A review of

the website showed that its pages contain the documents necessary for students (schedule of classes, schedule of the educational process, reference guide, rules for admission to the college, “Quality Assurance Policy”) and there is information about the college, its administration, information for students, teachers, director's block, information about government services provided, a news feed that is regularly updated. This information was obtained during an interview with A.T. Nurgozhina, a computer science teacher, and she is also the person responsible for maintaining the college's website and social networks.

## **8.2 Academic leadership**

The formation and implementation of the policy for evaluating students of the additional education program is carried out by the head of the department of additional education L.M. Akhanova, the implementation of the EP for college students is carried out by the deputy director for SEMW M.A. Shabdanova and Deputy Director for EPW Kustovskaya S.A. EPs are developed by leading college teachers taking into account the opinions of graduates, employers and students. Representatives of employers are involved in the development of the program as experts. The educational program is discussed at a meeting of the CMC, considered at the methodological council, agreed with representatives of employers and approved by the director.

*Among the 57 teachers surveyed, 91.23% responded that they were satisfied with the organization of work and workplace in this educational organization, and 8.77% partially agreed with this statement. Experts determined that the organization has a healthy microclimate, since the manager is quite accessible to both students and employees and responds promptly to requests. In the questionnaire, 78.95% of teachers are satisfied with the microclimate of the organization, and 19.3% are partially satisfied. According to 91.23%, in an educational organization, a teacher has the opportunity to realize himself as a professional in his specialty. For your information, a total of 57 people responded (a total of 46 and 19 part-time employees).*

*To the survey question “Do the leaders of the organization listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research work, clinical work,” 80% of teachers answered that systematically; 12.28% answered “sometimes”; 1.75% “quite rarely”, 0% “never”.*

## **8.3 Training budget and resource allocation**

The college is a private non-profit educational institution. Own financial resources are generated from educational activities at prices that are annually agreed upon with the founders of the college. Activities for the provision of educational services are provided for by the College Charter and are carried out on the basis of an appropriate agreement. The wage fund is formed from income from the provision of services.

In the college, in accordance with the “Regulations on Remuneration,” additional payments and bonuses have been introduced to the salaries of teaching staff for leading groups and managing classrooms. Remuneration for teaching staff is carried out in accordance with the assigned category and tariff rates. A stable increase in average wages during the reporting period was ensured for administrative, managerial, teaching and service personnel. Salaries are paid regularly and there are no wage arrears.

The experts were familiarized with a number of orders, the Regulations on remuneration, as well as invoices for the purchase of equipment for the college. Thus, according to the director's order No. 21 dated 08.23.21, the amount of payment for teachers for 1 academic hour was established: with the highest category - 1500 tenge, with the first category - 1400 tenge, for teachers without a category, the second category and with a master's degree - 1300 tenge, for hourly workers – 1000 tenge. In 2023, on the basis of the director's order No. 44 dated August 28, 2023, the amount of payment for teachers increased: for teachers with the highest category - 2000 tenge, with the first category - 1800 tenge, without a second category category and with a master's degree - 1660 tenge, for hourly workers - 1280 tenge . This is a great incentive and support for college teachers. During the survey, 85.96% of respondents responded that they were satisfied with the salary.

The distribution of financial resources is based on the development strategy of the college and is aimed at strengthening the material and technical base of the college.

#### **8.4 Administrative staff and management**

An interview with the director, as well as the college's personnel management service, showed that in order to effectively implement the college's development strategy, achieve the mission, goals and objectives, an organizational structure for managing the college's activities was created. Management of the college and structural divisions corresponds to the general structure. The staffing table has been approved and job responsibilities have been assigned.

The EEC was provided with the college's staffing table, which is an internal organizational and legal document, developed within the organization itself and containing its structure, list and number of staffing units, approved by the director of the college. It provides for positions related to the management and support of academic activities - director, deputy directors, heads of departments, heads of services, administrative staff from among teachers, administrative staff whose responsibilities include supporting academic activities (library manager, librarian, dispatcher). The core of the college consists of an academic staff - 65 teachers, 16 of them part-time.

#### **8.5 Interaction with the health sector**

The college actively interacts with the healthcare sector, taking an active part in the implementation of government programs in the field of healthcare development. The Deputy Director for Practical Work demonstrated the agreements concluded with the medical organizations of Astana. During interviews, employers confirmed the existence of a close relationship between the healthcare sector and the college, through an established mentoring system and the organization of practice. The college also closely cooperates with NJSC "MUA"; there is an agreement on mutual cooperation

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.*** Comply with 10 standards (including 4 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully – 10.

***Recommendations for improvement:*** no

#### **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

An external visit to the college showed that the college has a well-established and implemented system of continuous improvement in all key areas of activity. The college systematically reviews the organizational and staffing structure, updates the goals and functions of the Strategic Development Program, regulatory documentation taking into account the needs of healthcare and society, modernizes the material and technical base, improves modern educational technologies and innovations in the learning process to implement the institutional goals and objectives of the college, needs of students and practical healthcare. So, for the high-quality provision of educational services, the college plans to build a sports and assembly hall on the territory of the newly acquired building on 12-13 street, building 41. Representatives of the EEC were presented with a sketch.

The experts concluded that the college should establish a relationship between student selection and the college's mission and the desired quality and qualifications of graduates; introduce a system for studying employment, career support and continuous professional development of graduates; students' access to the health information system; use the results of feedback to improve the educational process as a whole; use analysis of students' educational achievements to provide feedback to structural units responsible for selecting and advising students and planning the educational process; periodically evaluate academic leadership regarding the achievement of its mission and end results; develop, implement and publish a quality assurance program that reflects the institutional vision and development strategy of the college; including reviewing needs for improvement and conducting regular management reviews and reviews; formalize collaboration with partners in the health sector; ensure that the renewal and restructuring process results in policies and practices being reviewed in accordance with past experience, current performance and future prospects.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Complies with 3 standards (including 1 basic, 2 improvement standards): fully - 3.

**Recommendations for improvement:** no.

**CONCLUSION:** An external institutional evaluation found that out of 80 standards, 76 accreditation standards demonstrate full compliance. 4 standards are partially met. No non-compliance with standards has been identified.

**5. Recommendations for improving the activities of the college:**

1) Industrial internships must be organized at clinical sites and departments that correspond to the goals, objectives and content of the internship programs. (2.2.3)

2) To replenish the teaching staff with full-time teachers, taking into account the total annual load and bring the “teacher-student” ratio to meet the established requirements. (5.2.2)

3) To bring the safety instructions in line with the specifics of a particular laboratory, classroom, and also for responsible persons to undergo training on safety and labor protection issues. (6.1.2)

4) To increase the number of offices at practice bases in medical organizations, speed up the construction of a gym. (6.1.3)

**6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council**

Members of the EEC established the compliance of the main activities of the educational institution "Higher Medical College "Danalyk" named after Z.G. Murzagulova" with the Standards of institutional accreditation of medical colleges and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit the above-mentioned college for a period of **5 years**.

	Full name	Signature
Chairman	NURGALIEVA GULMIRA TURSUNGALIEVNA	
Foreign expert	SALIKHOJAEVA RIKHSI KAMILOVNA	
Academic expert	SIROTINA ASMIK YURIKOVNA	
Expert - employer	NARIKBAEVA NURBAKHYT TURSymbekovna	
Expert - student	MURATOV SHALKAR SERIKKALIEVICH	

## Institutional quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the college (summary)

Standard	Criteria for evaluation	BS/SI*	Number of standards	Grade		
				Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Does not compliant
1	MISSION AND OUTCOMES	8/0	8	8		
2	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	14/0	14	13	1	
3	ASSESSMENT	7/0	7	7		
4	STUDENTS	10/4	14	14		
5	ACADEMIC STAFF/FACULTY	3/1	4	3	1 (BS)	
6	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	9/4	13	11	2	
7	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	5/2	7	7		
8	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	7/3	10	10		
9	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	1/2	3	3		
	TOTAL	64/16	80	76	4	
	* BS- BASIC STANDARD, SI- STANDARD FOR IMPROVEMENT					

**Список документов, изученных членами ВЭК в рамках проведения институциональной внешней оценки УО «Высший медицинский колледж «ДНАЛЫК» имени З.Г.Мурзагуловой»**

<b>№</b>	<b>Наименования документов</b>	<b>Количество</b>	<b>Дата утверждения</b>
1.	Устав колледжа	1	13.10.2021
2.	Лицензии на образовательную деятельность	1	
3.	Стратегический план развития	1	31.08. 2021
4.	Структура колледжа	1	31.08. 2021
5.	Договора аренды 2 здания	1	
6.	Договор аренды спортзала	1	
7.	Договора аренды кабинетов на базах практик	1	
8.	Все положения о работе структурных подразделений	44	
9.	Соответствующие документы медицинского колледжа и государства относительно определения ответственности за составление образовательных программ и распределения ресурсов		
10.	Документ, свидетельствующий о рассмотрении и утверждении миссии совещательным органом (протокол)	за 3 года	31.08.2021
11.	Политика в области качества (утверждённый оригинал);	1	31.08.2021
12.	Кодекс этики/поведения обучающихся	1	31.08.2021
13.	Кодекс этики/поведения преподавателей	1	31.08.2021
14.	История организации (кратко на 1-2 стр.)	1	
15.	Список членов педагогического совета (приказы за 5 лет).		
16.	Отчет по независимому анализу обучающихся колледжа (за последние 3 года)	1	
17.	Правила организации учебного процесса	1	
18.	Учебно-методические материалы пообразовательным программам	5	
19.	Разработки по методам обучения	5	
20.	Журнал теоретического практического обучения по специальностям	10	
21.	Журнал производственного обучения по специальностям	10	
22.	Экзаменационные ведомости по специальностям	15	
23.	Зачетные книжки по специальностям	15	
24.	Доступ к электронному журналу через автоматизированную информационную систему колледжа	1	
25.	Годовой план работы структурного подразделения	за 3 года	



26.	Выписки из протоколов совещательных органов о рассмотрении вопросов по разработке, согласованию, утверждению и пересмотру образовательных программ	за 3 года	
27.	Годовой отчет работы структурного подразделения	за 3 года	
28.	Результаты оценки обучающихся, включающие аналитический отчет	3	
29.	Отчеты экзаменационных комиссий	3	
30.	Выписки из протоколов совещательных органов с результатами рассмотрения вопросов по обсуждению, утверждению, пересмотру контрольно-измерительных средств и итога оценивания обучающихся	за 3 года	
31.	Доказательства участия в оценке обучающихся представителей практического здравоохранения (приказы, выписки из протоколов и т.п.)	9	
32.	Результаты обратной связи от обучающихся (анкеты и аналитический отчет).	За 3 года	
33.	Сведения о штате преподавателей, показатели острепенности и категоричности в разрезе образовательных программ	2	
34.	Документ, отражающий политику приема обучающихся, в том числе с ограниченными возможностями, перевода обучающихся из других медицинских колледжей (Правила, приказы и т.д.)	за 3 года	
35.	Документ, отражающий систему апелляций при приеме обучающихся (регламент, приказы, распоряжения и т.д.)	1	
36.	Документ, отражающий систему консультирования обучающихся	1	
37.	Анализ по результатам пересмотра количества принимаемых обучающихся в зависимости от материально-технических ресурсов колледжа.	за 3 года	
38.	Программа социальной поддержки обучающихся и отчеты о выполнении за 3 года (приказы, подтверждающие социальные дотации)	за 3 года	
39.	Документы, подтверждающие деятельность органов самоуправления обучающихся и наличие информации на веб-сайте колледжа глубиной 5 лет	за 3 года	
40.	Результаты анкетирования абитуриентов с аналитическим отчетом (за 3 года)	за 3 года	
41.	Результаты анкетирования выпускников за 3 года	за 3 года	
42.	Результаты анкетирования работодателей о качестве подготовке выпускников за 3 года	27	
43.	Политика отбора и приема сотрудников	1	
44.	Кадровая политика колледжа	1	
45.	Положение об оплате труда	1	
46.	Программа развития преподавателей и итоги её	за 3 года	

	реализации		
47.	Программы поддержки молодых преподавателей	за 3 года	
48.	Сведения о достижениях, наградах преподавателей	за 3 года	
49.	Сведения об участии преподавателей в страновых и международных мероприятиях	за 3 года	
50.	Результаты опроса преподавателей и сотрудников по удовлетворенности работы в колледже 5 лет	за 3 года	
51.	Отзывы обучающихся, организаций практического здравоохранения о преподавателях, в том числе размещенные на веб-сайте колледжа	10	
52.	Доступ к информации о преподавателях на веб-сайте колледжа	1	
53.	Политика отбора и приема сотрудников		
54.	Тарификационный список педагогов	1	
55.	Правила техники безопасности. Журнал техники безопасности	1	
56.	Журнал инструктажа обучающихся по технике безопасности в кабинете	46	
57.	Правила техники пожарной безопасности. Журнал техники пожарной безопасности	1	
58.	Сертификат по технике безопасности	10	
59.	Рабочие учебные программы по всем специальностям	60	
60.	Рабочие учебные программы производственной и профессиональной (преддипломной) практики	23	
61.	Документы по практике обучающихся	40	
62.	Выписки из протоколов заседания совещательных органов по вопросам производственного обучения и практики обучающихся	за 3 года	
63.	Списки обучающихся, участвующих в научной работе за 5 лет	за 3 года	
64.	Сведения о научных достижениях обучающихся (участие в олимпиадах, конкурсах и т.д., сертификаты, грамоты, дипломы)	за 3 года	
65.	Договора с базами практики в разрезе специальностей.	51	
66.	Документ, содержащий распределение функций и обязанностей между руководителями подразделений колледжа (приказ, распоряжение)	5	
67.	Меморандумы о международном сотрудничестве	4	
68.	План внутриколледжного контроля	за 3 года	
69.	Правила внутреннего учебного распорядка	1	
70.	Положение о текущем контроле успеваемости и промежуточной, итоговой аттестации обучающихся.	1	
71.	Путеводитель для студентов	1	
72.	Финансовые документы закупа оборудования	за 3 года	
73.	Рабочие учебные планы	5	
74.	УМКД по дисциплинам	5	

75.	Поурочный план		
76.	Сертификаты менторов	6	
77.	Утвержденный каталог элективных дисциплин	9	
78.	Рабочие учебные программы элективных дисциплин	31	
79.	Планы кружков (НИРС) (приказ, материалы кружков)	10	
80.	Перспективный план аттестации преподавателей	1	
81.	Личные дела преподавателей	4	
82.	Личные дела заместителей	3	
83.	Личные дела студентов	5	
84.	Личные дела выпускников	5	
85.	Курсовые работы (приказ о назначении руководителей, экзаменационная ведомость, курсовые работы)	6	
86.	Утвержденный перечень тем курсовых работ	1	
87.	Индивидуальные учебные планы обучающихся	100	
88.	Приказ о формировании учебных групп	1	