

To the Accreditation Council of  
the Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and  
Quality Assurance in Education and Health Care  
June 14, 2024

**REPORT**  
**OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE**  
**EVALUATION OF THE RSE "MEDICAL CENTRE HOSPITAL OF THE**  
**PRESIDENT'S AFFAIRS ADMINISTRATION OF THE REPUBLIC OF**  
**KAZAKHSTAN" FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS FOR**  
**INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION OF MEDICAL ORGANIZATIONS OF**  
**POSTGRADUATE AND ADDITIONAL EDUCATION**  
**(CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT)**

**Period of external expert evaluation: May 29-31, 2024**

**Astana, 2024**

## CONTENTS

	List of designations and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	4
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1	Presentation of the RSE "Medical Centre Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the Right of Economic Management	5
2.2	Information on the previous accreditation	7
2.3	Brief characteristics of the self-assessment report of the RSE "Medical Centre Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the Right of Economic Management	
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	7
4.	Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of the external evaluation of the RSE "Medical Centre Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the Right of Economic Management	9
5.	Recommendations for institutional improvement of the RSE "Medical Centre Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the Right of Economic Management	30
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	31
	Annex 1. Institutional quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the RSE "Medical Centre Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the Right of Economic Management	34
	Annex 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	35

## LIST OF DESIGNATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
ECAQA	Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Health Care
ACS	automated control system
Hospital/MCH PAA RK	RSE "Medical Centre Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the right of economic management
IRD	internal regulatory documents
GVFMC	guaranteed volume of free medical care
SCSE	state compulsory standard of education in the field of health care
JD	job description
DET	distance educational technologies
EHEA	European Higher Education Area
ECAQA	Non-profit institution "Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Health Care"
IAAR	Non-profit institution "Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating IAAR"
End-of-course assessment	End-of-course assessment
IEP	individual educational plan
EC	elective components
CIS	control and measuring tools
CED	catalog of elective disciplines
MOH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
LEA	local executive agency
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MSHE RK	Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MTB	material and technical base
MTE	material and technical equipment
MC PAA RK	State Institution " Medical Centre of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan "
RW	research work
SCC	scientific and clinical council
NEDB	national educational database
LSI	Laws and Statutory Instruments
CPD	continuous professional development
NQF	national qualification framework
NCIE	national centre for independent examination
MC	mandatory component
EP	educational program
MSHI	mandatory social health insurance
Department	department of professional education
IC	intermediate certification of students
PE	postgraduate education
MD	major disciplines
PE	postgraduate education
AT	advanced training

RT	retraining
Academic staff	Academic staff
MC	midterm control
LO	learning outcomes
WC	working curriculum
CC	certification course
ICWT	independent clinical work under the supervision of a teacher
SOP	standard operating procedure
IWR	independent work of a resident
TC	Typical curriculum
PAA RK	President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan
HD	Healthcare Department
EMD	educational and methodological documentation
ETC	educational training center
GPA	average grade point average

### 1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with the order of the ECAQA No. 18 dated 17.05.2024, the External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external institutional evaluation of the RSE "Medical Centre Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" (MCH PAA RK) on the REM in the period from 29 to 31 May 2024 in the following composition:

<b>№</b>	<b>Status in the EEC</b>	<b>Full name</b>	<b>Academic degree/title, position, place of work/place of study, year, specialty</b>
1	Chairman	Yermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, MBA, Head of the Department of "Public Health and Healthcare" of the NJSC "WKMU named after M. Ospanov", Chairman of the Committee "Public Healthcare" at the State Unitary Enterprise
2	Foreign Expert	Uryasev Oleg Mikhailovich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Faculty Therapy named after Professor V. Ya. Garmash, Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs of the Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education "Ryazan State Medical University named after Academician I.P. Pavlov" of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation
3	Academic Expert	Kasenova Saule Laikovna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Residency of the Department of Postgraduate Education of JSC «Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Diseases»
4	Academic Expert	Yesenkulova Saule Askerovna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Centre for Postgraduate Education of JSC «Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology», Member of the Association of Oncologists of the Republic of Kazakhstan
5	Academic Expert	Smailova Altyнай Nagyzkhanovna	PhD, Director of the Strategy Department of the Corporate Fund «University Medical Centre» of Nazarbayev University
6	Academic Expert	Salimbaeva Damilya Nurgazievna	PhD, Head of the Department of Strategic Development and Science of JSC «Scientific Centre of Obstetrics, Gynaecology and Perinatology»
7	Expert-Employer	Zhukubaeva Almira Asetkyzy	Master of Pedagogy and Psychology, the highest medical category in emergency care, therapy, the first medical category in public health. Head of the Education Department of the "National Scientific Oncology Centre" LLP
8	Expert-Resident	Nurgaliev Arslan Ardakovich	Second-year resident in the specialty "Adult and paediatric cardiology", Astana

			Medical University JSC
--	--	--	------------------------

The EEC report includes a description of the results and the conclusion of the external evaluation of the educational organization for compliance with the Standards for institutional accreditation of medical organizations of postgraduate and additional education (continuous professional development) (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC for further quality improvement and recommendations for accreditation of the educational organization for the Accreditation Council of the ECAQA.

## 2. General part of the final report

### 2.1 Presentation of the RSE "Medical Centre Hospital of the President's Affairs

#### Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the REM

Name of the organization, legal form of ownership, BIN	RSE "Medical Centre Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the Right of Economic Management (hereinafter referred to as MCH PAA RK)
Management body	Medical Center
Full name of the first director	Albayev Rustam Kuanyshbekovich
Date of establishment	1997
Location and contact details	Astana, Yesil district, st. E-495, building 2
State license for educational activities in residency (date, number)	No. KZ87LAA00017356 dated 08.11.2019
Information on branches, subsidiaries (if any)	-
Year of commencement of educational activities in <b>residency</b> (postgraduate education) and total number of graduates	Start year - 2019 Total number of graduates since the beginning of the residency programs - 18
Duration of training in residency, educational programs (EP)	EP "7R01101 "Radiology" " - 2 years EP "7R01102 "Medical Genetics"" - 2 years EP "7R01103 "Urology and Andrology for Adults, Children"" - 3 years EP "7R01104 "Cardiology for Adults, Children"" - 3 years EP "7R01105 "Oncology for Adults"" - 2 years EP "7R01106 "Otolaryngology for Adults, Children" - 3 years EP "7R01109 "Cardiac Surgery for Adults, Children"- 4 years
Number of residents in the current academic year	54
Quality indicators in residency	Number of expelled over a period of 5 years - 11, including for poor performance - none.  Employment rate, % in dynamics over 5 years: 2021 – 100% 2022 – 100% 2023 – 100%
Year of commencement of implementation of <b>additional and non-formal education programs</b> , total	Year of establishment – 2015 Total number of additional education programs – 86, with 240 hours of teaching time.

number of programs	Total number of non-formal education programs – 70, with 160 hours of teaching time.
Number of distance education programs	Total - 4, with 120 hours of teaching time.
Number of students in the current year	258
Full-time teachers/part-time workers involved in the implementation of residency and additional education programs	Total number of teachers - 100, including full-time - 100 Categorization: 100%
Availability of a unit responsible for the educational process	Name – Department of Professional Education Year of establishment – 2015 Head is Yerzhanova Farida Nurmukhambetovna
Number of research projects over 5 years	12
Number of international treaties over 5 years	18
Website Instagram Facebook with active pages	Website: <a href="https://bmcudp.kz/ru/education/">https://bmcudp.kz/ru/education/</a> Instagram: bmcudp tk Facebook: <a href="https://www.facebook.com/bmcudp.kz/">https://www.facebook.com/bmcudp.kz/</a>
Information on accreditation as a medical organization (date, No., period)	№KZ66VEG00011799 from 11/30/2021 (Highest category for 3 years)

### **Strengths of the educational organization and achievements over 5 years:**

1. Availability of a certificate of compliance with international standards of quality and safety of medical activities JCI since 2016 with re-accreditation in 2019 and 2022 (until 2025).
2. Multidisciplinary nature of the Organization, starting with outpatient services to the production of radiopharmaceuticals (Cyclotron production complex).
3. Availability of the WetLab training centre in a separate building on the territory of the Hospital, allowing to master surgical skills on animals (pigs).
4. Availability of the only laboratory in the Republic of Kazakhstan for personalized genomic diagnostics, where whole-exome sequencing of human DNA with bioinformational search is carried out.
5. Continuous professional development of the Hospital staff abroad at the expense of the employer (availability of a development program).

### **2.2 Information about previous accreditation**

In May 2019, the MCH PAA RK successfully passed institutional accreditation in the field of continuous professional development (additional education) for compliance with the standards of the NI "Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Health Care" (hereinafter referred to as the ECAQA), included in the register of recognized accreditation bodies of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Based on the results of the evaluation by an external expert commission, the Accreditation Council of the ECAQA assigned the Hospital the status of an accredited organization providing additional education with the issuance of certificate No. IA00009 dated May 24, 2019, for a period of 5 years.

### **2.3 Brief characteristics of the self-assessment report of the RSE "Medical Centre Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the Right of Economic Management**

The institutional self-assessment report (hereinafter referred to as the report) of the RSE "Medical Centre Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the Right of Economic Management (hereinafter referred to as the MCH) is presented on 109 pages of

the main text, annexes on 20 pages, copies or electronic versions of 22 documents located at the link [https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1cLnFMvZCEfggLv2S3Sh\\_ML9gPTC2Ymak?usp=drive\\_link](https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1cLnFMvZCEfggLv2S3Sh_ML9gPTC2Ymak?usp=drive_link).

The report is characterized by the completeness of answers to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structuring taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for conducting self-assessment of medical education organizations of the ECAQA, provided to the MCH by the accreditation centre - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the director, Albayev Rustam Kuanyshbekovich, which confirms the accuracy of the quantitative information and data included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 20 members of the internal self-assessment commission indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the institutional self-assessment - Shanazarov Nasrulla Abdullaevich, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, and Deputy Director for Strategic Development, Science and Education.

The institutional self-assessment was conducted on the basis of the director's order No. 225 dated 05.04.2024 "On the self-assessment of the RSE "Medical Centre Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the Right of Economic Management" in accordance with the standards of institutional accreditation.

The report was reviewed by an accreditation expert: Yermukhanova L.S., and the reviews noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes, which were taken into account in the process of feedback with a representative of the educational organization, and the corresponding changes and additions were made to the self-assessment report.

All standards provide real practice of the educational organization for training residents in 7 specialties and students in 156 additional and non-formal education programs. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, students, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, training results, knowledge and skills assessment results. Includes information on its own material and technical base with a total area of 122,103 m<sup>2</sup>, the number of beds - 391, as well as third-party clinical bases (11 in total), contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc. The report is presented to the ECAQA in its final form, with data adjustments based on the above recommendations, written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, tables and figures (diagrams, photographs) contain references in the text and are numbered sequentially.

### **3. Description of the external expert evaluation**

The external expert work within the framework of the institutional evaluation of the MCH was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the External Evaluation of Educational Organizations and Educational Programs of the ECAQA. Dates of the visit to the organization: May 29-31, 2024.

The sequence of the visit over 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Program (hereinafter referred to as the Program), which is located in the documentation of the accreditation centre. The program is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of the external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the members of the EEC used the following methods and their results:

- interviews with management and administrative staff - 21 people;
- interviews with residents - 16 people,
- meeting with students - 15 people (online);
- studying the website – <https://bmcudp.kz/ru/>
- interviews - 31 teachers / mentors;
- questionnaires of teachers and residents - 100 and 54, respectively;



- observation of resident training: attendance of 2 practical classes (Topic: "Radiation therapy in oncology", mentor - Nalgieva F.Kh., resident - Abildinova A.; Topic: "Medical and genetic counselling", mentor - Musabaeva Z.S., residents - Shadman N., Ablaihanova N.);
- review of resources in the context of fulfilling accreditation standards: 17 practice/clinical engagement bases were visited, including 4 external ones (JSC "National Scientific Medical Centre", MSE on the REM "City Multidisciplinary Hospital No. 2" of the Akimat of Astana, MSE on the REM "City Perinatal Centre" of the Akimat of Astana, MSE on the REM "Multidisciplinary Medical Centre" of the Akimat of Astana), where training is conducted on 6 educational programs with the participation of 73 teachers/mentors;
- study of 22 educational and methodological documents both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents studied is in **Annex 2**).

The staff of the accredited organization ensured the presence of all persons specified in the visit program and in the lists of interview sites and conversations (Table 1).

**Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, and conversations with members of the EEC**

<b>№</b>	<b>Position</b>	<b>Quantity</b>
1	Acting Director	1
2	Deputy Directors	6
3	Heads of structural divisions	14
4	Heads of departments, heads of residency programs	8
5	Teachers	31
6	Students	15
7	Residents	16
8	Graduates	18
9	Employers	7

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of the EEC members was held to discuss the results of the external evaluation. The EEC members began drafting the final EEC report. Generalizations of the external evaluation results were made. The experts individually filled out the "Institutional Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of the MCH for Compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". The EEC members did not make any comments. The recommendations for improvement for the MCH were discussed and the chairperson, Yermukhanova L.S., held a final open vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC; access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the team, prompt provision of information to the EEC members, and timely provision of the requested documents.

*While conducting a survey of residents, 81.63% rated the work of the External Expert Commission for Accreditation as positive, 14.29% as satisfactory. The majority of respondents (83.67%) believe that it is necessary to accredit an educational organization or educational programs.*

*According to 60% of teachers, the survey conducted by the ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving the key areas of activity of the accredited educational organization.*

At the end of the visit program, the Chairman of the EEC announced recommendations for the management and employees of the educational organization based on the results of the external evaluation as part of the institutional accreditation.

### **3. Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of the external evaluation of the RSE "Medical Centre Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the right of economic management**

## **Standard 1: MISSION AND FINAL OUTCOMES**

### **1.1 Mission**

During the implementation of the visit program activities, namely, following the interview with the first head of the organization, deputy directors, heads of structural divisions, in interviews with residents, students and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the educational organization, took part in the formation of proposals for formulating the mission, while the mission was communicated to residents and students through the website, social networks, information letters to medical organizations. The strategic plan of the organization for 5 years was reviewed, including such areas as providing high-quality and effective medical services, service at all levels of medical care, ensuring financial sustainability, developing innovative and scientific and educational activities, which confirms the fulfilment of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization. From interviews with residents, it was established that before the start of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, tell where to get the necessary information about the educational program, teachers, training bases.

During the visit to the departments, accreditation experts noted the reliability of the self-assessment report data regarding strengths. And in addition to the information included in Section 2.1 of this report, the experts determined that the Hospital is a multidisciplinary organization, from the outpatient service to the production of radiopharmaceuticals (Cyclotron Production Complex).

The experts noted the interest of students in training even at their own expense. For example, the formation of a training plan for 2024 to undergo advanced training on the topic "Basic course in electrocardiography" with the doctor of the functional diagnostics department, Master of Medical Sciences Utebekov Zh.Ye., begins in 2023.

The experts noted the uniqueness of the educational process of the Hospital and the fact that a training course for students on photodynamic therapy has been developed, which is the only one in Kazakhstan. There is an in-house pathology department, where residents can study the pathology of diseases, analyse complex clinical cases, and develop critical thinking. There is a modern high-tech video broadcast from operating rooms to conference rooms and an in-house printing house. The publication of educational and methodological literature is carried out at the expense of the hospital.

Social responsibility of the Hospital in creating favourable motivational conditions for the work of employees, resident doctors (availability of its own kindergarten "Karlygash", free vouchers for children "Discovery", preferential (50%) conditions for employees in the sanatorium, its own canteen, including for resident doctors, where the cost of meals is minimal; a gym, where resident doctors work out free of charge; transportation on 6 routes: financial assistance to mothers with many children, 8-9 times bonus per year,; additional 6 days to labour leave).

In the MCH PAA RK there are departments that are directly related to the educational process, which can be noted as the best practice in education, namely, the presence of the WetLab training centre in a separate building on the territory of the Hospital, which allows you to master surgical skills on animals (pigs). The experts got acquainted with the Senhans robotic system in the operating room and training centre and met with trainers for working with this equipment, who were trained and received permission to work and study in Italy. These conclusions were made during interviews with residents and students, who confirmed that they have access to the laboratory, to the Senhans robotic system and can observe the progress of the operation from the conference room.

The results of the documentation study demonstrate that the mission of the organization is aimed at achieving a high level of public health with continuous improvement of medical care using advanced methods of prevention, diagnosis, treatment and rehabilitation based on joint responsibility for maintaining and strengthening health, and the educational process is built in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard and current regulatory legal acts (LSI) in postgraduate education and health care. With regard to additional and non-formal education, it was determined that students are trained in small groups, each student is provided with an individual approach and the opportunity to practice all practical skills.

At the same time, during meetings with the head of the education department, the experts identified a number of problems, including the lack of a quality specialist in education, which causes certain difficulties in evaluating the educational process. But according to Farida Nurmagambetovna, work is underway on this issue, at this stage in July; changes will be made to the structure of the organization, which involves the inclusion of a quality specialist in education.

### **1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy**

To verify **standard 1**, a meeting was held with the acting director of the MCH PAA RK Shanazarov N.A. During the conversation, the experts asked the following questions: does the organization plan to increase the number of residents, will new educational programs be developed, in what part of education does the MCH PAA RK want to strengthen the work. During the answers, the acting director of the organization confirmed that yes; they do plan to increase the number of residents under the state order, in accordance with educational resources, that the MCH PAA RK has developed a Concept for the Development of Medical Tourism, there are 5 full-time coordinators, including 2 foreigners and 1 remote consultant. Last year, the MCH PAA RK joined the partner clinics of medical tourism. Colleagues from South Korea are engaged in attracting medical tourism, and Turkey is engaged in the service part. Today, the MCH PAA RK cooperates with 14 partner clinics. New educational programs will be developed as the market demand for educational programs increases.

*While conducting a survey of 54 residents (on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>), out of 22 questions, a number were devoted to the quality of the educational process and the educational program. It was found that 57.14% of residents would recommend studying in this educational organization to their acquaintances, friends, relatives. And 63.27% of respondents believe that the heads of the educational program and teachers are aware of the problems of students related to training. To the question "Do you think this educational organization allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?", 69.39% of residents answered positively, 12.24% are not sure about this, 12.24% could not yet answer this question and 6.12% would like to believe it.*

During a conversation with students, the following information was obtained - students who completed training at the MCH PAA RK noted that they plan to take thematic cycles of this particular organization in advance. They are satisfied that the training here is almost individual. For example, neurologists noted that they want to undergo advanced training in epileptology at the MCH PAA RK with Utebekov Zh., there are a lot of people who want to see him and you have to wait 2-3 months.

*The 20 teachers surveyed (21 questions in the questionnaire) also answered that 80% are satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace in this educational organization, and 15% partially agree with this statement. The experts determined that the organization has a healthy microclimate, since the manager is quite accessible to residents and employees, responds promptly to requests and requirements for ensuring comfortable conditions for both students and teachers. In the questionnaire, 90% of teachers are satisfied with the microclimate of the organization, and 10% are partially satisfied. According to 80%, in the educational organization, a teacher has the opportunity to realize himself as a professional in his specialty. For your information, only 20 people responded (there are 100 on staff), with 50% having up to 5 years of teaching experience, 30% having up to 10 years, and 20% having over 10 years of teaching experience.*

### **1.3 Final learning outcomes**

*The surveyed teachers responded that 10% were fully satisfied with the level of residents' previous training, and 80% were partially satisfied.*

The experts established a clear continuity between the final outcomes of the previous training of residents (prerequisites) and training in residency, and subsequent programs of continuous professional development. The organization has developed 86 programs of additional education, 70 programs of non-formal education, 7 residency programs. Residents are informed about this.

85% of the teachers-respondents believe that students of this educational organization have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training program, and 15% partially agree with this.

## **1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final outcomes**

The mission is formulated and the final outcomes of the residency programs are defined taking into account the proposals of such stakeholders as students, employees of the MCH PAA RK and employers. And the programs of additional and non-formal education are based on the proposals of students, potential employers, healthcare organizations, since there are a sufficient number of educational institutions in the country providing similar services. At the same time, when talking with residents, students and employers, experts did not receive a clear answer to the question "Do you participate in formulating the mission and goals of the organization, educational program?", "What is the personal contribution, for example, of residents to improving the educational program?". To these questions, the majority of residents answered that the organization's mission was approved before they entered the residency, and employers answered that when the mission was approved, they participated in the discussion online, via a zoom conference.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Comply with 14 standards: fully - 14.

## **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS**

### **2.1 Model of educational programs**

Educational programs in the specialties EP 7R01101 "Radiology", EP 7R01102 "Medical Genetics", EP 7R01103 "Urology and Andrology for Adults and Children", EP 7R01104 "Cardiology for Adults and Children", EP 7R01105 "Oncology for Adults", EP 7R01106 "Otolaryngology for Adults and Children", EP 7R01109 "Cardiac Surgery for Adults and Children" were implemented. The documents contain teaching and methodological complexes, which define the goal, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work. Conformity with the State Compulsory Educational Standard and standard requirements has been established. While visiting the CT and MRI departments, surgical department No. 8 (gynaecology), the experts received convincing data that the training is carried out according to plan, before the start of the lesson, residents, as well as students, answer tests, receive feedback from the teacher, for example, in gynaecology they have the opportunity to improve their skills on the Senhans robotic system in the operating room and training centre, under the supervision of a teacher or mentor who has been trained in Italy and received permission to work. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational program, since the experts studied the code of ethics and during the interview, the residents answered that they were informed about the content of this document.

Analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all scientific achievements in the relevant disciplines are taken into account, additions are made to the bibliography of the EMCD and syllabuses, and teachers use them in classes.

The mentoring system, which is described in the Regulation on the clinical mentor, was evaluated. A total of 73 mentors, whose tasks are to organize and conduct work with residents in mastering professional skills, knowledge of regulatory documentation on the training profile, mastering the norms of medical ethics, improving the general educational and cultural level, forming high responsibility in residents for the work performed, involving residents in the implementation of practical and research work at clinical sites.

Independent training of residents is presented involves independent study of scientific publications on topical issues of literary sources, work at clinical sites in close connection with department heads and doctors, medical personnel, work with medical documentation, which allows them to apply their knowledge and skills in practice.

Training of students is carried out in accordance with the current policy of professional organizations, since each organization has its own characteristics.

Students can interact with each other and with teachers through educational networks such as Platonus, the Hospital website, WhatsApp.

The procedure for informing residents about their rights and obligations is reflected in the Agreement on training under the residency program for higher and postgraduate education organizations, which sets out the rights and obligations of resident physicians.

This demonstrates compliance with standard 2 in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents.

*The qualification obtained as a result of mastering the residency educational program corresponds to level 7 of the national qualifications framework in medical education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications in the European Higher Education Area. (ESG 1.2).*

The educational organization has adapted training to the needs and wishes of individual students, for example, organizing individual training at the request of students.

At the same time, along with the principles of quality and academic integrity, which are described in the Academic Policy of the Hospital, the organization has also implemented an anti-plagiarism system (agreement with "PLAGIAT.PL" LLP No. 1906 dated 02.08.2023).

## **2.2 Scientific method**

The educational programs include scientific foundations and methodology of medical research (discipline "Evidence-based medicine", topic "Quantitative and qualitative research methods", number of hours 5/150 hours), including clinical research and clinical epidemiology (number of hours 5/150). During the conversation with the residents, the experts learned that they practice their research skills in the scientific club "Council of Young Scientists". The club includes 50 residents; the president of the scientific club is Yer Khanova Zhansaya, a 2nd-year resident of the EP "Cardiology for Adults and Children". Currently, 2 students are co-executors of a grant scientific and technical project on the topic: "Study of cryptogenic insulin in patients with atrial defibrillation", scientific supervisor is Abrahmanov A.S., head of the arrhythmology department.

However, experts noted that it is necessary to include the results of scientific research in educational programs for Additional Education for students.

The teachers said that they teach residents methods of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data, and the application of scientific developments. This form of training is organized in practical classes using the PBL method, as well as in the form of problem lectures.

Residents and students have access to updated scientific and clinical data, since the educational organization has a robotic surgery centre. The robotic system allows for laparoscopic robot-assisted surgeries in urology, gynaecology and general surgery. Access to a scientific laboratory has been organized for residents to practice their skills in performing surgical manipulations in vivo on operating tables equipped with endoscopic stands and a training robotic system, the necessary sets of modern instruments and suture materials, and residents can independently perform manipulations and analyse the results. And also free access to practical experience is provided, as there is its own clinical base with a total bed capacity of 391.

While questioning residents, it was found that the educational organization has access to the participation of students in research work and 63.27% of people are completely satisfied with this, 8.16% are partially satisfied, 4.08% are not satisfied. Residents should be engaged in RW and in response to the questionnaire, 42.86% wrote that they are already engaged in RW, 16.33% are planning to start, 20.41% are looking for a RW topic, 6.12% are not engaged.

## **2.3 Methods of training and teaching**

The relationship between traditional and active teaching methods guarantees that residents and students achieve the expected learning outcomes, since traditional methods provide resident doctors and students of advanced training programs with theoretical knowledge, form practical skills, and active forms and methods of teaching motivate independent personal growth.

The classroom part of the residency and AT programs is organized by active, interactive teaching methods, independent work under the guidance of a mentor is organized by practical teaching methods, and independent work involves extracurricular teaching methods.

Active teaching methods involve residents studying presentations, cases, analysing clinical cases,

patient case histories, and working in multidisciplinary teams. Interactive teaching methods involve the exchange of information between residents and students with the teacher, and are presented in the format of brainstorming, round tables, master classes, and analysis of situational problems.

Practical skills of students form the professional competencies of residents; in accordance with the list of privileges of the resident, he/she masters practical skills under the guidance of a mentor.

A feature of the MCH PAA RK is that when implementing the residency program, the learning process takes place directly in the clinical departments, which contributes to the growth of his/her professional competence, consolidation of theoretical knowledge in practice.

## **2.4 Program structure, content and duration**

There are documents containing requirements for the structure and content of educational programs, including a typical curriculum, a working curriculum, an academic calendar, and syllabuses. The Department of Healthcare Technology Evaluation and Strategic Development is responsible for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process.

The content of the working programs and the catalogue of elective disciplines reflect the needs of the healthcare system, including improving the competencies in emergency conditions of non-core specialists, as well as innovative approaches to nuclear medicine diagnostics, such as the synthesis of cyclotron radioactive isotopes, the synthesis of radiopharmaceuticals, positron emission tomography, as well as the specifics of RW and scientific achievements of teachers. For example, radiologists together with two residents are implementing the project: "The role of PET and CT in diagnostics in children", and oncologists under the supervision of Shanazarov N.A. have been carrying out the research project "Development of innovative technologies that improve the efficiency of diagnostics and treatment of background and precancerous diseases of the cervix associated with the human papillomavirus" since 2023.

For the successful implementation of residency programs, the organization has resources for organizing the assessment of practical skills of residents (simulation centre, robotic system for laparoscopic robot-assisted surgeries). However, there are some difficulties in recruiting students for educational programs of Additional training, due to problems with government procurement, since some organizations reduce the cost of training courses to a minimum.

*Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, in which 69.39% are completely satisfied, 16.33% are partially satisfied, 4.08% are not satisfied.*

Students of advanced training programs are also provided with all the necessary training resources. Moreover, the students noted that this hospital provides almost individual training for each student, thereby motivating the students to choose this training organization again.

The organization has its own clinical base with 391 beds and 500 outpatient visits, and has also concluded 11 contracts with medical organizations, including 14 foreign ones (South Korea, Turkey). *And to the question of the questionnaire "Is there sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.)", 69.39% of residents answered with full agreement, 24.49% partially agree, 2.04% disagree. At the same time, 77.55% of residents claim that after the end of classes, the teacher provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini-questionnaire, and works on mistakes).*

Clinical training is provided in the conditions of third-party multidisciplinary clinics, and the staff coordinates training on the basis of these clinics so that residents acquire adequate training in various aspects of the chosen field of medicine. For example, cardiac resuscitators are trained in the regional hospital during rotation.

At the same time, to the question "Do residents' representatives participate in the development of educational programs?", the experts received the following answer - 69.39% of residents participate constantly in the discussion and development of educational programs, 2.04% do not participate, 10.2% of students do not know anything about this.

## **2.5 Organization of training**

The management of the educational process, reflected in the self-assessment report (**Standard 2**) and general approaches to management were confirmed during a visit to the department of professional

education and a conversation with the head and specialists of the department. At the same time, verification of **standard 2** showed that to evaluate the quality of the educational process, a control department is needed specifically for the quality of education, for example, when evaluating the validity and reliability of test tasks, trained and certified testers are needed.

The experts got acquainted with the work of the departments, including during a visit to the department of anaesthesiology, resuscitation and intensive care, the experts were introduced to the department in more detail by the head of the department Babashev B.B. The department is designed for 20 beds, including 12 surgical beds, 8 intensive care units (ICU). The department has 12 recovery rooms and 11 operating rooms. Babashev B.B. noted that non-core residents (ENT, surgery) are not competent enough in emergency conditions. A total of 17 meetings were held and a cross-interview established that training at the MCH for residents takes place under the direct supervision of teachers and mentors, and residents and students have access to all educational resources of the hospital.

While visiting a practical lesson in the simulation centre, the experts saw that the organization promotes the development of practical competencies of residents, including on simulation equipment. At the same time, residents deepen their theoretical knowledge and develop communication skills.

The training of residents in the specialty "Oncology for Adults", "Cardiac Surgery for Adults and Children" is aimed at meeting the needs of practical healthcare, since the analysis of the shortage of specialists for 2024 revealed that the shortage of specialists in these profiles persists throughout the country. Therefore, this organization is multidisciplinary in the field of oncology and cardiac surgery, as well as in other profiles, and provides many opportunities and conditions for qualified training of specialists in practical healthcare. Thus, during a conversation with the management of the organization, experts received information about the material and technical equipment of the hospital, the resources of the clinical and diagnostic departments, and the teachers confirmed that the training of residents is carried out directly in the clinical departments of the MCH. Residents of this specialty can supervise patients with diseases such as urological, genetic, oncological, with diseases of the cardiovascular system, ENT diseases, diseases of a genetic nature, and conduct all types of radiation diagnostics.

This is facilitated by mentoring, which is carried out at the MCH PAA RK.

*Of the 54 residents surveyed, 69.39% responded that teachers use active and interactive teaching methods in classes quite often, 6.12% believe that they do so rarely or sometimes. When visiting the educational organization, experts identified problems in the implementation of new teaching methods, including, according to teachers, due to the small number of students, they cannot use the TBL method of teaching.*

## **2.6 Process of developing educational programs**

The procedure for developing residency and additional training programs is prescribed in the Academic Policy of the Hospital in accordance with the Guidelines for the development of higher and postgraduate education programs of the Ministry of Health and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Order of the National Centre for the Development of Higher Education of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 04.05.2023, No. 601 n/k).

Postgraduate education programs (hereinafter referred to as PEP) are developed and approved by the Hospital independently in accordance with the requirements of the State Compulsory Educational Standard, the rules of credit technology of education, the classifier of areas of personnel training and other LSI in the field of higher and postgraduate education (PE). The programs are developed in accordance with the established objectives, including the expected learning outcomes. The qualification obtained as a result of mastering the program is defined and explained, corresponds to a certain level of the NQF.

While determining the expected final learning outcomes, the recommendations of all interested stakeholders are taken into account. *For example, residency students (ENT, surgeons) asked for the following when completing the cycle in the department resuscitation; strengthen the EP with issues on emergency conditions.*

## **2.7 Procedure for approval of educational programs**

All EPs, including training at clinical sites, are approved by the authorized body based on clearly established criteria, evaluation of the educational program and existing powers for approval. After receiving a review, the EP is submitted for consideration and approval at a meeting of the collegial body of the MCH (SCC, Academic Council). Residency EPs are reviewed for compliance with standards, key competencies of resident doctors, the choice of the teaching method and assessment of resident doctors is assessed, the capabilities, resources of the department, compliance with the qualification requirements of teachers / mentors are assessed.

After the EP is approved in the AIS "Platonus", an online application is submitted to the EPVO.kz information system in order to obtain approval of the submitted program.

For the continuous improvement of the material and technical base (hereinafter referred to as MTB), the Administration allocates the necessary funds from the Hospital budget, which is spent on: major and current repairs, technical equipment for educational, scientific and information activities, the purchase of furniture and educational equipment, and the maintenance of engineering and communication networks. Constant work is underway to improve the IT technologies and infrastructure of the Hospital. Uninterrupted operation of the Internet is ensured, a local computer system and a system for video broadcasting lectures in classrooms have been created.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Comply out of 33 standards, 32 comply fully, 1 partially, 0 do not comply.

**Recommendations for improvement:**

1) The results of scientific and technical programs (STP) conducted at the MCH PAA RK should be included in additional education programs (short-term cycles, advanced training programs).

### **Standard 3: COMPETENCY ASSESSMENT AND DOCUMENTATION**

#### **3.1 Assessment methods**

The study of control and measuring tools (checklists) showed that the organization has implemented an appropriate assessment policy that allows for a comprehensive assessment of the academic achievements of residents. During the interview, residents talked about the forms of assessment, such as test assignments, oral surveys, situational tasks, and that they are satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from teachers. The system of appealing the assessment results is reflected in the Academic Policy and there have been no precedents of appeal during the period of work of the educational organization.

Thus, to verify the data of **standard 3**, the experts asked the head of the professional education department: How is the quality of test assignments assessed, are there certified testers in the organization, and checked the documents and methods for assessing residents and students. The organization has checklists for the main disciplines, which are compiled by the teachers of the EP and approved at a meeting of the Academic Committee. Control and measuring tools are reviewed by internal experts. The head of the education department responded that additions and updates to the CIS are planned to be made at the end of the current academic year, based on the results of a survey of all interested parties.

During a visit to the organization and an interview with specialists from the professional department, as well as with the deputy head of the science and gerontology department of the MCH Avdeev A., the commission was convinced that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and employees, and includes such documents as annual operational plans, annual reports, department regulations, agreements with teachers and residents, an order on the implementation of an employee motivation system for the development of scientific and innovative activities, orders for the implementation of scientific research, the Regulation of the Council of Young Scientists of the RSE "Medical Centre Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the right of economic management and educational and methodological documentation (work program, working curricula, syllabuses, journals), assessment tools (checklists,



statements), certificates, and verifications. A review of the website showed that the documents required for residents are posted on its pages - these are the Rules for Admission to the Residency of the MCH PAA RK, Questions for the Entrance Exam to the Residency, the Academic Policy of the MCH, for students of additional education, the site contains - the Policy for Admission of Students, and there is information on the thematic calendar plan of additional and non-formal education programs, which is regularly updated. This information was obtained during an interview with the head of the department of professional education, Yerzhanova F.N.

### **3.2 Relationship between Assessment and Learning**

The results of the assessment of residents are documented in the AIS "Platonus".

The organization evaluates the reliability and validity of the assessment methods by comparing the grades given by different experts, the validity of the assessment methods is carried out by analysing the content of the test, the curriculum and the objectives of the course, as well as conducting comparative tests between different students to check the consistency of the results.

During interviews with 20 teachers regarding assessment methods, experts received convincing information that the organization has 1 certified testologist, who is a reviewer of control and measuring tools. In the future, it is necessary to increase the number of certified testologists. Residents also shared their opinions on the timeliness of providing tests, conducting consultations before exams, the clarity of the entire assessment procedure and its fairness. For example, residents said that consultations are mandatory before exams, and the teacher conducts explanatory work on the assessment criteria, according to checklists. Students also expressed their opinions regarding the assessment methods for incoming and control tests, as well as checklists.

*During a visit to the organization, the management was asked the question: "Are external examiners involved in order to improve the fairness, quality and transparency of the assessment process?" And the answer was received: Yes, external doctors of practical health care are involved, both for entrance exams to residency and for passing the final certification.*

The experts inspected the resources for organizing the assessment of knowledge and practical skills, namely the simulation centre, where residents practice and pass practical skills, as well as the Senhans robotic system in the training centre.

The 8 employer representatives interviewed also pointed out that the training of graduates corresponds to the modern development of medical practice and science, since modern medical technologies are used in the training of both residents and students, such as high-tech video broadcasting from operating rooms to conference rooms and robotic surgery. Simulators and virtual reality are used in practical classes to model various clinical scenarios. Employers said that they themselves participate in the assessment of residents, since they are included in the examination committee when residents are admitted and when residents pass the final state certification. However, the educational organization did not conduct systematic feedback with them. Employers often note that residents lack the following skills and qualities: communication and interaction skills with patients, colleagues and other medical personnel, critical thinking and decision making, the ability to cope with emotional stress, insufficient skills in maintaining electronic medical records and knowledge - this is the ability to analyse complex clinical situations, apply clinical knowledge in practice and make informed decisions in conditions of uncertainty they wanted to see as the strongest.

At the same time, there are difficulties in developing control and measuring tools, including when using digital platforms, difficulties may arise associated with the technical implementation of tasks, especially if they include multimedia elements or interactive components.

### **3.3 Documentation**

The monitoring and documentation (document flow) system is systematic and transparent. Upon completion of training, all received certificates and diplomas are added to the personal portfolio.

Upon completion of each discipline, teachers conduct a survey of students, both in residency and in additional education, in order to assess the quality of teaching. Teachers receive specific feedback on their work, which allows them to adjust teaching methods, improve courses and improve their qualifications. Collecting students' opinions helps to identify weak points in curricula and programs,

which allows them to be adjusted in accordance with the needs and expectations of consumers, but nevertheless, at the level of additional and non-formal education, there is no Regulation on the comprehensive assessment of students.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria* out of 15 standards comply: fully - 14, partially - 1, do not comply - 0.

**Recommendations for improvement:**

- 1) To develop a "Regulation on the assessment of students", including different approaches and methods of assessment based on evidence-based practice

## **Standard 4: STUDENTS AND LISTENERS**

### **4.1 Admission policy and selection**

The organization has a policy on the admission of residents, which is called "Rules for admission to the residency of the MCH PAA RK". The head of the professional education department, F.N. Yerzhanova, spoke about the policy for accepting residents. Approaches to accepting residents are based on the country's requirements and internal regulations, namely, the "Rules for Admission to the Residency of the MCH PAA RK". For the period 2019-2023 82 residents were accepted to the educational program in the specialties of EP 7R01101 "Radiology", EP 7R01102 "Medical Genetics", EP 7R01103 "Urology and Andrology for Adults, Children", EP 7R01104 "Cardiology for Adults, Children", EP 7R01105 "Oncology for Adults", EP 7R01106 "Otolaryngology for Adults, Children", EP 7R01109 "Cardiac Surgery for Adults, Children", 18 people successfully completed the training. At the same time, according to the results of the final exam, 9 people received "excellent", 9 "good". Students are admitted in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 31.10.2018 No. 600 "On approval of the Standard rules for admission to training in educational organizations implementing educational programs of higher and postgraduate education", as well as the internal document "Rules for admission to the residency of the MCH PAA RK".

A balance is ensured between the existing potential of the educational organization and the opportunities for training and recruitment of students and listeners, since the organization has its own multidisciplinary clinic MCH PAA RK and 18 external clinical bases.

While selecting residents, such abilities of applicants as the reason for choosing the EP by the applicant, his interest in this specialty, active participation in student events, scientific conferences, scientific circles and the presence of a certain amount of information on the chosen specialty are considered.

In case of equal entrance exam results, priority in enrolment is given to persons with medical experience. Further, scientific publications are taken into account, including in top scientific publications, certificates of scientific developments, certificates of awarding scientific scholarships, grants, certificates/diplomas for participation in scientific conferences and competitions.

Thus, the experts validated the data according to **standard 4**. In general, all criteria are met, at the same time, some shortcomings were identified - a small number of grants. The experts familiarized themselves with the documentation on the admission of residents, including the personal files of the admitted residents. Many documents are well drawn up, but there are comments regarding the evidence base for publications.

Regarding the practice of academic consulting, personal support for residents and the development of not only professional skills, the experts interviewed mentors. For example, mentor Shcharipova Galiya Serikovna, an anaesthesiologist-resuscitator, noted that in their free time, they visit theatres and cinemas with residents. The organization has a resident development program, which includes the development of residents' technological skills, project management, legal aspects, access to specialized equipment and software, access to research and educational resources, development of partnerships with other organizations, and receiving regular feedback from mentors to adjust the course of development. Residents are included in such advisory bodies as the Academic Council, KILI.

### **4.2 Motivation**

The hospital creates conditions for the formation of professional and social competence, an active civic position of students, and promotes the development of personal qualities of future doctors. Meetings are held between students and the deputy director for strategic development, science and education, as well as with the head of the department on issues related to the organization of the educational process and educational work, on issues in the field of social, financial and personal needs. The hospital considers the needs of each resident doctor individually. While studying on a fee-paying basis at your own expense, it is allowed to pay in instalments (50/50), in isolated cases of financial difficulty in paying for training; a resident doctor can apply for a deferment or make monthly payments. Some residents are given the opportunity to work part-time at 0.5 rates at the MCH (Yerkhanova Zhansaya, Mamyrbekov Darkhan - cardiology department, Serikova Tamilana - otolaryngology department, Salimov Rustam - urology department). The Hospital also provides free transportation on six routes within the city and nearby settlements, which can be used by resident doctors. Resident doctors and students are allocated rooms with personal lockers for changing clothes (there are 58 lockers in the locker room for female residents and 32 for men). The MCH has its own canteen for employees and residents, where a set lunch costs only 500 tenge. Also, places are provided for children of resident doctors in the Karlygash MCH kindergarten.

Since 2021, 18 resident doctors of the EP "Radiology" have completed their residency training at the MCH on a fee-paying basis. Of these, 9 are employed in the diagnostic departments of the MCH of the Presidential Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan

#### **4.3 Number of students and listeners**

The hospital periodically reviews the number of resident doctors accepted through written requests to the Health Department, the LEA of the regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan, informing the residency EP at its base and training qualified specialists of the department. Hospitals participating in the implementation of the residency EP submit a need for residency for the upcoming academic year, taking into account the needs of the labour market.

Currently, for the purpose of international cooperation, 2 residents have gone to study in South Korea for 1.5 months, at the expense of the MCH.

Thus, the MCH carries out admission to residency, taking into account the country's need for personnel, based on current LSI and available material and technical resources, human resources for training residents.

Training of students at the MCH is carried out on an ongoing basis. Students are attracted by this educational base with an individual approach to each student, since the process is aimed at quality, not quantity. Students are also attracted by highly qualified teachers and the material and technical equipment of the MCH.

#### **4.4 Support and consulting**

The Admissions Committee provides detailed consultation to applicants for residency on the list of residency programs and clinical bases implemented by the MCH. For interested applicants for residency, information on each residency program is posted on the website, in the public domain. The hospital provides academic consulting by specialists from the Department of Professional Education.

Monitoring and control of the progress of resident doctors is carried out by conducting a survey on satisfaction with the educational process, analysing the achievements of resident doctors through the AIS "Platonus". Social and material support is described in paragraph 4.2.

#### **4.5 Representation of students and listeners**

The hospital is introducing the practice of including resident doctors in the working groups of departments when developing or updating the EP. Resident Kakenov Azamat - EP "Radiology" is included in the Academic Council. The representative of the residents included recommendations on elective disciplines. It is also necessary to take into account the opinions and recommendations of students based on the results of the survey when developing the EP of additional training in order to improve the EP.

Resident Mamyrbekov Darkhan - EP "Cardiology for Adults, Children", is included in the KILI. Resident doctors were also involved in writing the self-assessment report. There is a Council of Young

Scientists at the MCH, chaired by a 2nd-year resident, Yer Khanova Zhansaya, in the EP "Cardiology for Adults, Children". The Council includes 50 residents. The Council's work is carried out on the basis of the Regulations of the Council of Young Scientists of the RSE "Medical Centre Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan" on the Right of Economic Management, approved on January 29, 2024.

#### **4.6 Educational Strategies**

At the Hospital, the methods of training and teaching correspond to the abilities and needs of healthcare professionals and serve to achieve the mission of the educational organization, as well as the final learning outcomes. Individual work is carried out with each student to identify his or her individual qualities, inclinations, abilities, as well as the processing of practical skills.

The effectiveness of training is determined on the basis of a questionnaire, interview. During the internship, students document their training in an individual internship plan, where they fill out the Internship Diary. At the request of the students, training is also conducted in a distance format (for example, "Leadership in Nursing" for nurses).

Also, MCH specialists regularly conduct on-site courses on a volunteer basis. The last such courses were held last month in Atyrau.

#### **4.7 Working conditions**

The CPD programs are implemented in safe conditions on the territory of the Hospital, in specialized departments for conducting research, manipulations in offices equipped with high-tech equipment and certified workplaces. To comply with safety precautions, residents fill out fire safety briefing protocols, as well as reports on training events and safety drills. When working in laboratories, residents are also familiarized with safety precautions for using equipment. Mastering additional education programs is carried out using flexible forms of training, with or without separation from the student's work. Resident doctors who are grant recipients receive a state stipend for the entire period of study, regardless of the results of the midterm assessment.

Combining study with work (no more than 0.5 of the rate) in areas of activity close to their future specialty, in their free time, is permitted with the consent of the head of the EP and the head of the Department of Professional Education. In the presence of a specialist certificate, residents are allowed to carry out independent medical activities in public and private medical institutions.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Comply with out of 31 standards: fully - 30, partially - 1, do not comply - 0

**Standard 4: fulfilled**

**Recommendations for improvement, identified during the external visit:**

1) While developing additional education programs, take into account the opinions and recommendations of students to improve the content of educational programs and approaches to teaching.

### **Standard 5: PROVISION OF POSTGRADUATE AND ADDITIONAL EDUCATION**

#### **5.1 Recognition Policy**

The recognition policy in the residency of the MCH PAA RK is based on the assessment of performance and fulfilment of program requirements. Residents are assessed based on their knowledge, skills, professionalism and ability to work in a team. Additional education can serve as a mechanism for confirming qualifications and competence in the areas studied before the authorized body.

#### **5.2 Commitments and development of postgraduate and continuing education organizations**

Obtaining a diploma, additional, and non-formal education is accompanied by additional obligations and opportunities for the development of the organization. The MHC PAA RK has all the conditions for full-fledged training of residents, the application of new knowledge and skills in practice, as well as the opportunity for residents to participate in projects and scientific research that contribute to the development of the company. The MCH PAA RK has the only laboratory of

personalized genomic diagnostics in the Republic of Kazakhstan, where whole-exome sequencing of human DNA with bioinformational search is carried out, as well as the presence of the Wetlab training centre in a separately constructed building on the territory of the Hospital, allow residents to master surgical skills on animals (pigs).

### **5.3 Recruitment and selection policy of teachers**

A total of 100 employees, given the specifics of the organization, all teachers are full-time employees of the MCH PAA RK. The experts were familiar with the HR policy (the HR policy was approved by the order of the director No. 817 dated 10/27/2023), the Regulation on mentors (approved by the order of the director No. 675 dated 09/19/2023), which are aimed at forming and strengthening the corporate culture, motivating employees. Persons are allowed to conduct additional and non-formal education according to the Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 303 dated 12/21/2020.

In order to verify the data of standard 5, external experts obtained the opinion of teachers on the HR policy, which includes defining requirements for candidates, hiring procedures, assessing qualifications and work experience, as well as developing criteria for assessing professional competence. In addition, it includes measures to stimulate the development of the Academic staff, support scientific research and professional growth. The interview with M.A. Dosov, an anaesthesiologist-resuscitator, included questions on the financial assistance provided by the educational organization, how teachers are selected, and allowed the experts to learn about approaches to attracting clinical base staff for teaching (there are 100 such teachers in total), about the strategy and tactics of recruiting residents, information support for the educational program, and to identify problems in managing and developing human resources, since most teachers are also mentors.

*While questioning teachers, it was found that the majority (75%) are completely satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace in this educational organization, but 20% are partially satisfied. In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of R&D - 75% completely agree, 20% partially. Satisfied with the work of the HR service - 80% completely agree, 15% partially. Satisfied with the salary - 55% completely agree, 15% partially.*

### **5.4 Commitments and development of teachers**

In order to verify the data of standard 5, during a meeting with the head of the HR department and during interviews with teachers, experts received an opinion on approaches to the development of pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring, which includes the following: teachers regularly take specialized courses to develop pedagogical skills, understand modern educational technologies and mentoring methods, the administration provides an opportunity to participate in educational and professional events, helps teachers exchange experiences, learn about new trends and practices in teaching and mentoring, regular meetings and discussions of residents' progress with constructive feedback, the use of modern educational technologies, maintaining electronic portfolios, problem-based learning, and others.

The experts received answers about the teacher training program, which is held annually and 20 teachers participating in the implementation of the educational program were trained in 2024. These activities are funded by the university. The expert checked the teachers' certificates on such topics as "Methods of assessing students' knowledge and skills, reliability, validity and fairness of assessment methods at the postgraduate level", "Teaching methods, and mechanisms for assessing educational programs". The educational organization also motivates teachers through training abroad, at the expense of the MCH. For example, Basharova G.Ye., head of the surgical department No. 8 (gynaecology), was trained in Italy on the Senchans robotic system, which is mainly intended for obese women.

The experts found that teachers initiate research topics for residents stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature, medical documentation. For example, radiologists initiated a scientific project, with the participation of 2 residents, on the topic: "The role of PET and CT in diagnostics in children"

*The organization has opportunities for career growth and development of teacher competencies - 70% of surveyed teachers answered, and 15% partially agree with this. Studied in programs for improving professional qualifications - 70% less than 1 year ago, 20% during the current year, 70% more than 3 years ago, 20% more than 5 years ago and 0% answered "I do not remember when it was".*

*The organization implements social support programs for teachers - 20% answered that "yes, such programs exist", 0% "I have already used this", 10% of respondents answered that there are no such programs, and 60% of respondents do not know about it.*

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Compliant out of 15 standards: fully - 13, partially -2, do not comply - 0.

**Recommendations for improvement:**

- 1) To prepare and develop mechanisms for integrating education and practice/clinic to improve educational programs, conduct research in educational expertise, expand partnerships in educational activities.
- 2) To introduce assessment of learning outcomes using innovative technologies.

## **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

### **6.1 Material and technical support and equipment**

The hospital strives to provide favourable conditions for learning and working, promoting the health of students and residents, within the framework of its educational programs.

The following premises are available for educational events: a small conference hall for 25 seats, a large conference hall for 159 seats, a hall in the nuclear medicine department for 20 seats, a training room in block C2 (2nd floor) for 15 seats, as well as an educational and clinical centre for 25 seats for lectures and discussions with participants. All conference rooms are equipped with stationary video equipment, as well as a portable projector and a laptop for conducting classes in the departments, flip charts and whiteboards. In addition, the educational institutions have a simulation centre and a robotic surgery centre. The education department has 4 classrooms and each department has a conference room equipped with multimedia equipment. In general, the MCH has all the conditions for students.

### **6.2 Training bases**

A review of the resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, the following clinical bases were visited - Clinical and Pharmacological Department; Department of Functional Diagnostics; CT and MRI Department; Department of Anaesthesiology, Resuscitation and Intensive Care; Surgical Department No. 8 (Gynaecology); Surgical Department No. 3 (Traumatology, Orthopaedics); Surgical Department No. 4 (general surgery, urology) with a total bed capacity of 391, and the employees of the educational organization ensure collegial and ethical relationships with the medical staff, the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of residents. A sufficient number of subject patients, modern equipment is provided and demonstrates accessibility to students, and employees who simultaneously act as teachers and curators (mentors) ensure high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational program, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during training.

During a visit to clinical sites, where experts conducted a survey of resources, their compliance with training programs, and accessibility for teachers and residents, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical health care. The experts received evidence of compliance with standard 6, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence of the quality of the programs, an interview was conducted with residents in the specialty. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, sufficient time for patient supervision, work in Damumed with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents in need, participation in the "Residents' Scientific

Club", and availability of resources of international databases of professional literature. In general, residents are satisfied with training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, as they believe that the educational organization has good resources, image and international connections, at the same time, residents would like more independence in patient management, holding international events.

Residents showed their commitment to the educational organization, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgments on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in research, and financing. The experts studied the documents of residents (portfolio, results of resident assessment-checklists, and results of the resident survey).

### **6.3 Information Technology**

The hospital has its own website, information and communication technologies and electronic media: Group-Wise – Mail server; Novell IManager – Account server; Mail CRC – File server (for file exchange); Documentlog – Electronic document management system; KavServer – Antivirus program server; MIS – Medical information system; Printserver – Print server (there are large printers that are in some departments; WSUS – Server for updating the Windows system.

Students have access to international databases through Agreements with the Astana Medical University (AMU) and Nazarbayev University (NU). But according to residents, they wanted there to be a library at the place of study. Currently, students have the opportunity to use electronic resources in the computer lab, which has 7 stationary computers.

### **6.4 Interaction with colleagues**

Inter-professional and team cooperation in the clinic is organized through the daily participation of residents in rounds, daily planning meetings and analysis of seriously ill patients, and the resident urologist Tasbulatov A. is a member of KILI.

Students have free access to patients at clinical sites and all the conditions for improving their practical skills - 70% of teachers completely agree with this, 25% partially agree, 0% found it difficult to answer.

### **6.5 Formalized types training**

The hospital provides an opportunity for resident doctors to actively participate in national and international scientific events aimed at improving the quality of CPD. Residents can participate in Republican International Conferences at the expense of organizing training. This year, residents participated in the International Confederation of Young Scientists in Shymkent, as well as in the International Forum of Young Scientists. In 2023, two residents participated in International Conferences in South Korea and Spain.

In the near future, residents plan to participate in the International Competition of Young Scientists, with the topic "The Role of MRI in the Detection of Benign Breast Tumours".

### **6.6 Medical Scientific Research and Achievements**

The MCH strives to involve students in medical research in various fields. The MCH has the only laboratory of personalized genomic diagnostics in the Republic of Kazakhstan, where whole-exome sequencing of human DNA with bioinformatics search is carried out. Residents have full access to the laboratory for scientific research. There is a scientific club for students, the president of which is a 2nd year resident - Yer Khanova Zh. There are 50 residents in this club. Yer Khanova Zhansaya is a co-executor of the grant project: "Study of cryptogenic insulin in patients with atrial defibrillation." Two residents of the "Radiology" program are co-executors of the project: "The role of PET and CT in diagnostics in children." Through the discipline of evidence-based medicine, residents are trained in the skills of searching in international databases. Residents also publish in the journal "Bulletin of the MCH." For the purpose of international cooperation, at the expense of the MCH, 2 residents are studying in South Korea, at the Medical Centre "Asan".

An interview with 31 full-time teachers showed that there are both successes and problems in education management, depending on a specific base (a sufficient number of subject patients, time for maintaining medical records, independent work).

## **6.7 Expertise in the field of education**

The expertise is carried out in the form of an analysis of the needs for specialists, an analysis of resident training methods, an assessment of learning outcomes, and a discussion of these indicators allows us to draw conclusions about the quality of innovative changes in postgraduate education. For example, a weak link in the field of training in the EP is the assessment of educational achievements of both residents and students. In this regard, the department of professional training organized a seminar for teachers on the topic: "Methods for assessing the knowledge and skills of students, reliability, validity and fairness of assessment methods at the postgraduate level", certificates were presented to the experts.

The mechanisms for motivating and developing the interest of employees and teachers in conducting research in the field of postgraduate education are prescribed in the Order of 01.12.2022 "On the implementation of a system of motivating employees for the development of scientific and innovative activities."

## **6.8 Training in other institutions**

The hospital actively cooperates with other educational organizations. Memorandums and cooperation agreements have been concluded with: AEO "Nazarbayev University" (agreement No. 748-2022 / 33-25 dated 16.08.2022); NJSC "Astana Medical University" (agreement No. 5.2.2-D152 dated 05.04.2022); NJSC "Semey Medical University" (agreement No. 130 dated 31.11.2020); RSE on the REM "NSCTO named after Academician N.D. Batpenov" (agreement No. 2 dated 10.02.2022); NJSC "Karaganda Medical University" (agreement No. 338 dated 01.11.2021); NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after. M. Ospanov" (agreement No. 180 dated 14.06.2022); MSE on the REM "Nuclear Medicine and Oncology Centre" of the Abay Regional Healthcare Department and NJSC "Semey Medical University" (memorandum dated 07.02.2023).

Cooperation with practical healthcare organizations inside and outside the country is constantly improving in the field of advanced training, internships, as well as seminars and trainings for medical specialists in the field of healthcare and pharmaceuticals. For the purpose of international cooperation, at the expense of the MCH, 2 residents are studying in South Korea, at the Medical Center "Asan".

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Comply out of 25 standards: fully - 25.

## **Standard 7: EVALUATION OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES**

### **7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms**

At the Hospital, the evaluation of the EP is carried out in accordance with the regulation on the Academic Policy of the Hospital. The procedure for evaluating the quality of the educational program is reviewed collectively at a meeting of the Scientific and Clinical Council / Academic Council.

The system for monitoring and evaluating the educational program begins with collecting information, developing and approving the educational program, organizing the educational process, achieving the final outcomes of training residents, assessing them by employers, approving the catalogue of elective disciplines (CED), analysing feedback data from all participants in the educational process by means of a questionnaire after each discipline. Based on the results of this data, the educational program is adjusted.

Based on the results of the questionnaire for students, the following disciplines were included in the training program for ENT specialists and surgeons: "Emergency Conditions in Otolaryngology" and "Emergency Conditions in Surgery".

During interviews with employers, there were recommendations to include communication skills topics and work with electronic portals in the training program for residents.

The form of participation of the teaching staff in making management decisions is also their participation in meetings of the Scientific and Clinical Council and the Academic Council.

### **7.2 Feedback**

The Hospital has a trust box "For letters and requests to the Director of the MCH PAA RK" for collecting feedback, where students can leave their suggestions, wishes and complaints incognito. An



important role in the evaluation of the EP is played by monitoring the achievement of the final learning goals by students.

The Hospital systematically collects information twice a school year after the completion of each educational process in the form of a questionnaire, written and oral survey.

In 2023, 38 advanced training courses were conducted on 26 topics; 139 forms of non-formal education on 60 topics. Analysis of the results obtained during the survey revealed the following. *According to the survey results, 99% of respondents noted the importance of the training topic (in 2022 - 98%). Almost all students noted the richness and novelty of the program, the use of simulation technologies, and the professionalism of the course teachers.*

Recently, during the implementation of the EP, based on the results of the Hospital feedback survey, the students have been provided with new classrooms, their social conditions have improved (they are provided with individual lockers for changing clothes, new office equipment), and they take part in various master classes and seminars in their areas of expertise with the participation of foreign specialists.

Recently, during the implementation of the EP, based on the results of the Hospital feedback survey, the students have been provided with new classrooms, their social conditions have improved (they are provided with individual lockers for changing clothes, new office equipment), and they take part in various master classes and seminars in their areas of expertise with the participation of foreign specialists.

### **7.3 Stakeholder Involvement**

The residency and additional, non-formal education EPs are regularly assessed and revised with the involvement of stakeholders. The collected information is analysed, and the EP is brought into line with modern requirements, recommendations, requests, and wishes of students, teachers/mentors, and stakeholders.

Interviews with 7 employers were conducted offline and online and included questions such as: knowledge of the university mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in training residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, 100% employment of residency graduates, etc.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Comply out of 17 standards: fully - 17.

## **Standard 8: MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION**

### **8.1 Documentation and needs for education planning**

In order to implement the residency program, the Hospital is guided by the LSI of the Republic of Kazakhstan and approved internal documents of the Hospital, starting from the stage of admission of resident doctors and until completion of training. While forming the contingent of students, the personnel and logistical capabilities of the Hospital are taken into account.

The management system of the residency program and additional training is carried out on the basis of the Hospital Charter, Structure, and Regulations on departments and job descriptions. [https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1tBj-IugelQdojpZ7agZDlhRymBtEpsPJ?usp=drive\\_link](https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1tBj-IugelQdojpZ7agZDlhRymBtEpsPJ?usp=drive_link).

The transparency of the management and decision-making system is ensured by the minutes of the meetings of the advisory bodies with subsequent communication to all employees of the Hospital.

The main activities to ensure the quality of the residency programs are reflected in the work plans of the Department, the Academic Council, and the work plans of the supervising departments. The order of the Director of the Hospital approves the heads of the educational program responsible for its implementation.

The structure of the MCH is annually reviewed in July of each year.

The body that manages the Hospital is the Medical Centre of the President's Affairs

Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan (MC PAA RK).

The Head of the Hospital is its Director, acting on the principles of one-man management and independently resolving all issues of activity in accordance with his competence, determined by the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Charter of the Hospital.

The order of the Director of the Hospital approves the final certification committee, which includes the chairman, members from among the scientific and pedagogical staff and a representative of the organization for assessment and the secretary. The number of the committee is an odd number. Based on the results of academic performance, the rating of resident doctors, the final certification and the questionnaire of resident doctors, the EP is assessed and improved (amendments and additions are made).

The evidences and certificates issued by the Hospital to students upon completion of training in advanced training cycles, internships and master classes are taken into account by the National Centre for Independent Examination, when students pass qualification exams for a specialist certificate.

While planning additional education courses, it is necessary to provide for the development of certification courses, in accordance with the LSI and the functioning of the internal quality assurance system. In the future, it is also planned to issue electronic license certificates for completion of additional educational programs through the E-licensing platform.

## **8.2 Academic Leadership**

The mission of the Department of Professional Education is to implement educational programs of additional and non-formal education and residency programs in the field of healthcare, continuous professional development of employees of the Hospital's structural divisions in order to improve professional training, knowledge and interpersonal skills. The main goal of the Department is to ensure the development of educational activities at the Hospital and the continuous professional development of the Hospital's employees.

Information on the educational services provided is freely available on the Hospital's website in the "Education" Section <https://bmcudp.kz/ru/education/>.

The activities of the Department are aimed at improving systems and processes, and not at disciplinary (punitive) punishment of the person responsible for an error or incident. The academic excellence of the MCH is the availability of courses on photodynamic therapy, the only one in the Republic of Kazakhstan, a pathological anatomy department, modern high-tech video broadcasting from operating rooms to conference rooms, as well as the only laboratory in the Republic of Kazakhstan for personalized genomic diagnostics, where whole-exome sequencing of human DNA with bioinformatics search is performed.

To the question in the questionnaire "Do the organization's managers listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research, clinical work?", 45% of teachers answered that they do so systematically, 25% answered "sometimes", 0% "rarely", 0% "never".

## **8.3 Distribution of the budget and resources for education**

In the 2022-2023 academic year, from September to July, 7,073,973 tenge was spent on salaries of teachers and mentors; in the 2023-2024 academic year, from September to March, 8,026,792 tenge was spent, and civil-law contracts were concluded with mentors of external clinical bases in the amount of 3,362,696 tenge.

In 2023, 50,681,381 tenge was paid for the salaries of the Hospital's teachers providing paid educational services to third-party organizations, and 2,679,957 tenge for 2022.

The funds received from the provision of educational services are used to reimburse the costs of teaching activities to teachers / mentors in the amount of 40% of the total funds received from the provision of paid educational services. Over the past 5 years, the Hospital has been continuously allocating funds for the purchase of computer equipment, medical equipment, and the AIS "Platonus" has been purchased and implemented to automate the educational process. The Department of Professional Training has a classroom for resident doctors equipped with 6 new computers with Internet access, electronic databases, educational periodicals, and an electronic library.

Resident doctors are provided with personal protective equipment, surgical suits, and a room

with individual changing rooms.

#### **8.4 Administration**

The Hospital has an administrative staff in its structure, which includes a block for strategic development, science, and education.

Effective interaction between each individual specialist of the structural unit and the organizers of training ensures effective planning of educational events.

In order to effectively manage the educational process, the Hospital has an Academic Council, approved by the order of the Director of the Hospital No. 676 dated September 19, 2023, which is the main advisory and consultative body on issues of educational, methodological and organizational support for the educational process.

To monitor the activities of the professional training department, an annual survey of this unit is conducted.

According to the results of the survey, 85% of respondents out of 31 Academic staff are completely satisfied with the work of the postgraduate education department.

During interviews with Academic staff, residents and students, they noted the responsiveness and constant assistance of the education department in matters related to the educational process.

#### **8.5 Requirements and regulations**

In educational activities, the Hospital complies with national legislation and is guided by LSI of the Republic of Kazakhstan. All regulatory documents, such as Academic Policy, educational programs, working curricula, etc., compiled on the basis of the current State Compulsory Educational Standard of Training, as well as Orders and Resolutions of the Ministry of Health and the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The department of professional training is responsible for compliance with the relevant regulatory requirements. During the visit to the organization, we were presented with the Academic Policy of the educational organization, syllabuses for individual disciplines (Radiology and Cardiac Surgery), WC, as well as a catalogue of elective disciplines.

While developing and implementing educational programs, the requirements of practical healthcare are taken into account, for this purpose, the Academic Council includes representatives of practical healthcare, teachers involved in the implementation of programs, both residency and additional and non-formal education.

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.*** Compliant out of 16 standards: fully - 14, partially - 2, do not comply - 0

#### ***Recommendations for improvement, identified during the external visit:***

1) To consider the possibility of developing and implementing certification courses in clinical areas in the educational process.

2) To provide for an education specialist in the quality management department and conduct training for the education department employees on the current version of the QMS.

#### **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

The Hospital development strategy for 2022-2026 was agreed upon with the head of the Medical Centre of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan and approved by the Director of the Hospital on March 14, 2022.

One of the areas of development of the Hospital is the development of innovative and scientific-educational activities. The hospital regularly works to update the EP in accordance with modern trends, as well as the needs of both the domestic and foreign markets in the field of education. The adjustment process has its own principles and methodology, which is fully controlled with the participation of the Academic Staff of the Hospital.

Over the past 5 years, the number of educational services provided for residency and additional, as well as non-formal education has increased, which in turn increases the expertise and pedagogical

skills of the Academic staff, since regular practice in teaching occurs. Despite this, it is necessary to develop a mechanism for detecting and eliminating documented deficiencies in its activities.

Every year, a Roadmap is drawn up for the implementation of the Development Concept for subordinate organizations of the Medical Centre of the President's Affairs Administration of the Republic of Kazakhstan, one of which is the Hospital. The Department is responsible for the transfer of educational services to practical healthcare in the Republic of Kazakhstan, for improving the level of training of medical personnel of the Hospital.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Of the 6 standards, 5 comply fully, 1 partially, 0 do not comply.

**Recommendations for improvement:**

1) To develop a mechanism for detecting, documenting and eliminating deficiencies in educational activities

Thus, during the external institutional evaluation, 101/63 accreditation standards were found to comply, including 101 basic standards and 63 improvement standards. 6 basic standards and 2 improvement standards were partially met. No non-compliance with the standards was found. Compliance with the improvement standards indicates that the educational organization complies with the international consensus of institutional accreditation.

**4. Recommendations for improvement of institutional activities of the MCH PAA RK:**

- 1) To include the results of scientific and technical programs (STP) conducted at the MCH PAA RK in additional education programs (short-term cycles, advanced training programs) (2.2.1).
- 2) To develop a "Regulation on the assessment of students", including different approaches and methods of assessment based on evidence-based practice (3.1.1).
- 3) While developing additional education programs, to take into account the opinions and recommendations of students to improve the content of educational programs, approaches to training (4.3.2).
- 4) To prepare and develop mechanisms for integrating education and practice / clinic to improve educational programs, conduct research in educational expertise; expand partnerships in educational activities (5.1.3).
- 5) To introduce assessment of learning outcomes using innovative technologies (5.2.4).
- 6) To consider the possibility of developing and introducing certification courses in clinical areas into the educational process (8.1.2).
- 7) To provide for an education specialist in the quality management department and conduct training for the education department staff on the current version of the QMS (8.2.1).
- 8) To develop a mechanism for detecting, documenting and eliminating deficiencies in educational activities (9.2).

## 6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC established the compliance of the institutional activities of the organization of postgraduate and additional education (continuous professional development) of the RSE "Medical Centre Hospital of the President's Affairs Administration" on the Right of Economic Management with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend that the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this institutional activity for a period of 5 years.

	Full name	Signature
Chairman	Yermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna	
International Expert	Uryasev Oleg Mikhailovich	
Academic Expert	Kasanova Saule Laikovna	
Academic Expert	Yesenkulova Saule Askerovna	
Academic Expert	Smailova Altynay Nagyzkhanovna	
Academic Expert	Salimbaeva Damilya Nurgazievna	
Employer Expert	Zhukubaeva Almira Asetkyzy	
Student Expert	Nurgaliev Arslan Ardakovich	

**Профиль качества и критерии внешней институциональной оценки  
БМЦ УДПР РК (обобщение)**

Standard	Критерии оценки	Количество стандартов	Оценка			
			Базовые стандарты/ Стандарты улучшения	Полностью соответствует	Частично соответствует	Не соответствует
1.	<b>МИССИЯ И КОНЕЧНЫЕ РЕЗУЛЬТАТЫ</b>	14	6/8	6/8	-	-
2.	<b>ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНЫЕ ПРОГРАММЫ</b>	33	23/10	22/10	1/0	-
3.	<b>ОЦЕНКА КОМПЕТЕНЦИЙ И ДОКУМЕНТАЦИЯ</b>	15	12/3	11/3	1/0	-
4.	<b>ОБУЧАЮЩИЕСЯ И СЛУШАТЕЛИ</b>	31	21/10	21/9	0/1	-
5.	<b>ОБЕСПЕЧЕНИЕ ПОСЛЕДИПЛОМНОГО И ДОПОЛНИТЕЛЬНОГО ОБРАЗОВАНИЯ</b>	15	9/6	8/5	1/1	-
6.	<b>ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНЫЕ РЕСУРСЫ</b>	25	14/11	14/11	-	-
7.	<b>ОЦЕНКА ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНЫХ ПРОГРАММ</b>	17	9/8	9/8	-	-
8.	<b>УПРАВЛЕНИЕ И АДМИНИСТРИРОВАНИЕ</b>	16	10/6	8/6	2/0	-
9.	<b>НЕПРЕРЫВНОЕ УЛУЧШЕНИЕ</b>	6	3/3	2/3	1/0	-
	<b>Итого:</b>	<b>172</b>	<b>107/65</b>	<b>101/63</b>	<b>6/2</b>	<b>-</b>
				<b>172</b>		

**Список документов, изученных членами ВЭК в рамках проведения внешней оценки институциональной деятельности организации последипломного и дополнительного образования (непрерывного и профессионального развития) организации образования РГП «Больница медицинского центра Управления делами Президента Республики Казахстан» на ПХВ**

<b>№</b>	<b>Наименования документов</b>	<b>Количество</b>
1.	Стратегический план развития Больницы на 2022-2026 г.г., от 14.03.2022г.	1
2.	Устав организации, Приказ № 821 от 28.12.2022г.	1
3.	Организационная структура, от 17.03.2023г.	1
4.	Правила приема в резидентуру БМЦ УДП РК, Приказ № 820, от 27.10.2023г.	1
5.	Положение о резидентуре, Приказ № 820 от 27.10.2023г.	1
6.	Алгоритм организации послевузовского образования в резидентуре на базе БМЦ УДП РК, Приказ 261 от 17.08.2022г.	1
7.	Положение об отделе Профессионального образования, Приказ № 606 от 29.08.2023г.	1
8.	Академическая политика Больницы, Протокол №1 от 31.03.2021г.	1
9.	Положение об Академическом совете, Приказ №676 от 19.09.2023г.	1
10.	Правила управления человеческими ресурсами, Приказ № 817 от 27.10.2023г.	1
11.	Кодекс чести преподавателя/наставника и Кодекс чести врача-резидента, Приказ № 250 от 18.07.2019г.	1
12.	Методические рекомендации по разработке учебно-методической документации при реализации программ дополнительного и неформального образования, от 02.06.2022г.	1
13.	Положение о внутренней системе оценки качества образовательных программ дополнительного и неформального образования и резидентуры, реализуемых в РГП «БМЦ РК» на ПХВ, от 28.02.2024г.	1
14.	Правила об оплате труда, премирование и об оказании материальной помощи, Приказ № 65 от 01.02.2023г.	1
15.	Правила об оказании платных услуг и порядок использования средств, полученных от оказания платных образовательных услуг в БМЦ УДП РК, Приказ № 207 от 12.07.2022г.	1
16.	Правила управления инцидентами и коммуникациями с пациентами, Приказ №397 от 19.11.2020г.	1
17.	О внедрение системы мотивации сотрудников на развитие научной и инновационной деятельности, Приказ №462 от 01.12.2022г	1
18.	Заключение о признании РГП «БМЦ УДП РК» на ПХВ научным центром в области здравоохранения. Протокол РГП на ПХВ «Национальный научный центр развития здравоохранения имени Салидат Каирбековой», Приказ №323 от 21.06.2022г.	1
19.	Положение Совета молодых ученых РГП «БМЦ УДП РК» на ПХВ, от 29.01.2024г.	1
20.	О выполнении научных исследований, Приказ №404 от 03.11.2022г.	1
21.	Акт внедрения новой технологии (инновации) №12 РГП «БМЦ УДП РК» на ПХВ, наименование технологии «Внедрение протокола УЗИ исследования крупных суставов в динамике (до и после протезирования)»	1
22.	Акт внедрения новой технологии (инновации) №11 РГП «БМЦ УДП РК» на ПХВ, наименование технологии «Ультрасонография нервов в диагностике	1

заболеваний периферической нервной системы»	
---	--

ECAQA