

To the Accreditation Council of the  
Eurasian Center for Accreditation and  
Quality Assurance in Education and  
Healthcare  
May 8, 2023

**REPORT  
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION  
RESULTS OF AN INSTITUTIONAL EVALUATION OF HIGHER MEDICAL  
COLLEGE "INTERDENT" LLP FOR COMPLIANCE WITH MEDICAL  
COLLEGE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS**

**external expert evaluation period: March 14-16, 2023**

**Almaty, 2023**

## CONTENT

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1	Representation of Higher Medical College "Interdent" LLP	4
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	6
2.3	Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the report on institutional self-assessment of HMC "Interdent" for compliance with the Standards of Institutional Accreditation of Medical Colleges and conclusions	6
3.	Description of external expert assessment and conclusion	7
4.	Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of HMC "Interdent"	10
5.	Recommendations for institutional improvement of HMC "Interdent"	42
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	43
	Annex 1. Institutional quality profile and external evaluation criteria of HMC "Interdent" LLP	44
	Annex 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	45
	Annex 3. Organization visit program	

## LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

<b>Abbreviation</b>	<b>Designation</b>
HMC "Interdent"	Higher Medical College "Interdent"
TVE	Technical and Vocational Education
State Compulsory Educational Standard of the MoH of the RK	State compulsory education standard of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
ST RK	Standards of the Republic of Kazakhstan
DS&HR of the MoH of the RK	Department of Science and Human Resources of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MO	Medical organizations
ECC	Educational and clinical center
QMS	Quality Management System
EP	Educational program
PC	Pedagogical Council
MC	Methodological Council
PW	practical work
EW	educational work
AW	academic work
WC	Working curriculum
TC	Typical curriculum
CMC	Cyclic methodological commission
ShAPE	School of Advanced Pedagogical Excellence
YTSh	Young teacher school
EMCD	Educational and methodological complex of the discipline
WCD	Working curriculum document
CS	Course schedule
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
SRWS	Scientific research work of students
DER	Digital educational resources
ICT	Information and communication technology
ABSN	Applied Bachelors of Science in Nursing
IEP	Individual education plan
PI	Professional internship
NCIE	National Center for Independent Examinations
NCCT	National comprehensive computer testing
YAC	Youth Affairs Committee
mass media	Mass media
ECAQA	Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare
IAAR	Independent agency for accreditation and rating

## 1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 03 dated February 22, 2023, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as EEC) was formed to conduct an institutional external evaluation of HMC “Interdent” LLP in the period 14.03 - 16.03, consisting of the following composition:

No.	Status as part of the EEC	Full name	Regalia, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	Chairman	AMANZHLOVA TATYANA KADYROVNA	Deputy Director for Practical Training of the National Educational Institution “Kazakh-Russian Higher Medical College”
2	Foreign expert	TUKHTASINOVA DILOROM SAFOEVNA	Director of the Center for the Development of Medical Education, excellent student of healthcare of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Uzbekistan
3	Kazakh academic expert	KUMAROVA ALTYNAY BALTABAEVNA	Deputy Director for Educational Work MSE on the REM "Taldykorgan Higher Medical College”
4	Kazakh academic expert	NURGALIEVA GULMIRA TURSUNGALIEVNA	Deputy Director for Academic Affairs of the MSE on the REM “State Higher Medical College named after D. Kalmataev” of the Department of Health of the Abay Region.
5	Kazakh academic expert	ALIBAEVA GULSIM NURMAGANBETOVNA	Head of the Department of Applied Bachelor's Degree of the MSE on the REM “Higher Medical College” Almaty department of health.
6	Kazakh academic expert	MAYSATOV SANZHAR MAYSATOVICH	Deputy Director for Scientific and Methodological Work of the Private Institution “Karaganda Higher Medical Intercollege”.
7	Employers' representative	DAULETOVA KAMAR SAMALBEKOVNA	Chief nurse of the Republican State Enterprise at the REM "Republican Scientific and Practical Center for Mental Health" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
8	Student Representative	BAYANBAEVA ARUZHAN BAKYTZHANOVNA	3rd year student majoring in “Nursing” at the “Republican Higher Medical College” LLP

Observer from ECAQA is Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, head of the accreditation and monitoring department.

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC (Order of the ECAQA General Director No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of HMC “Interdent” LLP for compliance with the Standards of Institutional Accreditation of Medical Colleges (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards) and conclusions, recommendations of the EEC for ensuring the institutional quality of the main activities and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

## 2. General part of the final report

### 2.1 Presentation of the Higher Medical College “Interdent”

Name of the organization date of creation	LLP Higher Medical College "Interdent" Date of creation - 1998.
Legal form of ownership, BIN	Form of ownership: non-state BIN 990740001681
Location and contact details	The Republic of Kazakhstan, Almaty, Bogenbay Batyr St., 149 tel: 267-58-88, 87072675855 e-mail: info@interdent.kz website: interdent.kz
Total area	2956 sq. m, including educational - 1770 sq.m
Availability of a supervisory board/board of trustees	None
Management body	Founder
Full name of the first manager	Tokbergenova Gulmira Telmanovna
State license for educational activities (date, number)	No. KZ69LAA00018359 dated June 11, 2020
Information about branches, subsidiaries (if any)	None
Total number of <b>educational programs</b> for the last five years (the current year is taken into account)	1998 – Republican Clinical Center “Dentistry”: two educational programs “Orthopedic Dentistry” and “Nursing”. 2007 – LLP Medical College “Interdent”, three educational programs (EP): “Orthopedic Dentistry”, “Pharmacy”, “Nursing”. 2010 – 4 EP: “General Medicine”, “Orthopedic Dentistry”, “Pharmacy”, “Nursing”. 2019 – Higher Medical College “Interdent” LLP. Technical and vocational education programs (TVE) – 4: “General Medicine”, “Midwifery”, “Pharmacy”, “Nursing”. Postsecondary education programs (PSE) - “Applied Bachelor of Nursing.”
Total number of <b>educational programs</b> in the current year	TVE programs: “General Medicine” with duration of training of 2 years and 10 months. “Midwifery” with a training duration of 2 years and 10 months; “Nursing”, duration of training is 2 years. 10 months, 3 years. 10 months; "Pharmacy" duration of training is 2 years. 10 months. Post-secondary education programs “Applied Bachelor of Nursing” with duration of study of 1.6 years, 3.6 years.
Total <b>number of graduates</b> since the beginning of educational activities	TVE students -3979 Students of PSE -183
<b>Student population</b> in the current academic year	TVE students -1143 PSE students -562
Quality indicators in TVET	The number of expulsions over a period of 5 years is 96, including 28 people for poor academic performance.  Employment rate, %: 2019 -80%

	2020 -72% 2021 -79% 2022 -77%
Qualitative indicators in PSO	The number of expulsions over a period of 5 years is 15, including 3 people for poor academic performance.  Employment rate, % over 5 years: 2018 - 2019 - 2020 - 2021 - 2022 – 100%
Year of commencement of the implementation of <b>additional and non-formal</b> education programs, total number of programs and number of students trained	Additional and non-formal education is not provided.
Availability of a <b>simulation</b> room/department/center	Name – “Educational and Clinical Center” Area - 359 sq. m. Number of phantoms/mannequins –567
Availability of an office/ <b>testing</b> center	Computer class (3 classrooms) Area 148 sq.m. Number of seats – 30 Number of computers – 30 Availability of a proctoring system - yes
Full-time teachers/part-time teachers, incl. % sedate	The total number of teachers is 93, including full-time teachers - 77, part-time teachers - 16.  Sedateness,% - 26% Categorization (medical),% - 17.4% Categorization (pedagogical),% - 29.5%
Number of scientific projects over 5 years	In just 5 years –88 This year -18
Number of republican/ international agreements on joint activities for 5 years	Republican treaties –0 International treaties - 2
Number of clinical and industrial bases for training and practice of students	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Clinical bases, total - 21, including clinics - 17, clinics - 2, private medical centers - 2.</li> <li>➤ Bases for dental practice - 0</li> <li>➤ Bases for pharmaceutical practice, total - 5, including factories - 0, pharmacies - 4.</li> </ul>
Website Instagram Facebook with active pages	<a href="https://interdent.kz/">https://interdent.kz/</a> medcollege.interdent <a href="https://www.facebook.com/medicalcol.interdent?mibextid=ZbWKwL">https://www.facebook.com/medicalcol.interdent?</a> mibextid=ZbWKwL

## 2.2 Information about previous accreditation

In March 2018, Higher Medical College “Inetrdent” LLP passed institutional and specialized accreditation of educational programs “General Medicine”, “Nursing”, “Pharmacy” according to the

Accreditation Standards of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (IAAR). Institutional and specialized accreditation is valid until March 2023.

### **2.3 Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the report on institutional self-assessment of Higher Medical College “Interdent” LLP for compliance with the Standards of institutional accreditation of medical colleges and conclusions**

The institutional self-assessment report (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 118 pages of main text, 47 pages of appendices, copies or electronic versions of 47 documents.

The report is characterized by completeness of answers to all 9 main Accreditation Standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for conducting institutional self-assessment of medical educational organizations, which were provided to the college by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a covering letter signed by the director of the college, Gulmira Telmanovna Tokbergenova, Candidate of Medical Sciences, which confirms the accuracy of the quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 32 members of the internal self-assessment commission, indicating the responsibilities of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the institutional self-assessment of the college - Aigul Serikpaevna Alibaeva, deputy director for academic affairs.

Self-assessment of the educational activities of the college was carried out on the basis of the order of the head No. 8 of October 13, 2022 “On the creation of a working group to conduct institutional self-assessment and write a report.”

The report was reviewed by an accreditation expert: Tatyana Kadyrovna Amanzholova, and the reviews noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes, which were taken into account during the feedback process with a representative of the educational organization and appropriate changes and additions were made to the self-assessment report.

All Standards contain the actual practice of HMC “Interdent” in training students in 5 educational programs over the previous 5 years. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated in terms of the number of students, listeners, teachers, administration, information about selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of assessment of knowledge and skills. Included is information about our own material and technical base with a total area of 2596 m<sup>2</sup>, as well as third-party clinical bases (26 in total), contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc.

Thus, in the process of feedback with the college representative and experts, answers to the questions that arose were received and appropriate changes and additions were made to the self-assessment report based on the reviewers’ recommendations.

All Standards contain reasoned data, examples of the implementation of educational programs, national and international events, educational and methodological support, and a resource base, confirming compliance with the requirements of the Standards of institutional accreditation.

The main indicators of the institutional quality of the college are the following\*:

- 1) Improving the material base of the organization of education
- 2) Development of human resources potential of the college
- 3) Expanding the relationship with practical healthcare
- 4) Further development of international cooperation

The report is presented to the ECAQA in complete form, with data adjusted according to the above recommendations, written in competent language, the wording for each Standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the Standards, tables and figures (diagrams, photographs) contain links in the text and are continuously numbered.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure - external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the

information from the report with the information that will be received during the visit to the educational organization, i.e. carrying out verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

### 3. Description of external peer review

External expert work as part of the institutional assessment of the college was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting external assessments of ECAQA educational organizations and in accordance with the program approved on February 17, 2017. General Director of ECAQA Sarsenbaeva S.S. agreed with Gulmira Telmanovna Tokbergenova, director of the college. Dates of visit to the organization: 03.14 - 03.16.2023.

External evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of the Accreditation Standards.

The sequence of the visit over 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Program (hereinafter referred to as the program), which is located in the documentation of the accreditation center and in **Annex 3** to this report. The program is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of external peer review.

To obtain objective information, members of the EEC used the following methods and their results:

- interviews with management and administrative employees – 21 people in total;
- interviews with students – 114 people in total;
- studying the interdent/kz website;
- interviewing 21 employees, 38 teachers;
- survey of teachers and students – 58 and 200, respectively;
- observation of student training: attending 17 practical classes in the specialty “General Medicine” with qualifications “Paramedic”, “Obstetrician”:

1) Discipline: “Surgical diseases”, Group: 302/2, Topic “Cardiopulmonary resuscitation”,  
Teacher: Abdesh B.T.

2) Discipline: “Internal Diseases”, Group 302/1, Topic “Diabetes Mellitus”  
Teacher Shukir A.A.

3) Discipline “Pediatrics”, Group 301/2, Topic “Prevention of rickets”  
Teacher: Bektasov K.B.

4) Discipline “Pediatrics”, Group 301/1, Topic “Respiratory diseases”  
Teacher Eskarina A.E..

Specialty “Nursing” qualification “General Practice Nurse”:

1) Discipline: “Nursing in gynecology and obstetrics”, Group 308 group,  
Topic: “Pre-eclampsia in pregnant women”, Teacher Aydinov R.B.

2) Discipline: “Gerontology in Nursing”, Group 309/1 p/gr.  
Topic: “Psychological abnormalities in the elderly. Alzheimer's disease”  
Teacher Usen A.K.

Specialty "Nursing" qualification "Applied Bachelor of Science in Nursing":

1) Discipline: “Nursing care during acute diseases”, Group: 120  
Theme “Fractures. Splint installation”, Teacher Amangeldiev A.

2) Discipline “Specialized nursing care”, Group 314 top  
Topic “Help with skin care features”, Teacher Adak G.A.

3) Discipline: “Nursing care at home”, Group 215 group  
Topic: “Nursing process in case of dysfunction of the urinary system of the body”, Teacher

Orekhova E.F.

Specialty "Pharmacy" qualification "Pharmacist":

Discipline: Pharmaceutics, Group 212

Topic: “Liquid dosage forms”, Teacher Adilova K.Zh.



2) Discipline: General pathology, Group 201/1 p/gr. Topic “Allergic reaction”, Teacher Toishybek B.B.

3) Discipline: Anatomy, Group 118/1 p/gr, Topic “Kan. Erythrocyte, leukocyte, platelet”, Teacher Asanova S.M.

4) Discipline: Pharmacology, Group 312/1 p/gr., Topic “Vitamines”  
Teacher Kalzhan A.B.

CMC "General educational and socio-economic disciplines":

1) Disciplines: Foreign language, Group 100

Topic: “History of timekeeping devices. Present and Past Perfect.

History of devices for changing time. Present and past tense”

Teacher Alikberova N.A.

2) Discipline: Kazakh literature, Group 102, Life of Kadir Mirza (mixed lesson), Teacher Ilyasova U.A.

3) Discipline: Biology, Group: 114,

Topic: “The ratio of the surface area of the erythrocyte label to the volume. Target members.”, teacher: Zhuman A.A.

4) Discipline: Biology, Group 109

Topic: “Absorption and reabsorption. Urine formation. Amount of water consumed. Artificial purification of blood and other fluids in the body. The principle of dialysis.” Teacher Kamieva A.M.

- review of resources in the context of implementation of Accreditation Standards: 9 practice/clinical engagement sites visited, including:

1. MSE on the REM “Center for Perinatology and Pediatric Cardiac Surgery” of the Almaty Healthcare Institution

(chief nurse Amireeva A.A.) - training in the EP “Obstetrics”, “General Medicine”.

2. Cardiology Center of Almaty (chief nurse – Shukurgalieva Z.A.) – training in EP – “Nursing”, “Applied Bachelor of Science in Nursing”.

3. MSE on the REM “City Maternity Hospital No. 1” of the Almaty City Health Department (chief midwife Zhamanbaeva S.S.) - training in the EP “Midwifery”.

4. LLP ENT-Center "Ai-Medicus" (chief nurse Tungushbaeva A.M.) - training in EP - "Nursing", "Applied Bachelor of Science in Nursing".

5. MSE on the REM at the Children's City Clinical Hospital No. 2 (chief nurse Kuatbekova S.B.) - training in EP - “General Medicine”, “Nursing”, “Applied Bachelor of Science in Nursing”.

6. MSE on the REM at the “Emergency Medical Service”, substation No. 1, Almaty municipal health center (chief physician Makhranov A.K.) - training in the EP “General Medicine”.

7. “Sadykhan Social Pharmacy” LLP (Deputy Director Bolterik Zh.S.) – training in EP – “Pharmacy”.

8. JSC "Scientific Center of Pediatrics and Children's Surgery" Almaty (head sister Turdalieva A.T.) - training in EP - "General Medicine", "Nursing".

9. City clinic for WWII veterans in Almaty (head nurse Khalykova G.A.) - training in EP – “General Medicine”, “Nursing”, “Applied Bachelor of Science in Nursing” where training is conducted in the 5th educational program with the participation of 45 full-time teachers/part-time teachers;

- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 47 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents studied is in Annex 2).

The team of the accredited college ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the visit program and according to the lists of interview sites (Table 1).

**Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with members of the EEC**

<b>№</b>	<b>Full name</b>	<b>Job title</b>
1	Tokbergenova Gulmira Telmanovna	college principal
2	Alibaeva Aigul Serikpaevna	deputy Director of Academic work
3	Kaukeev Kairat Kaldybaevich	deputy director of practical work
4	Abykhanova Zhanar Samidenovna	deputy director of educational work
5	Uali Arailym Gabitkyzy	Methodist
6	Urazalieva Elmira Akhmetovna	head of the Department of General Medicine
7	Reimbaeva Botakoz Mahmutkyzy	Head of the departments “Nursing”, “Pharmacy”, “Midwifery”
8	Ergalieva Erke Nurdauletkyzy	Head of the Department of Applied Bachelor of Science in Nursing
9	Raimbekova Erkezhan Kabdollaevna	head of the library
10	Bolatbek Zhanat Bolatbekkyzy	Head of Academics
11	Kenesova Ainisa Khasymkhanovna	QMS manager
12	Nametkul Dilshat Seitkazymkyzy	human resources department inspector
13	Bekbatyrova Gulmira Tulegenovna	Head of the CMC “Special Disciplines of GM”, head of the educational and clinical center
14	Rakhmetzhanova Guldariga Moldakhmetovna	Head of the CMC "General professional and pharmaceutical disciplines"
15	Usen Aida Kairatovna	Head of the CMC "Special Disciplines of Nursing and Applied Bachelor's Degree"
16	Kamieva Aigerim Muratovna	Head of the CMC “General Education and Social and Economic Disciplines”
17	Kalken Ayganym Zhumakadyrkyzy	teacher-psychologist
18	Sabirov Amanzhan Alimzhanuly	technician - programmer
19	Talasbekova Gaukhar Askarovna	Chief Accountant
20	Rakhimbaeva Akmaral Kamalgazyevna	nurse
21	Akhishev Ruslan Idiriskhanovich	head of economic department

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held based on the results of the external evaluation. Members of the EEC began drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the results of the external assessment are made. The experts individually completed the “Institutional Quality Profile and the criteria for external evaluation of HMC “Interdent” for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.” No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improvement for the organization of education were discussed and the chairman T.K. Amanzholova held a final open vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, and access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the team and the prompt provision of information to members of the EEC.

When conducting a survey of students, 69% rated the work of the External Expert Commission on Accreditation as positive, 15% as satisfactory. The majority of respondents (69%) believe that it is necessary to accredit educational organizations or educational programs.

According to 87.9% of teachers, the survey conducted by ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving key areas of activity of an accredited educational organization.

At the end of the visit, the chairman of the EEC announced recommendations based on the results of the external assessment as part of institutional accreditation to the management and employees of the educational organization.

#### **4. Analysis of compliance with the Standards of institutional accreditation based on the results of an external evaluation of HMC “Interdent”**

##### **Standard 1: MISSION AND RESULTS**

###### **Proof of compliance:**

###### **1.1 Mission definition**

The mission has been formulated and the final training results of TVE and PSE programs have been determined, taking into account the proposals of stakeholders such as employers and students.

Reviewed the organization's strategic plan for a period of 5 years, including such areas as:

1. Development of organizational, educational, methodological and educational work of the college;
2. Improving practical training using elements of dual training and integration with practical healthcare;
3. Improving the work of the college based on modern methods of managing the organization and conducting analyzes by management;
4. Strengthening the human resources potential of the college;
5. Improving innovative technologies for teaching and monitoring knowledge using technical means;
6. Continuous improvement of the quality of material, technical and information support.

The strategic development program confirms the implementation of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization.

From interviews with students, it was established that before the start of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, and tell where to get the necessary information about the educational program, teachers, and training bases.

At the same time, when talking with students and employers, experts, we did not receive a clear answer to the question “Do you participate in formulating the mission and goals of the organization or educational program?” The students did not give a specific answer to this question, and employers responded as follows: when developing the mission and strategic goals, their wishes were taken into account, aimed at improving the practical training of future specialists.

To verify **Standard 1** a meeting was held with the head of the organization, director of HMC “Interdent” LLP, Tokbergenova G.T. The director of the college reported to the members of the EEC the strategy, mission and vision of the educational organization, prospects for its development, and also presented the qualitative and quantitative characteristics of accredited educational programs, demonstrated information about social work, employment of graduates, admission of applicants, composition of teachers and college resources.

Questions were asked to the director of the college about expanding MTB, social support for students, and expanding international cooperation.

Director Tokbergenova G.T. Comprehensive answers to the questions posed were given. The college has a fairly stable financial position. Due to the increase in the number of students in the current academic year (2021-2022 - 1707 students, 2022-2023 - 1768 people), the college begins construction of a new 6-story academic building. A building design has been developed, all permits for construction have been received, and a contractor has been identified. Funding is provided by the Damu Foundation. Start of construction: May 2023. When asked about social support for students, the head of the college reported to members of the EEC that 43 students from socially vulnerable sections of society receive a discount of 10-50%. 5 students receive personal scholarships from the founder of the college (Tazhimurat N - 205gr specialty "General Medicine", Akylzhanov R - 302gr specialty "General Medicine", Bakyt A - 309gr specialty "Nursing", Karzhaubay K - 307gr specialty

"Midwifery", Nuradinova U - 216gr 20 students in the 202 specialty "Applied Bachelor of Nursing") also 20 students in 2021-2022 were provided with hot meals, in 2022-2023 2 students receive social rations in the form of a food set.

When asked about international cooperation, the director said that the college actively cooperates with the International Educational Holding "Gaudeamus Education" LLP, Orenburg State Medical University, Saratov State Medical University named after V.I. Razumovsky, Siberian State Medical University, with which Memorandums of Cooperation were concluded.

Director Tokbergenova G.T. answered to all questions comprehensively; the vision and key activities for implementing the college development strategy and educational programs announced, taking into account the needs of practical healthcare and how these tasks are integrated with educational activities to train specialists for the region.

During the implementation of program activities, namely, based on the results of interviews with the director, members of the Pedagogical Council, in interviews with students and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **Standard 1**. was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the college, took part in the formation of proposals for formulating the mission, and the mission brought to the attention of potential students through the website, social networks, and information letters to medical organizations.

When conducting a survey of 200 students (on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>), out of 22 questions, a number of questions were devoted to the quality of the educational process and educational program. It was found that 60.5% of students would recommend studying at this educational organization to their acquaintances, friends, and relatives. And 60.5% of respondents believe that educational program leaders and teachers are aware of students' problems related to learning. To the question "Do you think this educational organization allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?", 70.5% of students answered positively, 6.5% were not sure about this, 17% could not yet answer this question and 3.5% would like to believe this.

## **1.2 Final learning outcomes**

The expected final results of training in educational programs at HMC "Interdent" correspond to the level of the European Qualification Framework, professional Standards and the requirements of the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan for medical and pharmaceutical Standards.

The final results are aimed at creating a highly qualified and competent specialist. As a result of mastering educational programs, graduates develop basic and professional competencies that are realized through knowledge, skills and abilities.

College graduates can perform all types of professional activities provided for by educational programs. This fact was confirmed when members of the EEC conducted interviews with employers and college graduates, who confirmed that the knowledge acquired within the college was sufficient for their independent work. Employers expressed their readiness and preference for hiring specialists who graduated from this college.

The evaluation of the final learning results is carried out based on the results of clinical, industrial, professional practices, and also based on the results of the Final state attestation, conducted by the National Center for Independent Examination. According to the results of the final certification of students in the 2021-2022 year, the average score for the college was 86.8%, in the 2022-2023 academic year 84%. The college also guarantees that during the learning process, students develop patriotism, citizenship, morality, the principles of professional ethics and deontology, reflected in the "Student Code of Ethics" (approved at a meeting of the Pedagogical Council, protocol No. 1 of 08/31/2022).

In the educational organization there are units that are directly related to the educational process, which can be noted as the best practice in education, namely, interaction with the practical healthcare sector. This conclusion was made because the college has concluded 26 agreements with clinical sites

in Almaty. Mentors and mentors - representatives of medical organizations - are involved in clinical practice. The college demonstrates high employment results for college graduates. The high level of specialist training and their demand in the labor market were confirmed by 28 college graduates who took part in interviews with members of the EEC. Many college graduates reported that the knowledge gained was sufficient for independent work in medical organizations.

The results of the documentation review demonstrate that the mission, vision and strategic development goals are consistent with all areas of the college's activities. The expected final results of training in educational programs contribute to the formation of established basic competencies and are aimed at creating a highly qualified and competent specialist, and the educational process is built in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standard and Laws and Statutory Instruments (LSI).

The surveyed teachers responded that 65.5% were completely satisfied with the level of previous (school) training of students; 31.03% were partially satisfied.

Experts have established a clear continuity between the end results of students' prior learning and college education, and subsequent continuing professional development programs.

82.7% of teacher respondents believe that students of this educational organization have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training program, and 13.8% partially agree with this.

No shortcomings in the implementation of this section of accreditation by EEC members have been identified

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Complies with 8 basic Standards: fully -8.

**Standard 1: done**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: no**

## **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS**

### **Proof of compliance:**

#### **2.1 Model of educational programs**

At HMC "Interdent", specialists are trained in 4 educational programs and 5 qualifications:

1. 09120100 "General Medicine", qualification 4S09120101 "Paramedic"
2. 09130200 "Midwifery", qualification 4S09130201 "Obstetrician"
3. 09130100 "Nursing", qualification 4S09130103 "General practice nurse"; qualification 5AB09130101 "Applied Bachelor of Nursing"
4. 09160100 "Pharmacy", qualification 4S09160101 "Pharmacist".

The implementation of educational programs is carried out in accordance with the mission of the college, determined by the purpose, objectives of the programs and the final results of training. The organization of the educational process is carried out in accordance with regulations in the field of technical and vocational education and healthcare on the basis of State Compulsory Educational Standard -2020; State Compulsory Educational Standard - 2021

The content of educational programs is built in accordance with the standard curricula of all specialties. Educational and program documentation (working curricula and programs) are developed in accordance with the requirements of the State Educational Standards 2021, 2022 and correspond to the goals and contents of educational programs to achieve the expected learning outcomes.

Documentation on educational programs developed at HMC "Interdent" includes TC, work curricula, educational process schedules, class schedules, technical technical support, and practice programs.

Working curricula for all specialties are reviewed at meetings of the methodological council and approved by the director of the college.

Each educational program has final learning outcomes. Integration with practical training is presented in the form of various types of practices at clinical sites; the formation and improvement of practical skills is carried out through simulation training.

Along with this, educational programs include educational components aimed at instilling national values, the formation of patriotism and citizenship, and the development of diverse interests and abilities of students.

Teachers at the Interdent Higher Medical College use modern teaching and learning methods that instill in students responsibility for their learning process and arouse interest in their future profession. Teachers are fluent and use in practice the role-playing method, preclinical simulation training, the method of critical thinking, problem-situational training, methods of enhancing cognitive activity, student-oriented methods, the design method, information methods using audiovisual, computer technology, multimedia technologies, Case technology stage. The content of educational programs is aimed at stimulating, training and supporting students in developing competence using elements of innovative teaching technologies TBL, CBL, PBL.

To implement educational programs in the specialties “General Medicine”, “Midwifery”, “Nursing”, “Applied Bachelor of Nursing”, “Pharmacist”, the organization’s documents contain EMCD, which defines the goal, takes into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work. Compliance with state standards and standard requirements has been established. By attending practical classes (17 classes), experts received convincing evidence that training is carried out according to plan, before the start of classes, students answer tests, receive feedback from the teacher, and have the opportunity to improve their skills and abilities. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational program, since the experts studied the code of ethics and during the interviews; students responded that they were informed about the contents of this document.

An analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in the advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the EMCD bibliography and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom.

The college has a mentoring system for both beginning teachers and students. For young teachers, mentors are experienced, creative teachers. In accordance with mentoring plans, all teachers attend the Young Teacher School, where they study modern teaching methods and knowledge assessment criteria. For students, group curators, leading teachers and a college psychologist act as mentors, who carry out work on adaptation of students of the new intake and introduce them to the internal rules. At clinical bases, production and professional practice is carried out under the guidance of mentors, whose activities contribute to the acquisition of practical skills and the mastery of professional competencies.

Independent learning of students is represented by research work, search and research activities, presentations, abstract reports.

The procedure for informing students about their rights and responsibilities is reflected in the Handbook - a guide that introduces students to the features of the college, describes the procedure for organizing the educational process, intermediate and final control of knowledge, and also contains information about the rights and responsibilities of students, and facilitates the work of curators in guiding students during the adaptation period and planning the learning process.

This indicates compliance with Standard 2 in terms of adapting teaching to the needs of students.

*The qualification obtained as a result of mastering the TVE educational program corresponds to the 4th level and the applied bachelor's program corresponds to the 5th level of the national*

*qualification framework in medical education and, therefore, the Qualifications Framework in the European Higher Education Area. (ESG 1.2)*

In order to improve quality and maintain academic integrity, there is an anti-plagiarism system that is reflected in the College's Academic Policy.

## **2.2 Structure, content and duration of educational programs**

The structure of the educational program determines the disciplines and types of educational work of students, united in the following cycles of disciplines: general humanities disciplines, socio-economic disciplines, general professional disciplines, special disciplines, industrial training, professional practice, intermediate certification, final certification, electives, consultations, elective classes.

Planning and organization of educational activities in college are carried out on the basis of working curriculums (WC), which is developed on the basis of State Compulsory Educational Standard for technical and vocational education, post-secondary education. Reducing the volume of disciplines is not allowed. Training sessions are conducted according to the schedule of the educational process and the schedule of training sessions. The maximum volume of students' academic workload, including all types of classroom and extracurricular educational work, does not exceed 54 hours per week. The total time budget for theoretical training is determined based on a mandatory teaching load of at least 36 hours per week.

Along with the inclusion of compulsory components in the educational program, elective components and electives are included. These components are included due to the relevance and needs of society and healthcare.

Work curricula are developed in all disciplines with a focus on learning outcomes and are approved by the head of the college. The sequence of study and integration of the academic discipline, the distribution of study time for each of them by courses and semesters is carried out taking into account interdisciplinary connections.

Simulation training is carried out in preclinical training rooms in the educational and clinical center of the college under the guidance of teachers of special disciplines.

Practical training includes:

- 1) industrial (clinical) practice;
- 2) professional (pre-graduate) internship.

The implementation of the educational program is ensured by the presence of a classroom fund, specialized rooms and laboratories, simulation equipment, a library fund of educational literature and teaching aids, including electronic textbooks, audio and video materials, methodological visual aids and recommendations on disciplines, clinical practices, diplomas projects using innovative and information computer technologies.

The educational program, according to the State Educational Standard, includes, along with compulsory disciplines, elective disciplines. The college has developed and approved a catalog of elective disciplines and electives by specialty. When compiling a catalog of elective disciplines in the "Interdent" HMC, the needs of representatives of practical healthcare and students are not taken into account and are not sufficiently replenished with new courses, which must be taken into account when developing a catalog of elective disciplines.

The content of industrial (clinical) and professional (pre-diploma) internships, including training in the conditions of an educational and clinical center, meets the requirements of State Compulsory Educational Standards, WC, practical training programs, and qualification requirements.

The content of the practice corresponds to the competencies of future specialists, reflecting the requirements of professional Standards. Pre-clinical training in practical skills is carried out in classrooms and in the educational and clinical center of the college.

The timing and content of industrial (clinical) and professional (pre-graduate) internships are determined by the WCD and the WC.

The organization and conduct of professional practice at the college is carried out in accordance with the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. KR DSM-304/2020 dated December 21, 2020. “On approval of regulations on a clinical base, a clinic of an educational organization in the field of healthcare, a university hospital, a residency base, an integrated academic medical center and the requirements for them.”

The list of basic medical organizations is approved by agreements between the college and the Moscow Region and includes 26 medical organizations in Almaty. Practical training is carried out in accordance with the educational process schedule.

By attending a practical lesson on the topic “Diabetes Mellitus”, volume 6 hours, the experts received convincing evidence that the training is carried out according to plan, before the start of the lesson, students answer tests, receive feedback from the teacher, and have the opportunity to improve their skills in diagnosing and assisting patients with diabetes mellitus. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational program, since the experts studied the code of ethics; during the interview, students responded that they were informed about the contents of this document.

When attending a practical lesson on the topic “CPR. Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation”, a 6-hour session and a conversation with students, the experts saw that the organization promotes the development of practical competencies of college graduates, including on simulation equipment. During the lesson, students practice CPR skills to the point of automaticity on existing dummies and phantoms. At the same time, students form and deepen their theoretical knowledge and develop communication skills.

An analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in the advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the EMCD bibliography and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom.

### **2.3 Scientific method**

HMC "Interdent" promotes the involvement of students in conducting and participating in research projects. One of the forms of scientific research is the writing of diploma (course) papers for bachelors of nursing. Bachelor's degree work is carried out through research in the field of nursing.

In the 2021-2022 academic year, 65 graduates of the qualification “Applied Bachelor of Nursing” (1.6 years) conducted scientific research in the field of nursing, which covered current issues of the healthcare system “Features of interaction between nurses and relatives of patients in the palliative care department”, “The role of the local nurse in immunization of the population and the prevention of infectious diseases”, “The role of the nurse in teaching patients during early recovery after an ischemic stroke”, “Nursing care for patients with endogenous psychoses at different stages of treatment”, “The role of the nurse in the prevention of nosocomial infection in the operating room under modern conditions”, etc.

For the purpose of personal self-realization, students take an active part in conferences at the city, regional and republican levels under the guidance of scientific supervisors from among experienced teachers. College students spoke at the regional Scientific and Practical Conference dedicated to the 25th anniversary of the Emily Medical Center in Almaty “Human capital as the most important factor in the quality of medical services”, at the Republican Scientific and Practical Conference dedicated to the 40th anniversary of the Almaty Higher Medical College “YOUTH AND SCIENCE: TODAY AND THE FUTURE”, where students took prizes and were awarded diplomas, and leaders were awarded letters of gratitude, and also took part in the Republican Scientific and Practical Educational Complex “Youth and Science: Today and the Future” in the 2021 academic year.



Research work of college students is also carried out through club work. The college has student clubs “Meirim”, “Aesculapius”, “Stimulus”.

When talking with students, experts learned that they use scientific evidence in their teaching and know the basics of evidence-based medicine. The teachers said that they teach applied undergraduate students methods of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data, and the application of scientific developments. This form of training is organized in the form of “round tables, analysis of literary sources on current topics, writing dissertations and course projects.

*When surveying students, it was found that the educational organization has access to student participation in research work and 62% of people were completely satisfied with this, 19% were partially satisfied, and 4.5% were dissatisfied.*

*Students should engage in research and development work, and in response to the questionnaire, 45.5% wrote that they are already engaged in research and development work, 11% are planning to start, 2% are looking for a research topic, 30% are not engaged.*

The research work of college students is carried out through club work. However, there is insufficient coverage of students with research work and club activities.

#### **2.4 Management of educational programs**

In a college, the academic leadership is responsible for the implementation of the educational process, which consists of various structural units that have certain powers to plan, review and implement educational programs.

In order to ensure the effectiveness of the educational process, the college has a Pedagogical Council, a Methodological Council, a directorate, cyclic methodological commissions (CMC), a council of curators, operating on the basis of approved annual plans. The activities planned in the plans of the above councils cover academic, practical, methodological, educational work, their implementation is confirmed by minutes of meetings and annual reports. The Pedagogical Council is the highest collegial advisory body of the college, coordinating issues of the educational process. The work of the pedagogical council is carried out in accordance with the regulations on the pedagogical council. Meetings of the Pedagogical Council are held openly, with the participation of teachers, college group supervisors, representatives of practical healthcare, students, and parents.

The work of the Methodological Council is regulated by the “Regulations on the Methodological Council”. At meetings of the Methodological Council, the pedagogical skills of teachers are analyzed to generalize their best experience, the educational and methodological equipment of disciplines is discussed, active, non-traditional forms of learning are promoted, and recommendations are developed for organizing innovative and research activities in college.

The educational part is a unit that carries out planning, monitoring and analysis of educational activities. At meetings led by the heads of departments and the Council of Curators, issues of academic performance, attendance and quality of knowledge for the month, semester, and academic year are considered.

The management of the departments is carried out by the heads of the departments, who, together with the group curators, interact with the deputy. Director for EW and the service of psychological support and correction on the participation of students of the department in various educational, competitive, scientific, public events, and social events.

The college has implemented a control and monitoring mechanism - intra-college control (ICC) - current issues are considered with the development of recommendations and memos for further improving the activities of the college.

The college management systematically analyzes the results of internal audits, competitions, and surveys to ensure that the Quality Policy is being implemented. To monitor and analyze the implementation of quality goals, an Intra-College Control Plan for the academic year is drawn up.

When developing educational programs, stakeholders did not make proposals or recommendations.

All educational programs are agreed upon with the heads of medical organizations that are the clinical bases of the college.

The content and structure of educational programs is determined by the requirements of the State Educational Standard. The educational and methodological department is responsible for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process.

The catalog of elective disciplines did not reflect the needs of the healthcare system. For the successful implementation of educational programs of the 4th and 5th levels, the organization has the resources to organize the assessment of students' practical skills (there is a teaching and clinical center equipped with modern clinical equipment).

*Teachers provide students with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, with which 65.5% are completely satisfied, 18.5% are partially satisfied, 4.5% are not satisfied.*

*To the question of the questionnaire "Is there enough time for practical training (supervision of patients, etc.)", 63% of students responded with complete agreement, 18% partially agreed, 5.5% disagreed. At the same time, 70% of students claim that after completing classes the teacher provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini-questionnaire, works on mistakes).*

Clinical training is provided in external multidisciplinary clinic settings, and staffs coordinate training at these clinics to ensure that students acquire adequate training in various aspects of their chosen health care field.

At the same time, to the question "Are student representatives involved in the development of educational programs?", experts received a positive answer. *The students surveyed are fully satisfied with the schedule of classes (63.5%).*

## **2.5 Relationship to practice and health system**

HMC "Interdent" provides an operational connection between educational programs and subsequent stages of professional training and practice.

An effective connection between educational programs and subsequent stages of professional training or practice, which the graduate will begin, is ensured by the mentoring institute.

To maintain operational connections with practical healthcare, the college carries out work in several areas: EIP, PI, monopactice; participation of the employer in the FAC commission; inviting employers to the Job Fair; participation in the commission at the professional competition "Best Graduate".

Depending on the specialty, students undergo practical training in medical or pharmaceutical organizations in Almaty and in the regions. The college has concluded agreements with 26 medical and pharmaceutical bases in Almaty city, Almaty region.

The college is implementing a dual education program. Dual education at the college was introduced on the basis of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 11, 2018 No. 455 "On amendments to the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 21, 2016 No. 50 "On approval of the Rules for the organization of dual education." The dual training bases of the Higher Medical College "Interdent" are 5 medical and preventive organizations in Almaty:

1. MSE on the REM "City Cardiology Center";
2. MSE on the REM "Children's City Hospital No. 2";
3. Center for Perinatology and Pediatric Cardiac Surgery;
4. Network of social pharmacies "Sadykhan";
5. Clinic "AMD".

Dual training is implemented through 3-party joint activity agreements. 58 students are participating in the project for introducing dual education, of which in the 2019-2020 academic year, 5 students of the specialty "Nursing", qualification "General Practitioner Nurse" completed the dual education program on the basis of the "AMD" clinic, from the 2020-2021 academic year and to this day, 11 students in the specialty "Nursing" with the qualification "General Nurse", 42 students in the specialty "Pharmacy" with the qualification "Pharmacist" are improving their practical skills at dual training bases..

However, members of the EEC noted that the college management needs to pay attention to the

development of dual training in the educational program "Applied Bachelor's Degree", since in the 2022-2023 academic year there was a large intake of applicants in this specialty, on the basis of TVE and in the training of specialists in this profile Representatives of many medical organizations are showing great interest.

Management of the educational process, reflected in the self-assessment report (Standard 2) and general approaches to management were confirmed during a visit to the educational department and conversations with the manager and employees. At the same time, verification of Standard 2 showed that the organization's documents contain work programs, teaching methods, where the goal is defined, the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work are taken into account. Compliance with state standards and standard requirements has been established. Experts received convincing evidence that training is carried out according to plan, before the start of classes, students answer tests and receive feedback from the teacher. The college has implemented a proper assessment policy to evaluate the academic achievements of students in a comprehensive manner.

The experts got acquainted with the work of the departments and interviewed the heads of the college departments on the issues of planning, reviewing, approving and implementing programs, program evaluation, and control and measurement tools for assessing the knowledge, skills and abilities of students, academic counseling and support for students, analysis of the effectiveness of training programs. The following people took part in the interview: Uali A.G. – methodologist; Urazalieva E.A. – head of the Department of General Medicine; Reimbaeva B.M., Asanbaeva S.K. – head of the departments “Nursing”, “Midwifery”, “Pharmacy”; Ergalieva E.N. – head of the Department of Applied Bachelor of Nursing; Talasbekova G.A. – head of a social group; Raimbekova E.K., Omarova A.A. – head of the library.

The experts also held a meeting with the **heads of the cycle methodological commissions**. The following chairmen of the Central Committee took part in the interview:

- Rakhmetzhanova G.M. – head of the CMC "General professional and pharmaceutical disciplines"
- Bekbatyrova G.T. – head of the CMC "Special disciplines of General Medicine"
- Kamieva A.M. – head of the CMC "General educational and socio-economic disciplines"
- Usen A.K. – head of the CMC "Special Disciplines of Nursing"

The functions and tasks of the CMC, their role in methodological work, research support for students, and interaction with other departments were discussed. The experts are familiar with the position of the CMC, the responsibilities of the chairmen of the CMC, how meetings are planned (work plan), and minutes of meetings are recorded. Questions were asked about approaches to reviewing and approving programs (external and internal review, feedback from employers), frequency of updating taking into account the needs of practical healthcare (annually).

During cross-interviews with heads of structural divisions and college teachers, it was established that educational programs in all specialties and qualifications were developed in accordance with the mission, goals and expected end results of the graduate model and reflect the professional Standards of technical and vocational, post-secondary education, as well as the needs of practical healthcare. The educational process in college is focused on the future practical activities of students.

The training of students in TVE and applied bachelor's programs is aimed at meeting the needs of practical healthcare, as there is a shortage of mid-level specialists in medical organizations in the city of Almaty. This organization, which actively trains specialists in the field of “Nursing”, provides a lot of opportunities and conditions for qualified training of specialists in this profile. Thus, during a conversation with the leadership of the organization, experts received information that in the 2022-2023 academic years, 380 students were enrolled in the applied bachelor's degree program in Nursing. The teachers confirmed that students are trained directly in the clinical departments of medical organizations in Almaty, which are the clinical bases of the college.

This is facilitated by the mentoring that is carried out in the organization.

Of the 200 students surveyed, 63% responded that teachers use active and interactive teaching methods in the classroom quite often, 28.5% believed that they rarely or sometimes. When visiting an

educational organization, experts did not identify any problems with the introduction of new teaching methods.

Interviews with 17 employers were conducted offline and included questions such as: knowledge of the college's mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of students, participation in student learning through supervision and/ or mentoring, providing students with the necessary resources for practical learning and clinical reasoning. The college demonstrates a fairly high rate of employment of graduates upon completion of training (2021-2022 -77%, 2020-2021 -79%, 2019-2020 - 72%).

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Comply with 14 Standards: fully -11, partially - 3.

**Standard 2: done**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1) To develop and annually update a catalog of elective disciplines based on a survey and analysis of the needs of employers and students.

2) To introduce dual training in accordance with the order of the MP of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 50 dated January 21, 2016 "On approval of the Rules for the organization of dual training" with amendments and additions in 2022, in the educational program "Nursing" the qualification "Applied Bachelor of Nursing".

3) To ensure the participation of certified mentors from among employees of clinical sites for on-the-job training and professional practice.

4) To increase the number of scientific student circles with the goal of covering at least 2/3 of college students with research work and developing skills in literature analysis, critical thinking, processing and publishing information.

### **Standard 3: STUDENT EVALUATION**

#### **Proof of compliance:**

#### **3.1 Evaluation methods**

Evaluation of students in college is carried out in accordance with the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated March 18, 2008 No. 125 "Model rules for ongoing monitoring of academic performance, intermediate and final certification of students."

Systematic control of knowledge is carried out in order to establish that students have mastered the state compulsory Standard. Evaluation is determined by the quality of students' assimilation of educational material - the level of mastery of knowledge, skills and abilities. Forms of knowledge control are accompanied by intermediate and final indicators. The forms of intermediate and final control of academic disciplines correspond to the State Compulsory Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the TC of academic disciplines. Forms of evaluation include: diagnostic, formative and summative. Methods for assessing students' knowledge and skills are carried out orally and in writing: surveys, written work, practical assignments, solutions to situational problems, independent and test work, testing, preparation of presentations, essays. When assigning a grade, the individual characteristics, attendance, and level of activity of students in class are taken into account.

The mechanism for assessing the achievement of the results of the educational program is monitored based on the log of theoretical classes and industrial training. Monthly monitoring of students' progress and attendance is carried out. Analyzes of academic performance and attendance by specialty and course are compiled by the heads of departments and heard at a meeting of the educational department. Missed classes by students are made up; for this purpose, teachers have detention days. Chairmen of the CMC and heads of departments monitor the timeliness of making up missed classes.

To assess the knowledge and practical skills of students, in accordance with the requirements of the State Compulsory Educational Standards 2020, 2022, a credit-point evaluation

system has been introduced. For the purpose of objective assessment of practical skills, checklists have been developed.

Determination of the level of professional preparedness of students is carried out in specialized rooms of preclinical practice, the Educational and Clinical Center. Certification of students during educational practices is carried out at each lesson. Teachers use various types and forms of control, oral questioning, solving test tasks, situational problems, and demonstrating practical skills. The OSCE (objective structured clinical examination) was introduced into the educational process, which made it possible to objectively evaluate the practical skills of students under conditions close to a realistic environment. Upon completion of industrial and professional internships, the professional competencies of students are assessed by the heads of internships at the Moscow Region bases, and then by college teachers.

Responsibility for the policy for assessing the knowledge and skills of students lies with all responsible persons at various stages of training (QMS specialist, heads of the QMS, heads of departments, academic department, deputy director for practical work, for academic work). For each examination session, the heads of departments draw up an examination schedule, which is brought to the attention of students, supervisors and teachers no later than a month before the start of the examinations (NCIE).

HMC "Interdent" demonstrates an effective continuous mechanism for internal quality assessment and examination of educational programs by monitoring the quality of student learning and various types of control over student training. The control analysis is carried out by a QMS specialist, who allows for the necessary corrective measures to be taken to improve the quality of educational programs and the quality of knowledge and skills.

Upon complete completion of the educational program, an end-of-course assessment is carried out. The end-of-course assessment of students in medical education programs is carried out in accordance with the "Rules for assessing the knowledge and skills of students in medical education programs." Preparation and evaluation of the knowledge and skills of graduates within the framework of the Final Attestation (FA) in medical colleges is carried out in the manner prescribed by the letter of the Director of the Department science and human resources of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 14-1-1-14/2787-I dated June 10, 2020 and the Instructive Letter of the National Center for Independent Examinations.

The final assessment of the knowledge and skills of medical college students is carried out by the NCIE. The system was developed according to the principles of objectivity and transparency and complies with international Information Security Standards.

Evaluation of the knowledge and skills of graduates within the framework of the FSA is carried out on the basis of the college in 2 stages. According to the schedule, stage 1 "Knowledge evaluation" is carried out by computer testing, consists of 100 test questions, testing time is 150 minutes with the participation of independent observers - NCIE specialists. Stage 2 "Evaluation of skills" is carried out using simulation technologies in accordance with the list of 5 clinical stations approved by the NCIE.

The results of passing the FSA in the 2020-2021 academic years are 86%, in 2021-2022 – 84%.

The college has developed an Appeal Regulation, according to which the student has the right to file a written appeal about a violation, in his opinion, of the established procedure for conducting intermediate and final certification. To consider appeals for the period of intermediate and end-of-course assessment, an appeal commission is created by order of the director.

The study of control and measurement tools by experts (500 tests, 150 tasks) showed that the college has implemented an appropriate assessment policy that allows for a comprehensive evaluation of students' educational achievements. During the interviews, students talked about forms of evaluation, for example, point-rating assessments, and that they were satisfied with the methods of assessing knowledge. They also receive regular feedback from teachers. The system of appealing assessment results is reflected in the document "Regulations on intermediate and end-of-course assessment" and during the period of operation of the educational organization there were no precedents for appeal.

Thus, to verify **Standard 3**, data, experts asked questions to the head of the methodological office,

Uali A.G. and checked documents and methods for assessing students. The organization has 20,000 test tasks, which were compiled for all disciplines studied and approved at meetings of the Central Committee and the Methodological Council (Minutes No. 1 of 08/31/22). Testing tools have been reviewed by experienced educators and employers. The head of the methodological office replied that additions and updates to the CIS are carried out annually.

During a visit to the organization and during an interview with employee A.Kh. Kenesova, a QMS specialist, the commission was convinced that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and employees, and includes documents such as annual operating plans, annual reports, regulations departments, agreements with teachers and students, and educational and methodological documentation (work programs, working curricula, syllabuses, journals), assessment tools (checklists, statements), evidence, certificates and certificates. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the documents necessary for students: the academic calendar, the schedule of the educational process, the academic schedule of classes, the schedule of intermediate certification and there is information about the history of the college, mission, license, accreditation, program plan - strategic development which is regularly updated. This information was obtained during an interview with A.A. Sabirov. – College system administrator.

### **3.2 Relationship between evaluation and learning**

The college ensures that feedback is provided to students based on the results of evaluations using questionnaires. *The results of the survey on the organization and conduct of current control and intermediate assessment: 90% of students are satisfied with the conduct of current and intermediate control.*

The results of the final state certification show the readiness of graduates to perform professional duties. At the FSA, graduates show consistently high results in theoretical and practical knowledge. Graduates are employed in medical organizations of the city, region, and other regions.

The results of student assessment are documented and recorded in theoretical and practical journals, grade sheets, intermediate certification sheets and grade books.

The organization evaluates the reliability and validity of assessment methods by analyzing the performance and quality of training and the results of intermediate and end-of-course assessment.

When conducting interviews with 38 teachers regarding evaluation methods, experts received convincing information that teachers use various methods of assessing knowledge such as oral questioning, assessment using computer technology, testing, laboratory and test work, essays, coursework, practice reports. Students also shared their opinions about the timeliness of providing tests, counseling before exams, the clarity of the entire assessment procedure and its fairness.

During the visit to the organization, management was asked the question: “Are external examiners involved in order to improve the fairness, quality and transparency of the evaluation process?” And the answer was received: during the Final Certification, representatives of the National Center for Independent Examination (NCIE) are involved in assessing students’ knowledge; after carrying out industrial and professional practice, evaluation of knowledge and mastery of practical skills is carried out by representatives of clinical bases.

The experts examined the resources for organizing the assessment of knowledge and practical skills, namely, a review of the educational and clinical center and test centers took place.

**The educational and clinical center** consists of 12 rooms. Head of the educational center Bekbatyrova G.T. demonstrated the resources of preclinical practice rooms for educational programs in the specialties “Nursing”, “General Medicine”, “Applied Bachelor of Nursing”.

Experts inspected simulation classes in the following disciplines: fundamentals of nursing, nursing in obstetrics and gynecology, nursing in surgery, nursing in pediatrics, nursing in therapy, “internal diseases”, “propaedeutics of internal diseases; material room. Included in the ECC World

Skills site. The training center is equipped with the necessary mannequins, 567 dummies and other equipment.

Experts received indisputable evidence of sufficient material and technical equipment in all classrooms for conducting practical classes and ensuring the educational process as a whole. According to the equipment report card, the classrooms are 95% equipped; the classrooms have the necessary equipment, visual aids, 10 interactive whiteboards, and 12 television panels.

When visiting the test center, system administrator A.A. Sabirov demonstrated a database of test tasks in various disciplines, and also said that the quality of tests is validated and the database of test tasks is updated taking into account changes in educational programs, as well as how tests are reviewed. The Test Center houses 25 computers. Distance learning is conducted on the Smart Nation platform and a demonstration of the college website was conducted.

The **19 employers**, surveyed answered questions such as: knowledge of the college's mission, participation in its development, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of students, participation in student training through mentoring and/or mentoring, providing the CMC and students with the necessary resources for practical training and development of clinical thinking. Employers said that they themselves participate in the assessment of students, in the acquisition of practical skills based on the results of vocational training and PI, in conducting current and intermediate certification. Representatives of employers unanimously spoke about the fairly high level and quality of student training at HMC "Interdent", and expressed agreement in the employment of college graduates in their medical institutions.

During the conversation, employers made several proposals to increase the number of hours on communication skills, professional ethics and deontology in educational programs.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria* correspond to 7 Standards: fully -7.

*Standard 3: done*

*Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: no.*

## **Standard 4: STUDENTS**

### **Proof of compliance:**

#### **4.1 Admission and selection policy**

Admission of students to HMC "Interdent" is carried out on the basis of the License for educational services dated March 30, 2018 No KZ79LAA00011389, according to the state order, determined by the Health Department of the Almaty Akimat.

The procedure for admission to training at HMC "Interdent" is carried out on the basis of the "Rules for admission to LLP "Interdent" Higher Medical College, developed in accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 28, 2012 No. 264 "On approval size of the admission quota for admission to study in educational organizations implementing educational programs of technical and vocational, post-secondary and higher education", Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 18, 2018 No. 578 "On approval of standard rules for admission to educational organizations implementing professional educational programs of technical and vocational education, post-secondary education", order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 14, 2015 No. 200 "On approval of Standards of public services provided in the field of technical and vocational education." The admission rules indicate the requirements for candidates and the list of required documents.

The college's admissions policy is based on the principles of openness and transparency.

In the college, to accept applications from individuals for training conduct entrance exams and enroll students, the director of the college creates an admissions committee, which operates from June 20 of each calendar year.

An applicant's admission to entrance examinations is a special exam (psychometric testing), which allows one to identify the students' professional suitability and ability for practical work in healthcare.

The admission plan for the educational program "Nursing" qualification "Applied Bachelor's Degree" from the republican budget is determined by the Department of Science and Human Resources of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The college received an educational order for the 2021-2022 academic years – 20 places, in the 2022-2023 academic years – 10 places. It is based on the Protocol of the Commission of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the placement of state educational orders from the local budget in the 2022-2023 academic years. 100 places are distributed: for the specialty "General Medicine" - 25 places in Kazakh training, for the specialty "Nursing" - 75 places (25 places in Russian language training, 50 places in Kazakh language training).

The college admissions committee is responsible for the selection and admission policy of students. Information about the college admission rules is available to future students and all interested parties on the college website <https://interdent.kz/>.

To conduct a high-quality selection, career guidance work is carried out among schoolchildren in the city, region and regions. Work on vocational guidance among applicants is carried out on the basis of the approved work plan of the admissions committee, as well as the annually approved Career Guidance Plan. As part of career guidance work, open days are held according to the schedule, where visual video materials are shown, an overview of the educational resources of the college, educational and clinical center, information booklets and printed materials about the college are distributed. In addition, career guidance work is carried out through social networks Instagram, WhatsApp, TikTok by daily updating information on the college website (social network data is linked to the site) with coverage of various student achievements and information about college events.

Despite the ongoing career guidance work at HMC "Interdent", there was no enrollment of applicants for the popular educational program "Midwifery", which must be taken into account to revise approaches to career guidance in college.

Materials on student admission and teacher selection were studied and compliance with **Standard 4** was established.

The organization has a policy for the admission of students, which is called the "Regulations on the Admissions Committee". A.A. Urazalieva spoke about the student admission policy. - executive secretary of the admissions committee. Approaches to student admission are based on country requirements and internal regulations for the period 2019-2022. 2042 students were accepted (2019-2020 academic year (191 students), 2020-2021 academic year (390 students), 2021-2022 academic year (503 students), 2022-2023 academic year (958 students), over the years of the college's existence, 15 graduates have been carried out and about 3,500 people have been trained. The results of the independent examination of college graduates 2018-2019 - 75%, 2019-2022 - 85.8%, 2020-2021 - 86, 3%, 2021-2022 – 86.85%.

A balance is ensured between the existing potential of the educational organization and the opportunities for training and recruitment of students. When selecting students, the average score of the certificate and the results of psychometric testing are taken into account. Thus, experts validated the data according to **Standard 4**. In general, all criteria are met.

Regarding the practice of academic counseling, personal support for students and the development of not only professional skills, experts interviewed Abykhanov Zh.S. – Deputy Director for HR, Kalken A.Zh. – teacher-psychologist, Alpysova S.M. – advisor of the volunteer movement "Ashik Zhurek".

The conversation was conducted on issues of educational and social work with students, support and counseling of students on personal issues; formation and development of communication skills, leadership; Events; projects; volunteer movement; feedback from students. Based on the results of the interview, it was established that the college has developed a system of academic support for students through counseling on preparation for classes and exams. Students of HMC "Interdent" LLP are provided with social support; children from large families in the amount of 10-50% are given a student discount in accordance with the Regulations "On Social Support for Students" (43 students were



provided in the 2022-2023 academic year). Sponsorship for the provision of social support is provided by the founder of the organization through the annual allocation of personal scholarships to students.

Students are included in such advisory bodies as the Pedagogical Council, the Student Council (a member of the Pedagogical Council is a 3rd year student of the specialty “General Medicine” Kerimzhan Bekzhan.

#### **4.2 Recruitment of students**

HMC "Interdent" controls the number of students recruited in accordance with the material and technical capabilities, educational potential of the teaching staff: there is a sufficient classroom fund, rooms for practical and laboratory classes, a library fund, and an information and computer base. The college has concluded agreements with 26 municipalities of the city, region and southern region.

Admission of applicants is carried out without infringing on the rights of citizens based on nationality, age, gender, religion, or language.

The number of admitted students in accordance with the material and technical capabilities of the college, as well as taking into account the national needs for human resources in health care in recent years (2019-2023) has been increased by 80%, and this is broken down by year for the 2019-2020 academic year. (191 students) / 2020-2021 academic year (390 students) – by 51%, 2020-2021 academic year. (390 students) / 2021-2022 academic year (503 students) - by 22.5%, 2021-2022 academic year. (503 students) / 2022-2023 academic year (958 students) – by 47.5%. Due to a significant increase in the number of students in the current academic year and an increase in the load on the material and technical base of the college, the college management is starting to build a new 6-story educational building.

#### **4.3 Counseling and support for students**

HMC "Interdent" operates a system of academic counseling for students. The functions of an academic mentor are performed by group curators and heads of departments. Students are provided with a Guidebook, which contains: mission, vision, information about the schedule of the educational process, data on the college administration, operating hours of structural units, rules and regulations, the student's code of ethics, and also become familiar with the “Rules of the internal educational routine.” Some questions regarding the educational process are posted on the website.

HMC "Interdent" uses all the main directions, forms and methods of organizing social and financial support accepted at the college.

In working with the contingent, a special place is played by the work of the social group, which conducts its activities in accordance with the Regulations on the social group. To determine the social and economic status of a college student's family, at the beginning of the academic year, curators fill out an auxiliary document such as a social passport for children from among orphans, children without parental care, the disabled, children from low-income families, large families, which reflects information about their social status with providing various categories of benefits.

In relation to socially vulnerable categories of students, the college has a comprehensive social policy that makes it possible to implement important social tasks. Every year, the college's social group considers discounts for different categories of students (large families, low-income people, orphans, disabled children). In the 2022-2023 academic years, 43 students from low-income families were given a discount on tuition in the amount of 10% to 50%; in the 2021-2022 academic years, 20 students received free hot meals.

From 2020 In order to stimulate research and educational activities of students, promote the formation of intellectual potential, and support talented and active students, the college has developed an incentive system in the form of a personal scholarship. When summing up the results of the educational process, the most active students and excellent students are awarded a personal scholarship named after the founder of the college, Myrzabekov M.O., and are awarded with diplomas, letters of gratitude, and valuable gifts. In the 2022-2023 academic years. personalized scholarships were awarded: “General Medicine” - Tazhimurat N., Akylzhanov R., “Nursing” - Bakyt A., “Midwifery” - Karzhaubay K., “Applied Bachelor of Science in Nursing” - Nuradinova U.

Work to promote the employment of graduates at HMC "Interdent" is carried out with the aim of providing information and other support to graduates on employment and employment issues. In this regard, the college annually holds "Job Fairs", and since 2017, the Alumni Council has been functioning.

The Council includes graduates of different years and specialties who work in medical organizations of the city, region and republic, occupy leadership positions, and this is Seil M. is a nurse at the Military Clinical Hospital of the MO of the Republic of Kazakhstan in Almaty; Zhanibek A. is a senior nurse of the department of anesthesiology and intensive care of the National Scientific Center for Surgery named after A.N.Syzganova, Almaty; Orynbasar M. is a senior paramedic of substation No. 7 of the MSE on the REM "Medical emergency service" in Almaty; Tlevaldiev F. is a manager of the medical service of the military unit of the National Guard of Semey, etc.

When communicating with graduates through thematic meetings, email correspondence, and telephone conversations, vacancies are identified in various medical organizations for the employment of graduates.

Graduates from different years are invited to participate in professional competitions as judges. At meetings with students, they share their employment experience, problems of working in medical organizations, and discuss with teachers issues of developing skills that need more attention.

#### **4.4. Student representation**

Students of HMC "Interdent" are members of the Student Council, which is an advisory body where the participation of students is the main priority in considering current issues of organizing the educational process.

The Student Council is a link between the administration and students of the college, which in the course of its activities expresses interests, supports student initiatives, solves social and legal problems of youth, assists in organizing an effective educational process, and creates a unified information space for students. The student council has the right to make proposals and wishes to the college administration to improve the educational process, and to attend the pedagogical council. The president of the student government, Kerimzhan Bagzhan, is a member of the Pedagogical Council, representing the interests of the student body.

To intensify the work of youth self-government and develop their leadership abilities, the college has a Youth Affairs Committee (YAC), which was created to ensure the realization of students' rights to participate in managing the educational process, solving issues related to the life of students, and developing their social activity.

The college provides conditions for the development of creative and sports achievements: clubs, sports sections, a canteen, a first-aid post, an assembly hall, a reading room, a library, and there is also a psychological support service for students.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Comply with 14 Standards: fully - 13, partially - 1.

**Standard 4: done**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1) To reconsider approaches to conducting career guidance work in order to attract students to the specialty "Midwifery".

### **Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF/TEACHERS**

#### **Proof of compliance:**

##### **5.1 Selection and recruitment policy**

The college has determined and implemented a policy for the selection and admission of employees in accordance with the Strategic Development Program of HMC "Interdent" for 2021-2025.

In accordance with the standard indicators established by the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" and Government Decree dated January 30, 2008. No. 77 "On approval of the Model Staff of employees of state educational organizations and the list of positions of teaching staff and persons equivalent to them", the staff of teaching staff of HMC "Interdent" is determined annually.

Hiring, promotion, incentives, dismissals, familiarization of personnel with rights and responsibilities are carried out by the inspector of the college's human resources department. The conditions for hiring and dismissing employees are regulated by the Labor Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as the employment contract.

A Personnel Policy has been developed and is successfully functioning, the purpose of which is the effective management and development of the college's human resources, maintaining the number and quantity of employees at an optimal level, their professional and social development. Analysis of the quantitative and qualitative composition of teaching staff, control and evaluation of teaching activities are the objects of constant attention from the college management. In the 2022-2023 academic year the educational process is carried out by 93 teachers (77 full-time teachers, 16 part-time teachers from practical healthcare). Share of full-time teachers from the total number for the 2022-2023 academic year is 82.8%, the share of teachers of special disciplines is 59%.

The number of teachers with an academic master's degree is 17 people. Qualification category of teachers at various levels: highest - 2, first category - 8, second category - 20, teacher-moderator - 2, teacher-expert - 1, teachers without category - 26.

The educational process is conducted in the state Kazakh and Russian languages. There are no restrictions when hiring based on gender, race, nationality, or language.

In order to improve the quality of teachers, it is planned to train masters from among full-time teachers, improve the qualifications of teachers in educational centers of the country, and send them for internships.

In order to verify the data of Standard 5, external experts obtained the opinion of teachers on personnel policy, which includes a democratic approach in relation to teachers and staff of the college, includes an analysis of the quantitative and qualitative teaching staff, regular monitoring and evaluation of teaching activities. During the conversation with Namenkul D.S., inspector of human resources departments, she included such questions as: the policy for selecting teachers, what is the staffing level, attracting employees from clinical sites to teach, which allowed the experts to learn about the strategy and tactics of teachers, the information security of educational programs, and also determine problems in human resource management and development. Experts received information about the involvement of 16 employees of clinical sites in teaching activities as part-time workers.

When surveying teachers, it was found that the majority (86.2%) were completely satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace in this educational organization, but 12.02% were partially satisfied. In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research work - 81.03% completely agree, 13.8% partially agree. Satisfied with the work of the HR (personnel) service - 82.8% completely agree, 17.2% partially agree. Satisfied with wages - 70.7% completely agree, 12.1% partially agree.

## **5.2 Staff and Faculty Development Policy**

The College provides faculty members with equal opportunities for continuing professional development in their careers that are consistent with and further the mission and educational outcomes.

Teachers are regularly awarded based on the results and achievements in educational, methodological, professional activities, including badges for 2 employees, medals for 9 people.

From 2018 to 2023 15 teachers were awarded a diploma "For their contribution to the development of healthcare."

To provide comprehensive assistance to young teachers, the college operates a "School of Young Teachers", which attracted 19 teachers in 2020-2021. In order to develop skills in educational work, obtain and systematize knowledge in the field of pedagogy, the methodological office has developed a program (within the framework of the Young Teacher School) containing theoretical and practical material on pedagogy, psychology, teaching and upbringing methods.

To provide comprehensive assistance to young teachers, the college operates a "School of Young Teachers", which attracted 19 teachers in 2020-2021. In order to develop skills in educational work, obtain and systematize knowledge in the field of pedagogy, the methodological office has

developed a program (within the framework of the Young Teacher School) containing theoretical and practical material on pedagogy, psychology, teaching and upbringing methods.

In order to provide pedagogical and methodological support during the period of professional adaptation to new professional conditions, each beginning teacher and young specialist are assigned mentors from among experienced teachers. Mentors analyze the work of their mentees, assess their potential, assist in the selection of teaching material, visual aids, types of control, and provide assistance in preparing and filling out documentation.

Advanced training with the participation of foreign specialists from 2017 to 2020 51 (40%) teachers passed.

The college has a flexible system of incentives and bonuses for teachers, in accordance with the collective agreement of the college.

Employees who have achieved success in their professional activities are rewarded with thanks, certificates of honor, bonuses, and valuable gifts.

Thus, experts have established that "Interdent" HMC has defined and implemented a policy for the recruitment and development of employees, which includes training and professional development of teachers, development of the competencies of teachers as teachers, support and evaluation of the activities of teachers, including newly hired ones, and as well as teachers attracted from healthcare organizations. The development policy includes support and evaluation of the activities of teachers, including newly hired ones, as well as teachers attracted from health care organizations.

At the same time, taking into account the annually growing student population (in 2019 - 633 students, in 2022 - 1768 students), the number of full-time teachers in 2022 was 77 people (compared to 2019 - 72 people), experts noted the need improving the college's activities in providing teaching staff.

Involving representatives of practical healthcare in 2022 (16 people) in teaching work does not "fill" the current needs for staffing the educational process.

It was 72 people, and in 2022 - 77, which does not fully satisfy the needs of educational programs, and the involvement of representatives of practical healthcare (in 2022 -16) as teachers and/or mentors does not "close" all current issues of educational methodological work and expectations of the college educational process.

In order to verify Standard 5 data, during a meeting with the head of the HR department and during interviews with teachers, experts received an opinion on approaches to developing the pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation for working with students, implementation of mentoring, which includes training and professional development of teachers, development of the competencies of teachers as teachers, support and evaluation of the activities of teachers, including newly hired teachers, as well as teachers attracted from healthcare organizations. Experts received answers about the teacher training program, which is conducted annually, and 40 teachers involved in the implementation of educational programs were trained in 2022. These events are funded by the college.

Experts have found that teachers initiate research topics for students, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation

There is an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies in the organization - 86.2% of surveyed teachers responded, and 12.07% partially agreed with this. Studied in professional development programs - 48.3% less than 1 year ago, 24.1% within a given year, 3.4% more than 3 years ago, 0% more than 5 years ago and 5.2% responded "I don't remember when it was."

The organization implements social support programs for teachers - 79.3% answered that "yes, such programs exist," 0% "I have already taken advantage of this," 1.7% of respondents answered that there are no such programs, and 18.9% of respondents don't know about it.

An interview with 38 full-time teachers showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of education, depending on the specific base (student access to equipment, a sufficient number of thematic patients, independent work). The experts received answers about the teacher training program, funding for this training, and whether teachers are certified in teaching methods.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Complies with 4 Standards: fully - 3, partially - 1.

*Standard 5: done*

***Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:***

1) To provide college educational programs with a sufficient number of teachers with appropriate qualifications and academic experience, especially in special disciplines, and systematically analyze the needs for teachers and mentors, taking into account the annual increase in the student population.

2) To identify and implement mechanisms for motivating teachers in order for them to create original educational and teaching aids in the state language that improve the organization of training.

3) To provide appropriate conditions and propose approaches that encourage teachers to engage in research work with results in the form of publication of articles, theses, reports, and analytical reports.

**Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

**Proof of compliance:**

**6.1 Material and technical base**

The external expert commission found that the medical college has sufficient and appropriate material and technical base, information resources, educational and resources for theoretical and clinical training of students, which the medical college uses to achieve its mission and strategic goals.

The Interdent Higher Medical College is located on the 1st, 4th, 5th, 6th floors in a building built in 1983. The total area of the main academic building is 2956 m<sup>2</sup>, the teaching area is 1770 m<sup>2</sup>, and the main building and the additional one are 1186 m<sup>2</sup>. There are 2.52 m<sup>2</sup> per student. In order to expand the material and technical base and increase the teaching space in the college, construction of a 6-storey educational building with a total area of 3000 m<sup>2</sup> begins.

The college has 39 classrooms, 1 laboratory, an Educational and Clinical Center consisting of 12 simulation rooms, 3 computer classes.

The classrooms and laboratories are equipped with modern technical and audiovisual teaching aids, equipment, etc. The equipment of the classrooms and laboratories is 95%. There are a sufficient number of models and mannequins for practicing practical skills of students, but due to their significant degree of deterioration, updating of the corresponding equipment and equipment is required.

The World Skills platform was created on the basis of the simulation technology center.

The college has an assembly hall with an area of 150 square meters for 100 seats, equipped with modern multimedia and music equipment.

In order to meet the personal and social needs of students, the college has a canteen with hot meals “Appetit” IE Nikulina A.G. in accordance with the sanitary and epidemiological conclusion No A.02.H.KZ52VWF00012899 dated September 17, 2019.

The college has a hangar-type sports hall for physical education classes, the area of which is 237 sq. m.

In order to create favorable conditions for the study of students and the work of teachers, a medical office has been organized at the college, which has a license series AA-4 No. 0106387 dated August 23, 2010 to engage in medical activities, issued on the basis of order No. 33 - n/1 0104206 of the Department of Economics and Budget Planning of Almaty. Every year, all 1st-4th year students undergo a medical examination at AMD’s own clinic.

Comprehensive college security includes: fire safety; electrical safety; safety related to the technical condition of the living environment. Entrance to the college is through a turnstile, which ensures security and restricts entry for unauthorized persons.

The college has an IP video monitoring system for the educational process, consisting of 30 internal and external high-definition video cameras with professional software and the ability to simultaneously video monitor all cameras.

The college has developed the “Regulations on the Anti-Terrorism Commission” and

appointed persons responsible for anti-terrorism security.

The college management annually allocates significant financial resources for the development and strengthening of the material and technical base. In 2018 is 24,990,657.00 tenge, 2019 is 4,590,203.00 tenge, 2020 is 5,278,620.00 tenge, 2021 is 18,675,933.32 tenge, and 2022 is 22,176,096.00 tenge.

Thus, over the past 5 years, 75,711,509.32 tenge have been spent on strengthening the material and technical base of HMC Interdent LLP. Additional costs for the renovation of the building were: in 2018 - 2,523,207.00 tenge, 2019 - 3,233,636.00 tenge, 2020 - 13,169,223.00 tenge, 2021 - 18,227,716.00 tenge, 2022 - 9,721,471,00tg. The total amount for construction and repair work for 5 years is 46,875,253.00 tenge.

In general, the college has a well-developed material and technical base that allows the implementation of the educational process in all EPs. Material and technical resources are available in sufficient quantity, quality and scale necessary to implement the mission and strategy of educational programs, as well as for their effective implementation.

A review of the resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, 9 clinical bases of the MSE on the REM were visited, like “Center for Perinatology and Pediatric Cardiac Surgery” of the Almaty Healthcare Department; Cardiology Center of Almaty; MSE on the REM “City Maternity Hospital No. 1” of the Almaty City Healthcare Department; LLP ENT-center "Ai-Medicus"; MSE on the REM "Children's City Clinical Hospital No. 2"; MSE on the REM “Emergency Medical Service”, substation No. 1, Almaty health department; “Sadykhan Social Pharmacy” LLP; JSC “Scientific Center of Pediatrics and Pediatric Surgery”, Almaty; City Polyclinic for WWII Veterans of Almaty with a total bed capacity of 1500, and employees of the educational organization provide collegial and ethical relationships with medical staff, management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of students. A sufficient number of thematic patients, modern equipment is provided and demonstrates accessibility to students, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and curators (mentors) provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the corresponding discipline of the educational program, the student receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during his studies.

When surveying students to the question “Am I satisfied with the conditions and equipment of college classrooms and classrooms?”, 55% were completely satisfied, 20% were partially satisfied, 13.5% were completely dissatisfied.

When surveying teachers, the question “Assess the timeliness of fulfilling requests for the purchase of methodological and didactic materials, office equipment, stationery to ensure the educational process in the organization?” was answered “timely” - 86.2%, “not timely” - 8.6%

## **6.2 Resources for hands-on learning**

For the high-quality implementation of educational practice, industrial training, and professional practice, the college has entered into agreements with 26 medical and pharmaceutical organizations in Almaty, the Almaty region, and regions. The work of 3 educational rooms has been organized at the clinical bases of the practice: MSE on the REM “KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov” - Aksai University Clinic - 1 room, LLP ENT - Center "Ai-Medicus" - 1 room, City Cardiology Center - 1 cabinet. The classrooms are equipped with the necessary educational furniture, blackboards, visual aids, and educational posters.

To develop clinical thinking and acquire the skill of examining “at the patient’s bedside”, supervising patients with various types of pathologies, at the clinical bases of medical organizations, students have access to various categories of patients under the supervision of teachers, mentors, and methodological supervisors.

Tripartite agreements on dual training were concluded between medical and pharmacy organizations, the college and 11 students of the educational program (EP) “Nursing”, 42 students of

the EP “Pharmacy”. In the 2019-2020 academic year 5 students of the specialty “Nursing”, qualification “General Practitioner Nurse”, as part of the dual training program, studied at the “AMD” clinic. After graduating from college, they were employed at the AMD clinic.

According to the agreements, medical organizations provide the opportunity to conduct all types of practical training \in any structural divisions of hospitals and clinics with the right to use their tools and equipment.

During a visit to clinical sites, where experts examined the resources, their compliance with training programs, and accessibility for teachers and students, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical healthcare. The experts received evidence of compliance with Standard 6, as well as validation of the self-assessment report information.

A review of the resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, 9 clinical bases with a total bed capacity of 1,500 were visited, and employees of the educational organization ensure collegial and ethical relations with medical staff and the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of students. A sufficient number of thematic patients, modern equipment is provided and demonstrates accessibility to students, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and curators (mentors) provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the corresponding discipline of the educational program, the student receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during his studies.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence about the quality of the programs, interviews were conducted with students in the specialty. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, sufficient time to supervise patients, work in Damumed with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for students in need. In general, students are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, because they believe that the educational organization has good resources, image and international relations, at the same time, students would like more independence in managing patients, holding competitions, round tables, conferences on current issues in medicine.

Students showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, and demonstrated their judgment on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, and the opportunity to participate in research work.

### **6.3 Information technology and library resources**

The college library organized its work in accordance with the approved “Regulations on the Library” and the annual work plan of the college.

The library is located on the 6th floor of the academic building. The college, on the basis of an agreement, works closely with the youth library named after Zhambyl, and the college library fund, taking into account cooperation with the library of KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov, amounts to 28,556 copies (including 13,306 copies in the state language). Book supply per student is 18 copies.

The collection of publications on electronic media is 134 units, of which 48 are in the state language.

Over the past 5 years, the college’s library collection has grown to 2,260, including 1,105 in the state language.

Experts have revealed that there is an insufficient amount of educational literature in special disciplines (childhood diseases, obstetrics and gynecology) in the state language.

Access to modern information resources to support educational programs for teachers and students is provided through access to the electronic databases of the “Kazakhstan National Electronic Library” ([www.kazneb.kz](http://www.kazneb.kz)), “Electronic Library” ([Okulik.kz](http://Okulik.kz)). Advisory assistance to teachers and students is

provided through the electronic library on the [www.college.smartnation](http://www.college.smartnation) platform. It contains literature on 5 specialties: 86 copies of basic literature, 55 copies of additional literature, of which 52 copies are in the state language.

The library has a reading room with 25 seats.

The college has introduced and effectively used information resources. There are 3 computer classes with 64 seats and 64 computers. Multimedia technologies are actively used. The entire educational space of the College is connected to the broadband Internet network. The classrooms are equipped with interactive whiteboards and multimedia projectors, which allow you to conduct interactive classes in any classroom.

#### **6.4 Health research and scientific advances**

One of the forms of scientific research is the writing of diploma (course) papers for bachelors of nursing. Bachelor's degree work is carried out through research in the field of nursing. Thesis design begins with mastering the discipline “Principles of planning and conducting research in nursing”, in which students become familiar with the basic principles and algorithms for conducting research and writing diploma (course) papers, decide on the topic of research and begin collecting and processing information. Before starting practical research, students choose research methods that they become familiar with in the discipline “Biostatistics and presentation of research results”, develop questionnaires, questionnaires, etc. The supervisor approves the chosen methods and, if necessary, makes adjustments. Research is carried out on the basis of medical institutions, according to the chosen topic.

In the 2021-2022 academic year, 65 graduates of the qualification “Applied Bachelor of Science in Nursing” (1.6 years) conducted scientific research in the field of nursing, which covered current issues of the healthcare system “Features of interaction between nurses and relatives of patients in the palliative care department”, “The role of the local nurse in immunization of the population and the prevention of infectious diseases”, “The role of the nurse in teaching patients during early recovery after an ischemic stroke”, “Nursing care for patients with endogenous psychoses at different stages of treatment”, “The role of the nurse in the prevention of nosocomial infection in the operating room under modern conditions”, etc.

For the purpose of personal self-realization, students take an active part in conferences at the city, regional and republican levels under the guidance of scientific supervisors from among experienced teachers. College students actively perform at scientific and professional training courses in the city, region, and republic and take prizes.

2nd year student of the specialty “GM” Shabalina M. was awarded a certificate at the City Scientific and Practical Conference “Ahmet Baitursynuly is the spiritual leader of the Kazakh people”.

At the republican scientific and practical conference “Current problems of modern science: the view of youth,” 1st year students “GM” Shirinova A. and Mukhametzhanova A. received certificates for participation and the relevance of the topic.

Active full-time participation was taken by 3rd year students of the specialty “Nursing” Zhumabaykyzy Aigul, Kuzhaeva Ayana actively participated in the republican scientific and practical conference “Development of nursing profession in the Republic of Kazakhstan: Science. Search. Innovation” through the Union of Medical Colleges.

The college has organized the work of 4 scientific circles:

1. “Aesculapius”, director Erkhassym Zh.
2. “Meyirim”, head Zaineshova S.B.
3. “Stimulus”, Nurgazy A.
4. “Zhas Physicist”, Sayachova T.B.

Experts found that 28 students took part in the circle work, which indicates insufficient coverage of students with research work.

Research work of teachers is carried out in the form of preparation of scientific articles, publications, and presentations at scientific conferences.



The results of the research activities of teachers are published annually on the pages of various publications:

2019, volume 2. Bekbatyrova G.T. published an article in the magazine on the development and state of nursing in the Republic of Kazakhstan "Information Bulletin" on the topic "The role of secondary health workers in the modern era".

2019, volume 3. Bekbatyrova G.T. published an article in the magazine on the development and state of nursing in the Republic of Kazakhstan "Information Bulletin" on the topic "Peculiarities of using interactive teaching methods in the system of professional training of college students".

2022, Zainishova S.B. published an article in the journal of the Non-Profit JSC "KazNMU named after S. Asfendiyarov" "Modern aspects of organizing nursing care to ensure the quality of life and health of elderly patients."

2022, Bugybai Sh.A. published an article in the journal of Non-Profit JSC "KazNMU named after S. Asfendiyarova" "Epidemiology of bleeding from varicose veins of the esophagus".

2022, Korabay R.A. published an article in the journal of. Non-Profit JSC "KazNMU named after S. Asfendiyarova" "Analysis of mortality during gallstone disease".

2022, Aydinov R.B. published an article "Reason of repeated cesarean section", Association of legal entities in the form of association "National movement Bobek".

An interview with 38 full-time teachers showed satisfaction with working conditions both in the walls of the college and in clinical bases.

### **6.5 Exchange in the field of education**

HMC "Interdent" interacts with foreign educational institutions. Memorandum signed with LLP International Educational Holding "Gaudeamus Education" (educational partners: Orenburg State Medical University, Saratov State Medical University named after V.I. Razumovsky, Siberian State Medical University).

In order to implement the Comprehensive Plan for the Development of Nursing in the Republic of Kazakhstan, the college team takes an active part in the seminars of the International Conference on Nursing in the Republic of Kazakhstan at the Republican State Enterprise "Republican Center for the Development of Health Care" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In addition, the college closely cooperates with the group of clinics SCHÖN KLINIK and ASKLEPIOS "UCare Education", Germany, Hamburg, within the framework of which students learn the German language and undergo practical training with further employment in Germany.

Cooperation in the field of education of HMC "Interdent" is carried out in the framework of seminars, participation in scientific and practical conferences.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Complies with 13 Standards: fully -10, partially - 3.

**Standard 6: done**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- 1) To update simulation equipment with modern dummies, mannequins, including digital ones.
- 2) To increase the library fund with modern educational literature, in the state language for special disciplines.
- 3) To expand international cooperation with organizations of education in the near and far abroad.

## **Standard 7: EVALUATION OF EDUCATION PROGRAMS**

### **Proof of compliance:**

#### **7.1 Mechanism of monitoring and evaluation program**

HMC "Interdent" develops and evaluates educational programs taking into account the requirements of the normative documents of the Ministry of Education and Science and Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In the College, the mechanism of evaluation of educational programs, examination of educational programs and monitoring of the implementation of these programs is carried out.

The evaluation of EP is carried out on the basis of the study of the results of the performance and quality of knowledge of the students, the satisfaction of the students, teachers and employers, as well as the achievements of the students.

For regular evaluation and monitoring of educational programs in the college, examination of curricula, work programs of disciplines and EMCD is carried out. External evaluation of educational programs was carried out in 2018 by conducting institutional and specialized accreditation of HMC "Interdent", and in 2022 the college passed the State certification.

Evaluation of educational programs is carried out by the method of feedback with students, graduates, teachers and employers by conducting a questionnaire.

## **7.2 Teacher and student feedback**

Feedback between the teacher and the student is conducted using an annual questionnaire. The results of the analysis of the questionnaires are reported to the management of the college and the entire pedagogical team for making administrative decisions and performing corrective actions. Corresponding information and additional corrective actions are provided to students, teachers, heads of departments and group curators.

To study the level of satisfaction of the teaching staff with working conditions, an anonymous survey of teachers was conducted. "Satisfaction with pedagogical composition and working conditions".

*The assessment of the degree of satisfaction of pedagogical workers was carried out according to the following criteria:*

- 1. Satisfaction with the college management system (95%)*
- 2. Satisfaction with working conditions (93%)*
- 3. Satisfaction with the labor evaluation system (97%)*
- 4. Objectivity certification of pedagogical workers (85%)*
- 5. Social support of teachers (92%)*
- 6. Satisfaction with the psychological climate in the team (90%).*

According to the results of the survey, it is possible to conclude that the pedagogical staffs (92%) are quite satisfied with the educational process and conditions of study at the college.

During interviews with students, teachers, graduates, employers, experts obtained convincing data that the management of the college regularly monitors the quality of educational programs, and takes appropriate corrective actions aimed at their improvement.

In order to validate the implementation of self-assessment reports and obtain evidence of the quality of programs, interviews were conducted with students of all educational programs. Experts asked questions about satisfaction with education, sufficient time for patient care, work with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support of students who need it, participation in scientific work, and availability of resources of international databases of professional literature.

Students showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering the questions of external experts, demonstrated their judgment on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, opportunities to participate in research, financing. Documents of students are examined by experts (portfolio, results of student evaluation, and results of questionnaires).

## **7.3 Educational achievements of students and graduates**

An indicator of the effectiveness of educational programs developed taking into account the requirements of practical health care is the existing tendency to improve the quality of student education according to the results of current, intermediate and final certification for the last 5 years.

### **Indicators of the quality of knowledge for the last 3 years in the field of specialization**

Academic year	Medical Nursing	Nursing	Pharmacy	Applied Bachelor of Nursing
2019-2020	66,5%	67,1%	65,9%	-
2020-2021	71,9%	76,6%	76,4%	80,1%
2021-2022	74,4%	75,9%	77,9%	79,3%

Confirmation of the quality of the content of educational programs and their implementation with the use of modern innovative technologies is recognized by positive reviews of specialists and managers of clinical centers. *Of the available reviews from 26 medical organizations in Almaty, 85% are positive, only 15% of the heads of clinical bases point to the need to improve the training of future specialists.*

*The analysis of the survey of 76 college graduates showed that the quality of specialist training was at a sufficient level (88%), and 12% noted that it was above average.*

#### **7.4 Involvement of interested parties**

The College involves all interested parties in the process of monitoring and evaluation of educational programs and the educational process: students, teachers, structural units (CMC, heads of branches/departments, teaching unit, scientific and methodical center, IT center, and library). Monitoring is carried out by talking, examining and discussing educational programs, surveying, attending classes, implementing the IRB plan.

In the college, the study of feedback on the practical training of students and consideration of the opinions of other interested parties is carried out by considering the results of the FSA, reports of the chairpersons of the SAC, and the results of the independent examination of graduates (NCIE) at the meeting of the pedagogical council. Reviews of the heads of basic medical organizations about the quality of training of graduates are generally positive. Managers of practical health care note the sufficient level of preparation of theoretical knowledge, communicative skills.

Interviews with 19 employers were conducted offline and included such questions as: knowledge of the mission of the college, participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of students, participation in the training of students of the applied bachelor's degree through mentoring, provision of (or departments) and students with necessary resources for practical training and formation of clinical thinking, sufficiently high indicators of employment of graduates of educational programs, etc.

Thus, in the 2021-2022 academic years, the average rate of employment for graduates of the TVE program is 77%, and for graduates of the applied program - 100%.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Complies with 7 Standards: fully - 7.

**Standard 7: done**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: no**

## **Standard 8: MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION**

### **Proof of compliance:**

#### **8.1 Management**

The staffing table and management structure of the College meets the established requirements in the field of TVE.

The organizational structure of the College has been developed and aimed at implementing the mission and strategic goal of HMC "Interdent". The organizational structure of the college is fully

consistent with the mission, goals and objectives of HMC “Interdent”, aimed at their implementation. The general management of the college is carried out by the Director, who provides ongoing management of the activities of the College. The director acts on the basis of the Charter, in accordance with the job description and employment contract. The Director is responsible for the implementation of the Strategic Development Plan of HMC “Interdent” and the achievement of the indicators defined in the activities of the Operational Plan for the implementation of the Strategy. The main structural divisions are: branches, departments that manage certain areas of activity of HMC ‘Interdent’. The functions and areas of activity of each structural unit are fixed in the relevant regulations. Direct management of the work of the unit and departments is carried out by its head. The head of a structural unit is appointed and dismissed by order of the director. The current organizational structure of HMC "Interdent" includes: director, Pedagogical Council, deputy director for educational and methodological work, deputy director for practical work; deputy director for educational work, methodological center, heads of brunches/departments, QMS, head of the housekeeping unit; EC inspector, accountant; librarian; nurse. The main activities of the college are coordinated by deputy directors, who are appointed and dismissed by order of the director of the HMC “Interdent”.

HMC "Interdent" has created appropriate structural divisions, which are defined in the main areas of activity: academic work, practical training, and methodological support of the educational process, educational work, financial and economic activities, medical care, safety, fire safety and emergency situations.

The functions of each structural unit are reflected in the relevant regulations on structural units: - regulations on structural units departments (educational, practical and educational work, QMS, educational department, library, supervision, pedagogical and methodological councils, mentoring, generalization of teaching experience, central medical complex, brunches/departments, medical center); - job descriptions that are developed and approved for each position in accordance with the college staffing schedule; - rules of internal educational regulations of the college.

During the external evaluation process, the following documents were studied and are listed in **Annex No 2**. Which ensure that the college complies with state requirements in the field of education and healthcare? Responsibility for compliance with relevant regulatory requirements rests with the college management, and control over document flow rests with the QMS manager.

## **8.2 Academic leadership**

The management structure includes the leadership of the college (director, deputy directors) and the heads of the structural divisions of the college (methodologist, heads of departments, etc.). According to the staff structure, the direct management of the college is carried out by the director, who acts on the principles of unity of command and exercises strategic management of the college in accordance with his competence, determined by the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Charter of the college.

The main activities of the college are coordinated by deputy directors, who are appointed and dismissed by the director.

The activities of deputy directors are regulated by order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 30, 2020 No. 169 “Standard Qualification Characteristics of Teacher Positions.

1. The Deputy Director for Academic Affairs exercises general control over the educational and methodological process in the college.

2. Deputy Director for Practical Work, his responsibilities include managing the college’s practice, providing educational and methodological support for students’ practical training.

3. Deputy The director of educational work provides leadership on all issues of organizing the educational process and supervises the work of the educational department.

The college also has auxiliary units that provide support for the educational process.

The activities of academic management regarding the fulfillment of the mission and the solution of tasks assigned to the college are studied and assessed on the basis of the analysis and generation of

reports and plans, analysis of the implementation of the goals and objectives of the strategic plan, and internal control reports..

The College periodically evaluates academic leadership regarding the achievement of its mission and outcomes by:

- studying the activities of academic management through their work plans and reports;
- hearings at the pedagogical and methodological councils, the CMC, the directorate;
- monitoring in accordance with the internal college control plan;
- conducting surveys and questionnaires of students, parents, PC, employers.

*The 58 teachers who were surveyed (21 survey questions) answered that 81.03% were satisfied with the organization of labor and workplace in this educational organization, and 17.24% partially agreed with this statement. Experts determined that the organization has a healthy microclimate, since the manager is quite accessible to both students and employees and responds promptly to requests. In the questionnaire, 84.5% of teachers are satisfied with the microclimate of the organization, and 5% are partially satisfied. According to 89.6%, in an educational organization, a teacher has the opportunity to realize himself as a professional in his specialty. For your information, a total of 58 people responded, with teaching experience of up to 5 years – 63.8%, up to 10 years – 12.07%, over 10 years – 24.1%.*

*To the survey question “Do the heads of the organization listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research work, clinical work,” 84.5% of teachers answered that systematically, 8.6% answered “sometimes”, 1.7% “quite rarely” , 0% “never”.*

### **8.3 Training budget and resource allocation**

The organization of the financial system of the college is carried out by the Chief Accountant, accountants in the areas of activity that are part of the structure of the college. Functional responsibilities are determined by qualification requirements.

The financial system of HMC “Interdent” LLP includes budgetary and extrabudgetary funds. To implement the state educational order, the college receives funds based on the approved budget. Budget funds are targeted and based on the principles of efficiency, effectiveness, priority, transparency, and responsibility. In accordance with the mission and function of the College, a system of budget expenditures is formed in the areas of use of budgetary and extra-budgetary funds based on the economic classification of expenditures (according to expenditure items).

At the beginning of the year, contracts for the provision of services for placing state educational orders are signed on the government procurement web portal, which serve as the basis for the allocation of funds for programs in the context of budgets, where the amount of funding is determined by the total amount of government. order. To determine the needs of the realistically possible amount of financial resources and their use, a budget request is drawn up for the forecast period. Cost planning for the implementation of the educational process is based on such indicators as the number of students and the teaching staff of the College.

### **8.4 Administrative staff and management**

To effectively implement the college’s development strategy, achieve the mission, goals and objectives, an organizational structure for managing the college’s activities was created. Management of the college and structural divisions corresponds to the general structure. The staffing table has been approved and job responsibilities have been assigned.

The staffing table is an internal organizational and legal document, developed within the organization itself and contains its structure, list and number of staff units, approved by the director of the college.

The staffing table of the college was developed in accordance with the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 30, 2008 No. 77 “On approval of the Standard Staffing of Employees of State Educational Organizations.”

The College's staffing table includes positions related to the management and support of academic activities: director, deputy directors, heads of departments, heads of services, administrative

staff from among teachers. Administrative employees engaged exclusively in administrative activities. Administrative staff whose responsibilities include supporting academic activities (library manager, librarian and media specialist, dispatcher). The core of the college consists of an academic staff - 93 teachers, of which 16 are part-time.

### **8.5 Interaction with the health sector**

Interaction with the healthcare sector is carried out on the basis of the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated November 2, 2018 No. 611 "On introducing amendments and additions to the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 28, 2016 No. 93 "On approval of the forms of a standard agreement for the provision of educational services and a standard agreement for professional practice"

Relationships with health services are carried out through participation in the implementation of educational programs as members of the pedagogical council, a mentor/mentor of clinical practice, a teacher of special disciplines, chairmen of the State Attestation Commission, members of the commission for assessing the knowledge and skills of students, members of working groups for the development of educational programs, educational reviewers - methodological materials/recommendations and participation in organizing and conducting conferences, seminars, round tables, lectures.

In the 2022-2023 academic year, 9 mentors, experienced nursing specialists from practical healthcare, were recruited to conduct clinical practice for students, with the goal of effective clinical training, development of mentoring and management experience, and development of professional and personal growth of students. Throughout the entire period, joint work was carried out with mentors on work programs/syllabuses, methods of conducting classes, assessment interviews, etc.

Representatives of practical healthcare took an active part in professional competitions as part of the competition committee.

Cooperation in the healthcare sector is carried out by concluding official agreements - contracts for professional/clinical practice and dual training.

In the 2022-2023 academic year, agreements were concluded with 6 medical organizations in Almaty for professional/clinical practice.

Dual education at the college is carried out in accordance with Article 119 of the Labor Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated November 29, 2015 "Rules for the organization of dual education", approved by order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 21, 2016 No. 50. A dual form of education has been introduced in the specialty "Nursing" with the qualification " General Practice Nurse". To implement a dual form of education covering 58 students, agreements were concluded with 5 medical organizations in Almaty.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Complies with 11 Standards: fully – 11.

**Standard 8:** *done*

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:** *no*

### **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

#### **Proof of compliance:**

The college occupies a definite and stable position in the educational services market in accordance with its stated mission, goals and objectives;

The set goals and objectives for the development of the college allow us to increase and improve the level of training of specialists from year to year by improving the quality of the educational process, developing scientific and personnel potential, strengthening and expanding the material and technical base, introducing innovative teaching technologies, and the quality of educational programs.

HMC "Interdent", as an educational organization, ensures that its organizational structure and processes correspond to the goals and objectives of the college's development.

In college, the process of updating the educational program is carried out taking into account previous experience and current activities. The main principle of assessing students' educational achievements is continuous monitoring of the learning process, consolidation of acquired skills and

regular assessment of the achievement of final learning outcomes. The college (QMS department) annually conducts a survey on satisfaction with the working conditions of teaching staff, employees and students. The results of the survey are discussed at meetings of the methodological and pedagogical councils, and for further improvement, measures are planned to increase satisfaction based on the results of the IRB, analysis of current activities, and the results of the survey, the policy for the provision of educational services is being revised.

The mission and goals of the educational program are adapted to the current state of healthcare and society as a whole. In order to improve the quality of training and competitiveness of personnel, the college effectively interacts with the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Department of Public Health of Almaty, the Department of Science and Human Resources of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and the Ministry of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, medical universities, and colleges. The mission and goals specified in the educational program show that the program is relevant and all the necessary conditions have been created for its implementation in the college;

The staffing table of the college provides for a sufficient number of structural units to implement the college development program, Road Maps for the modernization of medical education and science, and nursing education in the Republic of Kazakhstan.

To implement the educational program of applied bachelor's degree in the specialty "Nursing", a department was organized, a director was appointed, and teachers with academic degrees and work experience were identified. A summary is carried out quarterly - an analysis of the implementation of the college development program and an analysis of its implementation.

To carry out the task of developing the student's competencies and their compliance with the needs of the environment in which the graduate will work, the educational program is structured in such a way that students develop an understanding of modern socio-economic and cultural characteristics of medical problems, and the level of acquired clinical knowledge and skills corresponds to the needs of the system health and society.

The college constantly holds events to study the needs for training personnel for healthcare - job fairs with employers, surveys of representatives of practical healthcare, conferences with invitations from representatives of the healthcare system, etc. One of the ways to adjust the elements of the educational program is the dual education system.

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.*** Complies with 3 standards: fully – 3.

***Standard 9: done***

***Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: no***

## **CONCLUSION:**

When conducting an external institutional evaluation, it was found that out of **80 Standards** (including 64 basic standards and 16 improvement standards), 72 accreditation standards demonstrate full compliance, and 8 demonstrate partial compliance with improvement standards. No non-compliance with standards has been identified. Compliance with improvement standards indicates compliance of the educational organization with international consensus in such areas as mission development, student evaluation, and evaluation of educational programs, management and administration. Thus, 100% of the basic standards and 50% of the improvement standards are met.

## **5. Recommendations for institutional improvement of the college:**

### **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS**

1) To develop and annually update a catalog of elective disciplines based on a survey and analysis of the needs of employers and students.

2) To introduce dual training in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 50 dated January 21, 2016 “On approval of the Rules for the organization of dual training” with amendments and additions in 2022, in the educational program “Nursing” the qualification “Applied Bachelor of Nursing”.

3) To ensure the participation of certified mentors from among employees of clinical sites for on-the-job training and professional practice.

4) To increase the number of scientific student circles with the goal of covering at least 2/3 of college students with research work and developing skills in literature analysis, critical thinking, processing and publishing information.

### **Standard 4: STUDENTS**

1) To reconsider approaches to conducting career guidance work in order to attract students to the specialty “Midwifery”.

### **Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF/TEACHERS**

1) To provide college educational programs with a sufficient number of teachers with appropriate qualifications and academic experience, especially in special disciplines, and systematically analyze the needs for teachers and mentors, taking into account the annual increase in the student population.

2) To identify and implement mechanisms for motivating teachers in order for them to create original educational and teaching aids in the state language that improve the organization of training.

3) To provide appropriate conditions and propose approaches that encourage teachers to engage in research work with results in the form of publication of articles, theses, reports, analytical reports.

### **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

1) To update simulation equipment with modern dummies, mannequins, including digital ones.  
(6.1.1)

2) To increase the library collection with modern educational literature in the state language in special disciplines.

3) To expand international cooperation with educational organizations from near and far abroad.  
(6.5.1)

## **6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council**

The members of the EEC established the compliance of the main activities of the “Interdent” Higher Medical College LLP with the Standards of Institutional Accreditation of Medical Colleges and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend that the ECAQA Accreditation Council accredit the above-mentioned college for a period of 5 years.



### 7. Рекомендация Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА

По итогам экспертной оценки ТОО «Высший медицинский колледж «Интерденто» на соответствие Стандартам институциональной аккредитации организации технического и профессионального образования ТипО члены ВЭК пришли к единому мнению рекомендовать Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА аккредитовать вышеназванный колледж на период 5 лет

Председатель	АМАЖОЛОВА ТАТЬЯНА КАДЫРОВНА	
Зарубежный эксперт	ГУХТАСИНОВА ДИЛОРОМ САФОВНА	
Казахстанский академический эксперт	КУМАРОВА АЛТЫНАЙ БАЛТАБАЕВНА	
Казахстанский академический эксперт	НУРГАЛИЕВА ГУЛЬМИРА ТУРСУШАЛИЕВНА	
Казахстанский академический эксперт	АЛИБАЕВА ГУЛСИМ НУРМАГАНБЕТОВНА	
Казахстанский академический эксперт	МАЙСАТОВ САНЖАР МАЙСАТОВИЧ	
Представитель работодателей	ДАУЛЕТОВА КАМАР САМАЛБЕКОВНА	
Представитель студентов	БАЯНБАЕВА АРУСЖАН БАКЫТЖАНОВНА	

## Institutional quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the college (summarization)

Standard	Criteria for evaluation	BS/SI*	Total Standards	Grade		
				Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Does not compliant
1	MISSION AND END RESULTS	8/0	8	8	0	0
2	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS	14/0	14	11	3	0
3	STUDENT ASSESSMENT	7/0	7	7	0	0
4	STUDENTS	10/4	14	13	1	0
5	ACADEMIC STAFF/TEACHERS	3/1	4	3	1	0
6	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	9/4	13	10	3	0
7	EVALUATION OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS	5/2	7	7	0	0
8	MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION	7/3	10	10	0	0
9	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	1/2	3	3	0	0
	<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>64/16</b>	<b>80</b>	<b>72</b>	<b>8</b>	
	<b>*BS - BASIC STANDARD, SI - IMPROVEMENT STANDARD</b>					

**List of documents studied by members of the EEC within the framework of the work of the External Expert Commission on institutional and specialized accreditation of HMC "Interdent"**

<b>№</b>	<b>Names of documents</b>	<b>Quantity</b>	<b>Approval date</b>
1.	Constituent documents, college charter	2	
2.	License for educational activities	4	
3.	Comprehensive strategic development plan (minutes of the advisory body on its approval), monitoring.	1	
4.	College structure	1	
5.	Information about the staff of teachers, indicators of graduation and categorization in the context of educational programs.	5	
6.	Memorandums of international cooperation.	2	
7.	Internal college control plan	3	
8.	Internal educational regulations	2	
9.	Regulations on ongoing monitoring of academic performance and intermediate and final certification of students.	1	
10.	Guide for students.	2	
11.	Regulations on Personnel Policy	1	
12.	College Annual Reports	3	
13.	College financial report for 5 years	1	
14.	Library report	1	
15.	Working curricula, including dual training	7	
16.	Materials of the methodological and pedagogical council (plans, protocols, materials for them)	2	
17.	EMCD by discipline	13	
18.	WP, Course schedule	24	
19.	Work programs for clinical practice	10	
20.	Diary report on professional internship	1	
21.	Agreements with clinical sites for practice, including dual training	3	
22.	List of mentors	1	
23.	Catalog of elective disciplines	2	
24.	Checklists for assessing practical skills practical skills	38	
25.	Questionnaires and results of a survey of students' satisfaction with material and technical support	6	
26.	Analytical reports based on the results of the survey and decisions made for improvement	6	
27.	Feedback from employers on satisfaction with the quality of training for college graduates	10	
28.	Plan of educational work for department of advisors	5	
29.	Educational and methodological materials published by college staff	12	
30.	List of dual education students	2	
31.	Employment results by specialty (with supporting documents) for 5 years	5	

32.	Club work plan (SRWS)	5	
33.	CMC work plan and reports	4	
34.	Personal files of teachers of special disciplines	8	
35.	Journal of Theoretical Education	4	
36.	Industrial Training Journal	6	
37.	Examination sheet	4	
38.	Theses	5	
39.	Reviews (internal, external) of theses	5	
40.	List of thesis topics	1	
41.	List of scientific supervisors	1	
42.	Professional development plan and materials for them	5	
43.	Class schedule for the 2nd half of the year	5	
44.	Work plan of the school for a young teacher, minutes of meetings	1	
45.	Minutes of the meeting of the CMC	4	
46.	Information about MTB: tables of office equipment, financial statements on the development of MTB over the last 5 years (purchase of equipment, replenishment of the library collection, etc.)	1	
47.	The program of social support for students and reports on its implementation for 5 years (orders confirming social subsidies, etc.)	1	