

To Accreditation Council  
Of Eurasian Center  
For Accreditation and quality assurance  
In Higher Education and Health Care

**REPORT  
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION  
ON THE RESULTS OF THE ASSESSMENT OF THE EDUCATIONAL  
PROGRAMME 0306013 "PHARMACY" OF PSE on REM "PAVLODAR  
HIGHER MEDICAL COLLEGE"  
PROGRAMMES IN MEDICAL AND PHARMACEUTICAL  
SPECIALTIES OF TECHNICAL AND VOCATIONAL  
EDUCATION**

**external expert evaluation period: May 26-28, 2021**

PAVLODAR. 2021

## CONTENT

	List of symbols and abbreviations	3
1.	EEC composition	4
2.	General part of the final report of the EEC	6
2.1	Presentation of Pavlodar Higher Medical College (PHMC) and educational programme 0306013 "Pharmacy"	6
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	7
2.3	Analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational programme 0306013 "Pharmacy" PHMC for compliance with Accreditation Standards	7
3.	External expert evaluation	8
3.1	Description of the visit of the external expert commission	8
3.2	Results of the survey of key stakeholders	16
3.3	Conclusions on external expert evaluation	20
4.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards educational programme 0306013 "Pharmacy" and an overview of the strengths for each standard	20
5.	Recommendations for improving the educational programme for 0306013 "Pharmacy"	31
6.	Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council	32
	Attachment 1. List of documents requested by members of the EEC during the period of external expert evaluation	33
	Attachment 2. Quality profile and external assessment criteria (generalization) of specialty 0306000 "Pharmacy" PHMC for compliance with the Standards of specialized accreditation of organizations of technical and vocational education	34

### **List of symbols and abbreviations**

- AC - Accreditation Council
- AMP - administrative and management personnel
- BC - basic competencies
- EW - educational work
- NJSC "ECAQA" - Non-profit institution "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education And Health Care "
- FSA - final state certification
- ETS - engineering and teaching staff
- CYA - Committee on Youth Affairs
- CTP - calendar-thematic plan
- PHMC - "Pavlodar Higher Medical College"
- MES RK - Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
- Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan - Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan
- NJSC - Non-state institution
- EP - Educational programme
- PC - professional competencies
- PP - professional practice
- SCC - subject-cycle commission
- RK - Republic of Kazakhstan
- WP - work programme
- QMS - quality management system
- EMCD - educational-methodical complex of the discipline
- ShYT - school for young teachers
- IS - Information Systems
- CTS - Computer technology and software
- REC - Radio electronics and communications
-

### 1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA order No. 18 of 04/26/2021, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct during the period 26/05/21. until 28.05.2021 Specialized accreditation of PHMC in the following composition:



*Chairperson of the External Expert Commission -*

Tokbergenova Gulmira Telmanovna,  
Candidate of Pedagogical Sciences, Honorary  
Worker of Education of the Republic of  
Kazakhstan, Excellence in Health care of the  
Republic of Kazakhstan,  
Director of LLP "Higher Medical College"  
Interdent ";



*Foreign expert - Oleinikova Tatiana*

Anatolyevna,  
Candidate of Sciences (Pharmacy), Head of the  
Education Quality Management Department of  
Educational and Methodological Management,  
Associate Professor of the UEF Department  
"Kursk State Medical University, Nominated  
by the partner organization" Russian Register  
Certification Association ";



*National Academic Expert - Kumarova*

Altynai Baltabaevna,  
Deputy Director for Teaching and Educational  
Work  
SPE on REM "Taldykorgan Higher Medical  
College";



*National Academic Expert* - Abzhanova Zhanar Soltanovna, Deputy Director for Scientific and Methodological Work of Republican Higher Medical College LLP;



*National Academic Expert* - Evdomashenko Tamara Vitalievna, general practitioner, teacher of special disciplines, PSE "Kostanay Higher Medical College" of Health Department of Akimat of Kostanay region;



*National Academic Expert* - Suleimenova Asel Askhatovna, Head of the Department of General Medicine PSE on REM "Higher Medical College" Department of Public Health of the city of Almaty;



*Expert - representative of employers* - Kasenova Asem Tolegenovna, chief physician of the PSE on the REM "Hospice of Pavlodar region" of the Health Department of Pavlodar region;



*Expert - student representative - Tolegen Dana Meiramkyzy,*  
2nd year student in the specialty  
"Standardization, Metrology and Certification"  
LLP "Higher College of the Innovative  
University of Eurasia"



*ECAQA Observer - Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna,* head of the accreditation and monitoring department of the NJSC "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care".

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC. The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational program 0306013 "Pharmacy" for compliance with the Standards for the accreditation of educational programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties of technical and vocational education, recommendations of the EEC for further improving the implementation of PHMC training programmes.

## **2.General part of the final report of the EEC**

### **2.1 Presentation of Pavlodar Medical College and the educational programme 0306013 "Pharmacy"**

The public utility company on the right of economic management (PSE on REM) "Pavlodar Higher Medical College" (PHMC) of the Pavlodar region health department is one of the oldest secondary specialized educational institutions in the region. During this time, a huge experience in training specialists has been accumulated, the traditions of medical education have been multiplied. The history of Pavlodar Higher Medical College begins in 1949 with the opening of a 2-year nursing school. By the decree of the Council of Ministers of the Kazakh SSR No. 707-r dated 04.08.1954, the medical school was reorganized into a medical school, in 1995 - into a college. Since 2016, the college has received the status of higher medical, through the merger, the Center for Continuing Education and Simulation Education was formed.

The object of evaluation of the EEC is the educational programme in the specialty **0306013 - "Pharmacy"** Public utility company on the right of economic management "Pavlodar Higher Medical College" of the Pavlodar region health department.

Organization of the educational process in the specialty **specialty 0306000 - "Pharmacy"** with the qualification 0306013 "Pharmacist" carried out in accordance with the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 29, 2016 No. 661; dated February 21, 2020 No. KP DSM-12/2020; College charter, relevant regulations.

The legal address of the college: 140003, Pavlodar region, Pavlodar, st. Isa Baizakova, 151; e-mail: [mc\\_pavlodar@mail.ru](mailto:mc_pavlodar@mail.ru); Web site: [www.pvlmedcollege.kz](http://www.pvlmedcollege.kz); tel / fax: 8 (7182) 674971.

Founder - Health Department of Pavlodar region. The college is located in a typical building; the total area of all premises used for organizing the educational process is 6837.8 square meters

The activities of the medical college are carried out in accordance with the constituent documents: the Charter, approved by order of the Finance Department of Pavlodar region No. 364 of July 29, 2016; Certificate of state re-registration of a legal entity No. 1975-1945-01-GP dated January 17, 2017, issued by the Department of Justice of the city BIN 990240004320.

Educational activities in the specialty 0306013 - "Pharmacy" qualification 0306013 - "Pharmacist" carried out on the basis of a state license, issued by the DCSO of Pavlodar region of the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated August 23, 2016 No. KZ73LAA00007520.

The form of study is daytime. The normative term of study is 2 years 10 months on the basis of general secondary education. The language of instruction is Russian.

The training of specialists has been carried out since 1963. Over the past five years, 155 pharmacists have graduated.

14 teachers participate in training in this specialty, including 7 people with more than ten years of experience.

The college has concluded agreements with the heads of 42 medical organizations in Pavlodar to conduct educational, training-production and professional practices.

## **2.2 Information on previous accreditation**

In 2016, the college was accredited by the NKAOKO accreditation agency (certificate No. IA 018 dated May 31, 2016), specialty 0306000 "Pharmacy".

## **2.3 Analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational programme in the specialty 0306013 "Pharmacy" PSE on REM "Pavlodar Higher Medical College" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards**

Report on specialized accreditation organization of an educational programme specialties **0306013 - "Pharmacy"** of PSE on REM "Pavlodar Higher Medical College" (PHMC) of the Pavlodar region health department is presented on 81 pages of the main text, 12 appendices.

The report is characterized by the completeness of answers to all 9 accreditation standards, structuredness, taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the ECAQA TVE educational programme, as well as the internal unity of the information provided by the accredited specialties **0306013 - "Pharmacy"** PSE on REM "Pavlodar Higher Medical College" of the Health Department of the Akimat of Pavlodar region. Attached to the report is a cover letter signed by the director of the medical college - M.E.B., Kasimova B.K. confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

List of nine members of the internal committee - representatives of the self-assessment organization, indicating the responsibility of each for conducting specialized withamerevaluations, including the heads of the department - Benke O.A. The chairperson of the working group on preparation for specialized accreditation is Zh.Z. Baygulzhina. - Deputy Director for teaching and educational work.

Based on the internal order "On the creation of a working group for self-assessment within the framework of specialized accreditation", a self-assessment of the educational programme of the specialty **0306013 - "Pharmacy"** was carried out.

The Working Group During the preparation of the Self-Assessment Report, certain work was done: the key areas of specialized activities in the field of education, tasks for the implementation of the educational programme were analyzed, the necessary information was collected in accordance with Standards for accreditation of educational programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties of technical and vocational education (hereinafter referred to as the ECAQA Accreditation Standards); a thorough analysis, updating and addition of methodological and training materials, their content is reflected in the report. The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards

and includes a description of the strengths, areas for improvement for each of the 9 standards.

The database is presented in full, consistently; there are references to them in the text of the report. The report is written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain references in the text and are consecutively numbered.

### **3. External expert evaluation**

#### **3.1 Description of external expert evaluation**

External expert work on the specialized assessment of PHMC (hereinafter referred to as the college) was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external assessment of educational institutions and educational programmes of ECAQA and in accordance with the programme and schedule approved on May 11, 2021 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. ; agreed with the Chairperson of the EEC Ph.D. Tokbergenoy G.T. and the director of the college Kasimova B.K. External expert evaluation of specialized accreditation for compliance with the Accreditation Standards for educational programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties, technical examination of documents, study of the college website.

To obtain objective information on expert evaluation, the EEC members used the following methods: interview and vocational education (TVE) ECAQA started on March 15, 2021, which included expert evaluation of self-assessment reports, preliminary with management and administrative staff, interviews with students, observation, study website, interviewing employees of various structural units, teachers, on-line questioning of teachers and students in the period from May 26 to May 28, 2021, review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards, study of educational and methodological documents for accredited educational programmes.

On the part of the college staff, the presence of all persons indicated in the visiting programme and according to the lists of interview sites (table 1, Attachment 1 Lists of students, teachers and employers for interviews) is ensured.

May 24, 2021 in modeonline under the leadership of ECAQA Director general Sarsenbayeva S.S. and chaired by Tokbergenova Gulmira Telmanovna, a preliminary meeting of the members of the External Expert Commission was held. An acquaintance of experts took place, responsibility was distributed among the members of the EEC. Self-assessment reports brief: discussion of key issues, including the results of expert evaluation of self-assessment reports, familiarization of EEC members with recommendations for self-assessment reports, discussion of a list of documents that must be additionally requested from the college for self-assessment validation. The programme and schedule of external expert evaluation and planning of the work of the EEC members were discussed.

**The first day of the visit is 05/26/2021.** A preliminary meeting of the EEC ECAQA members took place. During the organizational meeting chaired by Tokbergenova Gulmira Telmanovna, the programme of external expert evaluation was specified and the first day of the visit is planned.

In accordance with the programme and schedule of external expert work, members of the EEC held a meeting and interview with the management of the college. There was a presentation of the EEC members, an acquaintance with the goals of external expert assessment. A meeting-conversation with the director Kasimova B.K was held during which, members of the EEC received answers regarding the development of a mission and vision, a strategic plan, further prospects for the development of the college and cooperation with medical universities and colleges from far and near abroad, agreements with clinical bases in Pavlodar. Director Kasimova B.K. exhaustive answers were given. This interview validated accreditation standards 1.8 and 9.

**Photo 1. EEC conducts an interview with the head (director) college**



At a meeting of EEC members with the academic leadership of the college (Baygulzhina Zh.Z., Dyusembaeva Zh.B., Sitkazinova G.K., Shaydullina A.M., Kaptaeva A.N., Nurakhmetova A.O., Mukenova Zh.N., Bitigova G.S., Makabayeva D.K., Benke O.A.), experts for the validation of standards No. 1-9 conducted an interview on the following issues: the contingent of students (in the context of specialties, the ratio of students on a paid basis and on a state order), structure and staffing, job responsibilities of employees, social support for employees and students, statistical information on admission, implementation of inclusive training under the programme for productive employment (hereinafter referred to as PPP), monitoring of employment of graduates, feedback and career growth of graduates, implementation of dual training, organization and monitoring of distance education in a pandemic.

External expert evaluation programme an interview of EEC members with AE Smagulova, AA Kuzin, G. Kh. Kasimova, NV Rogovskaya took place, Zhumartova D.D., Makpaleeva E.A. - on the staffing of programmes, the selection procedure at the stage of recruitment to college, social support for employees. During the meeting, questions were asked:

- application to monitoring and measuring tools for assessing the knowledge, skills and abilities of students, academic counseling, social and material support for students, work on the prevention of offenses in students, the work of the psychological service.
- assessment and monitoring of the implementation of educational programmes, the use of DOT during a pandemic, research work of students.

EEC members received substantiated confirmation of compliance with standards 1-9.

The interview was conducted to validate and verify the data of the self-assessment report of Standard 6

- book availability in accordance with the EP, the presence of an automated library and an electronic catalog, the procedure for forming an application for the purchase of educational literature in accordance with the EP.
- activity of a medical center, duties of a doctor and a medical nurse of a medical center.

**Photo 2. EEC conducts an interview with the management of the college and heads of departments.**



For external expert evaluation by members EEC conducted an interview with the heads of the CMC and offices: Kulbekova Sh.Zh., Musabekova A.A., Grigorenko A.G., Baigulova Sh.Sh., Nurkenova A.K., Mukenova Zh.N., Dosbergenvoy K.I., Ospanova A.N., Alimukhanvoy B.N. ... During the meeting, questions were asked:

- On regulatory documents, satisfaction with book supply and material and technical equipment of the EP, meaningful content of the EP, the presence of clinical bases, the use of traditional and innovative methods and forms of education, the presence of a system for assessing the activity of the CMC and the teacher, satisfaction with working conditions and forms of stimulating pedagogical activity.
- 

**Photo 3. EEC conducts an interview with the chairmen of the CMC and the heads of the offices.**



The EEC members visited theoretical and practical rooms, a computer technology room, a canteen, a medical center, a sports complex, a library, a conference room, and an assembly hall.

The college has 38 classrooms and laboratories, incl. 10 offices are located in medical organizations of the region and the city. The college has a well-stocked library and reading rooms with 30 seats.

To ensure a comfortable and modern educational process, students have access to five computer classes, where they can use modern information processing tools, and also have access to broadband Internet. 122 computers are used in the educational process. The number of students per computer is 7 people. 36 computers with office printing equipment were installed for teachers. To use modern educational technologies, the college has 14 interactive whiteboards with projectors. The percentage of equipment for preclinical practice rooms in all specialties is 85%.

**Photo 4. Overview of educational resources.**



On the same day, experts interviewed teachers offline, observing distancing and masking. Teachers answered questions about satisfaction with working conditions, wages, material

incentives (bonuses, additional payments for leadership, methodological work, publications), talked about teacher development activities, noted the high corporate culture in the college and ethical leadership. Everyone noted that equipment is being purchased, attention is being paid to improving the qualifications of teachers in terms of professional competence, attracting and supporting young specialists. The experts received answers about the teacher training programme, the financing of this training, the availability of certification in teaching methods for teachers and an established system of academic support for students.

This interview and review of the documentation allowed the reviewers to validate the data in the self-assessment report against standard 2,4,5.

According to the EEC programme, interviews were held with students of all educational programmes of the college. The interview was attended by 30 full-time students with respect to distance and mask mode. Students actively answered questions from ECAQA experts: on material incentives (for the provision of scholarships, free meals), social support (mentors, staff psychologist, a guide for students), participation in circles, events of the college, city and region, satisfaction with learning, communication with teachers, attitude of management (director, head of department, curator, psychologist), questioning. In the specialty 0306000 "Pharmacy", questions were asked about the bases of educational and industrial practice, the provision of textbooks and teaching aids on elective disciplines, etc.

At the end of all interviews, the head of VR Kaptaeva A.N., social educator Seysekenova A.K., presented the members of the EEC with a video and a presentation on educational and social work, confirming standard 4. (photo 6.)



At the end of the working day, the documentation was studied and a working meeting was held on the results of the first day of work of the EEC.

Thus, EEC members validated standards 1-9.

**The second day of the visit: 05/27/2021.** In order to validate standards 2, 4, 6 and 7, the experts visited practical bases in all areas of training. For high-quality passing by students of educational practice, educational and production training, professional practice, the college entered into an agreement with a list of basic medical organizations approved by the head of the Health care institution of Pavlodar region, Order No. 707 dated October 15, 2020 and includes 32 medical organizations [http://pvlmedcollege.kz/?page\\_id=2633&lang=ru...](http://pvlmedcollege.kz/?page_id=2633&lang=ru...) In addition, private contracts have been concluded with 5 pharmaceutical, 5 dental organizations for the implementation of relevant educational programmes. Thus, in order to form students' practical skills and abilities and master professional competencies, the leadership of the PSE on REM "Pavlodar Higher Medical College" 3-party contracts for the implementation of the dual training system.

The main bases of practice of the specialty 0306000 "Pharmacy" are - LLP Bulat-Pharm,

LLP FORMAT.KZ, LLP Dolgolet, LLP Alvit, LLP Gloria-Pharm. For specialties 0304000 "Dentistry", 0307000 "Orthopedic Dentistry" - LLP "Dentos", LLP "Premier", LLP "Medeo", LLP "Aydin", "Stomline", LLP "Azhar". (Attachment 4).

When visiting clinical and pharmaceutical bases, a meeting was held with employers, graduates of different years of graduation, mentors; chief physician, freelance dentist of Azhar LLP - Zh.K. Yesimova, director of Biofera LLP - KD Nevдах, deputy chief physician - Zh.B. Barlykova. regional clinical hospital named after G. Sultanov, director of LLP "Myrza-khan" - Magauov T.A. Also, a conversation with PHMC graduates working in these organizations: Kaniev D.Zh., Abdykalikov N.A., Sharrina O.V., Bayalbaeva Zh.A., Shankenova Z.D., Isakova T.M., Goryacheva N.V. During the conversation, positive feedback was received about the quality of training of graduates, about the joint work being carried out: adjusting educational programmes, participating in the FSA as examiners and mentors for conducting educational and industrial practices. Training rooms organized in clinics attended.

**Photo 7. Visiting EEC clinical sites.**



According to the programme, members of the EEC demonstrated the SOVA information and educational platform used for distance learning: an electronic journal, schedule, group lists, etc.

To validate standards 2.3.6, a meeting of EEC members with student activists took place, during which convincing answers were obtained to the following questions: the structure and activities of the student council, participation in the development of the mission; participation of students in circle work, volunteer movement, social support for students, participation in the collegial bodies of the college.

An interview was held with the head of the OMP service - Nurakhmetova A.O., who made a presentation on scientific activities (SRW, scientific work of graduates of applied bachelor's degree) and on international cooperation. EEC members were provided with documentation in

the form of: memorandums, theses, publications, achievements.

Pavlodar Higher Medical College actively interacts with international educational institutions and with organizations of the republican and regional levels. The college concluded agreements:

- Finland - a memorandum of cooperation in the field of Health care, medical education and science (dated November 30, 2012);
- with the budgetary educational institution of the Omsk region "Medical College" (from 07.10.2015);
- with the educational institution "Gomel State Medical College" (from 01.02.2017 for 3 years);
- with the State Autonomous Educational Institution of Secondary Professional Education "Kazan Medical College" (dated March 13, 2017 for 3 years);
- with the Karaganda State Medical University (from May 2018 for 5 years);
- GOU "Republican Medical College", Dushanbe
- LLC "Medical and Social College" Tajikistan.
- LLP "Gaudeamus Plus" (International educational holding), Nur-Sultan
- NJSC "Toraigyrov University"
- RPO "Medical Youth"
- "Innovative Eurasian University"

Since the signing of the Memorandums, the college has been working together on priority areas of health development, Thus, evidence of the implementation of Standard 5, 6, 9 has been obtained.

For the validation of standards 2,3,4,5,6,7, members of the EEC attended practical trainings of teachers: in the specialty 0306000 "Pharmacy", 0306013 "Pharmacist", teacher Alimukhanova B.N.Theme: "Pathogens of airborne infections."

in the specialty 0306000 "Pharmacy",0306013 "Pharmacist", teacher Baigulova Sh.Sh. Theme:"Root. Removal"

**Photo 8. Visiting EEC practical training.**



All attended classes are provided with a working curriculum, control and measuring tools, demonstration and handouts, equipment for individual practice of practical skills.

According to the EEC programme, interviews were held with graduates of all educational programmes and employers. More than ten graduates took part in the interview in full-time format, observing distancing and masking. Graduates actively answered questions from experts: satisfaction with the quality of educational services provided, adaptation in the workplace, participation of the college in the employment of graduates, proposals for improving educational programmes. Reviews about the quality of graduate training, degree of participation in curriculum development and college life.

The head of the methodological department, members of the EEC, were presented with a video presentation on the methods used, forms, knowledge control, types of independent work and stimulating the educational activities of students.

At the end of the second day of the visit, experts examined the college documentation: constituent documents, provisions on the organization of the educational process, job descriptions, plans for all structural units, protocols, reports, projects, research results, publications, schedule, WC, RUPs, EMCDs, syllables, KIMs, didactic materials, regulations, journals of attendance and progress, electronic journals, work plans, reports, questionnaires and the results of processing psychologist's questionnaires, etc.

**The third day of the visit: 04/30/2021** In accordance with the programme, the members of the EEC were offered the work of students in a multidisciplinary team has been demonstrated.

- 0307000 "Orthopedic dentistry", Dental technician, 1 course; Volunteer movement "Healthy Teeth, Healthy Children, Healthy Family." Topic: "Models for teaching oral hygiene for preschool and school children";
- 0301000 "General Medicine", Obstetrician, 3 course. Topic: "Physiological childbirth, periods of childbirth";
- 0302000 "Nursing", Nurse of general practice, 2nd year. Theme: "Provision of medical care to patients depending on the severity of the condition" demonstration of the triage system.
- 0302000 "Nursing", Nurse of general practice, 1st year. Circle "Kazaktanu". Topic: "Unique dishes of national cuisine"
- 0302054 "Nursing", Applied Bachelor, 3rd year. Topic: "Organization of the patronage service."
- 0302054 "Nursing", Applied Bachelor, 1st year. Topic: "Organization of the nursing process in diseases of the cardiovascular system"



Further, a meeting of EEC members was held on the results of an external assessment for compliance with the Standards of specialized accreditation of all specialized medical and pharmaceutical specialties of technical and vocational education (TVE) ECAQA. A final discussion of the results of external assessment, study of documents, results of interviews, interviews, questionnaires was held. The members of the EEC began to design the final report of the EEC.

Improvement recommendations for the college discussed. A draft report and a

recommendation for improving the organization's performance were prepared. The chair held a final open vote on college recommendations and a final vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

The programme and schedule of the external expert evaluation of the EEC has been completed in full. On the part of the college staff, the participation of all persons indicated in the programme is ensured.

To obtain evidence of compliance with the accreditation standards and verification of the self-assessment report data, external experts requested documents, video presentation, photo, video about resources (archived in ECAQA documents), according to the recommendations of the Self-assessment Guidelines.

### **3.2 Results of the survey of key stakeholders**

An observer from ECAQA in the period 27-30.04.2021 conducted an online survey of college students and teachers on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>...

#### **Student survey results:**

In total, the proposed questionnaire contains 39 questions, including an assessment of satisfaction with training and resources of the organization. The total number of students to whom the questionnaire was sent is 395. The total number of responding students is 395.

By specialties: 03010000 "General Medicine" qualification 0301013 "Paramedic" - 17.77%, 0301000 "General Medicine" qualification 0301023 "Midwife" - 8.63%, 0302000 "Nursing" (Nurse of general practice) - 36.55 %, 0302000 Nursing (masseur) - 1.02%, 0302000 Nursing (applied bachelor's degree) - 21.32, 0305000 "Laboratory diagnostics" - 0.51%, 0306000 "Pharmacy" - 7.11%, 0304000 "Dentistry" - 1.52%, 0307000 "Orthopedic Dentistry" - 5.58%.

Fully agree with the statement that they will recommend college as an educational organization - 85.28%, partially agree with this statement - 12.69%, doubt the answer 2.03%. Programme managers and teachers are aware of the problems of students associated with studying in college - 86.8% of respondents strongly agree, 11.68% - partially, completely disagree - 0.51%, the rest doubted the answer - 1.02%. According to 64.47% of the respondents, programme managers and teachers constantly involve students in the work of advisory bodies, the rest answered differently (they do not involve - 12.18%, I do not know anything about this - 11.68%, doubted the answer - 6, 09%, sometimes 5.58%). Fully satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms, college auditoriums 87.82% of respondents, partially satisfied 11.17%, not satisfied 0.51%, partially dissatisfied - 0.51% and doubted with the answer 0%.

The college has created conditions for rest and nutrition for students (recreation areas, benches on the territory, a buffet) in between classes - completely according to 87.82%, the remaining 12.08% of the respondents are not satisfied to some extent. Office equipment (computers, laptops, printers) are available for students in classrooms and practice bases are fully available for 93.4% of students, partially - for 5.08%, not available for the rest of the respondents. The majority (94.92%) answered that teachers provide students with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes. According to 83.25% in the college there is access to the participation of students in research work, 11.68% partially agreed with this, and the rest - 5.08% deny it. Fully and partially satisfaction with library resources 90.36% and 9.14%, respectively. The majority (92.89%) have access to electronic educational resources. The availability of medical services for college students is characterized as sufficient by 86.29% of surveyed students. 93.91% are completely satisfied with the activities of mentors, curators and tutors, partially - 6.09%. not satisfied in one way or another - 0%, 0% - DO not know their mentor / curator. College teachers and staff treat students with respect - 98.48% strongly agree. Most of the respondents (90.86%) know that the college has and is implementing social programmes to support students, and 7.11% have not heard and DO not know about it. The college has a career counseling service for students, 84.26% of

respondents are aware of this. Fully agree that the college has established a system of self-study of students 79.19%, partially agree - 10.15%, the rest of the respondents disagree (3.56%), or 7.11% doubted the answer. They assessed the organization of training at the practice bases as excellent - 75.63% of respondents, as good - 19.8%, cannot assess - 3.05%, satisfactory - 1.52%, unsatisfactory - 0%. Approximately 84.26% of respondents answered that there is sufficient time in college for practical training (patient management and care, nursing rounds, work in laboratories, etc.), the rest either partially agreed with the answer (10.66%) either disagree (2.03%), partially agree (0.51) or doubted the answer (2.54%). satisfactory - 1.52%, unsatisfactory - 0%. Approximately 84.26% of respondents answered that there is sufficient time in college for practical training (patient management and care, nursing rounds, work in laboratories, etc.), the rest either partially agreed with the answer (10.66%) either disagree (2.03%), partially agree (0.51) or doubted the answer (2.54%). satisfactory - 1.52%, unsatisfactory - 0%. Approximately 84.26% of respondents answered that there is sufficient time in college for practical training (patient management and care, nursing rounds, work in laboratories, etc.), the rest either partially agreed with the answer (10.66%) either disagree (2.03%), partially agree (0.51) or doubted the answer (2.54%).

More than 88.32% of the respondents are satisfied with the schedule of training sessions in the disciplines of the educational programme, partially - 9.64%, no - 0.51%, they doubt the answer - 1.52%. Fully and partially satisfied with the methods of assessing the knowledge and skills of students - 90.36% and 9.65%, respectively. The content of the educational programme (list of disciplines) in the chosen specialty fully meets the expectations of the majority - 88.83%, partially - 9.14%, no - 0%, doubt the answer - 2.03%. Teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods, 88.32% regularly count, sometimes 10.15%, doubt the answer - 1.02%, DO not know what it is - 0.51%, respondents.

To the question: How often the teacher is late for the beginning of classes - 91.88% of the respondents answered that there was no such thing, 7.61% answered that sometimes, I DO not know what to answer - 0.51%. In the opinion of 83.76% of the surveyed students, after the end of the class, the teachers constantly provide feedback (listens to the opinion, conduct a mini-survey, work on mistakes), and 13.71% write that "sometimes", 1.02% - answered "rarely", 0.51% answered never and 1.02% did not know what to answer.

Two-thirds of the respondents - 91.37% - stated that a college teacher (mentor, curator) is an example for a student as a professional doctor, a person (ethics, communication, appearance, speech), the rest or do not agree with this - (0%), doubted the answer (3.05%) and 5.58% answered "not all teachers of this college".

There is a sufficient number of patients to carry out practical activities in the chosen specialty, according to the majority - 77.66%. 91.88% of respondents like to study at this college. 95.43% of the respondents answered that they are satisfied with the relationship with fellow students, colleagues, medical personnel. Experienced personally negative attitude of teachers more than 91.88% of students answered "no", 3.55% answered "it happened deservedly", 0.51% "answered yes is not fair", 4.06% answered "no answer". Satisfied that more than 89.85% of respondents study in this particular college, partly 9.14%, DO not know how to answer 1.02%. The majority of respondents believe that the college manual is available to students - 98.48%.

To the question "Are you currently in a scientific circle or participate in a scientific project", 34.01% answered "yes", and 45.08% - "no", doubt the answer - 2.54% plan to start - 15.23%, in the search for a research topic - 3.05%. 92.89% of the respondents are fully confident that college allows them to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the chosen specialty, but 0.51% are not sure about this, 5.08% cannot yet give an answer, 1.02% want to believe it, and 0.51% began to doubt. 94.92% are completely satisfied with the organization of teaching in the college, partially 4.06%, 1.45% doubt the answer.

The work of the external expert commission was assessed positively - 87.31% of the respondents, satisfactory - 8.12%, not satisfactory - 0%, 4.57% doubt the answer. In the opinion

of 84.77% of respondents answered yes that it is necessary to carry out accreditation of a college or educational programmes, 4.06% do not agree, at the same time, 3.05% did not know what kind of procedure it was, 8.12% doubt the answer.

To the question - have managers or teachers involved you in activities to prepare for institutional or specialized accreditations? 32.99% answered yes, when preparing the self-assessment report, 7.11% answered that for organizations meeting of external experts, 7.61% answered that at all stages of preparation, 0.51% "since I speak a foreign language", 6.6% refused to participate, 40.1% answered "no", 5.08% heard about accreditation for the first time when the commission arrived.

To the question - "Did you understand all the questions of this survey?" 83.25% answered yes, 8.12% partially, for 6.6% the questions were not clear, 1.52% considered that the questionnaire was useful.

**Conclusion:** The external expert commission of ECAQA determined that the college has a corporate culture and ethical behavior between all participants in the educational process, as well as a developed system of mentoring and consulting students on academic and personal issues. This leads to a positive attitude of students to the place of study. At the same time, students are involved in the work of advisory bodies on the development of the mission, discussion of the educational programme and the educational process. Positive feedback from social partners about the level of theoretical and practical preparedness of students during the period of industrial practice testifies to a fairly high level of quality of training in an educational institution.

**Areas for improvement:** It is recommended that work continues to attract students to develop research skills in specialized disciplines.

**Teacher survey results:** in total, the proposed questionnaire contains 26 questions. The number of teachers who answered - 38. (Attachment 7, 9.)

Pedagogical experience up to 5 years - 10.53%, from 5 to 10 years - 18.42%, over 10 years - 71.05%. The number of teachers in the specialties: 0301000 "General Medicine" -50%, 0302000 "Nursing" - 63.3%, 0304000 "Dentistry" -18.42%, 0305000 "Laboratory Diagnostics" - 7.89%, **0306000 "Pharmacy" - 26.32%**, 13.16% - "theoretical disciplines".

97.6% are satisfied with the organization of the educational process in college, partially - 0%, partially disagree with 26.26%. In college, ethics is observed, and subordination is considered by 97.37% of respondents, 2.63% - partially. 97.37% of respondents are completely satisfied with the organization of labor and workplace in college, partially - 2.63%, partially disagree - 0%. In the organization, there is an opportunity for career growth and development of teachers, 89.47% of respondents believe, and 7.89% - partially, 2.63% partially disagree.

In this educational organization, I have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research in the opinion of 89.47% of teachers. Wages are completely satisfied with 71.05%, no answer 2.63%, more yes than no - 18.42%, more no than yes - 7.89%. 94.74% of teachers are completely satisfied with the work of the personnel department and personnel policy, and partly - 5.26%. During this year, 44.74% of the respondents improved their qualifications in their specialty, less than 1 year ago - 36.84%, more than 3 years ago - 18.42%. More than 63.16% of the respondents characterize the microclimate in the team as satisfactory, 0% - unsatisfactory, 2.63% DO not pay attention to it, 34.21% are satisfied with everything. 92.11% of respondents believe that in college there is an opportunity to be realized professionally.

Of the respondents, 88.47% believe that the students of this educational organization have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training programme, 7.89% of teachers partially agree, 2.63% partially disagree.

To the question - evaluate the timeliness of the execution of applications for the acquisition of methodological and didactic materials, office equipment, stationery to ensure the

educational process in the organization 100% answered that it is being carried out in a timely manner.

To the question that the educational organization supports my participation in conferences (international, republican), 81.58% answered that travel expenses are paid, 2.63% DO not pay any expenses, 13.16% answered that they DO not apply to management on this matter, 2.63% did not give an answer. Fully 86.84% of respondents agree that students have free access to patients at clinical sites and all conditions for improving their practical skills, 7.89% partially agree, 2.63% strongly disagree, 2.63% doubt the answer. 60.53% of respondents spend up to 30% of the total time on the theoretical part of the lesson, and 13.16% of teachers spend 50% of the time, and 13.16% of respondents - about 70% of the time, no answer 13.16%, which changes the optimal balance of the organization of the educational process.

47.37% of respondents fully satisfy the level of prior training of students (residents) upon admission to training programmes, in part - 47.37%, 5.26% - no answer.

In response to the question about mentoring work, 2.63% wrote that they are mentors, 65.79% are a curator, 7.89% are a tutor, I am not a mentor or a curator - 21.05%, 2.63% had no answer.

34.21% of respondents are not involved in clinical work, 2.63% prevail in teaching, 7.89% believe that it is optimal to combine teaching and clinical activities, 2.63% believe that it is difficult, 50% DO not engage in clinical work.

89.47% of respondents are aware that the college implements programmes of social support for teachers, 2.63% have already used this programme, 5.26% answered no, 2.63% are not aware of this. To the question- DO the heads of the organization listen to your opinion in relation to questions on the educational process, educational work, research work, clinical work 78.95% answered that systematically, 15.79% answered that sometimes, 2.63% rather rarely, 2.63% no answer. 76.32% high, 21.05% of teachers assess their professional level as average, 2.63% find it difficult to answer. 94.74% of teachers believe that this survey is useful for developing recommendations for improving the key areas of activity of their organizations, 5.26% partially disagree. The availability of the manual was assessed by 100% of the respondents. Teachers use different teaching methods.

**Conclusions:** the team has a corporate spirit and support from the management. The basic education of the entire teaching staff fully complies with the requirements for the content of student training, carried out in general, humanitarian, general - professional, special disciplines and meets the goals, objectives and areas of educational activities of the college. Job descriptions of teaching staff correspond to the typical qualification characteristics of the positions of teaching staff and persons equated to them. The teachers are satisfied with the working conditions and the organization of the educational process, at the same time it is necessary to equip special disciplines with qualified teachers, to strengthen the issues of advanced training.

**Areas for improvement:** continue to work on strengthening the teaching staff with masters, bachelors of clinical disciplines.

### 3.3 Conclusions from external expert evaluation

As part of an external expert evaluation of the college for compliance with the ECAQA Specialized Accreditation Standards by members EECs are carefully studied and evaluated main indicators of the organization.

The information obtained by external experts during the study of the self-assessment report, preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, interviews with management, employees of departments, study of documentation, during interviews with 22 administrative workers, interviews with students, teachers, 9 employers, and questionnaires 712 students, 71 teachers, including part-time workers. All information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, which made it possible to make sure that the information

provided by the college and supporting documents for compliance with the above-mentioned ECAQA Accreditation Standards was valid and validated.

During external expert evaluation, studied 27 documents (Attachment 2) and videos on learning resources, which made it possible to identify the conformity of the activity college accreditation standards...

Recommendations for improving the college's activities for compliance with the Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of the expert evaluation, were presented at a meeting with the management on April 30, 2021.

Thus, the external assessment and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the specialized college self-assessment report in full.

For the work of EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the college, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

#### **4. Analysis for compliance with the accreditation standards of the educational programme 0306013 "Pharmacy" and an overview of the strengths for each standard**

##### **Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES**

The expert commission received convincing data that in PHMC has a developed mission, goals and objectives, a strategic plan corresponding to the national policy in the field of vocational education. External and internal missions, vision, principles of activity and a strategic plan for the development of the college are determined in accordance with the stated goals and objectives, as well as the available resources: financial, material and technical, personnel, taking into account the needs of the market and the region represented. The collective of the college sets itself the task of training qualified and competent specialists of the appropriate level and profile, competitive in the labor market, fluent in their specialty, capable of effective work at the level of world standards.

The strategic plan, mission and objectives were developed, discussed and approved at a meeting of the Pedagogical Council (Minutes No. 1 of August 29, 2020).

All structural divisions of the college are engaged in planning and analyzing educational activities. Representatives of practical health care, from among employers, teaching staff, students were involved in the formation and revision of the strategic plan and mission. The strategic plan and mission statement is available on the website in three languages, posted in an accessible place, indicating transparency and accessibility. The college directs its activities to the formation of basic and professional competencies, a harmoniously developed personality, education of a citizen capable of posing and solving problems taking into account social, ethical, cultural, environmental factors. The final learning outcomes of the educational programme take into account the role of graduates in the health care system and are focused on the preparation of a competent specialist.

The college is guided by the principles of active and mutually beneficial integration with practical Health care, in cooperation with educational and medical organizations. The strategic plan defines the strategic directions of the formation of the professional competence of a specialist, ensuring the flexibility of educational programmes with a focus on the needs of practical health care, the priorities of the national health care system.

The level of development of each competence is carried out through an annual survey of employers and an analysis of the level of satisfaction with new competencies and the final control carried out by the NCIE.

##### **Proof:**

- Strategic plan for the development of PSE on REM "Pavlodar Higher Medical College";
- Plans of work of the structural divisions of the college;

- Minutes of meetings of collegial bodies (pedagogical council, council method, CMC meetings).

**The strengths of the PSE on the REM "Pavlodar Higher Medical College» which include:**

- the college is an accredited educational institution ([www.pvlmedcollege.kz](http://www.pvlmedcollege.kz));
- has the status of the Higher Medical College;
- internal control and analysis of the activities of the college is carried out;
- recognition of the college's merits in the Republic of Kazakhstan and abroad in the educational sphere;
- the trust of potential and real consumers of educational services;

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 9 standards conform: completely - 7, significantly - 2, partially - 0, Do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 1: completed**

***There are no recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit.***

## **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

The expert commission received convincing data that the educational programme in the specialty 0306000 "Pharmacy", 0306013 qualification "Pharmacist" corresponds to the mission, goals, objectives and strategic plan of the college and is focused on the training of competitive specialists based on innovative technologies of the educational process, new forms of education in the field of medical education, development of social partnership. The training process is carried out on the basis of normative educational and methodological, legal documents and allows you to conduct high-quality training of specialists in accordance with the standards. In this specialty of TVE, 1 course are trained according to the State Educational Standard of Education in 2020, approved by order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 21, 2020 No. KP DSM-12/2020;

The college uses modern methods - innovative teaching technologies, active teaching methods: role-based teaching methods, preclinical imitation teaching, problem-situational learning, developing learning technologies, information, student-centered methods, design method, "Case technologies", "Problematic learning technologies », CBL, TBL, PBL and others, which enable students to fully master professional competencies.

When implementing the EP, PHMC provides integration both vertically, taking into account interdisciplinary connections, pre-requisites and post-requisites for the studied subject, and horizontally, within one or different modules, pursuing the final results in the form of basic and professional competencies. The content of the industrial (clinical) and professional (pre-diploma) practice meets the requirements of the State Educational Standard of Education, WC, RUP of practices, qualification requirements and is implemented in accordance with the professional competencies of future mid-level specialists, in TVE, and post-secondary levels. Practical skills training is carried out in classrooms and pharmaceutical organizations of the city of Pavlodar and Pavlodar region.

Educational work is carried out on the basis of the President's programme articles: "Looking into the future: modernization of public consciousness", strategic documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan: the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Marriage and Family", the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On the rights of the child in the Republic of Kazakhstan ", the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan " On religious activity and religious associations ", articles by N. Nazarbayev" Looking into the future: modernization of public consciousness ", "Seven faces of the Great Steppe ", anti-corruption strategy of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2015-2025, The Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On State Youth Policy", the State Programme "Digital Kazakhstan" and on the basis of the priority directions of the "Rukhani Zhagryu" programme. The organization of educational work with students is carried out by all

structural units: curators, heads of departments, subject circles, in sports sections, volunteer movement.

The teaching staff of the medical college of all structural divisions of the college and advisory bodies (PC, MS, EMC, etc.) and social partners participate in the management of the EP.

To verify the results of educational programmes in the college, a feedback mechanism has been created with the labor market and employers, conducted in the form of interviews with chief nurses of medical organizations and leaders.

**Proof:**

- Curriculum documentation (curriculum, standard working curricula and programmes;
- electronic library system;
- contracts with 32 medical organizations, which are approved by order No. 707 of the Pavlodar Oblast Department of Health care dated 15.10.

**The strengths of the PHMC have been identified, which include:**

- availability of information and methodological support;
- the educational programme has a practical focus;
- qualified teaching staff, skillfully applying active methods and information technologies of teaching;
- introduction of elements of credit technology and innovative teaching methods into the educational process;
- attractiveness of the specialty 0306000 "Pharmacy" among applicants;
- a sufficient level of employment, which is proof of the competitiveness of graduates;
- introduction of disciplines determined by the educational organization, taking into account the demand in the labor market;
- the opportunity for students to choose an individual learning path according to EP;
- established contacts with pharmaceutical organizations of the city and region;

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.*** Out of 19 standards conform: fully-14, significantly - 5, partially - 0, Do not correspond - 0.

***Standard 2: completed***

***Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:***

1. To wider involve students and employers in the development of educational programmes.
2. Make changes to the algorithm for performing research work.

**Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS**

The expert commission received convincing evidence that the current assessment system in the college is based on regulatory legal documents. The college demonstrates an effective continuous mechanism for internal quality assessment and examination of educational programmes by monitoring the quality of education, various types of control over the training of students. Assessment is carried out for all key end results and for all types of activity and is carried out in the college through current, midterm control, differentiated credits, intermediate and final controls in the disciplines of the curriculum of the specialty according to the working curriculum. Students are assessed in linear and distance formats. In a remote format, it is carried out by means of: Google Classroom, Owl, Zoom, Skype; meet.google, text and test tasks on the Sova platform.

The college monitors the types of control: intermediate certification, final control, cutting knowledge by discipline and certification and is heard at meetings (CMC, methodological, pedagogical councils, department council, at the head office). The general policy on student assessment, including the timing of the assessment, assessment criteria, methods and forms of conduct, is reflected in the syllabuses of each discipline. Syllabuses for disciplines are developed by teachers, reviewed at the CMC and approved by the college methodological council. The forms of the final control of academic disciplines correspond to the State Educational Standard

of the Republic of Kazakhstan and TUP of academic disciplines, are annually discussed and approved at meetings of the CMC, EMC of the college. There is evidence of the involvement of social partners in assessing the professional competencies of students, corrective action by the college staff learning outcomes. The principles, methods and practice of assessing educational achievement are comparable to the methods of teaching and teaching and guarantee the achievement of the final results by the learners. The policy of assessing the educational achievements of students is objective and transparent (reference guide, information stands, at meetings of the headman, CMC, through the curator and heads of departments). Proof:

- Test and measurement materials in traditional and electronic format on platforms GoogleClassroom, Owl, Zoom, Skype; meet.google.
- Theoretical and practical journals in paper and electronic format;
- Personal data of students;
- Grade books and statements.

**The strengths of the PHMC have been identified, which include:**

- conducting the level of education, taking into account the standards and modern quality requirements;
- assessment of students is carried out using sequential procedures based on criteria and developed provisions;
- Satisfaction of participants in educational activities with the quality of educational services;
- creation of favorable conditions for quality education;
- stable positive% of academic performance when passing the final state certification of graduates;
- ensuring the objectivity of learning outcomes and the competitiveness of graduates.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria** conform from 5 standards: completely - 4, significantly - 1, partially - 0, DO not correspond - 0.

**Standard 3: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none**

**Standard 4: STUDENTS**

Admission of citizens to the PSE on REM "Pavlodar Higher Medical College" is carried out on the basis of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education", Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 18, 2018 No. educational programmes of technical and vocational, post-secondary education ", the State Service Standard" Reception of documents in the organization of technical and vocational, post-secondary education ", the Rules for admission to the PSE on the REM " Pavlodar Higher Medical College ", Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 264 dated 02.28.12 "On the approval of the size of the admission quota upon admission to study in educational organizations that implement educational programmes of technical and professional, post-secondary and higher education ".

The admission rules indicate the requirements for candidates and a list of required documents. Annually, the director of the college approves the composition of the selection committee, examination and appeal commissions, and appoints responsible and technical secretaries. The executive secretaries familiarize the members of the commission with the admission rules, requirements for the admission of documents, the admission plan, the conditions for the entrance examinations and the appeal procedure. They draw up the minutes of application submission and enrollment of applicants, admission reports.

The selection process for students begins with the acceptance of applications from applicants, personal files are formed, psychometric testing is carried out. There is a schedule of entrance examinations approved by the director of the college. Materials for entrance examinations are developed and provided immediately before the start of the exam. The results of entrance exams are posted on the day of the exam on information boards and on the college website. Applicants have the right to submit an application to the Appeals Commission. All

decisions are recorded, the enrollment of applicants is carried out at an open meeting. The selection procedure is carried out in accordance with the current Admission Rules. This year, the admission of applicants was carried out both traditionally and online. In connection with the pandemic in 2020, psychometric testing was admission to the competition,

There are conditions to support the health of students - a first-aid post, a sports hall, the necessary sports equipment and inventory, sports clubs and sections, a sports ground on the territory of the college. At the beginning of the academic year, newly admitted students are provided with guidebooks, which provide information about the history, traditions of the college, internal regulations, operating hours of all services, telephone directories, information about the administration, teachers of the department.

In the college, the educational and production department, headed by the deputy director for educational and production work, is responsible for the employment of graduates. The percentage of employment is carried out through the analysis of certificates issued by the State Center for Internal Affairs, requests to medical organizations in the city and region averaged 86%. There is a subject circle for EP.

To activate the work of youth self-government and the development of their leadership skills, a student council functions in the college. Students are involved in the work of advisory bodies and structural divisions. There is a detailed description of the educational work being carried out, its directions of types, methods and achievements. Students left without parental care receive social assistance. Psychological support is provided by a psychologist.

**Proof:**

- materials of the selection committee (statements, orders, personal files of applicants, registration logs of applicants, minutes of meetings of the selection committee);
- questionnaire materials of students and employers;
- reviews of employers about college graduates;
- regulations on the student council, reports on the work of the student council, minutes of meetings);
- reports on educational work.

**The strengths of PHMC have been identified, which include:**

- sufficient level of training of students, corresponding to the requirements of the health care system;
- formation of students' practical skills, taking into account the real needs of health care development;
- the presence of a student self-government system in the college;
- systems of social support for students;
- updating the material and technical base in accordance with the training requirements;
- regulation of college admission by collecting direct applications from medical organizations, accounting for employment indicators of graduates in each specialty;
- the presence of a council of curators, as a form of adaptation and academic counseling, students for the purpose of planning a professional career;
- the policy and criteria for admission to college are objectively transparent and public;
- the attractive status of the college as a prestigious and competitive educational institution for applicants;
- a variety of forms of student activity (participation in events of an international, republican, regional scale, etc.);
- availability of a sports hall and sports ground.

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.*** Out of 13 standards conform: fully - 9, significantly - 4, partially - 0, Do not correspond - 0

***Standard 4: completed***

***Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit***

1. Provide and find opportunities for preferential conditions of education for people from socially vulnerable groups of the population on a contractual basis.

### **Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF / FACULTY**

The expert commission received convincing data that in college there is an effective system of motivation, stimulation of the activities of teachers and young teachers, professional development of teaching staff and AMP. Personnel policy is aimed at increasing the Continuing Professional development of teachers and increasing the effectiveness of collective efforts to realize the mission and goals of the college.

The staffing of the educational process is carried out in compliance with the qualification requirements for the leaders, pedagogical workers of the educational organization and persons equated to them, approved by Order No. 338 of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 07/13/2009 (as amended on 04/30/2020), as well as in accordance with criteria for assessing the competence of the teaching staff and the effectiveness of the quality of teaching. Personnel policy is carried out in accordance with the College's Strategic Development Plan for 2017-2021. The college management on an ongoing basis analyzes the quantitative and qualitative composition of teachers, as well as regularly monitors and evaluates teaching activities.

The teaching staff is formed based on the needs for the effective implementation of educational programmes, as well as on the basis of the total academic load of 1080 hours per year on the basis of the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 77 dated December 31, 2013.

Professional development of teachers is carried out in different training centers: the branch "National Center for Advanced Studies" Orleu ", NJSC" TALAP ", on the basis of medical universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In the 2021-2021 academic year, 41 teachers on topical issues of medicine and pedagogy improved their professional qualifications.

The process of improving the qualifications of college teachers is an established and operational structure of education, systematic, planned and aimed at improving work in this direction. The theoretical and practical knowledge of specialists is being updated in connection with the increased requirements for the level of qualifications and the need to master modern methods of solving professional problems. There is works inside the college - self-education of teachers, participation in training seminars. College teachers publish their work in collections of international conferences and on the pages of publications of various levels, develop teaching aids and manuals, publish articles in periodicals, collections of materials of scientific and practical conferences.

Every year students of the specialty 0306000 "Pharmacy" of the college, under the guidance of teachers, take part in international, republican, regional, city, scientific and practical conferences, competitions. In their speeches, students demonstrate creativity, scientific thinking, a sufficient level of intellectual development, language training, the ability to navigate in the material under study and in the modern information environment.

On the international level - scientific and practical conference of students and teachers with international participation "Preventive aspects of railway medicine" - Vermenich Yu.V., 2nd year student of specialty 0306000 "Pharmacy" - Certificate, Grigorenko A.G., teacher of special disciplines

At the republican level Olympiads for schoolchildren and students in the Kazakh language, Republican educational center "Globus", Almaty

- Mukhamedyarova D., Khizhnikova A., Chembura A., 1st year students of specialty 0306000 "Pharmacy" - win prizes, Musabekova A.A., teacher of the professional Kazakh language.

in biology - Zhakenova D., Fedorenko A., Mukhamedyarova D., 1st year students of specialty 0306000 "Pharmacy" - 1st place, Nazarenko L.N., teacher of general professional

disciplines.

Republican distance Olympiad "Hippocrates", Intellectual center "Urker mitec", Nur-Sultan- Saitova A., Chudevich L, Tyschenko V., Dyusembenova D, 2nd year students of the specialty 0306000t "Pharmacy" -1 place, Grigorenko A.G. teacher of special disciplines.

**Proof:**

- personal files of teachers;
- orders for the recruitment of teachers;
- work plans and materials;
- personal data of teachers.

**The strengths of PHMC have been identified, which include:**

- availability of qualified teaching staff;
- a rating system for assessing the competence of the teaching staff;
- a systematic process of improving the qualifications of teachers;
- introduction of innovative pedagogical technologies;
- availability of international cooperation to increase the capacity of teaching staff;
- the use of innovative and active learning technologies.
- creating a health-saving environment for employees and students.

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.*** With correspond from 4 standards: completely - 3, significantly - 1, partially - 0, DO not correspond - 0.

***Standard 5: completed***

***Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit***

1. continue work to provide young teachers with social support
2. to resume the work of the school for improving pedagogical skills.

**Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

The expert commission received convincing evidence that the college has an assortment of material and technical, informational library resources; methodological, scientific literature on paper and electronic media in the context of specialty, which are constantly updated, replenished taking into account the relevance and reform of the health care system of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and are used both in college and on practical bases.

The available resources in sufficient volume comply with the requirements of the State Educational Standard of Education and regulatory legal acts, correspond to the stated mission, strategic goals and are available for teachers and students of the college. There is a positive trend in the acquisition, renewal, and replenishment of material and technical resources. The college is constantly working on the development and updating of material and technical equipment, the introduction of information technology in studying process. Pavlodar Higher Medical College actively interacts with both international educational institutions and organizations of the republican and regional level. The college concluded agreements:

- Finland - memorandum of cooperation in the field of Health care, medical education and science (30.11.2012)
- with the budgetary educational institution of the Omsk region "Medical College" (07.10.2015)
- with the educational institution "Gomel State Medical College" (01.02.2017 for 3 years)
- with the State Autonomous Educational Institution of Secondary Professional Education "Kazan Medical College" (March 13, 2017 for 3 years)
- with Karaganda State Medical University (May 2018 5 years)
- GOU "Republican Medical College", Dushanbe
- LLC "Medical and Social College" Tajikistan.
- LLP "Gaudeamus Plus" (International educational holding), Nur-Sultan
- NJSC "Toraigyrov University".
- RPO "Medical youth"
- "Innovative Eurasian University"

The management and teaching staff of the college is actively expanding the areas of cooperation, both at the international level and at the republican and regional levels.

**Proof:**

- circle work materials;
- agreements with international partners and work plans.

**The strengths of PHMC have been identified, which include:**

- the availability of modern simulation dummies, computer and interactive equipment;
- availability of an electronic library system;
- availability of an official college website with information about its activities in three languages;
- development of a safe environment system for students and staff (fire alarm, video surveillance, license protection, etc.);
- the presence of its own educational and clinical center with a simulation center;
- replenishment with mannequins and dummies of classrooms for practical training;
- wide coverage of clinical bases for practical training;

***Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.*** Out of 13 standards conform: completely - 8, significantly - 5, partially - 0, DO not correspond - 0.

***Standard 6: completed***

***Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:***

1. supplement and purchase electronic educational publications and virtual laboratories under the educational programme 0306000 "Pharmacy".
2. to develop provisions on the choice of elective disciplines
3. to equip and update the computer park with computers of the modern generation.
4. to strengthen and expand international cooperation on EP

**Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION**

The expert commission received convincing evidence that the assessment of educational programmes is carried out on the basis of the progress and quality of knowledge of students, data from monitoring the satisfaction of students, teaching staff and employers, as well as the achievements of students. To study and evaluate educational programmes in the college, there is a mechanism for reviewing and agreeing from employers, receiving feedback from students, teachers by means of questionnaires, surveys, monitoring the educational achievements of students based on the results of the current, intermediate, final certification with discussion at a meeting of the CMC, discussing the results of educational indicators for half a year at the teachers' council, receiving feedback from the chairmen of the SJSC representatives of social partners on the level of professional competence of graduates.

Students' knowledge and skills are assessed by discipline based on the results of six months. Every year, a cross-section of knowledge is carried out in subjects submitted for interim and final certification with an analysis of the results. Intracollege control is carried out on the quality of teaching certain disciplines of the specialty and the state of educational and methodological documentation. Internal monitoring of the activities of the college and its divisions is carried out in accordance with internal regulations and is of a planned nature. Based on the results of the audit, the head of the audited department develops corrective actions aimed at preventing the possibility of the occurrence of identified inconsistencies in the future. The college systematically conducts research on the expectations and satisfaction of teachers, employees, employers,

Employment of graduates for the period 2016-2020 Averages 95%.

**Proof:**

The results of the analysis of the survey and the questionnaire of students of 1 - 3 courses;  
Minutes of the CMC meetings;

Materials of pedagogical methodological councils, materials of HMC;

Materials of anonymous surveys of employers.

**The strengths of PHMC have been identified, which include:**

- compliance and implementation of the educational programme of the State Educational Standard of Education 2016; 2020
- sufficient material and technical base;
- qualified teaching staff;
- successful passing of an independent assessment of knowledge by graduates during the IA;
- effective interaction with social partners;
- collecting feedback from teachers and students at different levels and using a variety of methods;
- a high level of satisfaction of students with the quality of the educational process, teachers - with the results of their work;
- participation of employers in the coordination and review of educational programmes, programmes of professional practice, in the assessment of knowledge, skills and abilities of students.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 10 standards conform: completely - 9, significantly - 1, partially - 0, DO not correspond - 0.

**Standard 7: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit**

1. to resume work on the QMS

**Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION**

The expert commission received convincing evidence that the current organizational structure of the college is developed in accordance with the mission, goals and objectives of the PHMC... The staff structure of the college management determines the composition of the divisions and the list of college positions (Director, deputy director, heads of departments, chairmen of the CMC). College divisions are formal groups of workers responsible for a specific set of functions. (Pedagogical council, supervisory council, methodical council, council of curators). The qualifications of the heads of structural divisions correspond to the tasks of management. There is a base of internal and external regulations governing all the main processes. The openness and availability of managers and administration for students, teachers and parents is demonstrated, responding promptly and resolving any questions that arise. The internal routine of the college is represented by a complete list of constituent, legislative documents, regulatory legal acts and instructive standards that determine the activities of an educational institution and TVE in general.

The college demonstrates an efficient and stable financing mechanism, planning, accountability, openness and transparency of budget allocation on the principle of publicity.

**Proof:**

- college charter;
- strategic development plan;
- job responsibilities of employees;
- provisions, recommendations;
- order book;
- book of registration of incoming and outgoing documents;
- work plans of structural divisions;
- inner order rules;
- nomenclature of cases.

**The strengths of PHMC have been identified, which include:**

- the college developed the structure of management and administration of the main and auxiliary processes, established the responsibility of the structural divisions and staff of the college;

-the college carries out constructive interaction with the health sector, society and government, which contributes to the provision of qualified specialists in accordance with the needs of the community.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 12 standards conform: completely - 7, significantly - 5, partially - 0, DO not correspond - 0.

**Standard 8: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1. Plan and increase the number of events with social partners in the form of conferences, round tables and seminars.

## **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

The expert commission received convincing evidence that what to The college continuously improves the quality of the educational services it provides. The goals of the college's strategic development plan are updated taking into account changes in health care needs, regulatory documents, and transformations in society. The strategic plan was revised in 2017, in connection with the early implementation of the goals of the College Development Concept, reorganization by transforming and changing the status of the college into the Pavlodar Higher Medical College PSE on REM. In 2016, the college passed the procedure of institutional and specialized accreditation, in subsequent years, post-accreditation monitoring. With the transition to KMTO in the specialty 0306000 "Pharmacy" with qualification 0306013 "Pharmacist", the requirements for the training of specialists were revised, more attention is paid to the process of independent acquisition of knowledge.

Planning is carried out based on the results of an analysis of the existing needs of the college, taking into account current activities, in accordance with previous experience and prospects for the future. The college regularly analyzes the activities of the teaching staff, in order to eliminate deficiencies, as well as when developing a strategy, quality policy and revising the organizational structure and functions. Resources are continuously allocated based on ongoing analyzes for continuous improvement.

**Proof:**

Strategic plan.

**The strengths of PHMC have been identified, which include:**

- the Mission, Vision, Strategic Development Plan for 2017-2021 were developed, including goals, objectives, activities and target indicators aimed at training competitive specialists focused on work in multidisciplinary medical organizations capable of operating in market conditions;
- constant updating of educational programmes in accordance with changes in the demographic situation, morbidity structure, socio-economic and cultural conditions;
- participation of the college in Republican projects and competitions.
- the ability to establish good relations with all interested parties (MoH RK, Akimat of Pavlodar region, health department of the city and region, medical and pharmaceutical organizations).

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 4 standards conform: completely - 3, significantly - 1, partially - 0, DO not correspond - 0.

**Standard 9: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1. Expand the catalog of online and video tutorials.

Thus, all 9 accreditation standards have been met, no inconsistencies in the fulfillment of the criteria of each of the basic accreditation standards in the process of analyzing the self-assessment report and conducting the examination as part of the tasks of the external expert evaluation programme were found.

## **5. Recommendations for improving the specialized activities of PHMC:**

1. Involve students and employers more widely in the development of educational programmes.

2. Plan and increase the number of events with social partners in the form of conferences, round tables and seminars.
3. Retrofit and update the computer park with computers of the modern generation.
4. Purchase and supplement the library fund with electronic educational publications, virtual laboratories according to the educational programme 0306000 "Pharmacy".
5. Expand the catalog of online and video lessons in special disciplines.
6. Make changes to the algorithm for performing research work.
7. Develop provisions on the choice of elective disciplines.
8. Strengthen and expand international cooperation on EP.
9. Continue work to provide young teachers with social support.
10. To resume the work of the school for improving pedagogical skills, QMS.
11. Provide and find opportunities for preferential conditions of education for people from socially vulnerable groups of the population on a contractual basis.

#### 6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

According to the results of the expert evaluation of the educational programme in the specialty 0306013 "Pharmacy" of the State Enterprise on the REM "Pavlodar Higher Medical College" of the Department of Health of the Pavlodar region for compliance with the accreditation Standards of the organization of educational programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties of technical and vocational education, the members of the EEC came to a unanimous opinion to recommend the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit the above-mentioned educational programme for a period of 5 years.

Chairperson of the External Expert Commission

Tokbergenova Gulmira Telmanovna

Foreign expert

Oleinikova Tatiana Anatolyevna

National Academic Expert

Kumarova Altynai Baltabaevna

National Academic Expert

Abzhanova Zhanar Soltanovna

National Academic Expert

Evdomashchenko Tamara Vitalievna

National Academic Expert

Suleimenova Asel Askhatovna

Expert representative of Health care

Kasenova Asem Tolegenovna

Expert student representative

Tolegen Dana Meiramkyzy

Observer from ECAQA

Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
  
\_\_\_\_\_  
  
\_\_\_\_\_  
  
\_\_\_\_\_  
  
\_\_\_\_\_  
  
\_\_\_\_\_  
  
\_\_\_\_\_  
  
\_\_\_\_\_  
  
\_\_\_\_\_

## Attachment 1

### List of documents requested by EEC members during the period of external expert evaluation

No.	Names of documents	Quantity
1.	Strategic plan	1
2.	Constituent documents	6
3.	Job descriptions	10
4.	Regulations, rules for all structural divisions	23
5.	Personal files of students for all EP (optional)	5
6.	Personal files of teachers (optional)	4
7.	RUPs, TUPs for all EPs and disciplines (selectively)	6
8.	EMCD for all EP (optional)	4
9.	Work plans of structural divisions	5
10.	College annual work plan	1
11.	Personal data of students	25
12.	Personal data of teachers	20
13.	Name book	1
14.	Minutes of meetings of the National Assembly, administrative meetings, council method, pedagogical council	4
15.	Materials of the intracollegiate council and QMS	6
16.	Teacher publications	4
17.	Library stock accounting book	1
18.	Clinical base contracts	21
19.	International cooperation agreements	5
20.	Orders for personnel	3
21.	Student orders	4
22.	Theoretical and Practical Learning Journals	4
23.	Student progress books	7
24.	Syllabuses, educational programmes for EP (optional)	4
25.	Schedule of the educational process	1

## Attachment 2

### Quality profile and criteria for external assessment (generalization) of specialty 0306000 "Pharmacy" PHMC for compliance with the Standards of specialized accreditation of organizations of technical and vocational education

Standard	Criteria for evaluation		Grade			
			Totally coincides	Significantly matches	Partially compliant	Does not match
	Number of standards = BS * / IS					
1.	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	9	7	2	0	0

<b>2.</b>	<b>EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME</b>	<b>19</b>	<b>14</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>3.</b>	<b>ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>4.</b>	<b>STUDENTS</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>5.</b>	<b>ACADEMIC STAFF / FACULTY</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>6.</b>	<b>EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES</b>	<b>13</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>7.</b>	<b>PROGRAMME EVALUATION</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>8</b>	<b>GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>9</b>	<b>CONTINUOUS RENEWAL</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
	<b>Total:</b>	<b>89</b>	<b>64</b>	<b>25</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>