

To the Accreditation Council of the  
Eurasian Center for Accreditation  
and Quality Assurance  
of Education and Health Care  
13.12.2025

**REPORT  
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION  
ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF LLP "ACADEMY OF  
INNOVATIVE REPRODUCTIVE TECHNOLOGIES - ECOMED" FOR  
COMPLIANCE WITH THE INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION  
STANDARDS OF ORGANIZATIONS OF ADDITIONAL AND NON-FORMAL  
EDUCATION (CONTINUOUS PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT)**

**External expert evaluation period: February 26-27, 2025**

**Almaty, 2025**



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	List of designations and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1	Presentation of the LLP “Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies - Ecomed”	4
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	5
2.3	Brief description of the report on institutional self-assessment of the LLP “Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies - Ecomed” for compliance with the institutional accreditation standards of organizations of additional and non-formal education (CPD) and conclusions	5
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	6
4.	Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of external evaluation of the LLP “Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies - Ecomed”	8
5.	Recommendations for improving the educational activities of the LLP “Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies - Ecomed”	24
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	25
	Annex 1. Institutional quality profile and external evaluation criteria of the LLP “Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies - Ecomed”	26
	Annex 2. List of documents reviewed as part of the external expert evaluation	27
	Annex 3. Program of the visit to the organization by the external expert commission	30



## LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

<b>Abbreviation</b>	<b>Designation</b>
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Health Care
AIRT	LLP "Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies - Ecomed"
ART	assisted reproductive technologies
MSHE	Ministry of Science and Higher Education
MH RK	Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan
AT	Advanced training
NFE	Non-formal education
EP	Educational program
AC	Academic Council
DSPE	Department of Science and Postgraduate Education
DCA	Department of Clinical Activities
TS	Teaching staff
CPD	Continuous professional development
LEC	Local Ethics Committee
CSh	Course schedule
EP	Educational program
SC	Standard curriculum
WC	Working curriculum
КЭД	Catalog of elective disciplines
ИУП	Individual Educational Plan



### 1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with the order of the ECAQA under No.7 dated 10.02.2025, the External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external institutional evaluation of the LLP “Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies – Ecomed” during the period of February 26-27, 2025, consisting of the following members:

No.	Status as part of the EEC	Full name	Academic degree/title, position, place of work/place of study, year of study, specialty
1	Chairperson	KURMANOVA ALMAGUL MEDEUBAYEVNA	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Obstetrics and Gynecology at the Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi, Science Advisor at JSC “Scientific Center for Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology”
2	International expert	YESHIMBETOVA GULSARA ZAKIROVNA	Professor of the Department of Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatal Medicine of the Center for Development of Professional Qualifications of Medical Workers, Tashkent Member of the International Federation of Gynecologists and Obstetricians (FIGO), member of the board of the Association of Obstetricians and Gynecologists of the Republic of Uzbekistan
3	Academic expert	KAIDAULOV MUKHTAR KENZHEBEKOVICH	Master of Medical Sciences, Head of the Training Center Republican State Enterprise on the Right of Economic Management "National Scientific Center of Phthisiopulmonology of the Republic of Kazakhstan" of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan
4	Academic expert	IBRAYEVA AINAKUL AIFOVNA	Medical expert, head of patient support and internal expertise at the International Clinical Center for Reproductive Medicine PERSONA, expert in external comprehensive assessment of medical organizations
5	ECAQA Observer	UMAROVA MAKPAL ALDIBEKOVNA	Head of the Accreditation and Monitoring Department of the NU "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Health Care"

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulation on the EEC.



The EEC report includes a description of the results and the conclusion of the external evaluation of the LLP “Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies – Ecomed” for compliance with the Standards of institutional accreditation of organizations of additional and non-formal education (continuous professional development) (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC on improving the main types of activities and recommendations for the Accreditation Council of the ECAQA.

## 2. General part of the final report

### 2.1 Presentation of the LLP “Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies – Ecomed”

Name of the organization, legal form of ownership, BIN	LLP "Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies - Ecomed", 100140012285
Governing body	Academic Council
Full name of the first manager	Doctor of Biological Sciences, Professor Baikoshkarova Saltanat Berdenovna
Date of establishment	Initial state registration - January 25, 2010, re-registration - October 29, 2019.
Location and contact details	Kazakhstan, Astana city, Saryarka district, Saryarka Avenue, building 1, VP-3, postal code 010000, phone: 87003170101 e-mail address: <a href="mailto:academy@ecomед.kz">academy@ecomед.kz</a> ,
State license for educational activities - date, number (if applicable)	not applicable
Information on branches, subsidiaries (if any)	14 medical centers
Year of commencement of implementation of <b>additional and non-formal education</b> programs, total number of programs and number of students trained	Start year – 2020. Total number of additional education programs - 29, with a volume of 60, 120, 180 hours Total number of non-formal education programs – 6, with a volume of 40 hours. Total number of students trained – 343
Number of listeners in the current year	10
Full-time teachers/part-time workers involved in the implementation of additional education programs, incl. % of degree	Total number of teachers - 41, including full-time - 7, part-time - 34.  Proportion of degree holders, % - 43.9
The presence of a division responsible for the educational process in additional and non-formal education	Name: Department of Science and Postgraduate Education Year of establishment: 2024 Head: Kulanchiyeva Zhanna Arapbayevna
Number of scientific projects over 5 years	4 STP
Number of international treaties over 5 years	4 (Russia, Turkey, Japan, Singapore)
Website Instagram Facebook with active pages	<a href="https://ecomед.kz/institut-vrt/">https://ecomед.kz/institut-vrt/</a> <a href="https://www.instagram.com/ecomед.kz">https://www.instagram.com/ecomед.kz</a> <a href="https://www.facebook.com/ecomедplusastana?_rdr">https://www.facebook.com/ecomедplusastana?_rdr</a>
Information on accreditation as a	Certificate of Accreditation in the field of healthcare

[ECAQA\\_ Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance of Education and Health Care](#)



medical organization (date, No., period)	No.KZ69VEG00012715 dated 11.10.2022, for 3 years; Certificate of Institutional Accreditation IA No.0036 dated 25.12.2019, for 3 years
--	---

### **Strengths of the LLP “Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies – Ecomed” and achievements over 5 years:**

LLP "Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies - Ecomed" (AIRT) is an educational center in the field of reproductive medicine, with a network of its own medical centers throughout Kazakhstan, equipped with modern advanced equipment in the field of assisted reproductive technologies (ART).

AIRT was established in 2019 on the basis of the “Ecomed” Medical Center, which has a 30-year history of infertility treatment, starting with the first Kazakhstani "test tube" child to a dynamically developing organization implementing medical, scientific and educational projects.

Currently, more than 25 thousand ART cycles have been performed in AIRT clinics, more than 16 thousand children have been born using the IVF method, the effectiveness of the program is 51%. Laboratories in accredited clinics are equipped with modern high-tech equipment; artificial intelligence technologies EmbryoScope +, Single Embryo Transfer, MACS are used; there are their own banks of donors and surrogate mothers. In 2020-2024, the Academy implemented 27 educational programs, including advanced training (22) and non-formal education (5) for specialists in obstetrics and gynecology, reproductive medicine and embryology for 225 students; professional internships abroad and with the involvement of international trainers at the “workplace” for the clinic employees; international scientific and practical conferences on topical issues in the field of reproductive medicine are held annually.

The structure of AIRT includes the Academic Council, the Local Ethics Commission and the School of Innovative Reproductive Technologies.

### **2.2 Information about previous accreditation**

This is the first time that institutional accreditation for compliance with ECAQA standards has been carried out.

### **2.3 Brief description of the report on institutional self-assessment of the LLP “Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies – Ecomed” for compliance with the Standards of institutional accreditation of organizations of additional and non-formal (CPD) education and conclusions**

The institutional self-assessment report of the LLP “Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies – Ecomed” is presented on 127 pages of the main text, 15 pages of annexes, with electronic versions of documents located at the link [https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1YgC4pN4cRBMIVw2s-2C3-T\\_zeGLH1b84?hl=ru](https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1YgC4pN4cRBMIVw2s-2C3-T_zeGLH1b84?hl=ru)

The report is characterized by the completeness of answers to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the conduct of self-assessment of medical educational organizations of the ECAQA, provided by the LLP “Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies – Ecomed”, by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the General Director Baikoshkarova Saltanat Berdenovna, which confirms the reliability of the quantitative information and data included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 12 members of the internal self-assessment commission indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the institutional self-assessment - Kulanchiyeva Zhanna Arapbayevna, PhD, AIRT Advisor.

The institutional self-assessment of LLP "Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies -



Ecomed" was carried out based on the order of the executive director Zh.R. Azhetova under No.01 dated 20.01.2025 "Report on the institutional accreditation of LLP "AIRT - Ecomed".

All standards provide the actual practice of AIRT in training students in 22 additional and 5 non-formal education programs. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated in terms of the number of students, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, training results, knowledge and skills assessment results. Information is included on the company's own material and technical base with a total area of 10,223.6 m<sup>2</sup> and 14 own clinics, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, development and improvement plans, etc.

The report was submitted to the ECAQA in its final form, with data adjustments, written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, tables and figures (diagrams, photographs) contain references in the text and have continuous numbering.

The quality of the institutional self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure - external evaluation. The experts planned to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during a visit to the educational organization, i.e., verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

### **3. Description of external expert evaluation**

The external expert work within the framework of the institutional assessment of AIRT was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programs of the ECAQA and according to the visit program. Dates of the visit to the organization: February 26-27, 2025.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the AIRT institutional self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit of the external expert commission (EEC) is presented in detail in the Visit Program of the LLP "Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies – Ecomed".

To obtain objective information, the members of the EEC used the following methods and their results:

- conversation with management and administrative staff - 6 people;
- meetings with students - 6 people;
- study of the website <https://ecomед.kz/institut-vrt/>;
- interviews of 7 employees, 7 teachers;
- questionnaires of teachers and students - 12 and 35, respectively;
- observation of the training of students: attending a master class on the topic: "Menstrual cycle (variants of the NMC and their regulation)", lecturer: MD Aliyeva Tamara Dzhumamuratovna (conference hall at the address: Clinic "Ecomed", Gagarin Str., 78.);
- resource review in the context of fulfilling accreditation standards: 2 practice/clinical training bases were visited, including the International Reproduction Center (NGC), Kaparov Street, 392 and the Medical Center "Ecomed", Gagarin Street, 78, where training is conducted on 6 non-formal education programs and 22 additional education programs with the participation of 6 full-time teachers/part-time workers;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 226 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the divisions (the list of 66 documents studied during the visit to Ecomed is presented in Annex 2).

The staff of the LLP "Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies – Ecomed" ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the visit program and in the lists of interview and conversations sites (Table 1).



**Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews and conversations with the EEC members**

No.	Job title	Full name
1	General Director of AIRT-Ecomed:	Baikoshkarova Saltanat Berdenovna
2	Executive Director of AIRT - Ecomed:	Azhetova Zhanerke Rakhimbayevna
3	Employees involved in training students	Azhetova Zhanerke Rakhimbayevna (Director of the Department of SRIM, Acting Head of the Department of Reproductology) Kulanchiyeva Zhanna Arapbayevna (Advisor, Director of the Department of NPE) Kaniyev Daniyar Askhatovich (Acting Head of the Department of "Embryology") Sadvakassova Zhannur Begzhanovna (Chief Specialist of the Departments of SRIM and NPE) Shashkin Chingiz Sakayevich (Chairman of the LEC AIRT), Aliyeva Tamara Dzhumamuratovna (Head of the Department of "Obstetrics and Gynecology") Makhadiyeva Dinara Baigazyevna (Assistant of the Department of "Reproductology")
4	Students of CPD programs	Egovtseva Yelena Nikolayevna Makhambetova Nazgul Nurkanovna Nesipbek Makpal Amangeldyevna Rakhym Zhanargul Serikbayevna Sadvakasova Asel Gabdullayevna Sultangereyeva Dina Nurlanovna
5	International partner of AIRT - Ecomed (Russia)	Shurygina Oksana Viktorovna
6	Representative of the educational organization:	Kazhigalikyzy Roza Kazhigaliyevna

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of the EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. The EEC members began drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the external evaluation results were made. The experts individually filled out the "Institutional Quality Profile and External Evaluation Criteria of the LLP "Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies - Ecomed" for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards." The EEC members did not make any comments. Recommendations for improvement for the LLP "Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies – Ecomed" were discussed and the chairperson, Kurmanova Almagul Medeubayevna, held a final open vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC; access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the team, prompt provision of information to the EEC members.

*When conducting a survey of students, 65.7% noted that the most important tool for external expert evaluation is attending practical classes, 62.9% - a review of the resource base. All respondents believe that it is necessary to accredit organizations implementing CPD programs.*

*According to 100% of teachers, the survey conducted by the ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving key areas of activity of the accredited organization.*



At the end of the visit program, the Chairperson of the EEC announced recommendations to the management and staff of the educational organization based on the results of the external evaluation as part of the institutional accreditation.

#### **4. Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of external evaluation of the LLP “Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies – Ecomed”**

##### **Standard 1: MISSION AND FINAL RESULTS**

###### **1.1 Mission**

The mission of AIRT has been defined, including: Creation of the first international, innovative and educational Kazakhstani center for postgraduate education in the field of reproductive medicine.

AIRT has defined the vision as an Integrated into the international community, competitive Kazakhstani AIRT for postgraduate education in the field of obstetrics, gynecology and reproductive medicine.

Strategic goal: the Introduction of innovative reproductive technologies in the continuous professional development of medical personnel and international integration in reproductive medicine.

All information is communicated to stakeholders through publications on the organization's website <https://ecomед.kz> and information through media coverage (interviews in newspapers, Internet resources).

The mission was developed by the administration, staff and teachers of the organization and approved at the meeting of the Academic Council on 10.12.24. This is the 2nd version of the mission, which focuses on the introduction into the international community and the introduction of innovative technologies into practical healthcare. The key theme of the mission is the provision of postgraduate training in reproductive medicine, which allows training a specialist and developing his/her need for lifelong learning.

When developing the mission, such public health problems as reproductive health disorders - infertility, as well as the needs of the practical healthcare system, which should include the modernization of the system of training and continuous professional development of healthcare personnel through improving the quality of basic education and postgraduate training based on the National Qualifications Framework, were taken into account.

AIRT demonstrates its social responsibility by introducing innovative reproductive technologies into the continuous professional development of medical personnel and international integration in reproductive medicine, which is confirmed by events (transfer of external technologies into practical healthcare, expansion of clinical training bases, increase in the number of teaching staff, development of educational programs of various content and duration of training based on international standards) and is reflected in the document - the AIRT Strategic Plan for 2024-2029.

The mission contains the wording "creation of an innovative and educational Kazakhstani center for postgraduate education", which implies a desire to conduct research and aspects of global health.

The experts were familiar with the Strategic Development Plan for the period 2024-2029, approved at the meeting of the SC under No.2 dated 10.12.24 and including 3 areas:

1. Formation of leadership positions in the field of additional professional and non-formal education in the field of reproductive medicine;
2. Development of the teaching staff and personnel
3. Development of the AIRT-Ecomed infrastructure.

The strategic plan takes into account important goals and objectives, such as the creation of an effective system for organizing additional education for medical personnel of healthcare organizations of the Republic of Kazakhstan, modernization and improvement of the material and technical base of the Academy taking into account AI, facilitating the taking of high professional assessment by healthcare workers in their field of activity and in the healthcare organization at the place of assignment. Based on the strategic plan, an annual (operational) plan is drawn up annually. The experts



familiarized themselves with the operational plans for 2024-2025.

AIRT systematically collects and analyzes information on the main areas of its activities and presents the results in the form of annual reports. The heads of structural divisions are responsible for this. Based on the results of the analysis of the reports, corrective action plans are developed, as well as short-term plans for further improvement of the main processes of activity in educational and methodological work, the educational process, R&D and expert and advisory activities. Thus, the SWOT analysis for the past year showed that there is a problem of a low scientific component. In order to adjust, AIRT has planned to train the teaching staff in writing projects, articles in journals with a high impact factor, it is planned to submit AIRT documentation for accreditation for scientific and/or scientific and technical activities.

The mission and strategic goal take into account national priorities in continuous professional development.

The strategic development plan is accompanied by financial support in the form of budget formation from various sources in all areas. The experts are familiar with the income and expenditure parts of the AIRT budget. AIRT revenues are formed by receipts from paid types of educational activities for personnel training. The expenditure part of the AIRT budget is formed from wage payments, settlements with the budget for mandatory types of payment, costs for the maintenance of AIRT, the acquisition of scientific and methodological literature, assets, business and other costs. Thus, the indicators of financing the key areas of AIRT activity in 2023 compared to 2022, income increased by 226%, in 2024 it decreased by 56.6% compared to 2023. From the analysis of financial indicators, it follows that the volume of financial resources allocated for the implementation of CPD programs is insufficient to provide the appropriate material and technical equipment, the development of information networks.

The mission and vision are available to all participants in the educational process and external stakeholders by publishing on the organization's website <https://ecomед.kz/institut-vrt/>, social networks Instagram and Facebook, and information stands.

During the visit to the divisions, the experts noted the strengths of the LLP “Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies – Ecomed”, including:

1. Leadership in the field of reproductive medicine, media personality of the first director;
2. A dynamically developing organization with a network of independent medical centers, with accessibility for doctors in the regions in providing educational programs with the involvement of the best specialists;
3. A creative, professional team committed to the interests of AIRT,
4. Use of modern technologies and high efficiency of ART programs;

The educational organization has divisions that are directly related to the organization of training of students, which can be noted as the best practice in education, namely the department of clinical activities. This conclusion was made, since AIRT carries out the transfer of technologies and innovations in clinical activities, introduces innovative reproductive technologies in the professional development of medical personnel in its own team.

The results of the study of the documentation demonstrate that the mission of the organization is based on values, which, despite the changes occurring in the field of healthcare, politics and society as a whole, remain the basis and foundation of guaranteed quality of education, and the educational process is built in accordance with the current regulatory legal acts (RLA) in additional education and healthcare. With regard to additional and non-formal education, the following is defined - Creation of the first international, innovative and educational Kazakhstani center for postgraduate education in the field of reproductive medicine.

## **1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy**

The fact that the educational programs and events of AIRT are aimed at achieving the goal of improving the professional and personal development of students is proven by the fact that advanced



training is provided for specialists with higher medical education who have completed internship training in their specialty, as well as for specialists with secondary medical education.

Potential students can choose advanced training programs by visiting the organization's website or contacting the organization's employees directly, via chat, WhatsApp messenger, or by calling AIRT.

To verify standard 1, a meeting was held with the head of the organization, Baikoshkarova Saltanat Berdenovna. During the conversation, the experts asked the following questions: What are the prospects for the development of AIRT? What educational technologies are planned to be introduced into the educational process? Are you going to expand the range of specialties and attract additional teaching staff? During the responses, the director of the organization confirmed that, in accordance with the Strategic Plan, AIRT is studying the best international practices in improving the qualifications of doctors to build an individual trajectory of continuous professional development and select programs, according to educational technologies, and is introducing interactive learning methods and simulation technologies.

*When conducting a survey of 35 students (on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>), out of 22 questions, a number were devoted to the quality of the educational process and the diversity of training programs. It was found that 100% of students would recommend studying in this educational organization to their acquaintances, friends, and relatives. And 91.3% of respondents believe that managers and teachers are aware of the problems of students related to training. To the question "Do you think this educational organization allows you to improve the necessary knowledge and skills in your specialty?", 100% of students answered positively.*

*The 12 teachers surveyed (21 questions of the questionnaire) also answered that 100% are satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace in this educational organization.*

*The experts determined that the organization has a healthy microclimate, since the manager is quite accessible to both students and employees, responds promptly to requests. In the questionnaire, 100% of teachers are satisfied with the microclimate of the organization. In the opinion of 100%, a teacher has the opportunity to realize himself/herself as a professional in his/her specialty in an educational organization. For your information, only 12 people responded (47 in total, 7 full-time), while teaching experience of up to 5 years - 75%, up to 10 years - 0%, over 10 years - 25%.*

### **1.3 Final learning outcomes**

For each educational program (cycle, course), the final learning outcomes are defined, which are based on the competencies that the program listener must improve and perfect theoretical and practical knowledge in the context of increasing requirements for the level of qualifications and the need to master modern methods of prevention, diagnosis and treatment, and are spelled out in the advanced training programs. The experts studied the documents of 27 educational programs (PK-22, NFO-5) and found that all educational programs have expert evaluations indicating the compliance of the EP with the general framework in the industry qualification system, in the substantive part - compliance with current regulatory legal acts, protocols, established development methodology, resource provision. The working programs of additional education of AIRT are implemented in accordance with the Model programs for advanced training of medical and pharmaceutical personnel and the Model rules for the activities of organizations of additional education for adults (as amended dated 07.04.2017). The form of the advanced training program has been approved by the Educational and methodological association of the Republican educational and methodological council and has been in effect since 2021. The content of the work programs complies with educational standards and ensures the preparation of students in accordance with the name of the specialty, for this purpose, control is carried out at all levels of the educational process organization. The final learning outcomes primarily take into account knowledge, skills and relationships.

During the conversation with the Director of the Department of Science and Postgraduate Education Kulanchiyeva Zh.A., the following answers were received: how the procedure for



developing and approving the EP, forms of knowledge control is carried out.

The experts familiarized themselves with the Code of Ethics established on 10.12.2024. The interviewed students and teachers confirmed that students can be involved in the process of evaluating educational programs by expressing their opinions and wishes at the end of the training cycle or by anonymously surveying.

The teaching staff, employees and administrative and managerial personnel take part in the development of the final learning outcomes of students through participation in the meeting of the SC and students through the survey, thus AIRT ensures the participation of stakeholders. The experts reviewed the minutes of the meeting of the SC No.2 dated 10.12.2024, which reflected that the teaching staff, employees, and students took an active part in the development and implementation of the mission, goals, and objectives of AIRT.

AIRT, when developing the final learning outcomes, took into account their connection with the requirements of the RLA. Thus, the experts studied the protocol, which indicated that representatives of employers took part in the discussion of the mission, strategic goals and final results of the discussion - a leading neurosurgeon, Founder of LLP "Shashkin Clinic" PhD Shashkin Ch.S., a representative of the educational organization - a freelance hematologist of the Ministry of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan, MD, prof. of JSC KazNMU named after Asfendiyarov Kosanova A.K., as well as external reviewers of educational programs: PhD, prof. of the School of Medicine of KazNU named after Al-Farabi Kazhigalikizy R. and others.

The experts noted that the problems of global healthcare are reflected in the educational programs. The Department of Science and Postgraduate Education is responsible for quality control of educational programs. At the level of AIRT, the quality control of the organization of the educational process by departments is carried out according to the following indicators: provision of all specialties with current standard programs for advanced training of medical and pharmaceutical personnel, provision of all specialties with standard educational plans; provision of all specialties with approved working curriculum; timeliness of approval of working programs at the SC; compliance of working educational plans with standard ones.

The indicators of educational activity are reviewed at the end of each cycle by the employees of the Department of Science and Postgraduate Education and discussed at the Academic Council in accordance with the procedures for organizing the educational process. Based on monitoring, recommendations are formed within the framework of final reports on the program for advanced training of the entire team and individual employees, projects for modernization and automation are introduced, which are subsequently used in the formation of strategic plans and objectives.

*The surveyed teachers responded that 83.3% are fully satisfied with the level of previous training of students, and 16.7% are partially satisfied.*

*The experts established a clear continuity between the final results of previous training and the programs of continuous professional development offered in the accredited educational organization. The organization has developed 22 programs of additional education, including for the specialty of reproductive medicine, obstetrics and gynecology, embryology. Information about the number and variety of programs is provided through the website.*

*100% of the respondent teachers believe that students of this educational organization have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training program.*

#### **1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and final results**

The development of the AIRT mission involved the teaching staff, employees, as well as students and employers, which is confirmed in the minutes under No.2 of the meeting of the Academic Council dated 10.12.2024. This mission is the 2nd version in 5 years and significant changes affected the advantages of the Academy, the strategy at the present time. Suggestions for improving the mission were "Creation of the first international, innovative and educational Kazakhstani center for postgraduate education in the field of reproductive medicine."



At the same time, during a conversation with employees, experts received a clear answer to the question "Do you participate in formulating the mission and goals of the organization?", and the answers were affirmative. For example, the additional education program "Fundamentals of colposcopy using wide-band radio wave surgery" was compiled taking into account the wishes of the management of the "Ecomed" clinic, as well as potential students - obstetricians and gynecologists of women's consultations. Advanced training programs are developed taking into account the needs for deepening knowledge and improving practical skills that a potential student expects from an educational organization. In 2023, due to the increase in the number of late diagnoses of cervical cancer, advanced training programs were developed on the topics: "Fundamentals of colposcopy using wide-band radio wave surgery (practical skills), Fetal cardiotocography: methodology, decoding CTG, tactics of managing women depending on CTG indicators, gynecological endocrinology, Antenatal management of pregnant women"

*The 35 teachers surveyed (21 questions in the questionnaire) responded that 100% were satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace of AIRT. The experts determined that the organization has a healthy microclimate, since the manager is quite accessible to both employees and students, and responds promptly to requests. In the questionnaire, 100% of teachers are satisfied with the microclimate of the organization. According to 100%, the university teacher has the opportunity to realize himself/herself as a professional in his/her specialty.*

**Conclusions of the EEC on criteria.** Comply out of 9 standards: fully - 9, partially -0, do not comply - 0.

## **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS**

### **2.1 Model**

The training is organized in such a way that it takes into account the needs of practical healthcare. There are 36 advanced training programs in total, and 12 non-formal education programs with up to 60 hours. Since 2020, 36 programs have been developed, which include the following topics: "Male infertility", "Miscarriage. The role of APS, coagulopathy, TORCH infections", "antiphospholipid syndrome in obstetrics and gynecology", "Polycystic ovary syndrome (clinic, diagnostics, treatment)", "Anemic syndrome and pregnancy", "Autoimmune syndromes and pregnancy". This is due to the demand for the above topics for both doctors and nurses. Adapting training to the needs and wishes of individual healthcare professionals, the management of AIRT decided to open an advanced training program in "Clinical Embryology" for non-medical specialists in 2024. 14 advanced training programs and 4 non-formal education programs in the specialty "Obstetrics and Gynecology" have been developed and approved.

Based on the Concept of Development of Human Resources of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020-2025, AIRT conducts modular programs (advanced training cycles) taking into account the principles of the modular-cumulative system of continuous professional education of healthcare personnel.

AIRT offers various forms of training. Full-time, distance and hybrid, to enable students to study without interrupting their main place of work. To do this, the student indicates the preferred form of training in the application. Also, AIRT has 14 of its own clinical bases in various regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan, which provides the opportunity for offline training for students without traveling to other regions.

The advanced training programs define a goal that reflects the integration of practical and theoretical components. The ratio in hours is: classroom work - 60% of the time, independent work - 40% of the time of the total number of hours. The forms of independent work of the student are:

[ECAQA\\_ Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance of Education and Health Care](#)



abstracts, compilation of diagnostic and treatment algorithms, as well as crosswords on the topic, using sources of primary and additional recommended literature, presentations, reports at scientific and practical conferences, publications of scientific papers, development of illustrative diagrams, attendance at meetings of the School of Innovative Reproductive Technologies. The experts familiarized themselves with the educational programs of additional and non-formal education, control and measuring equipment for each program.

The final learning outcomes in advanced training programs take into account the issues of ethics and deontology, which a healthcare practitioner should develop and support.

The experts found confirmation that the training is conducted in accordance with the current state policy, namely, the Health and Healthcare Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan on Education, the order of the Minister of Healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 under No.KR DSM-303/2020 "On approval of the rules for additional and non-formal education of specialists in the field of healthcare, qualification requirements for organizations implementing educational programs for additional and non-formal education in the field of healthcare, as well as the rules for recognizing the learning outcomes obtained by specialists in the field of healthcare through additional and non-formal education" and other RLA.

AIRT closely cooperates with professional associations: "Kazakhstan Association of Reproductive Medicine", "American Association of Reproductive Medicine (ASRM)", "European Association of Human Reproduction and Embryology". This cooperation allows receiving both feedback from representatives of practical healthcare and science, and inviting members of the association to conduct advanced training courses.

Continuous professional development activities are officially recognized, since LLP "Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies - Ecomed" has institutional accreditation dated 25.12.2019, which expires on 24.12.2024.

The structure of the educational program consists of a passport of the educational program, information about the developers, data on the examination of the program, the purpose of the program, learning outcomes and the content.

The organization has implemented a Code of Ethics, which is familiarized with all students. The text of the Code can be read at the link <https://ecomед.kz/airt/kodeks-chesti-obuchajushhihsja-slushatelej-too-airt-ecomед/>. There were no precedents for violation of ethics during the entire period of educational activity.

Interaction of students and teachers with colleagues is carried out through educational and professional social networks, for example, Open Educational Resources, such as <http://abvpress.ru>, <http://www.geotar.ru>, <http://www.phdynasty.ru>, <http://www.medpraktika.ru>, <http://www.zdravkniga.net>.

While attending a 40-hour master class on the topic: "Menstrual cycle (variants of the Menstrual disorder and their regulation)", the experts received convincing evidence that the training is conducted according to plan; before the lesson, students answer tests, receive feedback from the teacher, and have the opportunity to improve their skills on the causes of menstrual irregularities and methods of their regulation. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of educational programs, since the experts have studied the code of ethics (approved by the Academic Council of AIRT, protocol No.2 dated 10.12.2024) and during the interview the students responded that they were informed about the content of this document.



An analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all scientific achievements in the relevant disciplines are taken into account, additions have been made to the bibliography of the teaching materials and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom.

The procedure for informing students about their rights and obligations is reflected in the Rules on the organization of the educational process, which is additionally posted on the website <https://ecomед.kz/airt/pravila-ob-organizacii-obrazovatel'nogo-processa/>.

Additional education (continuous professional development) is the main component of the process of continuous improvement of knowledge and skills of mid-level and post-secondary healthcare specialists. This approach is consistent with international principles of professional development and the European Higher Education Area. (ESG 1.2).

## **2.2 Scientific method**

The educational programs are developed based on the principles of scientific methodology, evidence-based practice and experience. The educational programs include scientific foundations and methodology of medical research. During the conversation with the students, the experts learned that they use scientific data in their training and know the basics of evidence-based medicine.

Students have access to updated scientific and clinical data, to the book collection of JSC “MUA”, JSC “KazNMU named after Asfendiyarov”, JSC “SKMA”, JSC “Nazarbayev University” on a lease-contractual basis, as well as via the Internet to the EBSCO database. Access to scientific results has been organized, since in 2025, within the framework of an internal grant, research is being conducted on 4 scientific projects:

1. "The influence of endometriosis on the quality of egg cells, embryos and the onset of pregnancy in endometriosis using high-tech reproductive technology";
2. "Clinical results of using the new cryopreservation technology "CRYOTEC Ready to Use" in Kazakhstan";
3. "Comparative analysis of fresh and cryopreserved oocytes using a commercial kit (Reprolife, Ready to use) within the framework of the oocyte donation program";
4. "Evaluation of the influence of progesterone levels on the day of embryo transfer in cryoprotocols on the success of ART programs".

Students can take part in the above projects and get acquainted with their results. In addition, free access to practical experience is provided, since there are 14 of their own clinical bases in various regions of Kazakhstan.

When questioning students, it was found that the educational organization has access to the participation of students in research work and 25.7% of people are completely satisfied with this, 17.1% are partially satisfied, 14.3% are not satisfied.

## **2.3 Contents of additional and non-formal education programs and their relationship with the provision of medical care**

The content and structure of educational programs for advanced training are compiled according to the standard curriculum, advice and recommendations of employers and students. The administration of AIRT and teachers are responsible for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process.

The content of the work programs reflects the needs of the healthcare system, including the need for courses in embryology, obstetrics and gynecology, as well as the specifics of research and development and the scientific achievements of teachers. These include the courses "Laboratory of Embryology in Human Reproduction", "Fundamentals of Human Embryogenesis", "Gynecological Endocrinology", "Gynecology of Childhood and Adolescence", etc. For the successful implementation of educational programs, the organization has resources for organizing the assessment of practical skills of students (simulation technologies, constant access to patients).



*Teachers provide students with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, in which 85.7% are completely satisfied, 5.7% are partially satisfied, 8.7% are unsure.*

*Students of advanced training programs are also provided with access to the book collection of JSC "MUA", JSC "KazNMU named after Asfendiyarov", JSC "SKMA", JSC "Nazarbayev University".*

*The organization has its own clinics with 10223.6 sq.m., and also concluded 8 contracts, including 5 with medical organizations and universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 3 foreign organizations. And to the question of the questionnaire "Is there sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.)", 77.1% of students answered with full agreement, 2.3% partially agree. At the same time, 97.3% of students claim that after completing the classes, the teacher provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini-questionnaire, and works on mistakes).*

*Practical training is provided in the conditions of 14 of own clinics, and the staff coordinates training based on these clinics so that students acquire adequate training in various aspects of the relevant field of medicine.*

*The students surveyed are completely satisfied with the schedule of classes (100%).*

The management of the educational process reflected in the self-assessment report (**standard 2**) and general approaches to management were confirmed during a visit to the Department of Science and Postgraduate Education and a conversation with the head and employee of the department. At the same time, verification of **standard 2** showed that AIRT has a full list of educational programs of additional and non-formal education declared in the self-report, control and measuring equipment, reviews of educational programs, as well as a structural unit responsible for managing the educational process.

The experts got acquainted with the work of the divisions, including the Department of Science and Postgraduate Education, a total of 5 meetings were held (Director, DS&PE, DCR&MC, teachers, students) and during the cross-interview it was established that the organization's policy is aimed at achieving the mission of the organization, teachers provide students with educational and methodological documentation before the lesson, students take part in the development of educational programs through participation in questionnaires, etc.

When visiting a master class on the topic "Menstrual cycle (options of the Menstrual disorder and their regulation)", with a volume of 40 hours and talking with students, the experts saw that the organization promotes the development and improvement of communication and practical skills and theoretical knowledge of healthcare professionals (nurses, paramedics, midwives).

Thus, during a conversation with the management of the organization, the experts received information that classes are held at Ecomed's own clinics, which was confirmed by the teachers.

*Of the 35 students surveyed, 94.3% responded that teachers use active and interactive teaching methods in classes quite often, 5.7% believe that they do so rarely or sometimes.*

**Conclusions of the EEC by criteria.** Comply with out of 13 standards: fully - 13, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.

### **Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENT COMPETENCES AND DOCUMENTATION OF CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION**

#### **3.1 Assessment methods**

AIRT, as an organization implementing additional education programs, developed a Policy for assessing the quality of implementation of working educational programs of continuous professional development (minutes of the AC under No.1 dated 09.09.24), which includes criteria in accordance with the standard.

Assessment of the implementation of working educational programs of continuous professional development is carried out annually by analyzing the demand for CPD programs by representatives of



practical healthcare, taking into account feedback from graduates and the management of medical organizations where students of CPD programs work.

In addition to traditional assessment methods, interactive assessment methods have been introduced in AIRT. For example, in the cycles of advanced training programs, survey methods are used through discussion of treatment protocols, critical assessment of patient case histories, analytical summaries of published articles related to a specific topic of the advanced training program, etc.

At the same time, it is recommended to introduce new assessment methods, including independent assessment of the knowledge and skills of students, to provide mechanisms for studying and documenting the reliability, validity and fairness of assessment methods (QIS 3.1.3).

### **3.2 Documentation of additional and non-formal education**

AIRT has a nomenclature of cases, including 6 main sections.

A system of monitoring and control over workflow management, document flow, which is carried out by the DCR&MC, has been introduced. The educational process is carried out in the following forms:

1. lectures;
2. practical, laboratory, seminar classes;
3. independent work of the student, specified in the "AIRT Guide" and "Rules for the organization of the educational process".

AIRT offers 27 advanced training programs for students. The experts familiarized themselves with the results of a survey of students for 2024, where 100% of students noted the professionalism of teachers and satisfaction with training at AIRT LLP.

AIRT uses a multi-level system for assessing the knowledge, skills and abilities of students, including:

- Primary testing to determine the initial level of knowledge;
- Midpoint control measures (tests, case problems, case methods);
- Assessment of practical skills using simulation technologies and clinical analyses;
- Final certification using an objective structured clinical exam in the form of testing (100 questions).

### **3.3 Documentation of additional and non-formal education**

The organization has implemented a system for documenting the educational process.

The documentation system includes regulatory and legal (plans, reports, regulations, agreements, applications, transcripts) and educational and methodological documentation (work program, working curriculum, syllabus, journals), assessment tools (checklists, statements), verifications, certificates and evidences.

Records management has been implemented, including electronic, which the experts have familiarized themselves with.

Documents are archived by an archivist who monitors the inventory of all documents in the AF, annually it is possible to write off a folder from the nomenclature of cases, which is not relevant, in this case the nomenclature of cases is changed and a new version is approved on the Academic Council. Documents are stored according to the storage periods determined by the nomenclature of cases.

Personal files of students are stored in departments according to the period specified in the nomenclature of cases, and certificates are stored until requested, since at present the issuance has moved to an online format. The number of issued advanced training certificates and non-formal education certificates are indicated in the department reports upon completion of each event. The departments draw up student registration logs, attendance logs and their academic performance logs, where the acquired knowledge and skills are assessed upon completion of each section.

The actual training of the student is confirmed by the issuance of certificates/verifications



indicating the training organization (with whom the JSC "MUA" consortium cooperates), the topic, and the number of hours (credit units).

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Compliance out of 10 standards: fully - 9, partially - 1, do not comply - 0.

**Recommendation for improvement:**

1) It is recommended to introduce new assessment methods, including independent assessment of the knowledge and skills of students (to provide mechanisms for studying and documenting the reliability, validity and fairness of assessment methods) (QIS 3.1.3).

**Standard 4: HEALTHCARE PROFESSIONALS (INDIVIDUAL PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT)**

**1.1 Motivation**

The organization has a policy for the selection and admission of students, which is called "Rules for the organization of the educational process", "AIRT Guide". The director of the department, Zh.A. Kulanchiyeva, spoke about the policy for enrolling students. Approaches to the admission of students are based on the requirements of the country and internal regulations. For the period 2020-2024, 225 students were accepted to 22 additional and 5 non-formal education programs. For example, the most popular programs were short-term programs from 60 hours (weekly).

Consulting students on the choice of training topics and event formats is carried out on the website. For this purpose, the website [www.ecomed.kz](http://www.ecomed.kz) contains information on the current price list for programs of qualified AIRT trainers, which allows the student to sign up for a group in advance via chat, WhatsApp messenger.

**4.2 Teaching Strategies**

The sequence of events of the educational process and the routing of the listener are specified in the "AIRT Guide" and "Rules on the organization of the educational process", where it is recommended to consistently study in certain cycles to improve competencies, due to the methodological connection between them and one cycle can be a prerequisite for another. AIRT develops the ability of program listeners to plan further advanced training, document their professional development through implementation in practical healthcare with the participation of listeners.

**4.3 Participation and influence of students on additional and non-formal education programs**

AIRT closely cooperates with medical centers and scientific organizations of the near and far abroad in reproductive medicine, creative and industrial and organizational activities with the aim of introducing innovations into the educational environment, namely, the selection of mature embryos using AI, preparation of the environment for the vital activity of reproductive cells.

AIRT employees are members of the Associations of the Kazakhstan Association of Human Reproduction, the Kazakhstan Association of Reproductive Medicine, authors/co-authors of 3 patents.

During interviews with students, experts found that students can express their opinion on the content of advanced training programs and non-formal training programs. At the same time, it is recommended to involve students in the discussion of issues related to the EP model, evaluation methods, program evaluation and management, provide for the inclusion of students in the process of developing an admission policy (SU 4.3.2)

**4.4 Working conditions**

The organization has the authority to determine the various forms of implementation of advanced training and non-formal learning programs. This allows taking into account the working conditions and employment of students at their main place of work. This requirement is spelled out in the document "Rules for the organization of the educational process".



At the end of training, the organization conducts a survey, which includes questions about the student's satisfaction with the knowledge gained. According to the results of the survey "Teacher through the eyes of students", positive dynamics are observed in the assessment of the professional qualities of the teaching staff, as well as professional standards of behavior and ethics of teachers. Thus, from the point of view of the surveyed students, the level of teaching has increased over the previous three years and in 2024 amounted to 90.2%.

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Compliance out of 11 standards: fully - 10, partially - 1, do not comply - 0

**Recommendations for improvement:**

- 1) It is recommended to involve students in the discussion of issues related to the educational program model, assessment methods, program evaluation and management, provide for the inclusion of students in the process of developing admission policies (QIS 4.3.2).

## **Standard 5: FACULTY**

### **5.1 Faculty Admissions Policy**

In total, there are 53 employees, including 7 full-time teachers and 47 part-time teachers. The experts were familiar with the personnel policy (Regulations on the procedure for hiring and dismissal, Internal Regulations), Regulations on the Regulations of the Competition Commission and documents to them, Regulations on payment, the Code of Corporate Ethics and Culture.

In order to verify the data of standard 5, external experts received the opinion of teachers on the personnel policy, which monitoring within the framework of the final reports, recommendations are formed on the advanced training program of the entire team and individual employees.

A conversation with the staff of the Department of "Obstetrics and Gynecology", MD Aliyeva T.D., "Reproductology" Makhadiyev D.B. allowed the experts to learn about approaches to attracting employees of clinical sites for teaching (there are 47 such teachers in total), about the information support of the educational program, and also to identify problems in the management and development of human resources.

*When questioning teachers, it was found that the majority (100%) are completely satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace in this educational organization. In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of R&D - 100% completely agree. Satisfied with the work of the HR service - 75% completely agree. Satisfied with the salary - 91.7% completely agree, 8.3% have no answer.*

### **5.2 Teacher Commitment and Development**

In order to verify the data of standard 5, during a meeting with the head of the HR department and during interviews with teachers, experts obtained an opinion on approaches to the development of teachers' pedagogical competence, motivation to participate in the training of students:

The teachers underwent advanced training and internships in foreign educational and scientific organizations in their specialty at the Russian-American Center for Reproduction and Genetics in Adler, at the Moscow Center for the Treatment of Infertility "IVF", the Russian Scientific Center for Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology, at the Bonn University Clinic in Germany, and the Tel Aviv University Clinic in Israel.

In order to exchange experience, they have repeatedly trained at the RAPRUI Reproduction Center of Professor S. Antinori (Rome, Italy), the University Clinic of Ulm (Germany), the leading German private IVF centers in Bonn and Ulm, the Russian-Finnish Center "Ava-Peter" (St. Petersburg), the clinical base of Harvard University Boston IVF in the USA, and the world's largest clinic Kato Ladies Clinic in Tokyo, Japan.



AIRT has trained lecturers in key competencies and specialists in the following areas: interactive learning in small groups - PBL, case-based learning (CBL), research-based learning (RBL) - 3, communication skills - 4, simulation training - 2.

At the same time, it is recommended to introduce a mechanism for monitoring and controlling the use of effective and efficient teaching methods by employees and teachers when planning and implementing the EP.

Experts have found that teachers develop in students the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation.

*The organization has opportunities for career growth and development of teacher competencies - 100% of surveyed teachers responded. Studied in programs for advanced professional training - 75% less than 1 year ago, 25% during the current year. The organization implements programs of social support for teachers - 75% responded that "yes, such programs exist", 25% of respondents do not know about it.*

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Of the 9 standards, 8 - comply fully, 1 - partially, 0 - do not comply.

**Recommendations for improvement:**

1) It is recommended to introduce a mechanism for control and monitoring of the use of effective and efficient teaching methods by employees and teachers when planning and implementing educational programs.

## **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

### **6.1 Material and technical resources**

AIRT has an agreement with the library of JSC "MUA", based on which there is access to the book fund and international electronic databases; a memorandum of cooperation and the use of Simulation equipment in JSC KazNMU named after S.D.Asfendiyarov; an agreement on cooperation with "SKMA" for the purpose of exchanging resources in the scientific and educational process.

The EEC visited two clinical sites, where the full functioning of multimedia equipment in educational auditoriums and conference rooms was demonstrated.

Also, students and employees of AIRT are given the opportunity to use electronic resources Springer, EBSCO not only within the walls of AIRT, but also in on-line mode, to use scientific, methodological and educational literature developed by their teachers.

### **6.2 Training bases**

The AIRT infrastructure corresponds to the specifics of the activity, implementation of advanced training programs in medical and non-medical specialties. Educational premises in the buildings meet sanitary and hygienic requirements, fire safety and correspond to qualification requirements. The educational building of AIRT has internal water supply and sewerage, ventilation and central heating that meet sanitary standards, artificial lighting of the auditorium is satisfactory.

The centralized Internet system of statistics and administration allows for clear control over all servers and services in the network, as well as distribution and control of network use.

An agreement on the lease of the book fund and access to electronic resources has been concluded with MUA.

### **6.3 Information technology**

AIRT has an official website ([www.ecomed.kz](http://www.ecomed.kz)). The website contains general information about AIRT, its mission, goals and objectives, and information. AIRT has a computer class, a lecture hall for 20-25 people, all connected to the Internet.



## 6.5 Formal and non-formal types of learning

Master classes, seminars, trainings, round tables and conferences are actively implemented, and AIRT employees actively participate in external events.

**Conclusions of the EEC on criteria.** Compliance out of 10 standards: fully - 10, partially - 0, do not comply – 0

## Standard 7: EVALUATION OF ADDITIONAL AND NON-FORMAL EDUCATION PROGRAMS

### 7.1 Mechanisms for monitoring and evaluation of educational programs

Monitoring the effectiveness of educational programs includes an analysis of the structure and content of the programs based on monitoring the timeliness of additional and non-formal education activities reflected in the AIRT plans and an analysis of the programs compliance with the RLA (protocol). The Department of Science and Postgraduate Education assesses the applicability and adequacy of the teaching methods and student assessment methods chosen by teachers. This is reflected in the Department's regulations and job descriptions of specialists. The quality of the documentation is assessed through reviews at meetings of the Academic Council. To conduct training for students in 2020-2024, 7 AIRT employees and 5 representatives of medical universities were involved on a contractual basis. The adequacy of educational resources is assessed by the Department of Science and Postgraduate Education. Compared to 2019, by the beginning of 2024, the number of educational programs in the organization has increased, which in 2025 is 36, more than 12 internal regulatory documents have been developed (*Strategic Development Plan, Quality Management System, Code of Honor of the Student, Code of Honor of the Teacher, Policy for Assessing the Quality of Implementation of Working Educational Programs of Continuous Professional Development, Rules for the Organization of the Educational Process, AIRT Guide, Code of Corporate Culture, Job Descriptions of Employees, Regulations on Structural Divisions, Questionnaires, HR Policy*), the mission and structure of the organization have been updated. The section of the website where information on advanced training programs is posted has been supplemented with the following documents: "Rules for the Organization of the Educational Process", "AIRT Guide, Code of Corporate Culture", "Code of Honor of the Student", "Code of Honor of the Teacher", etc. <https://ecomед.kz/>.

An analysis of the achievement of the final learning outcomes by students showed that for the period 2020-2024 there were no precedents for non-completion of training. The students' feedback showed that they improved their skills in their specialty and received additional up-to-date information. The experts familiarized themselves with the results of the 2024 student survey, where 100% of the students noted the professionalism of the teachers and satisfaction with the training at AIRT LLP.

*The results of the analysis of the quality of educational services provided by the LLP "Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies – Ecomed" made it possible to expand the number of training programs and bring them to the attention of stakeholders (ESG S1.7), invite such teachers as Professor Masashige Kuwayama from Japan, conclude agreements and memorandums with 8 organizations, and hold more than 4 national and 9 international events.*

An interview with the partners of the LLP "Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies – Ecomed" showed that the partners actively interact within the framework of the implementation of scientific projects and are interested in the implementation of educational programs.

An interview with teachers showed that the LLP "Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies – Ecomed" provides its teachers with periodic advanced training and participation in non-formal learning. During the training process, teachers actively use teaching methods such as PBL, CBL, TBL.



## 7.2 Feedback

Feedback from students and teachers is carried out through a questionnaire, the book of reviews and suggestions, where each student, teacher or visitor can voluntarily leave their feedback on the activities of AIRT. The experts reviewed the questionnaires and reports on the results of the questionnaire for 2020-2024.

Previously, feedback was carried out by means of a survey, taking into account the recommendations and wishes of students. Since 2024, a questionnaire has been conducted for students who have completed educational programs. The questionnaires are processed and stored in the Department of Science and Postgraduate Education.

The survey topics are as follows: satisfaction with training at AIRT LLP, satisfaction of students with the work of support services, satisfaction of employers with the quality of training of students and graduates of AIRT LLP, satisfaction of students with the quality of teaching at AIRT LLP, analysis of the assessment of the student support service.

The survey results are announced at a meeting of the Academic Council. The Department of Science and Postgraduate Education maintains contact with all students via WhatsApp and Telegram.

As a result of the analysis of the survey, in 2020 the material and technical resource was improved in the cities of Almaty and Astana: 2 conference halls were put into operation, 4 EPs in reproductive medicine were developed, 12 masters who were trained at AIRT in reproductive medicine were included in the personnel reserve.

As a result of the questionnaire analysis in 2023, the material and technical resource in the cities of Aktobe and Aktau was improved: 4 conference halls were put into operation in the regions, EPs on clinical embryology were developed, 18 masters who were trained at the AIRT in reproductive science were included in the personnel reserve.

An interview with 1 employer was conducted offline and included the following questions: knowledge of the mission of the educational organization, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of students, participation in the training of students through mentoring, providing students with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with teachers in particular, and with the organization as a whole.

To involve stakeholders in the program for monitoring and evaluating the EP (BS 7.2.7)

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Comply out of 9 standards: fully - 8, partially - 1, do not comply - 0

**Recommendations for improvement:**

- 1) To involve stakeholders in the program for monitoring and evaluating the educational programs (basic standard 7.2.7)

## Standard 8: ORGANIZATION

### 8.1 Documentation and needs for planning additional and non-formal education

The new organizational structure was approved in 2024. The organizational structure includes the “Department of Science and Postgraduate Education”, which is responsible for the educational direction. The department is guided by the Regulation approved on 10.12.2024.

Employees of the Department of Science and Postgraduate Education of AIRT develop a calendar-thematic plan for the year, plan the training of students for specific cycles, draw up a schedule, develop individual training schedule, if necessary, collect feedback from students and teachers, regulate compliance with working curriculum in the time aspect, advise students on technical and everyday issues.

AIRT is headed by the General Director: Doctor of Biological Sciences, Professor S.B. Baikoshkarova, the main functions are general management, solving financial and material issues of [ECAQA\\_ Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance of Education and Health Care](#)



ensuring the educational process in AIRT, etc. in accordance with the Job Instructions of the General Director.

The highest governing body of AIRT is the Academic Council (<http://ecomед.kz>) chaired by Doctor of Biological Sciences, Professor Baikoshkarova Saltanat Berdenovna.

## **8.2 Academic Leadership and Administration**

Structural subordination ensures the coordinated work of all AIRT divisions, whose activities are also based on such internal documents as: the Charter, the Strategic Plan, the "Rules for the Organization of the Educational Process" and internal regulatory documents of AIRT. An effective monitoring system has been developed to monitor the main processes of AIRT activities.

The duties and powers of AIRT in relation to the CPD programs are regulated by the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the internal regulatory documents of AIRT (Regulations of the Academic Council, AIRT Charter).

The tool for ensuring the transparency of the management system and decisions made on the educational program is the AC.

*To the question in the questionnaire "Do the organization's managers listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research, clinical/practical work?", 100% of teachers answered that they do so systematically.*

## **8.3 Allocation of budget and resources for training**

The budget for advanced training and non-formal education programs consists of paid services. In total, for the period 2020-2024, the budget for educational activities amounted to 41,845,000 thousand tenge. The necessary material resources and intellectual assets of AIRT are provided for the implementation of the strategic plan.

The budgeting system is managed by an accountant, whose functions include accounting of expenses and income, planning and accounting of fixed assets, participation in the procurement of public services.

Payment for training from individuals is made according to the application and invoice provided to the potential student. Payment is made to the organization's bank account, which ensures transparency.

## **8.4 Management of educational programs**

The implementation of NFE programs is supported by a salary fund for teachers, provision of students with educational resources, strengthening the program through invited foreign teachers, and the opportunity for students to participate in international and national conferences and seminars.

The system of paid services within the framework of the implementation of CPD programs includes a list of advanced training programs, elective disciplines and non-formal education events, displayed on the AIRT website, taking into account the students' choice of the program that interests them.

The program is analyzed and regularly revised with the participation of students, the opinion of employers and other interested parties. The employees of the Department of Science and Postgraduate Education of AIRT develop a calendar-thematic plan for the year, plan the training of students for specific cycles, draw up a schedule, develop individual training schedules, if necessary, collect feedback from students and teachers.

At the same time, it is recommended to ensure control over the administrative unit responsible for the development of CPD programs so that they contribute to high-quality implementation and continuous improvement (8.4.2.)



**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Compliance out of 10 standards: fully - 9, partially -1, do not comply – 0

**Recommendations for improvement:**

1) It is recommended to ensure control over the administrative unit responsible for developing continuous professional development programs so that they contribute to high-quality implementation and continuous improvement (QIS 8.4.2.).

**Standard 9: CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT**

The organizational structure is updated annually. The organizational structure was last updated in 2024 and such changes were made to it as the appearance of the Department of Science and Postgraduate Education.

Compared to 2019, in 2024 the organization offers students 22 programs in the following areas: Obstetrics and Gynecology, Reproductology and Embryology. The final learning outcomes are revised based on the regulatory legal acts and internal regulatory documents.

AIRT plans to conduct visiting cycles in medical organizations of Astana, Almaty, Atyrau, Shymkent, Ust-Kamenogorsk, in a word, at all 14 clinical sites in the regions.

In order to promote promising and competitive research projects, AIRT plans to continue financing initiative projects and participate in grant projects of the Ministry of Healthcare and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

It is planned to further develop laboratories in all clinical sites of the Ecomed network, systemic support and stimulation of local clinical trials of medical technologies with the approval of the LEC.

A medium-term program for the development of scientific competencies, training and scientific internships in strategic priority areas has been developed; the exchange of scientific personnel in the field of reproductive medicine will be developed, with an emphasis on the new specialty "Embryology" with the introduction of best practices from international experience.

AIRT systematically assesses the state of affairs and development prospects of AIRT, analyzes strengths and identifies weaknesses of the activity. After discussing the results of the analysis, improvement measures are developed in the structural divisions of AIRT, based on which a strategic plan for the development of AIRT is subsequently formed, approved by the Academic Council.

According to the number of employees of the teaching staff of AIRT, with whom employment contracts have been concluded since 2020, the teaching staff consists of doctors of medical sciences, candidates of medical sciences, professors, associate professors and assistants.

The distribution of financial resources is carried out in accordance with the approved budget for the current year.

**Conclusions of the EEC on criteria.** Comply out of 5 standards: fully - 5, partially - 0, do not comply - 0.

Thus, during the external evaluation of the educational program, out of 92 accreditation standards, compliance with **87** accreditation standards was established, including 62 basic standards (100%) and 25 improvement standards (83.3%). 5 standards were partially fulfilled, including 5 improvement standards. No non-compliance with standards was established.







## **5. Recommendations for improving the educational activities of the LLP “Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies – Ecomed”:**

1. To introduce new assessment methods, including independent assessment of students' knowledge and skills (provide mechanisms for studying and documenting the reliability, validity and fairness of assessment methods) (QIS 3.1.3).
2. To involve students in discussing issues related to the educational program model, assessment methods, program and management evaluation; provide for the inclusion of students in the admission policy development process (QIS 4.3.2).
3. To introduce a mechanism for monitoring and controlling the use of effective and efficient teaching methods by employees and teachers in planning and implementing educational programs (QIS 5.2).
4. To involve stakeholders in the educational program monitoring and evaluation program (BS 7.2.7).
5. To ensure control over the administrative unit responsible for developing continuous professional development programs so that they contribute to high-quality implementation and continuous improvement (QIS 4.2).



## 6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The EEC members established the compliance of the LLP “Academy of Innovative Reproductive Technologies – Ecomed” with the Standards of Institutional Accreditation of Additional and Non-formal Education (CPD) organizations and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend that the ECAQA Accreditation Council accredit this organization for a period of 5 years.

ECAQA Chairperson	KURMANOVA ALMAGUL MEDEUBAYEVNA	/signed/	
International expert	YESHIMBETOVA GULSARA ZAKIROVNA	/signed/	
Academic expert	KAIDAULOV MUKHTAR KENZHEBEKOVICH	/signed/	
Expert-employer	IBRAYEVA AINAGUL	/signed/	



**Институциональный профиль качества и критерии внешней оценки ТОО  
«Академия инновационных репродуктивных технологий - Ecomed» (обобщение)**

Стандарт	Критерии оценки	Количество стандартов	Базовые стандарты/ Стандарты улучшения	Оценка		
				Полностью соответствует	Частично соответствует	Не соответствует
1.	<b>МИССИЯ И КОНЕЧНЫЕ РЕЗУЛЬТАТЫ</b>	9	7/2	7/2		
2.	<b>ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНЫЕ ПРОГРАММЫ</b>	13	9/4	9/4		
3.	<b>ОЦЕНКА КОМПЕТЕНЦИЙ СЛУШАТЕЛЕЙ И ДОКУМЕНТАЦИЯ</b>	10	7/3	7/2	0/1	
4.	<b>СПЕЦИАЛИСТЫ ЗДРАВООХРАНЕНИЯ (ИНДИВИДУАЛЬНОЕ ПРОФЕССИОНАЛЬНОЕ РАЗВИТИЕ)</b>	11	8/3	8/2	0/1	
5.	<b>ПРЕПОДАВАТЕЛИ</b>	9	4/5	4/4	0/1	
6.	<b>ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНЫЕ РЕСУРСЫ</b>	15	10/5	10/5		
7.	<b>ОЦЕНКА ПРОГРАММ ДОПОЛНИТЕЛЬНОГО И НЕФОРМАЛЬНОГО ОБРАЗОВАНИЯ</b>	10	5/5	5/4	0/1	
8.	<b>ОРГАНИЗАЦИЯ</b>	10	7/3	7/2	0/1	
9.	<b>НЕПРЕРЫВНОЕ УЛУЧШЕНИЕ</b>	5	5/0	5/0		
<b>Итого:</b>		<b>92</b>	<b>62/30</b>	<b>62/25</b>	<b>0/5</b>	
			<b>92</b>			



**Список документов, изученных членами ВЭК в рамках проведения внешней оценки**

<b>№</b>	<b>Наименования документов</b>	<b>Количество</b>
1.	Структура и бизнес-процессы	1
2.	Миссия, стратегическая цель, видение на 3 яз	1
3.	Номенклатура дел рус,	1
4.	Номенклатура дел каз	1
5.	Кодекс чести преподавателя на 3 яз	1
6.	Кодекс чести обучающихся на 3 яз	1
7.	Политика в области качества на 3 яз	1
8.	Цели в области качества на 3 яз	1
9.	Штатное расписание	1
10.	Стратегический план АИРТ 2024-2029	1
11.	Положение об Ученом совете	1
12.	Положение ЛЭК	1
13.	Положение о ПД	1
14.	Приложение к положению ПД	1
15.	Положение о порядке приема на работу и увольнении	1
16.	Положение об оплате труда	1
17.	Правила внутреннего распорядка	1
18.	Положение Конкурсной комиссии	1
19.	Документы Конкурсной комиссии	1
20.	Управление записями	1
21.	Путеводитель	1
22.	Положение о корпоративной культуре	1
23.	Положение о хранении гособразца	1
24.	Процедура управления документацией	1
25.	Положение о бухгалтерии	1
26.	Положение о кафедре	1
27.	Правила об организации образовательного процесса	1
28.	Положение о Школе ИРТ	1
29.	Положение о Редакции журнала	1
30.	Положение о ВНК	1
31.	Положение о департаменте СРиМС	1
32.	Положение о департаменте НиПО	1
33.	Положение о департаменте КД	1
34.	ДИ Ген.директора	1
35.	ДИ Ученого секретаря	1
36.	ДИ дир деп СРиМС-исп дир	1
37.	ДИ дир деп НиПО	1
38.	ДИ дир деп КД	1
39.	ДИ бухгалтера	1
40.	ДИ глав спец деп СРиМС	1
41.	ДИ глав спец деп НиПО	1
42.	ДИ глав спец деп КД	1
43.	ДИ методиста деп СРиМС	1
44.	ДИ методиста деп НиПО	1



45.	ДИ методиста деп КД	1
46.	ДИ архивариуса	1
47.	ДИ зав.кафедрой	1
48.	ДИ профессора каф	1
49.	ДИ доцента каф	1
50.	ДИ ассистента	1
51.	ДИ техника безопасности	1
52.	Договор АИРТ и АО «МУА» на библиотеку	1
53.	Договор АИРТ и АО «КазНМУ им. Асфендиярова» на Симуляционный центр	1
54.	Меморандумы на сертифицированные лаборатории	5
55.	Трудовые договора со штатными сотрудниками: 1. Гендир -Байкошкарлова С.Б. 2. Исп.дир и деп СРиМС– Ажетова Ж.Р. 3. Дир деп НиПО – Куланчиева Ж.А. 4. Профессор каф. репродуктологии - Исаков С.С. 5. Зав.кафедрой АГ - Алиева Т.Д. 6. Зав.кафедрой Эмбриологии – Отарбаев М.К.	6
56.	Договора на выполнении научно-технических проектов за счет средств работодателя (инициативные)	4
57.	Рабочие учебные программы дополнительного и неформального образования, КИС, рецензии	35
58.	Акты экспертизы на РУП курирующего департамента	35
59.	Анкетирование и его анализ по годам	8
60.	Протоколы заседаний и утверждений ОП Ученого совета	5
61.	Протоколы и материалы заседаний Школы инновационных и репродуктивных технологий	2
62.	Операционные стандартизированные процедуры по этике (СОП)	24
63.	Комплексный отчет по всем индикаторам за период: 2020-2024гг	1
64.	Планы структурных подразделений по мероприятиям развития академии на 2024-2025 уч. год	8
65.	Приказы на слушателей на НФО 2025г.	25
66.	Личные дела слушателей на 2025г. и прошлых лет	15