

To the Accreditation Council of the
Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and
Quality Assurance in Education and
Healthcare
July 20, 2023

**REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF
EVALUATION OF EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM
7R01104 – “ALLERGOLOGY AND IMMUNOLOGY FOR ADULTS,
CHILDREN”
FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF
POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMS (RESIDENCE SPECIALTY) OF
MEDICAL EDUCATION ORGANIZATIONS JOINT STOCK COMPANY
"RESEARCH INSTITUTE OF CARDIOLOGY AND INTERNAL DISEASES"
period of external expert assessment: 29.06 -01.07 2023**

Almaty, 2023

CONTENT

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	5
2.1	Presentation of the educational program in the specialty - 7R01104 “Allergology and immunology for adults, children”	5
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	6
2.3	Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the report on self-assessment of the educational program 7R01104 “Allergology and immunology for adults, children” for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of postgraduate education programs (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions	6
3.	Description of external expert assessment and conclusion	7
4.	Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the educational program 7R01104 “Allergology and immunology for adults, children”	9
5.	Recommendations for improving the educational program 7R01104 “Allergology and immunology for adults, children”	36
6.	Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council	37
	Appendix 1. Quality profile and criteria for external assessment and educational program of residency in the specialty of educational program 7R01104 “Allergology and immunology for adults, children”	38
	Appendix 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert assessment	39

LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
JSC	Joint-Stock Company
SEC	State Examination Commission
State Educational Standards of the Republic of Kazakhstan	State compulsory education standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan
State guaranteed volume of medical care	Guaranteed volume of free medical care
JD	Job description
DPAE	Department of Postgraduate and Additional Education
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare
IS	Information Security
FSC	Final state certification
RW	Research work
IEP	Individual education plan
CB	Clinical base
KazNMU	Kazakh National Medical University
CTA	Comprehensive testing of applicants
CIS	Instrumentation assets
CDC	Consultative and diagnostic center
CEP	Committee for Educational Programs
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
KInEH	Kazakhstan information encyclopedic dictionary
MoH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MTE	Material and technical equipment
RI	Research Institute
JSC RIC&ID	Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Disease
RW	Research work
RRW	Resident's research work
STP	Scientific and technical program
NGO	NGO
EP	Educational program
EC	Educational services
OSCE	Objective Structured Clinical Exam
MSHI	Mandatory social health insurance
TRE	Tolerance Rating Evaluation
RSU	Regulations on the structural unit
PBL	Problem-Based Learning
TS	Teaching staff
Ps	Position
MD	Major disciplines
AT	Advanced training
WC	Working curriculum
RAC	Republican Allergy Center
CBL	Case-based-learning
mass media	Mass media
QMS	Quality Management System
IWR	Independent work of a resident
IWRT	Independent work of a resident under the guidance of a teacher
TTA	Technical training aids
TC	Typical curriculum
TBL	Team-based-learning (team training)
EMCD	Educational and methodological complex of the discipline
HRMLS	Human resource management and legal support
AC	Academic Council

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare (hereinafter referred to as ECAQA) Order No. 16 dated June 15, 2023, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as EEC) was formed to conduct an external assessment of the educational program during the period from June 29 to July 1, 2023 residency "Allergology and immunology for adults, children" in the following composition:

№	Status as part of the EEC	Full name	Academic degree/title, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	Chairman	Morenko Marina Alekseevna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Children's Diseases with courses in Allergology, Hematology and Endocrinology of NJS "Astana Medical University", Vice-President of the Association of Immunologists of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Chief Children's Allergist-Immunologist of the Astana University Hospital
2	Foreign expert	Saatova Guli Mirakhmatovna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of CardioRheumatology of the Institution "National Center for Maternal and Child Health" of the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic, Chief Rheumatologist of the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic, Vice-President of the Association of Rheumatologists of Central Asia and Kazakhstan
3	Academic expert	Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Childhood Diseases with Neonatology of the NAO West Kazakhstan State Medical University named after. M. Ospanova"
4	Academic expert	Kurmanova Almagul Medeubaevna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Clinical Disciplines of the Higher School of Medicine of Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Leading Researcher at JSC Scientific Center for Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology, Almaty
5	Employers' representative	Alimbetova Mayra Serikovna	Deputy Director for the Medical Department of the Almaty Multidisciplinary Clinical Hospital of the State Public Enterprise at the RPV "Almaty Multidisciplinary Clinical Hospital"
6	Residents' representative	Ismailov Musa Kenzhegaliuly	Resident 2 years of study in the specialty "General Surgery" NAO "

The observer from ECAQA is Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of the Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The work of the ECAQA was carried out in accordance with the Regulations of EEC (Order of the ECAQA General Director No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational program 7R01104 "Allergology and immunology for adults, children" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards for postgraduate education programs (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above-mentioned

educational program and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the residency educational program in specialty 7R01104 “Allergology and immunology for adults, children”

Name of organization, legal form of ownership, BIN	JSC "Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Diseases" BIN 990240008700
Management body	Joint-Stock Company
Full name of the first manager	Pashimov Marat Orunbasarovich
Created in	The Kazakh Research Institute of Cardiology was organized in December 1977. In 2001, it was transformed into the Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Medicine. In 2010, he received the status of a RSE at the Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Medicine of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Since 2018, it has the status of JSC “Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Medicine”
Location and contact details	050000, Almaty, st. Aiteke bi 120 Tel: +7 727-233-00-61 Official website: https://ncvb.kz/kz/ E-mail: ncvb-dir@yandex.kz
State license for educational activities in residency (date, number)	Perpetual state license for postgraduate professional education No. KZ19LAA00012857 dated September 18, 2018.
Information about branches, subsidiaries (if any)	-
Year of implementation of the accredited educational program (EP)	It is planned to recruit residents in 2023
Duration of training	2
Total number of graduates since the beginning of the EP implementation	24
Number of residents in the EP since the beginning of the current academic year	-
Full-time teachers/part-time teachers involved in the implementation of additional education programs, incl. % sedate	The total number of teachers is 3, including full-time teachers - 2, part-time teachers - 1. Sedateness,% - 33.3 Categorization, % - 100
Website Instagram Facebook with active pages	Official website: https://ncvb.kz/kz/

The Kazakh Research Institute of Cardiology was organized in December 1977. In 2001, it was transformed into the Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Medicine. Since 2010, it has the status of a RSE at the RPE “Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Diseases” of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and since 2018 it has been transformed into JSC “Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Diseases” (hereinafter referred to as JSC RIC&ID or institute).

Currently, JSC RIC&ID is one of the leaders of cardiological, cardiac surgery and therapeutic services in Kazakhstan, where highly qualified and specialized medical services are provided in

several areas, the results of scientific achievements in the field of internal diseases are carried out and introduced into practical healthcare, educational services are provided for the training of doctors in residency and additional medical education.

JSC RIC&ID is a fairly recognizable institution in the country's healthcare sector, and is recognized in the Republic of Kazakhstan and abroad. Thus, in 2021, JSC RIC&ID was accredited by JCI, which is a prestigious and objective recognition of the quality and safety of services in a medical organization, has National accreditation in the field of healthcare (Highest category), Certificate of the Kazakhstan Book of Records (KINEH), dedicated to the 30th anniversary of Independence of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Certificate 2020 - "The Best Enterprise in Kazakhstan" according to the International Association "Union for Economic Development".

To provide high-tech, specialized care, the JSC RIC&ID operates a clinical base, which is designed for 188 beds (155 budget, 33 beds for the provision of paid services), the institute also has at its disposal the Consultative and Diagnostic Center (hereinafter referred to as the CDC) and the Republican Allergy Center (hereinafter referred to as - RAC). The clinical bases of JSC RIC&ID are equipped with modern diagnostic and treatment equipment to provide high-quality medical care to the population of the regions of Kazakhstan at the level of national and international standards in cardiology, cardiac surgery, arrhythmology, endocrinology, gastroenterology, hepatology, allergology, pulmonology, immunology, rheumatology with diagnosis, determination of tactics treatment and assistance in resolving the issue of hospitalization, non-invasive and surgical interventions, laboratory, radiation, functional, endoscopic, ultrasound and other types of diagnostics are also performed.

JSC RIC&ID employs highly qualified specialists who have been trained in near and far abroad countries, including: 9 Doctors of Medical Sciences, 1 PhD, 24 Candidates of Medical Sciences, 10 Masters of Health.

In 2018, the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan re-registered the license for postgraduate education No. KZ19LAA00012857 dated September 18, 2018. A number of educational programs (hereinafter referred to as EP) were developed at JSC RIC&ID, each structural unit of the institute is involved in the process of training and education, master classes and seminars are held with the involvement of key specialists, including from countries far and near abroad. The Department of Postgraduate and Continuing Education (hereinafter referred to as DPAE) is a structural subdivision of JSC RIC&ID and carries out regulating educational activities of the institute's divisions.

At the moment, several EP residency programs are being implemented at JSC RIC&ID, which are consistent with internal regulatory documents - "Academic Policy of Residency Educational Programs of JSC "Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Diseases" and "Rules for the Organization of the Educational Process in Residency", approved by the Academic Council on September 2 2022, protocol No. 4.

The first graduation of residents in the specialty "Allergology and Immunology for Adults, Children" at JSC RIC&ID was carried out in 2016. The number of residency graduates during this period was 24 people. In 2020, the last graduation of 6 residents was carried out; further, due to the lack of recruitment of residents, educational activities for the accredited EP at JSC RIC&ID were not carried out.

2.2 Information about previous accreditation

The previous accreditation of the EP "Allergology and Immunology for Adults and Children" was carried out in 2016, the accreditation body was the Independent Agency for Quality Assurance in Education (ECAQA), link – <https://cloud.mail.ru/public/bdoe/Hg3X3b8Fy>.

2.3 Conclusion based on the results of reviewing the report on self-assessment of the residency educational program in specialty 7R01104 "Allergology and immunology for adults, children" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programs (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions

The report on the self-assessment of the residency educational program in specialty 7R01104 “Allergology and immunology for adults, children” (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 139 pages of the main text, 17 pages of appendices, copies or electronic versions of 53 documents located at the link Official website: <https://ncvb.kz/kz/>

The report is characterized by completeness of answers to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for self-assessment of the educational program provided to the educational organization by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as internal consistency of information. The report is accompanied by a covering letter signed by the head, Chairman of the Board of JSC RIC&ID Marat Orumbasarovich Pashimov, which confirms the reliability of the quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 5 members of the internal self-assessment commission indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational program - Kulzida Mukeevna Koshumbaeva, Ph.D., Associate Professor of the Department of Cardiology, JSC RIC&ID.

1. Abdukarimova Gulmira Bolatovna - Head of Quality Management Service and Risk management, Ph.D.;
2. Shukanov Arunur Saparbaevich - Lawyer of JSC RIC&ID;
3. Orekhova Elena Farkhatovna - Director of Nursing;
4. Rizvanova Lyazzat - Resident Cardiologist of the Research Institute of Clinical Hospital;
5. Guzel Parkhatovna Ishakbaeva - Head of the CDC.

Self-assessment of the educational program 7R01104 “Allergology and immunology for adults, children” was carried out on the basis of Order No. 92 of 04/11/2023 “On conducting specialized accreditation for 5 educational programs of JSC “Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Diseases” and No. 96 of 04/11/2023 "On the creation of a working group on organizing and conducting specialized accreditation for 5 educational programs of JSC "Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Diseases" and order No. 132P 05/11/2023 "On approval of the internal accreditation commission."

The report was reviewed by an accreditation expert: Morenko M.A. and in the reviews, strengths and areas for improvement were noted, and recommendations were also given regarding the clarification of the capabilities of clinical sites, diagnostic methods carried out at the RAC, additional data on mentors, which were taken into account during the feedback process with a representative of the Research Institute of Clinical Biology and Biology and included in the report on self-esteem.

All standards contain the actual practice of JSC RIC&ID in training residents and planning the training of residents in the specialty 7R01104 “Adult Allergology and Immunology,” reasoned data, approaches to implementing the tasks of the EP, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The presented self-assessment report contains sufficient information on the number of teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of assessment of knowledge and skills, material and technical base of the university and clinical sites, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for the development and improvement of the institute.

The report is presented to ECAQA in a completed form, with data adjusted according to the above recommendations, written in competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, tables and graphs contain references in the text and are continuously numbered.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure - external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be received during the visit to the educational organization, i.e. carrying out verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

3. Description of external expert assessment and conclusion

External expert work as part of the evaluation of the educational program 7R01104 “Allergology and immunology for adults, children” was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programs of the ECAQA and in accordance with the program approved by Order No. 16 of June 15, 2023. General Director of ECAQA Sarsenbaeva S.S. and agreed with the head of JSC RIC&ID M.O. Pashimov. Dates of visit to the organization: 29.06 - 01.07. 2023

External assessment is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Program (hereinafter referred to as the program), which is located in the documentation of the accreditation centre. The program is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of external peer review.

To obtain objective information, members of the EEC used the following methods and their results:

- interviews with management and administrative employees – 5 people;
- interviews with residents of 10 people (other specialties);
- studying the website); <https://ncvb.kz/>
- interviewing 5 employees, 4 teachers, 3 mentors;
- survey of teachers - 10;
- review of resources in the context of meeting accreditation standards: visited 2 clinical bases of practice/clinical engagement, with the participation of teachers and part-time teachers;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 53 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents studied is in Appendix 2).

The staff of the accredited organization ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the visit program and according to the lists of interview sites (Table 1).

Table 1 - **Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews with members of the EEC**

№	Position	Quantity
1	Management of JSC RIC&ID - Chairman of the Board, deputies for scientific, clinical and innovative work; strategic, financial and economic issues, head of the department of strategic development and organizational and methodological work	4
2	Head of the Department of Postgraduate and Additional Education	1
3	Resident teachers	4
4	Employees of supporting services – HR department	1
5	Residency graduates	3
6	Residents	10
7	Employers of residency graduates	3

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held based on the results of the external assessment. A final discussion was held on the results of the external assessment of the educational program, study of documents, results of interviews, interviews, and questionnaires. Members of the EEC began drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the results of the external assessment are made. The experts individually completed the “Quality Profile and criteria for external assessment of the educational program 7R01104 “Allergology and immunology for adults, children” for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards. There were no comments from the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational program were discussed by the

chairman M.A. Morenko. A final open vote was held on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

At the end of the visit, the chairman of the EEC announced recommendations based on the results of the external assessment as part of specialized accreditation to the management and employees of JSC RIC&ID.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, and access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the visited organization, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members, and the creation of the necessary conditions for the work of members of the EEC. The opportunity was given to visit clinical sites, a simulation center, a library, classrooms, and receive feedback from employees.

When conducting a survey of teachers, 100% completely agree that the survey conducted by ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving key areas of activity of an accredited educational organization.

3. Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the residency educational program in specialty 7R01104 “Allergology and immunology for adults, children”

Standard 1: MISSION AND RESULTS

Proof of compliance:

1.1 Mission statement

When studying the self-report of JSC RIC&ID, the implementation of the activities of the EEC program, namely, based on the results of an interview with the first head of the organization, members of the Board and the Academic Council, in interviews with residents and teachers, compliance with the criteria of standard 1 was established.

The mission of the EP “Allergology and immunology for adults, children” is consistent with the mission of the institute, developed in accordance with the needs of the health of society and the country’s medical care system and is aimed at achieving a world level in the main areas of activity based on the development of an innovative approach, expanding the range of educational services through implementation of continuous multi-level education.

Most participants in the educational process know the mission of the educational program, took part in the formation of proposals for formulating the mission, and the mission is brought to the attention of potential residents through the website, social networks, and information letters to medical organizations. Experts reviewed the organization’s strategic plan for a period of 5 years (2022-2026), including such areas as: educational activities; informatization and development of telecommunications; International activity; educational work with the student population; personnel policy and social sphere, which confirms compliance with the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization. From interviews with residents of other specialties, it was established that before the start of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, tell where to get the necessary information about the educational program, teachers, and training bases. At the same time, in conversations with residents and teachers, unambiguous answers to questions about their personal participation in developing the mission and discussing the strategy of the institute were not obtained.

The teaching of educational disciplines of EP in the specialty “Allergology and immunology for adults and children” is based on modern achievements in the field of science and practice, as well as modern educational technologies, which involve the construction of educational trajectories in accordance with the competency-based approach and the introduction of active innovative teaching methods. The patient-oriented training of residents at the institute is ensured by the presence of its own clinical base (clinical diagnostic, allergy centers, round-the-clock and day hospital) and the active involvement of residents in the clinical process, free access to any structural divisions of the institute,

to patients, diagnostic and therapeutic measures.

The multicomponent resident competency model used at JSC RIC&ID, which includes universal and professional skills, contributes to the development of the necessary knowledge required for a graduate, including in relation to ensuring the safety and autonomy of patients. https://ncvb.kz/images/ИСМ_компетентностная_модель_выпускника_резид.pdf

Residents, under the guidance of curators and mentors, have the opportunity to participate in research work, publications, and make presentations at scientific, practical and clinical conferences. The daily need to use evidence-based medicine for the effective management of patients develops residents' competence in continuous professional development.

JSC RIC&ID has all the resources necessary to develop professional qualities and achieve the final results stated in the mission of the educational program in accordance with national and international requirements and needs of the healthcare sector.

A survey of residents of other specialties showed that all 10 people were 100% satisfied with the organization of training, the microclimate at JSC RIC&ID, access to patients and equipment, the opportunity to supervise patients and provide medical care in a highly specialized clinic.

During the visit to the divisions of JSC RIC&ID, experts noted the strengths of the educational organization in relation to the accredited educational program, including:

1. JSC RIC&ID has procedures for the development and adoption of legal acts and their management.
2. The medical organization contributes to the development of professionalism among residents by creating conditions for mastering the necessary competencies.
3. The university has developed educational programs based on a competency-oriented model of a residency graduate, in accordance with the needs of society and the labor market.
4. High commitment and continuity of residency students to this JSC RIC&ID.
5. Demand for graduates of the JSC RIC&ID residency.
6. A highly qualified staff of teachers and mentors implementing residency programs at JSC RIC&ID.
7. The Institute has sufficient material and technical base and provides the opportunity to develop the necessary clinical skills and competencies.
8. JSC RIC&ID has a system for continuous improvement of the postgraduate educational process with a stable financial position.

The institute has all the conditions for the implementation of the educational process according to the declared EP, there is the opportunity to conduct practice and scientific research, and introduce innovative methodologies. Along with the availability of material resources, there is also sufficient potential for mentors from the medical staff of the allergy center. The JSC RIC&ID has departments that are directly related to the educational program 7R01104 "Allergology and immunology for adults, children", these are the presence of two branches of the RAC, CDC, a hospital and a hospital-replacement department, where beds for patients with allergic and immune diseases are located. For conducting seminars and working with documents, both branches of the RAC have training rooms, and also for residents of any specialties, the training rooms of NIKVB (on the 5th floor), where there is access to computers, are available. Before starting training, residents are required to undergo a medical examination and receive a health certificate with access to clinical practice.

The institute's teaching staff strives to introduce innovative teaching methods into the educational process. This is facilitated by the participation of the institute's staff in international scientific and practical conferences, seminars and training, as well as training of teaching staff in the framework of improving pedagogical competencies, in particular at the Kazakh National Medical University (hereinafter referred to as KazNMU) named after. A.S. Asfendiyarov at the School of Pedagogical Excellence named after H.S. Nasybullina." During the conversation with members of the EEC, residents said that at JSC RIC&ID teachers and mentors share their experience after passing qualifications and participating in conferences, and conduct master classes for students. Residents also have the opportunity to take part in clinical rounds and consultations, conferences, and telemedicine

consultations together with a clinical mentor.

During the training process, residents draw up a portfolio, fill out an individual curriculum, which includes an obligation to participate in scientific activities and research, and publish publications. At the same time, experts noted the insufficient publication activity of residents, including in the scientific and practical medical journal of the Research Institute of Clinical Biology and Biology.

The results of studying the documentation demonstrate that the mission of the organization and the mission of the educational program “Allergology and Immunology for Adults and Children,” as well as the educational process, is built in accordance with the State Compulsory Education Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan (hereinafter referred to as the State Compulsory Educational Standard) and the current regulations (hereinafter referred to as the NLA) in postgraduate education and healthcare. During the visit of the EEC, during meetings with residents, teachers, and staff of clinical sites, experts identified a number of problems, including insufficient work with stakeholders regarding the discussion of the mission and strategic plan of the institute.

At the same time, experts determined that the university has opportunities to eliminate these problems and can be eliminated before the start of the implementation of the EP in the declared specialty.

1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

During the external evaluation process, it was determined that the institute has autonomy in formulating its mission. The mission and strategic directions formulated by the leaders of the institute are reflected in the Strategic Plan of JSC RIC&ID for 2022-2026, reviewed by the Academic Council and approved by the Decision of the Board of Directors of JSC RIC&ID dated January 28, 2022, Minutes No. 1. JSC RIC&ID demonstrates autonomy in decision-making in such key areas as EP development, assessment, selection and admission of residents, choice/selection of faculty, terms of employment and resource allocation.

Experts analyzed the training system for allergists and confirmed the compliance of the educational program with international standards. JSC RIC&ID supports and develops the academic freedom of residents, which is expressed through motivation to publish, speak at conferences, and participate in various educational events.

From the self-assessment report and conversations with teaching staff and residents of other specialties, it was established that students conduct research work (hereinafter referred to as RW), which is part of the educational process of the JSC RIC&ID residency program. At the same time, residents have the right to independently choose the topic of scientific research and the head of the research project. The topic, the resident’s supervisor and the calendar plan for the implementation of the IR are agreed upon and approved in the DPAAE.

Residents are directly involved in the formation of an individual educational plan (hereinafter referred to as IEP) for each academic year together with a clinical mentor, which gives the resident the right to choose an individual learning path. Also, residents are given the freedom to choose disciplines included in the Catalog of Elective Disciplines (hereinafter referred to as CED).

Feedback from residents at the institute is carried out through a questionnaire, where they can write their suggestions, wishes on educational, organizational and other issues.

To verify standard 1, a meeting was held with the head of the organization, Chairman of the Board, Ph.D., M.O. Pashimov. During the conversation, the experts asked the following questions:

1. What are the prospects for improving the model of specialized medical education?
2. What are the most important areas of strategic planning?
3. What is the human resources potential of the institute?
4. Are there plans to improve the material and technical equipment of clinical sites?

During the answers, the head of the organization confirmed that JSC RIC&ID is the leading medical institution for cardiological, cardiac surgery and therapeutic services in Kazakhstan, where highly qualified, high-tech, specialized medical care is provided to patients with severe and difficult-to-diagnose diseases from all regions of the Republic. The activities of JSC RIC&ID employees are

based on a trusting relationship between the patient and the doctor, constant professional growth, openness to new technologies, respect and mutual support. The organization's goal is to strive for the highest level of care for each patient through the synergy of research, education and clinical practice.

The head also noted that in order to implement the mission, JSC RIC&ID continues to improve clinical activities to provide high-tech care to the population of the Republic of Kazakhstan, especially in terms of therapeutic and pulmonological care. The implementation of the main objectives contributes to the development of clinical practice in accordance with international standards of quality and patient safety, meeting the needs of the population.

Pashimov M.O. During the conversation, he expressed the opinion that the personnel potential of JSC RIC&ID currently consists of highly professional specialists in the field of cardiology, cardiac surgery, therapy, specialists from other universities are attracted, and it is planned to expand international relations with partners. At the same time, there is a lack of regularization of teaching staff implementing a number of residency programs, and management is working on this issue.

Regarding plans to improve the material and technical equipment of clinical bases, the head replied that a number of departments of the clinic have already been partially renovated, such as the emergency room, the reception and diagnostic department, and in the future it is gradually planned to increase the capacity in relation to other departments and equip the capacity of the institute's laboratory, in particular, the acquisition of new modern equipment for the allergy service.

Due to the current lack of students in the declared specialty "Allergology and Immunology for Adults, Children," an oral interview with residents was not possible. Residents of other specialties in interviews expressed great commitment to their organization, gratitude to the management and staff of the team for providing access to any diagnostic and treatment units of the Research Institute of Clinical Hospital, information databases and library resources.

During a conversation with teachers and mentors of the specialty, the majority responded that they were all satisfied with the organization of work and workplace in this organization. Experts determined that this institute has a healthy microclimate, since the director is quite accessible to both residents and employees. At JSC RIC&ID, each teacher has the opportunity to realize himself as a professional in his specialty.

1.3 Final learning outcomes

JSC RIC&ID informs the public about the established final learning outcomes of residency programs by indicating in the EP, syllabuses, State Educational Standards (Order No. 28716 MoH RoK - 63 dated July 5, 2022), which include the competencies of residency graduates formed during the training process at JSC RIC&ID. The criteria for assessing the level of development of competencies are reflected in syllabuses, which are freely available on the organization's website [http:// www.ncvb.kz/](http://www.ncvb.kz/).

At the institute, the final results of the implementation of EP residency in all specialties are assessed based on the results of certification and employment. Upon completion of the EP, the resident has the necessary skills in diagnostic, treatment, organizational, management, and research activities and is allowed to engage in independent practice as a specialist doctor.

During the visit, it was found that graduate allergists had previously successfully passed the stages of certification. When visiting the clinical base of the RAC, teaching staff and mentors noted that all graduates of the specialty are in demand on the labor market in the field of allergology, all are employed and have every opportunity for professional and career growth.

The institute pays sufficient attention to compliance with the standards of conduct of teaching staff residents and employees of JSC RIC&ID; for this, a number of documents "Academic Policy", "Code of Honor" have been developed, which reflect the requirements for compliance with ethical rules in relation to patients, their relatives and colleagues [http://www .ncvb.kz/](http://www.ncvb.kz/). The formation of professional behavior is carried out by familiarizing employees and residents with the provisions of internal regulatory documentation, requirements for the organization of the educational process, the main directions of work of structural divisions, the internal regulations of the institute, etc.; when creating a corporate culture based on equality of rights and responsibilities of employees and residents,

respect for their personal dignity. Quite effective mechanisms for observing the principles of academic integrity have been introduced into the educational process of residency - the Board of Directors, the internal audit service, and the quality management department. The institute has also created special support services (social and psychological service, Atameken party group, etc.) for students - DPAE, clinical mentors, department doctors, etc.

The surveyed teachers responded that they were 100% completely satisfied with the level of previous training of residents.

During the study of the self-assessment report and the visit of the organization's EEC, continuity was established between the final results of previous training of residents (prerequisites), residency training and subsequent programs of continuous professional development. The organization has developed 8 continuing education programs, including for specialty 7R01104 “Allergology and immunology for adults and children.”

Due to the current lack of students in the declared specialty, the survey was not conducted.

1.4 Participation in the formulation of mission and final results

JSC RIC&ID has procedures for the development and adoption of legal acts and their management. The organization contributes to the development of professionalism among residents by creating conditions for mastering the necessary skills.

At the same time, when talking with employers and residents of other specialties, experts did not receive a clear answer to the question “Do you participate in the formulation of the mission and goals of the organization, educational program?”, “What is the personal contribution of residents to improving the educational program?” In this regard, the organization is recommended to ensure the involvement of a broad representation of stakeholders in the development and discussion of the mission of JSC RIC&ID.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 14 standards (including 9 basic, 5 improvement standards): fully - 12, partially - 4, do not comply - 0.

Standard 1: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Update the mission of the educational program in specialty 7R01104 “Allergology and immunology for adults, children” with the participation of residents and employers, document this process and bring information about the mission to the attention of interested parties (1.4.1, 1.1.2).

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM

Proof of compliance:

2.1 Framework parameters of the postgraduate medical education program

The structure and content of EP 7R01104 “Allergology and immunology for adults, children” corresponds to the requirements of the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan 2022, developed on the basis of Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 13, 2018 No. 569 “On approval of the Classifier of areas of training for personnel with higher and postgraduate education” <https://adilet.zan.kz/rus/docs/V1800017565>.

Educational activities are carried out using credit technology in accordance with the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 20, 2011 No. 152 “On approval of the Rules for organizing the educational process using credit technology of education.” When training residents of all specialties, a 5-component competency model is used (knowledge, practical skills, communication and legal skills, self-improvement). The residency training program complies with international requirements and level 8 of the national qualification framework in medical education and the Qualifications Framework in the European Higher Education Area. In accordance with the classifier, the specialty is legitimate, and a graduate upon completion of the EP 7R01104 “Allergology and immunology for adults, children” will receive the appropriate document in the specialty - allergist and immunologist for adults, children.

To implement the EP in the specialty 7R01104 “Allergology and immunology for adults, children,” the organization’s documents contain an Educational and Methodological Complex of the discipline (hereinafter referred to as EMCD), which defines the goal, takes into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work. Experts established compliance of the content of the EMCD with the requirements of the State Educational Standard and standard rules.

Resident evaluations are based on the principles of academic integrity. Academic integrity is the main principle of the learning process. Participants in the educational process (residents, teaching staff, clinical mentors, administrative, managerial, educational and support staff) bear disciplinary responsibility for violating the principles of academic integrity. Work in which the principles of academic integrity were violated will not be accepted or evaluated. In case of violation of the Rules of Academic Honesty, disciplinary sanctions are applied to participants in the educational process, in accordance with the Code of Academic Honesty, approved by the minutes of the Academic Council dated September 2, 2022 No. 4. Such cases have not been previously registered by JSC RIC&ID.

During the visit, members of the EEC noted that the institute is student-centered in learning and residents understand their role and responsibility for learning. An analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in the advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the EMCD bibliography and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom. During the visit to the RAC, it was found that teaching staff use various teaching methods in educational activities, including seminars, oral presentations, video conferences, interactive teaching methods (case studies), problem-based learning (PBL), training based on Case-based-learning (CBL), etc. Residents (of other specialties) have the opportunity to participate in interdisciplinary consultations, participate in clinical discussions, clinical rounds, which certainly contributes to the development of professional skills in the diagnosis and treatment of allergic diseases.

The educational activities of residents are carried out with the direct participation of mentors. Mentoring is carried out on the basis of the “Regulations on mentoring”, approved by the protocol of the scientific and clinical council No. 4 of 09/02/2022. Clinical mentors accompany the student at the clinical bases of JSC RIC&ID (RAC, CDC, 24-hour hospital, day hospital). In addition to the mentor, to implement the training plan and the quality of the EP, residents are assigned a curator who takes part in the resident’s training and is personally responsible for the implementation of the training plan, and carries out measures to provide personal and psychological support to the resident while going through the stages of education. To implement the EP of the declared specialty, there are currently 3 mentors - allergists-immunology doctors with a medical category and more than 5 years of work experience, in accordance with the internal requirements of the institute (“Regulations on mentoring”, approved by the protocol of the scientific and clinical council No. 4 dated 02.09.2022 of the year).

According to the requirements of the personnel policy and the institute’s professional development plan, teachers and residency mentors are required to develop their pedagogical competencies. By interacting with KazNMU, the institute has the opportunity to improve pedagogical qualifications at the “School of Pedagogical Excellence named after Kh.S. Nasybullina”. During the reporting period, in the accredited specialty, 1 teacher was trained in interactive teaching methods.

The procedure for informing residents about their rights and responsibilities is reflected in the Academic Policy, in the syllabus for each discipline, which spells out the issues of discipline, the principles of the moral code, ethical standards, respect for senior teachers and doctors of JSC RIC&ID, penalties for missed classes.

Thus, the information obtained during the visit and familiarization with the institute’s documentation indicates compliance with standard 2 in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents. At the same time, along with the institute’s observance of the principles of quality, equality (gender, national) and academic integrity, which are described in the document in the syllabus for each discipline during the training period, the organization does not have an anti-plagiarism system..

2.2 Scientific method

During a conversation with the Deputy Chairman of the Board of Research Institute for Clinical and Innovative Work D. A. Kaibullaeva and the head of the allergological unit A. Zh. Bатырбаева, it was

established that, along with the development of clinical skills, the EP residency provides for the involvement of students throughout the entire period of study in implementation of scientific activities. In this regard, the Institute is expanding cooperation with partner universities in residency specialties, implementing the trinity of the educational process through the “Learning through Research” program, and plans to introduce international approaches in the training of scientific personnel. In order to improve scientific and clinical activities and exchange experience, JSC RIC&ID teachers participate in conferences, congresses, seminars, symposiums, congresses, meetings and forums held in Kazakhstan, in near and far abroad countries.

At JSC RIC&ID, the achievements of medical science are introduced into healthcare practice and into the educational process on modern methods of prevention, diagnosis and treatment of diseases. Thus, the experts were presented with evidence of the participation of the teaching staff of the EP in the development of the Clinical Protocol on Allergopathology (Bronchial Asthma. Clinical Protocol for Diagnosis and Treatment dated 04/04/2019), the act of implementation and more than 15 publications on topical issues of diagnosis and treatment of allergic diseases.

JSC RIC&ID strives to attract residents to participate in scientific and technical programs (hereinafter referred to as STP), where they master the skills of scientific research, analytical thinking and statistical processing. Modern achievements of science and practice are reflected in annually updated EEDs (elective components), focused on healthcare needs and individual educational trajectories: “Innovations in Allergology”, “Molecular Allergology”, “Evidence-Based Medicine”.

During a conversation with residents of other specialties, it was said that they provide assistance to teachers and doctors of practical healthcare in scientific research work (hereinafter referred to as RW), statistical analysis of the activities of departments of clinical bases, analysis and analysis of difficult clinical cases. Faculty members of the department, together with library staff and residents, conduct trainings and seminars on the implementation of clinical protocols and modern scientific achievements based on evidence-based medicine. At the same time, the experts were not provided with evidence of the participation of specialty residency graduates in scientific projects during the existence of the EP.

When assessing this section of the EP residency in the declared specialty, it should be noted that the scientific activity of teaching staff and residents is insufficiently high. Strengthening the integration of education, science and practice is recommended.

2.3 Structure, content and duration of the residency program

The content, volume and sequence of EP residency courses by specialty strictly comply with the State Standards of Education. The experts were provided with the necessary documents containing the requirements for the structure and content of educational programs, including the “Regulations on the development and approval of EP” approved by the AC JSC RIC&ID. Responsibility for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process lies with the institute and the DPAE.

The basis for achieving the objectives of training in the specialty is the acquisition by residents of the necessary knowledge and key competencies of the major (MD) disciplines of the main component and the elective component (EC). EP for training residents in the specialty 7R01104 - “Allergology and immunology for adults, children” is designed for 140 credits: core disciplines - 132 credits, elective component - 4 credits, intermediate assessment - 2 credits, end-of-course assessment - 2 credits.

The major disciplines of the EP are represented by the following disciplines: “Clinical immunology and allergology for adults” – 68 credits; “Clinical immunology and pediatric allergology” – 68 credits. An elective component (4 credits) can be chosen from the presented disciplines: “Innovations in allergology. Molecular allergology” - 4 credits, “Differential diagnosis of allergic dermatoses” - 4 credits, “Evidence-based medicine” - 4 credits.

The content of work programs and the catalog of elective disciplines reflect the needs of the healthcare system, including “Molecular allergy diagnostics”, “Differential diagnosis of allergic dermatoses”, “Evidence-based medicine”, as well as the specifics of research work at the institute and the scientific achievements of teachers.

The experts familiarized themselves with the catalog of elective disciplines and came to the conclusion that the list of elective disciplines can be expanded taking into account the multidisciplinary nature of the specialty “Allergology and immunology for adults and children.” For the effective implementation of the EP, it is advisable to include the following elective disciplines: “Methods and methodology of scientific research”, “Information technologies in healthcare”, “Clinical epidemiology”.

Clinical sites are selected for compliance with the residency program by the clinical department, which draws up contracts with clinical sites. For the successful implementation of the EP in the specialty 7R01104 “Allergology and Immunology for Adults, Children,” the organization has resources for organizing the assessment of the practical skills of residents (simulation center, inpatient and inpatient beds in the departments of therapy and pulmonology). The development of clinical skills and professional attitude to work is facilitated by the participation of residents in the actual activities of a doctor: supervision of patients at the inpatient level, outpatient visits, preparation of medical documentation, work in medical information systems, work with regulatory legal acts, duty, work in preventive departments, functional diagnostics, preparation of reports, presentations, creation of a portfolio, providing a clear example of a professional attitude to work in a medical organization and interprofessional communications of specialists of various profiles and levels. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, which was reported in interviews with teaching staff, studying documents on the website, visiting the library and electronic resources.

However, there are difficulties in planning, developing and approving educational programs, including insufficient involvement of stakeholders in the development of educational programs.

JSC RIC&ID has its own clinical bases - 2 branches of the Republican Allergy Center (at 52 Pyatnitskogo St. and 120 Aiteke Bi St.). The total number of offices in 2 branches is 23 offices (total area 484 sq.m.). Laboratory and instrumental studies are also carried out within the walls of the RAC (general clinical tests, allergy diagnostics in vivo/in vitro, enzyme immunoassays, rhinocytogram, peak fluometry, spirometry, endoscopic manipulations on an ENT combine, etc.). The volume of services performed last year amounted to 76,199 services per year.

Also in the therapy department No. 2 there are 2 allergy beds and 7 pulmonology beds, where patients with bronchial asthma are examined and treated. The institute's day hospital provides daily substitute care to patients with allergic diseases.

The Institute has concluded a number of international agreements and memorandums with Universities (Kazan Medical University, Sechenov Medical University, etc.), which certainly contributes to the professional growth of teaching staff and will allow us to revise the policy of employee motivation in the field of postgraduate education research. The RAC's activity plans include the possibility of renewing the agreement between the Children's City Clinical Hospital and No. 2 regarding the provision of a clinical base in the allergy department. Also, after passing accreditation and recruiting residents, it is planned to conclude an agreement with the Almaty Multidisciplinary Clinical Hospital and contribute to expanding opportunities for international cooperation.

Due to the absence of residents in the declared specialty at the time of accreditation, no survey was conducted.

To the question of the questionnaire “Is there sufficient time for practical training (supervision of patients, etc.)”, 100% of residents of other specialties responded with complete agreement. All residents interviewed claim that after completing classes, the teacher provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini-questionnaire, works on mistakes). The residents surveyed are completely satisfied with the schedule of training sessions (100%).

According to the results of a survey of teaching staff, representatives from residents of the specialty “Allergology and Immunology for Adults and Children” were not previously noted in the advisory bodies.

2.4 Organization of training and the relationship between postgraduate medical education and the provision of medical care

Management of the educational process, reflected in the self-assessment report (Standard 2) and general approaches to management were confirmed during a visit to the Department of Strategic Development and Organizational and Methodological Work, DPAE JSC RIC&ID and conversations with the head and employees.

The experts got acquainted with the work of the departments, including the clinical bases of the Russian Academy of Medical Sciences, the library, the simulation center, a total of 8 meetings were held and during cross-interviews it was established that the EP “Allergology and Immunology for Adults and Children” complies with regulatory requirements for the content and trajectory of training; Innovative teaching methods are being introduced.

The training of residents in the specialty “Allergology and Immunology for Adults, Children” is aimed at meeting the needs of practical healthcare. This organization is specialized in the field of allergology, and provides a lot of opportunities and conditions for qualified training of JSC RIC&ID specialists. Thus, during a conversation with the management of the organization, experts received information that the EP “Allergology and Immunology for Adults and Children” complies with regulatory requirements for the content and trajectory of training; Innovative teaching methods are being introduced, and opportunities for improving the material and technical base of the institute are expanding.

During a conversation with teaching staff and mentors, it was found that training of residents is carried out directly at the clinical bases of the Russian Academy of Medical Sciences and Research Institute of Clinical Hospital (2 branches of the Republican Allergy Center, a day hospital and a therapy department). Residents of this specialty can supervise patients with diseases such as atopic dermatitis, allergic rhinitis, bronchial asthma, urticaria, drug allergies, and severe generalized allergic diseases. This is facilitated by mentoring, which is carried out at JSC RIC&ID. At the same time, in order to expand the clinical experience of residents, it is advisable to practice in regional medical institutions.

Feedback from consumers is carried out through questionnaires with the participation of employees of the specialty, DPAE, and QMS. The results of feedback are analyzed and discussed at meetings of the department, DPAE, and AC. Due to the fact that there are currently no students enrolled in this EP, attending classes/lectures and conducting a survey of residents was not possible.

Thus, during the visit to JSC RIC&ID, experts established compliance with the basic criteria of the accreditation standard: a developed and approved educational program that meets the requirements of the State Educational Standard 2022 and is implemented in a student-oriented and patient-oriented environment in the best clinics of the city. The EP specialty “Allergology and Immunology for Adults, Children” is provided with appropriate methodological documentation and documents accompanying residents. Teachers use various teaching methods, mainly of a practical nature, and promote the involvement of residents in research work, which helps the formation and development of competencies in the specialty.

Verification of standard 2 showed that it is necessary to more actively use innovative teaching methods, expand the fragment on scientific methodology in the educational process, and also expand the opportunities for practical training at all levels of medical care.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 22 standards (including 19 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully - 20, partially - 2, do not comply - 0.

Standard 2: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Improve the processes of introducing innovative teaching methods in the implementation of the residency educational program (2.4.2).
- 2) Introduce an anti-plagiarism system into the results of research and independent work of residents.
- 3) Expand clinical training opportunities at all levels of health care, including work in the regions (2.4.3).

Standard 3: RESIDENT ASSESSMENT

Proof of compliance:

3.1 Assessment methods

Assessment of the educational achievements of students at JSC RIC&ID is carried out using criteria, regulations and procedures developed in accordance with the set goals and objectives for the implementation of EP and assigned qualifications within the framework of the current point-rating system and control of the educational process in accordance with directive, external and internal regulatory documents. JSC RIC&ID has developed and approved the “Regulations on ongoing monitoring of academic performance and intermediate and end-of course assessment of students” (No. 4 of 09/02/2022). The Regulations are presented on the JSC RIC&ID website in the “Education – Internal Regulatory Documents” section. <https://ncvb.kz/obrazovanie/vnutrennie-normativnye-dokumenty>.

The general policies, principles, methods used to evaluate students of the institute are annually reflected in work programs and syllabuses issued to students. Information about the point-rating assessment system is posted on the website <https://ncvb.kz>.

Assessment of the educational achievements of residents is carried out on the basis of indicators of the level of development of competencies developed by departments/modules in various forms: test questions, tasks in test form, a list of practical skills, situational tasks, clinical situations, assignments, etc. Methods for assessing current performance in EP disciplines are being developed employees of the department and approved by DPAE. Tests are reviewed by external reviewers and undergo testological examination.

The system for monitoring the educational achievements of students at JSC RIC&ID includes: current and milestone monitoring of academic performance, intermediate certification of students and final state certification (hereinafter referred to as FSC). Forms of current control are displayed in syllabuses.

Monitoring the progress of residents is carried out in the form of formative, summative assessment, as well as through regular feedback from clinical mentors and supervisors.

A point-rating assessment is used, where 100 is the maximum score. Information about the scoring system is posted on the website. After completing each discipline, residents undergo a milestone control - an examination in 2 stages (miniclinical examination at the bedside of a specialized patient and comprehensive testing in the discipline).

The results of educational achievements of residents of the specialty are entered into an electronic educational journal through the office-registrar system and the AIS “Platonus” program, which automatically generates examination sheets. The electronic educational journal is filled out in accordance with the calendar and thematic plan, in accordance with the schedule and the dates of the current, midterm and final controls reflected in the syllabus.

During the conversation with the teaching staff, it was established that in order to objectify the process of assessing residents during the final state certification, independent experts from practical healthcare and teaching staff from KazNMU are involved.

An assessment of clinical bases and the sufficiency of resources (material, technical, human, educational and scientific literature, etc.) is carried out annually in the format of the Department’s Annual Report, which ends with a general analysis indicating weaknesses, opportunities, on the basis of which relevant applications are planned.

Thus, to verify the data of standard 3, the experts asked questions to the head of the department of postgraduate and additional education, Aigul Balabekovna Tashetova, and checked the documents and methods for assessing residents. Questions for the manager included: “What are the mechanisms for monitoring students’ knowledge at JSC RIC&ID?”; “Describe the existing appeal system at the institute?”

The following answers were received: “The main control mechanisms at the institute are: collecting feedback from all interested parties (student residents, graduates, employers); annual holding of focus groups with students to analyze the content of individual disciplines and the

educational program as a whole; monitoring progress and quality of knowledge, results based on the results of intermediate and end-of course assessments; creating annually working groups from the DPAE for the examination of EP; organization of an independent examination of the results with the participation of leading practical healthcare specialists.” If a resident passes the exam with 50 points or less, then he is given the opportunity to re-study certain disciplines in the summer semester on a paid basis and re-take exams on them. If a resident does not achieve the minimum transfer score, he is excluded from residency.

The system for appealing assessment results is reflected in the document “Academic Policy of the Institute,” which sets out the procedure for filing an appeal. A resident who does not agree with the result of the final control submits an appeal no later than the next working day after the examination. To conduct an appeal in disciplines, teachers whose qualifications correspond to the profile of the appealed disciplines are additionally invited to work on the appeal commission. The results of the appeal are documented in a protocol, the data is transmitted to the registrar’s office on the same day.” Over the past 5 years, the institute has not had any applicants for appeal in residency specialties.

For the accredited EP, the experts were presented with all the necessary documents, including a CIS in the amount of more than 60 situational tasks and 250 tests, which were compiled in Russian, but there are no dates for their approval yet; this procedure is planned after recruiting residents. The head of the allergological unit, A. Zh. Batyrbaeva, responded that additions and updates to the CIS are planned to be made in the near future.

Feedback on the process of mastering the program is provided daily in the form of a formative assessment by the teacher of the discipline; periodically - by a supervisor, a clinical mentor, upon completion of studying the discipline in the form of an assessment of 3600. Analysis of the results of the assessment of 3600 demonstrates the correlation of students’ self-esteem and their perception in the eyes of fellow doctors. The results of the analysis of the results of feedback from residents are reported at a meeting of the Management Board, where a decision is made to make adjustments to the EP.

Thus, during a visit to the organization, familiarization with documents, during an interview with the Head of DPAE Tashetova A.B. and the Head of the allergological unit Batyrbaeva A.Zh., mentor Tokmurzaeva E.N., the commission was convinced that there is a documentation system that is transparent and is available to all teachers and staff, and includes documents such as annual operating plans, annual reports, department regulations, agreements with teachers and residents and educational and methodological documentation (EP, working curricula, syllabuses, journals), assessment tools (check- sheets, statements), certificates, certificates and certificates. A review of the website showed that its pages contain the documents necessary for residents and there is information (the entire block of EMCD in the specialty), which is regularly updated.

3.2 Relationship between assessment and learning

Assessment methods are fully compatible with teaching and learning methods and cover the assessment of all student competencies both during practical classes and during examinations. In assessing educational achievements, control and measurement tools developed by teaching staff of the specialty are used in various types (test questions, tasks in test form, situational tasks on practical and communication skills, etc.).

The methods used to assess the competencies of students at JSC RIC&ID are defined in syllabuses for disciplines, which are discussed and approved at departmental meetings, the Committee of Educational Programs (hereinafter referred to as CEP), and the AC. Evaluation criteria are announced at the first lesson for each discipline, and are also presented in the syllabus on the institute’s website. Each stage (current, midterm and final control) allows you to evaluate the achievement of the final results of the resident’s training.

The organization evaluates the reliability and validity of assessment methods. Criteria for the rule of knowledge assessment: the scale and criteria for assessing knowledge are provided at each level (current, midterm control). At the same time, the mechanisms for validating tests and other assessment materials used during exams and end-of course assessment of residents are unclear.

When conducting interviews with the head of the DPAAE, teachers regarding assessment methods, experts received information that a full assessment of all competencies is being carried out in accordance with the competency-oriented model of training residents at JSC RIC&ID; transparent procedure for assessing educational achievements at all stages.

The institute has created conditions for interprofessional training, since JSC RIC&ID trains residents in several specialties: rheumatology, gastroenterology, cardiology, endocrinology, cardiac surgery.

During the visit, members of the EEC, along with clinical sites, visited a simulation center. Taking into account the capabilities of the simulation center, an integrated format for assessing students' EP knowledge should be provided.

Interviewed 3 representatives from the RAC also indicated that the training of graduates corresponds to the modern development of medical practice and science, as well as special professional skills. Employers said that they themselves participate in the assessment of residents, since they are included in the independent examination commission. But the educational organization did not provide systematic feedback to them.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria comply with 9 standards (including 6 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully - 8, partially - 1, do not comply – 0.

Standard 3: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Regularly analyze and evaluate the quality of the methods used and the assessment format for the validity and reliability of the final learning outcomes.
- 2) To assess the knowledge of residents of the EP "Allergology and Immunology for Adults and Children", use the capabilities of the institute's simulation center.

Standard 4: RESIDENTS

Proof of compliance:

4.1 Admissions policy and selection

At JSC RIC&ID, approaches to the admission of residents are built on the basis of the country's regulatory documents: Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600 "On approval of the Standard Rules for admission to training in educational organizations implementing educational programs of higher and postgraduate education in accordance with the Rules for the organization of postgraduate Education", Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 20, 2015 No. 19 "On approval of the Rules for the transfer and reinstatement of students by type of educational organization." The institute has developed a policy for the admission of residents - "Rules for admission to residency", protocol No. 3 of the Academic Council of JSC "JSC RIC&ID" dated June 14, 2022, the "Academic Policy" has been updated (approved by the decision of the Academic Council, protocol 2 of 05.16.23), which reflects all the necessary procedures for the admission and selection of residents. https://ncvb.kz/images/Академическая_политика.pdf

Persons who have completed educational programs of higher medical education and internship are accepted into residency. Admission to the JSC RIC&ID residency program is carried out under the state educational order, at the expense of local executive bodies and for a fee at the expense of citizens' own funds.

The selection process for residency applicants provides for the training of persons with disabilities, while previously there were no such students at the institute. At the same time, experts discovered that the JSC RIC&ID has created conditions for patients with disabilities - there is an elevator, special paths for the blind, but there are restrictions when going up to the classrooms located on the 5th floor (the elevator only works up to the 4th floor).

In the course of studying the issue of transfers from other national and international programs, it was discovered that until now there have been no transfers of residents of the specialty "Allergology

and Immunology for Adults, Children” from the Research Institute of Clinical Biology and Biology to other educational organizations and vice versa.

For the period of entrance exams and enrolment in residency, the institute creates: an admissions committee for specialties and an appeal committee. The selection committee includes: the Chairman of the Board, the supervising deputy, doctors, candidates of science, leading doctors in their specialty.

Admission to residency, indicating the specialty, is announced through the media, by posting announcements on the university website (ncvb.kz, section “Education” - “Residency”). Information about the required list of documents for admission to residency, the deadlines for admission is posted on the JSC RIC&ID website, as well as in the admissions committee. The schedule for accepting documents at the institute is strictly regulated - it is carried out from July 3 to July 25.

Enrolment of persons into residency is carried out based on the results of the entrance exam for the profile and having scored at least 50 points out of a possible 100 points. Persons who obtain the highest scores on the entrance exam are enrolled in training under the state educational order on a competitive basis: for residency – at least 75 points. Entrance exams for residency are held from August 10 to 20, and residents are accepted until August 25.

In order to ensure transparency of the examination procedure, a video recording of the examination is carried out; observers and commission members are present in the hall. Enrolment of citizens into residency is carried out on a competitive basis, which is held separately among persons applying for target places. The regulatory documents of the rules for admission to residency do not limit the rights of low-income families and national minorities.

In order to ensure compliance with uniform requirements and resolve controversial issues, an appeal commission is being created at JSC RIC&ID (according to Order No. 600 with additions and amendments in January 2023 “Model rules for admission to training in educational organizations implementing postgraduate professional training programs”).

When talking with residents, all interviewed respondents (10 residents of other specialties) confirmed the objectivity and transparency of the procedure for admission to the residency program at JSC RIC&ID.

The number of residents is determined based on clinical training capabilities, as well as the needs of practical healthcare. The resources of the university, the teaching staff of the departments, the number and powerful material and technical equipment of clinical bases, the professionalism of practical healthcare staff (clinical mentors) make it possible to ensure balance and opportunities for training and recruitment of residents.

In the context of the implementation of a competency-oriented model of medical education, JSC RIC&ID operates a system of consulting residents both from teaching staff, mentors, and DPAE. Consulting of residents occurs based on the results of assessment and questioning of residents.

Thus, the experts validated the data according to standard 4. The experts reviewed the documentation for the admission of residents. The submitted documents are compiled correctly.

The organization has a resident development program. At the clinical bases of the departments, residents in the specialty “Allergology and Immunology for Adults, Children” have the opportunity to master all the necessary competencies in accordance with the stages of providing allergy care, including specialized care. At the departments, according to the Comprehensive Work Plan, the participation of residents in all medical activities of clinical bases is ensured, including consultations with allergists in other health care facilities;

According to individual plans, all residents participate in the provision of medical services, supervising thematic patients, as well as during night shifts. Residents are allowed to work with patients if they have a health certificate, after becoming familiar with the sanitary and epidemiological regime when working with patients, as well as the regulatory framework for the provision of medical care in general and in the allergy service in particular.

4.2 Number of residents

The number of accepted residents is regulated by the State Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the training of medical personnel and taking into account the possibilities

of clinical and practical training, the maximum permissible load on curators, the provision of educational, educational, methodological and scientific literature, the throughput capacity of clinical bases, as well as the material and technical resources of the Research Institute of Clinical Hospital.

According to the regulations on residency, the number of residents in each specialty per teacher is 1:3. Taking into account this ratio, today JSC RIC&ID can accept up to 9 residents for the EP “Allergology and Immunology for Adults and Children”. Thus, JSC RIC&ID has human and educational resources to admit and train residents of an accredited EP.

The first recruitment of residents for this specialty at JSC RIC&ID was carried out in the 2016-2017 academic year. In 2020, there was the first graduation of residents in the amount of 6 people. In the next 3 years, educational activities in the specialty “Allergology and Immunology for Adults and Children” were not carried out at the Research Institute of Clinical Biology and Biology.

Training of residents is carried out at the main clinical bases, represented by two branches of the Republican Allergy Center (RAC) (Almaty, Pyatnitskogo St. 52 and Aiteke Bi St. 120), the JSC RIC&ID hospital with a sufficient number of patients with allergy and immunopathology of various ages. As resident supervisors, there are teachers and mentors with the highest qualification category in the main and related specialties.

4.3 Support and advice to residents

JSC RIC&ID operates a system of academic counselling for residents at various stages of the implementation of the EP (in accordance with clause 5.3 “Academic Policy”, approved by the decision of the Academic Council, protocol 2 of 05.16.23). Consultations are provided on a regular basis by teaching staff, clinical mentors, supervisors, DPAE staff, and the institute also has a psychologist on staff who provides assistance in the event of a professional crisis.

At JSC RIC&ID, in order to optimize employment and monitor the careers of graduates, by order of the Chairman of the Board, a graduates’ career centre was organized (Regulation “On the Graduates’ Career Centre” dated 08/03/2020). The Graduate Career Centre promotes graduate employment; coordinates the work of all structural divisions on issues of professional guidance, annually conducts Personal distribution of graduates with the participation of representatives of health departments, pharmaceutical companies and public health departments of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

4.4 Representation of residents

Due to the lack of training at this time, there is no information on the stated EP. Previously, residents of an accredited specialty did not participate in advisory bodies.

4.5 Working conditions

In accordance with the current agreements between JSC RIC&ID and clinical sites, residents have access to patients in all structural units of clinics, including the RAC, intensive care unit, intensive care unit in accordance with the needs of the educational process, with the exception of cases where admission of students to the treatment process is not allowed current legislation and/or patient requirements.

According to the Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 18, 2018 No. MoH RK-16 on the approval of the Rules for the training of medical personnel in internship and the Rules for the training of medical personnel in residency, residency students studying under the state educational order are provided with a state scholarship in the prescribed manner.

Residents are annually provided with a vacation between academic years of at least 6 weeks, after the final state certification of at least 4 weeks, with the retention of the scholarship.

For residents transferred from other higher educational institutions, reinstated, remaining for a second year of study, returning from academic leave, an individual plan is drawn up based on the working curriculum approved for the corresponding academic year, taking into account the difference in the curriculum or academic debt. Part of the theoretical material from a variety of disciplines can be taught in a distance format, implemented on the basis of interaction between a remote teacher and a student, regardless of the place or time of training, using information and communication technologies (using platforms - zoom, webex). Individual terms of work are indicated by the DPAE employee in agreement with the responsible teacher of the specialty.

As part of scientific work, for the purpose of self-improvement, residents have free access to the resources of international databases of literature and scientific articles, can visit the library of JSC RIC&ID and the library of KazNMU named after. S.D. Asfendiyarova.

JSC RIC&ID provides for the combination of training with work (no more than 0.5 rates) in areas of activity close to his future specialty in his free time from study with the consent of the curator, head of the department and the residency sector.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 20 standards (including 14 basic, 6 improvement standards): fully - 19, partially -1, do not comply - 0

Standard 4: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Ensure resident representation in advisory bodies to involve them in the management of the educational process and in decision-making regarding the improvement of educational programs (4.3.8).

Standard 5: TEACHERS

Proof of compliance:

5.1 Recruitment and selection policy

Analysis of self-report data and activities carried out during the EEC visit showed that the Institute has a system of qualification requirements for teachers, on the basis of which recruitment is carried out, with the further holding of a competition according to the schedule approved by the Chairman of the Board of the Institute. The number and composition of teaching staff are planned based on the needs of the educational process, the standard teaching load per full-time teacher and student population.

JSC RIC&ID has developed uniform job descriptions, which prevents discrimination against teaching staff and creates a favorable environment for academic integrity. The Academic Policy describes the responsibilities of the teacher (clause 3.5). This document is available to all visitors to the JSC RIC&ID website https://ncvb.kz/images/Академическая_политика.pdf

When drawing up the staffing schedule for the new academic year, in order to conduct classes with residents, a mandatory requirement for teachers is to have an academic degree, academic title and work experience. It should also be noted that employees hired to teach residents from practical healthcare are subject to a number of requirements - the presence of a medical qualification category and sufficient experience in their specialty. When carrying out their professional activities, teachers and mentors must comply with the principles of ethical academic integrity.

The total number of employees in the accredited educational program is 3, of which 2 are full-time teachers, and 1 part-time. Degree level is 33.3%, the presence of a qualified medical category is 100%. At the same time, it should be noted that there is potential for the implementation of the specialty EP since 12 allergists-immunologists perform medical activities at the RAC, but there is no motivational component from the Research Institute of Clinical Hospital for working with residents.

During the visit, experts noted that JSC RIC&ID had developed, approved and implemented a personnel policy and developed the tasks and responsibilities of a mentor (clause 3.4 “Clinical mentor” in the “Academic Policy”), which the experts became familiar with during the visit. The organization has created conditions for systematic professional development of employees, improvement and standardization of the competitive personnel selection procedure.

When surveying teachers, it was found that 100% were completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace at JSC RIC&ID. Both branches have undergone renovations and created comfortable conditions for medical and educational activities.

At JSC RIC&ID, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish research results - 70% completely agree, 30% partially agree.

5.2 Faculty Commitment and Development

The main document defining the work of each teacher is an individual plan, which includes the educational (in hours), methodological, scientific, and therapeutic work planned for the current academic year, including advanced training. An individual work plan is considered at a meeting of the DPAA, after which it is approved by its head, and then by the Deputy Director for Postgraduate Education.

Planning of the volume of educational work of residency departments is carried out on the basis of the Working Curriculum and assignment of academic disciplines to the department for various types of educational work. The volume of the teaching load of teaching staff is approved for the academic year by the Scientific Council of JSC RIC&ID annually in accordance with the positions held.

JSC RIC&ID ensures that faculty and residents have adequate time for teaching, mentoring, and learning. Each type of activity accounts for 1/3 of the hours of the total amount of time, and 2/3 of the total number of hours is allocated for independent work of residents.

JSC RIC&ID has a policy for the professional development of department employees - training outside of the main activity once every five years (at least 240 hours/credit units). For employees who wish to undergo training without interruption from their main activities - training in the amount of 30 hours per week, or according to a specially established schedule.

During the meeting of the members of the EEC with the management of the institute, questions were asked to the head of the department of strategic development and organizational and methodological work, Nurlan Abdikalievich Abdikaliev, regarding the motivation of the institute's teaching staff and the answer was received that the plans of JSC RIC&ID provide for an increase in employee salaries and the introduction of differentiated payment.

Experts received answers about the teacher training program, which is conducted annually. Thus, out of 3 teachers participating in the implementation of the educational program, 2 have completed training over the past 3 years. These events are funded by the university. The expert verified a number of teacher certificates on such topics as: "Teacher in medical education and science organizations" 216 hours; "Immunology for teachers of medical universities", 120 hours (on the basis of KazNMU named after A.S. Asfendiyarov).

At JSC RIC&ID there is an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies. Among the employees of the RAC, 5 graduates of the residency program of the specialty "Allergology and Immunology, Adults, Children" are currently working in this organization, among them is Batyrbaeva A.Zh. is the head of the allergy unit, plans to continue to improve his professional level in the future - within the framework of PhD doctoral studies; two allergists received a master's degree - Avdugalieva A.A., Kuandykova L.K. The organization implements social support programs for teachers and applies additional types of incentives: announcement of gratitude; rewarding with a valuable gift; awarding a certificate of honour; submission for ranks, medals and badges of the Ministry of Health and the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Thus, among the doctors of the RAC, Beldibaeva M.B. was awarded with Certificate "Densaulyk saktau isine koskan ylesi ushin" and Batyrbaeva A.Zh. was awarded with Certificate of honour from the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

At the same time, experts noted that JSC RIC&ID does not have mechanisms for motivating practicing doctors at clinical sites to involve them in training residents not only as teachers, but also for mentoring.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 8 standards (including 7 basic, 1 Standard improvement): fully - 7, partially -1, do not comply - 0.

Standard 5: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Strengthen the academic staff of the program with specialists with academic degrees in specialty 7R01104 "Allergology and immunology for adults and children."

2) Develop a program for the development of professional and pedagogical competencies of teachers and mentors of specialty 7R01104 "Allergology and immunology for adults, children" (5.2.2).

3) To intensify the publishing activities of teachers (publications, monographs, teaching aids, development of intellectual property certificates, etc.) of specialty 7R01104 “Allergology and immunology for adults, children.”

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

Proof of compliance:

6.1 Logistics and equipment

JSC RIC&ID has a sufficient material and technical base for the implementation of the educational process for EP residency. The DPAA includes 3 lecture halls, 11 classrooms for seminars and practical classes, 4 scientific and practical laboratories, 1 computer class, 2 scientific and methodological rooms. To master practical skills, 4 training and simulation centers have been created - a simulation endoscopic center; cardiopulmonary resuscitation simulation center; simulation center for interventional cardiology and arrhythmology; simulation center (hybrid laboratory) for providing “Emergency cardiac care”, providing “Urgent resuscitation care”, “Providing medical care for COVID-19”.

The structural divisions of the institute include the CDC, RAC, a hospital with 188 beds, and a day hospital. The institute has a single laboratory to which doctors and residents of all specialties have access. The activities of the RAC carry out laboratory and instrumental studies (general clinical tests, allergy diagnostics in vivo/in vitro, enzyme immunoassays, rhinocytogram, peak fluometry, spirometry, modern ENT combine, etc.). Since January last year, RAC has been providing its services as a subcontractor.

The institute’s corporate network provides access to modern databases in the field of medicine: EbscoHost-Medline, Springerlink, Scopus, Web of Science, Elsevier, Thomson Reuters.

During the visit, library staff were asked a question about the mechanisms for updating the resources of the information fund and the answer was received that every year, applications are received from departments and teaching staff implementing residency programs indicating additional necessary literature. The information received is transferred to the management responsible for logistics and a plan is drawn up for the implementation of these requests.

6.2 Clinical sites

To carry out educational activities in the specialty “Allergology and immunology for adults and children,” the institute has a CDC, a RAC, therapeutic departments of a hospital, and a day hospital. The main clinical base is the RAC, which was reorganized by joining the institute on the basis of Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 17, 2014 No. 367 and is currently a structural subdivision of the institute called the RAC (according to the Order of the Director of the Research Institute of Biology and Biology of October 15, 2014). RAC has 2 branches in Almaty and provides specialized allergological consultative and diagnostic assistance to the population of the Republic of Kazakhstan within the framework of the compulsory medical insurance and the guaranteed volume of free medical care, as well as on a paid basis. Agreements have been signed with more than 85 organizations throughout the country. The volume of services performed in 2022 amounted to 76,199 services per year, which is 30 percent more than the previous year.

The total number of offices in the 2 branches of the RAC is 23, the total area is 484 sq.m. The material and technical base allows us to provide highly qualified allergy care to the population throughout the republic. The RAC provides consultations with an allergist, immunologist for adults and children, a pulmonologist, and an ENT doctor. The RAC has 25 employees - 12 doctors, of which 4 doctors have the highest qualification category, 6 doctors have the first qualification category.

In the therapy department No. 2 there are 2 allergy beds and 7 pulmonology beds, where patients with bronchial asthma are mainly hospitalized. The institute's day hospital provides daily substitute care to patients with allergic diseases. There are plans to renew the agreement with No. 2 Children's City Clinical Hospital regarding the provision of a clinical base in the allergy department. Also, after

completing accreditation and recruiting residents, it is planned to conclude an agreement with the Almaty Multidisciplinary Clinical Hospital.

A review of resources showed that clinical bases (RAC, day hospital and therapy department No. 2) correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, and employees of the educational organization ensure collegial and ethical relationships with medical staff and the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of residents. A sufficient number of thematic patients, equipment is provided and demonstrates accessibility to students, and employees who simultaneously perform the roles of teachers and curators (mentors) provide high-quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the corresponding discipline of the educational program, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during his time at the institute.

The experts obtained evidence of compliance with standard 6, as well as validation of the self-assessment report information.

At the same time, it should be noted that the current availability of diagnostic methods in the arsenal of the RAC is not sufficient to conduct scientific and clinical research in the field of allergology that meets international standards and practice. To implement scientific projects, attract residents, as well as teaching staff, to scientific activities, it is necessary to improve laboratory diagnostics by including methods of modern molecular diagnostics (allergenic testing, etc.) and immunological tests.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence about the quality of the programs, interviews were conducted with teaching staff and mentors of the accredited specialty. The experts asked questions to residents of other specialties about satisfaction with training, sufficient time to supervise patients, work in Damumed with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents in need, availability of international databases of professional literature and received convincing answers that for the implementation of educational activities there are sufficient conditions and material and technical basis for residency training.

Experts examined documents for residents (EMCD, portfolio, checklists) and contracts with medical institutions in Almaty.

6.3 Information technology

Residents of the institute have access to external electronic resources: full-text databases ScienceDirekt, Scopus, EBSCO and others. To provide the ability to work with various internal and external resources, a Wi-Fi wireless network is also used. This solution meets modern requirements for providing students with constant access to educational resources on the local network and the Internet. Since 2023, the institute has implemented the Platonus automated information system.

The information fund of the library is >30,000 copies, 11,100 titles, including medical scientific journals, monographs, conference materials (5374 copies), educational literature (366 copies), literature in the Kazakh language (670 copies), foreign literature (684 copies), reference literature (982 copies), methodological literature (898 copies), abstracts (1350 copies) and dissertations (256 copies), electronic literature on CDs, DVDs (150 copies), electronic textbooks, monographs and journals (2364 copies).

About 70 copies of periodical journals are issued annually to users, in paper and electronic format, among which 57 titles are of a scientific, medical and educational nature.

JSC RIC&ID can organize the development of the theoretical part of the educational program through the programs - zoom and google class, if an emergency situation arises. Distance learning is used only when conducting telemedicine.

6.4 Clinical teams

During the training process, residents, as a result of daily clinical activities, have the opportunity to interdisciplinary interaction in the process of discussing clinical cases (daily rounds, consultations, telemedicine consultations). In the process of clinical training on the basis of health care facilities, residents gain skills in examining patients, diagnosing and providing emergency care for life-

threatening conditions, prescribing a set of laboratory tests, establishing a diagnosis and carrying out treatment measures, etc. while working with patients in a team with experienced, qualified specialists. Provide emergency assistance in the emergency room during scheduled duty hours. Residents have the opportunity to take part in joint rounds of the professor, associate professor, head of the department, and in conducting clinical and pathological conferences.

The presence of diagnostic departments on our own base also allows us to successfully communicate with specialists in laboratory services, endoscopic, radiation and functional diagnostics. In addition, the presence of soft skills and communication skills in communicating with patients and their families, and specialists from other health care facilities are also strengthened during clinical work. Having a scientific background allows residents to develop additional analytical thinking.

6.5 Medical research and advances

In the process of studying the self-report of the accredited person, confirming data on scientific and technical progress and research work were not obtained. When meeting with the teaching staff of JSC RIC&ID, information was received that students of the institute have the opportunity to improve their scientific thinking skills through training at seminars or master classes with the involvement of foreign specialists, as well as through participation in republican and international conferences, symposiums, etc. From interviews with residents of other specialties, it was established that residents are involved as medical researchers in the implementation of scientific and technical progress of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as grant research of phases I-IV. One of the documents confirming competence in scientific activities is a portfolio with reports (oral and posters), programs of events and publications of the resident.

An interview with 3 teachers, including 2 full-time teachers, showed that teaching staff of the accredited specialty do not take part in scientific and technological progress, but taking into account the presence of experience in implementing scientific projects of the institute, sufficient scientific potential of related specialties, in this direction, within the framework of an integrated approach it is necessary to intensify the scientific activities of both teaching staff and residents.

6.6 Educational expertise

In order to ensure the quality of the EP, the institute at all levels monitors and evaluates the effectiveness of the EP on a regular basis through: examination of the content of the EP by members of working groups from the DPAAE; annual revision of syllabuses taking into account new requirements.

The examination is carried out in the form of an analysis of the needs for specialists, an analysis of resident training methods, and the results allow us to draw conclusions about the quality of innovative changes in postgraduate education.

As a result of the ongoing work on examination in the field of education at JSC RIC&ID, corresponding innovations have been introduced in the educational process, which allow the development of broader and more specialized competencies (assessment of mastery of practical procedures, discussion of a clinical case, patient examination, portfolio assessment, feedback (MSF - Multi- Source Feedback), assessment of the quality of medical documentation (AA - Audit Assessment Tool), assessment of student progress (ARCP - Decision on Progress), peer assessment (PA - Peer Assessment), self-assessment (SA - Self-Assessment), etc. Also during meetings The Journal Club (JC - Journalclub) holds regular discussions on cutting-edge trends in medicine and healthcare.

At the same time, anti-plagiarism and proctoring systems for analyzing the results of educational achievements of residents, the validity and reliability of test material have not previously been implemented, but with the introduction of the AIS "Platonus" program into the educational process in 2023, taking into account the capabilities of this information system, the institute has a real opportunity to implement high-quality monitoring of the analysis of key indicators of education performance. It was also noted that there were no research projects on the quality of postgraduate and additional education at JSC RIC&ID.

6.7 Training in other institutions

The Institute cooperates within the framework of a strategic partnership with international clinical centers and universities near and far abroad: Research Institute of Cardiology of the Tomsk Research

Medical Center; Federal State Budgetary Institution "National Medical Research Center" named after V.A. Almazova, Russian Federation; Scientific and Medical Research Center named after Academician E. N. Meshalkin, Novosibirsk, Russian Federation; "Crisis Research Center", Kaunas, Lithuania; Seoul National University Hospital, Korea; Be'er Sheva Medical Center, Israel, University Hospital of Milan, Italy.

During a conversation with the head of the allergological department, Batyrbaeva A.Zh. information was received that it is planned to expand the list of partners with leading centers providing allergological and immunological care to adults and children. Among the contractual relations planned in 2022-2023 by JSC RIC&ID are the following International Universities: Sechenov University (Russian Federation), Kazan Medical University (Russian Federation), updating of the memorandum with NJSK Astana Medical University (Kazakhstan), etc.

Residents of other specialties have the opportunity to undergo training in other institutions, but to date, the implementation of academic mobility among teaching staff and residents of the specialty "Allergology and Immunology for Adults, Children" has not been carried out.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply with 18 standards (including 11 basic, 7 improvement standards): fully - 16, partially -2, do not comply - 0

Standard 6: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Expanding the diagnostic capabilities of the Republican Allergy Centre using modern methods of molecular allergy diagnostics (clause 6.2).
- 2) As part of an integrated approach, it is necessary to intensify the scientific activities of both teaching staff and residents in the implementation of scientific projects and clinical research of the institute in the field of allergology and immunology (clause 6.5).

Standard 7: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM EVALUATION

Proof of compliance:

7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

At the institute, internal monitoring and evaluation of the specialty EP is carried out at all levels of education, including major departments, CEP, DPAE, AC, by receiving feedback from stakeholders (employers, professional associations and students). The assessment of the EP is directly monitored by the responsible teacher of the specialty, appointed by the DPAE, the head of the DPAE, the deputy chairman of the Board for Scientific, Clinical and Innovation Activities. The results of the inspection are heard and discussed at meetings of the department, DPAE and AC.

External assessment of the EP is carried out through the process of specialized accreditation by an accreditation body included in the Register 1 of recognized accreditation bodies of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

7.2 Feedback from faculty and residents

During the EEC visit, the results of feedback from the specialty "Allergology and immunology for adults and children" were not demonstrated.

When studying the documentation, DPAE provided information on the annual collection of opinions on the quality of the educational program from employers. At the same time, there is no information on the results of feedback from teachers and residency graduates.

7.3 Resident and Graduate Outcomes

During the last years of implementation of the EP "Allergology and Immunology for Adults and Children," the graduation of residents was carried out in 2020, a total of 6 people. Among the graduates of the specialty, all teachers successfully passed the final exam, 1 - with "excellent", 5 - with "good". When visiting clinical sites and talking with mentors and teaching staff of the program, it was noted that everyone was satisfied with the level of training of graduates, specialists are in demand in health care facilities in the city and are 100% employed.

7.4 Stakeholder engagement

Independent monitoring of data on the implementation and achievement of final learning outcomes is carried out by independent certification of graduates of the EP through the National Centre for Independent Examination by surveying employers.

JSC RIC&ID involves the main stakeholders in the program for monitoring and evaluating EP with the involvement of employees of the National Centre for Independent Examination, employers (health care institutions of the Republic).

During the EEC visit, an online conversation was held with employers (3 representatives of various medical institutions in Almaty). During the interview, questions were asked regarding the mission of JSC RIC&ID, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, participation in the educational process, and satisfaction with the level of training of residents, employment of residency graduates, etc. The experts received complete and convincing answers demonstrating full awareness of employers about the educational process. Employers 100% noted the high level of training of graduates and their demand in the labour market.

7.5 Procedure for approval of educational programs

During the study of documents and a visit to JSC RIC&ID, confirmation was received that the institute has developed mechanisms for approving EP, providing for the assessment of programs at the stages of planning, implementation, analysis of results and implementation of changes, which allows monitoring the process of EP implementation and the progress of residents, and ensures identification and timely decisions emerging problems.

The EP in the specialty is developed by a working group of specialists in the field of allergology and immunology, then discussed at the CEP meeting and further considered at the DPAE meeting, and then approved by the AC.

This procedure is carried out annually, after which disciplines are introduced into the CED that make it possible to enhance the achievement of the expected final learning outcomes.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 10 standards (including 7 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully -8, partially - 2, do not comply - 0

Standard 7: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) To develop a feedback mechanism with graduates, residents and employers to improve the educational program 7R01104 “Allergology and immunology for adults, children.”
- 2) Improve the assessment of the quality of the educational program and monitoring of its implementation by documenting this process with recording of the results, including recommendations for improving the educational program.

Standard 8: MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION

Proof of compliance:

8.1 Management

At JSC RIC&ID, the competence of management bodies is determined by the current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and internal regulatory documents. In accordance with standard documents, the institute has developed and approved regulations for each division, defining the structure, management and accountability, goals, objectives and functions of structural divisions, as well as job descriptions for each position provided for in the staffing table.

The activities of management regarding the fulfilment of the mission and the solution of tasks assigned to JSC RIC&ID are studied and assessed on the basis of the analysis and generation of reports and plans, analysis of the implementation of the goals and objectives of the strategic plan, internal audit reports (according to the plan), and the results of the work of internal and external commissions.

Students can also be involved in the process of assessing management’s activities by expressing their opinions and wishes at the end of the training cycle or mastering a specific discipline, or through a survey to identify opinions and take into account comments and suggestions from direct consumers.

JSC RIC&ID has developed and approved an important management tool - “Academic Policy”, which guides all structural divisions when managing the residency educational program. Coordination of implementation, control and monitoring of the implementation of residency programs in all licensed specialties is carried out by the DPAE under the supervision of the head of the department of strategic development and organizational and methodological work.

Ensuring the quality of the educational process in residency is determined by fulfilling the mandatory requirements for the level of training (State Educational Standard 2022) of the EP and the creation of a system for monitoring the effectiveness of the teaching staff and the implementation of the resident’s individual plan. Monitoring the quality of the educational process is carried out by DPAE, members of the educational programs committee, and independent experts.

Evaluation of residents and the achievement of final learning outcomes in the residency program are carried out on the basis of a final state certification. Every year, the rector’s order is issued on the conduct of the FSC and the composition of the certification commission.

Determining the financial and economic policy of JSC RIC&ID and the management structure of the institute is the responsibility of the first head of the university - the Chairman of the Board and the Deputy Chairman of the Board for strategic and financial-economic issues. In order to ensure the efficient use of financial resources (including distribution), a budget commission has been created, which reviews the results of the formation and use of financial resources. According to the data obtained from self-reports and interviews with managers, the university has a stable financial condition, financial and economic activities are aimed at ensuring financial stability and solvency for its obligations, increasing income, stability of wages, strengthening the material and technical base and is carried out in accordance with the law of the RK.

Thus, JSC RIC&ID implements residency EP in accordance with regulations approved by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as internal rules for organizing the educational process in residency.

8.2 Academic leadership

The educational process is managed in accordance with the organizational structure of JSC RIC&ID (approved by the Board of Directors, Minutes No. 40 of October 30, 2022). The governing body is the Board of Directors, the executive body is the Board: Chairman of the Board, Deputy Chairman of the Board for Scientific, Clinical and Innovation Work, Deputy Chairman of the Board for Strategic Development and Financial and Economic Issues, Head of the Department of Strategic Development and Organizational and Methodological Work.

At JSC RIC&ID, the management of residency programs and coordination of the activities of residents from the moment the residency exists is carried out by the DPAE. The main goal of the department is to carry out continuous organizational, coordination and administrative work aimed at achieving the mission and goals of educational programs, including residency in an accredited specialty. The department reports directly to the Deputy Chairman of the Board for Scientific and Clinical Activities, the Chairman of the Board.

The management of the activities of the DPAE is carried out by a manager appointed to the position by order of the Chairman of the Board. The department is responsible for making the following decisions: rules for organizing the educational process in residency, recommendations for recruiting residents, and training residents. Department employees also monitor residents, maintain relations with the practical healthcare sector and residency graduates, and interact with other structural divisions of the institute involved in the implementation and support of residency programs.

To the question of the questionnaire “Do the leaders of the organization listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research work, and clinical work,” 70% of teachers answered that systematically, 20% answered “sometimes,” 10% - no answer.

8.3 Training budget and resource allocation

At JSC RIC&ID, the responsibility and authority for managing the budgets of the EP residency is assigned to the Deputy Chairman of the Board for Financial and Economic Issues, the Planning and Economic Analysis Department, and the Accounting and Reporting Department.

When reviewing the documents and during the visit to the organization, it was noted that the distribution of resources for training residents is regulated by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Budget Program 006), the calculation of training costs is regulated in accordance with Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 474 “On approval of standards for calculating the cost of training for one resident, student residency, undergraduate, doctoral (PhD) students in educational organizations and scientific organizations in the field of healthcare within the country under the state educational order (with amendments and additions in accordance with Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 08/08/2011 No. 510 as of 08/08/2011), JSC RIC&ID Development Plan, JSC RIC&ID Public Procurement Plan for the current year.

Resource support for the educational process, including the target budget for training, is carried out by the planning and economic analysis department, whose employees provide material support for the program by drawing up cost estimates for training residents. The cost estimate for residency is included in the JSC RIC&ID Development Plan and in the Institute’s Public Procurement Plan.

8.4 Administration and management

JSC RIC&ID creates and strengthens strategic relationships with healthcare and education managers from government agencies, rectors of universities and academies, employers, and managers from medical institutions. Work with stakeholders is systematic: areas of activity with partners are laid down in the Institute’s Strategic and Operational Plans, in the clinic development plan for the current year, in the government procurement plan for the current year, tactical plans by type of activity, in the work plan of the Board of Directors of JSC RIC&ID, respectively in bilateral (multilateral) agreements (memorandums) on the provision of clinical sites; mutual understanding on academic cooperation, etc.

A wider range of stakeholders includes authorized bodies in the field of education and healthcare (Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan), representatives of the public, professional organizations, as well as persons and structures responsible for postgraduate education.

The Institute’s policy for the development of teaching staff is to clearly plan personnel policies, develop incentive measures and rewards for achievements in work. Types of incentives for teaching staff and the procedure for their application are determined by the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and orders of the Chairman of the Board.

JSC RIC&ID has created and operates an independent internal audit system and a quality management system (hereinafter referred to as the QMS). DPAE directly controls all stages of training. The results of the analysis of the assessment of the educational achievements of residents are discussed at the meetings of the CEP, DPAE and CS.

To the survey question “Do the leaders of the organization listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research work, and clinical work,” all teachers answered in the affirmative.

8.5 Requirements and regulations

JSC RIC&ID provides educational services in accordance with the perpetual state license for postgraduate professional education No. KZ19LAA00012857 dated September 18, 2018.

Internal documents regulating the educational activities of JSC RIC&ID are the Regulations on DPAE, On the development and approval of EP, Regulations on the mentor, On the ongoing monitoring of the progress of intermediate and end-of course assessment of students and the corresponding ones.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 11 standards (including 8 basic, 3 improvement standards): fully - 10, partially - 1, do not comply - 0

Standard 8: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Improve the mechanisms of motivation of teaching staff and mentors in the implementation of the residency program.

- 2) Optimization of the organizational structure of JSC RIC&ID (creation of a course/department of allergology) and management system through further implementation of corporate governance principles.

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

JSC RIC&ID monitors and controls regulatory and legal acts in the field of medical education, which allows eliminating inconsistencies in its activities. The Institute is updating internal documents for compliance react in a timely manner to changes in society, changing internal and external conditions.

The organizational structure of JSC RIC&ID has been updated and includes a direction related to educational activities under the supervision of the Deputy Chairman of the Board for scientific, clinical and innovative activities. <https://ncvb.kz/ob-institute/struktura>

The department and DPAE are responsible for the process of continuous improvement of the educational program.

The residency program “Allergology and immunology for adults and children” is undergoing initial accreditation, so there has been no update of the program. At the same time, DPAE exercises control over the processes involved in educational activities, the updating of teaching materials, information and library resources.

In 2021, the institute updated the Process Map of educational services for postgraduate professional and additional education programs and contains a description of the processes of planning, approval, implementation of educational programs, process performance indicators and resources for the functioning of the process.

As part of the continuous improvement of the work of the DPAE, the department’s report, which contains a full analysis of the activities, is heard annually at a meeting of the Board of Directors.

Experts noted the transparency of the management system and decisions made at the level of postgraduate education. The responsibility of academic leadership (DPAE and department) in relation to the development and management of EP has been determined. The stable financial position of JSC RIC&ID was noted.

JSC RIC&ID has planned to create an Academic Council, the main purpose of which will be to determine the list of educational programs, design, develop and improve training programs for residents and students of continuous professional development programs. It is planned to introduce a risk management system in educational activities.

The institute’s management also plans to train heads of structural divisions of JSC RIC&ID on management issues in education and science, and to annually improve the qualifications of employees and teachers in their areas of activity.

Experts noted that since 2016, JSC RIC&ID has maintained a certified quality management system (QMS) and has national accreditation.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Complies with 2 standards (including 1 basic, 1 Standard improvement): completely – 2.

Standard 9: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Expand the range of cooperation with medical educational and healthcare organizations in order to effectively implement the educational program and the possibility of training residents at alternative bases.

CONCLUSION:

When conducting an external assessment of the educational program, it was found that out of **114 standards** (including 82 basic standards and 32 improvement standards), 102 accreditation standards demonstrate full compliance, including 75 basic standards and 27 improvement standards. 12 standards were partially met, including 7 (9%) basic and 5 (17%) improvement standards.

5. Recommendations for improving the educational program 7R01104 “Allergology and immunology for adults, children” of the Scientific Research Institute of Clinical Biology:

Standard 1:

- 1) Update the mission of the educational program in specialty 7R01104 “Allergology and immunology for adults, children” with the participation of residents and employers, document this process and bring information about the mission to the attention of interested parties.

Standard 2:

- 2) Improve the processes of introducing innovative teaching methods in the implementation of the residency educational program (2.4.2).
- 3) Introduce an anti-plagiarism system into the results of research and independent work of residents.
- 4) Expand clinical training opportunities at all levels of health care, including work in the regions (2.4.3).

Standard 3:

- 5) Regularly analyze and evaluate the quality of the methods used and the assessment format for the validity and reliability of the final learning outcomes.
- 6) In assessing the knowledge of residents of the educational program 7R01104 “Allergology and immunology for adults, children,” use the capabilities of the institute’s simulation center.

Standard 4:

- 7) Ensure resident representation in advisory bodies in order to involve them in the management of the educational process and in decision-making regarding the improvement of educational programs.

Standard 5:

- 8) Strengthen the academic staff of the program with specialists with academic degrees in specialty 7R01104 “Allergology and immunology for adults and children.”
- 9) Develop a program for the development of professional and pedagogical competencies of teachers and mentors of the specialty (5.2.2).
- 10) To intensify the publishing activities of teachers (publications, monographs, teaching aids, development of intellectual property certificates, etc.) of the specialty.

Standard 6:

- 11) Expanding the diagnostic capabilities of the Republican Allergy Center using modern methods of molecular allergy diagnostics (clause 6.2).
- 12) As part of an integrated approach, it is necessary to intensify the scientific activities of both teaching staff and residents in the implementation of scientific projects and clinical research of the institute in the field of allergology and immunology (clause 6.5).

Standard 7:

- 13) To develop a feedback mechanism with graduates, residents and employers to improve the educational program of the specialty.

Standard 8:

- 14) Improve the mechanisms of motivation of teaching staff and mentors in the implementation of the residency program.
- 15) Optimization of the organizational structure of JSC RIC&ID (creation of a course/department of allergology) and management system through further implementation of corporate governance principles.

Standard 9:

- 16) Expand the range of cooperation with medical educational and healthcare organizations in order to effectively implement the educational program and the possibility of training residents at alternative bases.

6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

Members of the EEC established the compliance of the residency educational program in specialty 7R01104 “Allergology and Immunology for Adults, Children” JSC RIC&ID with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend that the ECAQA Accreditation Council accredit this program for a period of 3 years.

	Full name	Signature
Chairperson of EEC	Morenko Marina Alekseevna	
Foreign Expert	Saatova Guli Mirakhmatovna	
National Academic Expert	Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna	
National Academic Expert	Kurmanova Almagul Medeubaevna	
Employers' Representative	Alimbetova Mayra Serikovna	
Residents' Representative	Ismailov Musa Kenzhegaliuly	

Quality profile and criteria for external assessment of an educational program (summary)

Standard	Criteria for evaluation	Number of standards	BS*/SI	Rating		
				Totally compliant	Partially compliant	Does not compliant
1.	MISSION AND END RESULTS	14	9/5	12	2	
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM	22	19/3	20	2	
3.	RESIDENT ASSESSMENT	9	6/3	8	1	
4.	RESIDENTS	20	14/6	19	1	
5.	ACADEMIC STAFF/TEACHERS	8	7/1	7	1	
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	18	11/7	16	2	
7.	EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM	10	7/3	8	2	
8.	MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION	11	8/3	10	1	
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	2	1/1	2	0	
				75/27	7/5	
		114	82/32	114		

List of documents studied by members of the EEC as part of an external assessment of the residency educational program

№	Documents name	Quantity
1.	Academic policy	1
2.	Involved residents in science	1
3.	Agreement with city clinic No. 5	1
4.	Agreement with JSC South Kazakhstan Medical Academy	1
5.	Agreement with NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"	1
6.	Job description of a resident doctor (Kazakh, Russian)	2
7.	IMS competency model of graduate resident	1
8.	Personnel policy	1
9.	Process map	1
10.	Code of honor	1
11.	Bed capacity	1
12.	Catalog of elective disciplines	1
13.	Memorandum with NJSC "Astana Medical University"	1
14.	Opinions of employers about JSC RIC&ID graduates 2019	2
15.	On approval of the price for paid services provided during residency training from 08/11/2022	1
16.	Educational program "Allergology and Immunology"	1
17.	Employment report	1
18.	Work plan of the educational programs committee	1
19.	Teacher training plan for 2023-2024	1
20.	Regulations on Clinical Preceptors	1
21.	Regulations on the Council of Young Scientists	1
22.	Regulations on DPAE (departments)	1
23.	Regulations on conducting ongoing monitoring of the progress of intermediate and end-of course assessment of students	1
24.	Regulations on the development and approval of EP	1
25.	Rules for admission to residency for the 2022-2025 academic year	1
26.	CEP Order	1
27.	Order on the creation of an appeal commission	1
28.	Order on employment of a resident	2
29.	Protocol of the Academic Council	1
30.	Protocol of DPAE dated 06/20/23	1
31.	Protocol of DPAE dated 06/27/23	1
32.	Minutes of the Academic Council - approval of the Mission	1
33.	Minutes of the Academic Council - approval of the educational program	1
34.	Review of the educational program	1
35.	Certificate in Pedagogy Nurpeisova T.T.	1
36.	SOP on the development and approval of a system for assessing educational achievements	1
37.	SOP-Rules-for-current-control-of-student-progress	1
38.	Strategic indicators 2022-2026	1
39.	Minutes of the Academic Council No. 3 of 03/28/2023	1
40.	Minutes of the Academic Council No. 5 dated 05/24/2023	1
41.	Agreement with the Eureka Press library	1
42.	Teacher Code of Ethics	1

ЕСАQA