

To the Accreditation Council
of Eurasian Accreditation Center
and Quality Assurance
in Education and Healthcare
May 23, 2024

**REPORT
OF EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION
ACCORDING TO THE RESULTS OF EVALUATION OF
EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM
BY SPECIALTY 7R01136 "GENERAL SURGERY"
OF THE JSC "NATIONAL SCIENTIFIC CENTER OF SURGERY NAMED
AFTER A.N. SYZGANOV"
FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF
POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMS (RESIDENCE SPECIALTY) OF
MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS**

external expert evaluation period: May 21-23, 2024

Almaty, 2024

CONTENT

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1	Presentation of the educational program in the specialty “General Surgery” of the JSC “National Scientific Center of Surgery named after A.N. Syzganov”	4
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	6
2.3	Brief description of the results of the analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational program in the specialty “General Surgery” and conclusions about completion	6
3.	Description of external expert evaluation and conclusion	7
4.	Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational program “General Surgery”	8
5.	Recommendations for improvement of the educational program in the specialty “General Surgery”	39
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council on the accreditation of the educational program in the specialty “General Surgery”	40
	Annex 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation and educational program of residency in the specialty of the educational program in the specialty “General Surgery” of the JSC “National Scientific Center of Surgery named after A.N. Syzganov”	40
	Annex 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	41

LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare
EEC	External Expert Commission
MSHE RK	Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan
AMP	Administrative and management personnel
HEI	Higher education institution
SCC	State Certification Commission
SCSE	State compulsory Standard of Education
DSHR	Department of Science and Human Resources
End-of-course assessment	End-of-course assessment
IEP	Individual educational plan
CD	Clinical disciplines
IMIS, AIS, Damu	Medical information systems
CP	Clinical protocol
CC	Component of choice
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
MOH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
RW	Research work
NSCS	Joint Stock Company "National Scientific Centre of Surgery named after. A.N. Syzganov"
NCIE	National Center for Independent Examinations
EP	Educational program
OSCE	Objective structural clinical examination
MD	Major disciplines
DPCE	Department of Postgraduate Continuing Education
PHC	Primary health care
Academic staff	Academic staff
WC	Working curriculum
RCHD	Republican Center for Health Development
IWR, IWRT	Independent work of a resident, independent work
ST RK ISO, QMS	Quality management system of the Republic of Kazakhstan
TW	Typical curriculum
EMCD	Educational and methodological complex of the discipline
EMC	Educational and methodological council
AC	Academic Council
CBL	Case-based learning
ESG	European Higher Education Area
ESC	European Society of Cardiology
MCQ	Multiple choice question
RBL	Resource Based Learning
TBL	Team-oriented training

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with the ECAQA Order No. 16 dated May 2, 2024, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the residency educational program in the specialty “General Surgery” of the JSC “National Scientific Center of Surgery named after A.N. Syzganov” during the period May 21-23, 2024, with the following composition:

No.	Status as part of the EEC	Full name	Academic degree/title, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	Chairperson	Shabdarbaeva Dariya Muratovna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Pathologist of the highest category, Forensic Medical Examiner of the highest category, Head of the Department of Pathological Anatomy and Forensic Medicine named after Professor Yu. V. Pruglo, NJSC “Semey Medical University”
2	Foreign expert	Sattarov Jamoliddin Bakhronovich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Hospital Pediatric Surgery, Pediatric Oncology, Head of the Department of Quality Control of Education, Tashkent Pediatric Medical Institute, Republic of Uzbekistan, pediatric surgeon of the highest category
3	Academic expert	Kozhakhmetov Saken Kairullinovich	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Surgical Diseases named after Professor Tsoi G.V., “Astana Medical University” NJSC
4	Expert-employer	Nadueva Yelvira Sezhofeevna	President of the Private Institution "UZDIK DORIGER", Deputy Director of the Clinic "NeuroLab" LLP
5	Expert-learner	Guseva Kristina Alexandrovna	Resident of the second year of study in the specialty "General Surgery" of the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"
6	ECAQA Observer	Amandykov Alibek Begendikovich	Head of the Department of International Cooperation and Public Relations, NU “Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare”

The EEC report includes a description of the results and the conclusion of an external evaluation of the educational program “General Surgery” of the JSC “National Scientific Center of Surgery named after A.N. Syzganov” for compliance with the Accreditation Standards for postgraduate education programs (residency specialties) of medical educational institutions and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above-mentioned educational program and recommendations for accreditation for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the residency educational program in the specialty “General Surgery” of the JSC “National Scientific Center of Surgery named after A.N. Syzganov”

Name of organization, legal form of ownership, BIN	JSC “National Scientific Center for Surgery named after A.N. Syzganov” (hereinafter referred to as NSCS) Joint Stock Company, form of ownership - private 990240008204
Governing body	Board of Directors
Full name of the first manager	Baimakhanov Bolatbek Bimendeyevich
Establishment date	April, 1945
Location and contact details	The Republic of Kazakhstan, 050004, Almaty, Zheltoksan Str., 62 Tel/fax: 8(727) 279-95-05 e-mail: info@nnch.kz
State license for educational activities in residency (date, number)	Permanent State license to engage in educational activities in the field of postgraduate education (without term limitation) No. 12018231 dated November 21, 2012. Annex to the state license No. 001 (order of the Committee for Control in the Sphere of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 1543 dated November 21, 2012). Certificate of institutional accreditation. State license of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 12018231 dated November 21, 2012.
Information about branches, subsidiaries (if any)	no
Year of commencement of the accredited educational program (EP)	2022
Duration of training	3 years
Total number of graduates since the beginning of the EP implementation	no
Number of residents in the EP since the beginning of the current academic year	13
Full-time teachers/ part-time workers involved in the implementation of the educational program	The total number of teachers is 12, including full-time teachers - 8, part-time teachers - 4. Degree, % - Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor - 25%, Candidate of Medical Sciences - 42%, PhD - 25% Categorization,% - 100%
Website Instagram Facebook with active pages	https://nnch.kz/ syzganov_clinic https://www.facebook.com/nnch.kz/

Over the years of its development, the NSCS has become one of the leaders in the system of postgraduate medical education for training a new generation of competitive specialists in the field of healthcare, a leading scientific and clinical center of the Republic of Kazakhstan, operating in accordance with national and international standards of quality and safety based on the integration of

education, science, practices and innovative approaches in the interests of the individual, society, and state.

The management of educational activities was implemented through collegial bodies: the Academic Council, the Dissertation Council, the Council for Assigning Categories to Specialists, the Educational and Methodological Council and the Department of Postgraduate Continuing Education.

In 2010, for the first time in the history of the center, a postgraduate education department was organized.

In 2012, the NSCS received a license for educational activities in 4 residency specialties, in accordance with the permanent State license for educational activities in the field of postgraduate education (without term limitation) No. 12018231 dated November 21, 2012. Annex to the state license No. 001 (order of the Control Committee in the field of education and science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 1543 dated November 21, 2012); Certificate of institutional accreditation. State license of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 12018231 dated November 21, 2012; Certificate of specialized accreditation. State license of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 12018231 dated November 21, 2012.

To implement educational programs for additional professional education (advanced training and retraining of doctors) and residency training, in order to control the conduct of educational, methodological and organizational work in the field of education, an Educational and Methodological Council was opened in August 2014 to review and approve the educational methodological documentation of the postgraduate education sector (Order No. 262-p dated 08/09/2013).

In 2021, NSCS successfully passed state accreditation from the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the right to conduct research work at the expense of the state budget for a period of 5 years (No. 000047 dated February 25, 2021, MES RK). The first in the city of Almaty to successfully pass state accreditation from the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the right to conduct clinical trials of medicines, medical devices and medical technologies for a period of 5 years.

For the period 2012-2022 at the NSCS, 168 specialists were trained in practical healthcare in the specialty “Anesthesiology and resuscitation, including children’s”, “Cardiac surgery, including children’s”, “Radiation diagnostics” and “General surgery”

Every year, the department of postgraduate education achieves 100% of the indicators according to the strategic plan of the NSCS for educational activities (employment and passing tests the first time).

The founding principles of the center include the integration of education, science, practice and innovative approaches, which allows it to maintain national and international standards of quality and safety in the medical field. The educational activities of the center are managed through collegial bodies, including the Educational and Methodological Council and the Department of Postgraduate Continuing Education.

National Scientific Center for Surgery named after A.N. Syzganova is one of the leaders in the system of postgraduate medical education and training of specialists in the field of healthcare. In 2021, the center successfully passed state accreditation for the right to conduct research work at the expense of the state budget for 5 years, as well as accreditation to conduct clinical trials of medicines. These achievements confirm the reputation of the center as a leading scientific and clinical institution in the Republic of Kazakhstan.

2.2 Information about previous accreditation

Certificate of primary specialized accreditation No. 0003 dated June 24, 2019. Educational program: 6R113700 “General Surgery.”

2.3 Brief description of the results of the analysis of the self-assessment report of the residency educational program in the specialty “General Surgery” and conclusions about completion

The report on self-assessment of the residency educational program in the specialty “**General Surgery**” (hereinafter referred to as the report) is presented on 88 pages of main text, 9 pages of annexes, electronic versions of documents located at the link:<https://nnch.kz/strategicheskie-i-programmnye-dokumenty/strategicheskij-plan-ao-nntsh-im-a-n-syzganova/>
<https://nnch.kz/otdel-postdiplomnogo-obrazovaniya/rezidentura/>
<https://nnch.kz/otdel-postdiplomnogo-obrazovaniya/>
<https://nnch.kz/publikatsii-po-ntp/>
<https://nnch.kz/perechen-zarubezhnyh-publikatsij-sotrudnikov-i-doklady-na-mezhdunarodnyh-konferentsiyah/>
<https://nnch.kz/o-nas/o-klinike/>
<https://nnch.kz/missiya-tsentra/>

The report is characterized by completeness of answers to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for self-assessment of the educational program provided to the educational organization by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as internal consistency of information. The report is accompanied by a covering letter signed by the Chairman of the Board of JSC “NSCS named after A.N. Syzganov” by Academician of the National Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Kazakhstan Baimakhanov Bolatbek Bimendeevich, who confirms the reliability of the quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 6 members of the internal self-assessment commission indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting self-assessment of the educational program - Maksat Onalbayovich Doskhanova, head of the department of hepatopancreatobiliary surgery and liver transplantation, PhD, doctor - surgeon of the highest category.

Self-assessment of the educational program 7R01136 “General Surgery” JSC “National Scientific Center for Surgery named after

A.N. Syzganov”, carried out on the basis of order No. 077-p dated 02/05/2024 “On the working group on preparation for accreditation.”

All standards contain the actual practice of the University in training residents in the specialty “General Surgery”, taking into account the start of admission of students in 2022, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the objectives of the educational program, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated regarding the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, training results, results of assessment of knowledge and skills, material and technical base of the university and clinical sites, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, database), financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc.

The report is presented to ECAQA in complete form, with data adjusted according to the above recommendations, written in competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, tables and figures (diagrams, photographs) contain links in the text and are continuously numbered.

3. Description of external peer review

External expert work as part of the evaluation of the educational program in the specialty “**General Surgery**” was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programs of the ECAQA / Dates of visit to the organization: May 21–23, 2024. The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in Annex 3 to this report

To obtain objective information, members of the EEC used the following methods and their results:

- interviews with management and administrative employees – 10 people;
- interviews with residents – 12 people, including foreign ones;
- study of the website - <https://nnch.kz/>;
- interviewing 10 employees, 3 teachers, 3 mentors;
- survey of teachers and residents - 26 and 38, respectively;
- observation of the training of residents: attending theoretical classes in the department of thoracic surgery for residents of the 1st year of training. Teacher is Shirtaev Bakytzhan Kerimbekovich. The topic of the lesson is “Shapes of the chest”;
- review of resources in the context of implementing accreditation standards: 1 practice/clinical engagement base of JSC “NSCS named after A.N. Syzganov”, where training is provided in 7 educational programs with the participation of 54 full-time/part-time teachers;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 32 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents studied is in Annex 2).

The team of the accredited organization ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the visit program and according to the lists of interview sites (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, talks with members of the EEC

No.	Position	Quantity
1	Chairman of the Board of JSC “NSCS named after A.N. Syzganov” Baimakhanov Bolatbek Bimendeyevich	1
2	Deputy Chairman of the Board for Scientific, Clinical and Innovation Activities Shokan Akhmedbekovich Kaniev	1
3	Management Department of Research and Development Ismailova Gulziya Nurtazaevna	1
4	Department of Postgraduate Continuing Education Amal Zhumagazievna Smailova	1
5	Educational and methodological council	1
6	Meeting with resident teachers/mentors	2
7	Interview with 1st year residents	12
8	Head of the HR and Legal Support Department Bakhytzhan Berkutbaevich Nikbaev	1
9	Residency graduates 2014 Kaniyev Sh.A.	1
10	Heads of departments	4
11	Head of the library – Dergunova Irina Borisovna	1
12	Head of the organizational method of the department and statistics Kadirova Zhazira Adilbayevna	1
13	QMS Department – Kurabayeva Natalya Olegovna	1
14	Deputy Chairman of the Board for Strategic, Financial and Economic Issues Tungatov Kairat Khasipovich,	1
15	Head of the Department of Planning and Economic Analysis Madysheva Madina Zhaksylykovna	1
16	Chief accountant Danyshpanova Dilyara Danyshpanovna	1

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held based on the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion was held on the results of the external evaluation of the educational program, study of documents, results of interviews, interviews, and questionnaires.

Members of the EEC began drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the results of the external evaluation are made. The experts individually completed the “Quality Profile and criteria for external assessment of the educational program “General Surgery” for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.” No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational program were discussed and the chairman of Daria Muratovna Shabdarbaeva held a final open vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, and access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the NSCS, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

While conducting a survey of residents, 99% rated the work of the External Expert Commission on Accreditation as positive, 1% as satisfactory. The majority of respondents (89.47%) believe that it is necessary to accredit educational organizations or educational programs.

According to 76.92% of teachers, the survey conducted by ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving key areas of activity of an accredited educational organization.

At the end of the visit, the chairman of the EEC announced recommendations based on the results of the external evaluation as part of specialized accreditation to the management and employees of the educational organization.

4. Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the residency educational program in the specialty “General Surgery”

Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES

1.1 Mission statement

National Scientific Centre of Surgery named after A.N. Syzganova (NSCS) has a clear mission and vision aimed at public service and strengthening its leadership in the field of surgical medicine. The mission of the NSCS is to improve and preserve the health of the population of Kazakhstan through the application of advanced traditions in surgery, science and education. The centre strives to change its leading position in the country's surgical service, to use modern surgical technologies, and to combine clinical, scientific and educational practice. NSCS staff is focused on transforming the institution into the best and most innovative centre in Central Asia.

These main provisions are reflected in the NSCS Strategic Plan for 2019-2023, which was approved by the minutes of the meeting of the Board of Directors No. 3 of May 29, 2019. During this period, the plan suddenly changed, the minutes approved by the leaders of the Council No. 4 of July 2, 2020 and No. 7 of October 12, 2020. The strategic plan is available on the official website of the NSCS.

The educational program in the specialty 7R01136 “General Surgery” was developed collegiately and approved at meetings of the Educational and Methodological Council (Minutes No. 2 of March 11, 2024) and at the session of the Academic Council of the NSCS (Minutes No. 1 of March 26, 2024). This program is aimed at implementing the mission of the NSCS by preparing qualified surgeons with universal requirements and professional competencies, ready for independent professional activity in the treatment of diseases.

While implementing program activities, it was based on the results of interviews with the chairman of the organization, members of the Council, heads of the Council, during interviews with residents and teachers that compliance with the criteria of **standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the educational program, are accepted and participate in various proposals for the formulation. This mission is brought to the attention of residents through the website, social networks, and sending letters to the medical organization. Reviewed the organization's strategic plans for a 5-year period from 2019 to 2023, including such areas as customer focus Integrated academic healthcare system, Effective management and sustainable development, Contribution to development in the context of healthcare and education, ensuring compliance with

accreditation standards and goals and objectives. and looks at the organization. During interviews with residents, it turned out that before the start of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, tell where to get the necessary information about the educational program, teachers, and the basics of education.

During the visit to the NSCS, experts noted important aspects of the organization of education in relation to the accredited educational program, including:

1. Historical heritage and reputation:

NSCS named after A.N. Syzganov has a long history and recognized reputation in the field of surgery. This historical context and accumulated experience ensure high quality education and research.

2. Integration of education, science and practice:

The program focuses on the integration of educational, scientific and health components. This provides residents with the opportunity to gain the comprehensive and hands-on experience needed for a successful career in surgery.

3. Ensuring continuity of professional development of specialists.

NSCS actively promotes the continuous professional development of its specialists both within the country and abroad. Master classes are organized with the participation of leading foreign experts, and foreign specialists in general surgery are also invited to exchange experience. These professionals contribute to promoting a patient-centered culture and standards and impart their knowledge and skills to domestic professionals through mentoring programs.

4. High level of income for Academic staff:

The Academic staff of the program consists of experienced and qualified specialists, many of whom have academic degrees and titles. This provides a high level of education and mentoring to residents.

5. Modern material and technical base:

NSCS is equipped with modern medical and educational equipment, allowing for training at a high level using modern technologies and methods.

6. International cooperation:

The Center actively participates in international scientific projects and competitions, which promotes the exchange of experience and advanced training of both teachers and students.

7. Extensive experience and success in postgraduate education:

Since 2012, the NSCS has trained a significant number of specialists in various medical fields, which indicates the high effectiveness and demand for the center's educational programs. To have high quality of training, confirmed by the results of an independent evaluation of the knowledge and skills of NCIE graduates.

8. The opportunity for residents to participate in high-tech operations as assistants, free access to patients, various manipulations. There is an availability of ultra-modern equipment and opportunity to work as a resident physician.

9. Effective management of the university's activities thanks to organizational, financial, personnel and academic autonomy and developed corporate governance.

10. Regular participation of the NSCS in international scientific conferences in scientific and clinical areas, as well as in medical education and partnerships with leading foreign clinics and universities ensures constant monitoring of current trends and adaptation of internal processes to modern standards, providing the institute with a noticeable competitive advantage.

These strengths demonstrate the high level of the educational program "General Surgery" and confirm that the NSCS named after A.N. Syzganov is a leader in training qualified specialists in the field of surgery.

The NSCS has departments related to the educational program "**General Surgery**", which can be noted as the best practice in education, for example, the Department of Postgraduate Continuing Education. This conclusion was made because during a meeting with Amal Zhumagazievna Smailova, when asked by the Chairman of the EEC: "How do you evaluate the effectiveness of educational

programs and what are the main performance indicators?”, she answered: - The effectiveness of our programs is evaluated through several key indicators, including the employment of graduates, results of exams and tests, as well as feedback from residents. Every year we achieve 100% of the strategic plan, which is confirmed by the high levels of satisfaction and success of our graduates. And also during our visit, we were convinced that the library has a high supply of educational and scientific literature, including electronic resources. The head of the library, Irina Borisovna Dergunova, noted that NSCS students have free access to international databases.

The following departments that are directly related to the program are: “Department of surgery of coronary artery disease, primary care and heart transplantation - 15 beds; 2. Department of surgery of congenital heart defects – 12 beds; 3. Department of surgery of the gastrointestinal tract, endocrine organs and gynaecology – 18 beds; 4. Department of hepatopancreatobiliary surgery and liver transplantation – 22 beds; 5. Department of Angiosurgery – 12 beds; 6. Department of Thoracic and Paediatric Surgery – 14 beds; 7. Department of kidney transplantation, urology, nephrology and extracorporeal detoxification – 19 beds; 8. Department of X-ray surgery, interventional cardiology and arrhythmology – 30 beds; 9. Department of reconstructive plastic microsurgery and orthopedics – 12 beds; 10. Department of Kidney Transplantation, Urology and Extracorporeal Detoxification are 23 beds. 11. Paid departments - 33 beds. For the work of clinical departments, paraclinical departments have been deployed, the activities of which are aimed at improving the quality of medical care for patients, providing services necessary for the constant and uninterrupted operation of all clinical departments: 1. Diagnostic centre; 2. Clinical diagnostic laboratory; 3. Laboratory of Bacteriology; 4. Department of pathomorphology with prosection, cytology and electron microscopy group; 5. Blood transfusion room; 6. Central sterilization department; 7. Radiation diagnostics department; 9 8. Department of Physiotherapy; 9. Department of functional diagnostics; 10. Admissions department”, it can be noted as the best practice in education.

The results of studying the documentation demonstrate that the mission of the organization and the mission of the educational program «“**General Surgery**”, and the educational process is built in accordance with the State Compulsory Educational Standards and Laws and Statutory Instruments (LSI) in postgraduate education and healthcare. At the same time, during the interview (meeting) with the Chairman of the Board of JSC “NSCS named after A.N. Syzganov” Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Baimakhanov B.B., Deputy Chairman of the Board for Scientific, Clinical and Innovation Activities Kaniev Sh.A experts identified a number of problems, including limited opportunities for practice in foreign clinics and insufficient funding for academic mobility of teachers and students. Despite international cooperation, residents have limited opportunities for internships in foreign medical institutions, which could enrich their professional experience and knowledge.

The educational organization conducts training for residents in the following clinical bases and departments: City Clinical Hospital No. 7, Department of General Surgery, Department of Hepatopancreatobiliary Surgery and Liver Transplantation, Department of Thoracic and Paediatric Surgery, Department of Surgery of the Gastrointestinal Tract, Endocrine Organs and Gynaecology, where the patient is provided -oriented approach through the introduction of modern diagnostic and treatment methods, multidisciplinary teams and individualized treatment plans.

The educational organization pays due attention to the safety and autonomy of patients through strict adherence to clinical protocols, regular training of staff in safety principles, internal audit of the quality of medical services, and active involvement of patients in the decision-making process about their treatment.

Experts have found that residents have appropriate working conditions to support their own health, since the educational organization provides accessible and high-quality medical care for employees, equipped recreation areas and psychological support.

Basic resident competencies in an accredited specialty, such as clinical reasoning, diagnosis and therapeutic intervention, as well as specialized competencies including surgical technique, complex case management and use of modern technologies, help the educational organization to implement

innovative forms of training. This will allow residents to develop skills and qualities such as critical thinking, responsibility, leadership qualities and the ability to make decisions in stressful situations.

The educational organization encourages residents to become involved in research in their chosen specialty through the provision of grants for scientific projects, access to research databases and mentoring of experienced researchers, and also ensures the participation of residents in academic events such as scientific conferences, seminars, master classes and publications in professional journals.

At the same time, experts identified shortcomings in the organization of research work, such as insufficient incentives for residents to participate in scientific projects, poor integration of research work into the educational process.

1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

Experts have determined that the formation of professionalism includes systematic training, practical internship under the guidance of experienced teachers and mentors, as well as participation in clinical cases of varying complexity. The educational organization promotes the professional autonomy of residents by providing them with the opportunity to make independent decisions within the scope of their competence, and also supports their active participation in professional conferences and seminars.

Experts have established that the educational organization fully exercises autonomy in relation to the selection of residents for the accredited specialty (Rules for admission to training of medical personnel in residency, approved by order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 15, 2020 No. RK MOH-270/2020), developments educational program, determining approaches to assessing residents (order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 “On approval of the Standard Rules for admission to training in educational organizations implementing educational programs of higher and postgraduate education”, as amended by order No. 237 dated June 8, 2020), since all these processes are transparent and based on legislative and LSI. Responsible employees showed the experts a document defining the requirements for residency program teachers (Regulations on residency teachers, approved by order of May 15, 2023). The employment of residents is regulated by current regulations (residents are employed in advance before entering the Residency in accordance with the Minutes of the meeting of the Commission of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan on placing the State educational order for the training of medical personnel in residency No. 1 of May 17, 2022 and No. 2 of September 22, 2023) and agreements with employers in medical institutions, and the actual figure is 100% (using the example of other specialties).

To verify **Standard 1** a meeting was held with the Chairman of the NSCS, B.B. Baimakhanov. During the conversation, experts asked the following questions: How does an organization define its mission and vision, and what management mechanisms are used to ensure their implementation? What practical steps are taken to integrate the mission and vision into the organization's daily operations and strategic planning? During the responses, the NSCS Chairman confirmed that the mission and vision of the organization are clearly defined and integrated into its strategic direction. They are regularly discussed and updated to reflect changing health needs and challenges. To ensure that the mission and vision are achieved, various management mechanisms are used, such as the development of strategic plans, regular monitoring and evaluation of the achievement of set goals, as well as stakeholder engagement and feedback from patients and trainees.

The academic freedom of residents is manifested in the choice of scientific directions and research methods, and is ensured by the organization of education through mechanisms such as free access to scientific literature and resources, the ability to choose a research topic and supervisor, as well as participation in conferences and seminars. These mechanisms and principles of academic freedom are described in the document “Regulations on the research activities of residents”, approved by the minutes of the meeting of the Academic Council of April 15, 2023.

While conducting a survey of 38 residents (on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>), out of 24 questions, a number were devoted to the quality of the educational process and educational program.

It was found that 78.95% of residents would recommend studying at this educational organization to their acquaintances, friends, and relatives. And 81.58% of respondents believe that educational program leaders and teachers are aware of students' problems related to learning. To the question "Do you think this educational organization allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in your chosen specialty?", 84.21% of residents answered positively, 5.26% were not sure about this, 5.26% could not answer this yet question and 2.63% would like to believe it.

The 26 teachers surveyed (21 survey questions) also answered that 84.62% were satisfied with the organization of work and workplace in this educational organization, and 15.38% partially agreed with this statement. Experts determined that the organization has a healthy microclimate, since the manager is quite accessible to both residents and employees and responds promptly to requests. In the questionnaire, 96.15% of teachers are satisfied with the microclimate of the organization, and 3.85% are partially satisfied. According to 96.15% of educational organizations, a teacher has the opportunity to realize himself as a professional in his specialty. For your information, a total of 26 people responded (54 in total), with 11.54% having up to 5 years of teaching experience, 19% having up to 10 years of experience, and 81% having more than 10 years of teaching experience%.

1.3 Final learning outcomes

The final learning outcomes are determined and included in the document of the educational program in the specialty "7R01136 - General Surgery", developed within the framework of the State Compulsory Educational Standard (Order No. 647 as revised in 2020). This educational program takes into account the Qualification characteristics of a doctor, approved by the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 year No RK MOH-305/2020 "On approval of the nomenclature of specialties and specializations in the field of healthcare, nomenclature and qualification characteristics of positions of healthcare workers." These documents define the key competencies and requirements for the training of residents in the specialty "General Surgery", and also focus on achieving high standards in medical education. Informing stakeholders about the final results of training of residents in the specialty "General Surgery" is carried out through consultations, presentations and distribution of information booklets.

The experts were convinced that the professional behaviour and communication skills of residents are formed through regular training and are reflected in the corresponding document - the Code of Honour for Residency Trainees dated 01/05/2021. Teachers and residents are informed about the code of honour. You can familiarize yourself with the contents of the code of honour on the NSCS website in the section "Home / Department of Postgraduate Continuing Education / Residency."

While determining the final outcomes of training, the employees of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan took into account the previous results of training in undergraduate and internship courses, and also took into account the goals and objectives of subsequent continuous professional development in the chosen specialty. The NSCS provides training in additional and non-formal education (continuous professional development), including programs in the specialty of an accredited educational program. For example, programs have been developed and implemented on the following topics: Liver transplantation, Laparoscopic operations in the hepatobiliary zone (liver, gallbladder, bile ducts, pancreas), Endoscopic diagnosis and treatment of diseases of the gastrointestinal tract with a course of ERCP, Video-assisted thoracoscopy for diseases of the chest, Anatomical, extensive resection interventions on the liver lasting -_60, 120, 240_hours.

The surveyed teachers responded that 38.46% were completely satisfied with the level of previous training of residents, and 42.31% were partially satisfied.

Experts have established a clear continuity between the final results of previous resident training (prerequisites) and residency training, and subsequent continuing professional development programs. The organization has developed a cycle of advanced training in the specialty 7R01136 - "General Surgery." Residents are informed about this.

1.4 Participation in the formulation of mission and final outcomes

The goals and objectives of the NSCS activities are developed in accordance with the Message of the Head of State to the people of Kazakhstan: Strategy "Kazakhstan - 2050" is a new political

course of an established state, as well as in accordance with the key directions of the Strategic Plan and the Development Concept of the Republic of Kazakhstan until 2020, which is the second stage of implementation Development strategies of Kazakhstan until 2030. In developing the goals and objectives of the educational program “General Surgery,” all the centre’s employees, students, members of various associations, and employers took part, which is confirmed by the document approved at the meeting of the EMC (minutes No. 2 of 03/11/2024) and at the AC of the NSCS (No. 1 dated March 26, 2024). While issuing updated regulations and orders in education and healthcare, the developers of the educational program also take into account the reports of the chief surgeons of the regions of Kazakhstan on all indicators of the surgical service, and the internal analysis of the NSCS. Taking into account the results of the feedback, appropriate changes are made. An example of the effective use of feedback is the annual survey of employers studying to assess the level of satisfaction with educational programs. Many changes in the planning and organization of educational programs were made based on the results of the survey.

While talking with residents and employers, experts, a clear answer was received to the question “Do you participate in the formulation of the mission and goals of the organization, educational program?”, “What is the personal contribution of residents to improving the educational program?” To these questions, residents answered that they have the opportunity, independently or through the Resident Council, together with the department of PE, Methodological Council, Academic Council, Quality Council, to evaluate the management of the educational program, propose ideas for improvement and, if necessary, make adjustments, and employers responded that the staff of the NSCS a survey is conducted annually, each division maintains a performance improvement log, which records all inconsistencies, claims, consumer complaints, their reasons, and the implementation of corrective actions.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 14 standards comply: fully – 11, partially – 3, do not comply – 0.

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) It is necessary to update the NSCS website (sections on education).
- 2) To increase the motivation of residents to engage in scientific research.

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

2.1 Framework parameters of the postgraduate medical education program

The model of the educational program in the specialty 7R01136 “General Surgery” is determined on the basis of the final results of training of residents, therefore it includes the following: ensuring the training of qualified, competitive personnel that meets modern requirements for the quality of specialist doctors for independent work in a particular specialty. Duration of training is 3 years. The consistency and transparency of training is guaranteed by the fact that residents and teachers are informed about the necessary competencies that both students and teachers acquire. This happens in conditions of transparency and awareness of the successes of residents.

To implement the educational program in the specialty “General Surgery,” the organization’s documents contain EMCD, which defines the goal, takes into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work. Compliance with the State Compulsory Standards of Education and standard requirements has been established, including Instruction Letter No. 8 “On the development of educational and methodological documentation in educational organizations of the Republic of Kazakhstan providing residency training” (2010), Regulations on residency, approved by order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 28 dated 30.01 .2008; approved by the authorized body in the field of healthcare. The Bologna education system has been adopted as the basis for the educational process at the NSCS.

While visiting practical classes of the educational program “General Surgery”, experts received convincing evidence that the training is carried out according to plan, before the start of the lesson, residents answer tests, receive feedback from the teacher, and have the opportunity to improve

practical skills. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of the educational program, since the experts have studied the code of honour (Code of Honour for a teacher approved by the Chairman of the Board of the NSCS of 01/05/2021, Code of Honour of a residency student approved by the Chairman of the Board of the NSCS of 01/05/2021) and during the interview residents responded that they were informed about the contents of this document.

An analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in the advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the bibliography of EMCD and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom.

The mentoring system, which is described in the document “Regulations on the Clinical Mentor,” was evaluated. The procedure for informing residents about their rights and responsibilities is reflected in the Resident’s Guidebook (approved by the minutes of the meeting of the postgraduate education sector for 03/09/2021).

The qualification obtained as a result of mastering the educational program in the specialty “General Surgery” corresponds to level 8 of the national qualification framework (**ESG1.2**) and has code 7R01136.

Teachers use such methods of teaching residents as seminars, webinars, conferences, case studies, problem-based learning; case-based learning, team-oriented learning; training based on simulation technologies, role-playing games, brainstorming method, group discussion method, portfolio, combined survey, small group teaching method, simulation technologies, presentations. The list of teaching methods is described in the educational program. In addition, active teaching methods are implemented (analysis of clinical cases, maintaining medical records, examining the quality of medical care, patient management, training in a clinic with the participation of a real patient, training in primary health care settings, attending medical conferences, consultations, teaching with using web technologies); learning through inquiry. Through these methods, residents can be involved in patient care. Faculty may provide the resident with supervision of several case studies per day. For example, residents of an educational program in the specialty “General Surgery”, according to the profile of the discipline, independently examine patients under the supervision of mentors. According to the profile of the discipline, medical procedures are performed independently or under the supervision of teachers according to the list of mandatory acquisition of practical skills. Residents maintain medical documentation; draw up plans for examination and management of patients, and control and signature are carried out by a clinical mentor (full-time employee or part-time employee)

Experts have found that the principles of academic honesty and anti-plagiarism are fully implemented in educational organizations. In order to ensure the principles of academic integrity, in accordance with paragraph 37 of Annex 5 of the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 30, 2018 “On approval of the Model Rules for the activities of educational organizations of relevant types,” the NSCS conducts an inspection of theses, master’s theses, articles, monographs, methodological recommendations, textbooks, etc., for elements of plagiarism and to determine the level of originality using the Anti-Plagiarism software. Checking is carried out by employees of the department of scientific management and innovative technologies. This is reflected in the Code of Academic Honesty and Integrity. Academic integrity applies to such phases of resident training as research work and testing. And anti-plagiarism is applicable in the case when residents and teachers are engaged in writing master's theses, articles, monographs, methodological recommendations, textbooks, etc. on elements of plagiarism and to determine the level of originality using Anti-Plagiarism software. Residents are trained to promptly collect informed consent from patients for any diagnostic and therapeutic procedures. The experts noted that the medical records contain a corresponding document signed by the patient.

Thus, by the end of the 3-year training, residents will acquire basic skills in the profession of “General Surgery”, which will allow them to work in such institutions as: medical institutions of regional health departments of the Republic, scientific research centres, medical institutions (ESG 1.2).

The experts did not establish any violations with respect to the principle of equality in postgraduate education and continuous professional development, since the educational organization complies with the Constitution of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Law on the Languages of the Peoples of the Republic of Kazakhstan and other LSI in the field of education and healthcare. For example, an educational organization employs 54 people, of which 33.3% are women and 66.7% are men.

In the educational organization, there is a mechanism for regularly adapting teaching and learning methods to the requirements of modern science and education, as well as to the current needs of practical healthcare. This mechanism includes regular seminars on innovation, testing, training in the cascade method - by teachers who have been trained in new educational technologies in the Republic of Kazakhstan and abroad. In this regard, the teachers of the NSCS will carry out a lot of work to introduce into the educational process new forms and methods of teaching, means of enhancing cognitive activity: multimedia lectures; role-playing, business games; creative tasks (videos, crosswords, quizzes, etc.); use of problematic and situational tasks in practical classes.

This demonstrates compliance with Standard 2 in terms of tailoring training to the needs of residents.

2.2 Scientific method

The educational program includes the scientific foundations and methodology of medical research, including clinical research and clinical epidemiology. While talking with residents, experts learned that they use scientific evidence in their training and know the basics of evidence-based medicine. The teachers said that they teach residents methods of critical evaluation of literature, articles and scientific data, and the application of scientific developments. This form of training is organized in the form of a “Journal club”, which is held every week – on Mondays.

The NSCS has introduced the “Training through Research” program, which is aimed at increasing the level of training of a future specialist at the Centre, as a single educational, research and production complex, by developing in students the basic research competencies necessary for future professional activities. The resident training program involves performing various forms of educational and research work (preparing communications, reports, conducting research, publishing scientific articles, poster presentations, working in scientific circles, participating in scientific and practical conferences, etc.).

All program competencies and learning outcomes require students to apply knowledge and skills based on evidence-based practice at all levels of health care. All clinical sites operate in accordance with the clinical protocols of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan (MOH RK), which are based on evidence-based medicine. Residents participate in telemedicine conferences of the Republican Centre for Health Development (RCDH) of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, where the implementation of clinical protocols (CP) for practical healthcare is discussed. These conferences are conducted by centre staff who have developed CPs for the diagnosis and treatment of vascular diseases. The Research Management Department (R&D) organizes training seminars and lectures for residents and Academic staff. Council of Young Scientists of the NSCS named after. A.N. Syzganova helps in the publication and implementation of scientific research results into practice, in participation in international and interuniversity scientific conferences, as well as in the preparation of scientific works to receive grants, scholarships, awards and other forms of encouragement.

While surveying residents, it was found that the educational organization has access to students' participation in research work and 73.68% of people were completely satisfied with this, 0% were partially satisfied, and 0% were dissatisfied. Residents should engage in research and in response to the questionnaire, 21.05% wrote that they are already engaged in research, X% are planning to start, 2.63% are looking for a research topic, 0% are not engaged.

2.3 Structure, content and duration of the residency program

There are documents containing requirements for the structure and content of educational programs. Educational services for postgraduate education programs at the NSCS named after. A.N.

Syzganov is compiled in accordance with the requirements of ST RK ISO 9001:2009 (ISO 9001:2009) "Quality management system. Requirements" The processes of design, regulation, and management of educational programs are supported by a quality management system. The structure and content of the work curricula correspond to the State Compulsory Educational Standard for specialties; the discipline programs are developed at the proper scientific and methodological level. The sequence of studying disciplines is built using a system of pre- and post-requisites. Responsibility for the selection and implementation of innovations in the educational process lies with the management of the centre, and directly with the department of postgraduate education.

The educational program for training residents in the specialty 7R01136 - "General Surgery" is designed for 210 credits: major disciplines - 208 credits, elective component - 8 credits, end-of-course assessment - 2 credits.

The specialty training program 7R01136 "General Surgery" consists of 210 credits (6300 hours) and includes the following disciplines: Planned surgery - 58 credits, Emergency surgery - 60 credits, Purulent surgery - 32 credits, Surgery in the clinic - 16 credits, Thoracic surgery - 8 credits, Paediatric surgery - 8 credits, Gastroenterology with endoscopy - 5 credits, Traumatology - 5 credits, Urology - 5 credits, Anaesthesiology and resuscitation - 3 credits, Elective component - 8 credits, end-of-course assessment - 2 credits.

Thus, the EP disciplines are logically interconnected and are consistently studied by residents in all three courses of study.

Thus, the EP disciplines are logically interconnected and are consistently studied by residents in all three courses of study. The content of work programs and the catalogue of elective disciplines reflect the needs of the healthcare system, including the need to train specialists to work in conditions of shortage of medical personnel in rural and remote areas, as well as the specifics of research and scientific achievements of teachers. These include the following achievements: the development of new methods of minimally invasive surgery, the use of modern technologies in surgical practice, and conducting clinical trials of innovative surgical instruments and materials.

For the successful implementation of the educational program in the specialty "General Surgery", the organization has resources for assessing the practical skills of residents (analysis of clinical cases, maintaining medical records, examination of the quality of medical care, patient management, training in the clinic with the participation of a real patient, training in primary health care, attending medical conferences, consultations, teaching using web technologies; learning through research). However, there are difficulties in planning, developing and approving educational programs, including limited funding, insufficient modern equipment and a lack of highly qualified teachers. Experts found that the educational program takes into account legal requirements, including those regarding the accreditation of educational programs and compliance with quality standards for medical education.

Possible future roles of the residency graduate, namely medical examiner and manager, are developed through the ability to make independent clinical decisions. This is a priority in the training of practical-oriented specialists. In addition to clinical skills, it allows residents to implement the skills of communication and medical ethics, leader/manager or administrator, health advocate, communicator. The legal aspects of a doctor's activities are discussed in the classes of the discipline "Medical Law". The scientific component in resident training is formed through participation in research projects, writing scientific articles and conducting scientific seminars.

The organization of education ensures that the structure, content and duration of the educational program are adjusted in the event of any changes in various sciences, the demographic situation, as well as in response to the needs of the health care system. For this purpose, there is a mechanism for regular monitoring and revision of the educational program with the participation of professional communities, feedback from residents and teachers, as well as analysis of current trends and requirements in healthcare.

Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, with which 81.58% are completely satisfied, 7.89% are partially satisfied, 2.63% are not satisfied.

NSCS has its own clinical base with 210 beds and 1,500 outpatient visits, and has also entered into 6 agreements with medical organizations from 2019-2023. NSCS has about 30 memorandums with medical organizations located in Almaty, Almaty region and regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan, including 23 foreign ones:

- Nagasaki National Medical Centre (Nagasaki, Japan);
- Sunchonghyang University Hospital (Bucheon, South Korea);
- Budan Hospital of Seoul National University (Seoul, South Korea);
- Medical Corporation Sejong Hospital (Bucheon, South Korea);
- Inha International Hospital (Incheon, South Korea);
- John Radcliffe Hospital, Nuffield Department of Surgical Sciences, University of Oxford (Oxford, UK);
- Erasmus University (Rotterdam, the Netherlands);
- Acibadem International Hospital (Istanbul, Türkiye);
- Scientific Centre for Cardiovascular Surgery named after A.N. Bakulev RAMS (Moscow, Russian Federation);
- Russian Surgery Research Centre named after B.V. Petrovsky (Moscow, Russian Federation);
- Institute of Surgery A.V. Vishevsky (Moscow, Russian Federation);
- Research Institute of Transplantology and Artificial Organs named after V.I. Shumakova (Moscow, Russian Federation);
- Faculty of Medicine of St. Petersburg State University (St. Petersburg, Russian Federation);
- Republican Centre for Organ and Tissue Transplantation (Minsk, Belarus);
- Republican Research Centre for Cardiology (Minsk, Belarus);
- Bashkir State Medical University (Ufa, Russian Federation);
- National Oncology Centre named after V. Fanarjyan (Yerevan, Armenia);
- National Centre of Cardiology and Therapy named after M.M. Mirakhimova at the Ministry of Health of the Kyrgyz Republic (Bishkek, Republic of Kypgyzstan);
- Republican Specialized Centre for Surgery named after V.V. Vakhidova (Tashkent, Republic of Uzbekistan);
- National Cancer Institute (Ukraine);
- Russian Oncology Research Centre named after A.N. Blokhina (Moscow, Russian Federation);
- State Institution "Republican Centre of Oncology and Medical Oncology named after A.N. Alexandrov" (Minsk, Belarus);
- Scientific Centre for Surgery named after Academician A.A. Topchibasheva (Baku, Azerbaijan).

And to the survey question "Is there sufficient time for practical training (supervision of patients, etc.)", 89.47% of residents responded with complete agreement, 5.26% partially agreed, 0% disagreed. At the same time, 84.21% of residents claim that after completing classes the teacher provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts a mini-questionnaire, works on mistakes).

At the same time, to the question "Do resident representatives participate in the development of educational programs?", the experts received the answer that resident representatives are actively involved in the process of developing educational programs, providing feedback and suggestions for improving the educational process.

The surveyed residents are fully satisfied with the schedule of training sessions (94.74%).

2.4 Organization of training and the relationship between postgraduate medical education and medical care

Management of the educational process, reflected in the self-assessment report (Standard 2) and general approaches to management were confirmed during a conversation with the head of the postgraduate education department A.Zh. Smailova. At the same time, Standard 2 verification showed

that the NSCS does not have constant monitoring and periodic evaluation of residency programs in various areas, and there is also no periodic external quality assurance.

The experts got acquainted with the work of the departments, including the work of specialized departments (Department of General Surgery, Department of Hepatopancreatobiliary Surgery and Liver Transplantation, Department of Thoracic and Paediatric Surgery, Department of Surgery of the Gastrointestinal Tract, Endocrine Organs and Gynaecology). A total of 3 meetings were held and during cross-interviews it was established that there is constant communication between residents and their supervisors, and the relationship between supervisors and clinical mentors and stakeholders is monitored. This is facilitated by the mentoring that is carried out in the organization.

Thus, responsibility for choosing the basis for clinical training and practice of a resident in the specialty "General Surgery" is assigned to the DPCE, structural divisions and advisory bodies. The final review and approval of the educational program is carried out by the EMC of the NSCS named after A.N. Syzganov, whose composition is approved by the Chairman of the Board. The experts analysed information on the availability of accreditation of clinical sites and concluded that the main clinical sites are centres of highly specialized medical care of regional and national significance, and that the Centre has a sufficient number of clinical sites and a centre for the formation and development of practical skills among residents in accordance with the goals and objectives of the educational program in the specialty 7R01136 - "General Surgery".

The training of residents in the specialty "General Surgery" is aimed at meeting the needs of practical healthcare. The number of residency students will be determined based on the capabilities of clinical training, as well as the needs of practical healthcare. Every year, the Centre sends a request to the Regional Department of Public Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan about the required number of specialists in specialty 7R01136 - "General Surgery" for this current year. The PE department, taking into account the capabilities of the centre and the needs of the regions of the republic for medical personnel, annually sends an application to the Department of Science and Human Resources (DSHR) of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan about the required number of specialists in specialty 7R01136 - "General Surgery" for the current year. In accordance with the submitted request of the DSHR of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan is allocated a State order for the training of medical personnel.

Therefore, this organization is specialized in the field of general surgery and provides a lot of opportunities and conditions for qualified training of specialists in this field. Thus, during a conversation with the management of the organization, experts received information about the high level of material and technical base and the availability of modern educational technologies, and teachers confirmed that the training of residents is carried out directly in the clinical departments (Department of Surgery of IHD, Primary care and Heart Transplantation, Department of Surgery of Congenital Heart Defects, Department of Surgery of the Gastrointestinal Tract, Endocrine Organs and Gynaecology, Department of Hepatopancreatobiliary Surgery and Liver Transplantation, Department of Angiosurgery, Department of Thoracic and Paediatric Surgery, Department of Kidney Transplantation, Urology, Nephrology and Extracorporeal Detoxification, Department of X-ray Surgery, Interventional Cardiology and Arrhythmology, Department of Reconstructive -plastic microsurgery and orthopaedics, Department of Kidney Transplantation, Urology and Extracorporeal Detoxification).

Residents of this specialty can supervise patients with diseases such as acute appendicitis, cholelithiasis, intestinal obstruction, various types of hernias and other acute and chronic surgical pathologies. This is facilitated by the mentoring that is carried out in the organization.

Practical skills are developed in the departments of the NSCS named after A.N. Syzganov and the simulation centre (on the basis of KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov), organized within the framework of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan program 003/109 "Creation of educational and clinical centres at state medical higher educational institutions" and at clinical bases. While talking with residents, experts saw that the organization promotes the development of practical

competencies of residents, including using simulation equipment. At the same time, residents deepen their theoretical knowledge and develop communication skills.

Integration between training and medical care (on-the-job training) is carried out by analysing the compliance of disciplines with the necessary material and technical resources, literature, and the profile of clinical base departments. In accordance with the analysis, a work plan for each department is drawn up, taking into account the identified needs and shortcomings. Training is conducted in accordance with clinical protocols.

Of the 38 residents surveyed, 81.58% responded that teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods quite often, 7.89% believed that they rarely or sometimes.

The following employees from all structural divisions of the NSCS took part in the planning, discussion, approval and review of the educational program in the specialty “General Surgery”.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply out of 22 standards: fully - 20, partially - 2, do not comply - 0.

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To provide residents and students with electronic resources and relevant literature.
- 2) To actively involve employers in planning, discussing, approving and reviewing the educational program.
- 3) To annually update information on educational programs on the official website of the NSCS.

Standard 3: RESIDENT ASSESSMENT

3.1 Assessment methods

The policy and procedure for assessing learning outcomes within the EP is carried out using criteria developed in accordance with the set goals and objectives for the implementation of the EP and assigned qualifications within the framework of the current point-rating system for assessing knowledge and monitoring the educational process in accordance with directive, regulatory and internal documents:

– Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On Education” dated July 27, 2007 No. 319-III (as amended and supplemented as of December 4, 2015);

– Acting order Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 31, 2015 No. 647 “On approval of state mandatory standards and standard professional programs for medical and pharmaceutical specialties” as amended in 2020;

Policies and methods for assessing residents are reviewed and approved at a meeting of the PE department. The list of mandatory disciplines for final control during the intermediate certification period is regulated by the passed disciplines, which are reflected in the WC, and a technical specification is drawn up - a matrix of test tasks, the number of test questions in accordance with the number of credits passed in the disciplines. Responsibility for the implementation of the policy for assessing the educational achievements of residents lies with the department of educational training, Academic staff and the curator of the specialty.

The study of control and measurement tools (control questions, tasks in test form, tasks for laboratory work, practical and communication skills) showed that the organization has implemented an appropriate assessment policy that allows for a comprehensive assessment of the educational achievements of residents. While interviewed, residents spoke about forms of assessment, such as formative and summative assessment, and that they were satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from teachers. The system for appealing assessment results is reflected in the document “Regulations on intermediate and end-of-course assessment” and during the period of the work of the NSCS, there were no appeal precedents. The assessment covers not only knowledge and skills, but also professional behaviour and communication skills, which is confirmed by the following: the resident, throughout the entire period of training, forms a portfolio that corresponds to the final goals of the program and contains uniform reliable and valid criteria for assessing the student’s performance. A resident's portfolio consists of the resident's report; checklists with assessment of

practical activities, seminars, duties, etc.; characteristics of the curator; information about achievements during residency training, if any (awards, certificates, conference programs, abstracts of publications, videos, letters of gratitude, patient reviews, etc.).

Residents who have completed the educational process in accordance with the requirements of the IEP are admitted to annual and end-of-course assessment. A resident is considered admitted to the exam in the discipline if his admission rating (semester grade) is greater than or equal to 50 points. In the practice of educational organizations, residents (including other specialties) pass an independent examination in 100% of cases.

Validation and assessment of the reliability of resident assessment methods (tests, tasks, cases) is carried out as follows: review of control and measurement tools is carried out at several levels - within the NSCS - from an NSCS employee and external review, when employees of external organizations, associations or employers act as reviewers. Reviews are recorded at meetings of the PE department. The NSCS has a practice of involving external examiners in assessing residents, which is documented in the reports of the chairmen of the State Certification Commission (hereinafter referred to as the State Attestation Commission). The SAC is carried out at the National Centre for Independent Examination (hereinafter referred to as NCIE), where representatives of NCIE experts are present at both stages. This ensures the independence and objectivity of the assessment results.

Thus, to verify **Standard 3**, data, experts asked questions to the head of the department of postgraduate continuing education Amal Zhumagazievna Smailova and checked the documents and methods for assessing residents.

The Director of the Department of Postgraduate Continuing Education responded that there are plans to implement mechanisms to examine and document the reliability, validity, and fairness of assessment methods.

The number of exams in each course is regulated by the typical curriculum for the specialty. The forms of conducting are determined by the decision of the EMC and the Academic Council. The content of the exams is regulated by the Department of Postgraduate Education to maintain an optimal balance and carry out an integrated assessment of the development of competencies among residents.

The end-of-course assessment of residency graduates is carried out in accordance with the Rules for assessing the professional preparedness of graduates of educational programs in the field of healthcare, approved by order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 11, 2020 No RK MOH-249/2020. Control and measurement tools for the End-of-course assessment of graduates are developed by Academic staff in training residents, discussed and approved at the meeting of the EMC.

The results of resident assessments are documented only in the examination sheets for the disciplines.

There is a document on appealing the assessment results. To date, there have been no resident appeals.

During a visit to the organization and during an interview with the head of the organizational and methodological and statistics department, Zhazira Adilbaevna Kadirova, the commission was convinced that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and staff, and includes documents such as annual operating plans, annual reports, department regulations, agreements with teachers and residents, and educational and methodological documentation (work program, working curricula, syllabuses, journals), assessment tools (checklists, statements), evidence, certificates and certificates. A review of the website showed that its pages contain documents necessary for residents, such as questions of entrance exams for residency, questions of the entrance exam for the specialty 7R01136 - "General Surgery", an order approving standard rules for admission to training in an educational organization, a code of honour teacher and residency student, areas of competence of a residency graduate, NSCS quality policy, regulations on intermediate and final state certification, regulations on the organization of the educational process and the software department, reference guide 2021, license for educational activities, certificates of special accreditation, regulations

on clinical preceptor, and resident council regulations. There is also information about licenses and accreditation of the NSCS, which is regularly updated.

During the visit to the organization, management was asked the question: “Are external examiners involved in order to improve the fairness, quality and transparency of the assessment process?” And the answer was received that during the final state certification, leading specialists from practical healthcare are involved.

3.2 Relationship between assessment and learning

While conducting interviews with 2 teachers regarding assessment methods, the experts received convincing information that the results of student assessment in dynamics influence the organization of training, the choice of new teaching methods and the improvement of educational resources. Teachers noted that, based on analyzes of academic performance and exam results; they regularly make changes to curricula and teaching methods, introducing new technologies and interactive approaches. Residents also shared their opinions on the timeliness of test delivery, pre-exam counselling, the clarity of the entire assessment procedure and its fairness. For example, residents reported that detailed counselling and study materials are provided before each exam to help them better prepare and understand the assessment criteria.

The experts examined the resources for organizing the assessment of knowledge and practical skills, namely, specialized laboratories, simulation centres and training rooms equipped with the necessary equipment for practical training and testing. Experts determined that the choice of methods for assessing residents is based on the principle of objectivity and practical orientation, since the practical part of training is the main one. For example, assessment methods such as objective structured clinical examinations promote inter-professional learning. And a method such as case methodology (analysis of clinical cases) demonstrates the integration of learning and an emphasis on clinical skills. Established assessment methods ensure that the resident has mastered all sections of the educational program and acquired the necessary practical skills.

Deficiencies in the implementation of this section of Standard accreditation, discovered during the analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational program and during a visit to the educational organization, include insufficient systematization of feedback from residents regarding assessment methods and insufficient integration of modern educational technologies into the assessment process.

Feedback from residents based on the results of their assessment is collected in the form of anonymous questionnaires or surveys and published on the educational organization’s web portal. In interviews, residents confirmed that they receive feedback after completing their training.

Interviewed 5 representatives of employers also pointed out that the training of graduates corresponds to the modern development of medical practice and science, since residents acquire up-to-date knowledge and skills that meet modern requirements and standards. Employers said that they themselves participate in the assessment of residents, as they are included in the internal audit and feedback processes. However, the educational organization did not provide systematic feedback to them. Employers believe that they wanted to see the strongest skills in residency graduates, such as communication with patients and colleagues, as well as knowledge of modern diagnostic and treatment methods.

At the same time, there are difficulties in developing control and measurement tools, including the lack of structure and standardization of methods for assessing practical skills, as well as limited opportunities for monitoring and analysing assessment results.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria comply with 9 standards: fully – 6, partially – 3, do not comply – 0.

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) For ease of work and timely updating, to combine all regulatory documents into one document “Regulations on Residency”.

- 2) To implement mechanisms to examine and document the reliability, validity, and fairness of assessment methods.
- 3) To digitalize the resident assessment process.

Standard 4: RESIDENTS

4.1 Admissions policy and selection

The NSCS has a policy for the admission of residents, which is called “Rules for Admission to Residency.” Approaches to the admission of residents are based on the requirements of the country and internal regulations, namely, in accordance with the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600 “On approval of the Standard Rules for admission to training in educational organizations implementing higher educational programs and postgraduate education”, with the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 15, 2020 No. RK MOH-270/2020 "On approval of the rules for placing a state order, admission to training and training of medical personnel in residency", State Compulsory Standards of Education and the Rules for admission to residency.

Transparency of the selection procedure and equal access to residency programs is achieved through an examination where the examination is videotaped, with observers and commission members present in the hall. Enrolment of citizens into residency is carried out on a competitive basis, which is held separately among persons applying for target places.

Admission to residency, indicating a specialty, is carried out in accordance with the Standard Rules for Admission to Training in Educational Organizations Implementing Professional Study Programs of Postgraduate Education Order No. 600 “On Approval of the Model Rules for Admission to Training in Educational Organizations Implementing Educational Programs of Higher and Postgraduate Education (as amended 06.2020) and does not limit the rights of low-income families and national minorities. The admission of residents with disabilities is regulated by the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated August 31, 2012. No. 1119 “On approval of standards of public services provided by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, local executive bodies in the field of education and science.”

The document takes into account the requirements for residency applicants in terms of their previous achievements in undergraduate and internship (for example, the average GPA for the internship period (15%) and the average GPA for undergraduate (15%) or GPA for all 7 years of study (in the case absence in the GPA transcript, the average score for the application is calculated (converted to a 4-point scale) and the assessment of the 1st stage of the end-of-course assessment 7th year (independent testing conducted by NCIE)), and the safety requirements are also described (for example, before starting work, residents undergo safety training and access from an epidemiologist, and sign a safety information sheet).

The educational organization has created a barrier-free learning environment, including the presence of ramps, call buttons, elevators, and toilets for the disabled.

According to the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 595 dated October 30, 2018, a student can be transferred or reinstated after expulsion at the end of the first academic period. While transferring under a government order from one organization to another, the head of the receiving organization submits a copy of the enrolment order to adjust funding. Transfer from one specialty or form of study to another is carried out only on a paid basis. The course of further education is determined taking into account prerequisites, and the transfer of credits is based on a comparison of programs and learning outcomes, without taking into account differences in the forms of final control.

The appeal procedure based on the results of admission to residency is prescribed in the Model Rules for Admission to Study in Educational Organizations Implementing Professional Postgraduate Study Programs, Order No. 600 with additions and changes in June 2020. To date, there is no precedent for an appeal.

The process of developing a policy for the admission and selection of residents includes

representatives of students, namely residents identified by the Council of Residency Elders. Feedback is provided to residents on this issue, and recently the following changes have occurred in approaches to the admission of residents: for example, during a pandemic, due to the impossibility of passing exams in infectious diseases hospitals, the admission conditions were changed: instead of an interview, individual achievement scores and a certificate of work in medical institutions of the Republic of Kazakhstan related to the fight against COVID-19.

The review of the admission and selection policy and the number of residents is carried out annually, and the department of postgraduate continuing education is responsible for this.

Thus, experts validated the data according to **standard 4**. In general, all criteria are met, but at the same time some shortcomings were identified. The experts familiarized themselves with the documentation for the admission of residents, including the “Rules for admission to residency” and other regulations. Many of the documents are well-written, but there are comments regarding the completeness and relevance of the information presented on the official website. It is necessary to pay attention to regular updating of data, as well as to improve the systematicity of feedback from employers to further improve the educational program.

4.2 Number of residents

For the period 2019-2023 127 residents were admitted to all educational programs, including the program in the specialty “General Surgery” of 13 people. The total graduation of residents on the dates of commencement of admission to residency in all specialties amounted to 126 specialists. Every year, taking into account the needs for medical personnel at the NSCS named after A.N. Syzganov is sent a request about the needs of scientific and pedagogical personnel and clinical specialties of residency in the DSHR of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In accordance with the submitted request, the DSHR is allocated a State order for the training of medical personnel in residency. The number of residency students is determined based on the capabilities of clinical training, as well as the needs of practical healthcare. Every year, the Centre sends a request to the Regional Department of Public Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan about the required number of specialists in specialty 7R01136 - “General Surgery” for this current year. After processing the data received from the region.

4.3 Support and counselling for residents

In NSCS named after A.N. Syzganov has implemented a comprehensive system of support and counselling for students, covering academic, personal, psychological and social aspects.

- Academic support and counseling

To implement a competency-based model of medical education, there is a system of academic counselling for residents:

Academic mentor: assigned to each resident by order of the Chairman of the Board. The mentor helps in the formation and implementation of an individual curriculum, manages educational and scientific activities, and assists in employment.

Clinical preceptor: assigned to the medical organization where the resident is training. Its function is to guide the resident to master practical skills and competencies.

- Personal and psychological support

The support system covers personal and psychological aspects:

Psychological support: provided through specialized counselling and programs. Faculty staff is always ready to help residents in case of personal or professional problems.

Social support: includes sports and recreational work, participation in charity events, volunteerism and other events.

Confidentiality: is respected during consultation and provision of any support, which guarantees trust and openness in communication between residents and mentors.

- Vocational guidance and career planning

Vocational guidance: NSCS Academic staff provides support for vocational guidance, career planning and increasing the mobility and competitiveness of graduates.

Personal distribution of graduates: held annually with the participation of representatives of health departments, pharmaceutical companies and public health departments of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The employment rate of graduates of all residency programs is 100%.

- Tools for support in case of a professional crisis

To provide support to residents in the event of a professional crisis, the following tools are used:

Consultations: Regular meetings with academic and clinical mentors to discuss problems and find solutions.

Monitoring: The PE department monitors the progress and career growth of graduates, which allows timely identification and resolution of professional crises.

- Feedback: Residents can contact the PE department for immediate resolution of any problematic situations, as well as participate in surveys to assess satisfaction with support.
- Frequency, regularity and funding

Frequency and Regularity: Consultation and support are provided on a regular basis, with a flexible schedule agreed upon with residents. Consultation schedules are drawn up by curators and approved by management.

Financing: provided from the NSCS budget allocated for educational programs and support for residents.

- Accountability and implementation

Responsible persons: the postgraduate continuing education department, academic and clinical mentors are responsible for the implementation of the support and counselling system.

During the visit to the NSCS, evidence was obtained of the effectiveness of the support system through interviews with residents and mentors, as well as a review of documentation and student surveys, which confirmed a high level of satisfaction with the support.

4.4 Representation of residents

The following consultative and advisory body functions in the educational organization: Council of Residency Elders, in the work of which residents - elders, activists and all interested residents take part. Mechanisms for rewarding residents for public work have not been fully developed. All of the resident's achievements are added to his portfolio and are rewarded when reviewing portfolio materials. When surveying residents, experts found that residents have a real opportunity to participate in the organization of the specialty EP during direct discussion and approval of work programs. For example, based on the results of a survey of residents, plans for corrective and preventive measures were developed; for the EP, a proposal was made on the need to provide greater independence and require greater activity during duty and during everyday activities at the clinical site.

4.5 Working conditions

According to the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 15, 2020 No RK MOH-270/2020 "On approval of the rules for placing a state order, admission to training and training of medical personnel in residency," resident doctors studying under the state educational order are paid a scholarship, according to Rules for the appointment, payment and amount of state scholarships for students studying in educational organizations, approved by Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 7, 2008 No. 116. Residents are given the opportunity to work during extracurricular hours (no more than 0.5 rate), with the consent of the curator, head of department and PE department. Residents participate in all events held by the NSCS. For example, "Open Day", organizing training for nurses, consultations, organizing and conducting events for scientific and information exchange in the form of conferences, seminars, symposiums, forums and other forms aimed at exchanging experience, scientific and practical information, on strengthening mutually beneficial ties, participating in joint scientific and research projects.

Every year, residents undergo training according to the established schedule of classes and mastery of disciplines. According to the profile of the discipline, patients are independently examined under the supervision of mentors. According to the profile of the discipline, medical procedures are performed independently or under the supervision of teachers according to the list of mandatory acquisition of practical skills. Residents maintain medical documentation; draw up plans for

examination and management of patients, control and signature are carried out by a clinical mentor (full-time employee or part-time employee). All work performed is reflected directly in the resident's clinical diary, and the results of achievements in the portfolio. Residents, according to the prepared training schedule, are part of the duty team, and upon completion they report at morning conferences.

The NSCS does not consider the use of a platform for distance learning for residents within the framework of the EP.

In special circumstances (for example, if students transferred from other universities, reinstated, remaining for a second year of study, returning from academic leave), an individual training program for residents is used, which includes disciplines of the compulsory component, types of educational activities and disciplines of the component chosen from the CED.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply out of 20 standards: fully - 20, partially - 0, do not comply - 0

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To develop a mechanism to reward residents for their social activity.

Standard 5: TEACHERS

5.1 Recruitment and selection policy

There are 12 employees in total, of which 8 are full-time teachers, 4 are part-time teachers. Teachers meet the qualification requirements:

- have a specialist certificate or a specialist certificate with the highest category in surgery,
- is an active surgeon with at least 5 years of experience in the specialty:
- receives patients in the emergency department, is an attending physician, a consultant in general surgery, conducts an expert assessment of medical histories or clinical cases, is a practicing surgeon in a hospital and clinic,
- have a degree of Doctor of Medical Sciences, Candidate of Medical Sciences in the specialty "General Surgery",
- has at least 5 years of research experience,
- has scientific publications in peer-reviewed publications and journals with non-zero impact factor, methodological recommendations, teaching aids, monographs and textbooks,
- has experience in developing training programs in the specialty.

Degree is 83%, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor - 25%, Candidate of Medical Sciences - 42%, PhD - 25% Categorization, % - 100%

The experts familiarized themselves with the job descriptions of Academic staff and the regulations on mentoring. The experts are familiar with the personnel policy of the NSCS, "Regulations on the clinical mentor" 09/01/2023; "Regulations on mentoring of JSC "NSCS" 09/01/2021. The faculty to resident ratio is - 1/1.

The motivation system for teachers and clinical mentors includes ideal and material incentives. Ideal incentives include declaring gratitude, awarding certificates, and presenting for state and departmental awards. Material incentives include a system of bonuses for teachers and staff for personal contribution and achieved results in their work activities. Bonuses for teachers of residency students in specialties will be made based on the results of the work done, successful certification, accreditation, scientific results, birthdays and anniversaries.

The principles of ethics and academic integrity of teachers are reflected in the document - Code of Business Ethics of JSC "NSCS" 04/18/2019.

During a conversation with teachers, they confirmed their awareness of this issue - all teachers are familiar with the Code of Business Ethics of JSC "NSCS" 04/18/2019.

In order to verify the Standard 5 data, external experts obtained the opinion of teachers on personnel policy, which includes the policy of recruiting and hiring teachers and clinical mentors, stimulation and motivation of practical healthcare specialists. The conversation with the head of the HR department included questions such as how specialists from the NSCS are attracted and motivated

for educational activities and allowed the experts to learn about approaches to attracting clinical staff to teach, about the strategy and tactics of recruiting teachers, the information security of the educational program, and also to identify management problems and human resource development, since most part-time workers do not know teaching methods.

While surveying teachers, it was found that the majority (84.62%) were completely satisfied with the organization of work and the workplace in this educational organization, but 15.38% were partially satisfied. In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish research results - 92.31% completely agree, 7.69% partially agree. Satisfied with the work of the HR (personnel) service - 96.15% completely agree, 3.85% partially agree. They are satisfied with the salary – 69.23% completely agree, 15.38% partially agree .

5.2 Faculty Commitment and Development

In order to verify the Standard 5 data, during a meeting with the head of the HR department and during interviews with teachers, experts received an opinion on approaches to developing the pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with residents, mentoring, which includes appropriate support in professional and personal formation and development resident, shares experience, knowledge and supports the ward in a way that is effective and efficient, fosters independence in him, having thoroughly studied the abilities of the young specialist, his inclinations, interests, attitude towards the team, etc.

Experts determined that faculty and residents have adequate time for teaching, mentoring, and learning. The work schedule of teachers is established in accordance with internal regulations and the schedule of the educational process. Teachers' working hours are from 8:00 to 16:00. Teachers conduct seminars lasting 2 hours 2 times a week. The time for clinical reviews and clinical rounds is 1.5 hours a day. Faculty shifts are scheduled and may include night shifts and weekends, providing 24-hour support to residents and patients.

The experts received answers about the teacher training program, which is held annually and 12 teachers participating in the implementation of the educational program were trained in 2019, including 15 teachers of the accredited educational program in the specialty “General Surgery”. These events are financed by the educational organization. The expert verified teacher certificates on such topics as “Teacher in medical education and science organizations” - 1 week / 54 hours from July 9 to July 13, 2019; “Training as a testologist/expert in the development and examination of test items - 1 week / 54 hours from July 20 to July 25, 2019.

The salary fund of teachers consists of a base salary, additional payments for academic titles and degrees, bonuses for achievements in scientific and educational activities, as well as additional payments for extracurricular work.

Financing of mentors is carried out in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Experts have found that teachers initiate research topics for residents stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation. The resident presents the ability for continuous professional growth of the student, representing the totality of individual educational achievements, in the form of a “Portfolio”. Therefore, one of the tasks of the IWR and Portfolio is to encourage the residency student to do research work. As part of practical work, the resident must attend lectures by scientists, actively participate in scientific seminars and conferences, and conduct research work under the supervision of a curator

In an educational organization, there is an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies - 92.31% of surveyed teachers responded, and 7.69% partially agreed with this. Studied in professional development programs - 65.38% during a given year, 30.77% from 1-5 years ago, 0% over 5 years ago and 0% answered “I don't remember when it was.”

The organization implements social support programs for teachers - 46.15% answered that “yes, such programs exist”, 0% “I have already taken advantage of this”, 7.69% of respondents answered that there are no such programs, and 46.15% of respondents don't know about it.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply out of 8 standards: fully – 8, partially – 0, do not comply – 0.

Recommendations for improvement:

1) To regularly improve teaching skills through participation in the Academic Mobility Program for teachers, which provides for the exchange of experience and training in universities and research centres both near and far abroad.

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

6.1 Logistics and equipment

Training of residents is carried out on the basis of JSC “NSCS named after A.N. Syzganov” and “City Clinical Hospital No. 7”, including residents of the accredited educational program in the specialty “General Surgery” on the basis of JSC “NSCS named after A.N.Syzganov.” There are 210 beds in total. There are 14 classrooms, 1 conference room for seminars and journal clubs, 2 laboratories (pathoanatomical and pathomorphological), a library with 10 seats, a computer class with 6-7 seats.

The experts visited the library, which provides residents and employees with access to more than 12,356 copies of educational and scientific literature: books, dissertations, abstracts, periodicals in the state, Russian and foreign languages. The scientific library is updated according to requests for the purchase of literature received from the Academic staff of the centre. Total literature on the accredited specialty on paper is 50 pieces; on electronic ones are 70 pieces. The main monographs in the specialty “General Surgery” are the following: “Fundamentals of Surgery” edited by B.V. Petrovsky, “Clinical Surgery” edited by N.N. Burdenko, and they are available in the library.

There is access to international databases: Web of Science - webofknowledge.com, Elsevier - sciencedirect.com, Scopus - scopus.com. Residents are aware of this.

Before starting the corresponding discipline of the educational program, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during his training.

The material and technical base, including the library background, is updated annually. Thus, over the past 5 years, the update has affected the following: constant work is underway to improve IT technologies and the infrastructure of the NSCS; the services of the automated platform of ESUVO LLP “Platonus” were introduced for the inclusion of educational programs of the Residency in the Register of the Bologna system. The uninterrupted operation of the Internet was ensured and a local computer system was created. In recent years, the fleet of computer equipment has been updated, computer classes have been modernized, and the website of the NSCS has been improved.

6.2 Clinical sites

A review of the resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, the clinical base of the MSE on the REM “City Clinical Hospital No. 7” was visited, in addition to the above-described NSCS, with a total bed capacity of 700 beds, and employees of the educational organization ensure collegial and ethical relations with the medical staff, leadership of the clinical site to achieve resident outcomes. A sufficient number of thematic patients is provided (for example, on nosologies of purulent surgery, familiarization with emergency surgery, work in a clinic, etc.), modern equipment and demonstrates accessibility to students, teachers provide quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology.

During a visit to 18 clinical departments of the NSCS, experts examined the resources, their compliance with training programs, and accessibility for teachers and residents, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical healthcare.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence about the quality of the programs, interviews were conducted with residents. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, sufficient time for supervising patients, working with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents in need, participation in “Journal Clubs,” and the availability of international databases of professional literature. In general, residents are satisfied with the training,

assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, because they believe that the educational organization has good resources, image and international connections, at the same time, residents would like more independence in managing patients and conducting international events.

There is a simulation centre equipped with equipment including: surgical simulators, laparoscopic simulators, cardiopulmonary resuscitation mannequins, suture tools and ultrasound equipment. Residents of the educational program in the specialty “General Surgery” can practice practical skills: performing laparoscopic operations, applying surgical sutures, performing various diagnostic and therapeutic procedures. Providing emergency care to patients with acute abdominal conditions is also included in the training program.

Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgment on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in research work, and financing. Experts examined residents’ documents (portfolios, resident assessment results, checklists, residents’ survey results).

6.3 Information technology

Experts evaluated the access of residents and teachers to the necessary web resources, including Science direct, Scopus (Elsevier), Book-UP, PUBMED, British Medical Journal Best Practice, Springer, as well as access to electronic media (Facebook, Instagram, etc.). Residents confirmed that they can use the educational resources of the library (electronic textbooks, electronic manuals, scanned educational literature), the Internet, the Centre for Practical Skills (discs with educational films and illustrations, simulators and mannequins with software, presentations shown using a multimedia projector, computer training programs), including in preparation for classes.

Information and communication technologies are represented by the following: computers with Internet access, electronic databases, simulation software systems, interactive educational materials, video conferencing systems. The educational program uses technologies such as electronic training courses, virtual laboratories, online seminars, webinars, simulation simulators and distance learning programs. During self-study, residents use educational platforms, e-books, online libraries, mobile applications for medical calculations and data analysis. Access to patient data and the healthcare information system is provided through secure medical information systems and electronic medical records. Residents supervise 5 patients per day, including filling out the necessary documentation under the supervision of a teacher.

6.4 Clinical teams

In order to develop the experience of working in a team among residents, the educational organization conducts events such as joint clinical discussions, team simulation trainings, scientific conferences and seminars, as well as interdisciplinary practical training. Experts attended a journal club meeting on the topic “Modern approaches to the treatment of acute intestinal obstruction,” where the results of teamwork of residents in the specialties of general surgery, anaesthesiology and resuscitation were presented. Inter-professional interaction is also carried out through joint duty, consultations on complex clinical cases, as well as participation in interdisciplinary research. The collegiality of the residents’ work can be seen in their participation in round tables, discussions of clinical cases and preparation of presentations for scientific conferences. Residents can conduct health education activities among patients and educational activities among interns. For example, residents organized a series of lectures on the prevention of surgical infections and emergency care training for junior colleagues.

In the questionnaire, residents noted that they have free access to patients at clinical sites and all the conditions for improving their practical skills - 84.21% of teachers completely agree with this, 10.53% partially agree, 0% found it difficult to answer.

6.5 Medical research and advances

In the organization of education, research work is carried out in such areas as: “Improving the organizational aspects of surgical treatment of obstructive jaundice” (Head – Professor Baimakhanov B.B., executor – doctoral student Ph.D. Serikboluly Erbol), “Efficiency of the percutaneous-trans-

hepatic method in the treatment of liver echinococcosis" (Leaders - Professor Baimakhanov B.B., MD Medeubekov U.Sh., performer - doctoral student Ph.D. Nagasbekov M.S.), "Preventive tendon anastomosis in two-stage autotendon plasty of flexors fingers" (Supervisors - Professor Baimakhanov B.B., Nabiev E.N., performer - doctoral student Ph.D. Kazantayev K.Ye.), "Preoperative assessment of liver volume during liver transplantation" (Supervisors - D.M.S. Zholdybay Zh.Zh., Doctor of Medical Sciences Medeubekov U.Sh., executor - doctoral student Ph.D. Kalshabay Ye.Ye.).

According to the annual rating among research institutes/scientific centres of clinical profile (for all indicators of research performance), conducted by the RCHD, NSCS named after A.N. Syzganov took 4th place in 2020, 2nd place in 2019, 4th place in 2018 and 2nd place in 2017.

Residents of all years of study are involved in carrying out scientific work (or fragments). They perform work such as collecting and analysing clinical data, participating in clinical trials, conducting laboratory research, writing scientific articles, and participating in scientific conferences. All information about scientific work is included in the resident's portfolio, the structure of which is based on the "Learning through Research" program.

The educational program includes topics where residents study research methods in medicine. In this case, the total number of hours is:

If residents carry out scientific and practical research, they are provided with access to instrumental and laboratory equipment.

Interviews with 12 teachers, including 8 full-time teachers, showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of education, depending on the specific base (admission of residents to equipment, a sufficient number of case patients, time to maintain medical records, independent work).

6.6 Educational expertise

Expertise in education includes the following areas: evaluating the quality of educational programs, analysing teaching methods, monitoring student progress, and evaluating learning resources, which are formalized in the form of research, including student satisfaction research, analysis of curricula, and evaluation of the implementation of innovative teaching methods.

The educational organization participates in educational projects such as Erasmus+, TEMPUS, and national advanced training programs. As a result of the implementation of these projects, modern distance learning methods, interactive educational platforms, and academic mobility programs have been introduced.

Employees of the Department of Education conduct annual monitoring of the quality of educational programs and the results are included in the report on the quality of education, as well as in the improvement plan for the next year.

Sociological surveys, including questions of the quality of education, could become one of the mechanisms for examining education. However, they are not yet systematically used in educational organizations.

The examination is carried out in the form of an analysis of the needs for specialists, an analysis of resident training methods, and the results allow us to draw conclusions about the quality of innovative changes in postgraduate education. For example, the results of the analysis showed the need to implement simulation training to improve the practical skills of residents.

Mechanisms for motivating and developing the interest of staff and teachers in conducting research in the field of postgraduate education are grants for scientific research, awards for publications in international journals, and participation in international conferences. This is documented in the employee motivation regulations and in the collective agreement.

Clinical training resources are updated annually and in 2023 the residency program "General Surgery" will be equipped with the following: new simulation mannequins, modern operating tables, and access to international medical research databases.

6.7 Training in other institutions

The academic policy for resident training includes the possibility of training at alternative organizations if existing clinical sites do not cover all topics of the educational program. At the same

time, the training of residents in the specialty “General Surgery” is carried out on the basis of the NSCS, where there are 18 clinical departments with a total bed capacity of 210 beds. The preparation of scientific publications is carried out under the guidance of a teacher and does not require additional training bases. However, residents can participate in academic mobility within the country; for example, an agreement has been concluded with leading clinics in Kazakhstan and abroad, since there is an agreement with many medical organizations.

Dozens of agreements and 30 memorandums have been concluded with organizations, universities, associations, including Nagasaki National Medical Centre (Nagasaki, Japan), Suncheonhyang University Hospital (Bucheon, South Korea), Budan Hospital of Seoul National University (Seoul, South Korea) etc.

Teachers of educational organizations actively participate in republican and international events. Such participation allows you to apply the information received in the educational process.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply with standard 18: completely - 17, partially - 1, do not correspond - 0

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To update professional literature in the bibliography.
- 2) To update the equipment in the simulation room.

Standard 7: ROGRAMME EVALUATION

7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms

Monitoring of the educational program includes: evaluation of the management of the educational program (level of Academic staff, organization of the educational process, regular evaluation of the level of achievement of program goals, demand for graduates); implementation of EP (curriculum, standard discipline programs, methodological and information support, infrastructure, educational technologies, research); EP results (interim certification, end-of-course assessment), which ensures transparency of the process and results. An annual analysis of the educational program will allow the educational organization to make adjustments and improve the content. Initially, the educational program was reviewed by practical healthcare specialists, representatives of professional associations, and it was noted that the residency training program in specialty 7R01136 - “General Surgery” complies with the State Compulsory Standard of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Subsequently, the residency program was approved (at a meeting of the educational and methodological council, protocol No. 1, date 01/09/2023) at a meeting of the educational and methodological council, protocol No. 2, date 07/04/2022. Regular evaluation of the quality of the educational program is carried out by the PE department, EMC, academic council through a multi-level approach, including major/graduating and related specialties, through a survey of stakeholders (employers, students).

While evaluating the program, the goals and objectives of training and the final outcomes of training are taken into account (through evaluation of residents, independent examination). The process of implementing the educational program is evaluated through feedback from residents and teachers and the achievements of graduates. For example, a survey of residents of 2 years of study in 8 specialties demonstrated the following: student satisfaction with learning results 45 (100%), evaluation of the professional level of teachers - high 45 (100%). A separate survey of teachers was not conducted, since the questionnaire for residents contains questions related specifically to teachers. The survey showed teachers' satisfaction with working conditions, equipment and interest in the resident training process.

The evaluation of approaches to the admission of residents is carried out by The policy for admission to residency is regularly reviewed at the NSCS named after A.N. Syzganov in connection with the introduction of additions and changes to the current LSI of the Republic of Kazakhstan, namely: the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On Education” (as amended and supplemented as of December 4, 2015); Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 30,

2008 No. 27 “On approval of lists of clinical specialties for internship and residency training” (with amendments and additions as of August 2019); Order No. 600 “On approval of standard rules for admission to training in educational organizations implementing professional postgraduate education programs” (with amendments and additions approved in June 2020).

The selection and compliance of teachers and teaching methods is also carried out through feedback from residents. For example, the results of a survey of 11 residents in 2022 and 2023 showed that the evaluation of the professional level of teachers was 96%.

Assessment of methods for assessing the knowledge and skills of residents is carried out using: educational activities: grade book, reports on the implementation of the individual curriculum; Documents demonstrating mastery of practical skills (diary of practical skills, duty schedules, etc.), participation in the work of professional associations, public associations, scientific and practical societies; participation in research work: publications, participation in forums (scientific, scientific and practical conferences, congresses, symposiums), and demonstrates residents’ interest in the educational process and their independent work.

An assessment of the sufficiency and quality of educational resources (responsible department or employee) shows that the NSCS ensures the availability of the necessary training rooms, classrooms, equipped with modern technical teaching aids, multimedia equipment, corresponding to the educational programs being implemented, sanitary and epidemiological norms and rules. Also, to ensure the independent work of residency students, the Centre has a library with a reading room. Today, the library's book collection amounts to more than 12,356 books and journals.

In the process of evaluating the quality of residency educational programs, it was established that, along with the achievements (Academic staff’s experience in monitoring, evaluating and examining an educational program; at the NSCS named after A.N. Syzganov, mechanisms for approving educational programs have been developed, providing for the evaluation of programs at the stages of planning, implementation, analysis), there are a number of problems and shortcomings, including the formation of a transparent process and results of evaluation of the educational program for management and all stakeholders.

7.2 Feedback from faculty and residents

The educational organization regularly collects feedback from teachers and residents. No survey of employers was conducted. Feedback is mainly based on a survey. For feedback from teachers and residents, the blog of the Chairman of the Board is used; on which students and staff of the NSCS named after A.N. Syzganov receive answers to their questions regarding the conditions for the implementation of the educational program.

The results of the feedback are analysed, discussed at meetings of the PE department, and published on the website of the NSCS named after A.N. Syzganova (www.nnch.kz). In general, the use of feedback contributes to a better understanding of the current needs of students and teachers and is systematic in making changes to the educational program.

7.3 Resident and Graduate Outcomes

The results of residents and graduates are indicators of the quality of educational programs. The final results of assessing residents by specialty in 2022 show the following: 100% of residents passed the end-of-course assessment.

Thus, the results of an independent assessment of residents in 2022 showed that 100% of residents passed the end-of-course assessment. The highest rate is for residents in the “no” specialty, and the lowest achievement rate is for residents in the “no” specialty.

Faculty evaluated the level of clinical training of residents in 2021 and 2022, where residents passed a final test upon completion of each discipline. Experts noted the following successes in the clinical training of residents: complete patient management, ability to independently perform an operation after completing 1 year of training.

Monitoring of residency program graduates is carried out through employer surveys. The percentage of employment of graduates in the specialty 7R01136 - “General Surgery” over 5 years has not been calculated, because no graduates.

Since the entire process of training and monitoring of residents is concentrated in the department after graduate continuing education, the results of evaluating the clinical practice of residents and graduates immediately go to the responsible persons. The Department of Postgraduate Continuing Education is responsible for residency programs. To improve the educational process, the following has been done in the last 2-3 years: mechanisms for approving educational programs have been developed, providing for the evaluation of programs at the stages of planning, implementation, and analysis.

7.4 Stakeholder engagement

Educational organizations have approaches to involving teachers and residents in evaluating the educational program and monitoring its implementation. Thus, residents of specialty 7R01136 - "General Surgery" are included in the advisory body "yes" and participate in the discussion of all issues of the educational process. The results of the evaluation of the educational program are announced at meetings of the Clinical Council, meetings of the PE, EMC and AC departments, and are published on the centre's website.

The interview with employers was conducted online and included questions such as: knowledge of the university's mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in resident training through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, 100% employment of residency graduates, etc.

7.5 Procedure for approval of educational programs

The educational organization has established a system for documenting the educational process, including approval of the educational program, which includes the following: evaluation of programs at the stages of planning, implementation, analysis of results and implementation of changes, which allows monitoring the process of EP implementation and the progress of residents, and ensures the identification and timely resolution of emerging problems.

The educational program is approved at meetings of the PE, EMC department based on criteria such as systematic study and comprehensive assessment of EP in order to improve and guarantee quality (determining the value of the program, achieving goals, implementing tasks, the degree of compliance with the needs of society, the requirements of employers, the effectiveness of training methods), as well as evaluation of educational and methodological support and support of the educational process, evaluation of the quality of educational programs in areas of specialization. The interested parties involved in the approval of the educational program are the NSCS named after A.N. Syzganov.

A system for monitoring the quality and compliance of clinical bases, material and technical equipment and educational resources has been developed and implemented, which includes the following: visits to teaching staff at training bases during the academic year; availability of an accreditation certificate in a medical organization.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 10 standards: fully – 7, partially – 3, do not comply – 0

Recommendations for improvement:

1) To maintain feedback with employers by conducting questionnaires, interviews, etc. and use the results to improve educational activities.

Standard 8: MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION

8.1 Management

Residency training is conducted in accordance with the requirements of regulatory rules regarding the admission of residents, such as:

1. Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On Education”, subparagraph 2-1 of Article 5 in order to implement the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 20, 2013 No. 500 “On approval of the state educational order for the training of specialists with higher and postgraduate education”, which regulates the number of state educational order for the training of residents in the field of healthcare.

2. Model rules for admission to training in educational organizations implementing educational programs of higher and postgraduate education, Subparagraph 11) of Article 5 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 27, 2007 “On Education” and Model rules for admission to training in educational organizations implementing professional training programs postgraduate education, approved by Order No. 600 of October 31, 2018 (with additions and changes in June 2020), which determine the procedure for admitting citizens to residency. Procedures for admission and selection of residents are described in detail in Standard 4.1.

3. State compulsory educational standards for residency in medical specialties and a standard professional curriculum for medical specialties in residency, approved by the order of the acting Ministry of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 31, 2015 No. 647, which determines the content of the educational program. Assessment of knowledge and skills is carried out on the basis of intermediate certification, end-of-course assessment; supervision of patients, participation in surgical operations, visiting patients at home, duty planning, participation in conferences, etc. To implement the educational program, the educational organization has an organizational structure in which the educational sector is represented by the Deputy Chairman of the Board for Scientific, Clinical and Innovation Activities and the Chief Doctor. The experts got acquainted with the documents on the completion of training of residents, including the state-issued document on the qualification of a doctor in the specialty 7R01136 - “General Surgery”, also after passing the end-of-course assessment, the NCIE issues a certificate of a specialist without a category in the specialty 7R01136 - “General Surgery”.

The quality assurance program for postgraduate education was developed in accordance with the current management system of the organization and policy in the field of ensuring the quality of education and was approved at meetings of the PDO and UMS departments. Practical healthcare specialists and representatives of professional associations took part in the development of the program.

8.2 Academic leadership

The responsibilities and duties of the management and employees for postgraduate medical education are determined, which are assigned to the Chairman of the Board for Scientific, Clinical and Innovation Activities and are enshrined in the documents: Charter of the centre, management structure, departments and job descriptions. Transparency of management and decision-making in the educational process is ensured by holding a scientific and methodological council, an academic council, to which participants from among residents and employers are invited, which is reflected in the Centre’s Charter, Regulations on departments and job descriptions.”

The educational organization evaluates the management of the educational process and employees in relation to the achievement of the mission of the residency program, the expected final outcomes of training by providing feedback to residents and teachers (see section 7.2 of the report), conducting certification based on the document, audits on issues of effectiveness and efficiency of implementation goals and objectives.

To the survey question “Do the heads of the organization listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research work, clinical work,” 73.08% of teachers answered that systematically, 26.92% answered “sometimes”, 0% “quite rarely”, 0% “never”.

8.3 Training budget and resource allocation

The department responsible for planning and distribution of finances in residency programs is the financial and economic department, which considers the results of the formation and use of financial resources.

A financial plan is drawn up annually, including a target budget for training, which is: 2,572,000 (budget 006); 12,684,502.37 (paid 006) tenge. The financial plan is in line with the strategic plan for the period 2023. The share of funding for residency programs, taking into account the expansion of residency specialties, increased from 4.7% in 2021 to 100% in 2023. The most funds are spent on the acquisition of the Platonus program - 2,572,000 (budget 006). During a meeting with employees of the financial sector, experts found out that the distribution of resources in the NSCS named after A.N. Syzganov is carried out in all areas of the surgical service affecting work in practical, scientific, educational, research activities of all clinical and paraclinical departments. The salary fund is 20,531,000 tenge, the scholarship fund is 6,025,266 tenge.

A financial report is provided annually, which is approved by the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On approval of standards for calculating the cost of education for one student, residency student, master’s student, doctoral student (PhD) dated June 14, 2004 No. 474 and demonstrates, among other things, the distribution of educational resources in accordance with needs and covering all types of expenses (salaries of residency teachers, providing students with educational resources (educational and scientific literature, access to the Internet and international information databases of literature, information and communication technologies), strengthening the program through invited foreign teachers, academic mobility programs and the opportunity for residents to participate in international and national conferences, seminars) for the implementation and development of the residency program.

8.4 Administration and management

There is an appropriate administrative (5 people) and Academic (10 people) staff, including management: sole shareholder, chairman of the board, deputy chairman of the board for scientific, clinical and innovative activities, deputy chairman of the board for strategic and financial and economic issues, head of the strategic and commercial block . To effectively manage the educational process, employees of the Education Department have undergone advanced training.

Experts found that the quality management system (QMS) was implemented in 2020 and includes regular internal and external audits, including those supporting the process residency program. For example, it consists of an audit of the effective management of the structure, volume, technology and quality of surgical care. The R&D management department and the quality control department are responsible for the implementation and monitoring of the QMS. Teachers are aware of the QMS, which is confirmed during their interviews. The main documents of the QMS are.

Evaluation of the administration and management of the educational process in general and the residency educational program in the specialty 7R01136 - “General Surgery” is carried out by Monitoring the quality of the educational process by the PE department, EMC together with members of the educational programs committee (employers, students) and the results demonstrate such achievements as continuous improvement approaches to the implementation of educational residency programs with the active participation of stakeholders (primarily representatives of employers) in the formation of an educational strategy that reflects the university’s social responsibility for the development of advanced innovative technologies in practical medicine and science, the use of advances in information and communication technologies, as well as the strengthening public health.

8.5 Requirements and regulations

The educational organization complies with the recommendations of national authorized bodies, including the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Thus, in accordance with the classifier of residency specialties (On approval of the Classifier of areas of training for personnel with higher and postgraduate education; Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 13, 2018 No. 569), in the organization of education at the beginning of the 2023-2024 academic year, training is provided in 8 specialties and training in 9 specialties is planned. All

educational programs are provided with relevant educational and methodological documents and teachers.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 11 standards: fully - 11, partially - 0, do not comply - 0

Recommendations for improvement:

1) To improve funding mechanisms for all levels of education: exchange of residents, participation of residents in international events, invitation of visiting professors, publication of the results of scientific work of residents).

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

The procedure for updating the organizational structure is carried out by the personnel of NSCS and in 2023 such changes were made as there were no changes.

Updates have been made to the resident training process such that teachers will conduct classes using new innovative educational technologies.

Updates are made by introducing into the educational process new forms and methods of teaching, means of enhancing cognitive activity:

- multimedia lectures;
- role-playing, business games;
- creative tasks (videos, crosswords, quizzes, etc.);
- use of problematic and situational tasks in practical classes.

The use of innovative technologies in the educational process will be based on a strong material and technical base, the improvement of which, in accordance with the requirements of the time, is carried out constantly and is accompanied by the development of educational programs, taking into account the requirements of the labour market and modern advances in science.

The educational organization annually allocates resources for continuous improvement in the amount of 26843075. For example, in 2022-2023 11971200 in 2024 it is planned.

To purposefully improve the educational process, sociological research is carried out, including the development of new technologies, methods, and work methods; studying the experience of other countries; studying regulatory documents in all specialties, and also studying literature on medical postgraduate education (updated publications by domestic and foreign authors). In the process of this analysis, approaches to teaching in residency were revised, and such methods were introduced as: research methods in teaching; project-based teaching methods; gaming methods (role-playing, business games); cooperative learning (team, group work).

Of the authentic types of student assessment, assessment methods that are as close as possible to clinical practice will be actively used: mini-clinical examination; direct observation of the performance of practical skills; expert assessment of filling out medical documentation; portfolio assessment.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Complies with 2 standards: completely -2, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0..

Recommendations for improvement:

1) Improving financing mechanisms for all levels of activity (






CONCLUSION: while conducting an external evaluation of the educational program, it was found that out of 114 standards (including 82 basic standards and 32 improvement standards), 102 accreditation standards demonstrate full compliance, including 71 basic standards and 31 improvement standards. 11 basic standards and 1 improvement standard have been partially implemented. No non-compliance with standards has been identified.

5. Recommendations for improvement of the educational program in the specialty 7R01136 «General Surgery» of the JSC «National Scientific Centre of Surgery named after A.N. Syzganov»:

- 1) To annually update information on educational programs on the official website of the NSCS (1.1.2)
- 2) To increase the motivation of residents to engage in scientific research (1.1.6)
- 3) To provide residents and students with electronic resources and relevant literature (2.4,6.1.1)
- 4) To actively involve employers in planning, discussing, approving and reviewing the educational program (2.4.4, 7.1.2,7.1.4)
- 5) To digitalize the resident assessment process (3.1)
- 6) For ease of work and timely updating, to combine all regulatory documents into one document «Regulations on residency» (3.1.1)
- 7) To implement mechanisms to examine and document the reliability, validity, and fairness of assessment methods (3.1.2, 3.1.4)
- 8) To develop a mechanism to reward residents for their social activity (4.3)
- 9) To regularly improve teaching skills through participation in the Academic Mobility Program for teachers, which provides for the exchange of experience and training in universities and research centres both near and far abroad (5.2)
- 10) To update professional literature in the bibliography and electronic resources of educational and scientific literature in the specialties of «General Surgery» (2.2.2, 6.1.1)
- 11) To update equipment in the simulation room (6.1.1)
- 12) To maintain feedback with employers by conducting questionnaires, interviews, etc. and use the results to improve educational activities (7.2.1)
- 13) To improve funding mechanisms for all levels of education: exchange of residents, participation of residents in international events, invitation of visiting professors, publication of the results of scientific work of residents) (8.3)

6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

Members of the EEC established the compliance of the residency educational program in the specialty 7R01136 «General Surgery» of the JSC «National Scientific Centre of Surgery named after A.N. Syzganov» with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous decision to recommend that the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this program for a period of 5 years.

Chair	Shabdarbaeva Daria Muratovna	
Foreign expert	Sattarov Jamoliddin Bakhronovich	
Academic expert	Kozhakhmetov Saken Kairullinovich	
Expert employer	Nadueva Yelvira Sezhofoevna	
Expert student	Guseva Kristina Alexandrovna	

Профиль качества и критерии внешней оценки образовательной программы (обобщение)

Standard	Критерии оценки	Количество стандартов	БС*/СУ	Оценка		
				Полностью соответствует	Частично соответствует	Не соответствует
1.	МИССИЯ И КОНЕЧНЫЕ РЕЗУЛЬТАТЫ	14	9/5	7/4	2/1	
2.	ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНАЯ ПРОГРАММА	22	19/3	17/3	2/0	
3.	ОЦЕНКА РЕЗИДЕНТОВ	9	6/3	3/3	3/0	
4.	РЕЗИДЕНТЫ	20	14/6	14/6	-	
5.	АКАДЕМИЧЕСКИЙ ШТАТ/ПРЕПОДАВАТЕЛИ	8	7/1	7/1	-	
6.	ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНЫЕ РЕСУРСЫ	18	11/7	10/7	1/0	
7.	ОЦЕНКА ОБРАЗОВАТЕЛЬНОЙ ПРОГРАММЫ	10	7/3	4/3	3/0	
8.	УПРАВЛЕНИЕ И АДМИНИСТРИРОВАНИЕ	11	8/3	8/3	-	
9.	НЕПРЕРЫВНОЕ УЛУЧШЕНИЕ	2	1/1	1/1	-	
		114	82/32	114		

Список документов, изученных членами ВЭК в рамках проведения внешней оценки образовательной программы резидентуры

№	Наименования документов/дата утверждения	Количество
1.	Академическая политика (Положение об организации учебного процесса) 05.01.2021г.	1
2.	Положение академической мобильности АО ННЦХ 01.06.2021г.	1
3.	Положение о промежуточной аттестации резидентов 05.01.2021г.	1
4.	Положение об итоговой государственной аттестации 05.01.2021г.	1
5.	Политика АО ННЦХ им.А.Н.Сызганова в области качества 05.01.2021г.	1
6.	Кодекс деловой этики АО ННЦХ 18.04.2019г.	1
7.	Антикоррупционный Standard АО ННЦХ 31.12.2020г.	1
8.	Правила деонтологии и соблюдения прав пациента, правила обучения пациента 23.10.2023г.	1
9.	Положение о клиническом наставнике 01.09.2023г.	1
10.	Положение о наставничестве АО ННЦХ 01.09.2021г.	1
11.	Кодекс чести слушателя АО ННЦХ 05.01.2021г.	1
12.	Положение о совете резидентов 01.09.2023г.	1
13.	Справочник-путеводитель слушателя резидентуры 09.03.2021г.	1
14.	Положение об отделе постдипломного образования 05.01.2021г.	1
15.	Номенклатура дел отдела постдипломного образования 2021г.	1
16.	Лицензия АО ННЦХ	1
17.	Протокол заседания комиссии МЗ РК по размещению государственного заказа на подготовку медицинских кадров в резидентуре на 2023-2024г. 22.01.2023г.	1
18.	Протокол заседания комиссии МЗ РК по размещению государственного заказа на подготовку медицинских кадров в резидентуре на 2022-2023г. 17.05.2022г.	1
19.	Устав АО ННЦХ 11.06.2014г.	1
20.	Международная институциональная аккредитация ЕЦА. Свидетельство Аккредитации АО ННЦХ 17.06.2021г.	1
21.	ОО «Экспертов и консультантов по внешней комплексной оценке в сфере здравоохранения» Свидетельство об аккредитации 30.11.2021г.	1
22.	Профессорско-преподавательский состав АО ННЦХ 06.11.2023г.	1
23.	Чек-лист «Годовая аттестация резидентов»	1
24.	Чек-лист «Промежуточная аттестация резидентов»	1
25.	Рабочий учебный план Резидентуры по специальности общая хирургия на 2022-2023 уч.год 01.09.2022г.	1
26.	Расписание резидентуры по специальности общая хирургия на 2022-2023г. 01.09.2022г.	1
27.	Академический календарь резидентуры на 2022-2023 учебный год (ГОСО2022) 01.09.2022г.	1
28.	Размещение государственного образовательного заказа на подготовку медицинских кадров в резидентуре на 2022-2023 учебный год	1
29.	Правила приема в резидентуру АО ННЦХ на 2022-2023г 01.09.2022г.	1
30.	Журнал учета посещаемости и успеваемости слушателей резидентуры АО ННЦХ по специальности общая хирургия	1
31.	Протокол заседания конкурсной комиссии для отбора претендентов на участие в конкурсе Лучший преподаватель. Лучший ученый.	1
32.	Протокола заседания отдела постдипломного образования	19