

To the Accreditation Council
of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation
and Quality Assurance in
Education and Healthcare
November 03, 2023

**REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE
EVALUATION OF RSE on REM "NATIONAL COORDINATION CENTER
FOR EMERGENCY MEDICINE" OF THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH OF THE
REPUBLIC OF KAZAKHSTAN FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE
STANDARDS OF INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION OF ORGANIZATIONS
OF ADDITIONAL AND NON-FORMAL EDUCATION (CONTINUOUS
PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT)**

external expert evaluation: October 18-19, 2023

Almaty, 2023

CONTENT

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3-4
2.	General part of the final report	4-7
2.1	Presentation of the RSE on REM "National Coordination Center for Emergency Medicine" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan	4-6
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	6
2.3	Brief description of the report on institutional self-assessment of the RSE on REM "National Coordination Center for Emergency Medicine" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan	6-7
3.	Description of external expert evaluation and conclusion	7-11
4.	Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the RSE on REM "National Coordination Center for Emergency Medicine" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan	11-40
5.	Recommendations for institutional improvement of the RSE on REM "National Coordination Center for Emergency Medicine" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan	40-41
6.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	41
	Annex 1. Institutional quality profile and external evaluation criteria of the RSE on REM "National Coordination Center for Emergency Medicine" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan	42
	Annex 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	43
	Annex 3. Program for visiting the organization by an external expert commission	

LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
RSE on REM	Republican state enterprise on the right of economic management
RK	The Republic of Kazakhstan
MOH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MS&HE RK	Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan
IRD	Internal regulatory documents
EEC	External expert commission
NCCEM	National Coordination Center for Emergency Medicine
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare
AMP	Administrative and management personnel
BLS	Basic Life Support
ACLS	Advanced Cardiac Life Support
PALS	Pediatric Advanced Life Support
PTLS	Prehospital Trauma Life Support
NRP	Neonatal Resuscitation Program
ANA	American Heart Association
EMC	Emergency medical care
PHC	Primary health care
CPD	Continuous professional development
ETC	Educational and training center
LSI	Laws and Statutory Instruments
AS	Ambulance station
EMC	Emergency medical care
EMC	Educational and methodological council
MIA RK	Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic of Kazakhstan
NJSC	Non-profit joint stock company
LLP	Limited Liability Partnership
mass media	Mass media

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 23 dated October 29, 2023 an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as the EEC) was formed to conduct an external institutional evaluation of the RSE on REM "National Coordination Center for Emergency Medicine" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan (MOH RK) during the period October 18-19, 2023, in the following composition:

№	Status as part of the EEC	Full name	Academic degree/title, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	Chairman	Slavko Yelena Alekseevna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Internal Diseases of NJSC "Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov"
2	Foreign expert	Zaripova Zulfiya Abdullovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Center for Certification and Accreditation of the First St. Petersburg State Medical University named after Academician I.P. Pavlova
3	Academic expert	Sisenova Zhadyra Aldebaevna	Acting Head of the Department of Emergency Medicine medical care NJSC "West Kazakhstan State Medical University named after M. Ospanova"
4	Expert employer	Zhukubaeva Almira Asetkyzy	Master in Pedagogy and Psychology, highest medical category in emergency care, therapy, first medical category in public health. Head of the Education Department LLP "National Research Oncology Center"
5	Expert student	Shyntas Kasym Malikuly	MBA, acting Head of the Training and Simulation Center of the RSE on REM "City ambulance station" of the Akimat of Astana.

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC.

The EEC report contains the results of an external evaluation of the RSE on REM "National Coordination Center for Emergency Medicine" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan for compliance with the Standards of institutional accreditation of organizations of additional and non-formal education (continuous professional development) (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC for further improvement and recommendations for accreditation for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of the RSE on REM “National Coordination Center for Emergency Medicine” of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan

Name of organization, legal form of ownership, BIN	Republican state enterprise with the right of economic management "National Coordination Center for Emergency Medicine" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan (hereinafter referred to as NCCEM) BIN 130240021888
Management body	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Full name of the first manager	Muratov Timur Muratuly
Date of creation	By Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 28, 2012 No. 1724, the RSE on REM “Republican Center for Air Ambulance” of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan was created. Subsequently, by Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 24, 2019 No. 12, the Center was renamed into the RSE on REM “National Coordination Center for Emergency Medicine” of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.
Location and contact details	The Republic of Kazakhstan 010000, Astana, Nura district, Korgalzhyn highway, 13/2, no. 2 tel.: +7 7172 701-703 E-mail: info@emcrk.kz Official website: www.emcrk.kz
State license for educational activities - date, number (if applicable)	Not applicable in accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan on Education
Information about branches, subsidiaries (if any)	Representative office of the RSE on REM “National Coordination Center for Emergency Medicine” of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan in Almaty
Year of commencement of the implementation of additional and non-formal education , programs, total number of programs and number of students	Start year: 2017 The total number of non-formal education programs is 13 with hours ranging from 8 to 48, 1 additional education program with 7 credits Total number of students trained - 24,892
Number of listeners this year	1645
Full-time teachers/ part-time workers involved in the implementation of additional education programs	The total number of teachers is 7, including: 1 head of the Education and Training Center, 4 medical instructors, 1 instructor, 1 safe driving instructor Availability of a medical category - 85.7%
Availability of a unit responsible for the educational process in additional and non-formal education	Educational and training center Year of creation 2017 Head Agybaev Gumyrbek Rakhymbekovich
Website Instagram Facebook with active pages	Official website: www.emcrk.kz emergency_care_kz National Coordination Center for Emergency Medicine @emcrk.kz

Information about accreditation as a medical organization (date, number, period)	Certificate of accreditation for a period of 3 years with assignment of the first category, issued by the Public Association "Experts and consultants for external comprehensive evaluation in the field of healthcare" and certifying that the activities of a healthcare entity comply with accreditation standards in the field of healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Certificate issue date 12/07/2020 Registration No. KZ14VEG00010795
--	--

Strengths of the educational organization and achievements over 5 years:

- Students are trained in accordance with international standards BLS, ACLS, PALS, PHTLS, NRP on modern simulation equipment.

- 12 out of 14 educational programs have an author's certificate issued by the RSE "National Institute of Intellectual Property" of the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the additional education program "Paramedic" with a volume of 7 credits is included in the Catalog of additional education programs of the RSE "National Scientific Center for Health Development named after Salidat Kairbekova" <http://89.218.81.108/#/catalog/view>.

- Training is conducted by highly professional instructors with an international certificate and practical experience.

- Regular monitoring of the quality of training results is carried out using tracers, in particular, mastering the skills of providing emergency medical care in accordance with international standards. According to the Order of the Vice-Minister of Health dated February 25, 2021 No. 105 "On approval of the Rules for teaching emergency medical care skills in accordance with international standards," NCCEM is the single operator for monitoring and quality control of knowledge gained in the process of training international standards for emergency medical care assistance from employees of regional and city emergency medical services stations, emergency medical services departments at primary health care centers and emergency departments of medical organizations providing inpatient care.

- The organization works closely with the professional "Association of Emergency Medical Care of the Republic of Kazakhstan". The Chairman of the Association of Emergency Medical Care of the Republic of Kazakhstan is the Deputy Chairman of the Board of NCCEM Bayanbaev Arman Seytkanovich. Since 2019, NCCEM, together with the Association of Emergency Medical Care of the Republic of Kazakhstan, has organized and held 3 Spartakiads of emergency medical teams with the participation of specialists from all regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

- Constant feedback from consumers of educational services allows us to evaluate the quality of educational programs; the level of training achieved by students, and improves educational programs taking into account the needs of practical healthcare.

- Students and employers positively evaluate the quality of educational services provided.

- The organization has developed a strategic development plan, including the development of scientific and educational activities, taking into account existing and planned resources.

- The Republican Coordination Center for Stroke Problems and the Situation Center, operating on the basis of the organization, will in the future make it possible to implement educational programs in related specialties in the emergency care profile.

- NCCEM has an Accreditation Certificate with the assignment of the first category, issued by the Public Association "Experts and Consultants for External Comprehensive Evaluation in the Field of Healthcare" and certifying that the activities of a healthcare entity comply with accreditation standards in the field of healthcare of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Certificate issue date is 12/07/2020 Registration No. KZ14VEG00010795

- In 2019, on the basis of NCCEM, for the first time in the CIS, trainers for emergency medical care were trained in providing emergency care in accordance with international PHTLS standards with the invitation of experts from NAEMT (National Association of Emergency Medical Technicians).

The PHTLS course was developed by NAEMT in collaboration with the Committee on Trauma of the American College of Surgeons, which provides medical direction and oversight of the content of the PHTLS program.

- For the period from 2017 to August 2023, the training center trained 24,892 students.

2.2 Information about previous accreditation

Institutional accreditation of NCCEM was carried out by the Independent Agency for Quality Assurance in Education (IAQAE). Certificate of institutional accreditation IA-DN№005 dated November 9, 2020, valid from November 9, 2020 to November 8, 2023. Information about the accreditation carried out is posted on the official website of the National Center for the Development of Higher Education of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan <https://enic-kazakhstan.edu.kz/ru/accreditation/organizacii-dopolnitelnogo-obrazovaniya>

2.3 Brief description of the report on institutional self-assessment of the RSE on REM “National Coordination Center for Emergency Medicine” of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan

The NCCEM institutional self-assessment report (hereinafter referred to as the “Report”) is presented on 91 pages and contains 17 annexes on the relevant standards, displayed in the link <https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1Oa5RbZAtuP9I9IX5nMCObzEAn76h5aFh?usp=sharing>.

The report is characterized by completeness of answers to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for self-assessment of medical educational institutions of ECAQA, provided to NCCEM by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a covering letter signed by the Chairman of the Board, Muratov Timur Muratula, which confirms the accuracy of the quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 12 members of the internal self-assessment commission, indicating the responsibilities of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting institutional self-assessment - Agybaev Gumyrbek Rakhymbekovich, head of the ETC.

The composition of the internal commission for self-assessment according to institutional accreditation standards, indicating the responsibilities of each member of the internal commission, was determined on the basis of the Minutes of the staff meeting No. 26 of October 16, 2023.

The report was reviewed by members of the EEC. The reviews noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes, which were taken into account during the feedback process with a representative of the educational organization and appropriate changes and additions, were made to the self-assessment report.

All standards contain the actual practice of organizing education for training students in non-formal education programs. The description in the self-assessment report is quite complete and updated in terms of the number of students, teachers, administration, information about selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of evaluation of knowledge and skills. Included is information about our own material and technical base with a total area of 2289 m², including a classroom fund with a total area of 290.9 m², including 2 classrooms, a lecture hall and a conference room, contractual obligations with partners (BB Nura LLP, Semey Medical University), financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc.

The report is presented to ECAQA in a completed form, with data adjusted according to the above recommendations, written in competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, tables and diagrams contain references in the text and are continuously numbered.

The quality of the institutional self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure - external evaluation. The experts plan to validate the report data,

compare the information from the report with the information that will be received during the visit to the educational organization, i.e. carrying out verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

3. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work within the framework of the institutional evaluation of NCCEM was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting external evaluation of educational organizations and educational programs of ECAQA and in accordance with the program approved on October 5, 2023 by the General Director of ECAQA Sarsenbaeva S.S. and agreed with the Chairman of the Board Muratov T.M. Dates of visit to the organization: October 18-19, 2023.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the institutional self-assessment report and verifying indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit over 2 days is presented in detail in the Visit Program (hereinafter referred to as the “Program”), which is located in the documentation of the accreditation center. The program is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, members of the EEC used the following methods and their results:

- interviews with management and administrative employees – 6 people;
- meeting with listeners – 28 people. (16 students who graduated from previous years and 12 students studying during the EEC visit);
- studying the website <https://emcrk.kz/ru/>;
- interviewing 6 employees, 6 teachers;
- survey of teachers and students - 6 and 15, respectively;
- observation of student training: attendance at 2 practical classes on October 19, 2023:
 1. “Basic life support” (BLS).
Instructor: Sartaev Boris Valerievich.
Number of listeners: 6 people. Contingent: Employees of AMP NCCEM.
 2. “Advanced Cardiac Life Support” (ACLS).
Instructor: Taibekov Bulat Kurushovich
Number of listeners: 6 people. Contingent: Employees of the educational institution "Higher Medical College "Danalyk" named after Z.G. Murzagulova."
- review of resources in the context of meeting accreditation standards: visited training rooms and classrooms of the ETC, equipped with the necessary simulation equipment, where training is conducted in 14 educational programs with the participation of 7 full-time teachers; premises of the Republican Coordination Center for Stroke Problems and the Situation Center; the new building of NCCEM, which is being prepared for commissioning;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 26 units both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents studied is in Annex 2).

The team of the accredited organization ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the visit program and according to the lists of interview sites (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, talks with members of the EEC

№	Full name	Position
1	Muratov Timur Muratuly	Chairman of the Board
2	Adilbekov Yerzhan Boranbaevich	Deputy Chairman of the Board for Medical Affairs
3	Bayanbaev Arman Seitkanovich	Deputy Chairman of the Board for Strategic

		Development
4	Kalmagambetova Aizhan Tanatkanovna	Deputy Chairman of the Board for Economic and Administrative Support
5	Dikhanbaev Dauren Muratovich	Deputy Chairman of the Board for Production and Development
6	Saparov Askhat Ishangalieovich	Managing director
7	Agybaev Gumyrbek Rakhymbekovich	Head of Education and Training Center (ETC)
8	Zhanibekova Indira Anuarbekkyzy	Head of the Department of Strategic Development and Marketing
9	Dyusenbaev Sagadat Kairgeldinovich	Head of IT Department
10	Nurutdinova Galiya Khasenovna	Head of the Department of Organizational and Methodological Work
11	Taibekov Bulat Kurushovich	Doctor-instructor of the ETC
12	Sartaev Boris Valerievich	Doctor-instructor of the ETC
13	Kolotilov Yevgeniy Andreevich	Doctor-instructor of the ETC, representative office in Almaty
14	Baltabaev Adilzhan Sansyzbaevich	Safe Driving Instructor
15	Kalmyrza Banu Nalibekkyzy	Head of the Department of Human Resources
16	Ospanova Maria Asanbekovna	Deputy Chief Physician for Internal Audit of the Kyzylorda Ambulance Station (hereinafter referred to as “AS”)
17	Abdrakhmanova Nargiza Nuritdinovna	Deputy Chief Physician of Atyrau Ambulance Station
18	Mansurova Gaukhar Tleugazinovna	Deputy Chief Physician for Medical Work of Ambulance Station of Abay Region
19	Sadirkhodzhaev Rustem Sadirkhodzhaevich	Chief physician of Akmola Ambulance Station
20	Ilyasova Zhainagul Serikovna	Deputy Chief Physician for Quality of Medical Care of Mangistau Ambulance Station
21	Dzhumagalieva Gulnar Zhomartovna	Deputy Chief Physician for Medical Work of Ambulance Station of the West Kazakhstan Region
22	Gulmira Baltabekovna	MSE at the REM “Aral Multidisciplinary Central District Hospital” of the Kyzylorda Region
23	Zharkimbekov Bakyt Kalzheshovich	Head of the situation center
24	Beknazarov Kazbek Nurmagambetovich	Head of Public Procurement Department
25	Omarov Altynbek Ardakovich	Leading specialist of the Department of Quality Control and Expertise
26	Bakirova Janel Yerzhanovna	Chief specialist of the Republican Coordination Center for Stroke Problems
27	Nurgalieva Shyryn Kaderovna	Leading specialist of the Republican Coordination Center for Stroke Problems
28	Rahimberlina Rauan Askerzhanovna	Leading specialist of the accounting and reporting department
29	Bayzullov Nurmaganbet Kabibullauli	IT Management Technical Support Manager
30	Akhmetova Zhamilya Sartpaevna	Student of the Educational Institution (EI) “Higher Medical College “Danalyk” named

		after. Z.G.Myrzagulova"
31	Akhanova Lazzat Medelkhanovna	Student of the Educational Institution "Higher Medical College "Danalyk" named after. Z.G.Myrzagulova"
32	Beysenova Svetlana Sailauovna	Student of the Educational Institution "Higher Medical College "Danalyk" named after. Z.G.Myrzagulova"
33	Darieva Zhanat Azimbekovna	Student of the Educational Institution "Higher Medical College "Danalyk" named after. Z.G.Myrzagulova"
34	Burashov Sabyr Yergalievich	Student of the Educational Institution "Higher Medical College "Danalyk" named after. Z.G.Myrzagulova"
35	Zhagiparova Aida Karimovna	Student of the Educational Institution "Higher Medical College "Danalyk" named after. Z.G.Myrzagulova"
36	Kamalutdinova M M	Listener from AS Abay region
37	Samigulov A M	Listener from AS Abay region
38	Murtazina R V	Listener from AS Abay region
39	Yerlanov A Y	Listener from AS Abay region
40	Spanova L Y	Listener from AS Abay region
41	Kurmashev Y Y	Listener from AS Abay region
42	Urazov Azamat Sartaeovich	Listener from AS Kyzylorda region
43	Tobylbayeva Marina Tolegenovna	Listener from AS Kyzylorda region
44	Shagirova Aigerim Sarsenbekovna	Listener from AS Kyzylorda region
45	Baymuratova Yelmira Tauribaevna	Listener from AS Kyzylorda region
46	Temirbaeva Lyazzat Abievna	Listener from AS Kyzylorda region
47	Abdrakhmanova Nargiza Nuritdinovna	Listener from AS of Atyrau region
48	Zhanysbaeva Laura Kyrykbaevna	Listener from AS of Atyrau region
49	Aubakar Anar Mukhsimatovna	Listener from AS of Atyrau region
50	Kozhambetova Gulzhan	Listener from AS of Atyrau region
51	Sidagalieva Akerke	Listener from AS of Atyrau region
52	Kokoshko Alexey Ivanovich	Partner from "BB Nura" LLP
53	Urazalina Zhanar Maratovna, Ph.D.	Partner from Semey Medical University, Associate Professor of the Department of Emergency Medicine, chief freelance pulmonologist of Semey

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held based on the results of the external evaluation. Members of the EEC began drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the results of the external evaluation are made. Experts individually filled out the "Institutional Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of NCCEM for Compliance with ECAQA Accreditation Standards." No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improvement for the organization of education were discussed by the chairman Slavko Ye.A. a final open vote was held on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, and access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. A visit was organized for members of the EEC to

the new building of the NCCEM, with a bed capacity of 200 beds and a day hospital for 50 visits per shift, the building is being prepared for commissioning. The members of the EEC were shown the organization of work and interaction of the departments involved in the organization of the educational process: ETC, IT management, department of strategic development and monitoring, department of organizational and methodological work, human resources department. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the team, prompt provision of information to members of the EEC. An online meeting was organized with students - graduates of previous years, employers of students, representatives of NCCEM partners.

When conducting a survey of students, 100% of respondents believe that accreditation of an educational institution is an important and necessary mechanism for ensuring the quality of education.

Survey conducted by an ECAQA observer: among the most important external expert evaluation tools that allow drawing conclusions about the quality of professional development, the majority of trainees consider attendance at practical classes and seminars (93.33%), interviews with teachers (73.33%) and interviews with listeners (73.33%).

According to 50% of teachers, the survey conducted by ECAQA is useful for developing recommendations for improving key areas of activity of an accredited educational organization, 50% partially agree with this. Among the surveyed teachers, 16.67% believe that to ensure the quality of postgraduate education, accreditation of educational programs must be combined with other mechanisms (certification, audits, independent assessment of students' knowledge).

At the end of the visit, the chairman of the EEC announced recommendations based on the results of the external evaluation as part of institutional accreditation to the management and employees of the educational organization.

4. Analysis of compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the RSE on REM “National Coordination Center for Emergency Medicine” of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan

Standard 1: MISSION AND RESULTS

1.1 Mission

The mission of NCCEM is to provide emergency medical care by improving its accessibility for the population of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In the field of additional medical education, NCCEM declared its mission to be the constant deepening and improvement of the knowledge and skills of doctors in the context of annual updating of data on various sections of medicine in order to increase the level of assistance to the population of Kazakhstan in the field of health care, reproductive potential, improving the quality of life, and also to become a leader to provide quality medical care in Kazakhstan and disseminate the knowledge and literacy of our society in first aid in emergency situations and help them avoid critical situations and cope with them.

When implementing the activities of the visit program, namely, based on the results of an interview with the first head of the organization, members of the Board, in interviews with students and teachers, compliance with the criteria of **standard 1** was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the educational organization, took part in the formation of proposals for formulating the mission, at the same time, the mission was brought to the attention of listeners through the website, social networks, information letters to medical organizations, through the Association of Emergency Medical Care of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The organization's strategic plan for the period 2022-2027 was reviewed, in which “Development of scientific and educational activities and strengthening human resources” is indicated as one of the strategic directions, which confirms the implementation of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization.

From interviews with students and graduates of additional education programs, it was established that before the start of classes, teachers inform about the mission and work plans of NCCEM.

During the visit to the units, accreditation experts noted the strengths of the educational organization, including: NCCEM is a national leader in the field of emergency medical care training in accordance with international standards; has a close connection with consumers of educational services through the professional association of emergency medical care, in the process of professional activities with regional units of emergency medical care (hereinafter referred to as EMC); has an organizational structure that reflects the interactions of the units involved in the organization of the educational process; internal regulatory documents regulating the educational process have been developed on the basis of LSI; training is conducted by certified teachers with practical experience; 12 educational programs of non-formal education have an author's certificate, the additional education program "Paramedic" is included in the Catalog of additional education programs of the RSE on REM "National Scientific Center for Health Development named after Salidat Kairbekova"; A strategic plan has been developed highlighting the development of scientific and educational activities as one of the main directions.

The structural unit of NCCEM, which organizes and carries out the training process for students, is the educational and training center (hereinafter referred to as the ETC). Experts are convinced that the training center is an educational center where innovative and modern methods of training and advanced training for doctors and paramedical workers are used. The main goal is to train healthcare professionals in international standards for emergency care, practice medical manipulation techniques, and adequately respond (decision making) in emergency situations. To organize the educational process, lecture halls and classrooms equipped with simulation and training equipment are provided. The trainers of the training center focus on teaching the skills of providing ambulance and emergency medical care in accordance with international standards for employees of the medical aviation service, ambulance and emergency medical care.

The results of studying the documentation demonstrate that the mission of NCCEM is determined on the basis of studying and evaluating the needs of practical healthcare and society, in accordance with regulatory documents: Order of the Vice-Minister of the Ministry of Health dated February 25, 2021 No. 105 "On approval of the Rules for training in emergency medical care skills in accordance with international standards", Roadmap for improving the provision of medical care for injuries in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2022-2023, Roadmap for improving the organization of emergency medical care in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2022-2023.

The educational process is structured in accordance with the current LSI in additional education and healthcare. With regard to additional and non-formal education, the constant deepening and improvement of the knowledge and skills of doctors is determined in the context of annual updating of data on various sections of medicine in order to increase the level of assistance to the population of Kazakhstan in the field of health care, reproductive potential, improving the quality of life, disseminating knowledge and increasing public literacy on mastering first aid in emergency situations.

At the same time, during the meetings, experts identified a number of problems. *Experts noted that the mission in the field of additional and non-formal education is cumbersome, does not reflect the specific goal that NCCEM seeks to achieve in the field of education, and is not included in the mission of the organization.* However, when studying the strategic development plan of NCCEM for 2022-2027, experts found that the development of scientific and educational activities is one of the main strategic directions for the development of NCCEM.

1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy

To verify **standard 1**, a meeting was held with the head of the NCCEM organization. During the conversation, the experts asked the following questions: How is the mission communicated to the medical community and consumers of educational services? What place does scientific and educational activity occupy in the strategic plan of NCCEM? During the answers, the chairman of the organization's board confirmed that the text of the mission and vision is posted on the NCCEM information stands, on the website www.emcrk.kz, on social networks (Instagram, Facebook), and is also available to the public through information provided in the media. Information about educational

programs conducted by NCCEM instructors is posted on the website www.emcrk.kz, distributed through communication networks, and constantly voiced at various meetings, during meetings with partners, heads of emergency medical care, and specialists from medical organizations of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In the strategic development plan of NCCEM for 2022-2027, the development of scientific and educational activities is defined as one of the strategic directions.

When conducting a survey of 15 students (on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>), it was found that 100% of respondents would recommend studying at NCCEM to their acquaintances, friends, and relatives. And 80% of respondents believe that managers and teachers are aware of students' problems related to learning. To the question "Do you think this educational organization allows you to improve the necessary knowledge and skills in your specialty?", 100% of students answered positively.

During the face-to-face conversation with students, the following information was received: students speak positively about the organization of the educational process, the qualifications of teachers, and the equipment of training rooms. After completing the training, students master both the theoretical knowledge acquired during the training, as evidenced by the answers to test questions, and practical skills. Many students undergo training again and choose NCCEM for training.

The 6 teachers surveyed (21 survey questions) also answered that 66.67% were satisfied with the organization of work and workplace in NCCEM, and 33.33% partially agreed with this statement. Experts determined that NCCEM has a healthy microclimate, since the director is quite accessible to both students and employees, responds promptly to requests, 66.67% of teachers responded that NCCEM management systematically listens to the opinions of employees regarding issues related to the educational process, research, clinical work, a third of teachers believe that management sometimes responds to employee requests. In the questionnaire, 100% of teachers are satisfied with the microclimate in NCCEM. According to 83.33% of respondents, a teacher has the opportunity to realize itself as a professional in its specialty. For your information, a total of 6 people responded (there are 7 in total), with 16.67% having up to 5 years of teaching experience, 50% having up to 10 years of experience, and 33.33% having over 10 years of experience.

1.3 Final learning outcomes

The surveyed teachers responded that 16.67% were completely satisfied with the level of students' prior training, and 50% were partially satisfied.

Experts have established a clear continuity between the final results of previous training and the continuous professional development programs offered at NCCEM. The organization has developed 13 non-formal education programs and 1 advanced training program. Information about the number and variety of programs is carried out through the NCCEM website https://emcrk.kz/images/spisok_utc_ru.pdf, where a complete list of educational programs is posted. Educational programs indicate the final learning outcomes and a list of practical skills that students must master after completion of training, which the teacher introduces to students on the first day of training.

In addition, on social networks (<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=j73JOcSjkYc>; <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RMxrxlBrLCo>; https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=qe4_0e3b-8U;) listeners can familiarize themselves with videos/manuals on first aid and assistance in case of an accident, which reflect a brief content of educational programs.

1.4 Participation in the formulation of mission and final results

The mission is formulated and the final learning outcomes for each educational program are determined, taking into account the proposals of such stakeholders as representatives of organizations providing emergency medical care: Ambulance stations in the regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan and emergency medical departments at healthcare organizations providing primary health care. For example, training in the "Basic Life Support (BLS)" program is carried out as part of the implementation of the "Roadmap for improving the provision of medical care for injuries in the

Republic of Kazakhstan for 2022-2023”, “Roadmap for improving the organization of emergency medical care in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2022-2023.”.

In 2023, at the request of the head of the headquarters of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic of Kazakhstan NG-28-20-198/3131-I dated November 28, 2022 training was conducted under the “Basic Life Support (BLS)” program for military personnel of the National Guard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and a master class was conducted for employees of the Ministry of Internal Affairs.

Currently, large-scale measures are being taken in the Republic of Kazakhstan to reduce mortality at the prehospital stage, which include the modernization of emergency medical care at the prehospital stage, the development of regulations, and training of the population. Regularly in public places (near the New Year trees in Astana, on duty at hockey matches in the “Barys” HC), NCCEM instructors conduct master classes using simulation equipment for residents of Astana.

At the same time, when talking with students and employers, to the question “Do you participate in formulating the mission and goals of the organization, educational program?”, “What is the personal contribution, for example, of students to improving the content and methods of teaching?” listeners responded that they do not directly participate in the discussion of the mission, but they get acquainted with the mission of NCCEM during training, as well as on the website and pages on social networks. Employers responded that they participate in the discussion of the NCCEM mission through discussions at production meetings and official correspondence.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Complies with 9 standards: fully - 8, partially -1.

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) When updating the mission of the RSE on REM “National Coordination Center for Emergency Medicine” of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, it should reflect the educational activities of the organization.

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS

2.1 Model of educational programs of additional and non-formal education

To implement educational programs of additional and non-formal education on the basis of regulatory legal acts, NCCEM has developed internal regulatory documents: “Procedure for organizing training in an educational and training center”, “Procedure for organizing training in an educational and training center”, “Rules for conducting an appeal based on the results of the final exam training seminar”, “Student’s Guidebook”, which defines the procedure for organizing and conducting the educational process.

The developed educational programs indicate the purpose and objectives of training, take into account the integration of practical and theoretical components, and independent work. The purpose of the programs is for students to acquire new theoretical knowledge and improve practical skills necessary to provide qualified emergency care to adults and children in accordance with modern international principles of care. The lecture and seminar portions of the program cover the entire program (for example, basic resuscitation with an automated external defibrillator, advanced cardiopulmonary resuscitation in adults and pediatrics, and prehospital trauma care).

In practical classes, students master theoretical information using algorithms. To better assimilate knowledge and acquire the necessary practical skills, it is proposed to use active teaching methods using modern visual aids, mannequins, a defibrillator, video materials and auxiliary equipment.

By attending practical classes on the topic “Basic Life Support” (BLS) with a volume of 8 hours and “Advanced Cardiac Life Support” (ACLS) with a volume of 16 hours, experts received convincing evidence that the training is carried out according to plan, a survey of students is conducted, and students receive feedback from the teacher, answer test questions, have the opportunity to improve their skills in providing emergency care. The organization ensures compliance with ethical aspects in the implementation of educational programs, since experts have studied the Code of Business Ethics

and during interviews, students responded that they were informed about the contents of this document.

An analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in the advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the bibliography of educational programs, and teachers use them in the classroom.

Self-training of students is presented in the form of a business game. In the process of developing practical skills, students play various professional roles (doctor, paramedic, dispatcher, teacher, etc.). Each student plays the role of team leader at least 3 times in the full course and at least 1 time in the seminar-training course. Assigned trainee roles may vary depending on the number of trainees at the station. Depending on the assigned role, students practice practical skills in providing emergency care, features of communications in an extreme situation, and the procedure for organizing emergency assistance.

The training of students is carried out in accordance with the current policy of the state and professional organizations in the field of health care on the recognition of training activities for continuous professional development. The content and structure of educational programs meets the requirements of regulatory documents, which are presented in detail in the NCCEM institutional self-assessment report and are available in the list of cases. Employees constantly monitor changes in legal regulations and make appropriate adjustments to educational activities.

When conducting training, students and the instructor create a common group through social networks, in which, throughout the training and beyond, students can discuss with each other and with the instructor questions that arise during the training or during independent work. After completing the training, teachers receive feedback from students through a survey. The experts were provided with student questionnaires with questions about the quality and conditions of training.

Members of the EEC were shown videos (manuals) on first aid and assistance in case of road accidents, which reflected a brief content of educational programs. Videos were prepared by the training center staff and posted on the website and official pages of NCCEM on social networks (<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=j73JOcSJKYc>; <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RMxrxlBrLCo>; https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=qe4_0e3b-8U);

The procedure for informing students about their rights and responsibilities, organizing training is reflected in the following internal regulatory documents: “Reference guide for students of training seminars of the ETC NCCEM”, “Regulations on the stages of training in the educational and training center”, “Procedure for organizing training in educational and training center”, “Rules for conducting an appeal based on the results of the final examination of the training seminar”.

All information received by experts indicates compliance with standard 2 in terms of adapting training to the needs of students.

Additional education (continuous professional development) is the main component of the process of continuous improvement of the knowledge and skills of mid-level and post-secondary health care professionals. This approach is consistent with international principles of professional development and the European Higher Education Area. (ESG 1.2).

NCCEM has adapted training to the needs and wishes of individual students, for example, in 2023, training was conducted under the BLS program for military personnel of the National Guard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, a master class for employees of the Ministry of Internal Affairs at the request of the head of the headquarters of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic of Kazakhstan NG-28-20-198/3131-I from November 28, 2022). At the request of organizations, NCCEM also actively implements educational programs on “Basic cardiopulmonary resuscitation using an automatic external defibrillator” for persons without medical education, in particular for teachers (EI “Higher Medical College “Danalyk” named after Z.G. Murzagulova”, State Enterprise at the EI “School-

Lyceum No. 92" of the Akimat of Astana), which will allow students, if necessary, to effectively provide emergency assistance.

At the same time, the organization does not have a document defining the procedure for development and approval, as well as the requirements for the structure of educational programs.

2.2 Scientific method

Educational programs implemented by NCCEM are developed taking into account the recommendations of the international guidelines for resuscitation of the American Heart Association, the European Resuscitation Council, and the international guidelines for prehospital trauma life support (PHTLS) of the National Association of Emergency Medicine America's Aid in collaboration with the American College of Surgeons (National Association of Emergency Medical Technicians in cooperation on trauma of the American College of Surgeon).

All recommendations from internationally accredited Associations of Emergency Cardiovascular Care related to clinical strategy, intervention, treatment and testing have been compared to the Class of Recommendation and Level of Evidence and are the most current language approved by the American College of Cardiology.

When talking with students, the experts learned that they use scientific data in their training and know the basics of evidence-based medicine.

Students' access to updated scientific and clinical data is ensured, since in the organization of education at NCCEM, students, teachers and staff have access to recommendations of leading professional associations in the field of emergency medical care: <https://www.guidelinecentral.com/guidelines/AHA/>, <https://cprguidelines.eu/>, [https://www.facs.org/quality-programs/trauma/education/partnerships-in-education/#:~:text=Prehospital%20Trauma%20Life%20Support%20\(PHTLS\),oversight%20for%20the%20PHTLS%20program.](https://www.facs.org/quality-programs/trauma/education/partnerships-in-education/#:~:text=Prehospital%20Trauma%20Life%20Support%20(PHTLS),oversight%20for%20the%20PHTLS%20program.)

2.3 Content of additional and non-formal education programs and their relationship with the provision of medical care

Educational programs of NCCEM contain a theoretical part and practical classes, including the study of basic disciplines, clinical training, intermediate and end-of-course attestation.

For example, the Basic Life Support (BLS) program is based on the State Standard for Continuing Education and the recommendations of the American Heart Association (AHA). The program is designed for 8 academic hours, of which 1 hour (12.5%) of theoretical classes (lectures), 6 hours of practical classes (75%), and the work is aimed at making the actions of the person providing assistance automatic. Upon completion of the classes, a 1-hour test (12.5%) is taken (in test form and in the form of a practical exam) for the purpose of final control of the knowledge and skills of students.

The theoretical part of the program provides for the study of a full course of basic resuscitation using an automatic external defibrillator. Lecture material includes the study of algorithms for providing BLS assistance in cardiac arrest in adults and children. In addition, students learn how to assist unconscious people with palpitations and breathing (transfer to safety), as well as assistance with foreign body airway obstruction.

The level of knowledge of students before the start of training is assessed during an interview with the teacher, while the incoming level of knowledge of students is not recorded.

In practical classes, students master theoretical information using algorithms.

In order to improve the national accreditation system, the tracer methodology has been introduced into the process of evaluating the quality of student training. At the same time, the organization does not have a document defining the procedure for development and approval, as well as the requirements for the structure and content of educational programs.

There are difficulties in planning, developing and approving educational programs, including limited human resources. The strategic development plan of the organization for 2022-2027 provides for the expansion of the structural unit directly responsible for organizing the educational process - the Department of Science and Education (hereinafter referred to as the DSE), the main task of which will

be to ensure the development of scientific, innovative and educational activities in the field of healthcare, the use of advanced research achievements in the process of training medical personnel.

13 programs presented to experts are non-formal education programs. A 7-credit CDP program "Paramedic" has been developed, the program is included in the Catalog of the program of additional education of the RSE on REM "National Scientific Center for Health Development named after Salidat Kairbekova" <http://89.218.81.108/#/catalog/view>. The program is at the stage of calculating the cost of training per student and including it in the price list for paid services of NCCEM.

Teachers provide students with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes, with which 93.33% are completely satisfied, 6.67% found it difficult to answer.

NCCEM currently does not have its own clinical base; however, work is being completed to commission a new center building, which includes its own clinical base with a bed capacity of 200 beds and a day hospital for 50 visits per shift, which includes 8 clinical centers in 20 specialties.

Trainees were also trained in on-site cycles at the bases of medical organizations in the Kzyl-Orda, Abay, Atyrau, Zhambyl, and Akmla regions using both the medical organizations' own simulation equipment and delivered simulation equipment from NCCEM.

To the question of the questionnaire "Is there enough time for practical training (supervision of patients, etc.)", 100% of students responded with complete agreement, while 93.33% of students claim that after completion of classes the teacher provides feedback (listens to your opinion, conducts mini-questionnaire, work on mistakes).

At the same time, to the question "Do student representatives participate in the development of educational programs?", 86.67% of students answered positively, 6.67% know nothing about it. Students surveyed are fully satisfied with the schedule of training sessions (80%)

Management of the educational process, reflected in the self-assessment report (**standard 2**) and general approaches to management were confirmed during a visit to the ETC department and conversations with the head of the ETC and employees. At the same time, verification of **standard 2** showed that before the start of classes, an evaluation of the incoming level of knowledge of students is not documented; students have limited access to information resources.

The experts got acquainted with the work of the ETC, visited training rooms with simulation equipment, lecture halls, and conducted interviews with teachers of the ETC.

While attending 2 practical classes on the topic "Basic Life Support" (BLS) and "Advanced Cardiac Life Support" (ACLS) in a conversation with students, the experts saw that the organization promotes the development and improvement of the practical competencies of healthcare professionals (teachers of the medical college, employees of AMP NCCEM), including on simulation equipment. At the same time, students deepen their theoretical knowledge and develop communication skills.

Thus, during a conversation with NCCEM employees, experts received information about training in the training rooms of the ETC on modern simulation equipment or directly at the bases of regional AS, and teachers and representatives of employers confirmed these data.

Of the 15 students surveyed, 93.33% responded that teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods quite often, 6.67% found it difficult to answer.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply with 13 standards: fully - 12, partially - 1.

Recommendations for improvement:

1) To develop a system for evaluating the knowledge of students before the start of training and document the results of evaluating the incoming level of knowledge.

Standard 3: EVALUATION OF STUDENTS' COMPETENCIES AND DOCUMENTATION

3.1 Evaluation methods

The study of Controls Assessment Tools (CIS) (tests, situational tasks, control questions) showed that the organization has implemented an appropriate assessment policy that allows for a comprehensive evaluation of the educational achievements of students.

During the interviews, students talked about evaluation forms, such as oral questioning, discussing a real situation, answering test items, assessing practical skills using a checklist, and confirmed that they were satisfied with everything. Students also confirmed that they receive regular feedback from the teacher. At the beginning of the training, a general chat is created with the group teacher. All students receive from the teacher by e-mail and directly in class printed versions of the Guidelines (algorithms) of each course for checking the dose of the drug during training and algorithms for the sequence of actions during practical classes (mega-codes). Ongoing assessment of students is carried out during classes. Current assessment is formative because the student receives feedback from the instructor to improve the educational process, while the instructor informs students about the level of knowledge achieved.

The system for appealing assessment results is reflected in the document “Rules for conducting an appeal based on the results of the final examination of a training seminar”; during the period of operation of the ETC there were no precedents for appeal.

So, to verify the data of **standard 3**, the experts asked questions to the head of the ETC, Agybaev G.R.: How is the input level of knowledge of students assessed? What methods of evaluating students' knowledge are used? Answers were received that the level of knowledge of students is evaluated through an interview, which allows the instructor to form an idea of the level of knowledge of students; the result of the evaluation is not recorded. Among the methods for evaluating the development of trainees' competencies during training and after completion of training, methods such as answering test questions, solving clinical situations, oral answers to test questions, and evaluating practical skills using checklists are used). Solving situational problems close to real life situations allows students to consistently master skills and master intellectual operations, and also contributes to the development of self-organization skills. When solving situational problems: the student finds a solution to the situational problem, and the instructor helps students master the method of activity and understand its essence. Based on the results of completing a situational task and observing students, the skills (competencies) are diagnosed: to apply knowledge, as well as the ability to analyze and systematize information, the ability to update and apply the necessary knowledge, and methods of activity in standard and non-standard situations.

All students receive by e-mail and directly in class printed versions of the Guidelines (algorithms) of each course for checking the dose of the drug during training and algorithms for the sequence of actions during practical classes (Mega-codes).

Each educational program has test tasks, a set of clinical situations, and checklists. Testing is carried out in written form. CIS are approved at a meeting of the educational and methodological council, which is reflected in the minutes.

During a visit to the organization and during an interview with doctor-instructor Taibekov Bulat, the commission was convinced that there is a documentation system that is transparent and accessible to all teachers and employees, and includes documents such as annual operating plans, annual reports, department regulations, agreements with teachers and students, as well as educational and methodological documentation (work program, working curricula, syllabuses, journals), CIS (checklists, statements), evidence, certificates and verifications.

A review of the website showed that its pages contain documents necessary for students: a list of educational programs, a schedule of classes, a list of documents required for enrollment in training, a price list for educational services, videos reflecting the content of educational programs (Carrying out cardiopulmonary resuscitation, first aid in case of a traffic accident, etc.). This information was obtained during an interview with physician instructor Boris Sartaev.

At the beginning of the training, students fill out a student sheet; when passing the end-of-course test, each participant fills out a sheet of practical skills and an examination test sheet. Lists of participants are registered in the logbook for registering lists of seminar-training participants (a separate log is kept for each educational course). Upon completion of the training, the trainee is issued a certificate, which is recorded in the certificate journal. After the training is completed, the

examination sheet and the student's personal documents are attached to the list of participants of the course.

When conducting interviews with 6 teachers regarding evaluation methods, the experts received convincing information that teachers use all of the above evaluation methods in teaching. Listeners also confirmed the timeliness of the provision of tests, the provision of counseling before tests and certification exams, the clarity of the entire evaluation procedure and its fairness.

During the visit to the organization, management was asked the question: "Are external examiners involved in order to improve the fairness, quality and transparency of the evaluation process?" And a negative answer was received.

Interviewed 7 representatives of employers also indicated that the training of students corresponds to the modern development of medical practice and science.

Based on clause 15 of the activities of the "Road Map for Improving the Organization of Emergency Medical Care in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2022-2023," NCCEM instructors, together with representatives of the Regional Health Administrations of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and heads of emergency medical care stations, monitor the quality of training of emergency medical service station workers assistance to the regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the skills of providing emergency medical care in accordance with international standards BLS, ACLS, PALS, PHTLS, in the form of a tracer.

When conducting a tracer, a case method is used, the essence of which is that the listener is asked to comprehend a real life situation, the description of which simultaneously reflects not only any practical problem, but also actualizes a certain set of knowledge that must be learned when solving this problem. The use of the case method as a diagnostic tool for evaluating the level of development of information competence of students allows us to assess the ability to use subject knowledge in practice, apply it in a non-standard situation, analyze, synthesize knowledge, transform information, use knowledge to solve a real problem based on an assessment of the situation. When conducting a tracer, the instructor fills out checklists for everyone. Upon completion, the instructors analyze the quality of training to international standards for emergency medical personnel.

At the same time, *there are difficulties in developing control and measurement tools, including the mechanisms for assessing the reliability and validity of assessment methods were not demonstrated to experts. It was also recommended to provide for the organization of a test center for conducting computer testing, which would make it possible to objectify the assessment of students' knowledge.*

3.3 Documentation of additional and non-formal education

In accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 326-1 dated December 22, 1998 "On National Archive Fund and Archives", Model Rules for Documentation and Document Management in State and Non-Government Organizations, approved by Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 703 and other LSI in NCCEM, the Rules for documentation, documentation management and use of electronic document management systems have been developed and approved, regulating the procedure for working with documents in NCCEM.

The nomenclature of NCCEM files is signed by the head of the structural unit responsible for records management, agreed with the NCCEM expert commission, with the expert verification commission of the National Archives of the Republic of Kazakhstan, to which documents are transferred for permanent storage and approved by the decision of the Chairman of the NCCEM Board (no later than the end of the current year). The nomenclature of files is agreed upon with the State Institution "National Archive of the Republic of Kazakhstan" at least once every 5 years; if there have been no conceptual changes in the functions and structure of the NCCEM.

During the learning process, students can create a portfolio for themselves from action algorithms that they learn about in class, situational tasks, and mega-codes, which they can later apply in their practical activities. A portfolio, which is a motivating factor in learning, directs the student to improve its knowledge. (for example, the listener asks himself questions: "What did I succeed to the greatest extent and what did I succeed least and why?", "To what extent am I satisfied with my participation in

the team's work, the result obtained, my own progress in development?", etc. .).

The actual training of students is confirmed by relevant documentation, including agreements with organizations/individuals, registration and certificate issuance logs, answers to student examination tests.

After completing the training, a certificate of completion of training is issued for a period of two years (with the exception of the First Aid training seminar - three years).

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria comply with 10 standards: completely – 10.

Standard 4: HEALTH PROFESSIONALS (INDIVIDUALIZED PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT)

4.1 Motivation

The organization has developed internal regulatory documents that define the policy for recruiting and accepting students: “The procedure for organizing training in an educational and ETC”, “Regulations on the stages of conducting training in an educational and training center”, “Reference guide for students of training seminars of the ETC “NCCEM”.

The head of the ETC Agymbaev G.R. spoke about the policy for enrolling students.

In accordance with the Order of the Vice Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 105 dated February 25, 2021 “On approval of the Rules for teaching emergency medical care skills in accordance with international standards,” NCCEM is a single operator for monitoring and quality control of knowledge gained in the process of training in international standards of care emergency medical care of employees of regional and city emergency medical care, emergency medical care departments at primary health care facilities and emergency departments of medical organizations providing inpatient care.

At NCCEM, recruitment of students is carried out on the basis of applications from organizations and individuals. Training is carried out according to the annual approved calendar and thematic plan.

During the period from 2017 to August 2023, 24,892 students were accepted to study at NCCEM in 13 non-formal education programs. 24,892 people successfully completed the training. For example, the most popular programs were “BLS (Basic Life Support)”, which trained 5,923 students (23.4%), “Safe driving. Safe driving in difficult conditions” – 3,978 listeners (16%) and ACLS (Advanced Cardiopulmonary Life Support) – 2,410 listeners (10%).

A balance is ensured between the existing potential of the educational organization and the opportunities for training and recruitment of students, since the organization has two training rooms with modern simulation equipment, a lecture hall, and a conference room. In addition, at the request of organizations, training is conducted directly at clinical sites, mainly using NCCEM mannequins.

From 2021 to 2023, on-site training was conducted in the following organizations:

- MSE at the REM “Mangistau Regional Ambulance and Emergency Medical Care Station” of the Health Administration of the Mangistau Region

- PSE at the REM "Atyrau Regional Emergency Medical Care Station" of the Atyrau Region Healthcare Institution (NCCEM mannequins under a custody agreement)

- Corporate Foundation “University Medical Center”

- PSE at the REM “Atyrau Regional Perinatal Center” of the Health Administration (hereinafter - HA) of the Atyrau region

- FIRST SECURITY GROUP LLP

- MPI "Health Department of Zhambyl Region"

- MSE at the REM “Multidisciplinary City Children’s Hospital No. 2” of the Akimat of the city of Nur-Sultan (Astana)

- PSE at the REM “Aral Interdistrict Hospital” HA of the Kyzylorda Region
- State Institution "Health Administration of the Mangistau Region" for the AS of the Mangistau Region
- MSE at the REM "Zhangalinskaya district hospital" of the Akimat of HA of the West Kazakhstan region
- PSE at the REM "Kazalinskaya interdistrict hospital" HA of the Kyzylorda region
- MSE at the REM “City Polyclinic” HA at the Akmola Region
- PSE at the REM "City Clinical Hospital No. 5" in Almaty
- “Astana ECOLIFE” LLP
- MSE at the REM "School-Lyceum No. 92" of the Akimat of Astana
- MSE at the REM "Zhambyl Regional Blood Center" of the Akimat of the Zhambyl Region
- MSE at the REM "Hospital of the Baiterek District" of the Healthcare Administration of the West Kazakhstan region
- PSE at the REM "Kyzylorda Regional Emergency Medical Care Station" HA of the Kyzylorda Region (under a custody agreement, NCCEM equipped the training room with simulators and mannequins directly at their base)

During the field cycles from 2021 to 2023, 5090 students were trained.

Thus, the experts validated the data according to standard 4. The experts reviewed the documentation for the enrollment of students, including orders for the enrollment of students, the annual training plan of the training center, the price list for the provision of paid educational services, approved by the Chairman of the Board, contracts for the provision of paid educational services with the customer.

Experts interviewed students and instructors about the practice of academic advising, personal support for students, and the development of more than just professional skills.

As the students explained, they receive advice on the educational programs of NCCEM during professional communication with ETC staff, through the professional ambulance association of the Republic of Kazakhstan. On the website and official pages of NCCEM on social networks (<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=j73JOcSJkYc>; <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RMxrxlBrLCo>; https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=qe4_0e3b-8U;) applicants for training can familiarize themselves with videos of first aid and assistance in case of an accident, which reflect a brief content of educational programs.

Upon completion of training, for all training seminars, a certificate of completion of training is issued for a period of two years (with the exception of the “First Aid” training seminar - three years). After the certificates expire, students undergo re-training and, as a rule, choose NCCEM for training.

When choosing educational programs, students can contact the specialists of the NCCEM ETC, who will advise them on the topics of interest in educational programs, on the dates when and where the training is planned, and also, if necessary, contact the instructors to build a route for their professional development. (For example: sequence of training courses according to international standards: basic resuscitation - advanced cardiopulmonary resuscitation - advanced cardiopulmonary resuscitation in pediatrics, etc.). Consultants are guided by the following documents: SOP 5.1. “The procedure for organizing training in the Educational and Training Center” approved by the Order of the Chairman of the Board of NCCEM No. 104 dated July 12, 2022, the Regulations on the stages of training in the NCCEM Training Center, approved by the Chairman of the Board of NCCEM dated January 20, 2022.

In order to inform about the courses conducted by NCCEM, information letters on the training of doctors and non-medical workers are regularly sent to medical organizations and other departments.

4.2 Teaching strategies

During the training process, NCCEM instructors try to develop the abilities of each specialist with medical and non-medical education, teach them to plan, carry out and document their training,

achievements, mastery of skills by maintaining a portfolio, which is formed from action algorithms that they learn about in classes, situational tasks, mega -codes, which they will subsequently be able to apply in their practical activities.

A portfolio is a motivating factor in learning and directs the student to improve their knowledge. (for example, the listener asks himself questions: “What did I succeed to the greatest extent and what did I succeed least and why?”, “To what extent am I satisfied with my participation in the team’s work, the result obtained, my own progress in development?”, etc.). During the courses, students receive the necessary skills in providing emergency medical care, their implementation, strict adherence to clinical protocols, the ability to apply them correctly, work in a team using communication skills, observing the conditions of personal safety and safety for the patient. At the end of the training, students undergo an end-of-course test to evaluate theoretical knowledge and practical skills.

During the COVID-19 pandemic, some educational programs (seminars “Flight physiology and patient transportation”, “Dispatching service in emergency medical care”, “Call holding system”) were conducted using remote technologies. This training included familiarization with lecture presentations, conducting lectures and classes using Webex and Zoom. To conduct educational programs using distance technologies, preliminary technical training was required, which was provided by the IT department. In general, educational programs (seminars) using distance technologies received positive feedback from students.

However, training of students in emergency care (such as basic resuscitation, cardiopulmonary resuscitation and others) is carried out at NCCEM or directly at the bases of organizations only in an offline format due to the fact that students must practice practical skills on training mannequins under the supervision of an instructor

4.3 Participation and influence of students in additional and non-formal education programs

NCCEM closely cooperates with the Association of Emergency Medical Care (hereinafter referred to as AEMC) of the Republic of Kazakhstan, which includes the heads of regional ambulance stations, and the association is headed by a representative of NCCEM. Training center instructors also take part in association meetings as necessary. Representatives of ambulance stations can discuss their training needs and wishes when developing educational programs.

NCCEM, together with the AEMC, regularly organizes and conducts Spartakiads of emergency medical teams. For example, the last sports competition was held on August 11-12, 2023 in Semey with the support of the Health Department of the Abay region. Holding Spartakiads helps members of EMC teams not only improve their skills, but demonstrate the importance of teamwork and coordinated work of EMC medical workers, and also contribute to improving professional competence, growing the image of an EMC specialist, and developing training needs.

Doctors-instructors, NCCEM specialists and students (emergency medical services workers, medical organizations) are participants in various working groups of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan when developing normative legal acts, reviewing clinical protocols, etc. NCCEM involves students in discussing issues related to learning outcomes, evaluation methods, evaluation programs in the form of participation in a survey (listener satisfaction questionnaire). For example, as part of the implementation of the activities of the Roadmap for medical care for injuries in the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2022-2023 (Chapter 3, paragraph 8), NCCEM instructors, together with specialists from other medical organizations, participate in the revision of clinical protocols for the diagnosis and treatment of “Sudden death”.

4.4 Working conditions

NCCEM has created working conditions favorable to health and learning. The organization has developed and approved by order of the Chairman of the Board of NCCEM No. 87 dated September 21, 2020, a “Safety Program”, which promotes a safe and healthy environment for students and employees of NCCEM Annex 11.

The “Human Resource Management Program” was developed and approved by order of the Chairman of the Board of NCCEM No. 87 dated September 21, 2020, which reflects the working and employment conditions of NCCEM personnel.

Before the start of training, instructors conduct a briefing on labor protection; familiarization of the trainee with the Safety Instructions is confirmed by the signature of the trainee in the training log.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Complies with 11 standards: fully – 11.

Standard 5: ACADEMIC TEACHING STAFF

5.1 Faculty Admission Policy

The training center is a structural subdivision of NCCEM and has 7 staff units indicated in Table 2 below:

№	Name of position	Quantity (units)
1	Head of Training Center	1,0
2	Chief specialist	1,0
3	Leading specialist	1,0
4	Doctor-instructor	3,0
5	Instructor	1,0

The experts are familiar with the internal regulatory documents Regulations of the educational and training center, Job description of the head of the ETC, Job description of the doctor-instructor, Job description of the instructor, Job description of the chief specialist, Job description of the leading specialist, which define the purpose, objectives, structure and main areas of activity of the structural unit, responsible for the implementation of educational programs, as well as requirements for his employees. *While reviewing these documents, experts recommended revising the qualification requirements for employees in accordance with clause 20 of Order of the Vice Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 105 dated February 25, 2021 “On approval of the Rules for training in emergency medical care in accordance with international standards.”*

The experts also recommended: given the role assigned to the ETC in training medical and non-medical emergency medical workers, to expand the staff of the training center. In order to increase the scientific potential of the training center, it was proposed to consider the possibility of attracting teachers from medical universities and research centers to conduct training.

When surveying teachers, it was found that the majority (66.67%) were completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace in NCCEM, but 33.33% were partially satisfied. At NCCEM, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish research results - 50% completely agree, 33.33% partially agree. Satisfied with the work of the HR (personnel) service - 83.33% completely agree, 16.67% partially agree. Satisfied with wages - 16.67% completely agree, 33.33% partially agree.

5.2 Faculty Commitment and Development

In order to verify the data of standard 5, during a meeting with the head of the HR department and during interviews with teachers, experts received an opinion on approaches to developing the pedagogical competence of teachers and motivation to work with students. Teachers undergo training in pedagogical competencies at the Astana Medical University once every five years; the relevant documents were presented to the EEC.

In order to continuously monitor the timeliness and regularity of teacher training in their specialty and pedagogical competencies, experts recommended maintaining an electronic database for teacher training.

Providing quality educational services and strengthening the material and technical base requires planned work and financial support.

The source of financing the educational process is both budget financing within the framework of the state order and income from the provision of paid educational services that do not contradict the law.

Payment of remuneration for paid services provided is determined depending on the volume of paid services for the period and is made monthly to employees directly involved in the provision of paid services, according to the minutes of the meeting of the structural unit, agreed with the Managing Director, approved by the first manager in the amount of 10% of the total income from paid services.

The amounts of remuneration by structural divisions are distributed in the following order:

1) Remuneration to specialists of structural units (including trainers and the head of the Education and Training Center) for direct participation in the provision of paid services and the degree of labor participation of each employee individually - no more than 90% of the amount intended for payment of remunerations;

2) Other employees of structural units for creating organizational and technical conditions for generating income - at least 10% of the amount intended for payment of remuneration.

The first manager has the right to revise the amount of remuneration due to paid services depending on changes in income and the volume of work for paid services, and also, in order to stimulate and increase wages, establish individual remunerations for NCCEM employees.

When calculating the average salary of an employee, these remunerations are taken into account as one-time incentive payments.

Experts have found that NCCEM teachers develop in students the need for CDP and independent work with literature and medical documentation. There is access to websites and electronic resources for the development of professional competencies and teaching skills.

NCCEM finances the training of medical instructors/instructors through budgetary and extra-budgetary funds and paid educational services.

In order to organize the educational process, the following ETC instructors are trained and certified for teaching activities:

1. in 2016 - 2 full-fledged physician instructors for BLS courses at the European Resuscitation Council (RF);

2. in 2016 – 1 trainer-instructor for the Safe Driving course at the Transport Safety Center “Safe Driver” (RF);

3. in 2017 - 2 full-fledged physician instructors for BLS/ACLS/PALS/PHTLS courses at MAGEN DAVID ADOM (Israel);

4. in 2018 - advanced training for 2 medical instructors on the topic “Emergency Medicine 3H System and Professional Courses” at Baskent University (Turkey);

5. in 2018 - 1 full-fledged physician instructor for BLS/ACLS/PALS/PHTLS courses at CoMeT Medical Research Center (Israel);

6. in 2019 - 2 full-fledged physician instructors for BLS/ACLS/PALS/PHTLS courses at MAGEN DAVID ADOM (Israel);

7. in 2019 - 5 full-fledged physician instructors for BLS/ACLS courses at the American Heart Association (Italy);

8. in 2019 - 4 full-fledged physician instructors in PhTLS courses at the National Association of Emergency Medical Technicians - NAEMT (USA);

9. in 2020 – 1 trainer-instructor for the Safe Driving course at the Transport Safety Center “Safe Driver” (RF);

10. in 2021 - 3 instructors in the course “Teacher of medical education and science” at the Astana Medical University NJSC;

11. in 2021, 1 doctor-instructor for the course “Fundamentals of methodology in the field of additional education of healthcare specialists” at the NJSC “Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov”;

12. in 2021 – 3 full-fledged physician instructors for BLS/ACLS/PALS/PHTLS courses at Galilee Medical Center (Israel);

13. in 2022 – 2 full-fledged physician instructors in the course “The Neonatal Resuscitation Course (NRP)” at Galilee Medical Center (Israel).

14. in 2023 – 1 full-fledged physician instructor for BLS/ACLS/PALS/PHTLS courses at Galilee Medical Center (Israel).

At NCCEM there is an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies - 83.33% of surveyed teachers responded, and 33.33% partially agreed with this. Studied in professional development programs - 100% from 1 to 5 years ago. NCCEM implements social support programs for teachers - 16.67% responded that “yes, such programs exist,” and 83.33% of respondents do not know about it.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Complies with 9 standards: fully – 9.

Recommendations for improvement:

1) To review the job descriptions of ETC employees in accordance with clause 20 of the Order of the Vice Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 105 dated February 25, 2021 “On approval of the Rules for training in emergency medical care in accordance with international standards.”

2) To conduct constant monitoring of the regularity of training by ETC teachers in their specialty and pedagogical competencies in accordance with established requirements.

3) Consider the possibility of expanding the staff of the ETC with the involvement of teachers from medical universities and employees of research centers.

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

6.1 Material and technical base

The infrastructure of NCCEM corresponds to the specifics of the activities and implementation of educational programs of additional and non-formal education, using innovative information technologies, includes 2 classrooms equipped with modern simulation equipment (Table 3) and one lecture room (conference hall), equipped in accordance with modern requirements for the organization of the educational process. To effectively assimilate knowledge and acquire the necessary practical skills, students practice action algorithms using simulation equipment located in classrooms 305, 308 and the conference room. Classrooms are equipped with equipment for anesthesia, resuscitation and intensive care.

Table 3 - List of simulation equipment

№	Name of simulation equipment	Quantity, units
1	Mannequin simulator VOLODYA for teaching CPR skills with the ability to record results and printouts Modification No. 5	1
2	Childbirth simulator “Simply childbirth”	1
3	Training manikin	1
4	Children's training manikin	1
5	Manikin for BLS in set No. 2	1
6	Defibrillator for the treatment of cardiac arrhythmias, set of up to 10 items	1
7	Manikin-simulator with simulating inhalation with chest excursion (manikin with electronics/CPR)	3
8	Multifunctional full-height training mannequin for children	1
9	Defibrillator	4
10	Cardiopulmonary Patient Simulator	2
11	Interactive baby patient simulator	2
12	Interactive adult simulator	2

13	Baby incubation simulator	2
14	Lamp laryngoscope LI8 with straight blades	4
15	Manikin simulator for basic cardiopulmonary resuscitation	2
16	Simulator trainer. Leg model with external bleeding	14
17	Model of a five-year-old child's hand for practicing various injection skills, complete with replaceable	2
18	Fully Functional Internal Injection Arm Model (Adult)	1
19	Advanced phantom system for practical surgical skills	1
20	Expanded obstetric birth phantom complete with obstetric bed	2
21	Simulator for puncture and surgical microtracheostomy	2
22	Instrumental childbirth simulator	1
23	Simulator trainer. Mannequin trainer for basic cardiopulmonary resuscitation.	14
24	Simulator trainer. Mannequin for resuscitation and patient care M/F with intubation capability	8
25	Simulator trainer. Intravenous Injection Trainer	6
26	Adult intubation simulator	2
27	Advanced Patient Care Manikin	2
28	Training model for tracheal intubation of a newborn	2
29	Phantom for central venous catheterization	2
30	Phantom for pericardiocentesis and pleural drainage	2
31	Phantom for spinal puncture	2
32	Electric model for tracheal intubation, complete with replaceable pads	2
33	Multifunctional computer interactive childbirth simulation mannequin	2

To demonstrate lecture material, room 305 is equipped with a Benq projector, projection screen, HP monoblock (Processor 3.00 Hz, 2 cores; RAM 4 GB; Hard drive 500 - 1000 GB; screen diagonal 20"; Windows OS) and Internet access (Kazakhtelecom , 100 Mb/s).

6.2 Training bases

A review of the resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, experts visited training rooms equipped with modern simulation equipment, and ETC staff ensures collegial and ethical relations with students to achieve the final results of student training.

In addition, at the request of organizations, training is carried out directly at clinical sites, mainly using NCCEM mannequins (see paragraph 4.1). The degree of satisfaction of employers with the quality of training and their relevance in the labor market is evidenced by positive reviews and letters of gratitude from medical organizations and students.

For the continuous development of practical skills by ambulance station employees, custody agreements for simulation equipment were concluded with ambulance stations of some regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan NCCEM. Thanks to this, emergency medical service staff could practice algorithms for providing emergency assistance in their free time in accordance with international standards.

Before starting the training, the student receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he should improve and develop during the training. The list of practical skills and learning outcomes are indicated in each educational program.

During a visit to clinical sites, where experts examined the resources, their compliance with training programs, accessibility for teachers and students, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical healthcare. The experts received evidence of compliance with standard 6, as well as validation of the self-assessment report information.

In order to validate the implementation of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence about the quality of the programs, interviews were conducted with trainees. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, sufficient time to develop practical skills, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for students in need, and availability of resources from international databases of professional literature.

In general, students are satisfied with the training, evaluation methods, and purposefully chose NCCEM for training, because they believe that the educational organization has good resources, highly professional teachers with practical experience and a high professional reputation.

6.3 Information technology

NCCEM has an official website <https://emcrk.kz>, which informs the population about resources, news and events, and students also, have access to regulatory documents regarding the educational process of NCCEM.

In addition, NCCEM has a structural unit, the department of strategic development and marketing, where the public relations manager ensures that listeners are informed through the official website and NCCEM Internet resources about ongoing educational events. (<https://www.facebook.com/emcrk.kz>, https://www.instagram.com/emergency_care_kz/)

Students, teachers and staff have access to electronic databases of leading professional associations: <https://www.guidelinecentral.com/guidelines/AHA/>, <https://cprguidelines.eu/>, [https://www.facs.org/quality-programs/trauma/education/partnerships-in-education/#:~:text=Prehospital%20Trauma%20Life%20Support%20\(PHTLS\),oversight%20for%20the%20PHTLS%20program.](https://www.facs.org/quality-programs/trauma/education/partnerships-in-education/#:~:text=Prehospital%20Trauma%20Life%20Support%20(PHTLS),oversight%20for%20the%20PHTLS%20program.)

At the same time, access to international electronic databases such as Scopus, Cochrane Library, Medline, Elsevir has not been demonstrated etc., allowing access to studies, publications, systematic reviews in various areas of medical science and practice.

6.4 Interaction with colleagues

NCCEM instructors use the practice of multidisciplinary teams in their classes. They provide an opportunity for students to participate in the process (for example, when analyzing situational problems and mega-codes). The multidisciplinary team includes medical workers such as doctors, paramedics, nurses, dispatchers, and resuscitators. The instructor creates groups that examine the patient in a differentiated manner: doctors and nurses in emergency departments apply their methods and describe their vision of the task, doctors and paramedics from emergency medical services carry out their own diagnostics and manipulations. In team assessments, all specialists demonstrate their professional, ethical, communication and analytical abilities. At the same time, the instructor coordinates the actions of the students to work together to create the final result.

6.5 Formal and non-formal types of learning

NCCEM has a practice of involving specialists from emergency medical care in holding professional events of any format (online, offline meetings of emergency medical care managers and regional coordinating doctors on the basis of NCCEM, annual competitions between emergency medical care services).

Every year, NCCEM, together with the ALE “Association of Emergency Medical Care of the Republic of Kazakhstan,” organizes Republican Spartakiads of emergency medical service teams from all regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Doctors-instructors of the training center are developing clinical stations for conducting sports competitions (such as: acute coronary syndrome, home birth, drowning of a child, polytrauma) for emergency conditions in adults and children.

This event is held annually (except during the pandemic): in 2019 in the city of Astana, in 2022 in Shymkent, in 2023 in the city of Semey, in 2024 a trip to the North Kazakhstan region (Petropavlovsk) is planned.

The holding of sports competitions expands interregional cooperation among emergency medical careworkers, and examples of successful experience in the field of emergency medical care are exchanged.

Holding Spartakiads help EMC teams not only improve their skills, but demonstrate the importance of teamwork and coordinated work of EMC medical workers, and also contribute to improving professional competence and growing the image of an EMC specialist.

6.6 Research and scientific achievements

NCCEM organizes and participates in national and international scientific events to improve the quality of continuous professional development.

On September 2, 2021, the International Scientific and Practical Conference “Modern Concepts and Prospects for the Development of Medical Aviation” was organized and held dedicated to the 30th anniversary of the Independence of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the 10th anniversary of the medical aviation service of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In which speakers from Kazakhstan, as well as near and far abroad, took part. As a result of the conference, a Special Issue of the peer-reviewed interdisciplinary scientific and practical journal “Science and Healthcare” was published.

Every year NCCEM employees participate in national and international scientific events:

From 2016 to 2022, the “Congress of the Federation of Anesthesiologists and Resuscitators” (FAR) in the cities of Moscow, St. Petersburg, Arkhangelsk (RF), Musin E.Sh., Zhumadilov A.Sh. acted as speakers and gave reports.

Participation in international congresses Euroanaesthesia (European Anesthesiological Congress) 2016 - Euroanaesthesia 2016 (London), Euroanaesthesia 2018 - Euroanaesthesia 2018 (Copenhagen, Denmark), Euroanaesthesia 2022 in (Milan, Italy). Musin E.Sh., Zhumadilov A.Sh.

Annual participation since 2017 in International Congresses of Anesthesiologists and Reanimatologists held in Kazakhstan (Almaty, Astana, Aktau).

Kazakh-Israeli symposium on anesthesiology and resuscitation (2022)

On August 22, 2023, the “II International Caspian Forum of Anesthesiologists” was held, organized by the NGO “Kazakh Society of Anesthesiologists and Resuscitators” (NGO “KSAR”). The forum was attended by leading scientists and practical healthcare specialists from Kazakhstan, foreign countries and NCCEM staff.

On February 23, 2023, Adilbekov E.B. spoke as a speaker at the symposium “Stroke and Rehabilitation Issues” within the framework of the Central Asian Neurological Forum “Topical Issues of Clinical Neurology”.

On March 3, in the training for teachers of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the “Fast Heroes” project, organized jointly with the RSE on REM “National Center for Public Health” of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the WHO regional office in Kazakhstan, Medukhanova S.G. acted as a speaker.

On March 4, NCCEM staff made a presentation “CLOCCs in a patient in the postpartum period” at the online conference “Evidence-Based Neurology” with international participation.

On March 14, 2023, in the Central City Ambulance of the city of Astana, Deputy Chairman of the Board of the NCCEM for Medical Affairs E. B. Adilbekov spoke as a speaker on the topic “Prehospital care for patients with stroke.”

March 31-April 1, 2023 Adilbekov E.B. acted as a speaker at the IV Kazakh-Israeli symposium.

April 7, 2023 NCCEM staff took part in an online seminar on the topic: “Patient with CCI: therapy with proven effectiveness.”

On April 27-28 in Shymkent, NCCEM employees took part in the International Scientific and Practical Conference “Stroke: an Interdisciplinary Problem”, dedicated to the opening of the first stroke center in the Southern region of Kazakhstan. Employees also made presentations on the topic “Cognitive impairment in patients with strokes” and “Organization of the stroke service of the Republic of Kazakhstan. “Stenotic carotid atherosclerosis. Review of recommendations from clinical guidelines for rehabilitation after stroke.”

May 23 Medukhanova S.G. made a presentation to the European Stroke Organization (ESO-EAST) on “Stroke Service in Kazakhstan”.

May 26 Medukhanova S.G. gave a presentation on the work done in the stroke service together with the Angels Initiative at the annual meeting of Angels Initiative members as part of the European Stroke Organization conference

NCCEM employees, including the head of the educational and training center, are involved on an ongoing basis in providing advice to critical patients in intensive care units of hospitals, critical patients with obstetric pathology. The head of the training center also participates in the commission to reduce maternal mortality in the regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan from the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

May 26, 2022, head of the training center Agybaev G.R. took part as a speaker with a report on the topic “Activities of the medical aviation service in the Republic of Kazakhstan”, in the section “Remote medicine Modern trends and prospects” within the framework of the International Conference on Occupational Health and Industrial Safety "KIOSH-2022".

June 11-12, 2022, head of the training center Agybaev G.R. took part as a speaker on first aid aimed at maintaining life during circulatory (and/or respiratory) arrest in the program of the International scientific and practical conference “Kazakh dentistry today: problems and solutions.”

In order to improve their qualifications, NCCEM sends its instructors to organizations and educational institutions in Israel (G.R. Agybaev, B.V. SartaeV), Germany (B.K. Taibekov), Turkey (B.K. Taibekov) for training, internship, exchange of experience and development of the latest techniques and for further transfer to the regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan, for the period from 2017. – 8 months of 2023, 24,892 students were trained from the regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

NCCEM fruitfully cooperates with Semey University. A doctor-instructor from the Training Center, together with teachers from Semey University, completed professional training in the “Emergency Medicine Triage System” at Baskent University (Ankara, Turkey). (Appendix 19)

On June 21-22, 2022, a training center instructor participated in the Workshop on Management and Coordination of Mass Casualty Incidents (Triage), organized by the World Health Organization.

Agreements on joint activities with only two organizations were presented: “BB Nura” LLP, Semey Medical University.

6.7 Training in alternative educational organizations

As part of Program 005 “Advanced training and retraining of personnel in government health care organizations,” from November 25 to November 29, 2019, with the involvement of trainers from the National Association of Emergency Medical Technicians (NAEMT), 9 instructors were trained in the course Pre-hospital care for trauma – PhTLS.

As part of the Social Health Insurance Project, from November 30 to December 8, 2019, with the involvement of trainers from the American Heart Association (AHA), 24 instructors were trained in the course Basic Life Support - BLS and 17 instructors in the course Advanced Cardiac Life Support - ACLS.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Comply with standard 15: completely -14, partially -1, do not correspond - 0

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To expand the access of teachers and students to international electronic scientific and educational resources.
- 2) To develop joint cooperation with medical universities, research centers, incl. foreign, through the conclusion of Cooperation Agreements.

Standard 7: EVALUATION OF ADDITIONAL AND NON-FORMAL EDUCATION PROGRAMS

7.1 Mechanisms for monitoring and evaluating educational programs

Each of the presented programs has a review that reflects the structure of the program, the final learning outcomes, the teaching and evaluation methods used, and compliance with modern scientific

data and the achievements of practical healthcare. However, the programs were reviewed by a public health specialist with an academic degree. Experts noted that it is desirable that the examination of programs should also be carried out by specialists in the field of emergency medical services.

To evaluate the quality of student training, the tracer methodology has been introduced. Thus, the auditor collects information about the consistency, timeliness and quality of the processes performed. The quality of trainee training is also evidenced by such indicators as the prehospital mortality rate and the rate of successful resuscitation (Table 4).

However, the prehospital mortality rate for 2022 is 0.42%, which is 0.05% lower than in 2021, and the rate of successful resuscitation has increased and reached 40.8% in 2022 (in 2021 - 38.4%). At the same time, in some regions, indicators decreased in 2022.

Table 4. Dynamics of successful resuscitation by region of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the period 2016-2022.

№	Regions	Successful resuscitation (%)						
		2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022
1	Akmola	15,8	13,5	41,5	51,4	46,2	48,3	48,8
2	Aktobe	28,6	47,8	65,0	47,4	45,0	39,7	38,1
3	Almaty	80,5	91,4	42,3	52,0	46,5	25,7	26,6
4	Atyrau	30,7	53,8	50,0	48,3	48,1	48,2	46,3
5	Abai						36,9	51,4
6	EKO	12,0	20,3	17,6	20,0	16,8	28,5	65,6
7	Zhambyl	48,0	48,6	43,8	49,2	42,1	63,4	60,7
8	WKO	15,4	40,0	49,0	45,0	47,1	46,4	43,3
9	Karaganda	28,7	31,9	51,4	47,1	53,3	44,5	53,8
10	Kostanayskaya	30,3	26,2	24,5	17,8	25,9	20,5	11,2
11	Kyzylorda	23,5	26,8	40,5	44,0	56,8	44,8	56,3
12	Mangystau	30,0	100,0	9,0	30,0	47,9	93,8	80,0
13	Pavlodar	18,8	20,7	53,1	62,5	68,4	58,8	72,2
14	NKO	75,0	41,7	54,5	33,3	41,5	48,4	69,0
15	Turkestan	37,3	42,7	27,5	31,3	37,0	27,6	51,9
16	Shymkent	40,5	44,4	55,1	66,9	50,0	55,7	62,1
17	Almaty city	28,1	74,4	33,6	47,7	33,9	38,6	60,5
18	Astana	69,0	17,0	29,2	50,0	66,0	54,8	71,8
Republic of Kazakhstan		35,7	40,5	40,1	41,7	40,0	38,4	40,8

Table 4 shows that in 2016, the percentage of successful resuscitations in the country as a whole was lower than after the start of training EMS specialists in BLS, ACLS, PALS, and PHTLS standards. Thus, in 2016, the overall rate of successful resuscitation in the country was 35.7%, and in 2017 it was 40.5%. In subsequent years, this indicator was maintained at a high level, thanks to reforms in healthcare, as well as continuous cascade training of emergency medical personnel to international standards of care.

7.2 Feedback

Feedback from students to assess the quality of the organization of the educational process is carried out in the form of a survey after completion of training.

The purpose of analyzing student satisfaction is to use student feedback in making management decisions and improving educational activities. According to the results of the survey for 2022, the average maximum score is noted in the “Attitude in the Group” section - 3.97, “Training and Development” - 3.96 and the lowest score in the “Working Conditions” section - 3.94 (Table 5).

Table 5. Results of a survey of students who completed training at NCCEM in 2022.

№	Region name	Instructor/course	Number of questionnaires	Average score by section:		
				Working conditions	Education and development	Group attitude
1	Zhangalinskaya RB	Alieva A.S. -BLS	23	3,93	3,94	3,98
2	Kazalinskaya IMB	Taibekov B.K., Kolotilov E. – BLS, ACLS, PALS, PhTLS	51	3.96	3.96	3.99
3	Akmola	Agybaev G.R. – BLS, ACLS, PALS, PhTLS	10	3,98	4	4
4	Zhambyl	Alieva A.S., Kolotilov E. – BLS	193	3,88	3,91	3,91
5	Astana	Alieva A.S. -BLS	28	3,97	3,86	3,96
6	Mangystau	Agybaev G.R. – PALS	53	3,95	3,97	3,93
7	Mangystau	Taibekov B.K. - PhTLS	57	3,92	3,95	3,99
8	Abai city Semey	Alieva A.S. -PhTLS	14	3,92	3,94	3,93
9	Abai city Semey	Agybaev G.R., Alieva A.S. – BLS, ACLS, PALS, PhTLS	49	3,99	3,99	4
10	Abai city Semey	Taibekov B.K. - Dispatching service	35	3,83	3,94	3,97
11	Astana UZ	Alieva A.S. -BLS	245	3,96	3,96	3,98
12	Astana UZ	Agybaev G.R. – PALS	162	3,95	3,97	3,99
13	Astana UZ	Agybaev G.R., Taibekov B.K., Alieva A.S. -PhTLS	124	3,98	3,99	3,99
14	Astana UZ	Taibekov B.K. - ACLS	188	3.97	3.98	3.99
15	Mangystau	Alieva A.S., Kolotilov E. – BLS	236	3,97	3,98	3,99
16	Almaty city	Kolotilov E. – BLS, ACLS, PALS, PhTLS	122	3,95	3,95	3,98
Total			1590	3,94	3,96	3,97

To take into account the opinions of other interested parties (potential consumers of services), the press service specialist systematically publishes materials on the website and the media on the provision of emergency medical care, additional information is duplicated on the Instagram page

Links: https://www.instagram.com/p/Cw2CZawNCY5/?img_index=1;
https://www.instagram.com/p/CvypCYsqxDv/?img_index=1;
[https://www.instagram.com/p/CveA_aKKL0g/;](https://www.instagram.com/p/CveA_aKKL0g/) [https://www.instagram.com/p/CvG_FlcNFsy/;](https://www.instagram.com/p/CvG_FlcNFsy/)
[https://www.instagram.com/p/CuOHKzWqi1M/;](https://www.instagram.com/p/CuOHKzWqi1M/)
https://www.instagram.com/p/CsiiW0CSNew/?img_index=1;

Facebook

Links:

<https://www.facebook.com/emcrk.kz/posts/pfbid0FSXqRJevCa2B3hLETkrbhtpEWSyvFSVcZzFx2WRioG8KufWnnz1df2EPHRpoqcdPI;>
<https://www.facebook.com/emcrk.kz/posts/pfbid02wga1FVx5sxwfDx4b3Yy1KyaYkhJycpVXTdAeCJDvVHYtweYVZcZVEbmexsvXSyBDI;>
<https://www.facebook.com/emcrk.kz/posts/pfbid0QwPnP8v8mXSNVgkdZ26yAMYy3zua64NEhJCpDPaXYaYnrk8KcFNTvLaAgtiGrSRUI;>

There is a blog of the Chairman of the Board.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant out of 10 standards: fully – 10.

Recommendations for improvement:

1) To conduct an examination of educational programs along with public health specialists and specialized specialists in the field of emergency medical care who have an academic degree.

Standard 8: ORGANIZATION

8.1 Documentation and needs for planning additional and non-formal education

NCCEM is a legal entity in the organizational and legal form of a state enterprise with the right of economic management. The founder of NCCEM is the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The rights of the subject of state republican property in relation to the property of NCCEM are exercised by the Committee of State Property and Privatization of the Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The body that manages the NCCEM is the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The management of the current activities of NCCEM is carried out by the collegial executive body - the Board. The Board is headed by the Chairman of the Board. The Management Board is accountable to the Supervisory Board.

To monitor the effectiveness of the financial and economic activities of NCCEM, by decision of the authorized body of the relevant industry, an internal audit service may be established.

The activities of NCCEM are financed in accordance with the Development Plan from its own income and budget funds received in the manner determined by the budget legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The authorized capital of NCCEM is 47,433,759 (forty-seven million four hundred thirty-three thousand seven hundred fifty-nine) tenge.

The authorized capital is fully formed by the owner (founder) at the time of state registration of NCCEM.

NCCEM has an approved organizational structure, in which there is a structural unit responsible for the organization of additional and non-formal education - the ETC. According to the organizational structure, the training center reports directly to the Managing Director. The subject of the training center's activities is the implementation of programs of additional and non-formal education.

The ETC staff consists of 7 units: 1 director, 3 medical instructors, 1 instructor, 1 chief specialist, 1 leading specialist. Doctors-instructors with medical education from mobile medical aviation teams of NCCEM, doctors with the highest and first qualification categories, with practical experience of more than 5-7 years are involved in the educational process.

In the Development Strategy of NCCEM for 2022-2026, the fourth strategic direction is “Development of scientific and educational activities and strengthening the human resources potential of NCCEM.”

8.2 Academic leadership and administration

The following structural divisions are involved in the implementation of educational services: educational and training center, strategic development and marketing department, legal support department, economic planning and analysis department, accounting and reporting department, public procurement department, and human resources department. Effective interaction between structural divisions ensures the work for the implementation of educational activities. Each division provides control over specific issues:

1. Educational and training center - responsible for the preparation and conduct of educational events, for the formation of educational and methodological documentation, personal files of students, timely preparation and issuance of documents on the completion of seminar trainings, monitoring the progress of the educational process, effective use of the material and technical base for conducting educational events.

2. Department of Strategic Development and Marketing - responsible for organizing and implementing the process of strategic and operational planning, informing organizations and the public about the provision of paid educational services on the Internet resources of NCCEM (official website, Instagram, Facebook), promotion of paid educational services (production of videos, information materials).

3. The Legal Support Department and the Public Procurement Department - for the timely conclusion of contracts on public procurement of equipment for training and part of the contractual relations with students.

4. Department of Economic Planning and Analysis, Department of Accounting and Reporting - for the effective planning of financial resources and their use for educational activities (simulation equipment, remuneration of employees participating in the educational process).

5. Human Resources Department - when conducting on-site training, sending employees, planning educational events for NCCEM employees.

To the survey question “Do the leaders of the organization listen to your opinion regarding issues related to the educational process, research work, clinical/practical work,” 66.67% of teachers answered that systematically, 33.33% answered “sometimes.”

8.3 Allocation of budget and resources for training

The main document for implementing the standard of operating procedures “Rules for the development and revision of the budget” is the Development Plan of NCCEM, developed and approved in accordance with the order of the Minister of National Economy of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 14, 2019 No. 14 “On approval of the Rules for the development and approval of state-controlled development plans joint-stock companies and limited liability partnerships, state-owned enterprises, as well as monitoring and evaluation of their implementation.”

Planning of financial resources necessary for the activities of NCCEM is carried out according to the following standards:

1. Standard “Organizational and economic activities”.

2. Standard “Conclusion of agreements on the main type of activity and current activities of NCCEM”.

3. Standard “Procedure for the provision of paid educational services”.

4. Standard “Remuneration of employees of the organization.”

5. Standard “Business trips and official travel outside the country.”

Providing quality educational services and strengthening the material and technical base requires planned work and financial support.

The source of funding is both budget financing of the state order and income from the provision of paid educational services that do not contradict the law.

Funds received from the provision of paid services are distributed as follows:

A wage fund is formed in the amount of no more than 50% of total income. This Fund provides incentive remuneration for NCCEM employees who participated in the provision of paid services, as

well as for the establishment of additional payments and rewards for employees not directly involved in the provision of paid services.

Employees who took part in the provision of paid services are remunerated for the paid services actually rendered. The wage fund for employees who took part in the provision of paid services is determined depending on the amount of income for the corresponding period according to information from the structural unit responsible for accounting and reporting.

The amounts of remuneration for each employee are presented by structural divisions independently and are documented in the minutes of the meeting of the structural division.

Payment of remuneration for paid services provided is determined depending on the volume of paid services for the period and is made monthly to employees directly involved in the provision of paid services, according to the minutes of the meeting of the structural unit, agreed with the Managing Director, approved by the first manager in the amount of 10% of the total income from paid services.

The amounts of remuneration by structural divisions are distributed in the following order:

1) Remuneration to specialists of structural units (including trainers and the head of the Education and Training Center) for direct participation in the provision of paid services and the degree of labor participation of each employee individually - no more than 90% of the amount intended for payment of remunerations;

2) Other employees of structural units for creating organizational and technical conditions for generating income - at least 10% of the amount intended for payment of remuneration.

The percentages vary depending on the number of employees in the structural units and are advisory in nature.

The first manager has the right to revise the amount of remuneration due to paid services depending on changes in income and the volume of work for paid services, and also, in order to stimulate and increase wages, establish individual remunerations for NCCEM employees.

When calculating the average salary of an employee, these remunerations are taken into account as one-time incentive payments.

8.4 Management of educational programs

An Educational and Methodological Council (EMC) has been created and is functioning at NCCEM.

The main goal of the Educational and Methodological Council of NCCEM is to develop and conduct activities aimed at improving the quality of educational services provided, and to develop proposals on issues of educational and methodological support for the educational process in NCCEM. In its activities, the Educational and Methodological Council is guided by the Charter of NCCEM, external regulations governing educational activities, administrative documents of the Chairman of the Board of NCCEM, and the Regulations on EMS.

The experts examined the following documents relating to the activities of the EMC: Regulations on the EMC, the Work Plan of the EMC, and the minutes of the EMC meeting.

According to the Regulations on the EMC, the work of the EMC is carried out in accordance with the annual work plan, discussed at the first meeting of the EMC in the new academic year. A meeting of the EMC is held at least once every two months (2nd week of the month established by the EMC Work Plan). The organization does not have an annual work plan for the current year.

At the time of accreditation, the minutes of three meetings of the EMC were provided, i.e. The frequency of the EMC is not observed.

Experts, based on the documents studied, were convinced that the NCCEM operates an EMC. However, in the presented organizational structure of NCCEM there is no Educational and Methodological Council as a separate structure.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Complies with 10 standards: fully - 9, partially -1.

Recommendations for improvement:

1) To revise the organizational structure of NCCEM with the inclusion of an educational and methodological council as an advisory body managing the organization of additional and non-formal education.

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT

The expansion of the material and technical base of NCCEM is provided within the framework of the implementation of the national project “Quality and affordable healthcare for every citizen “Healthy Nation” (Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 12, 2021 No. 725) for the construction of multidisciplinary hospitals in the cities of the republic on the basis of a memorandum concluded between JSC “National Welfare Fund “Samruk-Kazyna” and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 17, 2020. The construction of the multidisciplinary hospital NCCEM in Astana is being completed. This Project, with a bed capacity of 200 beds and a day hospital for 50 visits per shift, will be equipped with a modern clinical base, including 8 clinical centers in 20 specialties, which will create its own clinical base for training students.

In order to improve the organization of the educational process, on the basis of the multidisciplinary hospital NCCEM, it is planned to create the Department of Science and Education (hereinafter referred to as the Department of Education), the main task of which will be to ensure the development of scientific, innovative and educational activities in the field of healthcare, the use of advanced research achievements in the process of training medical frames.

Every year, educational program developers (instructors) evaluate planned activities; update the topics of lectures, seminars and practical classes in accordance with the needs of practical healthcare and modern achievements in the field of emergency care.

Applications for the purchase of material and technical means to provide the practical part of the training were studied. In particular, an application for the purchase of technical means for the high-quality implementation of distance learning (for such programs as “Dispatching service in emergency medical care; Call holding system”, master class “Emergencies in obstetrics at the prehospital stage”)

At the same time, the experts were not shown a document regulating the mechanisms for detecting and eliminating documented deficiencies in educational and scientific activities.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Complies with 5 standards: fully - 4, partially -1.

Recommendations for improvement:

1) To conduct regular monitoring of educational activities through an internal quality assurance system.

Thus, when conducting an external institutional evaluation, out of 92 accreditation standards, compliance with 87 accreditation standards was established, including 62 basic standards and 25 improvement standards. 5 improvement standards are partially met. No non-compliance with standards has been identified.

5. Recommendations for improving the institutional activities of the RSE on REM “National Coordination Center for Emergency Medicine” of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan

- 1) While updating the mission of the RSE on REM “National Coordination Center for Emergency Medicine” of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, it should reflect the educational activities of the organization (standard 1.1.)
- 2) To develop a system for assessing students’ knowledge before starting training and documenting the assessment results (standard 2.3.4)






- 3) To review the job descriptions of ETC employees in accordance with clause 20 of the Order of the Vice Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 105 dated February 25, 2021 “On approval of the Rules for training in emergency medical care skills in accordance with international standards” (standard 5.1)
- 4) To conduct constant monitoring of the regularity of training by ETC teachers in their specialty and pedagogical competencies in accordance with established requirements (standard 5.2).
- 5) TO consider the possibility of expanding the staff of the ETC with the involvement of teachers from medical universities and employees of research centers (standard 5.1).
- 6) To expand the access of teachers and students to international electronic scientific and educational resources (standard 6.3.1).
- 7) To develop joint cooperation with medical universities, research centers, incl. foreign, through the conclusion of Cooperation Agreements (standard 6.6).
- 8) To conduct an examination of educational programs along with public health specialists with specialized specialists in the field of emergency medical care who have an academic degree (standard 7.1).
- 9) To revise the organizational structure of NCCEM with the inclusion of an educational and methodological council as an advisory body managing the organization of additional and non-formal education (standard 8.4).
- 10) To conduct regular monitoring of educational activities through the internal quality assurance system (standard 9.2).

6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

Members of the EEC established the compliance of the educational activities of the RSE on REM "National Coordination Center for Emergency Medicine" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan with accreditation standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend that the ECAQA Accreditation Council accredit this organization for a period of 5 years.

6. Рекомендация Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА

Члены ВЭК установили соответствие Стандартам институциональной аккредитации медицинских организаций дополнительного и неформального образования и пришли к единогласному мнению рекомендовать Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА аккредитовать РГП на ПХВ «Национальный координационный центр экстренной медицины» на период 5 лет

Председатель Внешней экспертной комиссии	СЛАВКО ЕЛЕНА АЛЕКСЕЕВНА	
Зарубежный эксперт	ЗАРИПОВА ЗУЛЬФИЯ АБДУЛЛОВНА	
Национальный академический эксперт	СИСЕНОВА ЖАДЫРА АЛДЕБАЕВНА	
Эксперт – представитель работодателей	ЖУКУБАЕВА АЛЬМИРА АСЕТКЫЗЫ	
Эксперт – представитель слушателей	ШЫНТАС ҚАСЫМ МӘЛІКҰЛЫ	

**Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of an educational program
(summarization)**

Standard	Criteria for evaluation	Number of standards	Basic standards/ Improvement Standards	Score		
				Totally coincides	Partially compliant	Not compliant
1.	MISSION AND END RESULTS	9	7/2	8	1	
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS	13	9/4	12	1	
3.	EVALUATION OF STUDENTS' COMPETENCIES AND DOCUMENTATION	10	7/3	10		
4.	HEALTH PROFESSIONALS (INDIVIDUALIZED PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT)	11	8/3	11		
5.	ACADEMIC TEACHING STAFF	9	4/5	9		
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	15	10/5	14	1	
7.	EVALUATION OF ADDITIONAL AND NON-FORMAL EDUCATION PROGRAMS	10	5/5	10		
8.	ORGANIZATION	10	7/3	9	1	
9.	CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT	5	5/0	4	1	
	Total:	92	62/30	87	5	
				92		

List of documents studied by members of the EEC as part of an external evaluation of the RSE on REM NCCEM MOH for compliance with institutional accreditation standards

№	Names of documents	Quantity	Date of approval
1.	Charter of the organization	1	04/11/2019; Making changes – 09/30/2021
2.	Development strategy for 2022 – 2026	1	01.12.2022
3.	Operational plan	1	02/03/2023
4.	Regulation of the educational and training center	1	06/07/2023
5.	Job description of the manager	1	06/07/2023
6.	Job description of a doctor-instructor	1	06/07/2023
7.	Job description of an Instructor	1	06/07/2023
8.	Job description of the chief specialist	1	06/07/2023
9.	Job description of Leading Specialist	1	06/07/2023
10.	Agreement on joint activities (“BB Nura” LLP, Semey Medical University)	2	2023 2021
11.	Reviews	4	2022
12.	Working curriculum (training seminars)	13	2022-2023
13.	Working curriculum (PC) “Paramedic (basic level)”	1	06/16/2023
14.	Trainer certificates		2021 – 2023
15.	Specialist certificate (admission to specialty)	4	2022 - 2023
16.	Regulations on the remuneration of employees of the RSE on REM "National Coordination Center for Emergency Medicine" of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan	1	2022, changes 2023
17.	Safety instructions	1	09/29/2021
18.	Training log	2	2022-2023
19.	Directory guide	1	2023
20.	Regulations on the stages of training at the ETC	1	01/20/2022
21.	The procedure for organizing training at the ETC	1	07/12/2022
22.	Rules for conducting an appeal based on the results of the end-of-course examination of the training seminar	1	07/08/2020
23.	Regulations on the educational and methodological council	1	04/28/2022
24.	Minutes of the educational and methodological council		2020-2023
25.	Listener survey		2023
26.	Work plan of the educational and training center	4	2020 – 2023