

## REPORT

on the results of the work of the external expert Commission assessment of compliance with the requirements of the standard.

educational program accreditation specialty 8D10102 – «MEDICINE»

NJSC "Astana Medical University" in the period from 28 to 30 May 2020

## INDEPENDENT ACCREDITATION AND RATING AGENCY

External expert commission

Addressed to the Accreditation the IAAR Council



### **REPORT**

on the results of the work of the external expert Commission assessment of compliance with the requirements of the standard.

educational program accreditation specialty 8D10102 – «MEDICINE»

NJSC "Astana Medical University" in the period from 28 to 30 May 2020

## Content

(I) A LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS	3
(II) INTRODUCTION	
(III) REPRESENTATION OF THE ORGANIZATION OF EDUCATION	5
(IV) A DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDU	JRE6
(V) A DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDUI	RE6
(VI) THE STANDARDS OF ACCREDITATION OF EDUCATIONAL	
PROGRAM	7
STANDARD 1. "MISSION AND OUTCOMES"	7
STANDARD 2. "THE RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT AND	
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES"	9
STANDARD 3. "POLICIES AND CRITERIA OF ADMISSION"	11
STANDARD 4. "THE PH. D. PROGRAM"	
STANDARD 5. "SCIENTIFIC MANAGEMENT"	15
STANDARD 6. "THESIS"	
STANDARD 7: EVALUATION OF DISSERTATION WORK	
STANDARD 8: MANAGEMENT AND ADMINISTRATION	18
VII REVIEW STRENGTHS/ GOOD PRACTICES FOR EACH	
STANDARD	19
VIII OVERVIEW RECOMMENDATIONS FOR QUALITY IMPROVEMEN	IT FOR EACH
STANDARD	
H. RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION COUNCIL	21
Appendix 1. Evaluation table "parameters of specialized EQUIPMENT	
	22
Appendix 2. THE PROGRAM OF THE VISIT TO THE ORGANIZATION	
EDUCATION	36
Appendix 3. THE RESULTS OF THE SURVEY	
TEACHERS	36
Annex 4. THE RESULTS OF THE SURVEY OF STUDENTS	
	36

## (I) LIST OF DESIGNATIONS AND ABBREVIATIONS

VEC-external expert Commission

MOH - Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan

IAAR - independent Agency for accreditation and rating

NAO MUA-non-profit joint-stock company " Astana Medical University»

OP-educational programs

SD-nursing

SRS-independent work of a student

SRSP - independent work of students under the guidance of a teacher

TUP-standard curriculum

Umkd-educational and methodical complex of the discipline



#### (II) INTRODUCTION

In accordance with the order No. 42-20-OD dated 04/27/2020 of the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (IAAR), from 28 to 30 May 2020, an external expert commission in the NAO MUA was carried out within the framework of primary specialized accreditation to assess the compliance of the educational program 8D10102 – «Medicine»

The report of the external expert commission (EEC) contains an assessment of the submitted educational programs against the IAAR criteria, recommendations of the EEC for further improvement of educational programs and parameters of the profile of educational programs.

#### **EEC** composition

- 1. **The Chairman of the commission** Turdalieva Botagoz Saitovna, MD, Professor, AO "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" (Almaty)
- 2. **Foreign expert** Marina Alekseevna Kanushina, director of "AC Institute of international Education", PhD, MBA. (Prague, Czech Republic)
- 3. **Expert** Aimbetova Gulshara Ergazyevna, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Kazakh National Medical University. S. D. Asfendiyarova (Almaty)
- 4. **Expert** Naylya Igorevna Sheveleva, MD, DSc, Professor, Karaganda Medical University (Karaganda)
- 5. **Expert** Andasova Zhanar Myrzagalievna, Ph.D., Associate Professor, JSC "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" (Almaty)
- 6. **Expert** Omarkulov Bauyrzhan Kadenovich, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" (Karaganda)
- 7. **Expert** Elena Leonidovna Stepkina, Ph.D., Kazakhstan Medical University "VSHO" (Almaty)
- 8. **Expert** Sadykova Sholpan Sauatbekovna, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, NUO "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" (Almaty)
- 9. **Expert** Torlanova Botagoz Ongarovna, Ph.D., South Kazakhstan Medical Academy JSC (Shymkent)
- 10. **Expert** Ivanchenko Nellya Nikolaevna, Ph.D., Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov (Almaty)
- 11. **Employer** Saule Sotsialovna Smakova, Medical College under LLP "Republican Medical Academy" (Nur-Sultan)
- 12. **Student** Ilyasova Bayansulu Begim- Muratkyzy, Eurasian National University named after L.N. Gumilyov (Nur-Sultan)
- 13. **Observer from the Agency** Aimurzieva Aigerim Urinbaevna, head of medical projects of the Agency (Nur-Sultan)

## (III) REPRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATION ORGANIZATION

The Council of Ministers of the Republic adopted a resolution on the opening of the Medical Institute in Tselinograd on October 26, 1964. In 1997, the institute was reorganized into an academy, and in January 2009 it achieved the status of a University. Based on the decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the University became part of the National Medical Holding. Since July 2010, it has been transferred to the jurisdiction of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Currently, the university has a state license of the Committee for Control in Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 31, 2009, No. KZ93LAA00014823, for an unlimited period, for the right to carry out educational activities under the programs of higher and postgraduate professional education, according to which it has the right to issue documents on education of the state standard.

The University has a multilevel education system.

5647 students, 1460 interns, 580 residents, 88 undergraduates and 63 doctoral students study at the faculties of the University, including 639 foreign students.

The university operates a system of international distance learning (MOODLE), which uses the latest advances in this area in its work.

Since 2012, distance learning has been introduced at the level of additional professional education.

According to the organizational structure of NJSC "MUA", the main structural divisions of the University are institutes, deans, departments, departments, departments, centers, which include a staff in the following categories: teaching staff, administrative and managerial personnel, training and support personnel, service personnel.

NJSC "MUA" was the first among the medical universities of Kazakhstan to begin multilevel training of medical and scientific-pedagogical personnel (system of continuous higher education) in the following areas: bachelor's degree - internship - residency; Bachelor's - Master's - PhD doctoral studies.

As part of the state assignment under program 031 "Implementation of international standards in hospital management", NJSC "MUA" also showed leadership and was the first to launch an educational program for the preparation of "Masters of Business Administration" (MBA) in the field of hospital management.

In June 2013, the University successfully passed the 3rd recertification audit of the management system in accordance with the international standard ISO 9001: 2008 and received the Certificate of the AFNOR body (France).

In 2013, the University's activities were highly appreciated by the European Foundation for Quality Management - a 5-star certificate of the Model of Excellence.

In 2013, the University successfully passed the national institutional accreditation (IQAA), in 2013 and 2014 specialized accreditation of bachelor's educational programs in the specialties "Dentistry", "Pharmacy",

"Medical and Preventive Business"; magistracy in the specialties "Medicine", "Preventive medicine" (NKAOKO); in 2013, international accreditation of MBA educational programs in Public Health and Bachelor in Public Health (Institute for Accreditation, Certification and Quality Assurance, ACQUIN, Germany). In 2014, based on the results of a comprehensive assessment of its activities, the University was recognized as having passed the state certification for compliance with the requirements of the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, qualification requirements for licensing educational activities and the requirements of regulatory legal acts in the field of education, and certified for a period of five years (MES RK and MH RK, April 2014). In 2015, the University has successfully passed specialized accreditation of educational programs for undergraduate specialties

General Medicine, Nursing, Master's degree in Public Health, doctoral degrees in Medicine, Public Health, and 21 residency specialties.

In 2017, the educational programs of the bachelor's degree "General Medicine", "Dentistry", the Master's degree "Nursing", residency

"Pulmonology, including children's", in 2019 the University passed institutional accreditation, as well as specialized accreditation of a number of educational programs.

Since 2017, the University has been the developer of the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the specialty "Nursing".

The main corporate values and principles of NJSC "MUA" are:

1.**respect for the person** - is respect for the rights of individuals to freedom of expression, respect for the opinions of others, tolerance of any differences between the members of the group, openness and goodwill in dialogue and joint problem solving;

2 **professionalism** - a responsible and conscientious attitude towards fulfilling one's duties, deep knowledge of one's specialty, high-quality and timely fulfillment of assigned tasks, systematic renewal of one's competence;

3.continuous improvement - the development and improvement of the abilities of teaching staff, staff and students; NJSC "Astana Medical University" - cooperation - interaction with domestic and foreign universities;

4.efficiency - the use of available human, intellectual, material, informational and financial resources to achieve maximum results;

5.innovativeness - the introduction of modern teaching technologies, scientific research achievements in the educational process;

6.continuity - loyalty to their traditions, respect for their history, concern for the implementation of the best experience and enrichment of it with new ideas;

7.caring for veterans - due respect for the older generation, memory of their merits, preservation and enhancement of traditions, honor and encouragement of veterans;

8.caring for a person - promoting the welfare and social protection of the teaching staff, students, employees, the implementation of social programs, providing conditions for the implementation of mutual obligations of the teaching staff, students, employees on the one hand and the university on the other, which are provided for by the Collective and labor agreements;

9.**labor motivation** - an effective system of moral encouragement and material remuneration of teaching staff, students, employees.

# General information about the structural unit that implements the accredited educational program

The dean's office of "Nursing", coordinating and implementing educational programs of the bachelor's degree "Ergotherapy", is headed by PhD Saltabaeva Ulbolsyn Sheralievna ( <a href="http://www.MUA.kz//resident\_graduate\_doctoral/">http://www.MUA.kz//resident\_graduate\_doctoral/</a>).

Characteristics of the surveyed educational programs:

Implementation level: bachelor's degree

Academic Degree: Bachelor of Health in Educational Programs

"Ergotherapy"

Term of development: 4

years Form of

development: full-time

Qualifications of graduates: occupational therapist

## (IV) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE

(only if re-accreditation is carried out)

#### (V) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE

The work of the EEC was carried out on the basis of the visit program of the expert commission on specialized accreditation of the educational program of doctoral studies in the specialty 8D10102 - "MEDICINE" of the NJSC "Astana Medical University" in the period from 28 to 30 May 2020.

As part of the EEC visit program, meetings were held with the rector of the university, provost and vice-rectors, heads of structural divisions, deans of faculties, developers of accredited EP, heads of departments, teachers, students, alumni, employers. A total of 58 representatives took part in the meetings (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information about employees and students who took part in the meetings with the EEC of the IAAR

Participant category	amount
Rector	1
Provost and Vice-Rector	6
Heads of accredited EP	6
Heads of structural divisions	18
Heads of departments	5

Teachers	5
Employers	5
Doctoral students	8
Graduates	4
Total	58

At the meeting of the IAAR EEC with the leaders of the IUA, there was a discussion of the priority strategic directions of the university development, changes in the framework of the managerial and financial freedom of the university, the mechanisms for implementing the university policy and motivating the teaching staff through certain indicators.

The commission studied the internal regulatory documents of the university, developed on the basis of external regulatory legal acts and educational and methodological documents for disciplines within the framework of educational programs, a typical curriculum, educational and methodological complexes and other materials. All supporting materials required for the study by the commission were provided.

In order to obtain objective information on the assessment of the university's activities, the members of the EEC used the following methods: visual inspection, observation, interviewing employees of various structural divisions, teachers, students, employers online and offline, questioning the teaching staff and students. From the side of the NAO MUA, the presence of all persons indicated in the visit program is ensured. The three-day program of visiting the EEC was completed in full.

For the period of accreditation, classes at the university were held in a distance format due to an emergency.

During a visual inspection, members of the EEC visited the university departments (objects for accredited EP):

- Center for Master's and Doctoral Studies:
- Department of Organization and Quality Control of Educational Activities;
- office registrar center;
- support center for publications, library literature;
- simulation center;
- Department of Normal Physiology;
- Department of Internal Medicine
- center for the transfer of educational technologies;

distance learning teacher of Biostatistics (Master

of

the Department

"Medicine", due to the lack of scheduled classes for doctoral students);

- Institute of Radiobiology and Radiation Protection;
- center for career guidance.

According to the results of the questionnaire survey of the teaching staff of the MUA, it was revealed that to the question "Assess the level of the teaching staff's ability to combine teaching with scientific research" - 28% of respondents noted relatively poorly. On the issue of providing benefits, rest and sanatorium treatment - 20% noted dissatisfaction and 12% found it difficult to answer; on questions of satisfaction with the food system, as well as medical services, 12% are not satisfied and 12% find it difficult to answer.

Also, respondents from among the teaching staff noted problems with the Internet, a shortage of mobile laptops and projectors, and the absence of their own clinic.

According to the results of a survey of MUA students, it was revealed that 10.85% are not satisfied with the availability of counseling on personal problems, 8.68% are partially dissatisfied and dissatisfied with the financial and administrative services of the educational institution, 19.6% are partially dissatisfied and dissatisfied with the availability of health services for students, 8.68% are partially dissatisfied and not satisfied with classrooms, classrooms for large groups, 10.85% are partially dissatisfied and not satisfied with the proportionality of classrooms for small groups), 26.08% are partially dissatisfied and dissatisfied

with the rest rooms for students, 6.51% expressed disagreement with the fact that the organization of education provides sufficient opportunity for sports and other leisure activities, 23.88% are partially dissatisfied and not satisfied with the provision of students with a hostel.

In order to confirm the information presented in the Self-Assessment Report, external experts requested and analyzed the working documentation of the university. At the same time, experts have studied the online positioning of the University through the official website of the university <a href="https://www.MUA.kz">www.MUA.kz</a>.

As part of the planned program, recommendations for improving the accredited educational programs of the MUA, developed by the EEC based on the results of the examination, were presented at a meeting with the management on 05/30/2020.

# (VI) COMPLIANCE WITH ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM

#### STANDARD 1. "MISSION AND FINAL RESULTS"

#### **Proof part**

The EP is based on the possibility of implementing individual educational trajectories, strengthening interdisciplinary training within the framework of the tasks of implementing the corresponding priority areas of development with the possibility of transforming individual blocks in accordance with the structure of employers' requests for the formation of specific professional competencies. This approach is designed to ensure the effective integration of doctoral students into the modern scientific community.

The EP meets the regulatory requirements adopted at the national level, is consistent with the National Qualifications Framework, the European Qualifications Framework based on Dublin descriptors. The working curriculum of a doctoral student is developed in accordance with the structure of the EP of doctoral studies in the scientific and pedagogical direction, approved by the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 604 "On the approval of state compulsory education standards at all levels of education."

The training of doctoral students is carried out in accordance with the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 13, 2018 No. 569 On approval of the Classifier of areas for training personnel with higher and postgraduate education.

Thus, the implementation of the EP is aimed at training qualified specialists for science and practice, which corresponds to the mission and vision of the MUA and ensuring the demand for graduates in the labor market.

#### **Analytical part**

The mission and goals of the University, their main provisions and points were discussed at the Board of the University. The mission of the University was approved by the decision of the Board of Directors No. 7 dated 07.24.2019.

The mission of NJSC "MUA" reflects the development and improvement of the national system of higher and postgraduate education and was developed in accordance with the general strategy of the state presented in the program documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan, it reflects its nature, features, established development priorities, as well as the place and role of the university in educational, scientific, socio-economic and cultural development of the region and the country as a whole. In accordance with the mission of the university, NJSC "Astana Medical University" trains personnel in educational programs of postgraduate education, including doctoral studies.

The mission of the EP of postgraduate education (doctoral studies) is to train highly specialized, competitive specialists of a new generation with a high level of professional competence, with pedagogical and research skills.

The mission of the EP is formulated in accordance with the requirements of state educational standards, the needs of the state and the market, the strategy of the university, the requests of employers and the wishes of students.

The leadership of the university initiated a wide discussion with the employees of the University of the mission, vision, core values, policy, main goals and objectives in the field of quality, which relate to all aspects and processes of educational and scientific activities of the university, monitoring and analysis of activities is carried out .

It was brought to the attention of the authorized bodies in the field of medical and pharmaceutical education and health care, the academic community, students and other interested parties by submitting the strategic development plan of NJSC "MUA" to the authorized bodies in the field of education, healthcare, as well as publication on the official website of the university - www.MUA .kz.

Admissions brochures also contain information about the mission and goals of the institution, making it accessible to stakeholders such as applicants and their parents.

The mission of the educational program is undergoing a phased approval process. At the first stage, the graduating department formulates the mission and main goals of the strategic plan based on the achievements of modern science and education, the requests of those wishing to study according to the program, as well as the expectations of employers. Further, the formulated mission and strategic plan are submitted for discussion by the departments involved in the process of training future specialists. After making final adjustments, the mission is submitted to the meetings of the Faculty Council, discussed at the meeting of the Senate Commission on Academic and Scientific Work of the University.

## According to Standard 1 Mission and Outcomes, there are the following strengths:

- 1. The Strategic Development Plan of the NAO MUA for 2019-2023 was developed and implemented with the participation of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, RCHD and international experts.
- 2. The educational program of doctoral studies in the specialty "Medicine" is in demand.

#### Area for improvement:

Expand the mission of the doctoral educational program in the specialty

"Medicine", taking into account the issues of global health and social responsibility.

#### No recommendation.

EEC conclusions by criteria: (strong / satisfactory / suggests improvement / unsatisfactory)

In general, according to this Standard, the organization's activities meet the specified criteria.

Quantitative indicators reflecting the organization's compliance with the Standard's criteria are as follows: strong positions - 5, satisfactory - 13, suggest improvement - 1, unsatisfactory - 0.

# STANDARD 2. "RESEARCH AND RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT AND EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES"

#### Proof part

There is free access to international information networks, to electronic databases, to library collections, to computer technologies and educational, methodological and scientific literature. The library of the university has sufficient funds for doctoral students working in the field of scientific research.

Currently, the departments teaching doctoral students are provided with highly qualified teaching staff with basic education, academic degrees and categories.

In the MUA, the LEK functions, which in its work is guided by the requirements of the Regulations on the Ethics Committee of NJSC "MUA" PL-MUA-57-14. The committee is also guided in its activities by the ethical principles of the Helsinki Declaration of the World Medical Association, reflected in the State Standard for Good Clinical Practice and regulatory legal acts (Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Science", State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan 5.01.024-2008 "Research work") of the Republic Kazakhstan SOP LEK is posted on the University website <a href="http://www.MUA.kz/science\_and\_research\_clinic/science/ethics\_committee/">http://www.MUA.kz/science\_and\_research\_clinic/science/ethics\_committee/</a>.

Electronic databases are updated annually. The number of subscribed periodicals on the profile of the university is constantly increasing. In the electronic information room, access to the Paragraph database, Emerald publishing house, Thomson Reuters, Springer publishing house, OvidSP platform, PubMed,

Physician Consultant, Student Consultant.

The University Library is provided with appropriate technical equipment to support daily activities: computers, multimedia projectors and visual aids. The library is equipped with 59 computers connected to the Internet, printers, copiers, a projector, and 12 electronic databases purchased from the university budget and received by national subscription through the NCSTI: Aknur, Epigraph, Books-up.ru, Pubmed, Jaypeedigital, WebofKnowledge, DynaMed, ScientificandMedical ART, Sciencedirect, Springerlink, Geotar-Media, Polpred.com.

The volume of the book and magazine fund is 789 847 copies, educational, educational, methodological, scientific literature in the state, Russian and foreign languages, of which educational literature 589 163 copies, which is 70% of the book fund, of which 163 680 copies are in the state language

NJSC "MUA" has a laboratory park, which allows doctoral students to carry out independent educational and research work. There is a scientific laboratory of the Institute of Radiobiology and Radiation Protection, a research laboratory of the Department of General and Biological Chemistry, where doctoral students practice the development of new methods for analyzing chemical and biological objects, use a biochemical analyzer, a PD 300 spectrophotometer and a digital spectrophotometer.

Adequate provision of educational, methodological and scientific literature for the doctoral program of the specialty "Medicine" in various profiles of the specialty was provided by the library of the university.

## Analytical part

The research activities of NJSC "MUA" are carried out by the teaching staff of the university, doctoral students, undergraduates, students in accordance with the strategic plan for the development of scientific and medical research of the university, taking into account the priority areas, annual plans of research work. Research in topical areas funded by the Ministry of Education and Science, the Ministry of Health and other state bodies, international funds and organizations is of priority importance in scientific activity. Research is conducted in accordance with international ethical standards and approved by the relevant ethics committees.

On the basis of NAO MUA, according to the plan, international and republican conferences and seminars are held. University professors and staff participate in international and republican conferences and seminars, as evidenced by the increase in the number of publications. The number of articles in international publications in 2019 amounted to 354, of which 40 in international peer-reviewed publications in the Web of Knowledge, Scopus. At the university, the process of integration into the world educational space is being implemented within the framework of the strategic direction of development of NJSC "MUA" for 2019-2023.

The academic partners of the university are the leading universities of the USA, Singapore, Europe, Russia, which allows introducing advanced technologies into the educational, scientific and medical process.

Internships for doctoral students in foreign educational organizations at NJSC "MUA" are carried out for 2-3 years of study, according to the individual work plan of the doctoral student. During field internships in foreign educational and scientific organizations, doctoral students carry out scientific research, experimental research work.

According to standard 2 "Research environment and educational resources", the commission noted the following strengths:

- 1. Direct interaction with the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, RCHD determines the current scientific directions of research of doctoral students, there are initiative works.
  - 2. High level of human resources, great teaching and practical experience of teaching staff.
- 3. Sufficiently good provision of resources: literature, laboratories, the Institute of Radiobiology, partnerships with both domestic research centers and institutes, and foreign educational organizations.

#### **Recommendations:**

1. Fill in the content of the website of the university by posting the following information: plan for the development / activities / work of the university, plan for the development of the educational program of doctoral studies, rules for admission to doctoral studies.

## EEC conclusions by criteria: (strong / satisfactory / suggests improvement / unsatisfactory)

In general, according to this Standard, the organization's activities meet the specified criteria.

Quantitative indicators reflecting the organization's compliance with the Standard's criteria are as follows: strong positions - 18, satisfactory - 8, suggest improvements - 1, unsatisfactory - 0.

# STANDARD 3. "POLICIES AND RECEPTION CRITERIA" Proof part

The EEC Commission established that the admission of persons to the MUA is carried out through budget funding - placing a state educational order for the training of specialists and paying for training at the expense of citizens' own funds.

Doctoral students are provided with a guidebook designed for their quick adaptation.

As supporting documents, the personal files of doctoral students of different years of study were presented and studied, where there are applications addressed to the Rector for admission; personal sheets, copies of an identity document, copies of an education document with attachments, a certificate confirming proficiency in a foreign language, a list of scientific publications, copies of copyright certificates, certificates, diplomas.

## **Analytical part**

The policy and criteria for admission to doctoral studies are set out in the "Rules for admission to doctoral studies for PhD NJSC" MUA "PR-MUA-05 and are regulated in accordance with:

- The Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education";
- The Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Science";
- Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600 "On Approval of the Model Rules for Admission to Training in Educational Organizations Implementing Educational Programs of Higher and Postgraduate Education"

In order to meet the needs of medical organizations in need of PhD doctoral students in the specialty "Medicine" and society in general, the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, responsible for planning and development of human resources in the health sector, preliminarily sets the number of admitted doctoral students for medical universities. In turn, NJSC "MUA" submits for approval to the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan an application for the number of admitted doctoral students in relation to the material, technical and educational potential of the graduating departments.

Persons with a Master's degree and work experience of at least 1 year or who have completed residency training in medical specialties are admitted to PhD doctoral studies.

Applicants must demonstrate to the commission an abstract of the future doctoral dissertation, which contains the title of the topic; target; tasks; methods by which the research goal will be achieved; materials that will guide the researcher in the process of writing the work; scientific novelty of the research; expected results of the study.

The rights and obligations of students are spelled out in an individual agreement, which is concluded before the start of the crime for the educational process.

Persons with a Master's degree and work experience of at least 1 year or who have completed residency training in medical specialties are admitted to PhD doctoral studies.

The choice of the topic of the dissertation work takes into account the scientific interests of the doctoral student in the framework of the directions of scientific research of the department or topics determined by the Ministry of Health, RCHRH.

Formation contingent enrolled formed on the basis of the Order the MES № 606 2018 31 October goda On approval average ratio of students to teachers for calculating the total number of professors teaching composition.

The admission of doctoral students is carried out by placing a state educational order for the training of personnel in scientific, pedagogical and specialized areas, as well as paying for training at the expense of students 'own funds and other sources.

## For Standard 3 "Policy and Admission Criteria", the Commission noted the following strengths:

- 1. Doctoral students are provided with a choice of an individual trajectory of training, an opportunity is provided for planning scientific research.
- 2. Doctoral students have the opportunity to master general and professional competencies through postgraduate continuous and additional education.
  - 3. Free choice of the supervisor for doctoral students.

EEC conclusions by criteria: (strong / satisfactory / suggests improvement / unsatisfactory) In general, according to this Standard, the organization's activities meet the specified criteria. No recommendation.

The quantitative indicators reflecting the organization's compliance with the Standard's criteria are as follows: strong positions - 7, satisfactory - 3, suggest improvements - 0, unsatisfactory - 0.

#### STANDARD 4. "DOCTORATE PROGRAM"

#### **Proof part**

Visit to the master's and doctoral center. The director of the center spoke about the activities of the center.

Visiting the department of organization and quality control of educational activities (director Bukeeva Zh.R.) and the center for planning, organization and control of the educational process (head Utenova G.M.). Presented are: academic policy of 04.07.2019 with amendments and additions of 03 April 2020 based on the decision of the Senate of the NAO MUK, clause 14.9 was added. Distance learning, working instructions for organizing intermediate and final certification of students in the 2019-2020 academic year during the COVID-19 coronavirus pandemic from 04.05. 2020

The following documents are presented: the regulation on doctoral studies at the NAO MUA, which describes the mechanisms of requirements for persons entering doctoral studies, the structure of educational programs, the procedure for monitoring progress, intermediate attestation, the content of educational programs, requirements for key competencies, requirements for scientific supervisors, requirements for key competencies of graduates, final state certification, etc.; - requirement for the content, design and defense of the dissertation; job descriptions of the head of the center for master's and doctoral studies, specialist of the center for master's and doctoral studies.

An analysis of the educational process by departments is presented (the name of the department, discipline, course, KTP, schedule, groups, a link to conducting classes, a link to conducting classes, a link to literature, a syllabus in 3 languages, topics of practical classes, topics of SRO, RK, final control, participating teachers). There was a visit to the departments of "Normal Physiology" and "Internal Medicine" with a visual examination of the clinical base - the Central Clinical Hospital of the Ministry of Defense of the Republic of Kazakhstan. At the departments there was a conversation with doctoral students of 2 and 3 years of study on internship, on working with scientific consultants and preparing a publication. The teachers of the departments noted the use of research-oriented learning (RBL), case-based learning (SBL), 3D films in the classroom with doctoral students; at the department

"Normal physiology" favors the PBL method.

Within the framework of academic mobility, doctoral students were trained on the basis of partner universities:

- 1. University of Klaipeda, Klaipeda, Lithuania (Doctoral student AM Meiramova, 2016, cycle "Biostatistics");
  - 2. University of Udine, Udine, Italy (Doctoral student A.Yu. Goncharov, 2018 cycle "Biostatistics");

3. Vytautas Magnus university, Kaunas, Lithuania (Doctoral student Smagulova A.K., 2019, cycle "Biostatistics in medicine");

The Center for Master's and Doctoral Studies provides information on the employment of doctoral students in the specialty "Medicine". Graduates of the doctoral program "Medicine" are in demand, employment is 95-100%. The minutes of the meeting of the commission on personal distribution, the decision of the commission on employment to work were presented.

#### Analytical part

Educational programs of postgraduate education are provided with the following auxiliary "tools": RUP, academic calendar, individual curriculum and individual doctoral student work plan. RUE and academic calendars are developed by the Center for Master's and Doctoral Studies for the academic year on the basis of the Model Curriculum approved at a meeting of the Senate. To monitor the implementation of the individual work plan of a doctoral student, which includes both monitoring of progress and compliance with the deadlines for writing a dissertation work, each doctoral student is given a journal "Individual Master's Work Plan", where the student keeps records throughout the learning process as they are completed.

EP, the working curriculum and the content of the disciplines are developed in accordance with the structure of the educational program of doctoral studies in the scientific and pedagogical direction, according to the order On Amendments to the Order of the Acting Minister of Health and Social Development of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 31, 2015 No. 647 "On approval of state compulsory standards and standard professional curricula for medical and pharmaceutical specialties, according to which the main criterion for the completion of the educational process for the preparation of PhDs is the mastering of at least 180 academic credits by a doctoral student, including all types of educational and scientific activities.

The scientific component of the educational program of doctoral studies is formed from the research work of a doctoral student, scientific publications, writing and defense of a doctoral dissertation. The volume of the scientific component is 64% of the total volume of the doctoral education program or 115 academic credits.

In the structure of the educational program, there are optional components that are developed by departments, based on the demand for the labor market, the needs of students and modern scientific achievements. In order to develop pedagogical and research skills, the program provides for pedagogical and research practices. Manager's competencies are developed by studying such subjects as "Project Management", "Partnership: Research and Society", etc.

In order to inform listeners, scientific advisers and teachers about the goals and end results of training, as well as the competencies that a PhD graduate should have, the NJSC "MUA" has developed a regulation "On the competence model of a PhD graduate of doctoral studies" PL-MUA-122.

Pedagogical practice has the goal of mastering, in-depth study and consolidation of theoretical training and the acquisition of practical skills and competencies by the doctoral student in the field of pedagogical activity.

The university carries out on an ongoing basis monitoring of the implementation of the EP. Feedback is carried out by questioning students.

## According to standard 4 "Doctoral program" the following strengths are noted:

- 1. Availability of educational, scientific and resource potential.
- 2. Possibility of choosing an individual trajectory of training within the framework of the current state educational standard by means of elective disciplines.
- 3. The employment rate is high, they are employed in the leading educational and healthcare organizations of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

#### **EEC recommendations:**

1.To improve the quality assurance of EP through active feedback and the involvement of teaching staff, doctoral students, employers in the development and discussion of EP with obligatory documentation

of the process at the level of departments, center of master's and doctoral studies with the presence of peer review.

2 To makewider use of the potential of partner universities in improving and attractiveness of the educational program.

3.Develop a plan for the development of joint educational programs with foreign partner universities and ensure its implementation.

#### EEC conclusions by criteria: (strong / satisfactory / suggests improvement / unsatisfactory)

In general, according

to this Standard activity organization meets requirements criteria.

Quantitative indicators reflecting the organization's compliance with the Standard's criteria are as follows: strong positions - 7, satisfactory - 9, suggest improvements -0, unsatisfactory - 0.

#### STANDARD 5. "SCIENTIFIC GUIDANCE"

## **Proof part**

When choosing scientific supervisors for doctoral students, the University is guided by the following principles: the scientific supervisor must either have an academic degree of doctor, or candidate of medical sciences, or PhD, or be a qualified specialist in the relevant industries with at least 5 years of work experience. The supervisor must have scientific works: at least 3 publications on the profile of the master's program in domestic and international scientific journals, including leading journals of the near abroad, as well as publications in journals included in the international databases Web of Science (KA), Scopus, RSCI, PubMed ...

In its activities the supervisors are guided by the legislative acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan on science, Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 the year № 604 On approval of the state obligatory standards of education at all levels of education, Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 30, 2018 the year number 595 On Approval of the Model Rules for the Activities of Educational Organizations of the Corresponding Types, Regulations on Master's and PhD Doctoral Studies.

The duties and rights of the scientific advisor are determined.

#### **Analytical** part

The procedure for approval of scientific supervisors / consultants is carried out in accordance with the university standard "On training in PhD doctoral studies" (the previous version of SU-MUA-39-13 "On training in PhD doctoral studies") in the following sequence: candidates for scientific leaders / consultants for doctoral students in the specialty "Medicine "are considered at meetings of clinical departments, then at an interdepartmental meeting, and finally approved by the Senate of the University. The result of these statements is the corresponding order of the rector on the appointment of the scientific leadership. Based on this order, a monthly payment of 45 hours is made for the scientific guidance of each doctoral student. Compliance with this document is monitored by the Center for Master's and Doctoral Studies, where a copy of the document is stored, and the original is kept in the quality management department of NJSC "MUA".

In NJSC "MUA", seminars on "Management of scientific research" are held annually with the invitation of foreign specialists, at which the University staff are trained. The subject of the seminars is the processes of organizing and developing scientific research in the health care system and medical education.

Support for the potential of scientific advisers at the University is carried out in accordance with the following documents:

- Program for the development of the teaching staff of JSC Astana Medical University for 2017-2021. (approved by the decision of the Management Board of JSC "MUA", Minutes No. 10 dated February 24, 2017);

The report in Appendix 17 presents the characteristics of scientific supervisors / consultants of doctoral students in the specialty "Medicine" based on criteria such as official qualifications, professional experience, results of research and publication activities (Hirsch index, etc.).

## Strengths of Standard 5 "Scientific Leadership":

- 1. Availability of highly qualified teaching staff of the EP "Medicine", capable of providing scientific guidance to doctoral students' dissertation research in various priority areas.
  - 2. There is a policy of due recognition and worthy remuneration of scientific advisers.

EEC conclusions - the criteria of the standard are fully disclosed, there are no recommendations.

EEC conclusions by criteria: (strong / satisfactory / suggests improvement / unsatisfactory)

In general, according to this Standard, the organization's activities meet the specified criteria.

Quantitative indicators reflecting the organization's compliance with the Standard's criteria are as follows: strong positions - 5, satisfactory - 4, suggest improvements -0, unsatisfactory - 0.

#### STANDARD 6. "DISSERTATION"

#### **Proof part**

It should be emphasized that the NJSC "Astana Medical University" closely cooperates with the Republican Center for Health Development (hereinafter - RCHD) - an organization that provides powerful methodological support to the healthcare system of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the basis of regular research and development. The wording of the topic of the doctoral dissertation and the candidacy of the scientific supervisor are discussed at the department to which the doctoral student is attached and approved at a meeting of the department.

## **Analytical part**

At the university, the requirements and rules for the publication of doctoral dissertations are reflected in the work instruction "Requirements for the content and design of a PhD doctoral dissertation" RI-MUA-48-20.

In NJSC "MUA" work is underway to assess the degree of borrowing of PhD material by doctoral students when performing doctoral dissertations, this work is carried out in order to improve the quality of the organization and efficiency of the educational process, to control the degree of independence of PhD students in doctoral dissertations and their observance of intellectual property rights of citizens and legal entities ...

The head of the center for master's and doctoral studies is responsible for checking the qualifications of students for borrowing, illegal borrowing and unjustified self-citation in the system

"Antiplagiat".

In NJSC "MUA" discussion of the implementation of scientific work and the main provisions of the doctoral dissertation before the defense is held at the meetings of the department. During the hearing of the report of the doctoral student on the progress of the dissertation and discussion of the main provisions of the teaching staff, the departments give recommendations and comments that the doctoral student can discuss with a scientific consultant and use in the implementation of research work. At the stage of preliminary defense, which is held at a meeting of the ISS, the doctoral student submits an act of verification of primary documentation, a review.

#### **Strengths of Standard 6 "Dissertation":**

1. Relevance of doctoral dissertation topics.

EEC conclusions - the criteria of the standard are disclosed, there are no comments.

Recommendations:

To improve the process of supporting publications to ensure the quality of publications and eliminate the risks of submitting articles of doctoral students and teaching staff to substandard scientific publications.

#### EEC conclusions by criteria: (strong / satisfactory / suggests improvement / unsatisfactory)

In general, according to this Standard, the organization's activities meet the specified criteria.

The quantitative indicators reflecting the organization's compliance with the Standard's criteria are as follows: strong positions - 16, satisfactory - 1, suggest improvements - 0, unsatisfactory - 0.

#### STANDARD 7: DISSERTATION EVALUATION

The activities of the University for teaching doctoral students in the specialty "Medicine" are regulated by PL-MUA-120-20 "On training in PhD doctoral studies at NJSC" MUA ", as well as by the work instruction" Requirements for the content, design and defense of a doctoral dissertation "RI-MUA-48. These documents reflect the policy of assessing doctoral students, including the assessment of the doctoral student's dissertation work.

A doctoral dissertation should be carried out in accordance with the program of planned research of the University, be included in international, state or regional scientific, scientific, technical and industry programs, in programs of fundamental or applied research.

All doctoral students take a comprehensive exam and defend their dissertation work in accordance with the working curriculum and working curricula that are common for medical universities. A doctoral student who has passed a comprehensive exam is allowed to defend a thesis. The defense of the dissertation work is carried out at an open meeting of the Dissertation Council with the participation of at least half of its members.

When a positive decision is made on the defense of the dissertation, the scientific secretary of the DS forms a doctoral student's certification file, which is sent to the Committee within 30 (thirty) calendar days after the defense of the doctoral dissertation at the DS.

## Strengths according to Standard 7 "Evaluation of dissertations":

- 1. The organization of the process of preparation and evaluation of doctoral students' dissertations is carried out in full compliance with the requirements of regulatory documents.
- 2. A high proportion of graduated personnel in the teaching staff of the graduating departments, which made it possible to ensure the quality of training of students and the work performed by them.

EEC conclusions - the criteria of the standard are fully disclosed, there are no comments. No recommendation.

EEC conclusions by criteria: (strong / satisfactory / suggests improvement / unsatisfactory)
In general, according

to this Standard activity organization meets requirements criteria.

Quantitative indicators reflecting the organization's compliance with the criteria of the Standard are as follows: strong positions - 10, satisfactory - 2, suggest improvements - 0, unsatisfactory - 0.

#### STANDARD 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

## **Proof part**

The university has a range of responsibilities and authorities to provide the educational program with resources, including a target budget for training.

Determination of the budget of NJSC "MUA" and the management structure of the university is the responsibility of the first head of the university, the Rector - Chairman of the Board. To handle financial issues in NJSC "MUA", the position of Vice-Rector for Economics is provided, his powers and responsibilities are determined. The vice-rector supervises the following structures responsible for budget management: the department of financial and investment activities, the department of infrastructure

development, the IT department, the center for the development of entrepreneurial and investment activities, marketing and PPP.

The budget of NJSC "MUA" is considered at the meeting of the Board of Directors. The university budget is formed from several sources:

- the republican budget (state order for training of personnel for higher and postgraduate education, advanced training of workers, development of scientific research, transfers);
- provision of paid educational and other services (Appendix 10). Revenues are received from the main areas of activity:
- Educational activities bachelor's degree (students, interns), postgraduate education (training of scientific personnel);
  - Educational activities advanced training and retraining of personnel;
  - Scientific activity;
  - Other services (Appendix 10).

The volume of funding over the past 5 years has a steady tendency to increase, due to the increase in the number of the contingent and the cost of training under the program "Salamatty Kazakhstan", attracting more students to paid educational services.

The university has a sufficient material and technical base, ensuring the conduct of all types of disciplinary and interdisciplinary training, practical and research work of students, provided for by the curriculum of the university, classrooms equipped with computers and appropriate software for teaching.

The university plans and allocates the resources necessary for the implementation of the educational program and allocates educational resources in accordance with their needs.

## **Analytical part**

The main management of doctoral programs and coordination of the activities of graduating departments is carried out by the Center for Master's and Doctoral Studies, which is an administrative structural unit of NJSC "MUA".

The structural unit has undergone a number of transformations: the dean's office of postgraduate education was organized in September 2010, before that it operated as a Center for postgraduate education. In connection with the change in the organizational structure and staffing of NJSC "MUA" on September 9, 2019, the Dean's office of postgraduate education was reorganized into the Center for Master's and Doctoral Studies. The center is directly subordinate to the vice-rector for scientific work. The activities of the CMD are aimed at organizing the work of departments in the field of planning, conducting and providing educational, scientific and methodological work for the preparation of undergraduates, as well as monitoring, recording, analyzing, evaluating and making recommendations for improving efficiency and quality of training, as well as interaction with other structural divisions of the NAO

"MUA" participating in the implementation and support of educational programs.

The center carries out its activities in accordance with the Regulation on the Center for Master's and Doctoral Studies (PSP-MUA-5.1.4-2019), the powers of the employees are carried out in accordance with their job descriptions. The main goal of the center is to carry out organizational, coordination and administrative work aimed at achieving the mission and goals of educational programs.

The involvement of teachers in the process of managing curricula is ensured through the participation of the teaching staff of the university in the development of the state educational standard, standard curricula for disciplines at the republican level, and work programs for disciplines.

Direct management of the educational process at the postgraduate level is carried out by a member of the Management Board, Vice-Rector for Research, reporting to the Chairman of the Management Board - Rector of NJSC "MUA".

## The panel noted the following strengths in Standard 8 Governance and Administration:

1. Close interaction with the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the health sector.

EEC recommendations:

1.Prepare Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) for the development and implementation of an educational program (EP) for doctoral studies with a description of the interaction between structural units in order to manage and coordinate the EP by the department of magistracy and doctoral studies.

2.Strengthen the personnel potential of the Master's and Doctorate Center by improving qualifications through training employees in the field of management and educational programs.

## EEC conclusions by criteria: (strong / satisfactory / suggests improvement / unsatisfactory)

In general, according to this Standard, the organization's activities meet the specified criteria.

Quantitative indicators reflecting the organization's compliance with the Standard's criteria are as follows: strong positions - 8, satisfactory - 15, suggest improvements - 3, unsatisfactory - 0.

# (VII) OVERVIEW OF STRENGTHS / BEST PRACTICES FOR EACH STANDARD According to standard 1 "Mission and final results":

- 1. The Strategic Development Plan of the NAO MUA for 2019-2023 was developed and implemented with the participation of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, RCHD and international experts.
- 2. The educational program of doctoral studies in the specialty "Medicine" is in demand.

## According to standard 2 "Research environment and educational resources":

- 1. Direct interaction with the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, RCHD determines the current scientific directions of research of doctoral students, there are initiative works.
  - 2. High level of human resources, great teaching and practical experience of teaching staff.
- 3. Sufficiently good provision of resources: literature, laboratories, the Institute of Radiobiology, partnerships with both domestic research centers and institutes, and foreign educational organizations.

## According to Standard 3 "Policy and Admission Criteria":

- 4. Doctoral students are provided with a choice of an individual trajectory of study, an opportunity is provided for planning scientific research.
- 5. Doctoral students have the opportunity to master general and professional competencies through postgraduate continuous and additional education.
  - 6. Free choice of the scientific supervisor by doctoral students.

## According to standard 4 "Master's program":

- 1. Availability of educational, scientific and resource potential.
- 2. Possibility of choosing an individual trajectory of training within the framework of the current state educational standard by means of elective disciplines.
- 3. The employment rate is high, they are employed in the leading educational and healthcare organizations of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

#### According to standard 5 "Scientific guidance":

- 1. Availability of highly qualified teaching staff of the EP "Medicine", capable of providing scientific guidance to doctoral students' dissertation research in various priority areas.
  - 2. There is a policy of due recognition and worthy remuneration of scientific advisers.

## According to standard 6 "Dissertation":

1. Relevance of doctoral dissertation topics.

## According to Standard 7 "Evaluation of dissertations":

- 1. The organization of the process of preparation and evaluation of doctoral students' dissertations is carried out in full compliance with the requirements of regulatory documents.
- 2. A high proportion of graduated personnel in the teaching staff of the graduating departments, which made it possible to ensure the quality of training of students and the work performed by them .

## According to standard 8 "Management and Administration":

1. Close interaction with the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the health sector.

## (VIII)REVIEWOF RECOMMENDATIONS TO IMPROVE QUALITY IN EVERY STANDARD

According to standard 1 "Mission and final results":

No recommendation.

#### **Area for improvement:**

Expand the mission of the doctoral educational program in the specialty

"Medicine", taking into account the problems of global health and social responsibility.

## According to standard 2 "Research environment and educational resources"

1. Fill in the content of the website of the university by posting the following information: plan for the development / activities / work of the university, plan for the development of the educational program of doctoral studies, rules for admission to doctoral studies.

## According to Standard 3 "Policy and Admission Criteria":

No recommendation.

## According to standard 4 "Master's program":

1.To improve the quality assurance of EP through active feedback and the involvement of teaching staff, doctoral students, employers in the development and discussion of EP with obligatory documentation of the process at the level of departments, center of master's and doctoral studies with the presence of peer review.

2 To makewider use of the potential of partner universities in improving and attractiveness of the educational program.

3.Develop a plan for the development of joint educational programs with foreign partner universities and ensure its implementation.

## According to standard 5 "Scientific guidance":

No recommendation.

## According to standard 6 "Dissertation":

To improve the process of supporting publications to ensure the quality of publications and eliminate the risks of submitting articles of doctoral students and teaching staff to substandard scientific publications.

## According to Standard 7 "Evaluation of dissertations":

No recommendation.

## According to Standard 8 "Management and Administration":

- 1. Prepare Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) for the development and implementation of an educational program (EP) for doctoral studies with a description of the interaction between structural units in order to manage and coordinate the EP.
- 2. Strengthen the personnel potential of the Master's and Doctorate Center by improving qualifications through training employees in the field of management and educational programs.

#### X. RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION BOARD

## Appendix 1. SPECIALIZED PROFILE PARAMETERS

No. P	CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION	Position of the educational organization					
		strong	Satisfa ctory	sugge sts impr ovem ents	Unsat isfact ory		
1.	"MISSION AND LEARNING OUTCOMES"						
1.1	Definition of the mission of the educational program						
1.1.1	The medical education organization <b>must</b> determine the mission of the educational program and bring it to the attention of stakeholders and the health sector.		+				
1.1.2	The medical education organization <b>must</b> ensure that the main stakeholders are involved in the development (formulation) mission of the educational program.		+				
	The medical education organization <b>must</b> ensure that the stated mission includes public health problems, the needs of the medical care system and other aspects social responsibility.	A	+		M		
1.1.4	The medical education organization <b>must</b> ensure that the mission of the educational program corresponds to the mission of the organization and allows the preparation of a competent researcher at the level postgraduate medical education.		+		Č		
1.1.5	The mission statement <b>should</b> contain goals and educational strategy to prepare a competent scientist, researcher in the level of postgraduate medical education.	A	+		L		
1.1.6	Mission of the educational program:  -Should be consistent with available resources, opportunities and market requirements;  -ways to support it should be identified;  -access to information on the mission of the medical education organization / educational program for the public should be provided (availability of information on the website of the university).			7			
1.1.7	The mission and goals of the educational program <b>should</b> discussed at the advisory councils / commissions of the university and approved by the advisory council of the university.		+				
1.1.8	The medical education organization <b>must</b> systematically collect, accumulate and analyze information on their activities in preparation for the implementation of the doctoral program; conduct an assessment of strengths and weaknesses (SWOT- analysis), on the basis of which the leadership of the medical education organization, together with the advisory board, should determine the policy and develop strategic and tactical plans		+				
1.2	Institutional autonomy and academic freedom				21		

	Medical education organization that implements educational	+			
	programs of doctoral studies <b>must</b> have institutional autonomy for				
	the development and implementation of policies for which the				
	responsibility of the faculty and administration, especially with				
	regard to:				
1.2.1.1	development of an educational program;	+			
1.2.1.2	use of the dedicated resources required		+		
	for the implementation of the educational program.				
	Medical education organization should guarantee academic freedo		+		
	m to its employees and future doctoral				
	students:				
1.2.2.1	in relation to the current educational program, in which it will be		+		
	allowed to rely on different points of view in the description and	1			
	analysis of issues in accredited specialties;				
	in the possibility of using the results of new research to improve		+		
	the study of specific disciplines / questions without expanding the				
	educational program.				
	Learning outcomes				
	The medical education organization <b>must</b> determine the expected		+		
	final learning outcomes that doctoral students will have to show		·		
	after completion of the doctoral program.				
1.3.2	The medical educational organization must ensure that doctoral		+		
	studies with the award of a PhD degree, a doctor in the profile				
	will provide future doctoral students with the competence that will				70
	allow them to become a qualified researcher capable of	<b>N</b>			32
	conducting independent scientific research in accordance with the				0
	principles of best research practice (good research practice).				
	Completion of the doctoral program should have a potential		+		
	benefit for those who pursue careers outside the medical				
	organization and apply their competencies formed during the				
	development of the doctoral program, including critical analysis,				
	assessment and solving difficult problems, the ability to transfer				
- 1	new technologies and the synthesis of new ideas.			_	
	Medical education organization / scientific		+		
1.5.4	the organization should ensure that the renewal and restructuring		T		
	process results in the modification of graduate learning outcomes				
	in line with the responsibilities that are assigned to graduates after			7	
	graduation doctoral programs.				
		2	16		
2	Total: 18 parameters  Standard "SCIENTIFIC AND DESEARCH	2	16		
2.	Standard "SCIENTIFIC AND RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT AND EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES"				
2.1					
2.1	Research environment  The suggests of individual destoral programs must be ensured by				
2.1.1	The success of individual doctoral programs <b>must</b> be ensured by		+		
	the organization of a strong and effective research environment.				
	The quality of the research environment <b>should</b> be assessed by				
	analyzing:		_		
	publication of research results (number of publications, impact		+		
	factor, etc.) by profile doctoral studies in				
	a medical educational organization /scientific organization.				

2.1.2		1			
2.1.3	the level of attracting external funding for research in medical educational organization / scientific organization.			+	
2.1.4	number of qualified and competent researchers, teachers in a group, at a faculty, an educational institution.	+			
2.1.5	national and international collaboration with medical research groups organizations, universities, scientific research centers.		+		
2.1.6	Presence in the medical organizations of education procedures / systems comply with the ethics of scientific research		+		
2.1.7	opportunities to provide access to the funds needed to write a dissertation, doctoral programs <i>may</i> include study at other laboratories, preferably in another country, thus ensuring internationalization.	+			
2.1.8	Medical education organization <i>should</i> explore the possibilities of providing joint doctoral programs with degrees from both universities and joint leadership to support cooperation between higher education institutions.		1	+	
2.1.9	The medical education organization <i>should</i> ensure that the process of updating educational resources will be carried out in accordance with changing needs, such as the recruitment of doctoral students, the number and profile academic staff, doctoral program.	a	+	J. F.	
2.1.10	Medical education organization <i>should</i> provide sufficient autonomy in the allocation of resources, including procedures aimed at decent remuneration teachers in achieving final results learning.	+	ŀ	Y	2
2.2	Material and technical base				
G.	The medical educational organization / scientific organization <b>must</b> have the material and technical support corresponding to the licensed indicators that include criteria:		3		6
2.2.1	auditoriums, laboratories and their equipment <b>must</b> be modern and adequate to the goals and objectives doctoral programs;		1	+	
2.2.2	conditions for the implementation of self-study and research work of future doctoral students;		+		
2.2.3	renewal and improvement of material technical base <b>should be</b> carried out regularly.		7	+	

2.2.4	The medical education organization <b>must</b> have sufficient resources for the proper implementation of the doctoral program to ensure: admission of doctoral students, organizing training in the doctoral program, performing dissertation work, scientific advice to doctoral students, consideration, peer review and assessment dissertation, operating costs, expenses for participation in training courses, ininternational scientific conferences,		+		
	payment of tuition fees for doctoral studies in institutions where it is practiced. scholarships for doctoral students in terms of variation in the size of the scholarship.		1		
2.2.5	Resource policy <b>should</b> be aimed at maintaining and ensuring continuous professional growth of program teachers doctoral studies.		+		
	The medical education organization <b>must</b> have a service and support service for future doctoral students, including a receptionist office, research centers and laboratories, a canteen, a canteen, a medical center, sports grounds and halls.			+	)
2.2.7	The medical education organization <b>must</b> provide a safe environment for employees, doctoral students, including those who ensure the implementation of the program, patients, if provided by the study, and those who care for them, including providing the necessary information and protection from harmful substances, microorganisms, compliance with the rules of technology safety in the laboratory and in the use of equipment	4			
1	Medical education organization <i>should</i> identify processes aimed at improving the learning environment of future doctoral students through regular renewal, expansion and strengthening of the material and technical base, which should correspond to the development in teaching practice.			+	
2.3	Information Technology				
2.3.1	A medical educational organization / scientific organization <b>must</b> have information support that corresponds to the goals and objectives doctoral programs:		+		
2.3.2	The library <b>should</b> contain the materials necessary for training - educational, technical, scientific and reference literature, various periodical medical publications, etc.;		+		
2.3.3	The medical education organization <b>must</b> ensure that future doctoral students will have timely and free access to library resources.		+		
2.3.4	The library <b>should</b> have the basic technical equipment to support day-to-day operations: fax machines, photocopiers, computers, printers available for public use, and a telephone with voicemail or answering machine.		+		24

	The library <b>should</b> have an informational website. The website			+	
	may contain the following elements: links, interlibrary forms, full text e-journal articles, and a contact form.				
	The medical education organization <b>should</b> regularly monitor				
	library resources, study and implement strategies to meet the		+		
	existing and future needs of doctoral students, including on the				
	basis of applications from departments and faculties, and the				
	amount of funds, allocated for the purchase of educational,				
	methodological, scientific literature.				
	The medical education organization <b>must</b> ensure that the use of		+		
	doctoral students will be provided with computer classes and		+		
	terminals with access to information resources (local area				
	network, Internet).				
	A medical education institution <b>should</b> provide for a mechanism		+		
	for monitoring the availability and adequate use of information		Т )		
	resources by future doctoral students.				
	The medical education <b>should</b>		+		
	be carried out continuous updating, improving and expanding base		т п	1 1	
	of information resources, with access to doctoral modern				
	electronic databases, including to foreign databases (Thomson			1	
	Reuters (the Web of Science, by Thomson Reuters				
	The ) Scopus', Pubmed, Elsevier, etc.).				
	The medical education organization <b>must</b> open and constantly		+		
	update on its website a section on doctoral programs that will		ľ		Th.
	open in the new academic year, containing the following	<b>1</b>			32
	information:			_	0
	-structure and staff of the doctoral department, duties of the				
	head and employees of the department;				VA.
	-admission policy, including clear rules on the selection				
	process for doctoral students;				
6.0	-list of doctoral programs;		39.		
	-structure, duration and content of doctoral programs;				
- 1	-criteria for the appointment of a scientific advisor, outlining				
	the characteristics, responsibilities and qualifications of the				
	scientific advisor;			7 V	
	-methods used to assess doctoral students;				
	-description of the work of				
	the State Attestation Commission;				
	-criteria for the design and writing of a thesis;	1	17		
	-description of the procedure for defending a dissertation				
	work;				
	-description of the activities of the Dissertation Council				
	(position, composition), if there is one, in the absence of a				
	Dissertation Council in the specialty at the university - model				
	rules for awarding academic degrees / model regulation on				
	the Dissertation Council;				
	-program for quality assurance and regular evaluation of				
	the doctoral program .	2	10		
	Total: 28 parameters	3	18	7	
3.	Standard "POLICY AND RECEPTION CRITERIA"				

3.1	The medical education organization <b>must</b> establish the relationship between the selection of doctoral students and the mission of the medical education organization, the educational program and the requirements of the labor market.		+		
3.2	The medical education organization / scientific organization <b>must</b> determine and implement a policy of admission, including a clearly established provision on selection process for doctoral students.		+		
3.3	The medical education institution <b>must</b> have a system / mechanisms of career guidance work aimed at selecting applicants for the selected specialties of doctoral studies.			+	
3.4	The medical education organization <b>must</b> determine the structure responsible for organizing the admission and selection of doctoral students, developed and approved rules / criteria for admission, based on the established model rules for admission to doctoral studies for higher educational institutions, disseminating information for a wide the public.	1	+		
3.5	In the selection of future doctoral students <i>should</i> evaluate research potential of the applicant, and not just take into account his academic performance.		+	V	1
3.6	In a medical educational organization, there <b>should</b> be a system for studying employment, demand, career support and continuous professional improvement future graduates.	A	+		
3.7	The medical education organization <i>should</i> ensure that the process of updating and restructuring leads to an adaptation of the admission policy for doctoral students, taking into account changing expectations and circumstances, human resource needs, changes in the postgraduate education system and needs of the program.		+		<
	Total: 7 parameters	-	6	1	
4	DOCTORATE PROGRAM standard		0		
4.1	Model of the educational program, methods				
1 1 1	learning and structure				
4.1.1	The medical education organization must ensure that the educational program is developed on the basis of an integrated, comprehensive, competence-based approach, using modular training technologies, and is positively evaluated by external experts / reviewers.			+	
4.1.2	The medical education organization must determine the goal and objectives of the doctoral educational program, which are aimed at achieving mission organization of education / educational program and learning outcomes.		+		
4.1.3	The medical education organization must ensure that the content of the educational program meets the requirements of the State Educational Standard and the standard curriculum of the relevant specialty and is developed taking into account the needs labor market.		+		

4.1.4	The medical education organization must ensure the implementation of the educational program with the appropriate working curricula, academic calendar, curriculum for disciplines, forms of the individual curriculum of future doctoral students and an individual plan doctoral student work.	+		
	The doctoral program must provide for the performance of original research, which requires analytical and critical thinking, to be carried out under scientific leadership.	+		
4.1.6	The medical education organization must ensure that the educational program will be implemented in accordance with the principles equality.		+	
4.1.7	The medical education organization must provide mechanisms to guarantee	+		
	fulfillment of obligations by future doctoral students in relation to doctors, teachers, patients and their relatives in accordance with the Code Conduct / Code of Honor.			
4.1.8	The doctoral program must guarantee teaching doctoral students the rules of ethics and responsible research	1	+	
4.1.9	The medical education organization must determine the teaching and learning methods appropriate to the educational program and achievement of the competencies of students.	+		
4.1.10	The doctoral program must be structured with a clear time limit equivalent to 3 years full time and contain: theoretical training, including the study of cycles of basic and major disciplines; practical training of doctoral students - various types of practices, scientific internships; research work, including the implementation of a doctoral dissertation for scientific and pedagogical doctoral studies; experimental research work, including the implementation of a doctoral dissertation for specialized doctoral studies; intermediate and final certification.	+ 20		
4.1.11	The medical education organization should provide for mechanisms for the implementation of pedagogical practice (in accordance with the type of doctoral studies) for the formation of doctoral students' practical skills and teaching methods.	+		
	The medical education organization should provide mechanisms for the implementation of research practice for the formation of doctoral students' knowledge, skills, competencies in the field of the latest theoretical, methodological and technological achievements of domestic and foreign science, modern methods of scientific research, processing and interpretation experimental data.	+		
4.1.13	The medical education organization should provide for mechanisms for the implementation of industrial practice (in accordance with the type of doctoral studies) for the formation of doctoral students on the basis of theoretical knowledge of practical skills, competencies and professional experience in the specialty taught, as well as mastering advanced experience.	+		27

4.1.14	The medical education organization must ensure that doctoral students will be provided with the opportunity for additional training during the vacation period in the presence of academic debt, desire to develop additional credits		+		
	An appeal mechanism should be developed in the medical education organization, allowing future doctoral students to review the decision regarding their achievements in educational programs.		+		
4.2	Doctoral Program Evaluation				
4.2.1	The medical education organization must have a program for monitoring processes and results, including the routine collection of data on key aspects of the educational program. The purpose of monitoring is to ensure the quality of the educational process, to identify areas that require interventions.	111		+	
4.2.2	The medical education organization must have approved mechanisms for the regular assessment of the quality of the program, including feedback from scientific consultants, employers and doctoral students.		1	+	
4.2.3	The medical education organization should have mechanisms aimed at systematic collection, analysis of feedback and its provision to teachers and doctoral students, which will include information on the process and products of the educational program, including unfair practice or improper behavior of teachers or doctoral students.	4	-		
	The medical education organization should ensure that the process of updating and restructuring the program will be regularly and aimed at:		-		
4.2.4	adapting the curriculum model and teaching methodology to ensure that they are appropriate and appropriate;		+		n
4.2.5	adjusting the elements of the program and their relationship in accordance with advances in medical sciences, with changes in the demographic situation and state health / morbidity structure of the population and socio-economic, cultural conditions.	U	\$		6
4.3	Engaging stakeholders		- 4		
4.3.1	The medical education organization must ensure that the teaching staff, doctoral students, administrative and managerial staff will be involved in the monitoring program and activities for evaluating the educational program. staff, employers		1		
4.3.2	The medical education organization should ensure that other stakeholders are involved in the assessment process, including representatives of academic and administrative staff, representatives of the public, authorized bodies for education and healthcare, professional organizations, employers.		+		
4.3.3	Medical education organization should have mechanisms for providing access to results evaluation of the educational program of all stakeholders			+	
4.3.4	The medical education organization should ensure that the process of updating and restructuring will lead to an improvement in the monitoring and evaluation of the program in accordance with changes in the final results teaching and teaching and learning methods.		+		28

	Total: 24 parameters	-		1	.8	6	
five	SCIENTIFIC GUIDANCE standard						
5.1	The medical education organization must ensure that it will	+					
	determine for each doctoral student scientific consultants						
	(domestic and foreign)						
5.2	The medical education organization must have mechanisms /	+					
	procedures governing the process of discussion and approval of						
	the candidacy of the scientific consultant and the research topic of						
	the doctoral student according to standard requirements and						
	GOSO.						
5.3	The medical education organization must ensure that scientific	+					
	consultants are selected from specialists with a scientific degree						
	and are actively involved in scientific research in the field of						
	science in the specialty of teaching a doctoral student.						
5.4	The medical education organization must have			١.	+		
	clearly formulated responsibilities and scientific advisor						
	responsibility						
5.5	The medical education organization should plan and organize			-	+		
	training courses for scientific advisers on implementation policy						
	doctoral programs, the main responsibilities of scientific advisers.						
5.6	Medical education organization must have procedures /			_	+		
	mechanisms / structures carrying out the organization, control of						
	the scientific activities of future doctoral students on						
	the implementation of dissertation research						Th.
5.7	The medical education organization must determine, approve and				+		
<i>.</i> ,	publish the principles, methods and practices that will be used to					_	9
	evaluate doctoral students, including the evaluation criteria						
	scientific work						VA.
	Total: 7 parameters	5		4	4		
6	Standard «PhD THESIS»						
6.1.	The PhD program should end with the preparation and defense of a		+		9		1
	doctoral dissertation, which is an indicator of the formation of the						
	doctoral student's competencies in accordance with the educational						
	program.						
6.2	Medical organization of education/scientific the organization must		+		- /		
	set a deadline for preparation dissertations, limited to a 3-year						
	period.						
6.3	The dissertation must be written by the doctoral student		+				
	independently, contain a set of new scientific results and provisions						
	put forward by the author for public defense, and indicate the						
	author's personal contribution to science, and also meet one of the						
	requirements:						
6.4	contain new evidence-based results, which solve an important		+				
	scientific problem;						
6.5	contain new evidence-based results, the use of which provides a		+				
	solution to an important problem applied tasks;						
6.6	contain new scientifically based theoretical and (or) experimental		+				
6.6		ı		1			1
6.6	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	1					
6.6	results, the totality of which is important for the development of						
6.6	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		+				

	goals and objectives of the research work, a methodological base,				
	methodological solutions, results, discussion, conclusion,				
	conclusions and future prospects of the +study.				
	A+ dissertation of applied significance should contain information about the practical use of the scientific results obtained by the				
	<u> </u>				
	author, confirmed by author's certificates, patents and other official documents.				
-					
	The dissertation can be written in the state or Russian languages	+			
	To ensure international recognition, the dissertation can be written	+			
	and defended in English.				
	The abstract for the dissertation should be published in the state,	+			
	Russian and English languages.				
	The summary of the doctoral thesis should be published in two				
	languages (English, Russian or Kazakh), depending on the main				
	language of study of the doctoral student.				
	The results of the dissertation work should be available to	+			
	interested parties (doctoral students,+ 32 scientific supervisors,				
	employees of the organization where the dissertation was				
	performed, researchers performing scientific work in a similar				
	direction, and other categories of interested persons), i.e.				
	published, if copyright or other reasons do not prevent this.				
	The dissertation can be published on the home web page of the				
	medical organization of education/scientific organization where the				W
	scientific work was performed, both in abbreviated form				
	(summary, theses), and in full, if copyright or other reasons do not	100			27
	prevent it.				
	The dissertation must be accompanied by not less than 7 (seven)				
	publications on the topic of the thesis, including at least 3 (three) in				TA.
	scientific journals recommended by the Committee, one (1) in the				
	international scientific edition, 3 (three) proceedings of				
	international conferences, including one (1) in the materials		23		100
	overseas conferences. The international publication must be in the				
	information database of Thomson Reuters (ISI Web of Knowledge,				
	Thomson Reuters) or Scopus, and have a non-zero impact factor.				
	In the case of joint publications, the co-author should document		+		
	that the doctoral student has made a significant and independent				
	contribution to the writing of these papers. Ownership of the				
	research results of a doctoral student should be clearly defined and				
	described. This will avoid re-publishing the results in more than				
	one dissertation.				
	The medical educational organization / scientific organization				
	should ensure that the doctoral dissertation is discussed at the				
	meeting of the Department (s) where the dissertation was				
-	performed.	16	1	0	
IN TO		16	1	V	
	Standard " evaluation of DISSERTATIONS»				
	The medical education organization / scientific organization must		+		
	define, approve, and publish the principles, methods, and practices				
	used for evaluating doctoral students, including the criteria for				
	evaluating scientific work.	_			
7.2	Final evaluation and approval of the thesis	+			

	education should ensure that training in doctoral studies carried out only in full-time			
8.1.2	Medical organization of		+	
	program.			
8.1.1	The management of a university / scientific organization <b>should</b> be effective and ensure the improvement of the educational		+	
8.1	Program management			
8	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION standard			
o		10	2	
	the process of evaluating and defending a dissertation remotely.	10	2	
	allow some members of the Dissertation Council to participate in	1		
	organizations should actively use information technologies that			
	expertise, medical educational organizations / scientific			
1.12	In order to achieve independent and competent international			
7.12	defense according to the "PhD Dissertation" standard.			
	Dissertation Council, which evaluates the dissertation and oral			
	organization / scientific organization based on the decision of the			
7.11	The PhD degree should be awarded by a medical educational			
7 1 1	reject the dissertation without the possibility of revision.			
	be allowed. In exceptional cases, the Dissertation Council may			
	oral defense, the doctoral student must additional protection may			
	finalize the dissertation. If a negative assessment is given in the			
	dissertation, the doctoral student should be given the opportunity to			
7.10	In case of negative evaluation of the written version of the		+	
7.10	who participated in the meeting, a negative decision is made.	100		
	decision (two-thirds) of the members of the Dissertation Council			
	the meeting voted for it. If less than 2/3 voted for a positive			
	or more of the Dissertation Council members who participated in			
	Dissertation Council made a positive decision, i.e. 2/3 (two-thirds)			
7.9	The dissertation defense should be considered successful if the			
7.0	doctoral program.			
	in order to ensure further employment for the graduate of the			
	Dissertation Council and the defense should be as short as possible			
7.8	The time between the submission of the dissertation to the			
7.7	The dissertation defense should be open to the public.	+		
7.7	preparation of the written version, and subsequent oral defense.			
7.6	The defense of a doctoral dissertation should include:	+		
	degree of doctor of philosophy (PhD) in the relevant specialty.			
	novelty, and also give an opinion on the possibility of awarding the			
	formulated in the dissertation and its practical significance, their			
	of validity of scientific provisions, conclusions, recommendations			
	Council, which assess the relevance of the chosen topic, the degree			
	reviewers should submit written reviews to the Dissertation			
7.5	Based on the study of the dissertation and published works,			
7.4	The dissertation must be reviewed.	+		
	of PhD training.			
	where the Dissertation Council functions in the corresponding field			
7.3	The dissertation defense should be conducted at the University	+		
	the work should be carried out by the Dissertation Council.			

8.1.3	The medical education organization must determine the structural unit responsible for educational programs and achievement final learning outcomes.		+		
8.1.4	The structural unit responsible for educational programs <b>should</b> have the authority to plan and implement the educational program, including the allocation of allocated resources for planning and implementing teaching and learning methods, assessment doctoral students, evaluation of the educational program and training courses.			+	
8.1.5	The medical education organization must guarantee the interaction of future doctoral students with the leadership on design issues, management and evaluation of doctoral programs.	/	+		
8.1.6	The medical education organization should encourage and facilitate the involvement of future doctoral students in the process of developing educational programs for the training of doctoral students, for which it is necessary to provide appropriate procedures.		+		
_	The structural unit responsible for educational programs <b>should</b> ensure the transparency of the management system and the decisions made that are published in the bulletins, posted on the website of the university, included in the protocols for review and execution.	. 0	+		
	The medical education organization <i>should</i> , through the structural unit responsible for educational programs, plan and implement innovations in the educational program.		+		
Œ	Medical education organization representatives from other relevant stakeholders <i>should be</i> included in the structural unit of the medical education organization responsible for educational programs, including other participants in the educational process, representatives from clinical bases, graduates of medical education organizations, health professionals involved in the training process or other teachers of the university faculties	4	- 20		
	Medical education organization should ensure that the structural unit responsible for the educational program:		1	Ty.	
8.1.10	takes into account the peculiarities of the conditions in which graduates will have to work and modify the educational program accordingly.				
8.1.11	considers the modification of the educational program based on feedback from the public and society as a whole.			+	
	Medical education organization / scientific the organization should ensure that the process of renewal and restructuring leads to improvements in the organizational structure and management principles of the PhD doctoral program to ensure effective performance in the face of changing circumstances and needs, and, in the long term, to meet the interests of various groups, stakeholders in the context of changing circumstances and needs		+		
8.2	Academic leadership				

8.2.1	The medical education organization <b>must</b> clearly define the responsibility of the academic leadership in relation to the development and management educational program		+		
8.2.2	Medical education organization <b>should</b> periodically assess academic leadership against the achievement		+		
	of its mission and learning outcomes.				
8.3	Training budget and resource allocation				
	The medical education organization <b>must</b>				
8.3.1	have clear terms of reference and authority for providing the educational program with resources, including the target budget for training.		+		
8.3.2	plan and allocate resources necessary for the implementation of the educational program and allocate educational resources in accordance with their needs.	9	+		
8.3.3	The financing system of a medical education institution should be based on the principles of efficiency, effectiveness, priority, transparency, responsibility, differentiation and independence of all levels of budgets.		+		
8.3.4	Financial and administrative policies <b>should</b> be aimed at improving the quality of the educational program.		+		
0.0.7	The medical education organization should:				
8.3.5	provide sufficient autonomy in the allocation of resources, including decent remuneration of teachers in order of achievement final learning outcomes;	Я	+		-
8.3.6	when allocating resources, take into account scientific advances in medicine and problems public health and their needs.	711	+		g,
8.4	Administrative staff and management				
	The medical education organization <b>must</b> have an appropriate administrative and academic staff, including their number and composition in accordance with qualifications, in order to:	₹			ľ
8.4.1	ensure the implementation of the educational program and related activities;		0	+	0
8.4.2	ensure proper management and resource allocation.			+	
8.4.3	The medical educational organization / scientific organization <b>should</b> develop and implement an internal program for quality assurance of management, including consideration of needs for improvement, and conduct a regular review and analysis of management.			+	
8.4.4	A medical educational organization / scientific organization <b>must</b> ensure the implementation of the PhD doctoral program in accordance with a quality management system certified by independent organizations.	Ŵ		+	
8.5	Interaction with the health sector				
8.5.1	A medical education organization <b>must</b> have constructive interaction with the health sector, with related health sectors of society and government, including the exchange of information, cooperation and initiatives of the organization, which contributes to the provision of qualified specialists in according to the needs of society			+	

8.5.2	The medical education organization <b>should</b> provide an			+	
	operational link between the educational program and the				
	subsequent stages of professional training				
8.5.3	The medical education organization should be given a formal			+	
	status of cooperation with partners in the health sector, which				
	includes the conclusion of formal agreements defining the content				
	and forms of cooperation and / or the conclusion of a joint				
	contract and the creation of a coordinating committee, and				
	holding joint events				
	IN TOTAL:	8	15	3	
	Total:	76	55	4	

