«АККРЕДИТТЕУ ЖӘНЕ РЕЙТИНГТІҢ ТӘУЕЛСІЗ АГЕНТТІГІ» КЕМ

НУ «НЕЗАВИСИМОЕ АГЕНТСТВО АККРЕДИТАЦИИ И РЕЙТИНГА»

INDEPENDENT AGENCY FOR ACCREDITATION AND RATING

REPORT

on the results of the work of the external expert Commission for assessment of compliance with the requirements of the standards of primary specialized accreditation of NAO "Astana Medical University"
Educational programs in the specialty of doctoral studies
8D10104 «Pharmacy»
NJSC "Astana Medical University"
in the period from 28 to 30 May 2020

INDEPENDENT ACCREDITATION AND RATING AGENCY
External expert commission

Address
ed to the
Accreditation
the IAAR Council

Независимое агентство
аккредитации и рейтинга

REPORT

on the results of the work of the external expert Commission for assessment of compliance with the requirements of the standards of primary specialized accreditation of NAO "Astana Medical University"
Educational programs in the specialty of doctoral studies
8D10104 «Pharmacy»
NJSC "Astana Medical University" in the period from 28 to 30 May 2020

Nur-Sultan, 2020

Content

I. LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

NJSC "MUA", University - Non-profit joint stock company "Astana Medical University".
EEC is an external expert commission.
KKKiBTU MH RK - Committee for quality control and safety of goods and services of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.
AI S - automated information system; AUP - administrative and management personnel;
LBC - library and bibliographic classification;
DB - databases ;
BRS - point rating system;
VKK - inside the department control;
SJSC - State Attestation Commission;
GO - civil defense;
SES RK - State Compulsory Education Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan;
IGA - final state certification;
IPP - an individual teacher's work plan ;
IMS - Integrated Management System;
IEP - Individual Curriculum ;
KazSSR - Kazakh Soviet Socialist Republic; CT - complex testing;
KOPS - committee of specialty educational programs;
ҚR DSM - Densaulyk saktau ministerial;
QED - catalog of elective disciplines; LEK - local ethical commission;
ISS - interdepartmental meeting;
MH RK - Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan;
MES RK - Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan;
IAAR - Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating;
Research Institute - Research Institute;
JSC "NMH" - Joint Stock Company "National Medical Holding";
NOT - new educational technologies;
NTP - scientific and technical program;
NCSTI - National Center for Scientific and Technical Information;
NTsELSiMI - National Center of examination of medicinal agents andmedical products;
EP - educational program;
Teaching staff - teaching staff;
PL - position;
RI - working instructions;
RK - Republic of Kazakhstan;
RUE - working curriculum;
QMS - quality management system;
SRM - Independent work of undergraduates;
SRMP - Independent work of undergraduates under the guidance of a teacher;
SRO - Student's independent work;
Goods and materials - inventory items;
TUP - standard curriculum;
UVP - training and support staff;

UDC - Universal Decimal Classification;
UMO RUMS - Educational and Methodological Association of the Republican Educational and Methodological Council;
UMKD - educational and methodological complex of the discipline;
UMC - educational and methodological center;
UMC - educational and methodological council;
CMD - Center for Master's and Doctoral Studies;
EBS - Electronic Library Systems;
GPA - grade point average;
ISO - International Organization for Standardization

II. INTRODUCTION

In accordance with the order of the Independent agency for accreditation and rating (hereinafter - the naaru) number 42-20-OD from 27.04.2020 years in the NAO "Astana Medical University" (hereinafter - the University) external expert committee assessed the compliance of the educational activities of primary education accreditation standards naaru programs in the specialty magistracy 8D10104 «Pharmacy».

The report of the external expert commission (hereinafter - EEC) contains an assessment of the educational program of the specialty **8D10104 «Pharmacy»** to the criteria of the NAA and recommendations of the EEC for further improving the activities of the University .

EEC composition

1. **The Chairman of the commission** - Turdalieva Botagoz Saitovna, MD, Professor, AO "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" (Almaty)
2. **Foreign expert** - Marina Alekseevna Kanushina, director of "AC Institute of international Education", PhD, MBA. (Prague, Czech Republic)
3. **Expert** - Aimbetova Gulshara Ergazyevna, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Kazakh National Medical University. S. D. Asfendiyarova (Almaty)
4. **Expert** - Naylya Igorevna Sheveleva, MD, DSc, Professor, Karaganda Medical University (Karaganda)
5. **Expert** - Andasova Zhanar Myrzagalievna, Ph.D., Associate Professor, JSC "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" (Almaty)
6. **Expert** - Omarkulov Bauyrzhan Kadenovich, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" (Karaganda)
7. **Expert** - Elena Leonidovna Stepkina, Ph.D., Kazakhstan Medical University "VSHO" (Almaty)
8. **Expert** - Sadykova Sholpan Sauatbekovna, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, NUO "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" (Almaty)
9. **Expert** - Torlanova Botagoz Ongarovna, Ph.D., South Kazakhstan Medical Academy JSC (Shymkent)
10. **Expert** - Ivanchenko Nellya Nikolaevna, Ph.D., Kazakh National Medical University named after S.D. Asfendiyarov (Almaty)
11. **Employer** - Saule Sotsialovna Smakova, Medical College under LLP "Republican Medical Academy" (Nur-Sultan)
12. **Student** - Ilyasova Bayansulu Begim- Muratkyzy, Eurasian National University named after L.N. Gumilyov (Nur-Sultan)
13. **Observer from the Agency** - Aimurzieva Aigerim Urinbaevna, head of medical projects of the Agency (Nur-Sultan)

The WEC report provides an assessment of the correspondence of educational programs organizations education criteria of the IAAR, the recommendations of the WEC for further improvement of educational programs and profile options educational programs.

(III) REPRESENTATION OF THE EDUCATION ORGANIZATION

The University was founded in October 1964 as the Tselinograd state medical Institute. Over the years of the Medical Institute's existence, there have been numerous changes in its organizational form, and management system reform in accordance with the requirements of the time. Detailed information presented on the University's website (http://www.amu.kz/about_the_university/).

The University has a multi-level education system. NAO " MUA " was the first among the medical universities of Kazakhstan to start multi-level training of medical and scientific-pedagogical personnel (system of continuous higher education) in the following areas: bachelor's degree-internship-residency; bachelor's degree-master's degree-PhD.

The University operates a system of international distance learning (MOODLE), which uses the latest achievements in this field in its work.

Since 2012, distance learning has been introduced at the additional level professional education.

The University is characterized by great achievements.

In 2011, the University integrated the EFQM excellence Model with existing quality management system. In November 2011, the University was successfully validated by international experts (assessors) for compliance with the criteria and fundamental concepts of the EFQM model of excellence at the level of "Striving for excellence", and in November 2012 – an assessment for compliance with the level of excellence of the EFQM Model "Recognized excellence", 4 stars. In 2013 the University's activities have been highly evaluated by the European Foundation for quality management-a 5-star certificate of excellence Model.

In 2013, the University was awarded the Asian award for excellence and best practice in the field of quality management at the ANQ - 2013 Congress of the Asian quality organization. The certificate of the Asian Quality Organization advanced JSC "MUA" to a new level of excellence, thereby confirming the fact that the University is one of the leading universities in the Republic of Kazakhstan, where the quality of education and services provided fully meet international standards and requirements.

In the world ranking of University Internet sites Ranking Web of Universities (Webometrics) (as of June 2018) NAO " MUA "takes 10925th place, 4390th place in the continental rating, and 22nd place in the Republic, which confirms the development of the corporate website content www.amu.kz", reflects the quality of The University's information infrastructure and the quality of the University's management.

In 2016, the University successfully passed the 5th recertification audit of the management system and received a Certificate from AFNOR (France).

In 2019, the University successfully passed the national institutional accreditation (ncaoko) and today almost all educational programs implemented by the University at all levels have passed specialized accreditation.

(IV) DESCRIPTION VISIT WEC

The work of the EEC (cluster 6) was carried out on the basis of the visit program of the expert commission on the primary specialized accreditation of the educational program of doctoral studies in the specialty 8D10104 "Pharmacy" in NJSC "MUA" in the period from 28 to 34 May 2020.

To obtain objective information about the quality of educational programs and the entire infrastructure of NJSC "MUA", to clarify the content of self-assessment reports meetings were

held: with the rector, provost, vice-rectors, head of the Center for Master's and Doctoral Studies, Head of the Department of Public Health, Dean of the Faculty of Nursing, Head of the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines, concurrently Dean of the Faculty of Pharmacy, Deputy Dean of the Faculty of Nursing, Deputy Heads of Departments of Accredited EP, Director of the Department of Organization and Quality Control of Educational Activities, Head of the Center for Planning, Organization and Control of the Educational Process, Head of the Center of the Registrar's Office, Head of the Publications Support Center, Library Literature and the University Museum, Head of the Simulation Center, Director of the Institute of Radiobiology and Radiation Protection, Head of the Center for the Transfer of Educational Technologies, Director of the Department of Work with Students,Head of the Center for Youth Affairs, Chief Specialist in Career Guidance, Head of the Corporate Development Service, Head of the Human Resources Department, Head of the Media Press Center, Director of the Department of Finance and Investment Activities, Director of the Infrastructure Development Department, Director of the Department of Science and Innovation, Director of the Department of Clinical work, the head of the E-University, the head of the quality management department, with the teaching staff, doctoral students, graduates, employers. A total of 102 people took part in the meetings.

During a visual inspection of the university, EEC visited the deans, the Center for Master's and Doctoral Studies, the Department of Organization and Quality Control of Educational Activities, the Center for Planning, Organization and Control of the Educational Process, the Center of the Registrar Office, the Center for Support of Publications, Library Literature and the University Museum, the Simulation Center, the Institute radiobiology and radiation protection, Center for the Transfer of Educational Technologies, Department of Work with Students, Center for Youth Affairs, Department of Career Guidance, Department of Science and Innovation, assembly hall.

On the second day of work, cluster No. 6 of the EEC visited the department of pharmaceutical disciplines and the production base - LLP "TerraPharm", at the city children's hospital No. 2.

The Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines is located on the 7th floor of the University building at 33 Sary-Arka street.

Training room "Pharmacy" (room No. 717), where classes are taught in disciplines

"Organization of pharmaceuticals and maceutical activities"; "Management and economics of pharmacy", etc., was presented by the senior lecturer of the department Akpayeva Karlygash Manapovna. The educational laboratory for pharmaceutical chemistry (No. 710) and the Educational laboratory for toxicological chemistry (No. 702 aud) were presented by the head of the department Shukirbekova Alma Boranbekovna, the educational laboratory for pharmacognosy (No. 708) was shown by the associate professor of the Department of Atimtaikyzy Ainash, with an educational laboratory (No. 701 on drug technology) was introduced by the senior teacher Filipovich Galiya Saitovna.

The structure and activities of Terra Pharm LLP were shown by the head of the pharmacy, Tatyana Alexandrovna Pavlova .

During the meeting, conversations were held with the main teaching staff, including professors Zh.M. Arystanov, T.A. Arystanova. and etc.

EEC also visited the Department of Biostatistics, Bioinformatics and Information Technologies

(V) DESCRIPTION OF THE PREVIOUS ACCREDITATION PROCEDURE

Accreditation of the EP of doctoral studies in the specialty "Pharmacy" has not been carried out before.

(VI) COMPLIANCE WITH SPECIALIZED STANDARDS ACCREDITATIONS

6.1 Standard "Mission and learning outcomes"

Proof part

The activities of the institution are aimed at the implementation of the mission of NJSC "MUA". The mission correlates with the Strategic Directions for 2019-2023 approved by the Board of Directors of NJSC "MUA" dated July 24, 2019, protocol No. 7, the mission of NJSC "MUA" is based on ensuring high quality education, science and clinical practice through training a new generation of medical personnel , modern science and concepts of the health of the nation. According to the mission, the University's activities are based on the integration of academic, scientific and clinical activities in order to provide high-quality and modern medical care to the population and train professional personnel.

The mission, vision and strategic goal of the university correspond to the goals, objectives and priorities of the national education system, which is expressed in the desire of the university to constantly improve the level of training of specialists to provide quality medical services to the population of Kazakhstan.

The University attracts doctoral studies in specialties to the formation of EP

"Pharmacy" teaching staff and employers.

The mission of the EP of doctoral studies is the same for all specialties and is to train highly specialized, competitive specialists of a new generation, capable of conducting scientific research at the world level.

The ultimate goal of the EP is in-depth training of qualified scientific specialists for the system of postgraduate education and the research sector in the field of pharmacy, with in-depth scientific, pedagogical training and a system of general cultural, professional competencies. The objectives of the EP are formulated in accordance with the requirements of state educational standards, the needs of the state and the market, the strategy of the university, the requests of employers and the wishes of students, based on the study of problematic issues of theoretical and practical pharmacy.

EP 8D10104 - "Pharmacy" is compiled taking into account the social expectations of society for the intellectual, personal behavioral qualities and skills of the graduate, which determine his readiness for an independent life, productive professional activity in modern market relations in society: the EP provides a list of expected learning outcomes, but is not traced a clear connection between general competencies at the exit, learning outcomes and the disciplines planned in the EP .

The educational program (hereinafter referred to as EP) for doctoral studies in the specialty 8D10104 "Pharmacy" submitted for primary specialized accreditation includes the practical training of doctoral students, including the passage of various types of professional practices (pedagogical practice - 2 credits and research practice - 3 credits for students under the Ph.D. program (PhD)), scientific internships.

Passage of professional practice for doctoral students is planned in accordance with the approved academic calendar and will be carried out according to the individual work plans of doctoral students in the amount established in the EP in the specialty.

Pedagogical practice is carried out with the aim of forming and improving teaching skills in higher education. Pedagogical practice of doctoral students in the NAO

"MUA" is planned for the 1st year in the spring semester in the amount of 2 credits in accordance with the approved RUE and the academic calendar. In addition, the consolidation of teaching skills can be carried out without interrupting theoretical and scientific research training in the form of conducting bachelor's studies in the disciplines of the specialty of training during the academic year.

The research practice of the doctoral student is planned by NJSC "MUA" according to the academic calendar in the fall semester of the 2nd year of study, the duration of the practice is determined in 3 credits.

The content of research practice is determined by the specialty of training, the topic of the research work of the doctoral student and the supervisor and is aimed at mastering the skills of planning and conducting research, processing and analyzing the data obtained, preparing scientific documentation and preparing scientific publications. The purpose of the practice is to develop skills for performing research work.

The bases for the practice are the laboratories of the department, NTSELS and pharmacies, the laboratory of the Department of Pharmaceutical and Toxicological Chemistry of JSC "SKMA", where it is planned to conduct the experimental part of the doctoral student's work under the guidance of a scientific consultant.

The results of passing all types of practice will be presented in the form of a report, the form of which is approved by the NJSC "MUA" with a mandatory hearing at a meeting of the supervising department.

In general, the doctoral program in the specialty 8D10104 - "Pharmacy" at the University is structured in such a way as to provide a holistic systematic understanding of the processes of research and teaching activities and teach how to use modern tools for solving strategic and tactical problems that are universal throughout the world.

Doctoral graduates of this EP have the opportunity to implement in the following areas of professional activity: pharmaceutical education, pharmaceutical science, pharmaceutical industry and pharmaceutical practice.

Information about the content of the EP of doctoral studies in the specialty "8D10104 - Pharmacy" is communicated to interested parties by posting on the website of NJSC "MUA".

The university conducts an analysis of the external and internal environment.

Analytical part

The implementation of the EP of doctoral studies in the specialty "Pharmacy" is planned from the 2020-2021 academic year and will depend on the presence / absence of a set for this EP.

The process of developing an EP for doctoral studies in the specialty "Pharmacy" is transparent and accessible to all interested parties (confirmed during interviews with employers).

Compilers of the educational program are given the opportunity to independently allocate hours within one discipline, the departments are given the freedom to change and supplement the program, which also allows the university to make appropriate adjustments to the educational program.

Academic freedom of a doctoral student is achieved through the choice of an educational trajectory, elective disciplines, directions of scientific research and a scientific advisor. Doctoral students have the opportunity to directly communicate their opinions to the University leadership at meetings with the head of the Master's and Doctoral Studies Center, vice-rectors and rector, through the rector's functioning blog.

The Center for Master's and Doctoral Studies, together with the Department of Organization and Quality Control of Educational Activities, the Center for Planning, Organization and Control of the Educational Process, the Center of the Registrar Office, is responsible for drawing up working curricula, registers educational achievements (registrar's office), draws up a schedule of classes final control. The Center for the Transfer of Educational Technologies is responsible for the implementation and monitoring of innovative teaching methods, the organization of training for the teaching staff, together with the Department of Organization and Quality Control of Educational Activities, analyzes the satisfaction of students with the quality of the educational process. The activity of the Department of Pharmaceutical Discipline is currently implementing the EP at the bachelor's degree and plans to implement the EP in the specialty "Pharmacy" in the magistracy and doctoral studies. The activities of other supporting structural units are aimed at providing the infrastructure for the learning process .

At the same time, the system of training scientific personnel at the University is ready to adapt to the changing conditions in the education system, such as changes in existing regulations, the emergence of a new legislative field, renewal and restructuring of the pharmaceutical

industry, having a highly qualified teaching staff and maintaining a constant cooperation with the professional environment.

Strengths / Best Practice

Strengths include:

- Institutional autonomy in the university in relation to the development of the educational program
- Availability of a Strategic Plan for the Development of EP doctoral studies in specialty

"8D10104 - Pharmacy", approved on 12.02.2020 by the Council of the Faculty of Pharmacy and creating the possibility of a variety of training areas (4 individual trajectories) for doctoral students

EEC conclusions by criteria: (strong / satisfactory / suggest improvements / unsatisfactory) - total 18 parameters

strong - 2

satisfactory - 16 suggest improvements - 0 unsatisfactory - 0

6.2 Standard "Research environment and educational resources"

Proof part

The success of the PhD program in Pharmacy at the University is ensured by the presence of a strong and effective research environment conducive to the development and formation of the research skills of PhD doctoral students. Its main goal, according to the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, is the preparation of highly specialized scientific and pedagogical personnel for the system of higher and postgraduate education, for the research sector and practical health care (Regulation on doctoral studies at NJSC "MUA").

The organization of a strong and effective research environment is a combination of a strong competence level of scientific leaders and consultants, cooperation with leading medical research organizations and institutions in Kazakhstan, near and far abroad (List of cooperation agreements , Research Center: http: // www. MUA.kz/science_and_research_clinic/).

The University provides conditions for future doctoral students to acquire the necessary knowledge and competencies based on the study of basic and specialized disciplines, the formation of skills and abilities during professional (pedagogical, research) practice and during the implementation of research and development.

In the implementation of the scientific and educational doctoral program in the specialty "Pharmacy" are planned to ensure a high quality of education, the implementation of scientific research, production doctoral specific scientific goals and the selection of objectives and methodologies for achieving the objectives are possible thanks to the presence in the trainees scientific leaders.

For the scientific leadership of doctoral students, competent teachers with academic degrees and titles are involved. From partner universities, perpetual consents for scientific guidance from foreign scientific consultants have been obtained (Medical University of Gdansk, Republic of Poland, Medical University in Lublin, Medical University of Mississippi, USA, NUPh, Kharkov, Ukraine, SPHFA, St. Petersburg, Russia, etc.) for the entire period of study of doctoral students (3 years), regardless of the year of admission.

Doctoral studies will be conducted by persons with a doctorate or candidate of sciences, PhD. The highly professional level of teachers, scientific leaders, consultants of PhD-doctoral students is confirmed by the fact that 100% of the teaching staff have academic degrees of doctor or candidate of sciences, extensive experience in the field of higher education, and participation in the implementation of research projects at various levels.

The University has a developed mechanism and sufficient autonomy in the allocation of resources, including procedures aimed at decent remuneration of teachers in achieving the final learning outcomes in doctoral and master's programs, including the results of research activities (scientific products).

Over the past 5 years, in general, there has been an increase in publications in indexed publications. A teaching staff who is ready to participate in conducting classes in the disciplines of the educational program of doctoral studies and / or to be scientific consultants for doctoral dissertations; have the required Hirsch index, Active scientist citation index according to Google Academy, national agencies in the Republic of Kazakhstan and the CIS countries: they are published in Web of Science publications, in publications with a non-zero impact factor based on Clarivate Analytics Web of Science and Scopus databases . They have scientific patents for inventions, publish textbooks and teaching aids.

Today there is an opportunity to conduct scientific research by future doctoral students in the National Center for ELECTRONICS, pharmacies, the Research Center of NJSC "MUA".

Analytical part

The standard "Research environment and educational resources" reflects the level of preparedness and improvement of the material and technical base and human resources, allowing future doctoral students to timely and efficiently receive the results of scientific research, which will be brought to the attention of a wide scientific audience by speaking at international conferences and preparing doctoral dissertations for defense in dissertation councils at medical universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Strengths / Best Practice

Strengths include:

- High professional level of the teaching staff of the university, planned to participate in the implementation of the EP doctoral studies in the specialty "Pharmacy"
- An effective system of incentives and motivation for teaching staff at the University
- Involvement of leading experts from near and far abroad in scientific consulting for doctoral students

EEC recommendations

✓attract external funding for scientific research in the field of practical pharmacy and medicine by identifying the most pressing problems of modern healthcare, developing topical topics scientific and technical projects (STP), including with the participation of future doctoral students.

✓Explore the possibilities and create joint EP of doctoral studies in the specialty "Pharmacy" with strategic partner universities to obtain the opportunity to award degrees from two universities.

✓Create a research laboratory separate from the educational process at the bachelor's degree, determine the list of relevant modern equipment necessary for future doctoral students in the implementation of research work on topical topics of applied importance.

✓Provide mechanisms for maintaining equipment at the required level, as well as mechanisms for updating and improving the material and technical base of the department of pharmaceutical disciplines.

✓Provide access for future doctoral students in the EP specialty "Pharmacy" to the research center and public laboratories .

✓Ensure admission of future doctoral students to VPN-resources for information support, corresponding to the goals and objectives of the doctoral program .

EEC conclusions by criteria: (strong / satisfactory / suggest improvements / unsatisfactory) - 28 parameters

strong - 3
satisfactory - 18 suggest
improvements - 7 unsatisfactory - 0

6.3 Standard "Policy and Admission Criteria "

Proof part

In NJSC "MUA" admission to doctoral studies in the specialty "Pharmacy" is planned to be carried out on a competitive basis based on the results of entrance exams. The policy and criteria for admission to doctoral studies are set out in the "Rules for admission to doctoral studies PhD NAO

"MUA" PR-MUA-05 and are regulated in accordance with:

- The Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education";
- The Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Science";
- Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 31, 2018 No. 600 "On Approval of the Model Rules for Admission to Education in Educational Organizations Implementing Educational Programs of Higher and Postgraduate Education";
- The current legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and local acts of the University. The rules include :

1. Requirements for admission to doctoral PhD
2. The procedure for admission of persons entering doctoral PhD
3. Procedure for conducting entrance exams
4. Enrollment in PhD doctoral studies

The requirements determine the procedure for admission of persons to the PhD program of the University.

Persons with a Master's degree in Pharmacy and work experience of at least 1 year are admitted to PhD doctoral studies.

The purpose of the entrance exam is to identify the degree of preparedness of an applicant for PhD-doctoral studies to master the educational program and perform research work.

Due to the changing requirements for the competencies of doctoral graduates, the entrance examination programs are reviewed and approved annually.

Citizens entering doctoral studies in the specialty "Pharmacy" take entrance exams: 1) in one of the foreign languages of their choice (English, French, German); 2) by specialty.

In the absence of the necessary prerequisites, the applicant is allowed to master them on a paid basis. In this case, doctoral studies begin after full mastering of the prerequisites.

The formation of the contingent of future doctoral students is planned to be carried out through budget funding, placing a state order for personnel training, as well as paying for training at the expense of citizens' own funds and other sources.

Analytical part

According to the "Policy and Criteria for Admission" standard, the admission policy for doctoral students meets the requirements of stakeholders, taking into account changing expectations and circumstances, human resource needs, changes in the postgraduate education system and the needs of the PhD doctoral program in the specialty "Pharmacy".

Strengths/Best Practice None. EEC recommendations

✓·Develop and implement a system / mechanisms of career guidance work aimed at selecting applicants for training in the EP of doctoral studies in the specialty "Pharmacy"

EEC conclusions by criteria: (strong / satisfactory / suggests improvement / unsatisfactory)

Strong - 0
Satisfactory - 6 Suggesting
improvements - 1 Unsatisfactory - 0

6.4 PhD Doctorate Program Standard

Proof part

The NJSC "MUA" approved the Regulation "On training in PhD doctoral studies in NAO "MUA" (the latest version was approved by the rector on 04.02.2020, minutes of the decision of the Board No. 4).

Based on the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 20, 2011 No. 152 "On approval of the Rules for organizing the educational process on credit technology of education", as well as in accordance with the strategic goal of the University

"Improvement of educational programs" in NJSC "MUA" introduced modular training in all specialties. In this regard, Modular educational programs are formulated taking into account all competencies and skills, with reflected final learning outcomes in the form of Dublin descriptors, which must be mastered by a graduate of all levels of education.

Both universal and professional competencies and the skills of a Ph.D. are reflected in the Regulations on the competence model of a PhD graduate of NJSC "MUA" PL-MUA-122. Universal competences are common to all levels of education. Professional competencies - focused on the specialty. To form these competencies, the skills prescribed in the SES were taken into account. Competencies are reflected in modular educational programs, syllabuses.

Dissertation work in the specialty "Pharmacy" at the University it is planned to be carried out under the guidance of a consulting team, consisting of at least 2 people - domestic and foreign scientific consultants with academic degrees of candidate or doctor of science, who are specialists in the field of doctoral research. Scientific consultants and topics of dissertation work are approved at a meeting of the Academic Council of the University. According to the "Regulations on doctoral studies in NJSC" MUA ", the functions and responsibilities of a scientific advisor are defined, who also performs the functions of an academic mentor (adviser), providing advisory assistance to a doctoral student in the formation of an IEP.

The teaching staff of the university has the freedom to choose the methods and forms of organizing and conducting training sessions, teaching methods, subject to the requirements of curricula and curricula .

The teaching staff at the University are regularly trained in the methodology of scientific research, to improve teaching skills; own modern interactive teaching methods and technologies, use them in the educational process.

In order to ensure the significance of the research work of the future doctoral student for the development of a part of the educational component of the EP and conducting research in the RUE, an internship is planned in foreign educational and scientific institutions 1 time during the training period. To date, NJSC "MUA" has concluded agreements with leading educational and scientific organizations, including universities of the near and far abroad.

Elective courses have a professional focus, which makes it possible for students to have an individual educational trajectory of learning (4 trajectories are proposed), that is, taking into account their scientific and practical specialization.

State certification of future doctoral students is planned in the form of comprehensive testing, then - the defense of doctoral dissertations in a dissertation council in medical universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Analytical part

According to the standard "PhD doctoral program" EP doctoral studies in the specialty

"Pharmacy" at the University is developed in accordance with the State Compulsory Standard of Postgraduate Education.

The objectives of the educational program of doctoral studies in the specialty "Pharmacy" are the preparation of domestic highly qualified scientific and pedagogical personnel, competitive both within the country and on the international labor market; integration of national doctoral programs into the global educational space.

Strengths/Best Practice None. EEC recommendations

✓·Present the developed EP of doctoral studies in the specialty "Pharmacy" to external experts / reviewers from among the leading experts from the near or far abroad.

✓·In accordance with the principles of equality in the implementation of educational programs at the University, to develop a Guidebook for students in the EP of doctoral studies.

✓·Develop a Guidebook for students in the EP of doctoral studies (this is my version instead of the previous one).

✓·To include in the EP of doctoral studies in the specialty "Pharmacy" the discipline on the ethics of scientific research.

✓·Develop a program for monitoring processes and results, including routine (my version is systematic) collecting data on key aspects of the doctoral study program in order to ensure the quality of the educational process, identifying areas requiring intervention.

✓·Develop mechanisms for the regular assessment of program quality, including feedback from academic advisors, employers and doctoral students.

✓·Develop mechanisms for providing access to the results of assessing the quality of the educational program for all stakeholders .

EEC conclusions by criteria: (strong / satisfactory / suggest improvements / unsatisfactory) - 24 parameters

strong - 0

satisfactory - 18 suggest improvements - 6 unsatisfactory - 0

6.5 Scientific guidance standard

Proof part

The teaching staff of the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines of NJSC "MUA" has a 100% degree of degree. Leading professors and associate professors of the department are planned as leaders of PhD doctoral dissertations in the specialty "Pharmacy" in NJSC "MUA", as scientific consultants at the department received written perpetual agreements for scientific leadership and consulting from leading experts from near and far abroad.

NJSC “MUA” regularly conducts training courses for scientific leaders on the policy of implementing doctoral programs in the framework of the development of scientific potential in accordance with the Concept of development of research activities.

In NJSC “MUA”, seminars on “Management of scientific research” are held annually with the invitation of foreign specialists, at which the University staff are trained. The subject of the seminars is the processes of organizing and developing scientific research in the health care system and medical education.

In order to increase the level of professional and pedagogical competence of teaching staff and the introduction of new educational technologies, the Center for the Transfer of Educational Technologies regularly conducts training seminars with the invitation of foreign specialists.

In order to improve the quality of knowledge in the field of their professional competence, the library provides access to information resources and databases for scientific leaders, the costs of which are compensated by the University. Scientific supervisors are systematically informed through the corporate website of the University and personal e-mail about grant competitions in the country and abroad, as well as about conferences held by profile, about journals indexed by

Thomson Reuters, which accept quality articles free of charge, where they can publish the results of their research both in educational and scientific activities.

Currently, the University has agreements on cooperation in the field of education and science with leading universities and scientific organizations of our Republic, near and far abroad. On the territory of the Republic, agreements have been concluded with the West Kazakhstan State Medical University named after Marat Ospanova, Aktobe; with the South Kazakhstan Medical Academy, Shymkent;

Kazakh National Medical University named after S. D. Asfendiyarov, Almaty, Karaganda Medical University and others.

The university also has unlimited contracts with the largest universities in the near and far abroad: Tashkent Pharmaceutical Institute, dated 03.19.2019, No. 23.124-1409 (for 3 years), St. Petersburg State Chemical and Pharmaceutical Academy, dated 05.03.2015 (for 5 years), Kyrgyz State Medical Academy. I.K. Akhunbaeva, dated 12.03.2019, No. 23.124-1405 (for 3 years), Tajik State Medical University named after Abuali Ibni Sino, 04.2017 (for 3 years), Bashkir State Medical University, from 05.03.2019 (for 5 years), Medical University of Lublin, Poland, etc.

An agreement on cooperation was signed with JSC "International Scientific and Production Holding" Phytochemistry ".

Analytical part

To provide scientific and methodological assistance while working on his thesis, control over the execution of the work, but also, in case of need, for psychological support, making recommendations on about doctoral students participate in the learning process of each future doctoral students is planned for 2 months after his admission to appoint scientific advisor from among the teaching staff of the Department of Pharmaceutical Disciplines and a scientific consultant from among the leading experts in the near and far abroad in the field of pharmacy.

The possibilities of expanding foreign internships for future doctoral students are considered on the basis of further strengthening ties with foreign educational organizations and healthcare organizations, using the experience of foreign countries, including the possibility of forming joint educational doctoral programs. The possibilities of participation of practical healthcare in the field of pharmacy in the development of educational programs in elective disciplines for future doctoral students are also considered.

Strengths / Best Practice

- Leading scientists from near and far abroad are involved as co-directors or scientific consultants of doctoral dissertations in the specialty "Pharmacy" in accordance with agreements and memorandums of cooperation between educational organizations, including written consent of leading foreign specialists with the obligation to provide scientific advice for the entire period of study (3 years) future doctoral students regardless of the year of admission.
- When choosing scientific supervisors and scientific consultants for future doctoral students at the Faculty of Pharmacy, they are guided by the following policy: the scientific supervisor and scientific consultant must have high professional competencies, therefore, it is planned to involve professors and associate professors with a scientific degree (doctor or candidate of science, doctor PhD).

EEC conclusions by criteria: (strong / satisfactory / suggest improvements / unsatisfactory) - 7 parameters

strong - 3

satisfactory - 4 suggest

improvements - 0 unsatisfactory - 0

6.6 Management and Administration Standard

Proof part

According to the structure, the main structural divisions involved in the direct implementation of the EP of doctoral studies are specialized departments and the Center for Master's and Doctoral Studies (hereinafter - CMD). For the effective functioning of all structures, the relevant Regulations have been developed that determine the interactions of various departments, including on the implementation of the EP. The CMD is directly responsible for the organization and implementation of the educational process, the functioning of the EP. According to the organizational structure of NJSC "MUA" CMD is under the supervision of the vice-rector for scientific work.

The issues of improving the EP are considered and discussed at the commission for academic and scientific work and submitted for approval by the Senate. The divisions involved in ensuring the improvement of the educational program are presented on the University website http://MUA.kz in the Corporate Governance section.

At the University, conducting training on EP doctoral studies in the specialty

"Pharmacy" is planned to be carried out in a scientific and pedagogical direction, which is due to the need to train personnel not only for practical healthcare, but also for pharmaceutical education.

CMD and departments are the main educational and scientific structural units of the University, carrying out educational, methodological and research work in one or several related / related disciplines, educational work among students, as well as training scientific and pedagogical personnel. The departments are directly subordinate to the supervising dean's office. The tasks of the department are the implementation of educational, educational, methodological, educational and research work and the continuous improvement of the quality of educational services provided .

The main functions of the CMD are:

-Formation of skills of independent research and teaching activities of undergraduates, PhD doctoral students and control of its implementation in accordance with the approved individual curricula ;

-Exercise control over the organization and progress of educational work, on keeping records of the contingent of students and their progress, attending classes, analyzing exam results, developing proposals for improving the organization of the educational process and improving the quality of teaching of undergraduates, PhD doctoral students ;

-Interaction with other departments of the University in accordance with the curriculum, organization and control in accordance with the schedule of classes.

The resources for the implementation of the EP of doctoral studies comply with the norms for calculating the cost of education for one student in higher educational institutions of the Republic of Kazakhstan on a state educational order. Funding for doctoral programs is carried out in accordance with regulatory documents.

Sources of funding are budgetary and extrabudgetary funding (state educational order, income from the provision of paid educational services, implementation of research and development work and other work that do not contradict the legislation, international funds, organizations, grants, etc.).

The norms of expenses for PhD doctorates who are on internship, expenses associated with a stay in a foreign country during a business trip have been determined. The budget funds have been determined, intended to reimburse the costs of the internship (field trip): for doctoral students: up to 3 months, no more than 2 times for the entire period of study.

Analytical part

Management of KSMU is determined by the developed Management Structure, which is updated as needed, which ensures the efficiency of the university as a whole and the implementation of mechanisms for improving the EP. The latest approved version of the

management structure is posted for the acquaintance of university staff on the corporate portal (https://portal.kgmu.kz).

According to the structure, the main structural divisions involved in the direct implementation of the EP of doctoral studies are the structures of the Faculty Council (departments and dean's offices). For the effective functioning of all the structures are developed corresponding provisions of, defining the interaction of various departments, in that among other things, on the implementation of OP.

Strengths / Best Practice None. EEC recommendations

✓·Structural unit responsible for educational programs

Doctoral studies - the Center for Master's and Doctoral Studies - **should** revise the Regulations on the unit, in which to develop clear functions and powers for planning and implementing educational programs for postgraduate training of highly qualified scientific and pedagogical personnel - PhD doctors.

✓Center for Master's and Doctoral Studies to develop a clear mechanism for assessing the educational program of doctoral studies with the involvement of external experts / reviewers from leading educational organizations and practical health care / practical pharmacy.

✓ Center for Master's and Doctoral Studies to develop a mechanism for revising the EP with the aim of modifying it based on feedback from the public and society as a whole.

✓·The Master and Doctorate Center to develop mechanisms to ensure proper management and allocation of resources.

✓·Develop a system / mechanisms for information exchange, collaboration with a view to expanding and active collaboration with the health sector

EEC conclusions by criteria: (strong / satisfactory / suggest improvements / unsatisfactory) - 27 parameters.

strong - 0

satisfactory - 18 suggest improvements - 9 unsatisfactory - 0

(V) REVIEW Strengths / BEST PRACTICES FOR EVERYONE STANDARD

7.1 Standard "Mission and learning outcomes "

- The presence in the university institutional autonomy in relation to the development of educational programs
- Availability of a Strategic Plan for the Development of EP doctoral studies in specialty "8D10104 - Pharmacy", approved on 12.02.2020 by the Council of the Faculty of Pharmacy and creating the possibility of a variety of training areas (4 individual trajectories) for doctoral students

7.2 Standard "Research environment and educational resources"

- High professional level of the teaching staff of the university, planned to participate in the implementation of the EP doctoral studies in the specialty "Pharmacy"
- An effective system of incentives and motivation for teaching staff at the University
- Involvement of leading experts from near and far abroad in scientific consulting for doctoral students

7.5 Scientific Guidance Standard

- Leading scientists from near and far abroad are involved as co-directors or scientific consultants of doctoral dissertations in the specialty "Pharmacy" in accordance with agreements and memorandums of cooperation between educational organizations, including written consent of leading foreign specialists with the obligation to provide scientific advice for the entire period of study (3 years) future doctoral students regardless of the year of admission.
- When choosing scientific supervisors and scientific consultants for future doctoral students at the Faculty of Pharmacy, they are guided by the following policy: the scientific supervisor and scientific consultant must have high professional competencies, therefore, it is planned to involve professors and associate professors with a scientific degree (doctor or candidate of science, doctor PhD).

(VI) OVERVIEW OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVEMENT OF QUALITY

8.1 Standard "Mission and learning outcomes "

No recommendation.

8.2 Standard "Research environment and educational resources"

✓ ❄☐·attract external funding for research in the field of practical pharmacy and medicine by identifying the most pressing problems of modern healthcare, developing topical topics of scientific and technical projects (STP), including with the participation of future doctoral students.

✓·Explore the possibilities and create joint EP of doctoral studies in the specialty "Pharmacy" with strategic partner universities to obtain the opportunity to award degrees from two universities.

✓·Create a research laboratory separate from the educational process at the undergraduate degree, determine a list of relevant modern equipment necessary for future doctoral students in the implementation of research work on topical topics of applied importance.

✓·Provide mechanisms for maintaining equipment at the required level, as well as mechanisms for updating and improving the material and technical base of the department of pharmaceutical disciplines.

✓·Provide access for future doctoral students in the EP specialty "Pharmacy" to the research center and public laboratories.

✓·Ensure admission of future doctoral students to VPN-resources for information support, corresponding to the goals and objectives of the doctoral program.

8.3 Standard "Policy and admission criteria"

✓·Develop and implement a system / mechanisms of vocational guidance work aimed at the selection of applicants for training in the EP of doctoral studies in the specialty "Pharmacy"

8.4 Standard "PhD Doctorate Program"

✓·Present the developed EP of doctoral studies in the specialty "Pharmacy" to external experts / reviewers from among the leading experts from the near or far abroad.

✓·In accordance with the principles of equality in the implementation of educational programs TO Y n and a f p with itete p and sp and bot and be Ref ABO h n , and to - n y t Euodias rer to about b y ca yuschi x with I on OP up to Toran t y ry.

✓·To include in the EP of doctoral studies in the specialty "Pharmacy" the discipline on the ethics of scientific research.

✓·Develop a program for monitoring processes and results, including the routine collection of data on key aspects of the doctoral study program in order to ensure the quality of the educational process, and identify areas requiring intervention.

✓·Develop mechanisms for the regular assessment of program quality, including feedback from academic advisors, employers and doctoral students.

✓·Develop mechanisms for providing access to the results of assessing the quality of the educational program for all stakeholders.

8.5 Standard "Scientific guidance"

No recommendation.

8.6 Standard "Management and Administration"

✓·The structural unit responsible for the educational programs of doctoral studies - the Center for Master's and Doctoral Studies - **should** revise the Regulations on the unit, in which to develop clear functions and powers for planning and implementing educational programs for postgraduate training of highly qualified scientific and pedagogical personnel - PhD doctors .

✓ Center for Master's and Doctoral Studies to develop a clear mechanism for assessing the educational program of doctoral studies with the involvement of external experts / reviewers from leading educational organizations and practical health care / practical pharmacy.

✓ Center for Master's and Doctoral Studies to develop a mechanism for revising the EP with the aim of modifying it based on feedback from the public and society as a whole.

✓·The Master and Doctorate Center to develop mechanisms to ensure proper management and allocation of resources.

✓·Develop a system / mechanisms for information exchange, collaboration with a view to expanding and active collaboration with the health sector

X. RECOMMENDATION TO THE ACCREDITATION BOARD

Appendix 1. SPECIALIZED PROFILE PARAMETERS
8D10104 "Pharmacy" Primary specialized accreditation

No. P \ P	CRITERIA FOR EVALUATION	Position of the educational organization			
		strong	Satisfactory	suggests improvements	Unsatisfactory
1.	**"MISSION AND LEARNING OUTCOMES"**				
1.1	**Definition of the mission of the educational program**				
1.1.1	The medical education organization **must** determine the mission of the educational program and bring it to the attention of stakeholders and the health sector.		+		
1.1.2	The medical education organization **must** ensure that the main stakeholders are involved in the development (formulation) mission of the educational program.		+		
1.1.3	The medical education organization **must** ensure that the stated mission includes public health problems, the needs of the medical care system and other aspects. social responsibility.		+		

1.1.4	The medical education organization **must** ensure that the mission of the educational program corresponds to the mission of the organization and allows the preparation of a competent researcher at the level postgraduate medical education.		+		
1.1.5	The mission statement **should** contain goals and educational strategy to prepare a competent scientist, researcher in the level of postgraduate medical education.		+		
1.1.6	Mission of the educational program **:** –**Should be** consistent with available resources, opportunities and market requirements ; –ways to support it **should** be identified ; –access to information on the mission of the medical education organization / educational program for the public **should** be provided (availability of information on the website of the university).		+		
1.1.7	The mission and goals of the educational program **should** discussed at the advisory councils / commissions of the university and approved by the advisory council of the university.		+		
1.1.8	The medical education organization **must** systematically collect, accumulate and analyze information on their activities in preparation for the implementation of the doctoral program; conduct an assessment of strengths and weaknesses (SWOT- analysis), on the basis of which the leadership of the medical education organization, together with the advisory board, should determine the policy and develop strategic and tactical plans		+		
1.2	**Institutional autonomy and academic freedom**				
1.2.1	Medical education organization that implements educational programs of doctoral studies **must** have institutional autonomy for the development and implementation of policies for which the responsibility of the faculty and administration, especially with regard to:	+			
1.2.1.1	development of an educational program;	+			
1.2.1.2	use of the dedicated resources required for the implementation of the educational program.		+		
1.2.2	Medical education organization ***should*** guarantee academic freedom to its employees and future doctoral students:		+		
1.2.2.1	in relation to the current educational program, in which it will be allowed to rely on different points of view in the description and analysis of issues in accredited specialties;		+		
1.2.2.2	in the possibility of using the results of new research to improve the study of specific disciplines / questions without expanding the educational program.		+		
1.3	**Learning outcomes**				
1.3.1	The medical education organization **must** determine the expected final learning outcomes that doctoral students will have to show after completion of the doctoral program.		+		

1.3.2	The medical educational organization must ensure that doctoral studies with the award of a PhD degree , a doctor in the profile will provide future doctoral students with the competence that will allow them to become a qualified researcher capable of conducting independent scientific research in accordance with the principles of best research practice (good research practice).		+		
1.3.3	Completion of the doctoral program **should** have a potential benefit for those who pursue careers outside the medical organization and apply their competencies formed during the development of the doctoral program, including critical analysis, assessment and solving difficult problems, the ability to transfer new technologies and the synthesis of new ideas.		+		
1.3.4	Medical education organization / scientific		+		
	the organization ***should*** ensure that the renewal and restructuring process results in the modification of graduate learning outcomes in line with the responsibilities that are assigned to graduates after graduation doctoral programs.				
	Total: 18 parameters	**2**	**16**		
2.	**Standard "SCIENTIFIC AND RESEARCH ENVIRONMENT AND EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES "**				
2.1	**Research environment**				
2.1.1	The success of individual doctoral programs **must** be ensured by the organization of a strong and effective research environment. The quality of the research environment **should** be assessed by analyzing:		+		
2.1.2	publication of research results (number of publications, impact factor , etc.) by profile doctoral studies in a medical educational organization / scientific organization.		+		
2.1.3	the level of attracting external funding for research in medical educational organization / scientific organization.			+	
2.1.4	number of qualified and competent researchers, teachers in a group, at a faculty, an educational institution.	+			
2.1.5	national and international collaboration with medical research groups organizations, universities, scientific research centers.		+		
2.1.6	Presence in the medical organizations of education procedures / systems comply with the ethics of scientific research		+		
2.1.7	opportunities to provide access to the funds needed to write a dissertation, doctoral programs ***may*** include study at other laboratories, preferably in another country, thus ensuring internationalization.	+			
2.1.8	Medical education organization ***should*** explore the possibilities of providing joint doctoral programs with degrees from both universities and joint leadership to support cooperation between higher education institutions.			+	
2.1.9	The medical education organization ***should*** ensure that the process of updating educational resources will be carried out in accordance with changing needs, such as the recruitment of doctoral students, the number and profile academic staff, doctoral program.		+		

2.1.10	Medical education organization ***should*** provide sufficient autonomy in the allocation of resources, including procedures aimed at decent remuneration	+			
	teachers in achieving final results learning.				
2.2	**Material and technical base**				
	The medical educational organization / scientific organization **must** have the material and technical support corresponding to the licensed indicators that include criteria:				
2.2.1	auditoriums, laboratories and their equipment **must** be modern and adequate to the goals and objectives doctoral programs;			+	
2.2.2	conditions for the implementation of self-study and research work of future doctoral students;		+		
2.2.3	renewal and improvement of material technical base **should be** carried out regularly.			+	
2.2.4	The medical education organization **must** have sufficient resources for the proper implementation of the doctoral program to ensure: admission of doctoral students, organizing training in the doctoral program, performing dissertation work, scientific advice to doctoral students, consideration, peer review and assessment dissertation, operating costs, expenses for participation in training courses, in international scientific conferences, payment of tuition fees for doctoral studies in institutions where it is practiced. scholarships for doctoral students in terms of variation in the size of the scholarship.		+		
2.2.5	Resource policy **should** be aimed at maintaining and ensuring continuous professional growth of program teachers doctoral studies.		+		
2.2.6	The medical education organization **must** have a service and support service for future doctoral students, including a receptionist office, research centers and laboratories, a canteen, a canteen, a medical center, sports grounds and halls.			+	
2.2.7	The medical education organization **must** provide a safe environment for employees, doctoral students, including those who ensure the implementation of the program, patients, if provided by the study, and those who care for them, including providing the necessary information and protection from harmful substances, microorganisms, compliance with the rules of technology safety in the laboratory and in the use of equipment		+		
2.2.8	Medical education organization ***should*** identify processes aimed at improving the learning environment of future doctoral students through			+	
	regular renewal, expansion and strengthening of the material and technical base, which should correspond to the development in teaching practice.				

2.3	**Information Technology**				
2.3.1	A medical educational organization / scientific organization **must** have information support that corresponds to the goals and objectives doctoral programs:		+		
2.3.2	The library **should** contain the materials necessary for training - educational, technical, scientific and reference literature, various periodical medical publications, etc.;		+		
2.3.3	The medical education organization **must** ensure that future doctoral students will have timely and free access to library resources.		+		
2.3.4	The library **should** have the basic technical equipment to support day-to-day operations: fax machines, photocopiers, computers, printers available for public use, and a telephone with voicemail or answering machine.		+		
2.3.5	The library **should** have an informational website. The website may contain the following elements: links, interlibrary forms, full text e-journal articles, and a contact form.			+	
2.3.6	The medical education organization **should** regularly monitor library resources, study and implement strategies to meet the existing and future needs of doctoral students, including on the basis of applications from departments and faculties, and the amount of funds, allocated for the purchase of educational, methodological, scientific literature.		+		
2.3.7	The medical education organization **must** ensure that the use of doctoral students will be provided with computer classes and terminals with access to information resources (local area network, Internet).		+		
2.3.8	A medical education institution **should** provide for a mechanism for monitoring the availability and adequate use of information resources by future doctoral students.		+		
2.3.9	The medical education **should** be carried out continuous updating, improving and expanding base of information resources, with access to doctoral modern electronic databases, including to foreign databases (Thomson Reuters (the Web of Science , by Thomson Reuters The) Scopus' , Pubmed , Elsevier, etc.).		+		
2.3.10	The medical education organization **must**		+		

	open and constantly update on its website a section on doctoral programs that will open in the new academic year, containing the following information: –structure and staff of the doctoral department, duties of the head and employees of the department; –admission policy, including clear rules on the selection process for doctoral students; –list of doctoral programs; –structure, duration and content of doctoral programs; –criteria for the appointment of a scientific advisor, outlining the characteristics, responsibilities and qualifications of the scientific advisor; –methods used to assess doctoral students; –description of the work of the State Attestation Commission; –criteria for the design and writing of a thesis; –description of the procedure for defending a dissertation work; – description of the activities of the Dissertation Council (position, composition), if there is one, in the absence of a Dissertation Council in the specialty at the university - model rules for awarding academic degrees / model regulation on the Dissertation Council; –program for quality assurance and regular evaluation of the doctoral program .				
	Total: 28 parameters	**3**	**18**	**7**	
3.	**Standard "POLICY AND RECEPTION CRITERIA"**				
3.1	The medical education organization **must** establish the relationship between the selection of doctoral students and the mission of the medical education organization, the educational program and the requirements of the labor market.		+		
3.2	The medical education organization / scientific organization **must** determine and implement a policy of admission, including a clearly established provision on selection process for doctoral students.		+		
3.3	The medical education institution **must** have a system / mechanisms of career guidance work aimed at selecting applicants for the selected specialties of doctoral studies.			+	
3.4	The medical education organization **must** determine the structure responsible for organizing the admission and selection of doctoral students, developed and approved rules / criteria for admission, based on the established model rules for admission to doctoral studies for higher educational institutions, disseminating information for a wide the public.		+		
3.5	In the selection of future doctoral students ***should*** evaluate research potential of the applicant, and not just		+		
	take into account his academic performance.				
3.6	In a medical educational organization, there **should** be a system for studying employment, demand, career support and continuous professional improvement future graduates.		+		

3.7	The medical education organization ***should*** ensure that the process of updating and restructuring leads to an adaptation of the admission policy for doctoral students, taking into account changing expectations and circumstances, human resource needs, changes in the postgraduate education system and needs of the program.		+		
	Total: 7 parameters	**-**	**6**	**1**	
4	**DOCTORATE PROGRAM standard**				
4.1	**Model of the educational program, methods learning and structure**				
4.1.1	The medical education organization must ensure that the educational program is developed on the basis of an integrated, comprehensive, competence-based approach, using modular training technologies, and is positively evaluated by external experts / reviewers.			+	
4.1.2	The medical education organization must determine the goal and objectives of the doctoral educational program, which are aimed at achieving mission organization of education / educational program and learning outcomes.		+		
4.1.3	The medical education organization must ensure that the content of the educational program meets the requirements of the State Educational Standard and the standard curriculum of the relevant specialty and is developed taking into account the needs labor market.		+		
4.1.4	The medical education organization must ensure the implementation of the educational program with the appropriate working curricula, academic calendar, curriculum for disciplines, forms of the individual curriculum of future doctoral students and an individual plan doctoral student work.		+		
4.1.5	The doctoral program must provide for the performance of original research, which requires analytical and critical thinking, to be carried out under scientific leadership.		+		
4.1.6	The medical education organization must ensure that the educational program will be implemented in accordance with the principles equality.			+	
4.1.7	The medical education organization must provide mechanisms to guarantee fulfillment of obligations by future doctoral students in relation to doctors, teachers, patients and their relatives in accordance with the Code Conduct / Code of Honor.		+		
4.1.8	The doctoral program must guarantee teaching doctoral students the rules of ethics and responsible research			+	
4.1.9	The medical education organization must determine the teaching and learning methods, appropriate to the educational program and achievement of the competencies of students.		+		

4.1.10	The doctoral program must be structured with a clear time limit equivalent to 3 years full time and contain: theoretical training, including the study of cycles of basic and major disciplines; practical training of doctoral students - various types of practices, scientific internships; research work, including the implementation of a doctoral dissertation for scientific and pedagogical doctoral studies; experimental research work, including the implementation of a doctoral dissertation for specialized doctoral studies; intermediate and final certification.		+		
4.1.11	The medical education organization should provide for mechanisms for the implementation of pedagogical practice (in accordance with the type of doctoral studies) for the formation of doctoral students' practical skills and teaching methods.		+		
4.1.12	The medical education organization should provide mechanisms for the implementation of research practice for the formation of doctoral students' knowledge, skills, competencies in the field of the latest theoretical, methodological and technological achievements of domestic and foreign science, modern methods of scientific research, processing and interpretation experimental data.		+		
4.1.13	The medical education organization should provide for mechanisms for the implementation of industrial practice (in accordance with the type of doctoral studies) for the formation of doctoral students on the basis of theoretical knowledge of practical skills, competencies and professional experience in the specialty taught, as well as mastering advanced experience.		+		
4.1.14	The medical education organization must ensure that doctoral students will be provided with the opportunity for additional training during the vacation period in the presence of academic debt, desire to develop additional credits		+		
4.1.15	An appeal mechanism should be developed in the medical education organization, allowing future doctoral students to review the decision regarding their achievements in educational programs.		+		
4.2	**Doctoral Program Evaluation**				
4.2.1	The medical education organization must have a program for monitoring processes and results, including the routine collection of data on key aspects of the educational program. The purpose of monitoring is to ensure the quality of the educational process, to identify areas that require interventions.			+	
4.2.2	The medical education organization must have approved mechanisms for the regular assessment of the quality of the program, including feedback from scientific consultants, employers and doctoral students.			+	

4.2.3	The medical education organization should have mechanisms aimed at systematic collection, analysis of feedback and its provision to teachers and doctoral students, which will include information on the process and products of the educational program, including unfair practice or improper behavior of teachers or doctoral students.		+		
	The medical education organization should ensure that the process of updating and restructuring the program will be regularly and aimed at:				
4.2.4	adapting the curriculum model and teaching methodology to ensure that they are appropriate and appropriate;		+		
4.2.5	adjusting the elements of the program and their relationship in accordance with advances in medical sciences, with changes in the demographic situation and state health / morbidity structure of the population and socio-economic, cultural conditions.		+		
4.3	**Engaging stakeholders**				
4.3.1	The medical education organization must ensure that the teaching staff, doctoral students, administrative and managerial staff will be involved in the monitoring program and activities for evaluating the educational program. staff, employers		+		
4.3.2	The medical education organization should ensure that other stakeholders are involved in the assessment process, including representatives of academic and administrative staff, representatives of the public, authorized bodies for education and healthcare, professional organizations, employers.		+		
4.3.3	Medical education organization should have mechanisms for providing access to results evaluation of the educational program of all stakeholders			+	
4.3.4	The medical education organization should ensure that the process of updating and restructuring will lead to an improvement in the monitoring and evaluation of the program in accordance with changes in the final results teaching and teaching and learning methods.		+		
	Total: 24 parameters	**-**	**18**	**6**	
five	**SCIENTIFIC GUIDANCE standard**				
5.1	The medical education organization must ensure that it will determine for each doctoral student scientific consultants (domestic and foreign)	+			
5.2	The medical education organization must have mechanisms / procedures governing the process of discussion and approval of the candidacy of the scientific consultant and the research topic of the doctoral student according to standard requirements and GOSO.	+			
5.3	The medical education organization must ensure that scientific consultants are selected from specialists with a scientific degree and are actively involved in scientific research in the field of science in the specialty of teaching a doctoral student.	+			

5.4	The medical education organization must have clearly formulated responsibilities and scientific advisor responsibility		+		
5.5	The medical education organization should plan and organize training courses for scientific advisers on implementation policy doctoral programs, the main responsibilities of scientific advisers.		+		
5.6	Medical education organization must have procedures / mechanisms / structures carrying out the organization, control of the scientific activities of future doctoral students on the implementation of dissertation research		+		
5.7	The medical education organization must determine, approve and publish the principles, methods and practices that will be used to evaluate doctoral students, including the evaluation criteria scientific work		+		
	Total: 7 parameters	**3**	**4**		
6	**GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION standard**				
6.1	**Program management**				
6.1.1	The management of a university / scientific organization **should** be effective and ensure the improvement of the educational program.		+		
6.1.2	Medical organization of education should ensure that training in doctoral studies carried out only in full-time		+		
6.1.3	The medical education organization must determine the structural unit responsible for educational programs and achievement final learning outcomes.		+		
6.1.4	The structural unit responsible for educational programs **should** have the authority to plan and implement the educational program , including the allocation of allocated resources for planning and implementing teaching and learning methods, assessment doctoral students, evaluation of the educational program and training courses.			+	
6.1.5	The medical education organization must guarantee the interaction of future doctoral students with the leadership on design issues, management and evaluation of doctoral programs.		+		
6.1.6	The medical education organization should encourage and facilitate the involvement of future doctoral students in the process of developing educational programs for the training of doctoral students, for which it is necessary to provide appropriate procedures.		+		
6.1.7	The structural unit responsible for educational programs **should** ensure the transparency of the management system and the decisions made that are published in the bulletins, posted on the website of the university, included in the protocols for review and execution.		+		
6.1.8	The medical education organization ***should,*** through the structural unit responsible for educational programs, plan and implement innovations in the educational program.		+		

6.1.9	Medical education organization representatives from other relevant stakeholders ***should be*** included in the structural unit of the medical education organization responsible for educational programs, including other participants in the educational process, representatives from clinical bases, graduates of medical education organizations , health professionals involved in the training process or other teachers of the university faculties ...		+		
	Medical education organization **should** ensure that the structural unit responsible for the educational program:				
6.1.10	takes into account the peculiarities of the conditions in which graduates will have to work and modify the educational program accordingly.		+		
6.1.11	considers the modification of the educational program based on feedback from the public and society as a whole.			+	
6.1.12	Medical education organization / scientific the organization should ensure that the process of renewal and restructuring leads to improvements in the organizational structure and management principles of the PhD doctoral program to ensure effective performance in the face of changing circumstances and needs, and, in the long term, to meet the interests of various groups, stakeholders in the context of changing circumstances and needs ...		+		
6.2	**Academic leadership**				
6.2.1	The medical education organization **must** clearly define the responsibility of the academic leadership in relation to the development and management educational program		+		
6.2.2	Medical education organization **should** periodically assess academic leadership against the achievement of its mission and learning outcomes.		+		
6.3	**Training budget and resource allocation**				
	The medical education organization **must**				
6.3.1	have clear terms of reference and authority for providing the educational program with resources, including the target budget for training.		+		
6.3.2	plan and allocate resources necessary for the implementation of the educational program and allocate educational resources in accordance with their needs.		+		
6.3.3	The financing system of a medical education institution should be based on the principles of efficiency, effectiveness, priority, transparency, responsibility, differentiation and independence of all levels of budgets.		+		
6.3.4	Financial and administrative policies **should** be aimed at improving the quality of the educational program.		+		
	The medical education organization **should:**				
6.3.5	provide sufficient autonomy in the allocation of resources, including decent remuneration of teachers in order of achievement final learning outcomes;		+		

6.3.6	when allocating resources, take into account scientific advances in medicine and problems public health and their needs.		+			
6.4	**Administrative staff and management**					
	The medical education organization **must** have an appropriate administrative and academic staff, including their number and composition in accordance with qualifications, in order to:					
6.4.1	ensure the implementation of the educational program and related activities;				+	
6.4.2	ensure proper management and resource allocation.				+	
6.4.3	The medical educational organization / scientific organization **should** develop and implement an internal program for quality assurance of management, including consideration of needs for improvement, and conduct a regular review and analysis of management.				+	
6.4.4	A medical educational organization / scientific organization **must** ensure the implementation of the PhD doctoral program in accordance with a quality management system certified by independent organizations.				+	
6.5	**Interaction with the health sector**					
6.5.1	A medical education organization **must** have constructive interaction with the health sector, with related health sectors of society and government, including the exchange of information, cooperation and initiatives of the organization, which contributes to the provision of qualified specialists in according to the needs of society				+	
6.5.2	The medical education organization **should** provide an operational link between the educational program and the subsequent stages of professional training				+	
6.5.3	The medical education organization should be given a formal status of cooperation with partners in the health sector, which includes the conclusion of formal agreements defining the content and forms of cooperation and / or the conclusion of a joint contract and the creation of a coordinating committee, and holding joint events				+	
	Total: 27 parameters			**18**	**9**	
	Total: 111 parameters	**8**		**80**	**23**	

Appendix 2. PROGRAM of THE visit TO the EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATION

Appendix 3. THE RESULTS OF THE SURVEY OF TEACHERS

Appendix 4. RESULTS of the STUDENT QUESTIONNAIRE