

## Accreditation Report and Recommendation

### Accreditation at

### L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University (ENU)

5B050600 – Economics (Bachelor), 5B050700 – Management (Bachelor), 6M050600 – Economics (Scientific and Pedagogical Master), 6M050600 – Economics (Profile Master), 6M050700 – Management (Scientific and Pedagogical Master), 6M050700 – Management (Profile Master), 6D051700 – Innovative Management (Ph.D.)

### I Procedure

**Date of contract:** 7<sup>th</sup> September 2017

**Receipt of self-evaluation report:** 6<sup>th</sup> November 2017

**Date of the on-site-visit:** 12<sup>th</sup>-16<sup>th</sup> November 2017

**Chairman of the expert group:** professor Vladimir Nikolayevich Kosov, Doctor of Physical and Mathematical Sciences, Abai Kazakh National Pedagogical University

**Attendance by ACQUIN:** Dr. Stefan Handke and Nina Soroka

**Attendance by IAAR:** Timur Yerbolatovich Kanapyanov, Manager of International Projects and Public Relations, IAAR (Astana)

### **Members of the expert group:**

- Professor Dr. Victor J. Randall, Coburg University of Applied Sciences and Arts, Department of Business Administration

**Compilation of the report:** December 2017

- Professor Dr. Marjana Merkač Skok, Gea College, Faculty of Entrepreneurship, Dean and Professor of Management and Organizational Behavior
- Gulvira Sovetbekovna Akyibaeva, Candidate of Economic Sciences, Karaganda State University named after E.A. Buketov
- Professor Parida Bakirovna Isakhova, Doctor of Economic Sciences, Almaty Management University
- Svetlana Vladimirovna Peregudova, 2<sup>nd</sup> year Master student of the study programme 6M050700 – Management at Kazakh University of Economics, Finance and International Trade

The **evaluation report** of the expert group is based on the self-evaluation documentation of the higher education institution and extensive discussions with the heads of the study programmes, faculty members, students, and employers.

The **evaluation criteria** are based on the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG<sup>1</sup>) in the official version valid at the time the contract is concluded. At the same time the national context, particularly the national rules regulating the establishment of study programmes, has been taken into account<sup>2</sup>.

*The applicant will receive the report in parts I-III to comment on it. Part IV entitled Recommendations for the Accreditation will be received by the relevant and responsible Standing Expert Committee and Accreditation Commission only.*

---

<sup>1</sup><http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/P1200001080>

<sup>2</sup><http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/P1200001080>

## Table of Contents

1. Initial Situation .....	5
2. Outcomes of the first accreditation .....	6
3. Description of the facts and assessment (in accordance with ESG).....	7
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance .....	7
<i>Description</i> .....	7
<i>Conclusion</i> .....	10
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes.....	11
<i>General principles and objectives</i> .....	11
<i>Description of the study programmes in Management (Bachelor, Master, and Ph.D.)</i> .....	13
<i>Assessment</i> .....	14
<i>Description of the study programmes in Economics (Bachelor and Master)</i> .....	24
<i>Assessment</i> .....	28
<i>Conclusion</i> .....	31
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.3: Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment .....	32
<i>Assessment</i> .....	32
<i>Conclusion</i> .....	38
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition and certification .....	38
<i>Assessment</i> .....	38
<i>Conclusion</i> .....	40
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.5: Teaching staff .....	41
<i>Description of facts</i> .....	44
<i>Assessment</i> .....	45
<i>Conclusion</i> .....	45
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support.....	46
<i>Assessment</i> .....	46
<i>Conclusion</i> .....	49
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.7: Information management.....	50
<i>Assessment</i> .....	50
<i>Conclusion</i> .....	53
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.8: Public information .....	54
<i>Assessment</i> .....	54
<i>Conclusion</i> .....	58
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes .....	59
<i>Assessment</i> .....	59
<i>Conclusion</i> .....	61
ESG Part 1. Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance .....	62

<b>Assessment</b> .....	62
<b>Conclusion</b> .....	62
4. Recommendation for the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN and Accreditation Council of IAAR.....	63
Recommendation on accreditation .....	63

## 1. Initial Situation

The experts thank the organizers and the participating teachers and students whom they have met during the on-site visit in Astana for being available for discussions and providing information on programmes and higher education institution. This kind of participation is perceived as very valuable not only for the evaluation of the programmes but also for a better understanding of the legal, social, and cultural background of the higher education system of the Republic of Kazakhstan, particularly of L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University. The **evaluation of the expert group** is based on the self-evaluation report of the university and extensive discussions with the heads of the study programmes, faculty members, students, and employers as well as the depiction of university management during the on-site visit. The process of accreditation in Kazakhstan has a common goal of checking the quality of study programmes and their compliance with European standards. In the context of international accreditations in European Higher Education Area, the **key evaluation criteria** are the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) that are revised on a regular basis. In addition, the accreditation procedure must take into account the relevant legislative requirements of the state concerned. To this end, an expert group has been appointed to ensure that all issues related to the evaluation procedure are taken into account (for instance, technical considerations, structural and formal aspects as well as social factors). The certificate with the seal of ACQUIN is awarded based on accreditation of study programmes in Kazakhstan. The standing expert group consists of several academic field representatives as well as representatives of professional practice and students.

## **2. Outcomes of the first accreditation**

Study programmes Economics (Bachelor), Management (Bachelor), Economics (Scientific and Pedagogical Master), Economics (Profile Master), Management (Scientific and Pedagogical Master), and Management (Profile Master) were assessed and accredited by ACQUIN for the first time in 2012.

The conditions were fulfilled and the decision was made to accredit the study programmes until 30th September 2017. For the proper implementation of the ACQUIN re-accreditation procedure, the term of accreditation of study programmes Economics (Bachelor), Management (Bachelor), Economics (Scientific and Pedagogical Master), Economics (Profile Master), Management (Scientific and Pedagogical Master), Management (Profile Master) was tentatively extended until 30<sup>th</sup> September 2018.

***The study programme of doctoral studies Innovative Management (Ph.D.) is being accredited by NAAR and ACQUIN for the first time.***

### **3. Description of the facts and assessment (in accordance with ESG)**

The expert group assesses the quality of study programmes and their compliance with European standards (Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area - ESG). General statements contain information applicable to all programmes. Specific matters relevant to individual programmes are mentioned only in the case of deviations from general conclusions.

#### **Part 1. Standards and guidelines for internal quality assurance**

##### **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.1: Policy for quality assurance**

[Institutions should have a policy for quality assurance that is made public and forms part of their strategic management. Internal stakeholders should develop and implement this policy through appropriate structures and processes, while involving external stakeholders.]

##### ***Description***

The policy in the field of quality assurance of ENU is based on its mission, vision, and values; it is a part of the university strategic management and is implemented at all levels of the higher education institution. The policy on quality assurance is made available in the public domain and is accessible via ENU website and information stands of university departments as well as the electronic document management system. The heads of all university departments make the policy known to all stakeholders (by using various kinds of information spreading tools, for instance, clarifications are available at all levels). They are also responsible for planning, implementation, and improvement of quality within scope of their functional duties. All stakeholders are involved in quality assurance processes.

The university has its own Quality Assurance Department. It ensures the implementation of its quality policy and maintains and improves its Quality Management System. The university has successfully undergone the procedure of the QMS re-certification. The certificate of

compliance of QMS with ISO 9001:2008 Standards has been obtained. It is valid until September 2018.

In accordance with the requirements of the regulatory documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan, ISO 9001:2008 and university management processes, ENU has drafted internal regulatory documents that establish the mechanisms of the functioning of all educational processes.

The main provisions of the policy are detailed in the following documents: Academic Policy of the University, ENU Code of Business Ethics, Internal Quality Standards, Operational Plans for Chairs and Departments, Plans for the Development of Study Programmes, and Quality Assurance Procedures.

The Quality Policy (2017) emphasises the importance of a number of focus areas: internationalisation of education; principle of student-centeredness; involvement of students in quality assurance processes; academic mobility of students, faculty members, and university staff; cooperation with employers.

Quality assurance of modular study programmes is carried out based on internal and external evaluations. The internal quality assessment of study programmes is provided by representatives with substantive expertise, procedure for reviewing and approval of modular study programmes over the course of meetings of the department, Teaching and Methodological Commission of the faculty, Council of the faculty, Scientific and Methodological Council of the university as well as Academic Council of the university.

External assessment of the quality of study programmes is carried out through the final state examination of students, procedures of state attestation and institutional accreditation of the university as well as participation in national and international ratings of study programmes. Accreditation and rating results are made available to all interested parties, published in the media and posted on the website of external organisations. There are expert opinions on accredited study programmes. The objectives and competencies of study programmes are also available and published on the official website of the university.

The analysis of the self-assessment report as well as the results of meetings, held with undergraduate and graduate students and faculty members, has confirmed that the priorities for the development of study programmes currently undergoing the accreditation process are in line with the national policy in the field of education and are defined by the



requirements of the external environment (competition and demographic issues), resources (information and material resources) and labour market requirements.

To increase the motivation and responsibility of employees, to ensure the quality of performance, and to determine the contribution of each employee to the strategic and operational goals of the university in 2016, the KPI pilot project was implemented at ENU. It is based on the principles of objectivity, transparency, attainability, and measurability of indicators. This project received a positive assessment of the university. KPI results are available on the official website of ENU. In 2017, corrections and amendments were made to the automated KPI system that took into account proposals from faculty members, heads of departments, and deans.

One of the strategic directions of the ENU is "the formation of the university as a research centre in the Eurasian space". The Quality Policy reflects the link between research and training, which involves research and implementation of its results in the context of education. Teachers take an active part in competitions for scientific research grants announced by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan; thus, conducting initiative research. Young scientists, undergraduate and graduate students are involved in the implementation of scientific projects. Subjects of theses for Master and Doctoral students are determined by taking into account the subject of fundamental scientific research conducted by the teaching staff.

The policy supports values such as maintenance of academic honesty and freedom, and promotes prevention of protectionism, corruption, and discrimination. These values are reflected in the following documents: ENU Business Ethics Code, ENU Student Honour and Conduct Code, Rules of the Study Procedures, Procedure for Checking the Students' Theses against Plagiarism. If disputes arise when students take interim and final examinations, a special Appeals committee is created to address these issues; such committees are governed by the Regulations on Appeal.

Feedback from stakeholders is received through sociological surveys and questionnaires; independent experts are involved in these procedures.

The quality assurance policy also applies to the activities performed by contractors (outsourcing) on the following types of work at ENU: sociological studies conducted by outside

organisations, external audits, maintenance work and renovation of premises. The requirements for contractors are stated in the technical specification of the services in question.

Thus, Quality Management System allows ENU to comprehensively monitor the effectiveness of its activities in the field of education; it ensures continuous monitoring of the quality of training and management by both the senior staff of the university and users of its services.

Implementation of the Policy in the Field of Quality Assurance, functioning of the quality management system, internal and external assessment of the quality of educational programmes, upgrading the qualification and rating of the teaching staff, monitoring the quality of the services provided, analysing the educational resources and support systems for students with the aim of improving the material and technical base, and information resources contribute to the successful development and competitiveness of the university as well as its continuous improvement of the quality of the educational services provided.

Chairs that implement study programmes subject to this accreditation procedure carry out activities in accordance with the Policy in the Field of Quality Assurance. The goals of study programmes fully correspond to the mission, aims, and objectives of Eurasian National University and are available in the public domain.

All stakeholders participate in quality assurance processes and are responsible, within their competence, for the quality of the educational services provided.

### ***Conclusion***

**The group of experts concludes that Standard 1.1 of the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

### **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.2: Design and approval of programmes**

[Institutions should have processes for the design and approval of their programmes. The programmes should be designed so that they meet the objectives set for them, including the intended learning outcomes. The qualification resulting from a programme should be clearly specified and communicated and refer to the correct level of the national qualifications framework for higher education and, consequently, to the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.]

#### ***General principles and objectives***

Development of modular study programmes is carried out on the basis of normative documents of the Republic of Kazakhstan as well as requirements of international standards within the Bologna process. The structure and content of syllabi correspond to standard curriculums and a catalogue of elective disciplines.

Study programmes includes objectives, level of qualification, degree awarded, recognition of previous training, ways and methods of implementing the study programme, evaluation criteria for learning outcomes, key learning outcomes, main modules of the study programmes.

The objectives of study programmes are formulated in accordance with the programmes of the institutional strategy and are consistent with the mission of the university and the needs of society; they correspond to the 7 level of the National Qualifications Framework.

The Scientific and Pedagogical Master course contains theoretical training, pedagogical and research practice, research work of Master students and final state certification. The results of the training reflect the qualification levels and key competencies of the graduates.

In determining the objectives of the study programmes, the results of training and competences, the needs of stakeholders, the results of questioning of students and employers, the recommendations of foreign experts and accreditation agencies are taken into account (the results of the questionnaires are published on the ENU website).

The disciplines included in the curriculum of the Master programme (Scientific and Pedagogical Master course) have been developed in accordance with the European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System (ECTS). The content of the modules is well balanced, logically linked and focused on obtaining the expected learning outcomes.

When forming elective disciplines for purposes and content, labour market requirements, their correspondence with global development trends and science achievements, employers' requests and programme profile are taken into account. The Master programme focuses on the scientific-analytical and research aspects of education, students have academic freedom in conducting scientific activities and research in the chosen direction. Assessment of educational achievements and the level of preparation of graduates are provided with the use of a score and rating system.

The organisation and completion of all types of practices are carried out in accordance with the state compulsory educational standards of the Republic of Kazakhstan (please see Quality Management System. Procedure. Professional practice. PRO ENU 705-12). The programmes for gaining work experience have been developed for each type of internships. Over the course of the past two years, there has been a trend towards an increase in the conclusion of tripartite agreements for internships.

The university created conditions for the effective promotion of students on an individual educational trajectory, including consultations provided by a number of advisers, curators, and mentors. These conditions ensure the availability and effective functioning of the system of individual assistance and counselling of students on the issues of the educational process. The academic policy is available on ENU website and via the Platonus system; students have access to all educational and methodological information.

Thus, development and approval of the study programmes are carried out in accordance with the approved procedure outlined in the Instruction for the development and approval of study programmes at ENU (22-16). The availability of normative documentation and methodological guidance ensures transparency and effectiveness of the development, approval and implementation of study programmes. The study programmes correspond to the objectives and the expected learning outcomes. The qualification obtained as a result of the programme completion is clearly defined and explained; it also corresponds to a certain level

of the National Qualification Framework and, therefore, the Framework for Qualifications of the European Higher Education Area.

Positive changes in the content of study programmes undergoing the accreditation process over the past five years are as follows:

- a significant increase in the volume of elective subjects (up to 75% of the total theoretical education) which contributes to the expansion of academic freedom of Master students;
- active assistance of employers in the improvement of vocational education through the recommendations of the most relevant disciplines;
- expert assessment of implemented programmes is carried out by Kazakhstani and foreign partners;
- growth of the number of internships allows increasing the level of adaptation of graduates in the chosen field of professional activity.

### ***Description of the study programmes in Management (Bachelor, Master, and Ph.D.)***

The Faculty of Economics and the part of its structure Department of Management offers several programmes in the field of management (Bachelor, Master and Ph.D.).

The Bachelor study programme Management is a full-time course designed for 8 semesters, i.e. 4 years. Upon completion 240 ECTS credits are awarded. The programme was introduced in 2011; the previous accreditation is valid until 30.09.2017. Requirements for admission include secondary or vocational secondary education. Languages of instruction are Kazakh, Russian, and English. The graduates of the study programme Management are awarded a Bachelor of Economic Sciences. The current number of enrolled students amounts to 153.

The Master programme Management is offered in two directions and lasts either one or two years.

The study programme Management (Profile Master course, 1 year/2 semesters) is offered as a full-time course with 60 ECTS credits and was introduced in 2011. Previous accreditation is valid until 30.09.2017. A requirement for admission is a proof of completion of a higher education. The languages of instruction are Kazakh, Russian, and English. Upon successful

completion of the programme Management, a Master of Economics and Business is awarded.

The study programme Management (Scientific and Pedagogical Master course, 2 years/4 semesters) is offered as a full-time programme with 120 ECTS credits. It was introduced in 2011. Previous accreditation is valid until 30.09.2017. The requirement for admission is previously completed higher education. The languages of instruction include Kazakh, Russian, and English. After successful completion of the programme Management, a degree Master in Economics and Business is awarded.

Currently, the number of students enrolled in the Master programme amounts to 17.

The study programme of doctoral studies in Innovative Management is conceptualized for a period of studies of 3 years (6 semesters) of full-time education and was introduced in 2014. Within the framework of this procedure, accreditation process is carried out for the first time. Entry requirements include a previously obtained Master degree. The languages of instruction are Kazakh, Russian, and English. Upon successful completion of the programme, a degree of Doctor of Economics and Business (Ph.D.) is awarded.

The number of students enrolled in the doctoral programme amounts to 10.

### ***Assessment***

#### ***Objectives***

The objectives of the study programme, general qualifications and target groups are adequately described in the regulatory documents of training and examinations and in the Diploma Supplement for each programme undergoing the accreditation process (Bachelor, Master, Ph.D.).

#### ***Bachelor study programme in Management***

The objectives of the Bachelor study programme Management include training of graduates with basic knowledge in the field of management and awareness of the organizational, economic, socio-psychological foundations that allow ENU graduates make managerial decisions in business organizations and companies of various forms of ownership. There is a clear combination of skills and methodological competencies, information and communica-

tion technologies (5 ECTS credits in the first semester), finance (3 ECTS credits in the third semester), accounting and audit (3 ECTS credits, fourth semester), statistics (3 ECTS credit, third semester), internships (3 ECTS credits in the fourth semester, 3 ECTS credits and 9 ECTS credits in the eighth semester) and pre-graduation practice (9 ECTS credits). Students would benefit if courses on research methodology and academic writing were offered at an early stage of training, for instance, over the course of the first or second year.

The programme allows students to acquire important competences, including professional, methodological, personal, social, pedagogical and language competences (Kazakh or Russian language, foreign language, e.g., English with 4 ECTS credits over the course of the first semester, foreign language for special purposes with 3 ECTS credits over the course of the third semester and Kazakh language for special purposes with 3 ECTS credits in the fourth semester).

In each semester the curriculum consists of a number of subjects (mainly, electives), such as self-knowledge, sociology, culturology, etc. and several disciplines on state and regional topics, governance, law and economics; which in its turn contributes to the development and participation of students in society.

The graduates of the Bachelor programme are in high demand which is confirmed by a high level of employment. Graduates of the undergraduate programme are employed and build their careers in state authorities, institutions, research institutes and organizations of all forms of property. As the assessment of graduates shows, 78 to 97.5% of all graduates in 2015 and 2017 have found employment. Based on these data, a clear tendency of increase of the number of employed graduates is seen by as much as 19.5%. The university systematically monitors the career of its graduates. Information about the employment of graduates at the university is dealt with by the Bureau of Careers and Business Partnerships, its main activities and operations are: job fair, open day, publishing of current employer vacancies on the website [www.enu.kz](http://www.enu.kz), meeting with employers to raise awareness of employment problems. The requirements of professional practice are included in the curriculum.

Completion of internships is an integral part of the higher education programmes; it is aimed at reinforcing theoretical knowledge gained in the process of studying at a higher educational institution with acquiring practical skills and competencies, and learning about best practices. Internships are carried out on the basis of agreements with enterprises and requests

from organizations. Agreements with institutions that provide internship opportunities for students are signed for a period of 3 to 5 years. Currently, 16 organizations and institutions are partners that provide opportunities for internships. They are the leading national companies of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Ministries of the Republic of Kazakhstan, state institutions, and research institutes. Within the framework of the undergraduate programme students have to complete an educational practices (2 ECTS credits), internship (15 ECTS credits), and pre-graduation practice (9 ECTS credits). Students can find a place for the internship themselves or with the help from the university. The recommendation in respect to internships made during the first-time accreditation was taken into account. Lecturers and specialists are also invited to classes. Students stressed that they appreciate this kind of acquaintance with the opinions of practicing professionals, and that they would like to have much more opportunities to meet professionals from organizations over the course of their studies.

The number of study rooms is sufficient, groups consist of a small number of students (usually less than 20), elective courses and English courses usually consist of 10 students. The best students enter the university (most of them get scholarships), students study hard in accordance with the requirements of training and pass examinations, so the drop-out rate is very low as is the number of second attempts to take the exam. Students who fail an exam can retake it in summer semester.

Study programmes are described and substantiated appropriately; students are provided with informative materials for the training course. For each subject in all programmes (Bachelor, Master, Ph.D.) there is the content of the educational and methodical complex (syllabus) which indicates the required structural elements: title page, model curricula for the subject of the obligatory component, a modular programme of the subject (curriculum), tasks for independent work of students and methodological recommendations for their implementation, materials for the current, interim and final examination, a glossary for the discipline, theses of lectures on the topic of discipline, plans for practical classes, seminars, laboratory classes as well as recommendations for the implementation of the tasks, list of software and multimedia materials for training sessions. After completion of the programme the undergraduate students have the opportunity to continue their studies by entering Master programme. This programme is not offered in the form of a joint or dual degree,



partial, distance, accelerated or combined training. Training of teachers is very important for the university; all teachers should receive further training and attend seminars, participate in academic mobility programmes and improve their qualifications at least once every 5 years. The university has organized various additional training programmes, especially for young teachers. They are given the opportunity to attend various conferences, forums and internships, for example, 2 weeks in Europe at training called Business, Education and the European Education System. They also attend various seminars and conferences in Kazakhstan.

### ***Master study programme in Management***

The purpose of the Master programme Management (Profile Master course, 1 year) is the training of professional managers with in-depth knowledge and skills in all aspects of managerial activities. The purpose of the Master programme Management (Scientific and Pedagogical Master course, 2 years) is the training of specialists with scientific and pedagogical knowledge who are able to engage in activities in the field of management.

The Master programme covers several fields of management and marketing with a strong focus on international experience. The names of some subjects (for example, management and psychology) are the same as in the Bachelor programme, but the content is more specialized and deepens the basic knowledge. The literature is mostly relevant and modern, some of it is in Kazakh, but many foreign sources and electronic databases are also available. The current state of affairs is based on the recommendations of the first-time accreditation in 2012, when the need to use international literature and expand the literary base both in the field of teaching and scientific activity was mentioned. The ENULIB portal has been created; students now have access to worldwide reliable full-text databases (PasportEuromonitorInternational, EastView, ELSKnafond, ELSLAN, IPRBooks, Polpred.comMediaReview, EBSCODB, the scientific database ThomsonReuters, Elsevier, DOAJ (Open Magazine Access Directory), access to the National Electronic Library of Kazakhstan (KazNEB), and open educational resources found on the Internet that are constantly being recommended to users. All programmes have been improved (undergraduate, graduate, doctoral), especially programmes with a high degree of research, such as the Master in Management (2 years) and Ph.D. in Innovation Management.

Students can access these electronic resources through university computers. A one-year Master programme does not provide for the study of research courses, but in the second semester students complete an internship (5 ECTS credits) and conduct experimental research work (14 ECTS credits). As for the two-year programme in Management, the first semester allows students to specialize in methods for conducting research (5 ECTS credits) and research work (4 ECTS credits), over the course of the second semester students engage with history and philosophy of science (3 ECTS credits). Internships (5 ECTS credits) are completed in both the second and the third semesters (12 ECTS credits); research work is carried out in the second, third and fourth semesters (8 ECTS credits).

Language skills of students are developed within the course of a foreign language for special purposes in the second semester (3 ECTS credits) as well as several professional and research competencies. The ratio of the basic mandatory, professional mandatory and elective modules is very favourable in terms of the elective modules. This approach allows students to fully structure their syllabus in accordance with their professional goals. The programme includes many topics on innovation and internationalization. It is further proposed to update the curriculum in new dimensions (for example, digitization) by including them in specific courses, for example, integration management with marketing communications.

The structure of the programme, the methods of teaching and the content of available courses allow students to develop personally and professionally, and also provide them with the opportunity for informed participation in society.

The requirements of professional practice are properly reflected in the programme. In addition to educational practice, the programme includes pedagogical practice in the third semester (3 ECTS credits). After graduating from a Master programme (or a similar level), the university offers its former students support in obtaining a Ph.D. This work is carried out by employees of the Bureau of Career and Business Partnership where a database is created, regular interaction with graduates is conducted, and their career growth and professional development are studied. Graduates are invited to various events held by this bureau and the university. In 2015-2016 85.7% and in 2016-2017 91% of all graduates of the Master programme in Management were employed.

The number of applicants for the Master programme in Management is decreasing. The university management believes that the main reason is the reduction in the amount of

grants allocated for this programme as well as the fact that the cost of studying at the National university is higher than the cost of training in a private institution of higher education.

The content and structure of all study programmes (Bachelor, Master, and Ph.D.) are reflected in three types of curricula: model curriculum, individual curriculum and work curriculum. Textbooks and teaching materials of disciplines in the educational process include a curriculum, a thematic plan of the course, lecture theses, seminar plans, methodological recommendations for organizing independent work, writing topics, testing tasks for self-control, criteria for assessing knowledge. The structure of textbooks and teaching materials allows students to get a holistic view of the concept of the course and the requirements system; it is very informative. The special committee created for the development of the programme consists of leading scientists, experts, students and employers who are responsible for determining the number of ECTS credits awarded for individual modules. The qualification objectives of the Master programme differ from those of the Bachelor programme.

#### ***Ph.D. study programme in Innovative Management***

The purpose of the PhD study programme Innovation Management is the training of specialists with deep scientific and pedagogical knowledge capable of effectively managing innovative processes and projects.

The programme consists of one compulsory module on Strategic Innovation Management (5 ECTS credits) and two professional mandatory modules on Innovation Theory (3 ECTS credits) and Scientometrics in the first semester. Students should choose one elective course in this semester from innovative topics. In the second semester, two more elective courses are chosen (in the field of management, marketing or research methods). The main part of the programme is devoted to independent research work: research work in the third semester, pedagogical internship (3 ECTS credits) and in the fourth semester research practice (8 ECTS credits). Performing work on a doctoral thesis is mandatory in each semester. The programme is concluded with the passing of the final state examination, consisting of a comprehensive examination, writing and defending a thesis. Students receive language, professional and research competences. A lot of individual research work is provided with the support of a local and an international scientific leader from a partner institution.

First graduates of the Ph.D. programme in Innovation Management are 100% employed. In 2017-2018 the number of students increased due to the provision of a state grant from the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

### ***Conception***

#### ***Bachelor study programme in Management***

The results of training for the Bachelor programme Management include theoretical and practical principles and methods of organizational, managerial, economic sciences in solving production and professional tasks, knowledge of various methods of quantitative and qualitative management in organizations, ability to analyze and solve industrial situations in enterprises.

The ratio of mandatory modules and elective modules is optional. To achieve the results of the programme, the mandatory disciplines on microeconomics, macroeconomics, statistics, management and finance, accounting and auditing (which make up 3 ECTS credits) should be slightly increased due to such subjects as the modern history of Kazakhstan, philosophy (for which 5 ECTS credits are awarded).

Students can use the opportunity to participate in academic mobility programme and study one semester at one of the partner institutions abroad. There is a sufficient level of support from the faculty of the university and motivation of students towards mobility, but some students do not participate in this programme for personal and objective reasons. The experience of students who took part in academic mobility programmes is positive; the process of acknowledging the subjects that they study while being abroad within the mobility programme is clearly defined.

Professional practice is included in the programme and there are ECTS credits awarded for it. The names of the courses correspond to their content; content is also appropriate within the programme. Nevertheless, the content of the programme can be improved by the inclusion of new approaches and disciplines, including digital subjects (for example, digital marketing, and more topics on entrepreneurship).

Content and competencies, special knowledge, interdisciplinary knowledge, professional, methodological and general competencies and key qualifications in individual modules meet the requirements in the field of undergraduate programs. Students are provided with an

extensive list of elective subjects so that they can specialize in a specific professional field. There are no restrictions when choosing elective courses, which are taught regardless of the number of students who have chosen a particular subject. Some students also can study the course individually if there are no other students signed for it; they emphasized an above average level of support from the faculty members.

Usually at the end of the study period examinations are organized in relation to a particular discipline, which often are conducted as oral examinations. Usually, an examination card includes three questions, students taking the exam chooses one, and then they have time to prepare and they are allowed to take notes. Sometimes examinations are conducted in the form of testing. Usually three forms of the exam are provided: a computer test, a written examination (depends on the subject) and an oral examination.

Current research topics are reflected in the programme. All teachers are required to participate in university or their own research projects, publish scientific articles, be active participants in scientific conferences, update subjects on an annual basis, and write monographs and textbooks (24 over the past four years). In 2014, the teaching staff of the Department of Management published 128 articles and scientific works; 100 works were published in 2015, 117 publications were done in 2016 and 66 publications in 2017. It is also important that the number of publications grows in magazines indexed in WoS and Scopus. Changes in the content of items are conducted annually, in accordance with the results of recent studies, recommendations of experts from organizations and feedback from students.

### ***Master study programme in Management (one and two year courses)***

The results of training for students of the profile direction (1 year of education) outline that its graduates should have practical skills in the field of production management, personnel management, development and management decision-making. The results of training for students in the scientific and pedagogical direction (2 years of study) include scientific and pedagogical skills, skills in developing and making decisions in the field of management and conducting research.

The ratio of mandatory modules and elective modules in Master programme is at an appropriate level. 10 ECTS credits (foreign language for professional purposes, management, psychology and strategic management), 20 ECTS for elective modules and 30 ECTS credits for

carrying out research for a one-year programme are provided for mandatory modules. For a two-year programme, 18 ECTS credits are awarded for basic and professional mandatory modules, 18 ECTS credits for individual research work and 17 ECTS credits for practice.

As for academic mobility, the situation for students is the same for all programmes in Management. It is encouraged, but the number of students participating in academic mobility programmes should be increased, since the experience of participating in mobility programmes is exceptionally useful. There are cases when students from abroad join the Master programme.

Practical parts of training provide for ECTS credits, its curriculum includes scientific and pedagogical internships. The title of the course corresponds to the content, and the content is appropriate for the Master level in Management. Management, leadership, communication and other topics are covered in most of the courses in both Master programmes. Competences, special knowledge, interdisciplinary knowledge, professional, methodological and general competences, key qualifications in individual modules basically meet the requirements for programmes. Current research topics are reflected in Master programmes Management, students participate in research projects of the university, they are encouraged to prepare scientific articles and they get access to publications in several journals.

### ***Ph.D. study programme in Innovative Management***

Learning outcomes: graduates should have fundamental scientific training as well as skills of conducting modern theoretical and experimental methods in the framework of scientific research.

The ratio of mandatory modules and elective modules is at the corresponding level. For compulsory modules, 8 ECTS credits are provided, for own research work, for practice and elective subjects students are awarded with 16 ECTS credits.

Internships are also provided in the Ph.D. programme and ECTS credits are awarded for them: 3 ECTS credits are awarded for pedagogical internship and 8 ECTS credits for research practice. The programme meets the set aims; it has a strong focus on several important aspects of research, evaluation, planning, implementation and analysis of research. The importance is that the research is conducted under the guidance and on the basis of the academic recommendations of the local and international scientific supervisor. The content

of the study programme Innovation Management corresponds to the requirements set in relation to the doctoral programmes. Students can obtain and develop their research competencies and participate in university research projects. Professors and students work together on research projects and publications. Participation of graduates and doctoral candidates in research work over the past three years has increased (38 participants of Master programmes and 28 doctoral students), they are involved in publications in scientific journals in Kazakhstan, prepared articles and speeches for international conferences, 5 papers of doctoral candidates are published in indexed journals of WoS and Scopus.

Professors monitor the development of new topics that they should include in the programme, for this they conduct surveys, questionnaires, meetings with employers, graduates, and study relevant contemporary literature in this field. The faculty members also conduct open classes when teachers attend each other classes and share recommendations. Thus, they are aware of the current state of the affairs. Questions of students are also the basis for change; they are raised during scientific seminars and conferences. Employers participate in the revision and development of programmes. All teachers have an individual work plan, which defines the working time, divided into scientific, teaching and organizational work. The senior professors, depending on the scientific degree, have more hours to conduct research. The introduction of research results into the learning process is accompanied by the official approval of teachers in the ranks of members of senior management (considered by a special commission). They also develop original courses and write monographs and textbooks. As for the doctoral students, professors actively include them in the research projects of the department and the university.

The teaching staff is represented by highly qualified specialists, among the teachers there are holders of the international Bolashak scholarship, provided by the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In order to get an idea of the realities outside the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of the actual situation on the market and the implementation of recommendations within the framework of international cooperation, the Department of Management cooperates with the following leading foreign universities: Central University of Finance and Economics (Beijing, People's Republic of China), Warsaw University (Warsaw, Poland); Economic University (Bratislava, Republic of Slovakia); Tokyo University (Tokyo, Japan); Bashkir State University (Ufa, Republic of Bashkortostan, Russia); Poltava University of Economics

and Trade (Poltava, Ukraine); Kyrgyz State University named after I. Arabaev (Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan); Kyrgyz Academy of Education (Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan); Institute for Environmental Analysis (Dresden, Germany), University of Applied Sciences of Lucerne (Lucerne, Switzerland). Invited professors participate in the study process, but students are in favor of an even greater increase in their number in the future.

### ***Conclusion***

The university took into account and implemented all the recommendations made in the framework of the previous accreditation of undergraduate and graduate programmes.

The criterion has been fulfilled.

### ***Description of the study programmes in Economics (Bachelor and Master)***

#### ***Basic information***

Study programmes Economics at ENU are offered as a Bachelor programme (5B050600) and Master programme (6M050600) at the Faculty of Economics. Both programmes were licensed by the national authorities in the Republic of Kazakhstan. In addition, the study programmes were evaluated and accredited by the German accreditation agency ACQUIN in 2012.

Since ENU is one of the leading higher education institutions in Kazakhstan, the training of qualified economists and specialists for business and various sectors of the economy of Kazakhstan and foreign countries is part of the self-determination and mission of the university. Realization and continuous development of programmes are carried out with the support of companies from a number of different areas, such as finance, energy, agricultural industry, and tourism.

The set qualification goals reflect the needs of relevant professional practices in the business sector of Kazakhstan, international business corporations, as well as public and private companies. Representatives of professional practice participate in the development and implementation of programmes; for the most part it is done by them being members of university councils.

The university does not set limits on the number of students entering the programmes on a fee basis.



### ***Bachelor study programme in Economics***

The Bachelor programme is designed for eight semesters, students receive 204 ECTS credits (129 Kazakhstani credits) for theoretical education. The university seeks to prepare graduates of the Bachelor programme to work in the business sector of Kazakhstan, that is why they should get knowledge about the world and national economic history, economic reforms and changes in Kazakhstan and development trends in the sphere of modern business. In these areas, students should have knowledge of the basic concepts and tools of economic theory, methods of state regulation of the economy and economic policy. In addition, they must distinguish between measures taken at the micro and macro levels.

The university points out that during the training students study theoretical disciplines and complete several internships. The educational process of the programme is aimed at fully realizing the creative potential of students and enhancing their skills of independent study and research. In this regard, when allocating credits for disciplines taught at senior courses of the programme, most of the credits are awarded for seminars, and lectures are organized in the form of posing questions and raising issues on specific topics. Assessment methods include a full range of written, oral and practical exams, projects and essays that are used to assess student performance and to confirm academic achievement at the end of the course or module.

The structure of the programme consists of modules that are divided into general obligatory disciplines (28 Kazakhstani credits), core disciplines (69 credits) and profiling disciplines (32 credits). In addition to these theoretical components, students must complete internships (at least 6 credits), attend physical education lessons (8 credits), and pass a state final examination (3 credits). Thus, the final number of credits awarded for the programme amounts to at least 146 Kazakhstani credits, which in turn corresponds to 240 ECTS credits.

The curriculum of the students' training consists of the modules mentioned below. Over the course of the first two semesters, students study Information and Communication Technologies, Foreign Language, Kazakh (Russian), Mathematics for Economists, Theory of Economics, Modern History of Kazakhstan, Microeconomics, Fundamentals of National economy, Global Economy; they also complete the so-called learning practice. Over the course of the third and fourth semesters focus is put on economic sciences in the following subjects: Foreign

Language for Special Purposes, Philosophy, International Economics, Management, Macroeconomics, Labour Economics, Social Economy, and internship. The fifth semester is provided for the study of Business Economics and Entrepreneurship; in the sixth semester Accounting, Finance and continues internship can be highlighted. During the remaining two semesters, students are engaged with the Economics of Innovation, Enterprise Innovation, Investments and Investment Activities of Enterprises, Evaluation of the Effectiveness of Investment Projects, internship, pre-graduation practice and state final examination. The Bachelor thesis is part of the practice and final examination. In each semester, students also study elective disciplines.

While general compulsory disciplines are the same for all educational programmes, core and profile disciplines put emphasis on the economy. Therefore, ENU independently determines some basic modules necessary for creating the profile of the university. The main modules include: Module of Social and Ethical Competences, Module of Economic, Organizational and Managerial Competencies, National and Global Economy, State and Public Economy, Economics of Enterprises and Entrepreneurship, Labour Economics and Economy of Social Sphere as well as Eurasian space: Cultural and Religious Interaction.

As for elective subjects, the university offers subjects covering a wide range of issues directly related to the applied economy and the business of public and private companies. Modules cover aspects of economic, cultural, legal, and also some interdisciplinary topics. Forty-nine Kazakhstan credits are awarded for them; therefore the main elective disciplines are of utmost importance for the choice of the profile of the educational programme as well as for the employment of students, since these disciplines are mainly recommended by certain employers.

### ***Master study programme in Economics***

The Master study programme is offered in two versions: the Scientific and Pedagogical direction with 59 Kazakhstan credits for theoretical preparation and the duration of four semesters, and the Profile direction lasting two semesters with 28 Kazakhstani credits for theoretical training.

Students of the of Science and Education Masters course are trained for further employment in the system of higher and postgraduate education. The programme is closely related to the

topics aimed at training business consultants and organizers of start-up projects, analysts, or higher-level employees working in the field of business planning. Working in companies, graduates should be able to participate in the management of national state and private companies, while taking into account the processes of globalization and internationalization. In addition to knowledge in the field of applied economics, students also get acquainted with the methods of research in order to conduct research in their chosen field.

The study programme consists of modules that are divided into general compulsory disciplines (20 Kazakhstan credits, including subjects of choice with 12 credits) and profile disciplines (22 credits, 20 of them for elective disciplines). In addition to these theoretical components, students should complete pedagogical and research internships (at least 6 credits), conduct research (7 credits), and pass the final state examination (4 credits). Thus, the total number of credits is at least 59 Kazakhstani credits, which corresponds to 120 ECTS credits.

The training is conducted over the course of four semesters, in the first year students study the following subjects: Pedagogy, Psychology, Foreign Language for Academic Purposes, Economic Security of Firms, Methods of Scientific Research, History and Philosophy of Science, and Foreign Language for Professional Purposes as well as complete an internship. The second year is devoted to pedagogical internship, research work of undergraduates, pre-graduation practice, the so-called complex examination and writing and defending the Master thesis.

While general compulsory disciplines are the same for all study programmes, profile disciplines mostly focus on the economy. The main modules include Methodology of Master Studies, Theory and Research, International Economics and Organization and Planning of Enterprises in the Economic Sector. As for elective subjects, the university offers subjects covering a wide range of issues related to applied economics and entrepreneurship. Modules cover aspects of economic, cultural, legal as well as some interdisciplinary topics - same as in the Bachelor programme. Nevertheless, disciplines more closely integrate scientific methods, economic theories and research questions.

Particular attention is paid to the area of research in the Profile direction of the Master programme. Students get acquainted with the advanced theories and methodologies of empirical research in the field of economics. Over the course of the first two semesters of studies, students attend the core disciplines (8 Kazakhstani credits, including subjects of

choice with 3 credits) and profile disciplines (10 credits, 9 of them for elective disciplines). In addition to these theoretical components, students must complete the so-called internship (minimum 2 credits), conduct research (4 credits), and pass a state final examination (4 credits). Thus, the total number of credits amounts to at least 28 Kazakhstani credits which correspond to 60 ECTS credits.

Students study for one academic year, in the first semester they complete the following disciplines: Foreign Language for Professional Purposes, Management, Psychology, Economic Security of Firms and Micro- and Macro-analysis as well as other disciplines. The second semester is designed for completion of internships, conducting experimental studies of students, including writing a Master thesis, passing the so-called comprehensive exam and writing and defending the Master thesis.

### ***Assessment***

The purpose of study programmes in Economics is the training of highly qualified specialists in business and management as well as social entrepreneurs. Study programmes are characterized by a more flexible structure when compared with programmes in other higher educational institutions of Kazakhstan, which can serve as an indicator of the ever-changing needs of the labour market. The programme itself is focused on the development of practical competencies, for example, due to completion of a compulsory internship. At the same time, the Master programme is focused on research. Students are given the opportunity to study topics based on their own interests: in accordance with management tasks and depending on the sector - public, private or non-governmental; they are prepared to apply the acquired knowledge.

### ***Purpose and conception of the Bachelor study programme in Economics***

The aim of the Bachelor study programme is to train specialists with basic knowledge and skills necessary for the public and private business as well as to prepare them for a successful career in a rapidly developing modern world. The programme offers scientific and practical elements, professional knowledge and skills, prepares students for flexibility in employment and further education. New communication technologies are used, and the creative

potential of students is developed. The programme provides in-depth training of general theories and courses that cover all the major aspects of the future graduate's work. As for the structure of the programme, it would be more appropriate to talk about a generalist. The Bachelor graduate receives basic extensive training in economics, management, administration, law and information technology management, including through classes at the university, extracurricular activities and self-study to improve their knowledge and skills to meet the needs of today's rapidly changing information society.

The implementation of the programme meets the national requirements in the field of compulsory disciplines, which are determined by the Ministry of Science and Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The rest of the programme is built on the basis of the own ideas of ENU, which is positively assessed by a group of experts. A positive impression is also created by the link between theory and practice, since students have enough time to practice during the training programme. Participation in academic mobility programmes is possible due to the fact that the compulsory components of the programme can be learned in the format of distance learning.

Over the course of the graduate programme, students gain the skills necessary for launching and developing their own businesses, strategies to increase the market share of the enterprise, understanding of personnel management, knowledge of supply chain management, and knowledge of organizational and market mechanisms. These competencies are suitable for accounting for changes and new issues. Internship is integrated into the programmes on several levels.

### ***Purpose and conception of the Master study programmes in Economics***

The Master programme is designed for Bachelor graduates who want to deepen their knowledge in the field of economics, especially international economics and entrepreneurship. When compared with the undergraduate program, it is clear that the content and described learning outcomes are very similar. Nevertheless, the conversation during the on-visit by the group of experts showed that teachers and students can convincingly explain the difference between the Bachelor and Master programmes. In addition to applied research methods and theoretical content, the Master programme differs from the Bachelor programme in the method of instruction. Students of the undergraduate programme more or

less follow the prescribed curriculum; graduate students work more independently and engage in projects in small groups on their own.

The Master programme in Economics focuses on training highly qualified specialists in business and management by developing their knowledge and skills in the field of new and distinctive socio-economic and technological processes. Graduates should gain knowledge about society, impact of new and emerging technologies on social processes and develop practical management skills that are necessary for the identification and successful application of new and emerging technologies in management organizations, such as private companies. The objectives of the programmes are considered from the point of view of the national and international economy and reflect the impact of globalization factors on complex social, economic, cultural and technological conditions.

Based on the description of the goals of the study programmes, the ENU tries to attract students who want to expand their knowledge and to develop practical management skills necessary for professional activities in the framework of new and developing socio-economic processes. Graduates receive professional training that will enable them to succeed in the labour market. The programme is characterized by a traditional approach to business and social changes and their relationship with economic modernization in the context of globalization problems in various fields, which seems appropriate to the objectives of the labour market in Kazakhstan.

Since the Master programme is offered in training options of one and two years of studying, it is hardly possible to provide a separate time for participation in academic mobility programmes within the syllabus of these study programmes. However, it should be emphasized that students can gain practical experience by completing compulsory internships, and also have the opportunity to travel abroad for shorter periods if they receive funding through special programmes (for example, the Bolashak scholarship).

### ***Conclusion***

Bachelor and Master study programmes in Economics correspond to the overall strategy of the university, and the expert group highly appreciates the introduction and continuous development of the programmes at ENU.

It should be emphasized that the group of experts came to a conclusion that ENU managed to improve its programmes within the last five years after the previous accreditation. Recommendations for more transparent presentation of training programmes were taken into account. It is also positive that the university works with case studies based on specific examples, which was also one of the recommendations made then. Other recommendations, for example, about the replacement of pedagogical internships in the framework of the programme of the scientific and pedagogical direction of the magistracy, were impossible because of the presence of mandatory ministerial prescriptions.

The expert group made a few minor recommendations and concluded that criterion 1.2 based on the Standards and recommendations for quality assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) were implemented.

### ***Conclusion***

- The criterion **has been fulfilled**

### **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.3: Student-centered learning, teaching and assessment**

[Institutions should ensure that the programmes are delivered in a way that encourages students to take an active role in creating the learning process, and that the assessment of students reflects this approach.]

#### ***Assessment***

Academic policy of ENU named after L. N. Gumilyov is a list of rules and procedures that are designed to improve the effectiveness of the organization of the educational process, ensure the quality of education, create favourable conditions for the personal development of students and a greater student-centeredness of the educational process as a whole. Among the main elements of academic policy are the formation of an individual trajectory of learning and a curriculum; organization of educational process; assessment of knowledge within the current and final controls; ensuring academic mobility of students and internationalization of the university environment.

The university provides training for Bachelor, Master and Ph.D. students on credit technology aimed at developing the students' abilities of self-reliance and self-education based on the choice of the educational trajectory.

In accordance with the principles of credit technology, first-year students are invited to choose the trajectory of training within the study programme. The orientation of educational trajectories determines the content of all elective disciplines. For the entire period of study at the university, the students themselves choose up to 70% of the academic disciplines of the Bachelor programme, up to 80% and 90% of the Master and doctoral studies respectively. The students receive advisory assistance from appointed advisors on the prerequisites and post-requisites of the chosen trajectory of training. Along with disciplines, students choose teachers responsible for teaching them. All information about the choice of students is reflected in their individual plans which determine the content of the annual curriculum of the specialty.



The educational process is determined by the interests of the students and the competency characteristics of the study programme. The curricula developed by the departments ensure the possibility of flexible educational trajectories.

Training is conducted in accordance with the developed student programmes in Economics and Management, curricula developed on the basis of model plans of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, catalogues of elective disciplines and Individual curricula of students at all levels of study: Bachelor, Master, and Ph.D. In determining the educational trajectory, students, if the discipline is not recognized as beneficial, students have the right to choose one of the beneficial disciplines. One copy of the individual plan is provided to the students for personal use. This allows students to be informed on the composition of disciplines, types of training activities, including various types of internships and practices.

The information on the educational process is presented to the students in the form of an academic calendar, the schedule of classes, schedules of independent work of students under the guidance of a teacher.

The principle of student-centered learning determines the differentiation of various types of classes which are conducted in the format of lectures, seminars, practical and laboratory classes, independent work of students under the guidance of a teacher. Within the framework of these types of classes, students receive educational information, form practical skills, and help reduce potential difficulties in mastering the academic disciplines.

In the process of studying the discipline and attending classes, students gain points that form a rating necessary for their admission to the exam and affect their final grade. As a result, students have the opportunity to receive timely information on the assessment of their knowledge at the current classes from the teacher, via the midterm and final control through the automated information system Platonus after the testing or oral exam.

Along with student-centered teaching, the principles of student-centered teaching are being implemented at the university. The academic policy developed in this connection includes various elements related to the provision of study programmes with highly qualified personnel and resources; organization of different types of classes and practices; using a variety of teaching methods and knowledge assessment.

The university creates conditions for the effective mastering of theoretical knowledge and practical skills for students. To this end, there are classroom and out-of-class activities that are divided into lecture, seminars, practical exercises, laboratory, and consulting. The knowledge and skills obtained by the students during the training are enforced over the course of internships in the conditions of real production. For this purpose, the university organizes educational, pedagogical, professional, and research practices and internships. Partner organizations, employers, experienced specialists of various fields of activity are involved in conducting practices. In addition, over the course the educational process, special classes are held in the profile organizations; there are branches of the university departments created there.

Formation of the necessary competences for students is facilitated by various teaching methods, which the teacher determines independently, taking into account the objectives of the training course. Faculty members of ENU use active teaching methods, including group work, business games, colloquia, discussions, round tables, trainings, etc. Quality control of the learning material is carried out through such forms of control as testing, oral and written interviews, thesis and creative work.

Within the framework of lecture classes, an indicative basis is formed for the subsequent mastering of the learning material by the students. The development of lecture material and lecturing is carried out by experienced faculty members who, as a rule, hold the following degrees: a Doctor of Sciences, a Candidate of Doctor of Sciences, and a Master of Science. With the introduction of credit technology, the method of lecturing was adjusted through the use of interactive teaching aid. Lecture sessions presuppose the preliminary preparation of students, which are provided by the theses of lectures. As a result, the active role of students in the course of the lecture increases, which often takes the form of a discussion, a round table, or a forum.

Conducting a seminar requires the students to develop the skills of using theoretical knowledge in relation to the features of the discipline under study. Subjects of seminars are problematic, allowing learners to master the skills of conducting discussions and scientific controversy. The traditional form of conducting a seminar is an interview, which requires the trainees to prepare for the pre-planned plan. Alternative forms of the interview workshop are colloquia, business games, round tables, and case studies.

Conducting laboratory exercises allows students to develop practical skills related to the application of experimental techniques. The format of the laboratory session includes the experimental part, processing and theoretical justification of the results obtained.

Classes within the framework of the self-study of students are intended for students wishing to receive additional consultations on the subjects of the academic discipline. Independent work of students under the guidance of the teachers is carried out in accordance with the approved schedule. The forms of organization of the independent work vary from the traditional by being more interactive.

An obligatory stage in the development of the study programme is the completions of internships which are divided into Bachelor pedagogical and professional internships; Master and doctoral studies include a professional internship and a research practice. The learning practice is conducted parallel to classes and includes a general acquaintance with the specificity of the profession. Pedagogical and professional practice is conducted on the basis of partner organizations with the purpose of practical application of the acquired knowledge and skills. Research practice takes place in various research institutes, at the departments of the university at the place of carrying out theses.

Developing student-centred learning, the university supports the sense of autonomy of students who have the opportunity to make a choice of trajectories as well as topics of Bachelor and Master theses and doctoral dissertations. Practice shows that the availability of such opportunities allows students to retain an active role in the learning process, motivates them to acquire new knowledge, and increases self-organization.

The university has the ENU Business Ethics Code, Code of Honour and Student Behaviour, Rules of the Labour Order, Regulations on the Disciplinary Commission. The Code promotes the creation of a favourable moral and psychological climate, an atmosphere of mutual respect, scientific and creative cooperation in the team. The rules contain policy guidelines for the academic policy of the university. The university effectively uses the procedure for checking the theses of students for prevention of plagiarism. However, it is important to note that the rules of academic honesty of the university are not described, which could support the academic culture of students.

Students have the opportunity to express their disagreement with the results of interim control results through an appeal procedure in which independent examiners participate.

The university created conditions for the free access of students to the head of their departments, deans of the faculty, the pro-rector and the rector of the university. If necessary, students can address their complaints, questions and problems to the Disciplinary Commission of the University, the Rector's Blog.

The academic policy of the university ensures the transparency of the evaluation of students' knowledge and their timely receipt of information about educational achievements. For this purpose, the software Platonus is used to automate the system of knowledge control and alerting students. Each student has access to their personal profile which reflects the scores received at the lessons, midterm, and final exam.

The automated system requires the teacher to timely issue current estimates and does not allow students to change them at their own discretion. This ensures a gradual accumulation of the rating and excludes cases of corruption.

The forms of teaching and pedagogical methods applied at the university help to strengthen the new position of the teacher, who is the organizer of cognitive activity, a consultant on self-training and self-organization of students. As a result of this, various types of group and individual teaching methods have been widely used, including small group work, project technology, case study, role-playing and business games, brainstorming method, problem problem method, round table method, master-classes, and many others.

At the same time, it should be noted that in the context of the departments it is necessary to activate the procedure of academic mobility of teachers with the purpose of strengthening professional competencies and expanding new methods of control acceptance, in the majority of cases, computer testing and oral examination with cards are practiced at the interim stages of control.

Within the framework of the courses being read, the teaching staff of the university develops teaching and methodological complexes of disciplines which describe the policy of the course. Within the framework of the policy, the main types of tasks that students are to fulfil during the academic period are identified as well as a list of topics and questions submitted for the exam, which allows students to effectively use the study time and perform all the necessary monitoring activities in a timely manner.

The university has a system of internal quality control of training, which includes current, interim and final examination.

Assessment of knowledge of students is carried out based on the credit and rating system. According to this evaluation system, the students who are studying, performing certain types of work during the semester, are assessed on a 100-point scale. The scores received by students in the classroom, midterm examination are put into an automated system. The average value of the current score is the students' rating that is used as the admission to the examination. The software allows automatic calculation of scores which in the final form are converted into traditional scores from 4.0 to 0 and letter equivalents from A to F.

It is important to note that the results of the training are supported by the results of the external assessment of students' knowledge, the high indicators of learning outcomes allow the university to lead in the rating of universities in Kazakhstan.

In most cases, the current examinations are conducted by independent examiners which contribute to the process of evaluation objectivity. Final state examinations are taken with specially appointed commissions present; the representatives of employers are invited to chair the commissions.

The university has developed the practice of taking into account mitigating circumstances when carrying out current assessment of knowledge, mainly related to the absence of classes for illness or other valid reasons. In this case, the affected students write an application to the dean so that the timings of the examination periods and opportunities are created to improve ratings for the disciplines.

The evaluation policy of students is consistent. The current control is systematic throughout the academic period, the midterm examinations are carried out as a periodic assessment of knowledge, the final control sums the indicators of the semester work of the student, this is about 60% of the total assessment system, and the examination is a confirmation of the theoretical knowledge and practical skills. It is important to note the transparency of the assessment system, all results are available on the Platonus platform, the conditions for objectivity are provided by an independent evaluation during the intermediate certification period.

The evaluation policy provides for the procedure for appealing the results of the examination. Students who do not agree with the results of the exam have the opportunity on the day of the examination or the next day until 1 pm to file an application with the dean's office with a request to appeal. The subject of the appeal can be the content of test tasks, the

correctness of the proposed options for answers, questions, and problems of technical work with the task. Based on the results of the appeal, a decision is made to either change or maintain the examination mark on the basis of the protocol of the appeal commission.

Evaluating this standard, the expert group recommends the following in the framework of improving study programmes:

- As part of the formation of students' academic culture, ENU should develop a provision on the academic integrity of the university
- Develop academic mobility programmes for teaching staff.
- Strengthen work on international cooperation and attract foreign lecturers.
- Within the framework of study programmes, develop and offer courses of an interdisciplinary nature, focused on the formation of professional competences.

## **Conclusion**

**The group of experts makes a few minor recommendations and concludes that Standard 1.3 of the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

### **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition and certification**

[Institutions should consistently apply pre-defined and published regulations covering all phases of the student "life cycle", e.g. student admission, progression, recognition and certification.]

## **Assessment**

The order of admission to the Eurasian National University named after L. N. Gumilyov is determined by the Rules for admission to the university approved by the Academic Council. The admission rules are developed in accordance with the requirements of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan On Education; Decisions of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan On the Approval of the Standard Rules for Admission to Education in the Organiza-

tion of Education, Implementing Educational Programmes of Higher Education. Organization of the reception of documents is carried out by the Admission Committee of the university.

As part of the work of the admission campaign of the ENU, the Centre for Professional Orientation and Testing at the University coordinates the vocational guidance work, the organization of the selection of applicants and the acceptance of documents from applicants and enrolment in the students.

Work is being carried out on informing interested parties about the educational services provided through the university's main site <http://www.enu.kz/>, the brochures on educational programmes are being circulated, and published in the media explaining the content of study programmes for graduates of schools, colleges, universities and their parents. Collection and monitoring of information on the development of the study programmes of the student is conducted via the automated information system Platonus. There is a module Parental Control, where parents can view the entire academic performance of their children, their attendance of training sessions, and the results of the examinations.

It is important to note that the policy of the university includes mechanisms to ensure progress of students in their academic careers. In this connection, the university conducts systematic work related to the creation of special conditions for the academic progress of students and their adaptation to the university environment; timeliness of information about educational achievements; increasing the motivation of students.

At the university there are institutes of curators and advisers who, starting from the first year of training, regularly interact with students on the organization of training.

To implement the student-centred approach in the process of forming research and practical competencies, each student is assigned with a supervisor and a head of internship. Their task is to teach the principles of research and practical work in conditions of real work environment. Students have the opportunity to independently choose the theme of their theses and a scientific adviser, taking into account their academic interests. Student conferences, subject competitions (the so-called Olympiads), student project competitions are held to realize the creative potential of students at the university. In addition, university students participate in subject competitions (the so-called Olympiads) in other institutions, student competitions, and are also involved in the development of funded scientific projects of the departments.

The university provides organizational support, including visa support for students to facilitate their participation in academic mobility programmes and academic internships. A mechanism is provided for the re-crediting of credits received in the process of training in other higher education institutions.

ENU applies the Regulation on the issuance of the European Supplement to the diploma of the graduate, determines the procedure for the drafting, content, development, improvement, issuance and storage of the European Diploma Supplement. This Regulation has been developed in accordance with the requirements of the European Commission, the Council of Europe and the Centre for Higher Professional Education of UNESCO as well as by taking into account the methodological recommendations for the application of the Diploma Supplement of the Centre for the Bologna process and academic mobility of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

As a whole, the university carries out all the necessary measures for the provision of students with the support of documents confirming the level of the academic degree. It is still necessary to expand the directions of the internationalization of the university through attracting foreign students and foreign lecturers.

## **Conclusion**

- The criterion **has been fulfilled**



### **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.5: Teaching staff**

[Institutions should assure themselves of the competence of their teachers. They should apply fair and transparent processes for the recruitment and development of the staff.]

ENU has the main responsibility for the quality of its employees and the provision of favorable conditions for their effective work. Therefore, ENU has developed clear, transparent, and objective criteria for recruitment, assignment, promotion and dismissal.

This information is available on the website of the Human Resources Department of ENU (<http://www.enu.kz/ru/oenu/karera/kadrovaya-politika>).

The procedure PRO ENU 601-16 Personnel management - the qualification requirements for personnel, the procedure for hiring, transfer, career, reductions, probation period, training of personnel, disciplinary measures for the employees are defined.

The university has developed the Regulations on the procedure for employment based on the Labour Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan On Education, the Typical Qualification Characteristics of the Positions of Pedagogical Workers and Equal Persons Approved by the Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan (as amended on 12.05. 2017, [http://online.zakon.kz/document/?doc\\_id=30466203#pos=0;0](http://online.zakon.kz/document/?doc_id=30466203#pos=0;0)) and internal documents of the university.

The university employs teachers according to the following criteria: knowledge of the English language, publication in international rating journals with non-zero impact factor, included in the Thomson Reuters and Scopus databases, academic degree, rank, and characteristics from the last job.

The teachers of ENU have the opportunity of career growth, according to the Regulations on the personnel reserve ENU on an annual basis, at the request of the HR department, information is provided on the personnel reserve of the faculty members. The personnel reserve includes prospective employees, Master and PhD students who have positive characteristics. The personnel reserve is formed by qualifying, professional-competence, age-related other characteristics.

The selection of teachers for vacant posts of the teaching staff is carried out on the basis of competitive selection and the subsequent conclusion of an employment contract. The university announces a competition for the positions of heads of departments, professors, associate professors after the expiration of the employment contract as well as for vacant positions.

The automated information system Platonus includes personal profiles of teachers where basic information about the teacher is provided. Information on the scientific directions of teaching staff, career growth, and their publication can be found on the ENU site in the section Science - Profiles of scientists (<http://www.enu.kz/ru/lica-enu/>).

ENU has developed a system for stimulating professional and personal development of teachers and employees.

Since 2016, the ENU KPI pilot project has been launched at ENU which characterizes the individual performance and key performance indicators of the university staff

When calculating scores of faculty members, the specific focus is paid to three main criteria: educational, educational and methodical work, scientific work and commercialization of research results; educational and social and organizational work.

Faculty members systematically conduct scientific and methodological seminars, trainings on the development of electronic textbooks and innovative methods of teaching. Other mechanisms to confirm the level of competence of teachers are assessment of the conduct of open training sessions, mutual attendance of classes as well as analysis of the results of the questionnaire Teacher through the Eyes of a Student.

To ensure the qualification requirements for faculty members, the level and specificity of the Department of the Faculty, summer and winter scientific schools, courses to improve qualifications, open classes for teaching staff, and a direction for doctoral studies are offered at the faculty.

The department is working to attract employers with a scientific degree who are leading experts in the field of economics.

The share of teachers with academic degrees offering classes in basic and profile disciplines of the study programmes amounted to 46% in 2014-2016 academic years, 61% in 2016-2017 academic year, and 60% in 2017-2018 academic years.

It should be noted the strong qualitative composition of the faculty members, 10 holders of the title Best Teacher of the University of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the winner of the Republican contest The Best Methodist of the RK-2014 and holders of the badge of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan Honoured Worker of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Two professors were awarded with badges for merits in the Development of Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The composition of faculty members includes eight holders of the scholarship of the international program Bolashak. The holders of the State Scientific Scholarship for talented young scientists are three teachers.

An Austrian-certified business coach participates in the Erasmus+ CACTLE International Project Central Asian Centre for Teaching, Learning and Entrepreneurship.

Six teachers received funding from Bolashak programme. Two professors of the department are lecturers of the National Research Nuclear University MEPhI (Moscow Engineering Physics Institute).

In 2014, one professor of the department went to lecture at the Xingzian University (China) and the Research Institute for Environmental Analysis (Germany), one lecturer lectured at the Penza State University (Russia).

In 2017 one professor went to the Russian Academy of Natural Sciences. The following foreign teachers conducted classes for students in the specialty Management: professor of the University of Shian Zhitong-Liverpool conducted classes in the discipline HR management in organizations as well as management. Professor of the Institute for Environmental Analysis, Dresden, Germany, conducted classes in the discipline Management of Innovation: Foreign Practice.

The department organizes international summer and winter scientific schools organized by international experts: Professor of the Institute of Environmental Analysis (Germany), two PhD doctors, Anadolu University (Turkey), Professor of the National University of Water Management and Nature Management (Ukraine), Professor of Banking Institute (Prague, Czech Republic), two professors of the Altai State University (Russia), Professor of Omsk State University named after F.M. Dostoevsky (Russia) and others. It is highlighted that the faculty members conducted research in such scientific centers as Universitet Webster (Greece), Nova University (Portugal), Andong National University and Sookmyung Woman's

University (South Korea), Institute of Business and Technology Management of the Belarusian State University, Prague University, Charles University (Czech Republic), Peoples' Friendship University of Russia (Russia).

The Faculty members completed internships abroad in scientific centres, universities and research institutes of Germany, Portugal, the Netherlands, Greece, Czech Republic, Belgium, Austria, Poland, China, South Korea, Slovakia, Latvia, Russia, and Belarus. There are such scientific schools as Foreign Economic Strategies of States, Economic Development of Kazakhstan, Enhancing the Competitiveness of the National Economy: Logistics Models and Approaches.

### ***Description of facts***

The results of the research activities of the teaching staff are introduced into the educational process as elective modules, over the course of 2015-2017 academic years 37 acts of introduction of the results of scientific research into the educational process were received. The research work was actively introduced into production of NC Astana EXPO-2017 JSC (2015), Passenger Leasing Carriage Company JSC, Kazgermunai JV LLP (2015), Astyk logistics LLP (2015), Orion-Astana LLP (2016), Etecom LLP (2016), Akmola Car Repair Plant JSC (2016), NBK-A LLP (2017), Foodmaster-Trade Company LLP (2017).

In 2012, the experts of the Accreditation, Certification and Quality Assurance Institute ACQUIN recommended to establish contacts with foreign partners. In order to implement this recommendation, agreements are concluded with the following leading foreign universities: Central University of Finance and Economics (Beijing, People's Republic of China); Warsaw University (Warsaw, Poland), Economic University (Bratislava, Republic of Slovakia); Tokyo University (Tokyo, Japan), Bashkir State University (Republic of Bashkortostan, Russia), Poltava University of Economics and Trade (Poltava, Ukraine); Kyrgyz State University named after I. Arabaeva (Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan), Kyrgyz Academy of Education (Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan); Institute for Environmental Analysis (Dresden, Germany); Lucerne University of Applied Sciences (Luzern, Switzerland).

The same experts of the Accreditation, Certification and Quality Assurance Institute ACQUIN recommended increasing the number of written examinations and solution of problems.

This recommendation of the agency ACQUIN in the framework of the first-time accreditation is implemented as 60% coverage of the disciplines in written exams and solving applied problems.

### ***Assessment***

The recommendations of the first-time accreditation were implemented. There is a high level of training for students and qualifications of the faculty members of study programmes that are being accredited.

Human resources for implementing the higher education programme are sufficient.

Interaction with other study courses is carried out through observance of the prerequisites of discipline.

Measures for the development and qualification of personnel have been used to a sufficient degree.

For the constant improvement from the point of view of the evaluated standard, it is possible to include constant improvement of qualification.

### **Conclusion**

The criterion has been fulfilled. The university coped with the recommendations of the previous accreditation procedure. The university is invited to strengthen internationalization. The university is also invited to engage practitioners not only with the Institute for Economic Research JSC, but also practitioners of organizational and legal forms of management (state bodies, Joint-stock companies, regional state-owned enterprise, Unitary Enterprise based on the Right of Economic Management, etc.) to the teaching activity.

When checking theses, it is necessary to strengthen the work on assessing the degree of borrowing (the programme of antiplagiarism).

▪

### **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.6: Learning resources and student support**

[Institutions should have appropriate funding for learning and teaching activities and ensure that adequate and readily accessible learning resources and student support are provided.]

#### **Assessment**

The material and technical base and information resources of the university are sufficient and correspond to the requirements of the programmes being implemented.

The university has the necessary services for the implementation of study programmes: a scientific library Otyrar Kitapxhanasy, a medical center, a student cinema, student dormitories, sports grounds, public catering facilities for students, faculty and staff, a legal clinic, creative teams, student groups Shanyrac Attraction, a production center E-studio, a dance school Samryk, an orchestra of Kazakh folk instruments Dala sazy, etc. The Library of the Eurasian National University named after L.N. Gumilyov is an important structural subdivision in the scientific and educational environment of the university. The library fund is an integral part of information resources and includes educational, methodological and scientific literature as well as legislative and regulatory legal acts. The implementation of the educational programmes in Economics and Management is provided by free access of students to library funds, computer technologies, educational methodological and scientific literature, educational, scientific, information databases, including international sources, placed in electronic libraries. ENU increased the general fund of the library, the base as of 2017-2018 academic year is 1 665 091 copies, including 460 313 copies in the Kazakh language (27.6% of the total fund).

The ENU Library has an electronic catalogue that allows students to search for necessary literature and provides access to electronic versions of individual textbooks and teaching materials. All information on library collections is reflected in electronic catalogues that allow students and teachers to conduct a multidimensional search for books and other materials in preparation for training sessions, including in the framework of independent work of graduate and undergraduate students. Access to the electronic information library system

that includes electronic catalogue, electronic library, and databases is provided in all educational buildings within the library, at the departments, in computer classes, in dormitories due to I am a single corporate university network.

It is important to note that, based on the recommendations from the first-time accreditation in 2012, the ENULIB portal has been expanded, both in training and in scientific activity, the training portal has been granted access to full-text database databases (Passport Euromonitor International, East View, electronic library Knigafund, electronic library Lan, IPR Books, Polpred.com Media Review, EBSCO, the scientific citation database of Thomson Reuters, Elsevier, DOAJ (Directory of Open Access Journals) as well as access to the Kazakhstan National Electronic libraries (KazNEB), constant use of open educational Internet resources for their recommendations to users.

A major point of the academic policy is to inform students on the organization of the educational process, the conditions of training, and the content of programmes, corporate rules related to the norms of behaviour, academic activity, and work of support services for students. This information is distributed through printed publications, the university's website, the student's electronic personal study, terminals and faculty stands.

A guidebook is developed for students, and it contains all the necessary information about the faculties, the organization of the educational process and the monitoring activities, and the possibilities for academic support.

The university pays much attention to the development of administrative structures to support students. Among the main structures providing academic, research, information, cultural and leisure support for students are: Department of Academic Affairs, Planning and Teaching Department, Department of Organization and Monitoring of Educational Processes, Career and Business Partnerships Division, Legal Services Department, Personnel Management, Information Technology Department, Office Registrar, Career and Testing Center, Training Center for Students, Organization of Final Certification of Post-Graduate Education, Academic Policy Development Department, Quality Assurance Department, International Cooperation Department, International Educational Programs Department, Center for the Development of Multilingual Education and Academic Resources, Science Department, Youth Business Incubator, Innovation Park, Department for Social and Civil Development, work with students and youth organizations, Department of social and cultural work.

Structures on academic issues can support students of the interdisciplinary education process and educational and methodological support in accordance with state compulsory education standards; ensuring control over the implementation of plans for educational and methodological work at the departments and faculties; organization and development of working curricula of specialties; the development of an academic calendar; drawing up a schedule of study sessions and examinations; the development of catalogues of elective disciplines; development together with the departments of syllabuses, educational-methodical complexes of disciplines (UMCD); organization and control of students' passage of all kinds of practices; conducting personal affairs of students.

The office of the university registrar assists students through the registration of students for academic disciplines; the formation of academic groups and larger groups of students in the same year; registration of individual student curricula; organization and conduct of intermediate and final attestation of students; accounting for the student's credits for the entire period of study and for the entire period of study; formation of transcripts of students.

The Legal Department as a supporting structure contributes to the formation of legal knowledge and regulation of legal relations.

In general, the supporting structures carry out systematic and consistent work with students, both in academic and extra-curricular times, providing the conditions for learning and supporting personal development. All structures work in a planned mode, reporting on the activities of support services is reflected in the reports of the pro-rectors, department heads, the annual report of the university rector, which are reviewed collectively and brought to the attention of all departments and faculties studying through participation in collegial bodies of the university. Information resources on-line are available 24/7, without interruptions and days off, which is provided by automated software services.

Technological support for students and teachers is provided through the provision of computer equipment, classrooms with multimedia equipment, specialized classrooms; software complexes of Platonus. All departments have access to the automated information system Platonus and the search system of the library.

Basic information about educational programmes and services of support available for students is published on the website of the university.



## Conclusion

- Criterion **has been fulfilled**

### **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.7: Information management**

[Institutions should ensure that they collect, analyse and use relevant information for the effective management of their programmes and other activities.]

#### **Assessment**

The collection and analysis of information is necessary for effective management and accountability in the activities of the education organization. Maintenance of the mission, objectives, tasks, evaluation of their effectiveness is carried out in accordance with internal regulatory documents, such as PRO-ENU 501-17 Analysis of the quality management system by senior management.

The following documents are applied in the management of the main processes (educational, methodical, scientific, educational): decisions of collegiate management bodies (Scientific and Advisory Council, Academic Council, Scientific and Technical Council, rector's office), orders of the rector and the decree of pro-rectors in the areas of activity, documents on students (decrees on personnel, undergraduate students, graduate students, doctoral students), planned, analytical, reporting, financial and accounting documents.

For the exchange of information within the university there are the following means available: communication facilities (telephones, e-mail, Internet, local network, faxes, etc.); information and normative documents (norms, journals, books, reference books); archives; computer and photocopiers. The analysis on the part of top management is carried out in the areas of the management system, it affects the decisions that are made on policy changes, quality objectives, increases the effectiveness of processes; improves the products in relation to customer requirements, needs and resources. The decisions made are always recorded. To fulfill its public mission, ENU regularly publishes quantitative and qualitative information on study programmes of all levels implemented at the university on the official website. Assessment of key performance is carried out in accordance with the KPI map of faculty FP ENU 14-01-16. Data are collected throughout the academic year, and the assessment is carried out by the relevant authorities.

In all departments of the university, clerical work is conducted in accordance with the approved nomenclature of cases, preservation and archiving of documents is ensured, work is

underway to transfer to the electronic document flow I-ENU 03-16 Clerical Work. The presence of an internal information and educational portal, a ramified corporate network, allows access to all information resources from any computer and creates the necessary conditions for the qualitative training of specialists and the development of faculty members. Information resource is the automated information system Platonus, which is a programme created to support the assessment of students knowledge in the framework of the rating system, the acceptance of exams by computer testing, filling out the rating magazine, controlling students' knowledge and filling out the electronic journal with teachers (<https://edu.enu.kz/>). Access to the automated information system Platonus is carried out through the personal account of the student. Also, the system of electronic document circulation ARTA Synergy was launched at ENU in 2011 ([doc.enu.kz/login](https://doc.enu.kz/login)). The Scientific Library uses the Kazakhstan Automated Matrix Library and Information Program (KABIS) - a database which serves to automate the main library processes and create an electronic catalogue of the library stock as well as the full-text database. The collection and analysis of information on the activities of the teaching staff ensure high level of students 'satisfaction with the implementation of the study programmes, and with the work of the internal quality assurance system. Considering the technical capabilities of the automated information system Platonus at the end of each examination session, the Office of the Registry presents a report that reflects the results of academic achievements and the completion of professional practices of students, and the necessary actions taken as a result of the evaluation. GPA is calculated by the system automatically based on the results of a given student's progress. In accordance with the mission of ENU, the method of online questioning through automated information system Platonus was defined as a method of information gathering. Satisfaction of interested persons in the quality of the information received and in its completeness is investigated by means of the analysis of questionnaires for students and teaching staff. The order of implementation of automated information systems is defined in PRO ENU 606-13. The Department of Academic Affairs is a key element in the collection and processing of information concerning the educational process. For the current and midterm control of students' knowledge, the "Computer Testing System" is used, which makes it possible to produce a simultaneous independent procedure for monitoring the knowledge of students, which is necessary for the increase of the level of academic achievement, student satisfac-

tion, and the implementation of the study programmes. The received data on internal and external information undergo the stage of analytical processing. Analytical calculations are used to summarize the results and the effectiveness of the study programmes. The use of internal and external information allows ENU to react quickly to changes and deviations in the implementation of the study programmes.

Management of information about the employment of graduates of the university is carried out by the Career and Business Partnership Department. Employment is 84%. To improve the quality of training students, as well as to improve and develop educational programs, monitoring of students' satisfaction with the implementation of educational programs is conducted. The procedure for registering consent to the processing of personal data is consistent in accordance with the documented procedures of the ENU QMS.

ENU uses the educational Internet portal of the university [www.edu.enu.kz](http://www.edu.enu.kz). ENU information software includes the following software tools: INFOKIOSK.ENU, ARTA SYNERGY, Platonus, Mail.enu, moodle.enu, kpi.enu. INFOKIOSK.ENU is a single entry point to all information systems of the university (automated information system Platonus, ARTA Synergy, electronic library-ENULIB, corporate mail, and official website of ENU). Information kiosks (terminal) are installed in the educational buildings of ENU. Once a year, a statistical report of 3-HK and 1-HK is formed (the annual report for the Republican Statistical Agency). Based on the results of the sessions, the system generates a report of the results of the examination session. On the basis of the report, qualitative and quantitative analyzes of students' progress in the courses are conducted, the results of which are heard and discussed at the meetings of the departments, the Council of the faculty, the university administration and the university. At the university, an internal information and educational portal ([www.enu.kz](http://www.enu.kz)) is functioning successfully. The general information part of the portal contains information about the university, its departments and the life of the university. Thus, the information that forms a particular database is analyzed and used to effectively manage the study programmes at all levels (Bachelor, Master, and Ph.D.).

Job descriptions, regulations, internal regulatory documents serve as a guarantee for the lawful collection and analysis of information, the regulation of the responsibility of officials for the reliability of information posted in the automated information system Platonus and ARTA Synergy.

ENU has created and effectively operates a unified automated data management database, which allows for the systematic collection, analysis and use of information to achieve goals in all areas of activity.

### **Conclusion**

- Criterion is **fulfilled**

### **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.8: Public information**

[Institutions should publish information about their activities, including programmes, which is clear, accurate, objective, up-to date and readily accessible.]

#### **Assessment**

Modern information systems, information and communication technologies and software are widely used in ENU in order to adequately inform the public.

The main source of informing the public about the activities of the ENU is a university site ([www.enu.kz](http://www.enu.kz)). The site is based on the principles of timeliness, accessibility and openness. Through the website the image of the university is formed, the information environment for the high school graduates, students, employees of the university is provided, etc.

The site clearly reflects the mission, goals and objectives of the university. Information on the scientific and educational nature, history, achievements of the university and its structure are also described.

Preparation of information for its distribution to the public is carried out by the ENU website. Collection and preparation of materials is carried out by web-representation and the responsible teacher of the department of ENU.

Each faculty of the university has its own page, which contains brief information about the educational process:

- Information on the administration of the university and structural subdivisions (contact details and e-mail addresses of the administrative staff and structural subdivisions of the university);
- General information on the rights and duties of students;
- Features of training a student on credit technology;
- Where information is reflected on the amount of the student's workload, the system for assessing students' learning achievements, the methodology for calculating gpa, etc;
- Instructions on how to work with educational and scientific literature, rules of note-taking;

- Information on the mechanism for transferring, return and expelling the student (explanations of the terms of the transfer, the reasons for the expulsion, the procedure and the terms of the return);
- Information on the organization of independent work of students (described with an explanation of the forms of implementation, control of implementation);
- Information on the organization of the examinations at the end of semesters for students;
- Information on tuition fees and scholarships;
- The procedure for awarding vacant educational grants that were released in the process of obtaining higher education;
- Rules for the use of material and information resources of the university;
- The general procedure for implementation of the external academic mobility of students at ENU;
- Rules of living in a student dormitory;
- Contacts and addresses.

The website is available in three languages (Kazakh, Russian, and English). Popular sections of the site include Admissions, Training, and Career as well as news and site announcements. The greatest interest to the site is shown by applicants. In order to study the system of education in the university, the order of admission, etc.

Entrants can study all this information in the Admissions section. The visitors of the site are provided with all information about the general conditions of admission to the university - a passing point for admission, necessary documents, conditions of admission, information for foreign applicants, price lists of paid tuition fees for the school year and opportunities for obtaining educational loans and deposits. Students can find the current regulations on the award of internal grants, as well as on benefits and social assistance to students at the university.

In the section you can get acquainted with the list of educational programs in the faculties (bachelor, master, and doctorate). The exact description of the study programme is placed on the pages of the faculties departments. The web page of the department Management includes:

- General information about the department;

- Information about the management and faculty members;
- On international cooperation;
- On scientific projects and bases of practices.

All activities and events of the department are published in the media and on the pages of the department on the faculty website. The chair places information about the scientific achievements of students and teachers.

The chair conducts round tables, forums, conferences focused on the development of cooperation and interaction with employers, local authorities, partner universities, etc. The analysis of the public information policy implemented by the department shows its multifaceted nature, which allows covering the activity of the department comprehensively and objectively.

In the section Academic process the faculty sites contain academic calendar, a schedule for the semester, a timetable for the examination session as well as access to the educational portal Platonus.

The section Career contains information about the employment of graduates, practical bases, and vacancies. Questionnaires for employers are also conducted for the assessment of the satisfaction level with employment and completion of internships by ENU students.

The site publishes announcements on the internship of vacancies for students and graduates. To help students, the site has a sample of a CV to help find the first job.

In the section Announcements, announcements about vacancies are published on ENU website. This section contains information about various activities that take place in the university, competitions and programmes in which students can participate. For example, information about free language courses, admission of documents for participation in the program of academic mobility, etc. information on the participation of students in conferences, scientific grants. On the main page of the site foreign students and academic partners of the university can leave a review.

Every month in the News Section materials are published regarding the meetings of the collective governing bodies of the ENU, Academic Council, etc. Annually there is a meeting of the rector, which is about the activities of the university from the previous year. When it is held, a live broadcast is available via YouTube channel.



The section ENU Life informs students on the Centre for Youth Policy, clubs and associations of the university as well as news about the student life of the University.

On the official website of the university there is a section Development, in which the results of the external evaluation of the university are published. In the subsection Accreditation documentary evidence of the accreditation of all educational programmes at ENU. Also in this section there is a subsection Ratings that provided data on international and republican ratings in which ENU participates.

The website also includes a feedback system. The e-mail of the Admissions Committee is available throughout the school year.

On the main page of the site there is a Rector's Blog, where visitors can ask questions and receive answers from structural divisions and comments of the rector on the topics discussed. The contacts of the dean and his deputies, heads of the department and teachers are provided on the faculty website.

Also on the site is a specialized mail [vopros\\_rektoru@enu.kz](mailto:vopros_rektoru@enu.kz) for students and university staff to apply.

Direct communication with university perspective and current students is carried out through accounts in social networks on VK, Facebook, Instagram, etc. This work is actively carried out during the admission period as well as before the meeting of the rector with the public or his meeting with the faculty members and the student community of the university.

Information posted on the site ENU as well as faculty websites is used for the preparation of information booklets about the university and the companies in cooperation with partners and employers.

Preparation of information for its distribution for to the public through mass media is carried out by the university press service according to the annual media plan of the university. Collection of information from faculties and other structural units of the University is also carried out by the press service. Materials are published by the press service or under its editing on the official site of ENU as well as in the national media.

Thus, the official website contains clear, accurate, objective and up-to-date information on the activities of the department, programmes being implemented, the expected results of studies on these programmes, qualifications, teaching, training, evaluation procedures and

educational opportunities provided to students as well as information on opportunities employment of graduates.

To improve the level of awareness of the target audience, the department for monitoring the implementation of the strategy conducts various types of questionnaires:

- Electronic survey of Bachelor and Master students on the quality of educational programs
- Questioning of staff and faculty members about job satisfaction
- Questioning of students to identify job satisfaction by the admissions office, living conditions in the dormitory, student self-government, adaptation in the university, etc.
- Annual questioning of students "Teacher with the eyes of students".

It is worth noting that it is recommended to provide the option "for the visually impaired" on the official website with the goal of full inclusion of the potential target audience.

The procedure for informing the public is based on the provision of information:

- On ENU activities;
- On implemented study programmes, goals and expected key learning outcomes;
- Qualifications awarded;
- Teaching, evaluation procedures, general conditions of admission, educational opportunities, employment opportunities, which is in line with the recommendations of the European Higher Education Area.

## **Conclusion**

- Criterion **has been fulfilled**

### **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.9: On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes**

*[Institutions should monitor and periodically review their programmes to ensure that they achieve the objectives set for them and respond to the needs of students and society. These reviews should lead to continuous improvement of the programme. Any action planned or taken as a result should be communicated to all those concerned.]*

#### **Assessment**

To ensure effective implementation of study programmes and create an enabling learning environment at ENU the following tools are applied: questioning of all persons interested in the quality of training; active cooperation with employers on quality assurance issues; internal university quality monitoring system and the activities of the faculty, department and university structures for quality control and assurance.

The university regularly reviews the Strategy and Policy in the field of quality, monitors their implementation. To ensure quality assurance, the university complies with the requirements of the normative regulations of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, implements international requirements and procedures for improving the quality of education, analyses the effectiveness of planning and reporting, conducts sociological monitoring of the implementation of the mission and strategy, attracts stakeholders - social partners, employers, teaching staff, observes the principle of openness of university management for proposals.

The development of strategic documents is also carried out based on the results of the analysis of the external and internal environment, identified risks, compliance of resources, labour market needs and specifics of the market of educational services. The discussion annually takes place at the meetings of the departments, Councils of the Faculties and the Academic Council of the university. In this context, opinions and proposals of employers and students are taken into account.

The departments annually monitor, assess and revise the study programmes, taking into account the views of the representatives of the students, employers who are members of the Study Programmes Development Committee.

The Quality Assessment Department carries out ongoing monitoring and regular evaluation in the form of online questionnaires. The questionnaires are conducted with the purpose of finding out the quality of educational services, reveal the degree of satisfaction of students with the quality of the subjects taught (the quality of teaching lectures, seminars and laboratory classes, the quality of assignments and the time for their implementation, teaching and methodological support) and receiving suggestions from students related to this issue. The survey is conducted twice a year and is available here: [https://my.enu.kz/page\\_anketa](https://my.enu.kz/page_anketa) in the Kazakh and Russian languages. The results are analysed by the departments and taken into account.

The analysis of the questionnaires showed that, in general, students of study programmes undergoing the accreditation process are satisfied with the quality of the educational services provided. Chairs analyse the progress of students, the conformity of the forms of evaluation of students learning and the results of the discipline and assess the appropriateness of the work load of disciplines; if necessary, changes in the work load of the respective disciplines are introduced.

The interests of employers are taken into account by monitoring the analysis of their satisfaction with study programmes based on the results of internships, the results of the employment of graduates, scientific and practical forums held at the university with the participation of representatives of professional sectors, and the involvement of employers in the development of modular Master programmes. Employers are satisfied with the competencies of graduates.

All suggestions of students and other stakeholders are reflected in the minutes of the expanded meeting of the departments, the changes introduced are reflected in the study programmes, catalogue of elective subjects and the learning and methodical materials for the subject. Proposals concerning the work of support services are sent to the relevant structural units of the university.

The analysis of the self-assessment report, the results of the meetings with Bachelor and Master students, and teaching staff showed that the departments monitor, regularly assess

and revise the study programme strategy with regards to the requirements and recommendations of the ministry of Science and Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, ACQUIN accreditation agency, and other stakeholders.

Thus, the monitoring, regular evaluation and revision of the study programmes allows the staff of the ENU to adjust study programmes in a timely manner, taking into account the achievements of modern science, the trends of change in the labour market, thus, ensuring the training of competitive professionals.

It is recommended to introduce and implement permanent feedback documentation used on a regular basis for acquisition of students' opinions based on the results of surveys and out of these ongoing activities.

## **Conclusion**

- **Criterion has been fulfilled**

### **ESG Part 1. Standard 1.10: Cyclical external quality assurance**

[Institutions should undergo external quality assurance in line with the ESG on a cyclical basis.]

#### **Assessment**

ENU conducts external quality assurance procedures in accordance with the State General Education Standard and European Standards and Recommendations (ESG) on a regular basis. The university carries out procedures for the accreditation of study programmes through national and foreign accreditation agencies and publishes information on accredited study programmes on its webpage. Also, the university regularly conducts procedures for institutional accreditation.

Quality Management System of ENU is subjected to constant examination regarding its compliance with all the requirements of ISO 9001:2008.

#### **Conclusion**

**The group of experts makes a few minor recommendations and concludes that Standard 1.10 of the Standards and Recommendations for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG) has been fulfilled.**

#### **4. Recommendation for the Accreditation Commission of ACQUIN and Accreditation Council of IAAR**

*(The university does not receive this part of the report)*

##### **Assessment of the implementation of Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), as amended.**

The study programmes 5B050600 – Economics (Bachelor), 5B050700 – Management (Bachelor), 6M050600 – Economics (Scientific and Pedagogical Master), 6M050600 – Economics (Profile Master), 6M050700 – Management (Scientific and Pedagogical Master), 6M050700 – Management (Profile Master), 6D051700 – Innovative Management (PhD) have been evaluated on compliance with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG).

The group of experts makes a conclusion that Standard 1.1 (Policy for quality assurance), Standard 1.2 (Design and approval of programmes), Standard 1.3 (Student-centred learning, teaching and assessment), Standard 1.4: Student admission, progression, recognition and certification), Standard 1.5 (Teaching staff), Standard 1.6 (Learning resources and student support), Standard 1.7 (Information management), Standard 1.8 (Public information), Standard 1.9 (On-going monitoring and periodic review of programmes), Standard 1.10 (Cyclical external quality assurance) have been fulfilled.

The group of experts points out that the recommendations from the first-time accreditation procedure are properly taken into account.

##### **Recommendation on accreditation**

The group of experts recommends accrediting the study programmes 5B050600 – Economics (Bachelor), 5B050700 – Management (Bachelor), 6M050600 – Economics (Scientific and Pedagogical Master), 6M050600 – Economics (Profile Master), 6M050700 – Management (Scientific and Pedagogical Master), 6M050700 – Management (Profile Master), 6D051700 – Innovative Management (PhD) without conditions but with the following recommendations:

1. The university should allocate more resource for the equipment of the university library in order to purchase more recent international literature in the fields of Economics and Management.
2. In order to foster the research environment at the university, the workload of young researcher should be reduced in terms of administrative duties and tasks in the self-governance of the university.
3. Timetables of courses in study programmes should be organized in a more flexible way to provide more available time for research.
4. The university should strengthen efforts to attract more lecturers from foreign universities. Visible international publications and the participation international conferences of faculty members might support these efforts.
5. It is necessary to strengthen cooperation between international and university partners. In addition, international mobility of teachers should be encouraged by introducing an appropriate incentive programme.
6. The system of academic integrity should be systematized and formalized in the form of a student information brochure handed out with registration.

#### **Recommendations for degree programmes "Economics" (Bachelor and Master)**

1. At least one additional Quantitative Course should be prescribed from the list of Elective Disciplines numbers 35, 36 or 37 in the *Catalogue 5B050600 Economics* and made mandatory for the students of Economics.
2. The incorporation of the following Electives into the curriculum is recommended: 1) Game Theory, 2) Economic History, 3) International Monetary Economics and 4) Economics and Politics of the Soviet Transition.
3. An interdisciplinary option should be made available as Elective (i.e. opening of study programs).
4. The integration of practitioners as guest lecturers from industry and finance (we suggest at least 5 experts per year) should form an integral part of the syllabus in Economics.