

To Accreditation Council
of Eurasian Center
for Accreditation and Quality Assurance
in Higher education and Health Care

05.03.2022

**REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION
BASED ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL
PROGRAMME
7R01125 – “TRAUMATOLOGY AND ORTHOPEDICS (ADULT, CHILDREN)”
OF NEI "KAZAKH-RUSSIAN MEDICAL UNIVERSITY"
FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF
POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMMES (SPECIALTY OF
RESIDENCY) IN MEDICAL ORGANIZATIONS OF EDUCATION**

external expert evaluation period: 16-18 February 2022

Almaty, 2022

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	5
2.1.	Presentation of "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" and educational programme 7R01125 "Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)"	5
2.2.	Information on previous accreditation	7
2.3.	Conclusion on the results of the review of the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme 7R01125 "Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)" for compliance with the Standards for accreditation of postgraduate programmes (specialty of residency) of medical organizations of education and conclusions	7
3.	Description of the external expert evaluation and conclusion	7
4.	Results of the survey of teachers and residents	8
5.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01125 "Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)"	9
6.	Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme 7R01125 "Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)"	15
7.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	16
	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme (generalization) 7R01125 "Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)"	17
	Attachment 2. List of documents studied as part of the external expert evaluation	18
	Attachment 3. Organization Visit programme	

List of symbols and abbreviations

Abbreviation	Interpretation
RoK	Republic of Kazakhstan
MoH RoK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RoK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
GD	Government Decree
NEI	Non-State educational institution
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care
SCES	State compulsory standard of education
university	Higher education institution
OHPE	Organization of higher and postgraduate education
SC	Scientific Council
AC	Academic Council
CEP	Educational Programmes Committee
AMP	Administrative and managerial personnel
TS	Teaching staff
TCC	Training and Clinical Center
EP	Educational programme
DP&CEP	Department of planning and control of the educational process
CED	Catalog of elective disciplines
CMI	Control measuring instruments
QEP	Quality of the educational process
AC	Attestation Committee
RIEP	Individual educational plan of the resident
IWRT	Independent work of the resident under the supervision of the teacher
IWS	Independent work of the student (resident)
EP	Educational Plan
WC	Work Curriculum
TEP	Typical educational plan
RW	Research work
EEC	External expert commission
NLA	Normative legal acts
EMC	Emergency medical care
PHC	Primary health care
MTB	Material and technical base
PD	Profiling Disciplines

1. Composition of the external expert commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 02 dated 02.02.2022, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as EEC) was formed to conduct an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01125 "Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)" in the period from 16 to 18 February, as follows:

order №	Status as part of EEC	Full name	Regalia, position, place of work/place of study, course, specialty
1	chairperson	Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Surgical Diseases of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda", President of the NJSC "Surgical Association of Karaganda Region", member of the International Surgery Society
2	Foreign Expert	Ruslan Abdullaevich Nasyrov	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Vice-Rector for Scientific Work, Head of the Department of Pathological Anatomy with a Course of Forensic Medicine of the St. Petersburg State Pediatric Medical University of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, Member of the New York Academy of Sciences
3	Foreign Expert	Tatyana Vasilyevna Pozdeeva	doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, head of the Department of Economics, management and Medical Law, Dean of the Faculty of Medicine and Prevention and the Faculty of Higher Nursing Education of the Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of Higher Education "Volga Research Medical University" of the Ministry of Health of the Russian Federation, Nizhny Novgorod
4	Kazakh Academic Expert	Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Children's Diseases with Neonatology, NJSC "West Kazakhstan State Medical University named after Marat Ospanov"
5	Kazakh Academic Expert	Ermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Public Health and Public Health, NJSC "West Kazakhstan medical University named after Marat Ospanov", training coach Mandatory social health insurance of the Western region.
6	Kazakh Academic Expert	Akhmetova Almira Kalikapasovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the dermatovenerology and cosmetology Department of NJSC Semey Medical University
7	Kazakh Academic	Kudabaeva Khatima Ilyasovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Internal Diseases

	Expert		No.1, NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov"
8	Kazakh Academic Expert	Sadieva Zhanar Zamankhanovna	Anesthesiologist-resuscitator, anesthesiologist-resuscitator, head of the department of postgraduate education of JSC "South Kazakhstan Medical Academy".
9	Kazakh Academic Expert	Zhunusova Aigul Bitimbayevna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, doctor – pediatrician of the highest category, director of the Department of Academic Work of Semey Medical University NJSC
10	Kazakh Academic Expert	Tuleutaeva Raykhan Esenzhanovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Pharmacology and Evidence-Based Medicine of NJSC Semey Medical University
11	Kazakh Academic Expert	Tezekbaev Kanat Mardenovich	Head of the Department of Traumatology and Orthopedics of NJSC "Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University"
12	Kazakh Academic Expert	Rakhmanov Eltai Utemuratovich	PhD, Deputy Director of the Master's Programme in Sports Medicine and Rehabilitation, Instructor, School of Medicine, Nazarbayev University, organizer of educational, practical and research work of undergraduates in sports medicine and rehabilitation
13	Employers' representative	Zhazira Dzhumabekovna Moldabaeva	Deputy Chief Physician of the State Enterprise on the Right of Economic Management "City Polyclinic No.29"
14	Resident Representative	Ermekbai Abay Amanzholy	Resident of the second year of study in the specialty "Anesthesiology and resuscitation, including pediatric" of NJSC "Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University"

The observer for ECAQA is Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna, Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department.

The work of the ECAQA was carried out in accordance with the Regulation of EEC (Order of the Director General of ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017). The ECAQA report contains an assessment of the residency educational programme in the specialty 7R01125 "Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)" of the Kazakh-Russian Medical University for compliance with the Standards of Accreditation of Postgraduate Education Programmes (Residency Specialty) of Medical Organizations of Education and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the ECAQA for further improvement of approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above educational programme and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

2. General part of the final report

2.1 Presentation of "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" and educational programme 7R01125 "Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)"

Organization name, legal form of ownership, bin	Non-governmental educational institution "Kazakh-Russian Medical University", 970 240 002 300
Management body	The supreme body – the general meeting of participants Executive body – Rector Control body – Audit Commission Collegiate body – Academic Council
Full name of the chief executive officer	Dzhainakbayev Nurlan Temirbekovich
Created in	1992 г.
Location and contact details	71, Torekulova str., Almaty
State license for educational activities in the residency (date, number)	license for educational activities AB No. 0137388, issued by the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on June 2, 2010
Information on branches, subsidiaries (if any)	no.
Year of implementation of the accredited educational programme (EP)	Year 2020
Duration of training	3 years
Total number of graduates since the beginning of EP implementation	21 graduates transferred from KazMUNO
Number of residents on EP since the beginning of the current year	45 trainees
Full-time trainers/ Combiners involved in the implementation of EP, incl. % of degree	9/6, 53%

The NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" (hereinafter – the University) was established in 1992 as the Kazakhstan Medical Institute (KMI). In 2010, KMI was renamed into Kazakh-Russian Medical University (certificate of state re-registration No. 9833-1910-U-e dated May 4, 2010).

NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" is an educational institution that provides students with competitive higher and postgraduate medical education with a state diploma.

The University currently represents the organization of medical education with a private form of ownership, having the necessary material, technical and scientific and educational base, highly qualified pedagogical and scientific personnel (license for educational activities AB No. 0137388, issued by the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on June 2, 2010). The University trains specialists in the following levels: bachelor's degree, internship, residency and master's degree on the basis of existing state licenses for higher and postgraduate levels, additional education in accordance with the current State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and also implements additional education programmes. On the basis of the order of the acting chairperson of the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 15, 2018 No.264, the direction of the master's degree in EP 6M110100 "Medicine" (license No. 0137388) and 6M110200 "Public Health Care" (license No. 0162831) was opened at the NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University".

The principles of the Bologna process, the credit system of training is implemented in all specialties of the bachelor's degree. Since 2011, the University publishes a quarterly magazine «Actual problem of theoretical and clinical medicine».

In accordance with Article 23 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Science", the University has been accredited by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan as a subject of scientific and technical activity, certificate number Series MK No. 005269 dated 08.10.2018. The university budget is formed from several sources: the republican budget (state order for training specialists of higher, postgraduate and additional education), provision of paid educational services.

The main applied scientific direction of the university is the development of innovations for implementation in practical health care, including the development of mobile medicine for the rural population. Thus, for his achievements in the development of mobile medical complexes, Rector, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor N.T. Dzhainakbayev was awarded the quality certificate of the Swiss Institute of Quality Standard "International Quality Certificate" (SIQS) on July 1, 2015. In order to develop cooperation, 30 agreements, agreements and memoranda with Kazakhstan and foreign higher educational institutions have been concluded. In 2012, the University successfully passed the State Attestation of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, in 2018 and 2020 – preventive control of the Committee for ensuring control in the field of education and science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Training of students is conducted in the state, Russian and English languages. Form of study – full-time, daytime. Over 29 years of activity, the University has trained more than 6,000 specialists successfully working in the practical health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

2.2 Information on previous accreditation

Not conducted.

2.3 Conclusion on the results of the review of the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme 7R01125 "Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)" for compliance with the Standards for accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (specialty of residency) of medical organizations of education and conclusions

Self-assessment report 7R01125 – "Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)" (hereinafter – the report) is presented on 98 pages of the main text, 13 appendices on 12 pages, copies or electronic versions of <http://www.iaar.kz/en/accreditation-en/perechen-akkreditovannykh-obrazovatelnykh-programm/respublika-kazakhstan/meditsinskie-organizatsii-obrazovaniya#> and 2 educational programmes of the master's degree programme http://www.ecaqa.org/akkreditatsiya/reestr-akkreditovannykh-meditskikh-organizatsij-obrazovaniya-i-obrazovatelnykh-programm/spetsializirovannaya-akkreditatsiya/magistratura_documents located at the link <http://medkrmu.kz/missiya-universiteta/>. (<http://medkrmu.kz/strategickie-plany-razvitiya/>)

The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to all 9 main accreditation standards and criteria, structured taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the organization of education by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the head of the Rector, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor N.T. Dzhainakbayev, which confirms the reliability of quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 12 members of the internal self-assessment commission, indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization. The self-assessment of the educational programme 7R01125 – "Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)" was carried out on the basis of the order of the rector No. 26-02-50/1-n/k dated 01.07.2021 "On preparation for accreditation and organization of the process of self-assessment of educational programmes". "On the establishment of a working group for conducting a specialized self-assessment and writing a report"

In all standards, the real practice of the NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" on the training of residents in the specialty "Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)" is given, taking

into account the beginning of admission of students in 2021-22, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently complete and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of knowledge and skills assessment, material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc.

The report is presented in the ECAQA in a completed form, with the correction of data on the above recommendations, written in a competent language, the formulations for each standard are clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of standards, tables and figures (diagrams, photographs) contain references in the text and have end-to-end numbering.

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving to the next stage of the accreditation procedure, the external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the information from the report with the information that will be obtained during the visit to the educational institution, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

3. External expert evaluation

External expert work in the framework of the evaluation of the educational programme 7R01136 – "**General Surgery**" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external evaluation of educational institutions and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care" No.5 dated February 17, 2017) and in accordance with the programme approved on February 02, 2022 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the Rector of the NEI "KazRosmeduniversity" N.T. Dzhainakbayev.

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is presented in detail in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the Programme), which is contained in the documentation of the accreditation center and in Attachment 3 to this report. The programme is evidence of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

To obtain objective information, the EEC members used the following methods and their results:

- interview with management and administrative staff – 12 people in total;
- interviews with residents – 32 total people,
- study website <http://medkrmu.kz/missiya-universiteta/> <http://medkrmu.kz/strategicheskie-plany-razvitiya/>
- interviewing 11 employees, 13 teachers;
- questionnaires of teachers and residents – 113 and 200, respectively

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. The final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of the interview, questionnaires was held. EEC members started designing the final EEC report. The results of the external evaluation are summarized. The experts individually completed the "Quality Profile and External Evaluation Criteria 7R01125 – Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)" according to the criteria of specialized accreditation for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

4. Results of the survey.

An observer from the ECAQA in the period from 16.02 to 18.02.2022 conducted an online questionnaire on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>.

The resident survey includes 22 questions.

In total 200 people (in total 629 residents for the current year) answered.

Residents of the first year of study – 51.5% prevailed from the total number of respondents, further on according to the list: residents of the 2nd year of study – 33.5%, residents of the 3rd-4th year of study – 11.5%, graduates – 3.5%.

Of the responses received, 87.5% will recommend this university as an educational institution, and 11% will recommend it partially. Fully agree with 89% of respondents and 9% partially that programme managers and faculty are aware of their learning challenges. Fully (87.5%) and partially (10.5%) satisfied with the conditions and equipment of the teaching rooms, classrooms of the university. According to 82.5% (fully) and 14.5% (partially) of office equipment is available for residents on practical bases. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature, 87% of respondents fully agree to prepare for classes, 11.5% partially. The library fund and resources were fully satisfied with 85.5 per cent of respondents, with a partial satisfaction rate of 11 per cent. 88% of respondents have access to electronic educational resources, and 9% consider that partially. According to 87% of respondents, the organization of clinical training for residents fully satisfies them, and 11.5% partially. There is sufficient time for practical training (patient supervision, etc.), we completely agree – 95%, partially 4%. Satisfied with the methods of assessing my knowledge and skills, fully agree 90%, partially 9.5%. According to the respondents, 90.5 per cent of teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods on a regular basis, and 7 per cent respond seldom. According to 90% of respondents, teachers constantly provide feedback after completing classes, but according to 7.5% - sometimes, and 1.5% – rarely. Fully satisfied that study in higher education – 93%, partially – 5.5%, disappointed – 1% of the respondents. Completely (93%) and partially (6%) satisfied with the organization of teaching at the KRMU. The work of the EEC was assessed as positive – 89.5%, satisfactory – 7.5%.

The teacher survey included 21 questionnaire questions. A total of 113 people answered (484 in total), with 28.3% having teaching experience up to 5 years, 22.1% up to 10 years, and 49.6% over 10 years.

74.34% are completely satisfied with the organization of the educational process, and 22.12% are partially satisfied. The university observes ethics and subordination, 86.73% completely agree, 11.5% partially. Fully satisfied with the organization of work and workplace 75.22% of respondents, partly 23%. In the organization there is an opportunity for career growth and development of competence to teachers, completely agree – 70.8%, partially – 22.12%.

In this educational institution, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research – 75.22% completely agree, 16.8% partially. 83.2% of respondents are fully satisfied with the work of the personnel service, and 13.3% are partially satisfied. Half of those surveyed underwent further training during the year. Only 81.4% fully agree that they can be implemented as professionals, and 13.3% partially. Unfortunately, 33.6% did not answer the question whether the university supports the teacher in the participation of International and Republican events, and 30.97% did not address this question to the leadership. Most of the respondents 73.45% completely agree, and 22.1% partially agree that the disciplines are provided with sufficient resources (classrooms, equipment). 38.9% are unaware of the implementation of social programmes to support teachers and doubt their availability 10.6% of respondents. The management and administration systematically listen to the opinion of teachers – 65.5%, sometimes 18.6% of respondents. Various teaching methods are used in the education of students, but most often the analysis of situational tasks is used (75.2%), oral surveys (61%), less often they rewrite thematic information from a monograph (10.6%). 70.8% fully agree that this survey will be useful for the development of recommendations for improving the university and educational programmes of the residency, 14.2% partially agree with this.

The results of the questionnaire presented in the Attachment generally demonstrate the effective management of educational programmes, the positive aspects of training in residency programmes, at the same time determine areas for improvement (social support programmes for teachers, support for teachers in terms of improving their professional competence, support for teachers in terms of

participation in International and Republican conferences, support for both students and teachers in academic mobility.

5. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme 7R01125 "Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)"

Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES

Evidence of compliance:

The mission of the educational programme on OP7R01125 – "Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)" is aimed at training a highly competitive specialist. Elective disciplines are devoted to the study of the most pressing issues of traumatology and orthopedics

Training of residents in EP 7R01125 - "Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)" is carried out on the basis of multidisciplinary clinics of the city with a strong staff, which contributes to the fulfillment of the mission and allows the student to receive clinical training at all levels of medical care in the field of traumatology and orthopaedics

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 17 standards: full – 17.

Standard 1: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1. Improvement of the educational process – development and implementation of effective innovative technologies in the educational process.
2. Increasing academic mobility of teachers and residents
3. Development of strategic partnership with international partners (universities, associations).

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

Evidence of compliance:

A competence-oriented approach is used in the training of residency students. Introduction of innovative teaching methods, modern testing methods. Formation of a catalog of elective disciplines taking into account the need for practical health care.

The work of residents is carried out with real patients to form professional competence in various clinical conditions – research institutes, in highly specialized hospitals, in municipal hospitals, in polyclinics, family medicine organizations, at emergency medical stations, to improve skills used by the TCC.

Programme structure, content and duration are in line with the standards

A credit and modular system and an integrated training approach are used in the training of residents.

Academic mobility of residents allows to monitor the process of employment of a graduate, track the trajectory of the graduate and determine the needs of the employer and the quality of training.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 30 standards: full – 30.

Standard 2: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Expanding the material and technical base of the department's clinical bases and providing residents with full access to high-tech equipment, strengthening the integration of education, science and practical medicine.

Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS

Evidence of compliance:

The methods used to assess the competencies of students in the NEI "KazRosmeduniversity" are defined in syllabuses on disciplines that are discussed and approved at departmental meetings, CEP, AC, SC. The assessment criteria are announced at the first lesson for each discipline, and are also presented in the syllabus on the university's website <https://krmu.edu.kz/>. Each stage (current,

milestone and final control) allows you to assess the achievement of the final results of the resident's training.

The final state certification is carried out in 2 stages: knowledge assessment (comprehensive testing in all disciplines and skills assessment (mini-clinical examination at the patient's bedside). The final assessment of graduates is carried out by the assessment organization. Development, examination and updating of the examination material is carried out by the assessment organization. Test specifications and a list of skills assessment are agreed with educational and methodological associations in the field of health personnel training (Rules for assessing the professional training of graduates of educational programmes in the field of health, approved by the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 11, 2020 No. KR DSM-249/2020). In general, according to Standard 3, it can be noted that the use of an electronic system contributes to the transparency of evaluation methods and avoids unnecessary paperwork. Portfolio evaluation allows you to assess the professional competence, communicative personal qualities and scientific interest of a resident.

The conclusions of the EEC meet the criteria of 11 standards: 11 in full.

Standard 3 implemented.

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Introduction of qualitative questionnaires and thorough analysis of questionnaires to improve the quality of the educational process.

Standard 4: STUDENTS

Evidence of compliance:

Admission to the residency under EP 7R01125 – "Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)" is carried out in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Approval of Standard Rules for Admission to Education in the Organization of Education Implementing Educational Programmes of Higher and Postgraduate Education" dated October 31, 2018 No.600, State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan – 2020 and the Rules for Admission to the Residence of the NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University" for the current academic year of the residency, the EP involves the clinical focus of education and advanced specialized training under EP 7R01125 – "Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)".

The conditions of admission of residents are described in detail in the "Rules of admission to the residency" for the relevant academic year, based on regulatory legal acts.

Number of residents admitted to the educational programme

Academic year	2020-2021	2021-2022
Number of applicants	36	14
Number of Interviews Invited	36	14
Number of interviews completed	36	14
Number of residents enrolled	36 (state order – 26, LEB – 9, paid – 1)	14 (state order – 10, LEB – 4, paid – 0)

4.3 Resident support and advice

- support is provided to residents, focused on social, financial and personal needs,
- have and allocate appropriate resources for social and personal support,
- Guarantee confidentiality in relation to advice and support provided, where appropriate

The medical organization of education develops and implements a policy on the representation of residents in advisory and collegial bodies (councils, committees, working groups, etc.) and due participation of residents in the formulation of the mission and final results of training, in the development of the training programme, planning of working conditions, evaluation of the training programme, management of the training programme.

In the implementation of the training programme, to have an approved policy of financing residents both through the receipt of scholarships and by providing opportunities for work in extracurricular time, the application of the resident incentive system and other ways of financing.

According to the Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 15, 2020 No. KR DSM-270/2020 "On approval of the rules for placing a state order, admission to training and training of medical personnel in the residency", resident doctors studying under a state educational order are paid a scholarship, in accordance with the Rules for the appointment, payment and amount of state scholarships to students in educational institutions, approved by the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 7, 2008 No. 116.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 30 standards: full – 30.

Standard 4: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Organization of academic mobility of residents and internships in partner universities;
- 2) Active participation of residents in international scientific conferences.

Standard 5: FACULTY

Evidence of compliance:

Policies for the recruitment and admission of teachers, supervisors and clinical mentors have been developed, approved and implemented, which

- determines the required experience and qualifications of the specialist, criteria of scientific and educational, pedagogical and clinical achievements,
- includes a balance between teaching, research and medical care,
- defines the responsibilities and obligations of employees,
- takes into account the ratio of teachers to residents, sufficient for effective teaching and learning.

The HR Department ensures compliance with the requirements of personnel policy in the educational programme for residency by monitoring the ratio of the profile of teaching staff, compliance with the range and balance of teachers of basic biomedical sciences, behavioral and social sciences and profiling (clinical) disciplines necessary for the implementation of the educational programme.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 7 of the standards: fully – 6, partially - 1.

Standard 5: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Further training of teachers in innovative and information technologies with the involvement of specialists from the world's leading medical schools;
- 2) Participation of teachers in competitions for the assignment of grants, scholarships;
- 3) Activate the publication of TS in journals with high Impact-factor.

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

Evidence of compliance:

The Administration of KazRosmeduniversity for continuous improvement of material and technical base from the budget of the university allocates necessary funds which are spent on: capital and current repairs, technical equipment of educational, scientific and information activity, acquisition of furniture and educational equipment, maintenance of engineering communications and networks of buildings and structures and registration of buildings and structures.

The University has signed cooperation agreements with 85 medical organizations located in Almaty, Almaty region and regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Agreements on cooperation with clinical bases are drawn up taking into account the needs of the university in the profile of patients, the level of medical care provided by medical institutions, the availability of study rooms, laboratories. When signing contracts, special attention is paid to the availability of a certificate of accreditation from medical organizations, certifying the compliance of the clinical base with the accreditation standards in

the field of health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Each year, the Clinical Operations Department updates the cooperation agreements. The specialized disciplines in EP 7R01125 – "Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)" are held on the basis of the following clinics, presented in the Attachment.

Information support for the work of residents is carried out through: the media (Facebook, Telegramm, etc.) the university website; television monitors in the lobby of educational buildings; boards of official information of the Residence Department and university departments.

Information and communication technologies, including Internet resources, international databases of scientific and educational literature, electronic textbooks are actively used in the implementation of the educational programme for residency,

The Kazakh-Russian Medical University has a test center for 122 seats, 3 computer rooms for 39 seats, a linguistic office for 15 seats, an electronic library hall for 22 seats. The total number of computers is 500.

The programme for training residents in EP 7R01125 – Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children) to work in a team and effectively interact with other health care specialists includes direct work of residents together with employees of clinical bases in all spheres of their activity, participation in selector republican and city meetings, in scientific and practical conferences, work in multidisciplinary teams. Working in multidisciplinary teams when choosing the tactics of managing the most complex patients increases the responsibility of residents when they see that performance depends on the correct organization of team work. In such situations, the resident performs all work within his competence.

The skills of coordination of work with colleagues and other health care specialists in residents according to EP 7R01125 – "Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)" develop during examination, treatment and emergency care of patients. The resident is present during the consultations, fulfills the orders of senior colleagues within his competence.

According to the strategy of the NEI "KazRosmeduniversity", since 2011 applied research works have been implemented by the faculty of departments/courses, students of the university through temporary scientific teams created for the implementation of research projects, the purpose of which was to increase the level of training of the future specialist in the university, as a single educational and research and production complex, by forming the resident's basic research competencies necessary for future professional activity.

The main applied scientific direction of the university is the development of innovations for implementation in practical health care, including the development of mobile medicine for the rural population. Thus, initiative research was carried out on the topic: "Improving the provision of medical care to residents of rural regions at the level of primary health care through mobile complexes".

The use of mobile medical complexes makes it possible to deploy a modern medical clinic based on the capacity of any medical institution, organized according to a modular principle.

Examination of the quality of the implemented educational programme of the residency is a mandatory stage of the educational process and is carried out by the following structures of the NEI "KazRosmeduniversity": departments (planning, development, implementation, monitoring, evaluation, revision of the EP), Committee of educational programmes (planning, development, monitoring, evaluation, revision of the EP), Department of academic work (coordination, control of compliance with the NLA, monitoring, evaluation of the EP), Residency Department (implementation, monitoring, revision of the EP), Department of strategic development and QMS (coordination, monitoring, evaluation, revision of the EP), Academic Council (approval, evaluation, revision of the EP), Training Council (approval, evaluation, revision of the EP). The composition of collegial advisory bodies (CEP, AC, SC) includes teachers, representatives of professional associations, employers, students. Order for the composition of the CEP No. 26-02-15-n/k dated 28.08.2020)

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Meet of 21 standards: fully -21.

Standard 6: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: none.

Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION

Evidence of compliance:

Within the framework of the general system of monitoring the quality of education, which consists in assessing:

management of EP (level of teaching staff, organization of the educational process, regular assessment of the level of achievement of the programme goals, demand for graduates); implementation of EP (curriculum, standard programmes of disciplines, methodological and information support, infrastructure, educational technologies, research); results of EP (interim certification, final certification).

Monitoring and evaluation of EP is carried out at all levels, a multilevel approach is used, including the profiling /graduating and related departments, the residency department, the specialized CEP of postgraduate education, the AWD, the Academic Council, the Academic Council, the Career Center (general monitoring of the quality of educational programmes through a survey of stakeholders (employers, professional associations and students).

Recruitment of residents according to EP 7R01125 – "Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)" was carried out for the first time in 2011, the first issue is planned for 2023.

Adequate stakeholder representation is observed in assessing the processes and outcomes of resident training programmes. Thus, the CEP includes the heads of the department, professors, associate professors, teachers of departments that provide the educational process in the relevant specialty, representatives of the student population. The composition of the AC, the CEP is approved by the Rector of the University.

Departments collect feedback from students, representatives of practical health care, teachers of other educational organizations in the form of reviews.

In 2021, a sociological study was conducted "Satisfaction of employers with graduates of the NEI "KazRosmeduniversity". 30 employers (60% response rate) from 6 oblasts and the city of Almaty were interviewed. The results of the survey of employers on the quality of training of graduates of the NEI "KazRosmeduniversity" for 2021 showed that no employer rated the quality of training as low.

Stakeholders have access to the results of evaluation of individual courses and the educational programme as a whole.

Mechanisms for the approval of educational programmes have been developed, which provide for the evaluation of programmes at the stages of planning, implementation, analysis of results and implementation of changes, which allows monitoring the process of implementation of educational programmes and the progress of residents, and ensures the identification and timely solution of emerging problems.

Examination of the EP is carried out by the CEP, for compliance with the IWS, approves the CED according to the trajectories of training of a specialist, taking into account pre- and post-requisites, evaluates the choice of methods for assessing the results of training of residents.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 15 standards: fully – 15.

Standard 7: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Strengthen feedback to graduates by residents and the employer.

Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

Evidence of compliance:

Continued organizational, coordination and administrative work to achieve the mission and objective;
Innovative structure of the university;

Transparency of the management system and decisions made;

The responsibility of academic management in relation to the development and management of the educational programme is determined;

High academic evaluation of learning achievements and outcomes;

Sustainable financial condition of the university
Extensive collaboration with partners in the health sector.

The mechanism of interaction of the NEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University", as a state medical higher education institution, with the authorized bodies (Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan) and the health sector is regulated by: the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan; the implementation of State programmes, Decrees and orders; contracts and agreements with health management bodies; contracts and agreements with health care organizations; written appeals of authorized state bodies and medical organizations.

In general, the transparency of the management system can be noted for 8 standards. Organizational, coordination and administrative work is established. Extensive collaboration with partners in the health sector.

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 15 standards: fully – 15.

Standard 8: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Improve the financing mechanism at all levels for the full development of residents (academic mobility, participation in international events).

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

Evidence of compliance:

- Continued organizational, coordination and administrative work to achieve the mission and objective;
- Transparency of the management system and decisions made;
- The responsibility of academic management in relation to the development and management of the educational programme is determined;
- High academic evaluation of learning achievements and outcomes;
- Sustainable financial condition of the university;
- Extensive cooperation with partners in the health sector

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Compliant with 4 standards: fully - 4.

Standard 9: Implemented

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

6. Recommendations for the improvement of the educational programme 7R01125 Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)

- 1) To develop academic mobility of teachers and residents and internships of teachers in partner universities (standards 2.5).
- 2) Systematize the process of training teachers in innovative and information technologies with the involvement of specialists from the world's leading medical schools (standard 5).
- 3) Encourage the participation of teachers in competitions for the assignment of grants, scholarships (standard 5).
- 4) Provide conditions and motivating factors for increasing the publication activity of teachers in journals with high Impact-factor (standard 5).
- 5) Expanding the material and technical base of the department's clinical bases and providing residents with full access to high-tech equipment, strengthening the integration of education, science and practical medicine (standard 6).
- 6) Implementation of qualitative questionnaires and thorough analysis of questionnaires to improve the quality of the educational process (standard 7).
- 7) Strengthen feedback to residency graduates and employers (Standard 7).
- 8) Improve the funding mechanism for the organization of academic mobility of residents and their participation in international events (standard 8).

7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

Members of the EEC established the compliance of the educational programme "7R01125 Traumatology and Orthopedics (adult, children)" with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this programme for a period of 5 years.

Chairperson	Turgunov Yermek Meiramovich
Foreign Expert	Ruslan Abdullaevich Nasyrov
Foreign Expert	Tatyana Vasilyevna Pozdeeva
Kazakh Academic Expert	Zhumalina Akmaral Kanasheva
Kazakh Academic Expert	Ermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Akhmetova Almira Kalikapasovna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Kudabaeva Khatima Ilyasovna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Sadieva Zhanar Zamankhanovna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Zhunusova Aigul Bitimbayevna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Tuleutaeva Raykhan Esenzhanovna
Kazakh Academic Expert	Tezekbaev Kanat Mardenovich
Kazakh Academic Expert	Rakhmanov Eltai Utemuratovich
Employers' representative	Zhazira Dzhumabekovna Moldabaeva
Resident Representative	Ermekbai Abay Amanzholuly

















Observer for ECAQA M.A. Umarova

**Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme
(generalization)**

Standard	Evaluation Criteria	Number of standards	Estimation		
			Fully compliant	Partially compliant	Not compliant
1	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	17	17		
2	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	31	31		
3	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS	11	10	1	
4	STUDENTS	30	29	1	
5	FACULTY	7	6	1	
6	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	21		
7	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	15	15		
8	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	15	15		
9	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4	4		
	Subtotal:	151	148	3	
			151		

List of documents studied by the members of the EEC during the visit to the KRMU

№	Name of the document	Identification number	Date of approval
1	2	3	4
1	Personnel policy	R-01-23-01	25.12.2020
2	Regulations on social support for students	P-03-21-06	21.06.2019
3	Regulations on the Commission for ensuring the academic quality of the educational programme	PL-03-36-08	26.08.2021
4	Regulation on the Test Committee	RB-03-18-04	28.10.2021
5	Rules for admission to the residency	PR-03-11-05	24.07.2020
6	Regulations on on-site training in internship and residency	PL-03-11-07	29.08.2019
7	Teacher Honor Code		12.12.2017
8	Regulations on the Organization of Training with the Use of Distance Education Technologies	PL-03-37-05	29.08.2019
9	Regulation on the Board of Curators	PL-03-21-08	18.11.2019
10	Regulation on the assessment of students' knowledge	PL-03-35-10	29.08.2019
11	Regulations on the current monitoring of academic performance, interim and final certification of students	PL-03-35-11	29.08.2019
12	Rules for Granting Academic Leave to Students	PR-03-35-12	29.08.2019
13	Code of Academic Integrity	K-03-36-05	27.04.2019
14	Rules of Internal Regulations for Students	PR-03-36-08	29.08.2019
15	Regulations on the Committee for Educational Programmes	PL-03-17-06	29.08.2019
16	Rules for using the "Anti-plagiarism. University" system	PR-03-17-10	29.08.2019
17	Regulation on the processing, protection and storage of personal data of employees and students	PL-03-23-06	17.06.2019
18	Clinical Instructor Statement	PL-03-11-08	17.06.2019
19	Academic Policy	R-01-17-14	27.08.2021