

To Accreditation Council  
Of Eurasian Center for Accreditation  
and Quality Assurance  
In Higher Education and Health Care

December 24, 2021

**REPORT  
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION  
ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL  
PROGRAMME  
7R01114 - "RADIOLOGY"  
OF NJSC "KAZAKHSTAN-RUSSIAN MEDICAL UNIVERSITY" FOR  
COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS OF ACCREDITATION OF  
POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMMES (SPECIALTY OF  
RESIDENCE) IN MEDICAL EDUCATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS**

**external expert evaluation period: December 13-15, 2021**

**Almaty city, 2021**

## CONTENT

	List of symbols and abbreviations	2
1.	Composition of the external expert commission	3
2.	General part of the final report	4
2.1	Presentation of the accredited organization and educational programme in the specialty - 7R01114 - "Radiology"	4
2.2	Information about previous accreditation	5
2.3	Conclusion on the results of the review of the report on the self-assessment of the educational programme - 7R01114 - "Radiology" for compliance with the Standards for Accreditation of Postgraduate Education Programmes (Residency Specialties) in Medical Educational Organizations and conclusions	5
3.	Description of external expert evaluation and conclusion	7
4.	The results of the survey of teachers and residents	14
5.	Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment educational programme - 7R01114 - "Radiology"	18
6.	Recommendations for improving the educational programme - 7R01114 - "Radiology"	28
7.	Recommendation to the Accreditation Council	29
	Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation and educational programme of residency in the specialty - 7R01114 - "Radiology"	30
	Attachment 2. List of documents reviewed as part of the external expert evaluation	31
	Attachment 3. Organization visit programme	32

## LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviation	Designation
RK	The Republic of Kazakhstan
MoH RK	Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan
MES RK	Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
GD RK	Government Decree
NEI	Non-state educational institution
ECAQA	Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care
SCES	State compulsory education standard
university	institution of higher education
OHPE	Organization of higher and postgraduate education
SC	Scientific Council
AC	Academic Council
CEP	Committee for Educational Programmes
AMP	Administrative and management personnel
TCC	Training and Clinical Center
EP	Educational programme
DPCEP	Department of planning and control of the educational process
QED	Catalog of elective disciplines
CMI	Control measuring instruments
QEP	The quality of the educational process
AC	Attestation commission
RIEP	Resident's Individual Educational Plan
IWRT	Independent work of a resident under the supervision of a teacher
IWS	Independent work of a student (resident)
AP	Academic plan
WC	Working Curriculum
TEP	Typical Curriculum
EEC	External expert commission
NLA	Regulations
EMC	emergency medical care
PHC	Primary Health Care
MED	Medicine of emergencies and disasters
MTB	Material and technical base
MD	Major disciplines

### 1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 32 of November 23, 2021, an External Expert Commission (hereinafter referred to as EEC) was formed to conduct accreditation of the educational programme - 7R01114 - "Radiology" in the period 13-15.12.2021 (date) in the following composition:

<b>Status in the EEC</b>	<b>Full name</b>	<b>Regalia, position, place of work / place of study, course, specialty</b>
Chairperson	Zhanalina Bakhyt Sekerbekovna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Surgical and Pediatric Dentistry, NJSC "Marat Ospanov West Kazakhstan Medical University"
foreign expert	Uryasiev Oleg Mikhailovich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Faculty Therapy with Courses of Endocrinology, General Physiotherapy, Clinical Pharmacology, Occupational Diseases and Military Field Therapy, Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs of the Ryazan State Medical University named after Academician I.P. Pavlova" of the Ministry of Health of Russia
foreign expert	Khasanov Adkham Ibragimovich	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Pediatric Maxillofacial Surgery of the Tashkent Dental Institute, Chairperson of the Association of Dentists of Uzbekistan
Kazakh academic expert	Yesenkulova Saule Askerovna	Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of Oncology NJSC "Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University" Member of the Association of Oncologists of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Employers' representative	Musabayeva Asem Muratovna	Candidate of Medical Sciences, Chief Physician of the Municipal State Enterprise on REM "City Polyclinic No. 9" of the Public Health Department of Almaty City, MBA, organizer of health care of the highest qualification category
Resident Representative	Ziya Azimkhan Nurzhanuly	Resident of the third year of study in the specialty "Urology and andrology for adults, children" JSC "Scientific Center of Urology named after Academician B.U. Dzharbusynov"

*ECAQA Observer - Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna - Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department of «Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care»*

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC (Order of the

ECAQA Director General No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme - 7R01114 - "Radiology" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards for postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of medical educational organizations and conclusions (hereinafter referred to as the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC for further improving the approaches and conditions for the implementation of the above educational programme - 7R01114 - "Radiology" and recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

## 2. General part of the final report

### 2.1 Representation of the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"

Organization name, legal form of ownership, BIN	National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"
Management body	Administration
Full name of the first head	Dzhaynakbaev Nurlan Temirbekovich
date of creation	In 1992, as the Kazakhstan Medical Institute (KMI), in 2010, KMI was renamed the Kazakh-Russian Medical University (certificate of state re-registration No. 9833-1910-U-e dated May 4, 2010).
Location and contact details	050004. Almaty. Torekulova st., 71 Phone: +7 727 250 83 75 Fax: +7 727 250 83 75 e-mail: <a href="mailto:info@medkrmu.kz">info@medkrmu.kz</a> Web site: <a href="http://medkrmu.kz/en/">http://medkrmu.kz/en/</a>
State license for educational activities in residency (date, number)	AB No. 0137388, issued by the Committee for Control in Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on June 02, 2010).
Information about branches, subsidiaries (if any)	-
Starting year of the accredited educational programme (EP)	2014.
Duration of study	2
The total number of graduates since the start of the EP	19
Number of residents at the EP since the beginning of the current year	20
Full-time teachers/ Part-time workers involved in the implementation of the EP, incl. % degree	7/14, 40% degree

The university is currently a privately owned medical education organization. In accordance with Article 23 of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Science", the University was accredited by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan as a subject of scientific and scientific and technical activities, certificate number Series MK No. 005269 dated 08.10.2018. The university budget is formed from several sources: republican budget (state order for the training of specialists in higher, postgraduate and additional education), the provision of paid educational services.

The main applied scientific direction of the university is the development of innovations for implementation in practical health care, including the development of mobile medicine for the rural

population. So, for achievements in the field of development of mobile medical complexes, the rector, MD, professor Jainakbaev N.T. On July 1, 2015, he was awarded the International Quality Certificate (SIQS) by the Swiss Institute for Quality Standards.

In 2016, the University was accredited by the Independent Kazakh Agency on quality Assurance in Higher Education (certificate of institutional accreditation dated May 31, 2016 IA No. 0066, valid from 05/31/2016 to 06/01/2021). Also in 2021, the University was accredited by the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care» (certificate of international institutional accreditation dated June 17, 2021 IA00039, valid from 06/17/2021 to 06/16/2026)

6 undergraduate educational programmes, 13 residency educational programmes in the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (IAAR) passed specialized accreditation <http://www.iaar.kz/ru/accreditation-ru/perechen-akkreditovannykh-obrazovatelnykh-programm/respublika-kazakhstan/meditsinskie-organizatsii-obrazovaniya#>

and 2 master's degree programmes

<http://www.ecaqa.org/akkreditatsiya/reestr-akkreditovannykh-meditsinskikh-organizatsij-obrazovaniya-i-obrazovatelnykh-programm/spetsializirovannaya-akkreditatsiya/magistratura>.

## 2.2 Information about previous accreditation

In 2016, the educational programme was accredited by the National Institution "Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating" (the certificate is valid from 03.10.2016 to 02.10.2021), registration number No. AB 1080 dated 10.30.2016 <http://medkrmu.kz/>.

## 2.3 Conclusion on the results of the review of the self-assessment report of the educational programme - 7R01114 - "Radiology" for compliance with the Standards for Accreditation of Postgraduate Education Programmes (Residency Specialties) in Medical Educational Organizations and conclusions

Report on self-assessment of the educational programme - 7R01114 - "Radiology" is presented on 126 pages of body text, 25 pages of appendices, copies or electronic versions of 12 documents located at the link <https://drive.google.com>.

The report is characterized by the completeness of answers to all 9 basic accreditation standards and criteria, structuredness taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for the self-assessment of the educational programme provided to the educational organization by the accreditation center - ECAQA, as well as the internal unity of information. Accompanying the report is a letter signed by the Head of the Rector, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor Dzhainakbaev N.T., which confirms the accuracy of the quantitative information and information included in the self-assessment report.

The report contains a list of 10 members of the internal self-assessment commission indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the self-assessment of the educational programme - Bekmagambetova Zh.M., head of the strategic development and accreditation department.

Self-assessment of the educational programme - 7R01114 - "Radiology", was carried out on the basis of the order of the head No. 26-02-50 / 1-n / k dated 07/01/2021 "On preparation for accreditation and organization of the process of self-assessment of educational programmes".

The report was reviewed by an accreditation expert: MD. Esenkulova Saule Askerovna and reviews noted strengths and areas for improvement, as well as recommendations for additions and changes, including the following:

Standards	Reviewer recommendations
1	1.1.3. Provide specific information on needs in radiology. 1.1.6. Innovations not described allowing to develop the basic and special competencies of residents. 1.1.7. Describe methods to encourage residents to become scientists/researchers 1.1.8. Give examples of the participation of resident radiologists in charity events.

	1.4.2. Specify full name employers, stakeholders involved in formulating the mission and final results of the EP7R01114 - "Radiology".
2	2.1.3. What specialty is assigned when mastering the EP 2.3.1. How is the QED formed and how is the choice ensured? 2.4.4. possible alternatives for the implementation of training are not described and the competencies of the graduate are not presented. 2.5.1 Describe the characteristics of the clinical setting that are relevant to the disciplines taught 2.2.3. Which R&D projects involve resident radiologists, give examples.
3	3.1.5. Describe what types, methods of control exist in the implementation 7R01114 - "Radiology" 3.1.6. Describe the CIS validation procedure 3.2.2. What practical skills does the resident master at the simulation center in this specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology".
4	4.2.3. Show information about the needs of health care in doctors of this specialty 4.4.1. Do residents in the specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology" participate in advisory and collegiate bodies.
5	5.1.3. Determine the responsibility of all clinical teachers and mentors in the quality implementation of the EP. Specify the proportion of full-time teachers and mentors Describe the quantitative and qualitative characteristics of teaching staff implementing the EP7R01114 - "Radiology".
6	6.2.1. Describe to line bases and their resources (departments, equipment, etc.).
7	7.1.4. Describe specifically which stakeholder proposals were taken into account when evaluating the EP 7.2.1. Describe the feedback from teachers, residents, employers and what are the results of the feedback analysis to improve the EP.
8	8.3.1. Describe the types of expenses for the implementation and development of the residency programme
9	9.1. What resources are allocated for development specifically?

Thus, in the process of feedback from the representative of the educational organization, the experts received answers to the questions that arose, and the corresponding changes and additions were made to the self-assessment report based on the recommendations of the reviewers.

All standards reflect real practice National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" for the preparation of residents in the specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology" taking into account the start of students' admission in 2014, reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. Description in the self-assessment report is sufficiently completed and up-to-date in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, results of assessment of knowledge and skills, the material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, development plans and improvement.

The report is submitted to the ECAQA in a finalized form, with data adjusted according to the above recommendations, written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable and described in accordance with the criteria of the standards, tables and diagrams (diagrams, photographs) contain links in the text and have continuous numbering .

The quality of the self-assessment report served as the basis for moving on to the next stage of the accreditation procedure - external assessment. The experts plan to validate the report data, compare the

information from the report with the information that will be obtained during a visit to the educational organization, i.e. verification of quantitative and qualitative indicators.

### **3. Description of external expert evaluation**

External expert work in the framework of the evaluation of the residency educational programme in the specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the External Evaluation of ECAQA Educational Organizations and Educational Programmes (approved by order of the Director General of the "Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care" No. 5 dated February 17, 2017) and according to the programme approved on November 23, 2021 No. 32 by ECAQA Director General Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with Dzhaynakbaev N.T., rector of the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University". Dates of the visit to the organization: December 13-15, 2021

The external evaluation is aimed at validating the data of the self-assessment report and verifying the indicators indicating the degree of compliance with the criteria of the accreditation standards.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is detailed in the Visit Programme (hereinafter referred to as the programme), which is located in the documentation of the accreditation center and in Attachment 3 to this report. The programme is proof of the implementation of all planned activities within the framework of an external expert evaluation.

Participation of a foreign expert Uryasev Oleg Mikhailovich, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Faculty Therapy with courses in Endocrinology, General Physiotherapy, Clinical Pharmacology, Occupational Diseases and Military Field Therapy, Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs of the Ryazan State Medical University named after Academician I.P. Pavlov" of the Ministry of Health of Russia is provided on the zoom platform (video recordings are archived in the accreditation body).

Participation of a foreign expert Khasanov Adkham Ibragimovich. Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Pediatric Maxillofacial Surgery of the Tashkent Dental Institute, Chairperson of the Association of Dentists of Uzbekistan in offline mode.

To obtain objective information, the members of the EEC used the following methods and their results:

- interviews with management and administrative staff - a total of 21 people;
- interviews with residents - 23 people;
- website exploration [www.medkrmu.kz](http://www.medkrmu.kz);
- interviewing 9 employees, 6 teachers;
- questioning of teachers and residents - 67 and 177, of which 86 residents, respectively;
- observation of the training of residents: visiting a magazine club on the topic: "Working with literary sources in preparation for the implementation of a scientific project", the contingent of students - residents in the specialty 7R01124 - "Adult Oncology", full name of the teacher - Yesentaeva S.E., head of the department of oncology with a course in radiology;
- review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards: visit to the 1st base of practice / clinical engagement "PSE on REM "Almaty Cancer Center", st. Utepova 3, where training is provided in 2 educational programmes with the participation of 6 full-time teachers / 33 part-time teachers;
- study of educational and methodological documents in the amount of 16 units. both before the visit to the organization and during the visit to the departments (the list of documents examined is in Attachment 2).

On the part of the staff of the accredited organization, the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview sites and interviews was ensured (Table 1).

Table 1 - Information on the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with members of the EEC



<b>No.</b>	<b>FULL NAME.</b>	<b>Position</b>
1.	Kusainova Arman Saylavbekovna	Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs
2.	Imanbaeva Zhaisan Abilseitovna	Vice-rector for scientific and clinical work
3.	Sovostyanova Tatyana Anatolyevna	And about. vice-rector for educational work
4.	Orakbay Lyazzat Zhadigerovna	Head of residency department
5.	Kulebaeva Elmira Kuanyshevna	BossCareer Center
6.	Iskakova Dana Askarovna	Head of the Department of International Cooperation and Academic Mobility
7.	Veryovkina Vera Ivanovna	Bosspersonnel department
8.	Iskakova Maryam Kozbaevna	Dean of the Faculty of Dentistry
9.	Vdovtsev Alexander Viktorovich	Responsible for the mobile medical complex (QEP)
10.	Seydalin Arystan Oskarovich	Head of the department of scientific work
11.	Mansharipova Alma Toleuovna	Scientific Secretary
12.	Aumoldaeva Zauze Maratovna	Head of the Training and Clinical Center
13.	Esentayeva Suriya Ertugyrova	Head of the Department of Oncology with a course of radiology
14.	Zhakupbekov Serik Talasbekovich	Teacher
15.	Yesenalieva Aigerim Baurzhankyzy	Teacher
16.	Surov Maxim Yurievich	Teacher
17.	Khasanova Mukhae Muratovna	Teacher
18.	Zhanataeva Zhadyra Kulmakhanov	Teacher
19.	Derzhibayev Ilias Serikhanovich	Resident by specialty "Radiology, 1 year of study
20.	Zakiryarov Ilya Abdumagametovich	Resident by specialty "Radiology, 1 year of study
21.	Taipova Mehriban Yanarkyzy	Resident by specialty "Radiology, 1 year of study
22.	Turganbekova Zhansaya Manarbekkyzy	Resident by specialty "Radiology, 1 year of study
23.	Azimkhanova Altynai Azimkhankyzy	Resident by specialty "Radiology, 2nd year of study
24.	Akyntai Ylzhan Bibolsynkyzy	Resident by specialty "Radiology, 2nd year of study
25.	Imangazyev Esbolat Saylauuly	Resident by specialty "Radiology, 2nd year of study
26.	Kobesova Dariga Erkinbekovna	Resident by specialty "Radiology, 2nd year of study
27.	Nurullaeva Mehriban Turganovna	Resident by specialty "Radiology, 2nd year of study
28.	Omarbekova Aigerim Askarovna	Resident by specialty "Radiology, 2nd year of study
29.	Orazbek Dinmukhammed Bakytbekuly	Resident by specialty "Radiology, 2nd year of study
30.	Sultankulova Mukhaya Abdinbievna	Resident by specialty "Radiology, 2nd year of study
31.	Turdyzhanov Erasyl Maratuly	Resident by specialty "Radiology, 2nd year of study
32.	Alpeysova Sholpan Tanatarovna	Clinical mentor, PhD, MRI doctor

33.	Ishkinin Evgeniy Ivanovich	Clinical Mentor, Head of the Radiation Therapy Department
34.	Akhmetbayeva Asem Kazakhstanovna	Clinical mentor, PhD
35.	Medeubekov Ulugbek Shalharovich	Director of the State Enterprise on the REM "Central City Clinical Hospital"
36.	Novikov Igor Igorevich	Deputy director for medical work of the PSE on the REM Almaty Regional Multidisciplinary Clinic "
37.	Sarina Akaiasha Abdykadyrovna	Deputy Director of the State Enterprise on the REM "Karasai Multidisciplinary Interdistrict Hospital"
38.	Zhumataeva Zarina Akhmetovna	Chief Physician of MC "Rakhat"
39.	Imanaliev Dauren Zhumazyevich	Director of the State Enterprise on the REM "Balkhash Central District Hospital" p. Bakanas
40.	Kusmoldanova Saule Ryspekovna	Director of the State Enterprise on the REM "Eskelda Central District Hospital"
41.	Zhumashev Kanat Kalikanovich	Director of the State Enterprise on the REM "Regional Perinatal Center", Taldykurgan
42.	Sadykova Akmira Makhanbetkalievna	Chief Physician of State Enterprise No. 29
43.	Alimbetova Maira Serikovna	Deputy Director of the State Enterprise on the REM "Almaty Multidisciplinary Clinical Hospital"
44.	Nurbaev Rolan Mamyrovich	Director of the State Enterprise on the REM "Almaty Regional Children's Clinical Hospital"
45.	Amirov Daniyar Kulmanovich	Deputy Chief Physician for Medical Work City Clinical Hospital No. 5
46.	Sharipova Aigerim Muratovna	Deputy Director of the Municipal State Enterprise on the REM "Panfilov Multidisciplinary Interdistrict Hospital"

Thus, when implementing the programme activities, namely, following the results of an interview with the first head of the organization, members of the advisory body of the scientific and clinical council, in interviews with residents and teachers, compliance with the criteria of standard 1 was established. All participants in the educational process know the mission of the organization, accepted participation in the formation of proposals for the formulation of the mission, while the mission was brought to the attention of potential residents through the website, social networks, newsletters to medical organizations. Reviewed the strategic plan of the organization for a period of 5 years, including such areas as 1) Improving the quality of services provided through the development of educational programmes of the university; 2) Internationalization and development of the scientific potential of the university at the international and national levels; 3) Ensuring the growth of the effectiveness of university management through the digitalization of activities and compliance with the requirements of national and international standards; 4) Improving the efficiency of human capital management through the improvement of relationship management processes, the development of competencies, team spirit and proactivity; 5) Formation of the image of the university in the education market through the use of marketing tools; 6) Modernization of the material and technical base of the university by updating computer equipment and increasing the classroom fund, which confirms fulfillment of the accreditation standard and demonstrates the goals, objectives and prospects of the organization. From interviews with residents, it was found that before the start of classes, teachers inform about the mission, work plans of the educational organization, they say where to get the necessary information about the educational

programme, teachers, and training facilities. This indicates compliance with **standard 2** in terms of adapting training to the needs of residents.

The documents of the organization contain work programmes, EMCD, where the goal is defined, the integration of practical and theoretical components, independent work is taken into account. Compliance with SCES and standard requirements was established. Attending a practical lesson on the topic "Magnetic resonance imaging of the brain", the volume of hours - 6, the experts received convincing data that the training is carried out according to the plan, before the start of the lesson, the residents answer the tests, receive feedback from the teacher, have the opportunity to improve the skill of interpreting the results of a comprehensive X-ray examination.

The organization ensures that ethical aspects are observed in the implementation educational programme, as the experts studied the code of ethics (06/01/2018) and during the interview, the residents answered that they were aware of the content of this document.

When attending a practical lesson at a clinical base: "PSE on REM "Almaty Cancer Center" st. Utepova, 3, the topic of the practical lesson: "Magnetic resonance imaging of the brain" Course residents of the 1st year of study, teacher's name: Alpeisova Sh.T., the experts saw that the organization promotes the development of dual learning. At the same time, residents deepen their theoretical knowledge and develop communication skills.

An analysis of educational activities showed that the scientific basis and all the achievements of science in advising disciplines were taken into account, additions were made to the bibliography of the EMCD and syllabuses, and teachers use them in the classroom.

The study of control and measuring tools (50 tests, 20 cases) showed that the organization has implemented an appropriate assessment policy that allows for a comprehensive assessment of the educational achievements of residents. Tasks in the test form are checked for compliance with the requirements of training and the acquired milestone competencies (<https://drive.google.com>). During the interview, the residents spoke about the forms of assessment, for example, when mapping of radiological patients and that they are satisfied with everything. They also receive regular feedback from teachers. The system for appealing the results of the assessment is reflected in the document "Academic Policy of the University» and during the period of work of the organization of education there were no precedents of appeal. Thus, compliance with standard 3 is established.

During a visit to the organization and during an interview with the head of the radiology course Akhmetbayeva A.K. checked other documents, such as annual operating plans, annual reports, regulations of departments, agreements with teachers and residents and educational and methodological documentation (work programme, working curricula, syllabuses, magazines), evaluation tools (checklists, statements), certificates and certificates.

During interviews with residents, experts found that employees of clinical bases were involved in dual training for teaching, such questions were asked as participation in the formation of the EP Mission and final results, residents' access to the medical equipment of the clinical base, advanced training in pedagogy, satisfaction with the basic knowledge of residents, grading in an electronic journal, assessment policy, methods for assessing the independent work of residents, scientific research together with residents on the strategy and tactics of recruiting residents, information support of the educational programme, as well as identify problems in the management and development of human resources.

Interviews with teachers showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of education, depending on the specific base (time for maintaining medical records, independent work). The experts received answers about the teacher training programme, the financing of this training, and the teachers' certificates in pedagogy.

On the same day, the experts studied the materials on the admission of residents and the selection of teachers and found compliance with standard 4.

In order to verify the data of standard 5, external experts received an opinion on personnel policy and approaches to the development of the pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with residents, and mentoring. Experts found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical records. An example in

the current academic year is the study of radiation signs of COVID-19, residents of the 2nd year of study Moskvina K., Zairov D.T., Patshakhan A., Ysgakov Zh., the results of which were presented in the scientific article "Clinical and radiological signs of coronavirus infection COVID -19", published in the Journal of the Kazakh-Russian Medical University No. 1/31/2021.

During visits to the clinical base, where experts conducted a survey of resources, their compliance with training programmes, accessibility for teachers and residents, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical health care. The experts obtained evidence of the implementation of standard 6, as well as validation of the information in the self-assessment report.

In order to validate the implementation of the data of the self-assessment report and obtain evidence of the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with residents in the specialty. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with training, enough time to supervise patients, work in Damumed with medical records, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents in need, participation in Journal Clubs, availability of international databases of professional literature. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, as they believe that the educational organization has good resources, image and international relations, at the same time, residents would like more independence in managing patients,

Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgments on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, the opportunity to participate in research, financing, actively participated in answering questions from foreign expert Oleg Mikhailovich Uryasyev. The experts studied the documents of the residents (portfolio, the results of the assessment of residents-check-lists, the results of the survey of residents).

Interview with 12 conducted by employers in the mode (on-line) <https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5835921548?pwd=TnF3MzZPN3M1VWhzditOWmpBNitSUT09> and included such issues as: knowledge of the mission of the university, participation in the development of the mission and proposals for the strategic plan, participation in the work of advisory bodies, satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, 100% employment of residency graduates, etc.

Recruitment of residents in the specialty 7R01124 - "Adult Oncology" has been carried out since 2014.

A review of the resources showed that they correspond to the goals and objectives of educational activities, for example, a visit to the clinical base of the "PSE on REM "Almaty Cancer Center" with a total bed capacity of 170, and employees of the educational organization ensure collegial and ethical relations with the medical staff, the management of the clinical base for achieving the final results of residents. A sufficient number of thematic patients is provided, modern equipment and demonstrates accessibility to students, and employees who simultaneously act as teachers and curators (mentors) provide quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he should acquire and develop during the training.

On the last day of the visit to the organization, a meeting of the members of the EEC was held following the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of the educational programme, the study of documents, the results of interviews, interviews, and questionnaires was held. EEC members have begun drafting the final report of the EEC. Generalizations of the results of the external evaluation are made. The experts individually completed the "Quality Profile and Criteria for External Evaluation of the Educational Programme 7R01114 – Radiology" for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the educational programme were discussed and the final open vote was held by the chairperson Zhanalina Bakhyt Sekerbekovna on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council for the accreditation period of 5 years.

Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University", a high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

At the end of the programme of the visit, the chairperson of the EEC announced recommendations to the management and employees of the educational organization based on the results of an external assessment as part of specialized accreditation.

**Conclusion:** Based on the results of the external evaluation, the EEC members carefully studied and evaluated the main indicators of the accredited educational programme. The information obtained by external experts during the study of the self-assessment report, the preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, the implementation of the activities of the visiting programme of the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" was analyzed. All the information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, which made it possible to verify the reliability of the information provided by NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" and supporting documents for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards. Despite the fact that in the self-evaluation report of the educational programme, the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" described its best practice in meeting accreditation standards,

The accredited educational programme has 2 clinical bases, of which 1 were visited by experts. In connection with the new version of the order No. 647 On approval of state compulsory standards and standard professional training programmes for medical and pharmaceutical specialties dated July 31, 2015 (as amended by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 21, 2020 No. ҚР DSM-12/2020 Chapter 2. Requirements to the content of residency educational programmes with a focus on learning outcomes), the educational programme has undergone changes and additions regarding the development of the research competence of residents, who should participate in the work of the research team. There is no general provision or requirements for the implementation of scientific work at the university, at the same time, initiative research is carried out at the departments in which residents participate through writing reviews, collection of patient data, analysis of literature and results of examination of patients, preparation of reports and speeches at conferences). Also, in accordance with Article 222, Article 18, Residency, paragraph 4 of the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the health of the people and the health care system dated July 7, 2020 No. 360-VI ZRK, external experts studied the activities and held conversations with clinical mentors and found that each resident is provided with a mentor.

The accredited educational programme and the entire educational, methodological, personnel and resource base were assessed according to the current State Educational Standards and for compliance with accreditation standards. Through interviews with teachers and mentors, it was possible to determine their direct participation in the development (CEPs, department meetings), evaluation of the educational programme (CEP), decision-making on a number of key issues in the choice of clinical sites, topics of electives, participation in appeal commissions for the admission and evaluation of residents, developing the content of individual plans for residents and choosing mentors. Recommendations for improving activities in the implementation of the residency educational programme in the specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of an expert assessment, were presented at a meeting with management on 13.12.

The programme of the 3-day visit of the external expert evaluation of the EEC has been fully implemented. The staff of the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" ensured the participation of all persons indicated in the programme. Thus, the external evaluation and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-evaluation report of the residency programme in full in accordance with the Regulations on the External Expert Commission, the Guidelines for the external evaluation of the ECAQA medical education organization. Comfortable conditions were created for the work of the EEC, access to all the necessary information and material resources of the accredited educational programme was organized. Experts

note the high level of corporate culture and discipline responsible for postgraduate education of employees of the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University", departments,

#### **4. The results of the survey.**

An ECAQA observer conducted an online survey on the resource <https://webanketa.com/> during the period December 13-15, 2021.

##### **Survey of residents includes 22 questions.**

Total answered 177 people, of which 86 (14%) are residents (a total of 610 residents for the current year).

##### **Results of the survey of residents:**

The total number of residents who responded is 86.

Of the total number of respondents, residents of the 1st year of study prevailed - 21.47%, 2 years of study - 16.38%, 3-4 years of study - 10.73%, bachelors - 38, 42%, graduates - 12.99%.

This university will be recommended as an educational organization - 70.62% fully agree, 23.73% partially agree, 2.82% completely disagree with this statement, 2.82% doubt to answer.

74.58% of the respondents fully agree and 20.34% partially agree that programme managers and teaching staff are aware of their problems in training, 2.26% completely disagree with this statement and 2.82% of students doubt to answer.

Programme managers and teachers involve students in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, academic council, committee of educational programmes) in 72.88%, 8.47% are not involved, they know nothing about it 8.47% doubt to answer 2.82% respondents, sometimes 7.34%.

The majority of students are satisfied with the conditions and equipment of the classrooms, the audience of this educational organization is 66.1%, 10% are partially satisfied, 25.99% are completely dissatisfied, 3.95% are partially dissatisfied, 1.69% of the respondents doubt to answer.

To the question: "This educational organization has created conditions for rest and meals for students (rest rooms, benches / gazebos on the territory, buffet-dining room) in between classes," they answered completely agree - 77.4%, disagree - 10.73 %, partially - 6.21%, doubt to answer - 5.64%.

69.49% are satisfied with the availability of office equipment in classrooms and at clinical sites, 19.21% are partially satisfied, 4.52% are dissatisfied, 3.95% partially disagree, 2.82% doubt.

Teachers provide students with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes in 78.53% of cases, partially in 13.56%, completely disagree with this statement 3.39%, partially disagree 3.95%, doubt the answer 0.56% of students.

Access to the participation of students in research work is fully satisfied - 79.1%, partially in 14.12%, completely disagree with this statement 3.95%, partially disagree 1.69%, doubts with the answer 1.13% of students.

82.49% of the respondents are completely satisfied with the activities of mentors, curators, supervisors, 10.17% are partially satisfied, 2.82% are not completely satisfied, 2.26% are not partially satisfied, 1.12% of students do not know their mentor, curator.

According to 79.66% of the respondents, teachers constantly provide feedback after completing classes.

72.32% of 128 students are completely satisfied with the library fund, 14.69% are partially satisfied, 8.47% are dissatisfied, 3.95% have no answer. 79.1% of students noted sufficient access to electronic educational resources, 12.99% are partially satisfied, not completely satisfied, partially and no answer - 7.9%.

According to the respondents, 71.19% are completely satisfied with the availability of medical services, 16.38% are partially satisfied and 12.42% are not completely satisfied, partially and there is no answer.

75.71% believe that social programmes to support students exist and are being implemented in the educational organization, 5.65% disagree with this opinion, 14.69% have not heard about such

programmes and do not know what they are asking about and there is no answer - 1, 13% and 2.82% respectively.

76.27% are completely satisfied with the presence of a student's career counseling service in the educational organization, 23.73% - no, did not hear and did not answer.

80.79% fully agree that the educational organization has established a system of self-study for students, residents, undergraduates, doctoral students, 12.43% partially agree, disagree and 3.39% partially, 3.39% of respondents doubt the answer.

The organization of clinical training, according to 65.54% of students, completely satisfies them, and 18.08% is good, I can't rate it, satisfactory and unsatisfactory - 16.38%.

Satisfied completely (81.36%) and partially (22%) respondents with teaching methods. There is sufficient time for practical training (patient care, etc.) - 70.62% fully agree, 17.51% partially. Satisfied with the methods of assessing my knowledge and skills - 81.36% fully agree, 11.86% partially.

In the opinion of 73.45%, teachers regularly use active and interactive teaching methods in the classroom, and in the opinion of 5.65% - rarely. According to 79.66% of the respondents, teachers constantly provide feedback after completing classes, but according to 13.56% - sometimes and 2.82% - rarely.

The content of the educational programme (list of disciplines) in the chosen specialty satisfies 77.97%, and 16.95% partially.

The accessibility of the education manual for students was noted by 92.66%.

According to the survey, 46.89 students are engaged in research work. And 10.73% are planning to start research work, 3.39% are in search of R&D.

During training, 38.98% of students have published work during training, while 11.86% have more than one publication.

According to 75.14% of respondents, accreditation is a necessary mechanism for improving educational programmes, but 11.3% believe that it is not necessary to carry out and 7.91% doubt the answer. The work of the EEC was assessed as positive - 79.1%, satisfactory - 11.86%.

**The survey of teachers included 21 questions of the questionnaire.** A total of 67 people answered, while 40.3% had a teaching experience of up to 5 years, 13.43% - up to 10 years, 46.27% - more than 10 years.

The results of the survey generally demonstrate satisfaction with the educational process, the resources of the clinical base, the competencies of teachers, and also indicate the existence of a centralized management of educational programmes.

The total number of teachers on the list is 67. The total number of respondents is 67, out of the total number of 67 residency teachers - 34.33%. 85.07% are fully satisfied with the organization of the educational process, and 10.45% are partially satisfied. Completely satisfied with the organization of labor and workplace 76.12% of respondents, partially 16.42% and completely disagree 1.49% of respondents.

There is an opportunity for career growth and competence development for teachers in the organization - 79.1% fully agree, 13.43% partially and 2.99% partially disagree. In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research - 73.13% fully agree, 17.91% partially, 5.97% fully disagree, 0% partially disagree, 2.99% do not answer.

83.58% of respondents are completely satisfied with the work of the personnel service, 13.43% are partially satisfied, 1.49% doubt the answer.

The majority of 74.63% of the respondents have been undergoing advanced training for the last 5 years. 79.1% of respondents have the opportunity to realize themselves as professionals, and 16.42% - partially.

To the question of whether the university supports the teacher in participating in international and republican events with travel, travel, registration fee paid 29.85%, 2.99% do not pay fees, do not address this issue to the management 26.87%, no response in 34.33%.

44.78% know about the implementation of social programmes to support teachers, 40.3% do not know about this, 17 have doubts with the answer 7.46%. The management and administration systematically listen to the opinion of teachers - 68.66%, sometimes - 13.43% of the respondents.

When training residents, a variety of teaching methods are used, but more often work in small groups (71.64%), analysis of situational problems (67.16%), oral surveys and analysis of the topic (70.15% and 80.6%, respectively), also problem-based learning (41%), test solving (58%), cases are drawn up and solved less often (29.75%).

68.68% fully agree that this survey will be useful for developing recommendations for improving the university and residency educational programmes, 22.39% partially agree with this.

The results of the survey are presented in the Attachment and generally demonstrate the effective management of educational programmes, the positive aspects of studying in residency programmes, at the same time identify areas for improvement (social support programmes for teachers, accessibility of management and administration for teachers and residents, pedagogical competencies and advanced training of teachers).

## **5. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of the educational programme - 7R01114 - "Radiology"**

### **Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES**

#### **Evidence of Compliance:**

##### **1.1 Mission and deliverables statement**

EP implementation in the specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology" is carried out in accordance with the Mission of the University and is available on the official website of the university [www.medkrmu.kz](http://www.medkrmu.kz).

The mission of the university is an innovative, socially oriented, practice-oriented, internationally recognized university <http://medkrmu.kz/missiya-universiteta/>

Goals, activities to achieve goals and target indicators that contribute to the improvement of the system of training residents at the university are reflected in the Strategy of the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" for 2019-2025" (CC dated December 26, 2019, protocol No. 5) <https://krmu.edu.kz/dokumenty-universiteta-2/> and implemented through the approved strategic directions of activity.

The official source of information about the university is the website [www.medkrmu.kz](http://www.medkrmu.kz), informing the public about the activities of the University.

The mission and goals of the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" are aimed at the professional orientation of a residency graduate as a highly professional specialist in demand in the health care system of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The formation of the mission of the university is influenced by the opinions of all stakeholders - heads of departments and divisions of the university, faculty, students, graduates, employers, health and education authorities, and members of the public.

##### **1.2 Professionalism and professional autonomy**

Academic freedom is represented by the independence of the development and implementation of the EP, within the framework of standard curricula, SCES. Freedom in the preparation of the EP is achieved by describing syllabuses, QED, IEP, RUPL, the form, structure and development procedure of which is determined by the organization independently. The EP, after being approved on the course, is reviewed at the meetings of the CEP, the Academic Council.

The EP in the specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology", given in the EP, in the formation and development of professionalism and professional autonomy is provided for by the key competencies of the residency graduate:

Learning outcomes in 7 disciplines of the mandatory component (100% of 7 disciplines) implement LO-3 - Safety and Quality, in 7 disciplines (100% of 7 disciplines) develop LO-4 - Public Health, 5 disciplines of the mandatory component and 3 disciplines of the choices contribute to the development of LO-6 - Training and Development.



As a result of training, a resident in the specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology" receives a holistic vision of processes, the ability to select effective and safe treatment, which generally determines an individual approach to patients - the autonomy of decisions in favor of the patient. A resident, under the supervision of a manager / mentor, receives special knowledge, develops practical skills, for the assessment of which formative and summative assessment is used. The formation of this skill requires solid theoretical knowledge, stable practical skills, and work with scientific literature. The EP presents the list of practical skills recommended by the SCES, their number and the level of performance of competencies. Curation of patients, duty is performed by a resident

### **1.3 Learning outcomes**

**EP in the specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology", developed within the framework of the State Educational Standard (order No. 647 in the revision of 2020) and Qualification characteristics of a doctor (order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 21, 2020 No. ҚР ДСМ-305/2020 "On approval of the nomenclature of specialties and specializations in the field of health care, nomenclature and qualification characteristics of positions of health care workers"), the main end results of the resident's training are taken into account.**

The duration of the training programme in the specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology" is two years (140 credits), which is sufficient to form the planned competencies and achieve the final results.

The end results of residents are:

- is able to independently conduct an examination and interpret the result of the X-ray method of research

- conduct differential diagnostics and formulate a conclusion based on the principles of evidence-based medicine

- interpret the result of a comprehensive examination of the patient with the development of further recommendations

- effectively interact with the patient, his environment, health care professionals in order to achieve the best results for the patient

- assess risks using more efficient methods to ensure a high level of safety and diagnostic quality

- act within the framework of the legal and organizational field of the health care system of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the specialty "Radiology", work as part of interprofessional teams

- formulate research questions, analyze scientific databases, draw conclusions and apply the results in their clinical practice

- self-taught and ability to educate others, participate in discussions, conferences and other forms of continuous professional development.

### **1.4 Participation in the formulation of the mission and deliverables**

The formulation and content of the mission of the residency programme was based on the mission of the university within the framework of the State Educational Standard and the qualification characteristics of a doctor.

When forming the programme, its goals, final results, a discussion was held at the level of: student audience, graduates (discussion of opportunities), department staff (discussion in the working group, at a meeting of departments / courses), at a meeting of the CEP (dated 14.05.2020 No. 5), on the Academic Council (dated August 28, 2020 No. 5) and the Academic Council of the University (dated August 12, 2020 No. 5).

Corrections were made to the general structure of the programme, to the formation of its goals and results. And when uploaded to the Republican Register of educational programmes, it was reviewed and then adjusted with the participation of external reviewers.

External stakeholders involved in formulating the mission and outcomes include: employers (including potential ones), National Public Professional Associations, health care organizations.

To improve all areas of the university, including the mission, the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" has introduced a system for collecting and analyzing feedback from consumers through internal and external monitoring. The following subdivisions are involved in the implementation of monitoring: the department of the QMS, EMA, EC, CEP, the scientific

department, the clinical department.

During meetings with residents and teaching staff, EEC members partially received confirmation of their knowledge of the Mission and the final results of the EP. The survey conducted by ECAQA notes that programme managers and teachers involve students in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, academic council, educational programmes committee) in 72.88%, 8.47% are not involved, 8.47% know nothing about it 2.82% of respondents doubt to answer, sometimes 7.34%.

**Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria.** Out of 17 standards conform: completely - 14, significantly - 0, partially - 3, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 1: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- 1) Concretize the definition of the Mission of the educational programme (EP) with the involvement of the main stakeholders and document this discussion process through collegial bodies;
- 2) To raise awareness, place the Mission and the final results of the EP on the University website.

## **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

#### **2.1 Framework parameters for the postgraduate medical education programme**

During the visit of the EEC IAAR and the audit of the residency programme in the specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology» it is established that the educational process is carried out and implemented on the basis of the state order for the training of medical personnel. The educational framework parameters are built on the final learning outcomes (LO), taking into account the qualifications of the resident graduate and in accordance with the existing basic medical education, ensuring its consistency and transparency, while the educational programme of postgraduate medical education for training in residency in the declared specialties is brought into line with the approved state educational standards and TEP. The structure and content of the EP comply with the requirements of the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan 2017, 2020, approved by order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 647, in accordance with the name of the programme and specialty.

EP by specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology" was compiled in accordance with the requirements of the State Educational Standard, was previously called "Radiology" and was included in the Republican Register of Educational Programmes. The name of the EP was changed from "Radiology" to "Radiology" in accordance with the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated May 25, 2021 No. KP DSM-43 "On approval of the list of medical specialties of residency programmes" and the decision of the EMA in the direction of training - Health care dated June 23. 2021 #10.

Persons who have completed residency training and successfully passed the final certification are awarded the qualification "radiologist» in the relevant specialty of residency and a certificate of completion of residency is issued.

The residency EP complies with international requirements and level 7 of the national qualification framework in medical education and the Qualifications Framework in the European Higher Education Area.

#### **2.2 Scientific method**

The scientific method of residents is revealed through participation with reports at conferences and seminars held at the level of the university, the Republic of Kazakhstan, foreign countries, publications in republican and foreign publications; participation in various student organizations, associations and creative teams, sports sections. So, for example, at the end of April of this year, residents participated in the project on the territory of the Central Clinical Hospital of Almaty at the mobile medical complex (QEP) vaccination against COVID-19 was carried out among hospital workers and the population.

During interviews with residents and teaching staff, it was proposed to expand the capacities of various clinical sites, not only to provide training in practical skills, bases PSE on REM "Almaty Cancer Center".

Residents have constant free access to electronic library resources, including the Cochrane Database, PUBMED, MEDLINE and full-text articles from leading medical journals.

### **2.3 Content of the residency programme**

Educational programme for training residents in specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology" designed for 140 credits: major disciplines - 132 credits, elective component - 4 credits, intermediate certification - 2 credits, final certification - 2 credits.

**Major disciplines are represented by disciplines: "Radiology" 31 credits, "Pediatric radiology" 13 credits, "Ultrasound diagnostics" 16 credits, "Mammography" 7 credits, "Computed tomography" 16 credits, "Magnetic resonance imaging" 18 credits, "Nuclear medicine" » 12 credits, "Radial diagnosis of diseases of organs and systems" 19 credits.**

The elective component (4 credits) can be chosen from the presented disciplines: "Radiation diagnostics in osteology and differential diagnostics"-4 credits, Radiation Diagnostics in Pulmonology and Cardiology-4 credits, Radiation Diagnostics in Oncology - 4 credits, Evidence Based Medicine-4 credits.

QED is developed by the CEP of postgraduate education, with the participation of stakeholders. Elective disciplines are carried out for each academic year. Informing students about the registration for the study of elective disciplines is carried out by the residency department, the office of the registrar. Students of the first year of study choose elective disciplines for the next academic year until March 20 of the current academic year. Registration for elective disciplines is carried out through the AIS "Platonus".

### **2.4 Programme structure, content and duration**

The content of the academic disciplines of the mandatory component is strictly regulated by the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan in 2020 and is reflected in the TEP of disciplines of the EP of the specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology" gives residents the opportunity to plan and implement an individual, directed learning trajectory during the entire training, preparing for work in their chosen specialty. Ensuring a guaranteed high quality of the educational process is determined by the quality of planning. The number of hours for two years of study is 4200. The total number of hours is 140 credits, 4 of which are in elective disciplines. The list of disciplines of the elective component is compiled according to the Catalog of elective disciplines, which is formed and approved annually at the university. The number of hours of the elective component (elective disciplines), their correlation with compulsory disciplines are regulated by the State Educational Standards of the Republic of Kazakhstan. 4 credits were allocated for PA and FSA. In total, the development of major disciplines (mandatory) accounts for 132 credits.

The distribution of disciplines by hours, semesters is carried out by the CEP and the department of academic work in accordance with the State Educational Standard, TEP and the list of selection components, agreed with the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs.

The duration of the development of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology" is 2 years. The academic year consists of 45 weeks, which is 2100 hours and includes theoretical, clinical training and holidays, lasting 6 weeks between academic years. Final certification lasting 2 weeks. The academic week consists of 54 hours, 1/3 of which falls on the independent work of the resident during extracurricular time.

### **2.5 Organization of training**

Control over the educational activities of the residency is carried out by the Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs. The head of the department determines clinical bases and contracts with clinical bases are made by the department for clinical work.

NJSC "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" is equipped with automated information system "Platonus", which was introduced to automate process management, based on the use of standardized electronic documents by departments and the introduction of new educational information technologies in the process of managing the educational process. The system contains a centralized database that allows University staff to automate their educational and methodological work, and residents to receive the necessary information on the educational process. Working with this platform was demonstrated during the visit.

When analyzing the educational programme and the results of interviews with residents, it is noteworthy that the representation of residents is of a formal nature, their participation in the planning of the EP is minimized.

### **2.6 Relationship between postgraduate medical education and health care delivery**

In EP in the specialty 7R01114 - Radiology, the entire list of full-time specialists in the residency programme is presented, as well as actively involved clinical mentors, who are leading employees of practical health care. When attending a practical session, the experts made sure that the residents work with clinical mentors according to the schedule, the residents master and improve practical skills, the tutor gives a description of each resident, and each clinical case is analyzed.

In addition to the clinical mentor, each resident has a curator (advisor) who takes part in the preparation of the resident and is personally responsible for the implementation of the training plan, carries out activities for the personal and psychological support of the resident during the stages of education. The curator is appointed from the teaching staff of the course, who have the degree of doctor, candidate of medical sciences, as well as the highest qualification category. Curators and a mentor in the course of daily work give specific recommendations for further improving professional skills, mastering the norms of medical ethics and deontology, and raising the general educational and cultural level.

**Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria.** Out of 31 standards conform: completely - 30, significantly - 0, partially - 1, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 2: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- 1) When planning the EP, ensure the representation of stakeholders.

### **Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS**

#### **Evidence of Compliance:**

##### **3.1 Assessment methods**

The University has developed and applies a number of documents regulating the issues of admission, the educational process of residents - "Regulations on residency", "Academic policy", "Regulations on the ongoing monitoring of academic performance, intermediate and final certification of students at the National Educational Institution "KazRosmeduniversitet".

The assessment policy, forms and methods of conducting current, midterm and final control for each discipline, as well as the forms, methods and criteria for assessment when transferring from course to course, are determined by the responsible department.

The list of compulsory disciplines for the final control during the academic period is regulated by the disciplines passed, which are reflected in the WC. The form of midterm and final control is approved by the Academic Council. For testing, a technical specification is compiled - a matrix of test tasks, which is reflected in syllabuses. To ensure maximum objectivity and transparency of the assessment process, the department / course has developed checklists for conducting current, midterm and final control in the discipline (Mini-cEX, CbD, OSCE,). The possibility of an appeal based on the results of the intermediate and final certification of residents is determined in the "Academic Policy of the University", which spells out the procedure for filing an appeal. A resident who does not agree with the result of the final control, file an appeal no later than the next working day after the examination. Among residents in the specialty "radiology" there were no appeals.

##### **3.2 Relationship between assessment and learning**

The relationship between assessment methods and training of residents in specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology" is carried out through a portfolio, evaluation of scientific activities. Assessment methods are developed by the department and reflected in syllabuses. When visiting the clinical base, the portfolios of residents were examined, the syllabuses of the report materials were fully confirmed.

Assessment methods are comparable to teaching and learning methods and cover the assessment of all learners' competencies both during practical classes and examinations. In the evaluation of educational achievements, various types of control and measuring tools developed by the Department of Oncology with a course of radiology are used (control questions, tasks in a test form, tasks for laboratory

work, practical and communication skills, etc.). The results of students' educational achievements are entered into an electronic educational journal through the office-registrar system and the AIS "Platonus" programme, which automatically generates examination sheets. The electronic educational journal is filled in in accordance with the calendar and thematic plan, in accordance with the schedule and the dates of the current, boundary and final controls reflected in the syllabus.

The registrar's office records the entire history of the student's educational achievements and ensures the organization of all types of knowledge control and the calculation of the academic rating.

The documents submitted for examination, the results of interviews with students, faculty members do not allow to fully demonstrate the university's policy regarding ensuring validity, objectivity, representativeness and effectiveness in achieving learning outcomes, their impact on the learning process and the achievability of the required competencies.

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Out of 11 standards conform: completely - 9, significantly - 0, partially - 2, do not correspond - 0.

***Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:***

- 1) Develop and harm the mechanism of reliability, validity of methods for assessing the educational achievements of residents.

## **Standard 4: STUDENTS**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

#### **4.1 Admission policy and selection**

Selection and admission to educational residency programmes at the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" is carried out in accordance with established external legal documents. The admission procedure is ensured by the principles of transparency and equality of opportunity.

Residency admission with an indication of the specialty is announced through the placement of an announcement on the university website (<http://krmu.edu.kz/rezidentura-3/>, "Admission Committee" - "Residency").

The programme of entrance examinations for residency in specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology" is formed by teachers of the department of oncology with a course of radiology, approved at a meeting of the department, at the CEP, at the AS and posted on the University website. Introductory questions are also posted on the site and are held from August 8 to 16, enrollment is on August 28. Examinations are held with video recording, observers and members of the commission are present in the hall. For 2021-2022 10 applicants submitted documents. Upon admission, scientific achievements are taken into account that correspond to the profile of the chosen specialty: scientific publications, including those in rating scientific publications; certificates of scientific developments; certificates of awarding scientific scholarships, grants; certificates/diplomas for participation in scientific conferences and competitions»

The rules for admission to residency are regularly reviewed at the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" in connection with the introduction of additions and changes to the current regulatory legal acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan, for example, the conditions for admission have been changed - conducting an interview online and calculating the final grade achievements of the applicant and the availability of a certificate of the applicant's place of work in medical institutions of the Republic of Kazakhstan related to the fight against COVID-19). Therefore, persons working in provisional, infectious diseases hospitals, polyclinics, and ambulance stations had a priority right in the competitive selection.

#### **4.2 Number of residents**

Every year, taking into account the needs for medical personnel, a request is sent to the University about the needs of scientific and pedagogical personnel and clinical residency specialties to the Department of Science and Human Resources (DSHR) of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. So in 2021-2022 specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology" accepted 10 people. Residents 2 years - 10.

#### **4.3 Support and advice to residents**

In the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" there is a system of academic consulting for residents at the departments.

To this end, a curator is assigned to the resident, who provides the functions of an academic mentor, participates in the formation and implementation of an individual curriculum, manages the educational and scientific activities of the student, and assists in finding employment. The curator is appointed from among the faculty of the department. In addition, the resident is assigned a clinical mentor in the medical organization where the resident is trained.

Residents are also informed of information about maintenance services by corporate mail [residence@medkrmu.kz](mailto:residence@medkrmu.kz). Residents receive information about student support services from information on stands in departments / courses, in the residency department and through the university website [www.medkrmu.kz](http://www.medkrmu.kz)

In order to optimize the employment and monitor the career of university graduates, by order of the rector, the Career Center was organized, which promotes the employment of university graduates in conjunction with departments / courses; establishes close ties with the health authorities, the employment service; coordinates the work of all structural divisions of the University on career guidance and promotes the employment of graduates.

In the current academic year, it is planned to graduate in the specialty **7R01124 - 7R01114 - "Radiology" - 10 residents.**

#### **4.4 Representation of residents**

Meetings of collegiate bodies of the university are open and students can attend them. The admission of residents under this educational programme was carried out for the first time.

The results of the survey of residents and interviews in focus groups during the work of the accreditation commission indicate a high level of satisfaction with the support service and counseling, which meets the requirements of the accreditation standard criteria. At the same time, during the development of the policy and admission, the participation of residents was not confirmed, and the management of the university was recommended to include residents in the working group to develop a policy for the selection and admission of residents for the next academic year.

#### **4.5 Working conditions**

According to the order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 15, 2020 No. KR DSM-270/2020 "On approval of the rules for placing a state order, admission for training and training of medical personnel in residency", resident doctors studying under the state educational order are paid a scholarship, according to Rules for the appointment, payment and size of state scholarships for students in educational institutions, approved by the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 7, 2008 No. 116.

It is possible to combine training with work (no more than 0.5 rate) in areas of activity close to his future specialty in his free time from study with the consent of the curator, head of the department and head of the residency department.

If they have a specialist certificate, residents of the 2nd year of study are allowed to conduct independent medical activities in public and private medical institutions, outside of school hours.

The results of the ECAQA survey showed that the majority of students are satisfied with the conditions and equipment of the classrooms, the audience of this educational organization is 66.1%, 10% are partially satisfied, 25.99% are completely dissatisfied, 3.95% are partially dissatisfied, they doubt to answer 1, 69% of the respondents.

**Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria.** Out of 30 standards conform: completely - 28, significantly - 0, partially - 2, do not correspond - 0

**Standard 4: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1) When developing a policy for the selection and admission of residents for 2022-2023, include representation of residents.

### **Standard 5: FACULTY**

## **Evidence of Compliance:**

### **5.1 Recruitment and selection policy**

The university has a Human Resources Policy, which provides for the selection and admission of employees, the development and activities of employees, the promotion of employees, etc. The competition is held as part of the implementation of the Strategic Directions of the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" for 2019 - 2023 (CC dated December 26, 2019, protocol No. 5) <https://krmu.edu.kz/dokumenty-universiteta-2> and contributes to the consolidation of positions as a leading University among the medical universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The requirements for staffing, the educational process are determined by the qualification requirements for educational activities. In accordance with the State Educational Standards, for clinical training in residency in specialties, a mentor is appointed from among qualified practical health care professionals working at the clinical bases of the residency, who have the first or highest qualification category, with a requirement for at least 5 years of experience in the relevant specialty. Scientific work is an integral part of the activities of the teaching staff of the university and a necessary condition for the preparation of residents in all specialties of residency.

The teaching staff is formed based on the needs for the effective implementation of educational programmes, as well as on the basis of the total teaching load. When compiling the staffing table for the new academic year, for conducting classes with residents, a mandatory requirement for teachers is the presence of basic education, the correspondence of the code of the specialty to the academic degree, academic title and work experience. The total number of faculty members is formed on the basis of the average ratio of residents and teachers - 3:1.

Competitive selection is carried out on the basis of the current Regulations on the competitive replacement of positions of faculty and researchers, approved by order of the rector No. 26-02-44-n / κ dated November 27, 2020.

For the implementation of the EP in the specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology" responsible for the course of radiology. The head of the course is the candidate of medical sciences Akhmetbayeva Asem Kazakhstanovna. There are 7 full-time teachers and 14 clinical mentors on the course. The degree of the department is 40%.

### **5.2 Teacher commitment and development**

Training of residents in the specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology" is assigned to the teaching staff, whose duties include: to have a complete understanding of the residency's NLA; have a complete understanding of the requirements for the level of training of a graduate in terms of the composition of knowledge, skills and abilities in the profile of the direction (specialty) or the discipline provided; participate in the development of residency educational programmes, participate in the formation of a contingent of residency students in a specialized specialty, coordinate the content of curricula; ensure a high level of teaching disciplines through the use of traditional and the introduction of innovative technologies and interactive teaching methods. In preparation for the first semester of the 2020-2021 academic year and improving the quality of online teaching, training was conducted for teaching staff on the course "Distance Educational Technologies". 561 people were trained ((Order No. 26-05-02 of 08/01/2020), including from the Department of Oncology and Radiology Esentayeva S.E., Sarsenbayeva G.E.

When visiting the clinical base and interviewing teachers, clinical mentors of the department of oncology with a radiology course, it was revealed that employees undergo advanced training according to the plan of the department both in their specialty and in pedagogy. Despite the ongoing activities, teachers and clinical mentors proposed to expand the opportunities for academic mobility of teaching staff and residents to the countries of near and far abroad after the epidemiological situation eases.

**Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria.** Out of 7 standards conform: fully - 6, significantly - 0, partially - 1, do not meet - 0.

**Standard 5: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1) Develop evaluation criteria (KPI) to evaluate the performance of teaching staff and clinical mentors.

## **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

#### **6.1 Logistics and equipment**

Material and technical base The National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" includes: lecture halls, study rooms, educational and research laboratories, a library, information technology facilities, cultural and social facilities, clinical bases - multidisciplinary clinics in Almaty. The university has 2 academic buildings with a total area of 12706.4 m<sup>2</sup>, a sports hall, 1 hostel for 200 people.

There is also an office of "information and communication technologies", which consists of 3 study rooms. All classrooms are equipped with the necessary equipment. Each office is designed for 12 seats. The classroom is designed to teach the disciplines of information and communication technology. The classrooms are equipped with printers and 38 computers. The computers have applications such as: The entire package of Microsoft Office, Microsoft FrontPage XP, Macromedia Flash, Hyper Cam, Adobe Photoshop CS2, Windows Movie Maker, Camtasia, Cisco packet tracer, Iren - a test programme, Electronic textbooks. Residents can visit the office to prepare presentations, creative projects, reports as part of extracurricular activities.

The test center has 122 computers for midterm and final control of students' knowledge in accordance with the standard programme. Testing is carried out according to the test licensed programme "Examiner". In the "Test Editor" programme, tests are typed, which are later used in the "Examiner" programme. Tests are displayed in Kazakh, Russian and English. The "Analyzer" programme is designed to view the results of tests that were passed by the examiners in the "Examiner" programme. In the premises of the Test Center, control over the observance of order and discipline of students is carried out in accordance with the academic integrity of the university (12 video surveillance cameras).

As part of the implementation of programmes on innovative technologies, in 2009 a Mobile Medical Complex (QEP) was formed to examine and provide free medical care to socially vulnerable groups of the population, to identify socially significant diseases (oncology).

Mobile medical complexes are used in preventive, screening, dispensary examinations and in the provision of advisory assistance in rural PHC organizations and socially vulnerable groups of the population on a charitable basis.

During the visit to the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University", the commission made sure that it has sufficient material and technical base (logistical, informational, clinical (leading medical institutions in Almaty) and library resources) used to organize all types of practical preparation and research work of residents, provided for by the State Educational Standard, work plans and the implementation of the mission, goals and objectives of the university and meet the requirements of accredited educational programmes. Departments for clinical training are equipped with modern dummies for the formation of practical skills.

#### **6.2 Clinical sites**

In the course of training, residents in the specialty "Radiology" pass specialized disciplines at 5 bases:

- PSE on REM "Almaty Cancer Center" at the address st. Utepova 3 and beds - 170.
- GBSNP at st. Kazybek bi, 96 with beds - 355;
- Central City Clinical Hospital 12 at Zhandosov St., 6 with a bed capacity - 350;
- City Clinical Hospital No. 7 at the address of md. Kalkaman 1, building 1, with a bed capacity - 1000;
- GKDIB No. 1 7 at Baizakov St., 299a, with a bed capacity - 360.

Clinical bases have sufficient beds, the Department of Oncology with a course of radiology - a sufficient number of classrooms for practical training of independent work of residents. Thus, clinical sites are selected for compliance with the residency programme by the clinical work department, which draws up contracts with clinical sites.



### **6.3 Information technology**

In the structure of the university, a Department of Distance Educational Technologies (DDET) was created to organize and support the educational process using distance learning technologies. For effective communication and technical support for students and teaching staff of the university, the work of the call center of the DET department was organized. The university has formed bases of educational information resources, to which there is access from the internal network of the university. The distance learning system is based on AIS Moodle. Internet is provided free of charge via Wi-Fi.

The library has databases from Elsevier Scopus and Science Direct with a wide range of bibliometric tools in order to track, analyze and visualize the results of publication activity and Web of Science from Clarivate Analytics, which combines abstract databases of publications in scientific journals and patents.

On the basis of the License Agreement, access to the Russian ELS "IPRbooks" was provided, in test mode it was connected to the database of electronic medical literature "BookUp". From the Kazakhstan database, the Kazakhstan National Electronic Library - KazNEB is used.

There is a special room for creating video lectures by teachers, a corporate video library channel has been created. Confirmation is the video lecture of Akhmetbayeva A.K. "Blackout Syndrome" <https://youtube.com/watch?v=WOesqNXqudk&feature=share>

### **6.4 Clinical teams**

Working in a team of various specialists allows you to learn not only the collegiality necessary in further work, but also significantly increases the knowledge of residents in related specialties. Performing team work allows residents to appreciate the role of a leader in a team and learn the managerial skills that are necessary in the practical daily work of a doctor.

Residents in the specialty 7R01114 - Radiology develop skills for coordinating work with colleagues and other health care professionals during the examination, treatment and provision of radiological care to patients. The resident is present during the consultations, carries out the instructions of senior colleagues within the framework of his competence. The result of the resident's activity is checked by the teacher.

### **6.5 Medical research and developments**

Since 2016, KazRosmedUniversity has signed about 30 international agreements with medical universities and organizations of the Republic of Belarus, Kyrgyzstan, Uzbekistan, Russia and Turkey in the field of medical education and science, academic and cultural exchange of faculty and students

The use of mobile medical complexes makes it possible to deploy a modern medical clinic organized on a modular basis on the basis of the capacities of any medical institution. The uniqueness of the use of QEP lies in the fact that it goes beyond the usual mobile medical complex and allows you to deploy a modern medical clinic organized on a modular basis on the basis of the capacities of any medical institution. A high level of development and manufacturing, a carefully selected set of medical equipment, and the reliability of life support systems for mobile clinics make it possible to speak of a new standard of mobile medical care for the population. A single educational, research and production complex has been formed with the formation of basic research competencies in the resident.

### **6.6 Educational expertise**

In order to improve the quality of medical education, develop and improve the pedagogical and professional competencies of teachers and medical workers, the Teacher's School was organized. The objectives of the School are the development and assessment of the competencies of the teaching staff (PTS), the development of languages, evidence-based medicine, the study and implementation of international best practices, research in the field of medical education, partnerships with non-governmental organizations (NGOs), practical health care and other medical OHPE.

As part of the Winter School, from 2018-2020, all employees of the Department of Oncology were trained with a radiology course.

During the visit of the clinical base, it was found out that the teaching staff of the department, including clinical mentors, do not have scientific research in the field of medical education.

### **6.7 Training in other institutions**

The university has organized a department of academic mobility, which is working to establish partnerships with Kazakh and foreign universities, pursues a policy for their implementation with educational institutions and organizations of the Republic of Belarus, the Kyrgyz Republic, the Russian Federation, Turkey and France.

NJSC "KazRosmeduniversitet" has agreements and memorandums of cooperation with 11 higher educational institutions in France, Turkey, Russia, the Republic of Belarus.

However, due to the unfavorable epidemiological situation of the internship, the mobility of employees and students has decreased.

**Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria.** Out of 21 standards conform: completely - 20, significantly - 0, partially - 1, do not meet - 0

**Standard 6: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1) Develop a mechanism for motivating and developing the interest of employees and teachers in conducting scientific research in the field of medical education.

## **Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

#### **7.1 Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms**

The medical education organization constantly monitors the quality of the educational programme. All stakeholders, including students and employers, are involved in the evaluation of the educational programme. The procedure for evaluating the EP is determined by the Academic Policy of the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" and regulated by the relevant regulatory legal acts. Monitoring and evaluation of the EP is carried out at all levels, a multi-level approach is used, including the profiling / graduating and related departments, the residency department, the profile CEP of postgraduate education, the OAR, the Academic Council, the Academic Council, the Career Center (general monitoring of the quality of educational programmes through a survey of stakeholders (employers, professional associations and students).

The mechanisms for evaluating the residency programme at the National Educational Institution "KazRosmeduniversitet" include the following types of work:

- 1) Monitoring the provision of the educational process with resources (clinical facilities, educational literature, classroom fund, equipment, teaching staff: teachers, clinical mentors, curators);
- 2) Monitoring the compliance of curricula with the requirements of state education standards;
- 3) Monitoring feedback from stakeholders on the quality of the content of the EP;
- 4) Monitoring the progress of students.

The successful development of mutual relations between programme developers and employers continues through expert evaluation of educational programmes, so as a reviewer of the educational programme 7R01114 - "Radiology" Yanchenko A.A., Head of the Department of Radiation Diagnostics, University Hospital of NJSC "Semey Medical University" is involved.

#### **7.2 Feedback from faculty and residents**

The university systematically collects and analyzes feedback through questioning of teachers and students, which are held twice a year during the winter and summer sessions. The questionnaire includes questions about the quality of the educational process, compliance with schedules and schedules, corruption, etc.). The obtained data are discussed at the meetings of the rector with the heads of departments / courses and heads of structural units, with students. The results of the discussion of the EP at the CEP are brought to the teaching staff of the University.

The total number of respondents in the 2020-2021 academic year is 164 people. The level of satisfaction with clinical practice is 4 points out of 5. There is an Action Plan to improve the satisfaction and expectations of university consumers based on the analysis of the questionnaire to assess the satisfaction of students with the conditions of study at the university (minutes of the meeting of the CEP dated 24.09.2020 No. 2; dated 21.09.2021 No. 2) .

The EEC studied the survey materials and received full confirmation of the submitted materials in the self-report.

### **7.3 Resident and alumni results**

The residency department collects feedback from students to determine the level of satisfaction with the content of the EP, the organization of the educational process in the form of a questionnaire, monitoring requests to the rector's blog.

The process of monitoring the EP is carried out by analyzing the feedback data from residents. In implementing the principle of transparency of the educational process, the opinion of students is taken into account.

In the course of the ECAQA survey, it turned out that 65.54% of students were completely satisfied with the organization of clinical training, and 18.08% rated it as “good”, I can’t rate it, satisfactory and unsatisfactory - 16.38%. respondents

### **7.4 Stakeholder involvement**

The monitoring of the EP involves: the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the NCIE, regional and city health departments, employers, representatives of the committee for the control of medical and pharmaceutical services and representatives of practical health care, representatives of public associations of doctors (Associations), representatives of the public and trade unions.

To strengthen the relationship between the educational process and practice, the university has established partnerships with all leading medical institutions in Almaty.

### **7.5 Approval procedure for educational programmes**

The examination of the EP is carried out by the CEP for compliance with the State Educational Standard, approves the QED according to the trajectories of specialist training, taking into account pre- and post-requisites, evaluates the choice of methods for assessing the results of training of residents. The CEP carries out a systematic study and comprehensive evaluation of the EP in order to improve and guarantee the quality (determining the value of the programme, achieving the goal, achieving the objectives, the degree of compliance with the needs of society, the requirements of employers, the effectiveness of the teaching methodology), as well as assessing the educational and methodological support and support of the educational process, evaluation of the quality of the EP in the areas of specialization. For this purpose, an external evaluation of the EP is carried out by a competent representative of practical health care.

***Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria.*** Out of 15 standards conform: fully - 11, significantly - 0, partially - 4, do not correspond - 0.

***Standard 7: completed***

***Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:***

1) Create a quality assurance system for evaluating and monitoring residency programmes with the participation of University graduates (base: Order No. 595 of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, p. 34).

## **Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION**

### **Evidence of Compliance:**

#### **8.1 Management**

During the visit, it was found that the formation of the residency contingent of the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" is carried out in accordance with the State Educational Standard of 2017. 2020, is implemented through the placement of a state order for the training of medical personnel and taking into account the possibilities of clinical, practical training, the maximum allowable workload for advisors, the provision of educational, educational, methodological and scientific literature, the capacity of clinical bases, as well as the material and technical resources of the University.

Students who have mastered the residency programme in their specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology" and successfully passed the state certification, a state document is issued on the qualification of a doctor in the specialty "radiotherapy doctor".

Transparency in the management of the educational programme is carried out through the discussion of educational and methodological documentation for the residency programme of the specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology" at a meeting of the CEP, AC, and after receiving their positive opinion, it is approved by the vice-rector for scientific and clinical work. The transparency of the management of the EP in the specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology" is ensured by the functioning of a number of mechanisms, these include:

- 1) the functioning of the integrated quality management system (ISMK);
- 2) the presence of internal regulatory legal acts (academic policy) that regulate the process of implementing the EP of the specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology";
- 3) the functioning of the system for collecting feedback from stakeholders, including the system for collecting anonymous feedback (rector's blog);
- 4) the functioning of collegial advisory management bodies, including university staff, students, representatives of practical health care (CEP, the Academic Council and the Academic Council of KazRosmeduniversity);
- 5) Publication of information about the educational programme in the specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology" on the university website.

To ensure openness of discussion of problems and ideas for teaching residents, the official website (<http://medkrmu.kz>) of KazRosmeduniversity has a rector's blog. There is also a residency section. The university website is available through RSS zhanalyk, Twitter, Facebook, YouTube, VK, Izdeu, Zhanalyktar.

## **8.2 Academic leadership**

Management of the educational process, including at the postgraduate level, is carried out in accordance with the organizational structure NJSC "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University". The direct management of residency programmes and the coordination of the activities of residents from the moment the residency exists is carried out by the residency department, which monitors residents, maintains relations with the practical health care sector and residency graduates, interacts with other structural units of the University involved in the implementation and support of residency programmes (OAR, DPCEP, DIT).

For the successful implementation of the EP, the Committee for Educational Programmes (CEP) functions. The CEP consists of experienced expert methodologists from among qualified teaching staff, representatives of students and practical health care.

## **8.3 Training budget and resource allocation**

Management of financial and economic policy and activities NJSC "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" is the responsibility of the first head of the university - the rector. Financial matters are under the jurisdiction of the Director of the Department of Financial Work and the Chief Accountant of the University, whose duties and powers are established by the job description and the Regulations on the Department of Financial Work.

The budget of KazRosmeduniversity is formed from two sources: the republican budget (the state order for the training of personnel for higher and postgraduate education, advanced training of medical workers, development of scientific research, transfers) and the provision of paid educational services.

To improve the quality of teaching, ensure a close relationship with practical health care in NJSC "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" are invited as part-time teachers, doctors and candidates of sciences, specialists in practical health care.

The policy of the university for the development of teaching staff consists in a clear planning of personnel policy, the development of measures to stimulate and reward for achievements in work. Types of teaching staff incentives and the procedure for their application are determined by the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan and orders of the rector. In order to stimulate the improvement of scientific

qualifications and the quality of teaching, teachers who have accumulated extensive teaching experience are awarded the academic title of university professor.

#### **8.4 Administration and management**

The administrative and managerial, service and educational support staff is calculated on the basis of the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Norms for calculating the cost of education for one student, graduate student, clinical intern (undergraduate) in higher medical educational institutions within the country according to the state educational order" dated 14.06.2004 No. 221.

The calculation of the teaching load of teaching staff is carried out in accordance with the Model Rules for the Activities of Higher Education Organizations (Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 499 of 05/20/2013) and the state standard of education (order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. 387 of 07/29/2009 and order No. 647 of 07/31/2015) and approved at a meeting of the Academic Council of the University.

The structural subdivision responsible for ensuring the quality of management is the Department of Strategic Development and QMS, which organizes regular audits of the work of departments and structural subdivisions.

Internal regulatory documents are open and available on the official website <https://medkrmu.kz/>

#### **8.5 Requirements and regulations**

Interaction NJSC "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" with the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the organization of the educational process in residency is carried out through the implementation of the State Educational Standard and is consistent with the priority areas of the following national legislative and policy documents:

- Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Education" dated June 27, 2007 No. 319-III (as amended and supplemented as of 07.07.2020);
- The State Programme for the Development of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020-2025, approved by the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 27, 2019 No. 988;
- The State Health Development Programme of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020-2025, approved by the Decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 26, 2019 No. 982.

The choice of a residency specialty is regulated by the Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan No. KR DSM-116 dated August 28, 2019 "On the placement of a state educational order for the training of personnel in medical and pharmaceutical specialties with postgraduate education for the 2019-2020 academic year"

**Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria.** Out of 15 standards conform: completely - 15, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not meet - 0

**Standard 8: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:** Not

### **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

#### **Evidence of Compliance:**

An example of a process of continuous improvement, approaches to the implementation of the EP of the specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology", is the active participation of stakeholders (primarily representatives of employers) in the formation of an educational strategy that reflects the social responsibility of the university for the development of advanced innovative technologies in medical practice and science, using the achievements of information and communication technologies, as well as improving the health of the population.

Study, monitoring and evaluation of the educational programme 7R01114 - "Radiology" is carried out at all levels, includes the main and related departments, the profile CEP, the Academic Council. National Educational Institution "KazRosmeduniversity" continuously improves the mechanisms for periodic review, study and evaluation of the ongoing educational programme 7R01114 - "Radiology" and ensures the quality of the programme management process. The educational programme is regularly

studied and evaluated through feedback from residents, faculty and stakeholders, including employers, as well as an analysis of the educational achievements of residents.

In order to improve the organizational structure and management principles, the following is being carried out: the introduction of a risk management system in educational activities, the optimization of the quality management system model and the transition, in the future, to the new version of MS ISO 9001 (2015), the introduction of an automated process, the intensification of the image policy.

For the preparation of residents in the specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology", it uses 5 types of QEP as an educational laboratory. PMCs (mobile medical complexes) offered by the university are equipped with basic diagnostic equipment and staffed by doctors (general practitioner, surgeon, obstetrician-gynecologist, ophthalmologist, otorhinolaryngologist, dentist) to provide qualified medical care to the population of remote areas. Also, the QEP specialists include specialists in instrumental diagnostics (doctors of radiation and clinical-laboratory diagnostics) and paramedical personnel.

**Conclusions of the EEC according to the criteria.** Out of 4 standards conform: completely - 4, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not meet - 0.

**Standard 9:** completed

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:** Not

#### **6. Recommendations for improving the educational programme 7R01114 - "Radiology":**

1. Concretize the definition of the Mission of the educational programme (EP) with the involvement of the main stakeholders and document this process of discussion through collegiate bodies (1.1.1);
2. To raise awareness, place the Mission and the final results of the educational programme on the website of the University (1.1.1);
3. When planning an educational programme, ensure the representation of stakeholders (2.5.2);
4. Develop and harm the mechanism of reliability, validity of methods for assessing the educational achievements of residents (3.1.6);
5. When developing a policy for the selection and admission of residents for 2022-2023, include representation of residents (4.4.1);
6. Develop evaluation criteria (KPI) to evaluate the performance of teaching staff and clinical mentors (5.2.3);
7. Develop a mechanism for motivating and developing the interest of employees and teachers in conducting scientific research in the field of medical education (6.6.3);
8. Create a quality assurance system for the evaluation and monitoring of the residency educational programme with the participation of University graduates (reason: Order No. 595 of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, paragraph 34) (7.1.1, 7.1.2).

### **7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council**

EEC members established the compliance of the educational programme 7R01114 - "Radiology" with the Accreditation Standards and came to a unanimous opinion to recommend to the ECAQA Accreditation Council to accredit this programme for a period of 5 years.

Chairperson	Zhanalina Bakhyt Sekerbekovna
foreign expert	Uryasiev Oleg Mikhailovich
foreign expert	Khasanov Adkham Ibragimovich
Kazakh academic expert	Yesenkulova Saule Askerovna
Employers' representative	Musabayeva Asem Muratovna
Resident Representative	Ziya Azimkhan Nurzhanuly

ECAQA Observer Umarova M.A.

**Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme  
(generalization)**

Standard	Criteria for evaluation	Number of standards	Grade			
			Totally coincides	Significantly corresponds	Partially Compliant	Does not match
1.	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	17	14	-	3	-
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME	31	30	-	1	-
3.	ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS	11	9	-	2	-
4.	STUDENTS	30	28	-	2	-
5.	FACULTY	7	6	-	1	-
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	21	20	-	1	-
7.	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	15	11	-	4	-
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	15	15	-	-	-
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4	4	-	-	-
	<b>Total:</b>	<b>151</b>	<b>136</b>		<b>15</b>	
			<b>151</b>			



## List of documents reviewed by EEC members

No.	Document names	Quantity	Date Approval
1.	"Strategy of the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" for 2019-2025"	1	CC dated December 26, 2019, protocol No. 5.
2.	Academic Policy of the University	1	
3.	Regulations on mentoring	1	NKS No. 18 of 06/17/2019
4.	Regulations on the ongoing monitoring of progress, intermediate and final certification of students	1	US dated April 24, 2020 No. 1.
5.	On approval of candidates for chairperson and composition of the State Examination Commission" The commission included leading professors of the university, deans, representatives of other	1	No. 26-02-48-n / κ dated 02.12.2020
6.	Rules for admission to residency of the National Educational Institution "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"	1	
7.	Regulations on the competitive replacement of positions of the teaching staff and scientists.	1	Order of the rector No. 26-02-44-n / κ dated November 27, 2020.
8.	Regulations on field training in internship and residency.	1	AC dated August 29, 2019 protocol No. 1.
9.	Regulations on the organization of training using distance learning technologies	1	AS dated August 29, 2019 No. 1.
10.	Personnel policy of the National Educational Institution "KazRosmeduniversitet"	1	12/25/2020
11.	Student's Code of Academic Integrity	1	US dated 04/27/2019, protocol No. 9
12.	Code of Corporate Culture and Ethics	1	06/01/2018
13.	EP specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology"	1	AS (dated 06/24/2021 No. 6) and US University (dated 08/18/2021 No. 11).
14.	Agreement with JSC "Antiplagiat"	1	license agreement No. 1051 dated 07/08/2020
15.	Resident portfolio	3	Kasymov T.E., Zakiryarov I.A., Aliev T.S.
16.	Schedule of practical classes for residents in the specialty 7R01114 - "Radiology"	3	September 2021 October 2021, November 2021

**Programme**  
**visits to the External Expert Commission of ECAQA**  
**NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University" (specialized accreditation)**  
**Almaty, Abylai Khan Ave., 51/53**  
**December 13-15, 2021**

\***Note:** the programme indicates the time of Almaty.

Link to zoom for the participation of a foreign expert - a member of the EEC in the events of the programme <https://us06web.zoom.us/j/9702400023>

Time	EVENTS	Notes
<b>Day one – December 13, 2021</b>		
08-10.12.2021	<b>Studying documents</b> for compliance with the standards of accreditation of programmes of basic (bachelor's) and postgraduate education (specialty of residency) of medical educational organizations before external expert evaluation. Studying the website and social networks of KazRosmeduniversitet for compliance with accreditation standards.	EEC members
<b>12/10/2021</b> <b>(Friday)</b>  15:00-16:00* Almaty time	<b>Online meeting of members of the External Expert Commission.</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Acquaintance, distribution by the Chairperson of the EEC of responsibility between the members of the EEC.</li> <li>– Brief review of reports on self-evaluation of KazRosmeduniversitet programmes. Discussion of key issues, including the results of the review, familiarization of EEC members with general recommendations.</li> <li>– Discussion of the list of documents that must be additionally requested from KazRosmeduniversitet for validation of reports on self-evaluation of educational programmes.</li> <li>– Discussion of the external expert evaluation programme.</li> </ul>	EEC members  Zoom link from ECAQA observer provided to EEC members confidentially
<b>1st day: 12/13/2021, Monday</b>		<b>Assessment of compliance with accreditation standards</b>
8:45-9:00 (15/)	Meeting of the members of the EEC. Discussion of the programme and schedule of visiting KazRosmeduniversitet on the 1st day of the visit.  Abylai Khan Ave., 51/53, Conference hall for the work of members of the EEC, 7th floor	
9:00-9:30 (30/)	<b>Meeting of the EEC with the leadership of KazRosmeduniversitet</b> Rector, Professor Dzhainakbaev Nurlan Temirbekovich	Standards 1, 6, 8, 9

	<p>Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs Kusainova Arman Saylavbekovna  Vice-rector for scientific and clinical work Imanbayeva Zhaysan Abilseytovna  And about. Vice-Rector for educational work Sovostyanova Tatyana Anatolyevna  Heads of structural divisions</p> <p><u>Content of the meeting:</u> presentation of the EEC members, introduction to the objectives of the visit, interviews on mission issues, strategic planning, integration of education-science-practice, internationalization of education, provision of resources for educational programmes</p>	<p>Abylay Khan Ave.  51/53, room 717a, 7th floor</p>	
	<p><b>Undergraduate programmes</b>  <b>EEC-1</b></p>	<p><b>Residency Programmes</b>  <b>EEC-2</b></p>	
9:30-10:15 (45/)	<p><b>Interview with the management of undergraduate programmes</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Kusainova Arman Saylavbekovna, Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs;</li> <li>– Iskakova Maryam Kozbaevna, Dean of the Faculty of Dentistry;</li> <li>– Alekshcheva Roza Kenesovna, Acting Dean of the Faculty "Pharmacy", «Public Health Care» and "Nursing";</li> <li>– Uysenbayeva Sharbanu Omirgalievna, head of the educational and methodological department</li> </ul> <p><u>Content of the meeting:</u> Presentation for 7 min.  Interview on the policy of ensuring the quality of basic education, planning and management of educational programmes, methodological and resource providing undergraduate programmes, admission and graduation of students for 5 years, assessment system, evaluation and analysis of the effectiveness of training programmes, development prospects.  Studying the documentation of undergraduate programmes for compliance with accreditation standards</p>	<p><b>Interview with the heads of residency programmes</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Imanbaeva Zhaisan Abilseytovna, Vice-Rector for Scientific and Clinical Affairs;</li> <li>– Orakbai Lyazzat Zhadigerovna, head of the residency department</li> </ul> <p><u>Content of the meeting:</u> Presentation for 7 min.  Interview on the policy of quality assurance of postgraduate education, management of educational programmes, methodological and resource provision of residency programmes, admission and graduation of residents for 5 years, resident assessment system, mentoring, selection of clinical sites, evaluation and analysis of the effectiveness of training programmes, development prospects.  Studying the documentation of residency programmes for compliance with accreditation standards.</p>	<p>Standards 1, 4, 7, 8, 9</p> <p><b>EEC-1</b> – Room 717a</p> <p><b>EEC-2</b> – Room 717b</p>
10:15-10:35 (20/)	<p><b>Student admission policy for undergraduate programmes.</b>  <i>Interview with the Secretary of the Admissions Committee.</i> Kalieva Gulbanu Batyrkhanovna, Sovostyanova Tatyana Anatolyevna, Liang Zhanat Amandykovna.</p>	<p><b>Evaluation of educational programmes: demand and employment of graduates</b>  Interview with the boss Career Center Kulebaeva Elmira Kuanyshevna.  <u>Content of the meeting:</u> Regulations on the Center, plans, reports, employment monitoring, feedback.  <u>Department documents for 2020-2021</u></p>	<p>Standards 4, 7</p> <p><b>EEC-1</b> – Room 717a</p> <p><b>EEC-2</b> – Room 717b</p>

	<p><u>Content of the meeting:</u> organization and monitoring of the educational process, admission of students, educational work, feedback from students, social and material support for students.</p> <p><u>Documentation:</u> plans and reports for 5 years, lists of students for 2020-2021, lists of expelled students for 2019-2021, survey results for 5 years, documentation of the admission committee for 2020-2021.</p>		
10:40-11:20 (40/)	<p><b>Planning, approval and monitoring of the quality of educational programmes</b></p> <p>Interview with:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Chairperson of the Academic Council Kusainova Arman Saylavbekovna;</li> <li>– director of the department for academic work Bakirova Bibigul Abdimanapovna;</li> <li>– Berkutbayeva Oryngul Zhansapovna, head of the planning and control department of the educational process;</li> <li>– Uysenbayeva Sharban Omirgalievna, head of the educational and methodological department;</li> <li>– Head of the Department for the Development of Educational Programmes Zhanat Amandykovna Liang;</li> <li>– chairmen of the committees of educational programmes (undergraduate) Rakhmetova Kumis Usenovna (EP «Public Health Care», "Nursing"), Syzdykova Aiman Bolatovna (EP "Dentistry"), Kelimkhanova Saule Yesenkulovna (EP "Pharmacy"), Ligay Zoya Nikolaevna (postgraduate education, residency)</li> </ul> <p><u>Content of the meeting:</u> planning the educational process, class schedules, working with departments, discussing and approving educational programmes, making changes to the EP, assessing the EP, assessing teaching methods, introducing innovative teaching methods, representing students in AC and CEP and their role in the development and evaluation of EP, reverse communication from students and influence on the improvement of the EP.</p>	<p><b>International cooperation in the context of quality assurance of educational programmes</b> (undergraduate)</p> <p>Interview with the head of the department of international cooperation and academic mobility Iskakova Dana Askarovna on the issues of internationalization of education, cooperation with partner organizations, strategies for academic mobility.</p> <p><b>Personnel policy of the university in the context of educational programmes of undergraduate and residency</b></p> <p>Interview:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Veryovkina Vera Ivanovna, head of personnel department;</li> <li>- Iskakova Maryam Kozbaevna, Dean of the Faculty of Dentistry;</li> <li>- Alekesheva Roza Kenesovna, Dean of the Faculty "Pharmacy", «Public Health Care» and "Nursing";</li> <li>- Orakbay Lyazzat Zhadigerovna, head of the residency department</li> </ul>	<p>Standards 2, 5, 7, 8</p> <p>EEC-1- Room 717a</p> <p>EEC-2 – Room 717b</p>

11:20-11:40 (20/)	<b>EEC meeting and the results of external evaluation and interviews, exchange of views of EEC-1 and EEC-2</b>		Conference hall, 7th floor
11:40-12:10 (30/)	<b>Visit to the Department of Distance Educational Technologies</b> <i>Responsible Kerimbekova Assel Almasovna, Mokhirev Alexander Anatolievich</i>	<b>Assessing Resources for Clinical Education Mobile medical complex (PMC)</b> Demonstration of the possibilities of PMK in training residents: 1) "Mobile diagnostic center" (30) 2) "Mobile hemodialysis station" (30) <i>Responsible Vdovtsev Alexander Viktorovich</i>	Standards 2, 6  Abylai Khan Ave., 51/53
12:15-13:00 (45/)	<b>Assessment of students. Test center visit</b> Head Manapova Damira Edigeevna <u>Content of the meeting:</u> a system for assessing the knowledge of students, proctoring, registration of information, work with departments, monitoring and improvement.  <b>The system of accounting for the achievements of students. Registrar's office visit.</b> Head Kalieva Gulbanu Batyrkhanovna	<b>Involvement of students in R&amp;D, R&amp;D results and their impact on the quality of educational programmes (bachelor's degree, residency): Department of Scientific Work.</b> Head of Department Seydalin Arystan Oskarovich. <i>Scientific Secretary</i> , professor Mansharipova Alma Toleuovna. <i>Scientific Clinical Council (SCC)</i> . Meeting with the chairperson of the NCC, getting acquainted with the regulations, composition, plan, protocols, reports. Interviews with NCC members. <i>Local Ethics Commission</i> , meeting with the chairperson of the LEK, getting acquainted with the position, composition, plan, protocols, reports. Interview with members of the LEC.	Standards 2, 3, 8  EEC-1 – room 717a  EEC-2 – room 717b
13:00-14:00	<b>Lunch break</b>		
	<b>Undergraduate programmes EEC-1</b>	<b>Residency Programmes EEC-2</b>	
14:30-15:15 (45/)	<b>Assessment of educational resources. Audit Fund.</b> Head of AHO Yeleubekov Daniyar Zinatbekovich <b>Library visit.</b> Head of the library Valiulina Marzhan Bekarystanovna <b>Visit to the Museum named after Mukhtar Aliyev</b>	<b>Overview of the resources of the Training and Clinical Center and demonstration of opportunities in educational programmes of residency, bachelor's degree</b> Aumoldaeva Zaure Maratovna, head of the center	Standards 6, 3  EEC-1- st. Torekulova, 71, 1st floor, rooms 103, 112, 114, 110  <b>Ground floor</b>  EEC-2- there

	Responsible Shaykhina Saule Shakhatovna, head of the department of ViSR	<u>Topic of the lesson:</u> "Differential diagnosis of essential and secondary arterial hypertension" speciality of residency: "Therapy", group T 21-01	
15:15-16:00 (45/)	<b>Interviews with undergraduate students</b> <u>Content:</u> participation in the development and evaluation of educational programmes, access to patients and equipment, participation in university events (including research), taking into account the opinions of students, student support (consulting, curators, advisors, tutors), providing appropriate documentation, satisfaction with the educational process (methods of assessment, teaching, provision of resources, including library and IT), extracurricular environment.	<b>Interviews with residents</b> <u>Content:</u> participation in the development and evaluation of educational programmes, admission to patients and equipment, participation in university events (including research), taking into account the opinions of residents, supporting residents (consulting, mentoring), providing relevant documentation, satisfaction with the educational process (assessment methods, teaching, resource provision, including library and IT), out-of-class environment for residents.  <i>EEC-2 is divided into three subgroups in accordance with the specialties of the residency programmes (list from the ECAQA observer)</i>	Standards 2, 3, 4, 6, 7  <b>EEC-1</b> – online interview <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9801179805?pwd=MTQ0eVhXakhCa20ySW4xOFF0enRldz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9801179805?pwd=MTQ0eVhXakhCa20ySW4xOFF0enRldz09</a>  <b>EEC-2</b> Subgroup 2.1 audience 402 Subgroup 2.2 audience 406 Subgroup 2.3 audience 407
16:00-16:45 (45/)	<b>Interviews with undergraduate professors</b> <u>Content:</u> development, approval and updating of educational programmes, planning of the educational process, teaching and learning methods, student assessment methods, maintaining relevant documentation, development of teachers in pedagogy and specialty, satisfaction with the educational process and students.	<b>Interviews with full-time residency teachers</b> <u>Content:</u> development, approval and updating of educational programmes, planning of the educational process, methods of teaching and learning, methods of assessing residents, maintaining relevant documentation, development of teachers in pedagogy and specialty, satisfaction with the educational process and residents.	Standards 2, 5 <b>EEC-1</b> – online interview <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9758823011?pwd=TEpUQ3FPWjVnd3hLU0EvdIkkYmc4Zz09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/9758823011?pwd=TEpUQ3FPWjVnd3hLU0EvdIkkYmc4Zz09</a>  <b>EEC-2</b> – Room 717b
16:45-17:05 (20/)	<b>EEC meeting and results of external evaluation and interviews, exchange of views of EEC-1 and EEC-2</b>		Conference hall, 7th floor
17:05-18:00 (55/)	Work with documentation on undergraduate and residency programmes for compliance with accreditation standards.		Standards 2, 3
<b>2nd day: 12/14/2021, Tuesday</b>			<b>Assessment of compliance with accreditation standards</b>
<b>Overview educational resources</b>	<b>of Undergraduate programmes EEC-1</b>	<b>Residency Programmes EEC-2</b>	
8:45-13:00	<u>Undergraduate Foundation in Dentistry Clinic Atlas Dent,</u>	<b>Subgroup 2.1</b>	Standards 2, 6, 9

	<p>st. Satpaev 28, corner of st. Zheltoksan  <u>Topic of the practical lesson:</u>"Increased abrasion of tooth crowns. Classifications.  Changes in the clinical picture of the state of organs and tissues of the oral cavity. Changes in the functional state of APLS in pathological tooth wear. Types of orthopedic treatment.  Course 6, art. Lecturer of the Department of Surgical and Orthopedic Dentistry Samalbaev U.T.</p>	<p><u>EP "Family Medicine", "Adult and Pediatric Cardiology"</u>  <u>Base:</u> City Cardiology Center  st. Tole bi, 91  <u>Topic of the practical lesson:</u> "Thromboembolic complications in coronavirus infection"  <u>course 1-3, full name of the teacher:</u> Ibragimova I.N., Ligay Z.N.</p> <p>EP "Urology and andrology for adults, children"  <u>Base:</u> Almaty Regional Diagnostic Center  st. Auezov, 57  <u>The topic of the practical lesson:</u> "Endoscopic removal of stones from MP"  <u>course 2, full name of the teacher:</u> Tokpanov A.K.</p>	
	<p><u>Undergraduate Foundation in Pharmacy</u>  Pharmacy No. 2 LLP  st. N.Nazarbayeva, 91/97  PP "Organization of pharmaceutical activity"  <u>Topic of the practical lesson:</u>"Familiarization with the organization of the department, familiarization with the list of medicines sold without a doctor's prescription. Work on site to work in the over-the-counter medicines department. Necessary consultations.  <u>Well3, full name of the teacher:</u> Zharymbetov K.B.</p>	<p><b>Subgroup 2.2</b>  EP "Obstetrics and gynecology for adults, children"  <u>Base:</u> City Clinical Hospital No. 4  st. Papanina, 220  <u>The topic of the practical lesson:</u> "Endovideoscopic technologies in the diagnosis and treatment of gynecological pathologies"  <u>course1, Full name of teachers:</u> Bodykov G.Zh., Chupin A.N.</p> <p><u>EP "Maxillofacial Surgery"</u>  <u>Base:</u>City clinical hospital №5  Dostyk Ave., 220  <u>Topic of the practical lesson:</u>"Fractures of the lower jaw"  <u>course2, full name of the teacher:</u> Zeitenova G.B.</p>	
	<p><u>Undergraduate Foundation in Nursing</u>  Scientific Center of Urology named after B.U.Dzharbusynov  st. Basenova, 2</p>	<p><b>Subgroup 2.3</b>  EP "Radiation Oncology"</p>	

	<p>PP "Nursing in Therapy"  <u>Topic of the practical lesson:</u>No. 2 "Work as an assistant to the head nurse or deputy chief physician for the nursing process "  <u>Well4</u>, full name of the teacher: Sagaeva S.K.</p>	<p><b><u>Base:</u> "PSE on REM "Almaty Cancer Center"</b>   st. Utepova, 3  <u>Topic of the practical lesson:</u> "Principles of treatment of metastatic breast cancer"  <u>Course 1</u>, full name of the teacher: Esentayeva S.E.</p> <p>EP "Radiology"  <b><u>Base:</u> "PSE on REM "Almaty Cancer Center"</b>   st. Utepova, 3  <u>Topic of the practical lesson:</u>"Magnetic resonance imaging of the brain»  <u>Course 1</u>, full name of the teacher: Alpeysova Sh.T.</p>	
	<p><u>Undergraduate Health Foundation</u>  PSE on REM City Polyclinic No. 21  md. Kokzhiiek, 66  "Leadership in nursing" 6V10101-SD, r / o (10 months).  <u>Topic of the practical lesson:</u>No. 5 "Working with letters from the population. Interview with the public on the complaint. Preparing a draft response to a letter  <u>Course 1</u>, name of the teacher: Gazizova G.K.</p>	<p><b><u>Subgroup 2.4</u></b>  EP "Psychiatry for adults and children"  <u>Base:</u> "RNPTsPPiN"  st. Amangeldy, 88  <u>The topic of the practical lesson:</u> Schizophrenia. Clinical variants, types of flow. Differential diagnostics. Treatment Tactics»  <u>course 1</u>, Full name of the teacher: Yeshimbetova S.Z., Raspopova N.I.</p> <p><b><u>Seminar attendance</u></b>  EP "Otorhinolaryngology for adults, children"  <u>Base:</u> Medical center "Medline"  Amangeldy Ave., 28  <u>Topic:</u> "Acute otitis media and mastoiditis"  1 Course, full name of the teacher: Esenalieva R.N.</p>	
13:00-14:00	<b>Lunch break</b>		
14:00-14:15 (15/)	<b>Visit to the Department of Military Medical Training</b>		Abylai Khan Ave., 51/53
			<i>Responsible Sadvokasov Zaken Kauazkanovich</i>



			3rd floor
14:15-14:40 (25/)	<b>EEC meeting on the results of an external evaluation and visits to clinical sites, exchange of views of EEC-1 and EEC-2, discussion of recommendations for improvement</b>		Conference hall, 7th floor
	<b>EEC-1 undergraduate programmes</b>	<b>EEC-2 residency programmes</b>	
14:40-15:25 (45/)	<b>Interviews with representatives of practical healthcare (potential employers of undergraduate graduates)</b> <u>Content:</u> participation of stakeholders in ensuring the quality of bachelor's training, participation in university events, incl. in the development of the mission and educational programmes, topics of electives, proposals for improving education, satisfaction with the knowledge and skills of undergraduate graduates, feedback from the issuing organization.	<b>Interviews with representatives of practical healthcare (potential employers of residency graduates)</b> <u>Content:</u> participation of stakeholders in ensuring the quality of training of residents, participation in university events, incl. in the development of the mission and educational programmes, topics of electives, proposals for improving education, satisfaction with the knowledge and skills of residency graduates (independence, competence, professionalism, stress resistance, creativity, outlook, discipline, etc.), feedback from the issuing organization.	Standards 2, 5  Online interview <a href="https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5835921548?pwd=LnF3MzZPN3M1VWhzditOWmpBNitSUT09">https://us02web.zoom.us/j/5835921548?pwd=LnF3MzZPN3M1VWhzditOWmpBNitSUT09</a>
15:00-15:40 (40/)	<b>Attendance at extracurricular events for bachelors (electives, NSC meetings, etc.)</b> <b>Meeting with an asset of undergraduate students.</b> <i>Responsible: Iskakova Maryam Kozbaevna, Alekesheva Rosa Kenesovna</i>	<b>Meeting with residents' asset</b> (support for initiatives by the university management, participation in research, volunteer movement, working conditions) <b>Studying the portfolio of residents.</b>	Standards 1, 4  <b>EEC-1-</b> Room 717a  <b>EEC-2-</b> Room 717b
15:40-16:10 (30/)	<b>Visit to the Anatomical Museum</b> Responsible Salimgereeva Bagdat Zhanabaevna, head of the department of anatomy with courses	Interview with the department responsible for <b>professional and pedagogical improvement of university teachers.</b> Evaluation of professional development programmes for teachers, individual plans of teaching staff. <i>Department of Academic Affairs, Human Resources Department</i>	Abylai Khan Ave. 51/53  <b>EEC-1-</b> 1st floor, Anatomical Museum  <b>EEC-2 -</b> Room 717b
16:10-16:30 (20/)	<b>EEC meeting on the results of external evaluation and interviews, exchange of views of EEC-1 and EEC-2, discussion of recommendations for improvement</b>		Standards 4-7 51/53 Abylai Khan Ave., Conference hall for the work of EEC members, 7th floor
16:30-17:40 (70/)	Work with documentation on undergraduate and residency programmes for compliance with accreditation standards. Questioning of residents, bachelors and teachers (conducted by an observer from ECAQA).		
17:40-18:00 (20/)	Discussion of the recommendations of the EEC based on the results of 2 days of the visit		
<b>Day 3: 12/15/2021, Wednesday</b>			<b>Assessment of compliance with</b>

		accreditation standards	
8:45	<b>Meeting of the members of the EEC at the address Abylay Khan Ave., 51/53</b>		
9:00-9:15 (15/)	Meeting of the members of the EEC. Discussion of the programme and schedule of the visit to KazRosmeduniversity on the 3rd day of the visit.		
	<b>EEC-1 undergraduate programmes</b>	<b>EEC-2 residency programmes</b>	
9:15-9:45 (30/)	<p><b>Attending a practical lesson of the basic disciplines of the bachelor's degree in the specialty</b>  <u>Topic:</u> "Preparation of carious cavities in classes 1 and 5. Peculiarities of preparation for light-curing composite materials. Preparation of a carious cavity for filling. Working in the Phantom Room»  <u>majoring in Dentistry.</u></p> <p><u>Topic:</u> "Medical and social aspects of demography" in the specialty «Public Health Care».  Assessment of availability of relevant methodological materials, documentation.</p>	<p><b>Visit to the magazine club.</b>  <u>Topic:</u> "Working with literary sources in preparation for the implementation of a scientific project" residents in the specialty "Oncology (adult)".  Assessment of availability of relevant methodological materials, documentation.</p>	<p>st. Torekulova, 71  <b>EEC-1-</b>  Audience 103</p> <p>Abylai Khan Ave., 51/53  <b>EEC-2-</b>  Room 717b</p> <p>Abylai Khan Ave., 51/53  <b>EEC-1-</b>  Audience 520</p> <p>Videos on the specialties "Pharmacy", "Nursing" - Room 717a</p>
9:45-10:15 (30/)	<p><b>Attending a practical lesson of the basic disciplines of the bachelor's degree in the specialty</b>  <u>Topic:</u> "Pharmacopoeial analysis of drugs of inorganic nature"  <u>majoring in Pharmacy.</u></p> <p><u>Topic:</u> "Work in medical departments: intravenous, intramuscular, subcutaneous and intradermal injections"  <u>majoring in Nursing</u>  Assessment of availability of relevant methodological materials, documentation.</p>		
10:15-11:00 (45/)	Interviews with heads and representatives of university departments at the request of EEC members.		
11:00-13:00	Final discussion of the results of the external evaluation of educational programmes for compliance with accreditation standards. Filling individually by each member of the EEC of the Quality Profile and criteria for		

	external evaluation of educational programmes. The beginning of the design of EEC reports: bachelor's degree (4), residency (12).	for the work of EEC members, 7th floor
13:00-14:00	<b>Lunch break</b>	
14:00-17:00	<b>Designing EEC reports: undergraduate (4), residency (12). Discussion of recommendations for improvement. Final voting on recommendations for KazRosmeduniversity. Final vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.</b>	51/53 Abylai Khan Ave., Conference hall for the work of EEC members, 7th floor
<b>17:00-17:30</b>	<b>Announcement of the results of the work of the EEC, recommendations for improvement for the management and employees of KazRosmeduniversitet.</b>	<b>Room 717a</b>
17:30-18:00	Signing of documents by members of the EEC. Completion of work. Departure. Completion of the EEC	